An Analytical Study of Alfred Hill’s
String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor

Yuen Ching Lam

A thesis submitted for the degree of
Master of Arts
at the University of Otago,
Dunedin, New Zealand.

June 2006
Abstract

Alfred Hill (1870-1960) was a central figure of the Australasian art music world during his lifetime. He was New Zealand’s first professional composer, and had a close connection with its indigenous people, the Māori. However, to date his music has been studied very little. This research focuses on a single composition, String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor (1907-1911). It aims to analyse the work in depth, and make observations about Hill’s style. While the quartet is in a late Romantic style, which resulted from his musical training in Germany, there are innovative elements. One important characteristic of Hill’s compositions is the incorporation of Māori elements into his music, which include poetry, legend and music. This quartet, which is based on a Māori legend, was created during Hill’s last stay in the country, when he produced most of his Māori-inspired works. This thesis investigates the background to its creation, analyses the music in depth, and aims to explore how the composer tried to integrate elements of Māori culture into his music.
To Dr Joanna C Lee
for her continuous encouragement and inspiration
Preface

My interest in the music of Alfred Hill started in Hong Kong three years ago, when I was preparing to go to Canterbury University for my year-long exchange studies. I was exploring a topic related to New Zealand music for the final-year project of my undergraduate studies. Similar to my last project, one challenge I faced in working on Hill’s music was dealing with the lack of materials available.

There was no full score available of String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor, the focus of this thesis. I reconstructed a score based on the parts published by Breitkopf & Härtel in 1913. I was not able to locate and obtain the manuscript of the music until the last four months before the thesis was finished. There are two sets of parts in manuscript, which are in different handwriting. Due to the limited time I have had for the thesis, I have not been able to identify if one of them was in Hill’s hand, nor to check the consistency between the two sets and the published one. The manuscript was consulted only when inconsistencies were discovered in the published version. Mistakes were therefore corrected based on the analysis of the music and the manuscript. The reconstructed score, which is separate, is included in the appendices. It is intended for study purpose only, and it is recommended that it be used with the thesis to enhance the understanding of points made.

The process of working on this research has provided many opportunities to learn and grow. I thank my supervisors, Dr Anthony Ritchie and Mr Peter Adams, for their guidance and insightful comments. I enjoyed discussing my ideas with them.

I thank my co-supervisor Prof Donald Maurice at Massey University. I first met him while I was on exchange studies at Canterbury University. He provided valuable assistance for my Hill project three years ago, and has kept my interest in this challenging topic after I returned to Hong Kong and was engaged in other activities. He has continued to provide support and advice for this research.

I am grateful to Dr Dan Bendrups, whose input on the Māori aspect of Hill’s music has added a new dimension to the research. Thanks also to Mr Allan Stiles for providing valuable advice at the beginning of the research.
Lastly, I thank my parents and my two brothers for their unlimited support. They help make my dreams come true. This thesis is the result of the collaboration of individuals from different parts of the world.
# Table of Contents

Abstract

Preface

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: (i) Introduction, (ii) Historical Background

Chapter 2: Literature Review

Chapter 3: (i) Overview of the Quartet, (ii) Analysis of the First Movement

Chapter 4: Second Movement

Chapter 5: Third Movement

Chapter 6: Fourth Movement

Chapter 7: Findings and Conclusion

Bibliography

Appendix: Separate score of String Quartet No. 2, edited by the author.
Chapter 1:
(i) Introduction

Alfred Hill (1870-1960) was a focal point of the Australasian art music world during his lifetime. Returning from his musical studies in Leipzig in 1891, the composer spent most of these years in New Zealand until 1910. After that he resided in Australia until his death at the age of eighty-nine. The experiences of working and residing in the two countries contributed to the uniqueness of his works. New Zealand’s first professional composer, one main feature of Hill’s compositions was the integration of elements from Māori culture into his music. This was the result of the composer’s fondness for Māori culture and his close connection with its people.

Although his compositions are significant to the music history of New Zealand, there has been a lack of research work on them. In light of this, and to provide some in-depth insight, this thesis deals with only one of his compositions – String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor (1907-1911), which is based on a Māori legend. By examining the background to its creation, and analysing the music thoroughly, this thesis investigates how Hill’s experiences up to this point might have influenced this particular work. It aims to explore how the composer tried to incorporate elements of Māori culture into his late Romantic German musical style.

The following section focuses on Hill’s musical life before the completion of the quartet. Chapter 2 undertakes a review of the relevant literature. Following that, there is a chapter providing a musical analysis of each of the four movements. The final chapter presents the findings and conclusion of the analysis.
Hill’s years in New Zealand can be divided into three periods: (1) his formative years: 1872-1886, (2) his return from studies in Leipzig: 1892-1896, and (3) the creation of most of his Māori-inspired works: 1902-1910. String Quartet No. 2, which was based on a Māori legend, was created during the last period. Thus, while this historical background covers Hill’s whole life, the focus will be on his life and works before the completion of this quartet. The discussion will, therefore, concentrate on his musical studies in Leipzig and the last two periods of his New Zealand residence. The Māori music that was incorporated into his compositions will also be discussed. This chapter aims to explore how all these factors might have influenced String Quartet No. 2.

First period in New Zealand (1872-1886) – the formative years

Although Hill’s birth country was Australia, he was raised in New Zealand. Born into a musical family in Melbourne on 16 December 1870, Hill emigrated with his family to Auckland when he was only eighteen months old. Three years later, the family moved to Wellington, where the composer started learning cornet. He soon mastered the instrument, and played in his father’s family orchestra and theatre troupes on tours throughout New Zealand. Having had these musical experiences, Hill turned to learning the violin and viola, with the latter becoming his preferred instrument. By the age of fifteen, before he had received any formal musical training, he had already composed his first piece of music and had it performed in Wellington. Realising that Hill was full of musical potential, his father decided to send him to Leipzig to study music.

Student years in Leipzig (1887-1891) – music in the late Romantic German style

Hill’s music reflects the significant impact of his studies at the Leipzig Conservatory. The conservatory, which was founded by Mendelssohn in 1843, had a reputation based on the organisation of its training. Such a systematic way of teaching served Hill so well that, by the end of his studies, he was one of seventeen students awarded the Helbig Prize for distinguished performance. In the concert for his final examinations, Hill included one of his own works, the Scotch Sonata for Violin and
Piano, which was very well received. Before leaving Leipzig, he already had six works published. All these accomplishments offered the twenty-one-year-old Hill promise of a future profession as a competent composer, conductor and string player.

Hill had studied with different music teachers during his five years at the Conservatory. The most influential three were Gustav Ernst Schreck (1849-1918), Hans Sitt (1850-1922) and Oscar Paul (1836-1898).¹ Schreck taught Hill harmony, theory and composition. As a composer, Schreck was well-known for his prolific production of secular and occasional choral music, which was in a conservative harmonic idiom. His teaching of the technique of writing counterpoint also exerted influence on Hill’s choral and vocal music. This can be seen in his early cantatas, such as *The New Jerusalem* (1892) and *Hinemoa* (1896).² Moreover, Schreck wrote many compositions for “neglected” instruments, as Thomson mentions, such a *gebrauchsmusik* attitude had a strong influence on Hill.³ This is evident in Hill’s practical approach to writing music, as will be seen in his String Quartet No. 2. He once stated that his creation of a composition depended largely on the need for the music and the availability of the instruments.⁴

The Austro-Bohemian violinist, Hans Sitt, taught Hill violin, but it was more as a role model that Sitt influenced Hill. McCredie points out that Sitt’s activities – conducting orchestras, playing in string quartets and organizing musical events – have a “curious parallel” to Hill’s musical activities in both Australia and New Zealand.⁵ One significant example of conducting and organizing events is Hill’s involvement in forming the orchestra for the Christchurch International Exhibition 1906-07. As a violist, Hill played in various string quartets. Besides all these musical activities, he also taught at the New South Wales State Conservatorium of Music. One may wonder if Hill unconsciously or even knowingly followed his teacher’s path in performing, teaching and conducting.

Oscar Paul was another influential teacher of Hill. As a musical scholar, Paul was a pioneer in recognizing the significance of incorporating other musical cultures.

---

² Ibid., 185.
⁴ Alfred Hill, *Alfred Hill Tribute*, a radio programme that features a tribute to Alfred Hill after his death, Radio New Zealand Sound Archive, T1928-29, open real tape.
into Western art music. He referenced not only ancient musical cultures, but also those of Palestine, Islam and India. It is possible that Paul’s lectures influenced Hill’s interest in the music of the Māori as well as that of the Australian Aboriginal and the New Guinean. However, as we shall see, Hill’s interest in other cultures was also influenced by Nationalist composers, such as Dvorak.

During his time at the conservatory, Hill played the violin in the famous Gewandhaus Orchestra for two years, which also impacted on his compositional style. Since Carl Reinecke (1824-1910), the conductor of the orchestra, did not appreciate the music of the New German School, the repertory of the orchestra was always traditional rather than contemporary. Furthermore, by playing in the orchestra, Hill had the opportunity to perform with many famous soloists and conductors – often playing their own works – for example Grieg, Tchaikovsky and Brahms. The contact with this repertoire contributed to Hill’s compositional style.

While Hill was studying in Leipzig, he developed a particular fondness for Wagner’s music. Hill wrote in his diary, Wagner “seems to stand so far above all the rest. His works show such thought and his ideas are so lofty… He understands how to express every passion properly.” His fondness for this composer is reflected in the use of leitmotif in many of his compositions. For instance, in his cantata Hinemoa, which was based on a Māori legend, Hill adopted a Māori melody as the motif to represent the love between the two main characters. Similarly, in his String Quartet No. 2, he used a mainly pentatonic melody and labelled it “hero motive” to represent the Māori hero in the story. There are other melodies used as leitmotifs in this work, as will be shown in the analysis. With this device, Hill modified and transformed the melodies according to the context of the story. This practice, known as thematic transformation, was “a standard technique in the late 19th century.” It was used as a way of developing the programme and unifying the work. The transformation and development of a theme parallels developments in the musical programme.

---

8 In fact, he liked Wagner’s music so much that his three children were given the names Tristan, Isolde and Elsa.
Second period in New Zealand (1892-1896) – first contact with Māori

After his studies in Leipzig, Hill returned to Wellington. During this period in New Zealand, his outputs consisted mainly of dramatic works including operas and cantatas, which were in the conservative idiom that he learned in Leipzig. However, after the composition of his cantata Hinemoa in 1896, there was a new element in his music – the Māori element – drawn from the indigenous people of the country. This exotic element, which Hill had not utilised in his music before, added a new dimension to both his music and career.

Hinemoa is based on the Māori legend of Tutanekai and Hinemoa. It was created with Arthur Adams\(^\text{10}\) as librettist after Hill’s first contact with Māori music in 1895. Although this work is now largely forgotten, it is significant in the history of New Zealand music. It is not only the first art music work that combined music of the two different cultures, but it also helped create a sense of national identity as well as nurturing an appreciation of Māori culture when its status in the Pakeha circles of the day was low.

Hill’s first introduction to Māori music was through his Pakeha friend E. D. Hoben, who was a Wellington journalist.\(^\text{11}\) He sang Hill a Māori melody one day, which Hill then used as the love motif in his cantata.\(^\text{12}\) This melody, which represents the love between Tutanekai and Hinemoa, is a recurring motif that appears throughout the whole work.

Hill’s incorporation of Māori elements into this work was partly due to his sympathy for the Māori people. He said, “...citizens of Wellington rather laughed at the idea that we could get anything from the dirty lazy Maori...they didn’t think much of them, especially artistically. ‘You wait and see’ I said.”\(^\text{13}\) He adopted the legend and music of the Māori in the cantata to show other Pakeha that there were qualities to be appreciated in Māori culture and art. This use of Māori music is much like Dvorak’s treatment of Native American Indian and Negro music in the New World Symphony. The Czech master used the work to urge the Americans to “submit the indigenous musics of their country...‘to beautiful treatment in the higher forms of

\(^{10}\) Arthur Adams (1872-1936), who was eighteen months younger than Hill, was born in Otago. He was a novelist, journalist and dramatist. (Thomson, A Distant Music, 51)
\(^{11}\) Hoben grew up at Tauranga where he lived close to a Māori pa. (Ibid, 57)
\(^{12}\) Alfred Hill, Interview re. Composition 'Hinemoa,' an interview with Alfred Hill made on 5 July 1952, Centre for New Zealand Music, cassette.
\(^{13}\) Ibid.,
art.” 14 Essentially, this was exactly how Hill was to treat Māori indigenous musical elements in his art music compositions.

Having decided to write the music for the cantata, Hill stayed in areas populated by Māori for a period of time, to collect more materials for the work. In a broadcast talk in 1953, he said, “for weeks at a time I lived at Rotorua, Taupo and Ngaurawahia, wandering among these delightful people to collect material. One of the results of this research was the operatic cantata ‘Hinemoa.’ This lovely Maori legend was adapted by Arthur Adams, and I incorporated many of the Maori tunes and rhythms.” 15 After collecting the materials from the Māori people, he started writing the music in late 1895.

While Hill’s use of Māori music in the cantata was due to his sympathetic interest in its culture, Shieff points out that “it was also expedient and opportunistic.” 16 After hearing the Māori melody from Hoben, Hill responded, “Here’s something novel. If I can’t make a success any other way, I might be developing this idea of Māori music.” 17 From this quotation, it is evident that he believed the use of this novel element – a stylised Māori melody – would be helpful to his career. It is not surprising to find Hill returning to this novel Māori ingredient.

Through the use of the indigenous element Hinemoa had created a sense of national identity. A commentator of that time said, “We reached a marked stage in our musical history with the production of a national cantata—Hinemoa—by two young New Zealanders,...” 18 As Dahlhaus states, nineteenth century musical thought believed “that national character was the primary and essential quality of folk music…and that folk music expresses the spirit of a people (understood as the spirit of a nation, first and most clearly manifested in the culture of the lower classes).” 19

Whether it was sympathetic interest, the search for novel materials, the need for a unique identity or the combination of all these reasons, the success of Hinemoa

---

17 Alfred Hill, Alfred Hill, Alfred Hill talks about his search and knowledge of Maori music, Radio New Zealand Sound Archive, T1930, open real tape.
18 Shieff, “Alfred Hill’s ‘Hinemoa’,” 71, quoting Hastings Standard, 18 January 1897, MLMSS.
led to many subsequent Māori-inspired works in Hill’s output. It also prompted the development of his relationship with Māori communities.

Another significant work from this period is Symphony No. 1 in B Flat. The exact date of its composition is not known, but the first three movements were completed by 1898 with the finale unfinished. Although this work is also entitled the Maori Symphony, and the first three movements are prefaced with poems related to Māori, they were not initially intended for this piece as Stiles has shown. All these Māori elements were added after the success of Hinemoa. The symphony originally has the German title lo Sinfonie and had no programme. In fact, Stiles states that the composition of the first movement may have already taken place while Hill was in Leipzig, therefore before 1892. Furthermore, Stiles states that there are no Māori musical elements in the work. These Māori-related changes may have been used as a way to popularize his composition following the success of Hinemoa. Therefore, the Māori influence on this work would appear to be notional, rather than real.

Although this symphony is unfinished and has never been performed in its entirety, each of the four movements were intended for different occasions, with three of them performed as individual pieces under new titles. The first movement “allegro con brio” was performed in Melbourne in 1913 and retitled Te Rauparaha Symphonic Poem. The second movement “adagio” was retitled Tangi and performed in Sydney in 1899, Wellington in 1907 and 1909, and even as far as London in 1911. While it is not known if the third movement “scherzo” has ever been performed, it was originally written in Leipzig for a string quartet. The finale “march” was rescored in 1903 and called Inaugural March. It was used for the opening of Her Majesty’s Theatre in Sydney. The rescored finale was later used in Hill’s opera Don Quixote. From the historical background of this work, we not only see the influence of the success of Hinemoa, but also the influence of his studies at Leipzig – the practical approach in using and reusing his own music for different occasions.

While Hill’s practical attitude in composition was influenced by his studies at Leipzig, he explained his own views on composition in the preface to his book Harmony and Melody. He mentions four qualities/abilities that a composer should

---

20 The scores of the first two movements are prefaced with extracts from the poem The March of Rauparaha by Thomson Bracken (1843-1898), and that of the third with part of the poem Waipounamutu. (Allan Stiles, notes on Alfred Hill’s Symphony No. 1 in B Flat, score, Stiles Music Publication, 2004)

21 Ibid.

22 Ibid.
possess in order to produce a masterwork. One quality concerns the way of using the materials for writing music. For this, he makes an analogy between building a house and a piece of music. He says:

In building houses we use wood or stone, and decorate with various materials. In building a sonata or song we use melody and harmony, and certain devices to ornament them with. The material is available to all. It is the individual use of the material that counts.

He then takes the slow movement of Beethoven’s Sonata No. 5 for Violin and Piano as an example of the simplicity of material needed for creating such a masterwork. The material he mentions in the piece consists of a few basic chords and a simple harmonic progression. He was amazed by the “economy of material” used. In this sense, he seems to believe that a masterwork depends upon the structure of the music more than its originality.

Settling in Sydney (1897-1902) – subsidence of Māori-inspired works

Hill settled in Sydney from 1897 until 1902. It appears that the Māori influence on his compositions subsided during these five years when he was away from New Zealand. That would be natural due to his physical separation from the country and from Māori culture.

Last period in New Zealand (1902-1910) – active engagement with Māori

Due to an unsuitable climate and his own poor health, Hill returned to New Zealand in 1902. This period is Hill’s final residence in this country, during which time he was actively engaged with Māori communities. His close association with Māori is reflected in the large quantity of Māori-inspired works created in this particular period. I will discuss six of these significant works created in this period, which come from a variety of genres. Also discussed are the two major sources of his

23 The four qualities/abilities of a great composer is the one who “has something great to say, a fine sense of proportion, exquisite taste” and “uses the material available to the best possible advantage.” (Alfred Hill, Harmony and Melody and Their Use in the Simple Forms of Music Together With Special Instruction on the Composition of School Music, London: Elkin & Co., 1927, preface.)
24 Ibid.
25 Ibid.
Māori contact: the Māori he met at Charles Goldie’s painting studio in Auckland, and those from Te Arawa Iwi at Whakarewarewa, in Rotorua.

About the time Hill left Sydney, he had completed *Tapu*, an opera based on a Māori theme. With Adams as librettist, this work had again incorporated Māori musical elements, including haka and poi dances. Its first performance in Wellington on 16 February 1903 was a great success, and led to subsequent performance in other cities and later, in Australia. The creation of this work suggests that although Hill was away from New Zealand for several years, the music of the Māori was still in his mind.

After the Australian performance of *Tapu*, Hill returned to Auckland where he befriended the painter Charles Goldie (1870-1947), who was well-known for his Māori portraits. It was from the Māori who modelled for portraits in Goldie’s studio that Hill collected a lot of Māori music. Hill said, “These old people used to sing to me when the light faded, half-remembered the old chants of the olden days. And that is where I got much of my collection of Māori music, music that went back probably fifty, sixty or more years ago…” Since Hill met Goldie during the early 1900s, his mention of music of fifty or more years ago would place it from the 1840s or earlier. This Māori music will be discussed in detail later in this chapter.

*Waiata Poi* (1904), with words written by Hill himself, was his first work to be recorded. The song was so popular that it was performed throughout New Zealand, and its popularity reached as far as America. Its creation happened spontaneously when Hill was at Goldie’s studio. Hill described how this work came about while Goldie was away, “I sat on the sofa and a little mouse came playing on the carpet. I watched for a while and then suddenly the refrain of the poi song came into my mind.” Hill later dedicated the song to Goldie, his great friend. Hill’s friendship with Goldie played an important role in his collection of Māori music.

Although Thomson suggests that the probable musical origin of *Waiata Poi* “was a poi song popular in the days of Maggie and Bella Papakura, well-known Rotorua personalities,” more study is needed in order to verify its origin. This, however, introduces another major source of Hill’s contact with Māori – his close association with Maggie Papakura from Te Arawa Iwi.

26 Hill, *Interview re. Composition 'Hinemoa.'*
28 Ibid., 82.
Maggie Papakura (1872-1930) was born at Whakarewarewa in Rotorua and was a member of Te Arawa Iwi. She was a well-known Māori guide, who was knowledgeable about Māori culture and history. It is uncertain exactly when Hill became acquainted with her, but it appears to have been during the early 1900s. Although there is not much detail available regarding their contact, their close relationship is reflected in their communications from 1910, in which Papakura sought Hill’s advice about her visit with a group of Māori singers to Sydney. Hill was invited to Rotorua regarding this, and was given a warm welcome by the chiefs of Whakarewarewa when he arrived. From this, we see that he was not only closely associated with Papakura, but with the people of her iwi as well. Their relationship was such that Hill was referred to as “Arapeta Hira,” a Māori transliteration of his name. This also tells us that Hill’s close association with Te Arawa Iwi would have provided him with many opportunities to get to know their culture and collect their music.

The Christchurch International Exhibition 1906-07, in which Hill played a significant role, is important in the history of New Zealand. *Exhibition Ode*, which was composed by Hill to the prize-winning text written by Johannes C. Andersen, was designed for the opening of the exhibition. For this special event, it is not surprising that Hill once again utilised Māori musical elements in the music. The work was performed by New Zealand’s first fully professional orchestra, which was established and conducted by Hill. The whole performance of the piece was highly praised and received enthusiastic applause for several minutes at its conclusion. This work also shows that Māori elements had become extremely important for Hill, and were designed to create a sense of national identity as well as a musical exoticism.

After the last concert of the Exhibition on 15 April, Hill went to Hampden in the South Island for a vacation. It was during this time that *String Quartet No. 2* was begun. This would suggest that Hill started writing the quartet in mid- to late April, 1907. However, there appears to be a long period of time before the quartet was completed. According to the note on the manuscript of the music, it was finished on

---

30 Ibid.
31 “Modern scholarship tells us that Arawhara would transliterate better to Alfred but it appears that Arapeta (Albert) was his given name.” (Donald Maurice, “Alfred Hill (Arapeta Hira), the German, Australian, Kiwi Composer and Violist,” *ANZYS* 17 (November 2004): 21).
32 He was a poet and scholar of Māori culture.
26 August 1911 and performed ten days later in the Austral String Quartet Concert in Sydney. In other words, this piece was written over a period of four years between April 1907 and August 1911.

Although it is uncertain how much of the quartet was completed in 1907, it appears that its completion was spurred on by the prospect of a performance. By 1911 Hill had already returned to Sydney and was playing in the Austral String Quartet. Furthermore, the Austral String Quartet often played new works, including music by contemporary composers such as Debussy and Ravel. As Thomson mentions, the quartet “introduced many new works to an audience at first sceptical and even hostile.”³⁴ As we shall see in the musical analysis, the quartet contains some unusual effects and playing techniques. While these might have been used for the sake of describing the Māori legend on which the quartet was based, it also seems that Hill intended to add those unusual elements to the music to create innovative sounds. Such innovative sound effects may well have been influenced by the contemporary repertoire Hill encountered with the Austral String Quartet.

String Quartet No. 2 is also subtitled Maori. Each of the four movements, which bears their own descriptive title, portrays a scene of the Māori legend:

“No.1 The Forest (Allegro Agitato)”
“No.2 The Dream (Adagio)”
“No.3 The Karakia (Scherzo)”
“No.4 The Dedication (Finale)”

While some Māori words are used, they are restricted to the names of the characters in the legend. Although there is a detailed description of each scene of the story in the programme (see the score), there is no mention of direct appropriation of any Māori melody in the quartet, as was the case in Hinemoa and the Fourth Violin Sonata. Although it is unlikely to contain a direct reference to specific pre-existing Māori melody, the analysis will show that certain characteristics of Māori music can be found in the quartet.

Hill wrote a total of seventeen string quartets, but only the first two have a Māori theme. String Quartet No. 1, which was also subtitled Maori, was dedicated to

³⁴ Thomson, A Distant Music, 121.
the Austral String Quartet. It was first performed by the quartet in Sydney on 18 May 1911. It is not known if Hill had started working on this piece before or after String Quartet No. 2, but its title as the first quartet appears due to its earlier first performance rather than its earlier creation. Unlike String Quartet No. 2, the composer acknowledged the adoption of Māori themes in the music of String Quartet No. 1. Also, Māori musical terms are applied to the music, including the descriptions of two of the movements, which he entitled “Waiata” and “Tangi (Lament).”

One final example of a Hill work from this time that references Māori music is Sonata No. 4 for Violin and Piano, also called the Maori Sonata (1910). Its three movements: “Waiata Maori,” “Tangi” and “Waiata Poi” were all based on the Māori melodies that Hill collected. While the circumstances for the creation and performance of the sonata is not known, Hill later transcribed it into an orchestral work and called it Maori Rhapsody, another example of his re-cycling of compositions.

Hill’s contact with Māori before the completion of String Quartet No. 2 in 1911

Since Hill did not keep a diary regarding his contact with Māori communities, it is difficult to ascertain a chronology of events with regard to his contact with Māori. Moreover, he did not write down all the Māori music that he collected, so it is difficult to tell the types and the amount of Māori music he had heard. However, this thesis attempts to discover information on Hill’s contact with Māori before 1911 in order to examine its effect on String Quartet No. 2. It cannot hope to discover every detail. By working on the limited information found, it aims to explore how those Māori contacts might have influenced this quartet.

Below is a summary of Hill’s contact with Māori prior to 1911:

35 The sonata was also re-arranged by Michael Vidulich as a viola concerto.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Contact with Māori / Māori-inspired works discussed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1895</td>
<td>• Introduction to Māori music through Hoben</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Lives in Rotorua, Taupo and Ngaruawahia for a period of time to collect Māori materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Works on Hinemoa at the end of the year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>• Hinemoa (cantata)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1897</td>
<td>• Settles in Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ca.1898</td>
<td>• Symphony No. 1 in B Flat Maori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(the first three movements were completed by 1898 with the last movement left unfinished)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1902</td>
<td>• Returns to New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Tapu (opera)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ca.1902-04</td>
<td>• Befriends Charles Goldie in Auckland after returning to New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Collects Māori music from the Māori models in Goldie’s studio, some of which Hill claimed to date from around the 1840s or earlier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1904</td>
<td>• Waiata Pōi (song)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>• Commemorative Ode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(for the opening of the Christchurch International Exhibition 1906-07)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1907</td>
<td>• Works on String Quartet no. 2 in mid/late April while on holiday in Hampden in the South Island</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>• Visits Te Arawa Iwi at Whakarewarewa in Rotorua regarding Maggie Papakura’s travel with a group of Māori singers to Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Returns to Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Violin Sonata No. 4 Maori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911</td>
<td>• String Quartet No. 1 Maori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• String Quartet No. 2 Maori (1907-1911)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the early 1800s Māori had been introduced to European music and its style was adopted into their own songs. Diatonic melodies, harmonies from missionary hymns, and other aspects of European style started to become popular among the Māori. Characteristics of this music that were new for Māori were the use of wider intervals, extended range and diatonic scales in the melodies. Māori waiata
absorbed these features, and it was this new type of Māori music that Hill frequently incorporated into his own compositions.

While this ‘Europeanised’ musical form gained popularity, the traditional chant had never disappeared but was practised side by side with it. As McLean and Orbell state, the traditional chant “is still performed today much as it was when Europeans first visited New Zealand two centuries ago.” One reason is that these songs “continue to serve specific social and ceremonial needs.” This ancient song type was without European influence. McLean and Orbell explain that “the lack of European influence on the music is not extraordinary, since it is known that dissimilar styles are unlikely to affect one another very much, except insofar as one may displace the other.” The characteristics of this traditional song type, as opposed to the acculturated European influences, include additive or non-existent metres, narrow ranges, few notes, and small intervals.36

While the traditional chant is without influence from European music, such lack of influence is not absolute. A later collection of the traditional chants by the same authors shows that features of the European musical system are found in those traditional songs composed after the mid-nineteenth century, when European music had already exerted certain influence. However, McLean and Orbell state that the European influence is “almost exclusively in terms of greater use of regular metre and form.” This means the principal features of the traditional Māori system, “such as few notes, small intervals, narrow range, end-of-line drags and terminal glissando, are faithfully followed.”37 In other words, the European influence was mainly restricted to the use of metre and form, and the function and melodic structure of these ‘post-European’ traditional chants remains the same as the ‘pre-European’ ones.

It is likely that Hill became familiar with both pre-European music and acculturated songs that were in the repertoires of the Māori performers with whom he associated. In discussing Māori music with Heenan, Hill mentioned the “small intervals” of the Māori chants, and said that “they couldn’t be taken down in notation.” He also explained that since there was no tape recorder or dictaphone at that time, he took the Māori songs down by notes. For this he would “get the Māori to write the words and then sing with the tune over and over again” until he could sing it

36 Mervyn McLean and Margaret Orbell, Traditional songs of the Maori (Auckland: Auckland University Press, 2004), 7.
with them. Songs with characteristics of traditional chant such as small intervals, end-of-line drags and terminal glissando, would have been difficult to annotate in conventional Western notation, and Hill had to collect them orally.

In describing the Māori chants that he had heard, Hill said, “all the chants that I have heard up to now are short phrases with one grand line which is slightly different. But all the phrases are the same with the exception that you sometimes add a note or two, and a word or two.” His description of the chants matches the basic structure of the sung styles of traditional chant. As McLean and Orbell state, the sung items “use as a formal principle the varied repetition of a basic melody or strophe.”

Hill not only learnt the melodic structure of the traditional song types, but also other characteristics as well. In 1939, when he returned to Auckland to write film music, he attended a performance in which he heard “some of the old valuable songs and waiatas of the past.” After the performance, he made a comment about the practice of taking breath in the middle of a word by Māori. He said, “in olden days it was a serious matter to break even a song by taking breath.” He explained that another singer would take up the theme and carry on the song until the end. He said that this practice “had its roots deeply embedded in the ancient religious philosophy of a cultured race.” His mention of the continuity of a song by avoiding breaks is an important practice in traditional chant. As stated by McLean and Orbell, “a basic principle of waiata style, in front of most Māori song types, is that of melodic continuity. This is achieved by avoiding breaks for breathing.”

In the early 1900s, Hill collected much Māori music in Goldie’s studio, some of which he claimed to date from around the 1840s or earlier. About this time, he was also closely associated with the people of Te Arawa Iwi at Whakarewarewa in Rotorua. Although no further detail regarding these contacts has been found, it is believed that this Māori music would have been similar to that he came across in 1895. This means that he had more opportunities to learn all those song types during that time, and thus became more familiar with the music and its culture.

---

39 Ibid.
40 McLean and Orbell, Traditional songs of the Maori, 11.
42 McLean and Orbell, Traditional Songs of the Maori, 16.
In 1926, Hill published *Songs of the Maori*, in which certain individuals were acknowledged for their contribution to his collection of the Māori songs for this publication.⁴³ These people include Maggie and Bella Papakura, Hare Hongi (Henry M. Stowell), James Cowan, Elsdon Best, J. McDonald, A. T. Ngata M.P. and P. Tahiwi. Again, it has not yet been established exactly when Hill might have come into contact with those people.

Thus, before the completion of String Quartet No. 2 in 1911, Hill had been in contact with the Māori songs whose melodic structure had been influenced by the European musical tradition as well as traditional chants lacking European characteristics. In addition to the melodic structure of the music, he had the knowledge of other characteristics. The following chapters will show how these contacts and knowledge of Māori music might have influenced the quartet.

Hill’s Māori music – traditional or Europeanised?

In order to have a broader view on the Māori music that Hill used in his compositions, I will look at Māori music from two perspectives: Western and Māori. From the Western point of view, if the melodies have any characteristics of European idiom – such as the use of the diatonic scale (rather than micro-intervals) and the use of regular metre (rather than additive or non-existent metres) – they are not considered traditional but Europeanised Māori music. It is solely based on the musical structure of the melody that determines whether the music is traditional.

However, from the Māori point of view, whether or not the music is traditional often depends on the function of the song, not the music itself. As McLean and Orbell mention, Māori chants “serve specific social and ceremonial needs.”⁴⁴ The function of the song is so important to the Māori that “to sing without an object was regarded as an ill omen.” This is why there is a “reluctance [on the part] of present day singers to record songs when there is otherwise no occasion for the performance.”⁴⁵ Since the determining factor here is the function, music that is Europeanised could be still considered as traditional. McLean explains that this happens because “despite incorporating new and often demonstrably European elements, they also satisfy criteria of cultural identity or exemplify indigenous values, usually by virtue of their

⁴⁴ McLean and Orbell, *Traditional songs of the Maori*, 7.
⁴⁵ Ibid., 15.
Thus, as long as the music serves the functions needed, it is considered traditional no matter if it is Europeanised or not. Furthermore, McLean says that, “regardless of origins, a song or dance must be recognised as ‘traditional’ if it is accepted as such by the culture that practises it.” In this sense, whether a piece of music is traditional should be judged by the people within the culture, not from outside.

While the important factor in Māori culture is the message of the text, it does not mean that music is secondary to the text. McLean asserts that, “the genius of group Polynesian dancing and singing lies in the integration of music, text and movement components and the high degree of synchrony and blend involved.” He reminds the readers that, “for analytic purposes it is legitimate to separate these elements, but it should not be forgotten that in performance they are integrated, inseparable and equal.” Therefore, it is actually the whole context – people, occasion, place, text, music and body movement – that makes the music traditional, not the music itself. Based on this, what Hill did was to take certain elements from this context, which are traditional as a whole.

Indeed, according to the materials found for this research, Hill never stated if the Māori music that he used was traditional or Europeanised. What he did state is that these elements, whether they were music, legends or simply a Māori word, were from the Māori people. It is the association with the Māori that is important to Hill. He once said that, “…without destroying the native colour and flavour of these old tribal melodies, we can make a sonata or a string quartet or an opera or an cantata…” This tells us that what was important for Hill is not the melody itself, but the “native colour and flavour” of Māori music that could be expressed through the melody.

Hill even compared Māori music with European music: “when you listen to a well performed war song or haka, it is like listening to a fine bit of Beethoven, or a little bit of Wagner opera. It’s great art and that is the important thing.” Here, he was not so much comparing their musical quality as asserting that they were all great art within their own tradition.

47 McLean, Weavers of Song: Polynesian Music and Dance, 438.
48 Ibid., 412.
50 Ibid.
In fact, the use of Māori melody alone cannot make Hill’s works Māori in any case. What made his essentially Western Romantic musical style have a sense of Māoriness was the composer’s notes on the music, the Māori titles or terms used in the music, and his close relationship with the Māori (which was known to many of his audience). With this background, he tried to create an impression or, as he said, the “native colour and flavour” of Māori in his music. He also attempted to create a sense of ‘otherness’ or exoticism through reference to Nationalist works by composers such as Dvorak. We will explore such influences in later chapters.

Based on what has been discussed, we miss Hill’s message if we only focus on the melodic structure of the ‘Europeanised’ Māori music used in his works. He simply referenced the Māori in his works through using their music. It appears that Hill expressed this in his music so well that the Māori responded to it. As Tregear, an eminent authority on the Māori, said when talking about Hinemoa, “…I could not have believed that any European music could have so well interpreted the genius of the Māori feeling…The man who can make such music as ‘Hinemoa’ must walk in front of us all.”51 This reflects that Hill’s incorporation of Māori music in his works was not a superficial one, since one had to have a good understanding of the culture and people in order to be able to convey this sense of cultural identity.

So, it is likely that the musical structure of the Māori music that Hill used is in the European style. It is the case however that this music is traditional within its own framework. Both are valid statements and indeed have no conflict with each other. To address the Europeanisation of Māori music is to help understand its development. Thus, one of the aims of this thesis is not to identify the traditional Māori music or chase the origin of the Europeanised ones, but to explore how those Māori contacts might have influenced the musical features of this particular work.

After String Quartet No. 2 – settling in Sydney (1911-60)

Due to health problems, Hill returned to Sydney in 1910 and settled there until his death in 1960. Although he continued to visit New Zealand and his Māori friends after leaving the country, the Māori influence on his works gradually lessened. In the first year after he left New Zealand, as discussed, the first two string quartets were played by the Austral String Quartet, of which he had become a member in 1911.

51 This quotation is from a letter mentioned in the article “E Hine te Aroha E,” New Zealand Radio Record (November 1931): 2. (The whole name of the writer of the letter is not mentioned.)
Four years later, he wrote *Maori Rhapsody*, which is the orchestral version of Violin Sonata No. 4 written in 1910. Again, the circumstance of the creation and performance of this work is not known, but this was likely to be intended for a particular occasion.

By the middle of this decade Hill seems to have become a principal musical figure in Australia, especially after he became first professor of harmony and composition at the New South Wales State Conservatorium of Music in 1916. However, while his focus was on Australia, his links with New Zealand and Māori remained. In 1926 his *Songs of the Maori* was published, which contains the Māori songs he collected and arranged. Ten years later, he proposed to the New Zealand Prime Minister the establishment of New Zealand Conservatorium of Music, which was eventually abandoned due to the outbreak of war.\(^5^2\) When he returned to New Zealand in 1930 and 1939 to write film music, he collected Māori music while visiting their communities. Moreover, there were Māori-inspired works produced in the 1930s, including the cantata *Tawhaki* which was based on a Māori legend, and *The Sacred Mountain* for piano quartet which was inspired by an old Māori poem.

**Conclusion**

Hill’s Romantic musical language resulted from his exposure to this style during his studies in Leipzig. Since his first contact with Māori music in 1895, this other element became an important part of his works, and was significant in his life, particularly during his final years of residence in New Zealand in the 1900s. In addition to the analysis of String Quartet No. 2, this thesis aims to explore how the composer tried to integrate elements of Māori culture into his music.

\(^{5^2}\) Thomson, *A Distant Music*, 189-190.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

There is little literature about Alfred Hill. Most writings are short articles and deal generally or briefly with the topic. In fact, in preparing a review of literature on Hill, one discovers that there is inconsistency in the information from different sources. This review will show that the limited availability of the materials needed has made previous studies very difficult, despite all the efforts involved. Most of these studies date from more than fifteen years ago, with the two most significant ones being completed in 1968 and 1980 by Andrew D. McCredie\(^3\) and John M. Thomson,\(^4\) respectively. Furthermore, later publications usually contain repeated information from the previous ones. The availability of materials related to Hill has not largely increased, and the accessibility of those items has not significantly improved until recently. This suggests one underlying reason for the lack of research on the composer and his music. Another possible reason for the lack of research is the erroneous perception that Hill is not worthy of in-depth study. Very often he is not considered a genuine New Zealander, and the quality of his compositions has not been viewed particularly favourably by the academic community.

Because of the limited existing in-depth writings as mentioned above, articles from newspapers, especially those written during Hill’s lifetime, are also included in this review. Although they are often intended for the general public, these materials are reliable resources as they elaborate on a particular event or social response regarding the music of that time.

Since primary sources are important due to the lack of existing extensive studies, writings concerning major primary materials such as manuscripts and personal papers are also mentioned. They provide information about valuable resources for the study of the topic. In light of this, this review of literature aims to show that more materials have become available in recent years, and that there is still much to learn about Hill and his music.


Classification of the literature

For the purposes of this study, the writings on Hill and his music are classified in four categories: (1) biography, (2) study of particular works, (3) the rise in recognition of Māori music through Hill’s works and (4) sources of primary materials. There is also a section on literature regarding the analytical methods adopted in this thesis, followed by a section on literature dealing with Romantic compositional issues.

Biography

The most thorough writing in this category is Thomson’s *A Distant Music*. While this biography deals with the whole life of the composer, as the title already suggests, its focus is on the musical life of the Antipodes during Hill’s lifetime rather than on his personality or his music. There is discussion of Hill’s major works, but there is no analysis of the music. There is a comprehensive account of the events of Hill’s life, and of the people around him. Indeed, Thomson admits that his aim was to investigate significant events during the evolution of a colonial musical tradition through examining the life and times of its principal figure. Thus, this book is not the type of biography that deals primarily with the personal life of the composer, nor is it a study of his music. It is an Australasian musical history during the period in which Hill was the focal point.

Another important writing in this category is the paper “Alfred Hill (1870-1960): Some Backgrounds and Perspectives for an Historical Edition” by McCredie. It deals with Hill’s student years in Leipzig, the major events that Hill had been involved with, both in New Zealand and Australia between 1892 and 1930, and the relationship of his string quartets to the symphonies, with an analysis on the transformation of the String Quartet in B Minor into the Symphony in B Minor. However, McCredie, at the beginning of his paper, states that it is not a biography of Hill or an examination of his life accomplishment. Rather, its aim is to examine the major primary documentary and musical source materials, which were then known as the Alfred Hill Papers, held at the Mitchell Library, the State Library of New South Wales in Sydney. By looking at these sources from the historical, sociological, biographical and musical perspectives, it investigates the significance of these sources on Hill. Thus, this paper is also not a study of Hill’s personal life or his music, although there is discussion of these aspects.
There are other biographical writings on the composer by the authors mentioned above, but they are largely based on the two writings mentioned. Therefore, there is no book on Hill that focuses specifically on his music or his personal life in any great detail.

Study of particular works

Since it was not Hill’s practice to record, number or date his own compositions, there is not a complete list of his works available. Because of this, Allan Stiles is currently working on a catalogue of the works for his PhD thesis. This is a catalogue of more than 2000 titles, and when it is available it will be very useful for future study of Hill’s music.

While there is no one book that analyses Hill’s music, studies on some of his works do exist. As mentioned before, McCredie has done an analysis on the transformation of the String Quartet in B Minor into the Symphony in B Minor. It aims to identify the deviations between the two pieces and the new elements in the later piece. Thus, the objective is to reveal Hill’s practice of adapting and transforming his already existing materials, rather than the inner workings of the music.

In his paper "The Maori Musical Elements in the First Symphony and the String Quartets Nos. 1 & 2," Eric Rowe tries to identify the Māori musical elements in the music. While it analyses melody, harmony and form in these works, it is probably due to the limited scope of the paper that only parts of certain movements are studied. However, such partial analysis does not give a thorough, in-depth overview of the music.

Jeremy Commons has written about Hill’s ten operas by discussing the libretti, their creation and the social response to them. However, there is no musical analysis involved. In other words, this paper was written solely from the social perspective.

55 Allan Stiles is a musicologist, who has been collecting and studying Hill’s music for several years. He founded Stiles Music Publications (http://www.stilesmusicpublications.com/index.html) in 2000, which supplies editions of a number of previously unpublished works by Hill.
56 Eric Rowe, "The Maori Musical Elements in the First Symphony and the String Quartets Nos. 1 & 2." (A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the award of the degree of Bachelor of Creative Arts (Honours), University of Wollongong, 1998).
57 For Symphony No. 1 and String Quartet No. 2, only the first movement is analysed; and for String Quartet No.1, only the second and third movements are analysed.
Indeed, Commons states that he deliberately makes no judgment on the quality of the operas. He believes that as works intended for live performance in the theatre, they must be heard or even seen before a valid assessment can be made.

Peter Harcourt’s comprehensive account of New Zealand musicals between 1880 and 1940 also deals with Hill’s stage musicals.\textsuperscript{59} Although there is a special focus on the Māori aspect, the approach is also a social one. Similarly, Sarah Shieff investigates the cantata \textit{Hinemoa} from the social point of view rather than a musical one. By looking at the cantata in its social context, the objective is to contextualize this particular part of Pakeha musical life in New Zealand rather than examine the music itself.\textsuperscript{60}

There are many other writings discussing Hill’s works, but they are mainly studies from the social or historical perspective. There are also many short newspaper articles commenting on his works during the time of their composition and performance. However, again, the remarks are generally a social response to his new compositions. Although occasionally there are comments on the music, they are generally on the style of the music rather than its musical structure or form. Therefore, most studies of Hill’s music are written from the social perspective. While there are papers providing musical analysis of his works, they do not give a thorough examination of a whole work. This was one of the motivating factors for this thesis.

\section*{The rise in recognition of Māori music through Hill’s works}

One important characteristic of Hill’s music is his incorporation of Māori elements in his works. While the way he used those elements might be controversial, there is no doubt that his works helped raise the profile of Māori music in Pakeha society. There are various sources that support this view. All these writings are journal articles, which were completed between the 1920s and 1950s while Hill was still alive. The main message conveyed in these articles is that Hill had not only made Māori music known to New Zealanders, but to the world as well.

Although these articles are short writings and only discuss the topic generally, they reflect Hill’s significant relationship with Māori and his contribution to Māori

\textsuperscript{59} Peter Harcourt, \textit{Fantasy & Folly: The Lost World of New Zealand Musicals, 1880-1940} (Wellington: Steele Roberts, 2002).
culture. The lack of study on this aspect suggests that this important part of Hill’s life and music is largely missing in the current writings.

**Sources of primary materials**

Since there is not much research on Hill and his music, primary materials such as correspondence and manuscripts become very significant. There are articles that deal with Hill’s correspondence and manuscripts, but these say little of his life and music. However, since one difficulty in working on Hill is locating these items, they become valuable as background materials on these primary sources. While various items of Hill are held at different institutions in both Australia and New Zealand, the three writings found for this review are mainly concerned with the materials held at the Mitchell Library, the State Library of New South Wales in Sydney.

One of the earliest writings regarding this aspect is the article by McCredie. As mentioned before, it examines the significance of the Alfred Hill Papers as the primary materials for later studies on the composer and his music. According to McCredie, these papers were a collection of documents and manuscripts presented to the Mitchell Library by Hill’s wife in July 1962, one and a half years after his death. The author examined the papers in early 1967, which were kept in six collapsible canvas folios and had not yet been organized and catalogued. In presenting his paper, McCredie made his own categories and studied the materials from the historical, sociological, biographical and musical standpoints.

At the beginning of his book, Thomson briefly mentioned different sources of Hill’s materials and their status. One major source he used was the Alfred Hill Papers, which by the time of his study had already increased to two sets comprising ten boxes and two parcels in total. The author states that when he was writing the book in May 1980, these materials had not yet been fully examined and catalogued.

As the music archivist who is responsible for arranging and describing the music manuscripts of Hill and his wife (Mirrie Hill) at the Mitchell Library, Meredith Lawn discusses her experience of handling this challenging task. Fourteen large

---

63 The two sets are the Uncatalogued Papers 1854-1960, which consists of six boxes and one parcel; and the Further Papers 1887-1960, which consists of four boxes and one parcel. (Ibid., see Acknowledgement and Sources).
64 Meredith Lawn. “Musings of a Music Archivist: Arranging and Describing the Music Manuscripts of Alfred and Mirrie Hill at the State Library of New South Wales” This article is a revised and expanded
boxes of the original manuscripts and printed music belonging to Hill and his wife were received by the library in 1991, Lawn states that they were in a state of disarray, and it was a difficult and time-consuming job to make the materials accessible to researchers. Although the collection has become much more accessible after several years of work, she states that there are still materials remaining to be investigated and catalogued properly. Since the first collection of Hill’s materials acquired by the library in 1962 (the six canvas folios studied by McCredie), the entire Hill family collection, which includes personal papers and music of the couple and other family members, has grown to sixty-six boxes in total.

Apart from the materials held at different institutions, there are other items being kept by the family members. Thus, certain materials are not available for research at the present time. Hill’s materials have become more and more accessible in recent years, but there are still materials waiting to be identified and studied.

**Analytical literature**

There are many different ways of analysing a piece of music: a good summary of these can be found in Nicolas Cook’s *A Guide to Musical Analysis*.65 This thesis will take more than one approach in analysing Hill’s String Quartet No. 2. It will be largely based on the traditional methods mentioned by Cook, focusing on form, melody, rhythm and harmony. Since a major characteristic of Hill’s music is the use of various leitmotifs, the motivic approach by Rudolph Reti will also be adopted. The motif presented in the second theme of the first movement of String Quartet No. 2 appears throughout the whole quartet. It is “the central germ of the music”, an idea proposed by David Epstein.66 Its basis is founded on both Schenkerian analysis and Schoenberg’s *grundgestalt* concept, and Epstein demonstrates how works of the eighteenth and nineteenth century are unified by being based on a central germinal element. The approach in this thesis will be similar, while dividing each movement’s analysis into three stages: an overview of the movement’s programme and structure, melodic and motivic analysis, and harmonic and tonal analysis.

---

Literature on Romantic compositional issues

Since Hill’s music is essentially Romantic, it is not surprising to see certain standard compositional devices of the nineteenth century employed in his String Quartet No.2. In addition to the use of a *grundgestalt*, these devices include thematic transformation, cyclic form and programme music. The *New Grove* entries on these topics give a detailed discussion regarding these practices. A topic of particular interest in this quartet is Nationalism, which is associated with the incorporation of Māori materials in order to create a sense of unique identity. There are comprehensive accounts of this issue in books by Carl Dahlhaus and Rey M. Longyear. Hill created a national identity in his music by following the model set by composers such as Dvorak. However, as we shall see in the analysis, Hill achieved this by associating a sense of ‘otherness’ with Māori, through using unusual Western techniques, rather than quoting or imitating Māori music. In terms of Nationalism, this approach makes him different from his contemporaries.

Conclusion

There has been little research done on Hill and his music, with a lack of study on both his personal life and individual works. The lack of scholarship is due to the limited availability of, and accessibility to, primary sources relating to Hill and those few existing completed studies upon which future research could be based. This thesis does not, therefore, have all the information on Hill available for consideration. However, it attempts to make a contribution to research on Hill by focusing in detail on a single composition, String Quartet No. 2, exploring its background thoroughly, and analysing the music in depth.

---

Chapter 3:
(i) Overview

For Hill, the genre of the string quartet was the highest form of music. He once stated that in an orchestra a wrong note could sometimes go undetected, whereas in a string quartet all mistakes would be heard. He said: “The greatest composers had written their finest works in that form. You see, when you have four instruments only, nothing has happened, everything comes out of them, everything is heard.”69 This implies the obvious fact that all the members of a string quartet have to be fine string players. Since this quartet was intended for the Austral String Quartet, in which Hill was a member, he may have used it as a way to demonstrate his own skill on his instrument, as well as his mastery as a composer in the string quartet medium.

Therefore, we could expect the String Quartet No. 2 to be a work of substance, in terms of style and content. This thesis aims to uncover various levels of musical and programmatic thought, and show the different influences on Hill at the time.

String Quartet No. 2, which is based on the legend of Rata, has the following programme provided by Hill himself:

In the forest guarded against man by the potency of a Karakia (talisman) grew the giant kauri (a beautiful New Zealand tree), from which Rata, the hero, would fashion the canoe to bear him across unknown seas. Entering the forest as Taniwha (the grim monster) and Kotuku (a beautiful crane) were engaged in deadly combat, Rata felled the tree. That night he dreamt he heard Kotuku's cry for aid. Changing into a beautiful Maiden, she told how the wicked Tohunga (priest) has cast a spell on her and Taniwha was endeavouring to make her reveal the Karakia. She informed Rata that his labours would be in vain unless he knew the magic formula, and promised to teach it to him if he would kill Taniwha. Next day Rata found the kauri waving gloriously again and beneath it lurked Taniwha. Rata boldly slew the monster and in its place stood the lovely maiden of his dream. From her he learned the formula which he recited to Tane (the forest god). As he did so the air became full of the cry of countless birds. Circling the tree they pecked and pecked until it fell, then fashioning it into the noblest canoe that the world has seen. Dedicating it to Tane, the lovers and birds chanted the mystic Karakia, "Ki te urunga te waka."  

There is also a programme note for each movement describing the scene and music in detail. Each of these will be shown later when analysing the corresponding movement. The four movements are:

“No.1 The Forest (Allegro Agitato)”
“No.2 The Dream (Adagio)”
“No.3 The Karakia (Scherzo)"
“No.4 The Dedication (Finale)”

This piece follows the typical four-movement structure of the nineteenth-century string quartet. The analysis of the music will show how Hill skilfully made use of the standard musical form of each movement to portray the Māori legend.

---

70 Alfred Hill, Programme Notes for String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor in record sleeve, *Two Australian Works: Alfred Hill: Maori Quartet No. 2 in G Minor and Edgar Bainton: Quartet in A Major* performed by the Austral String Quartet, Festival Records FC-30802, vinyl LP.
While the piece is written in Romantic idiom, there are also compositional innovations that were quite unusual for this style of music.

The use of leitmotif to enhance the programme in this quartet reflects the impact of Wagner. With thematic transformation, these leitmotif themes, which represent particular characters and scenes, are modified in order to adapt them to the programme. Moreover, this work is in cyclic form, “in which a later movement reintroduces thematic material of an earlier movement.” The finale closes “with the material of the beginning of the work.” As well as describing the programme, these techniques also intend to provide “cohesion both between and within separate movements of multi-movements works.”

Furthermore, the analysis will reveal that the unity of the music is also achieved by the use of a grundgestalt – ‘basic shape’ – underlying most of the themes. Samson mentions that it was “the late 19th-century perception that music took its unity from a Grundgestalt…” In addition to the use of a central germinal element, a secondary chromatic motivic idea – with scale degrees five, flat six and natural six – can be found in every movement of the quartet. While this motivic idea is not as pervasive as the grundgestalt, it is employed as a background element to connect different sections of the music. Thus cyclic form, grundgestalt, leitmotif and thematic transformation are all employed by Hill in order to bring coherence and unify this work.

The use of Māori elements in this music could suggest the influence of Nationalist composers, such as Dvorak. As Samson, when discussing Romanticism, says, “the underlying impulse was...that the ‘spirit of the people’, which quickly became synonymous with the ‘spirit of nation’, is embodied in its folk music, as in its language.” While it is unlikely that there is any direct use of music collected from the Māori people, features of their traditional chant can be seen. We will see in the analysis that Hill expressed the “spirit of the people” through the Māori legend and language rather than through reference to their music. Moreover, there are exoticisms in the music that suggest a sense of ‘otherness,’ in keeping with the programmatic

---

72 Ibid., 798.
character of the work. As Samson states, “For some composers, the license of the programme...was the invocation of...an exotic dream-world of folktale and legend...” 75 Hill’s ways of incorporating Māori elements reflect aspects of a Romantic style. The analysis will also show that there are influences from other composers as well, including Beethoven and Debussy.

The analysis of each movement contains an outline of the composer’s programme, a discussion on the form, and an overview of the movement. This is followed by a melodic and motivic analysis, a harmonic and tonal analysis, and finally, a conclusion.

75 Samson, “Romanticism,” 600.
(ii) First Movement

The first movement is entitled “The Forest (Allegro Agitato),” and has the following programme given by the composer:

This carries the hearer into the mysterious shades of the forest, upon which break sounds of the struggle between the Kotuku and the Taniwha. Viola and cello are heard against the double pizzicato which here suggests the tapping of the woodpecker in the silent forest, and later, transferred to the cello, is employed to signify the thudding strokes of the Taniwha. Music suggestive of distant trumpets heralds the approach of Rata, whose splendid theme is allotted to the first violin and afterwards taken up by the cello. The vigorous development section illustrates the progress of the fight, while the reappearance of Rata's theme once more transfers the interest to the forest. In the Coda the hero's work is accomplished, and as evening falls restfully faint echoes of the combat reach the ear.\(^\text{76}\)

Under the title on the score, Hill has written: “a) The fight of the Crane and the Monster” and “b) Rata enters the wood.”

This movement is in sonata form, and it will be shown that these two descriptive sub-headings above are represented by the first and second themes in the exposition respectively.

\(^{76}\) Hill, Programme Notes for String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor.
As shown in Table 2, each section in this standard sonata-form movement (e.g. first subject group) portrays one of the two scenes: the scene “Fight” and the scene with “Rata.” The last section describes both, to conclude the movement.

Table 2 Basic structure of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>No. of bar</th>
<th>Main keys</th>
<th>Programmatic scenes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>1-25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>G minor, D minor</td>
<td>Fight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>26-29</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Rata</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>30-61</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>B-flat major, G major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>62-95</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>Fight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recapitulation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>96-120</td>
<td></td>
<td>Same as the exposition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>121-124</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>125-152</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>G major, E major</td>
<td>Rata</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coda</td>
<td>153-166</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Fight and Rata</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 Overview of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Exposition   | 1-9     | G minor, D minor | • First theme played by first violin, representing the fight scene.  
• The rhythmic pattern of the first three repeating double stops is the dotted rhythm motif of the theme, which keeps reappearing throughout the movement. | “This carries the hearer into the mysterious shades of the forest, upon which break sounds of the struggle between the Kotuku and the Taniwha. Viola and cello are heard against the double pizzicato which here suggests the tapping of the woodpecker in the silent forest…” |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Violin I (bars 1-9)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[Musical notation]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Violin 1 (bars 26-29)**

---

**Violin 1 (bars 30-37)**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>38-41</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• Appearance of dotted rhythm motif reminds us of the fight.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>42-49</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• ‘Hero’ theme is taken up by cello.</td>
<td>“…taken up by the cello.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50-53</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>• Appearance of dotted rhythm motif, once again, reminds us of the fight.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|          | 54-61   | G major        | • ‘Hero’ theme is now played by both violins.  
|          |         |                | • Only first phrase of the theme is played and it is repeated a perfect fourth higher. | ---                        |
| Exposition |        |                |                       |                                              |
| Second subject group |        |                |                       |                                              |

[Sheet music image]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62-77</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>• Materials are from first subject group.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78-86</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>• New melody (which I will refer to as the ‘anguish’ theme) develops in first violin.</td>
<td>“The vigorous development section illustrates the progress of the fight…”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87-95</td>
<td>D major, G minor</td>
<td>• Transition passage to recapitulation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
<td>Bar no.</td>
<td>Main key areas</td>
<td>Comments/Observations</td>
<td>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>96-120</td>
<td>G minor, D minor</td>
<td>• These two sections are the exact repetition of that in exposition.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>121-124</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>125-152</td>
<td>G major, E major</td>
<td>• This section recurs in tonic major.</td>
<td>“…while the reappearance of Rata’s theme once more transfers the interest to the forest.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
<td>Bar no.</td>
<td>Main key areas</td>
<td>Comments/Observations</td>
<td>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Coda     | 153-166| B-flat major, G minor | • New melody transformed from the ‘anguish’ theme emerges in first violin.  
• The movement concludes with the reappearance of the dotted rhythm motif in second violin and viola. | “In the Coda the hero's work is accomplished, and as evening falls restfully faint echoes of the combat reach the ear.” |
Melodic and motivic analysis

The quartet begins with the rustling semiquavers in the viola and the sustained dominant pedal note in the cello, depicting “the mysterious shade of the forest.” This opening music has a similarity with that of Dvorak’s American Quartet (1893), which also starts with a sustained pedal note in the cello with semiquavers above, though it is played by both the violins rather than the viola. Although Dvorak did not provide a programme for this music, his opening creates an effect that is similar to Hill’s quartet. As Robertson comments on Dvorak’s opening: “…the violins as a background, like rustling leaves in the wind, for the quiet entry of the main theme.”

In addition to the similar opening, Dvorak’s use of a pentatonic melody for his first theme is similar to that of Hill’s second theme, which will be shown later. Thus, while it is not known if Hill had come across Dvorak’s quartet, which was composed in America and inspired by the music of the Negroes and the American Indians, the similarities found between the two works suggest he did. Like the New World Symphony, the American Quartet seems to reflect Dvorak’s statement that he intended these late compositions, written when he was domiciled in America, as models to show how composers could utilise “the indigenous musics of their country…'to beautiful treatment in the higher forms of art.’” Hill seems to have followed Dvorak’s model in this quartet.

---

77 Alec Robertson, Dvorak, Master Musicians Series (London: Dent, 1945), 188.
With this background set up in the first bar, the first theme emerges, featuring double stopping on the first violin, which signifies the fight between the Crane and the Monster (Fig. 1). The rhythmic pattern of the repeating three double stops at the beginning of the theme which recurs throughout the whole movement, is a dotted rhythm motif: \( \frac{\text{2}}{\text{4}} \).

**Fig. 1** First theme – first appearance in exposition

This motif appears elsewhere in the movement and develops organically to connect various themes and ideas. In other words, it does not only underpin the fight scene, but also serves to unify the whole movement. The use of the motif in this way was a Romantic “impulse towards organically unified works, notably in thematic working.”

The two melodic lines of the theme move stepwise within a range of no more than a fourth. The first phrase (bars 1-5) is mainly constructed from the dotted rhythm motif, and features a chromatic ascent from D to F. Although the melodic and rhythmic structures of this phrase do not have much variation, a tense atmosphere is created by the rapid dynamic change, which starts with piano and reaches fortissimo within five bars.

---

Moreover, the melodic progression of the chromatic notes here (D to F), which is the fifth – sixth-flat – sixth-natural of the scale degrees (G minor), can be seen both later in this movement, and in the following three movements. This motivic idea serves to connect different sections of the music. However, since it is not as pervasive throughout the quartet as the grundgestalt (which will be discussed later), there will be no further discussion on it. Such a chromatic accent is unremarkable in a work of this style and era. The chromatic progression of this motivic idea reflects Hill’s Romantic tendency. As said by Dahlhaus, “the growing prominence of chromaticism…[is] normally regarded as the signs of musical progress in the nineteenth century.”

The second phrase (bars 6-9) has a melody in parallel fifths, such consecutives being generally avoided in conventional tonal music. Hill also set this out as a general rule when teaching composition. At the beginning of his book *Harmony and Melody*, he had listed three rules for connecting chords, the first of which is to “Avoid parallel 5ths and 8ths.” He states that “Rules are for the sake of sound and practicability.” Such parallel melodic lines are avoided because “They sound crude.” From this, it is evident Hill used a parallel-fifth melody for the second phrase in order to create a “crude” sound or effect.

Such parallel movement of the second phrase also creates a quality in the music that may suggest Hill was attempting to refer to traditional Māori music. In talking about Australian aboriginal music, he said, “…it is primitive and uninfluenced by the white man…the songs are quite unsophisticated – the people haven’t yet heard even a missionary hymn—and they spring from the very heart of the nature.” He continued, “The natives find never-failing inspiration in the birds and animals around them….” Although this was said regarding Australian aboriginal music, his mention of “the natives” suggests that this could also be applied to the Māori. As discussed before, Hill was aware of Māori music whose melodic structure had been influenced by the European musical system. Therefore, it is possible to surmise that Hill was trying to create a sense of ‘otherness’ here, and associated it with the Māori story. The

---

unsophisticated character of the theme, with its parallel fifths, can be seen to reflect what Hill thought of as an “unsophisticated” or “crude” story.

While the first theme is being played, the second violin plays double pizzicato two octaves apart to signify “the tapping of the woodpecker.” This technique, for which both the lowest and highest strings are plucked simultaneously, is an unusual practice in any music before that time. While the adoption of this unusual technique for the instrument was for the sake of imitating the sound of the woodpecker, it also reflects Hill’s innovative approach to instrumental writing. The rustling semiquavers over tonic pedal (referencing the opening of Dvorak’s *American* Quartet), the “crude” parallel fifth melody and the woodpecker double octave pizzicato all combine to create a unique and picturesque passage closely allied to Hill’s programme.

The first theme is immediately taken up by the second violin after its first appearance. Except for the change of key, the main difference in the theme for its second appearance is the addition of a melodic line at the beginning and at the end of the theme (Fig. 2). Rather than starting the repeat by playing the double stops at the interval of a third (as previously), the upbeat in bar 9 is a three-note dominant chord, in which the lowest notes are played by the viola. And at the end of the theme in bars 16-17, a melody, which is an octave higher than the upper melodic line of the second violin, is played by the first violin. The use of an extra melody at the beginning and at the end of the theme for the second time portrays the progress of the fight. Although the modifications of the repeated first theme are very subtle, these changes suggest the gradual progress of the combat, and are a clear example of thematic transformation which was such a Romantic style commonplace.

**Fig. 2 First theme – second appearance in exposition**

> While the semiquaver patterns continue in the viola here, the unusual double pizzicato two octaves apart is now in the cello, and represents “the thudding strokes of the Taniwha.” An additional element is added to the texture, with the first violin
playing fast ascending scale notes, which describe the intensity of the fight as the combat continues.

After this repeat of the theme, it is developed between bars 18 and 23. The melodic lines in these bars, which are played by both the violins, are mainly constructed from the dotted rhythm motif (Fig. 3). The materials of the accompaniment – semiquavers and fast ascending scale notes – are also from the first theme. Thus, these bars are another thematic transformation of the first theme. With the upward movement of the dotted rhythm motif, the portrayal of the fight is maintained in this passage as the first theme develops and reaches a climax at triple forte in bar 24.

**Fig. 3 Development of first theme in exposition**
The texture and rhythmic pattern of the music change in bar 26 where the transition begins (Fig. 4). The first theme is transformed again, using the dotted rhythm motif. The rising open fifths and dotted rhythm motif on the first violin in bars 25 to 29 depict the “music suggestive of distant trumpets heralds the approach of Rata.” The second theme in the next section (second subject group), which also begins with the dotted rhythm motif, emerges naturally and organically from the melodic line in this transition.

Fig. 4 Transition in exposition

The accompaniment for this melodic line has a march-like rhythm, which is the main accompaniment for the second subject group as well. This rhythm also grows out of the first subject group – with reference back to the semiquaver patterns. These continue in the viola in bar 25 until the arrival of the quiet march-like rhythm in bar 26. Thus, the use of the dotted rhythm motif and the march-like accompaniment in the transition create a smooth connection between the first and second themes. The process of transforming the first theme into the second theme shows Hill’s skill in constructing and modifying melodies. Although the two themes portray two different scenes, the sharing of the dotted rhythm motif suggests they happen simultaneously in the same place – the forest. These connections contribute to the cohesive and original nature of this work.
The second theme, which Hill called the “hero motive,” is a contrasting lyrical theme. Its first appearance starts with the upbeat in bar 29 and ends with a tailpiece in bar 38 (Fig. 5). Since this theme reappears in other movements, for convenience, I will thereafter refer to it as the ‘hero’ theme.

**Fig. 5 Second theme – first appearance in exposition**

It will be shown later that the “motive” Hill is referring to here consists of the four descending pitches indicated above (F, D, C, B-flat). This becomes an important *grundgestalt* in the quartet (see Fig. 83 in chapter 6). Although the theme, which is in the key of B-flat major, is made up of all the notes of the scale – B-flat, C, D, E-flat, F, G and A – the fourth note (E-flat) only appears three times and the seventh note (A) only once. Thus, the predominant use of the other five notes, which belong to the pentatonic scale, creates a mainly pentatonic flavour in the ‘hero’ theme. As mentioned earlier, we can draw parallels between Hill’s pentatonicism and its use by Dvorak, particularly in his *American* Quartet and *New World* Symphony.
While the melodic and rhythmic structure of Hill’s ‘hero’ theme is different from Dvorak’s first theme (Fig. 6), Hill’s mainly pentatonic melody could reflect his interest in pentatonicism in Dvorak’s work. Dvorak’s use of the pentatonic scale in this piece, which adopts the scalar characteristics in American Indian and Negro music, was the result of his American experience.

Fig. 6 Dvorak, _American_ Quartet, first movement, first theme

The pentatonic melody used by the Czech master was an expression of his impressions of the new country he was living in at that time: America. In the same way, Hill may have tried to apply an impression of ‘otherness’ to the Māori hero in his story through associating the character with an ‘exotic’ melody, which is predominately constructed with the pentatonic scale.

In addition to the use of the pentatonicism, the melodic structure of Hill’s ‘hero’ theme shows a characteristic resemblance to Dvorak’s opening theme in the adagio of the _New World_ Symphony, which was also composed in the same year in America (1893). Although the rhythmic pattern of Hill’s theme is different from that of Dvorak’s opening theme, they all share the distinctive repeated notes in the melodies as illustrated on the next page. While Hill mentioned the _New World_ Symphony in an interview undertaken in 1926, 83 it is not known if he had heard it before the completion of his quartet in 1911. However, the appearance of these features in Dvorak’s music, plus the fame of the _New World_ Symphony, suggests he did.

In Hill’s theme, the repeated second and third notes in bars 33, 35 and 37, are like those in Dvorak’s themes as shown in Figs. 7-9. Moreover, the pitch relationship in the melodic line of Hill’s theme presents a parallel to the theme in Dvorak’s adagio as labelled with “a,” “b” and “c” above the corresponding fragments of the melody in Figs. 7-8.

**Fig. 7** Hill, String Quartet No. 2, first movement, ‘hero’ theme (second theme)

![Fig. 7](image1)

**Fig. 8** Dvorak, *New World* Symphony, adagio, opening theme

![Fig. 8](image2)

While those musical features found in Hill’s quartet are not exclusively Dvorak’s, the parallel seen in their music reflect their shared impressions of ‘exotic’ music they encountered, though the two cultures were totally different from each other.

The first appearance of the ‘hero’ theme is accompanied by the march-like rhythm played by the rest of the instruments (Fig. 5). With the expression “spring” marked for the repeated semiquavers, which refers to the technique of bouncing the bow on the string (*spiccato*), the accompaniment suggests the purposefulness of the Māori hero as he walks in the forest. As with the first theme, Hill was conscious of developing interesting timbre in his piece for picturesque purposes. After that, the theme is taken up by the cello in bar 42, with the same rhythmic pattern as the accompaniment.
Between repeats of the ‘hero’ theme are short reminders of the first theme, which becomes modified into a shorter melodic line, again, using the dotted rhythm motif. The dotted rhythm motif on the first violin and the semiquavers on the viola and cello recall briefly the fight (Fig 9). The similar reminders of the first theme occur in bars 50-53 also, and suggest that the struggle continues, despite the focus on the Māori hero.

Fig. 9 Between the first two appearances of the ‘hero’ theme in exposition

The third appearance of the ‘hero’ theme is played by both the first and second violins with the former playing an octave higher (Fig. 10). Rather than repeating the whole theme, only the first phrase is played and is immediately repeated in bar 58. These two ‘first’ phrases are connected by the fast ascending G major scale notes, which are like those that appeared in the first subject group.

Fig. 10 ‘Hero’ theme – third appearance in exposition
Furthermore, rather than being accompanied by the march-like rhythm, it is accompanied by semiquavers in the viola and pizzicato in the cello. These show that the elements of the first subject group are present in the third appearance of the ‘hero’ theme. Thus, the transformed ‘hero’ theme is played in a higher register by more instruments and is incorporated with elements of the first subject group. It is intended to heighten the atmosphere and anticipate the return of the fight scene in the next section – the development section – as well as creating musical unity.

The development section (bars 62-95), portrays “the progress of the fight,” and therefore is dominated by the dotted rhythm motif and the elements for the first subject group, which include semiquavers, double pizzicato two octaves apart and fast ascending scale notes. The first half of the development section (bars 62-77) is mainly constructed from these elements with the dotted rhythm motif as the main element for the melodic line.

The second half of the development section (bars 78-95) is also dominated by the dotted rhythm motif and semiquavers. However, a significant new melodic line emerges in the first violin in bar 78, accompanied by the dotted rhythm motif (Fig. 11). This expressive theme in the distant key at B minor is marked “with anguish” by the composer. For convenience, I will refer to it as the ‘anguish’ theme. It recurs elsewhere in the quartet, as we shall see.

**Fig. 11 ‘Anguish’ theme in development**
Although on first impression this theme looks like a new melody, it is actually a transformation of the ‘hero’ theme. The basic outline of the four descending notes of the “hero motive” is presented in the first two phrases of the ‘anguish’ theme (Fig. 12). The next two phrases of the ‘anguish’ theme (Fig. 14) also resemble the third and four bars of the ‘hero’ theme in the third appearance (Fig. 13). Moreover, the two themes bear similar rhythmic structure. While the ‘anguish’ theme is transformed from the ‘hero’ theme, an element of the first theme is also used - the fast ascending scale notes in bar 84. Thus, the ‘anguish’ theme has embodied elements of both the first and the ‘hero’ themes. While the ‘anguish’ theme portrays the struggle of combat, its transformation from the ‘hero’ theme signifies that the hero will soon save kotuku (who is actually a beautiful maiden) from the monster.

Fig. 12 Motivic link between the ‘hero’ and the ‘anguish’ theme
‘Hero’ theme:

‘Anguish’ theme:

Fig. 13 ‘Hero’ theme – third appearance in exposition

Fig. 14 ‘Anguish’ theme – third and fourth phrases

84 The descending five notes in bars 80-81 (F-sharp, E, D, C-sharp and B) also recur in the third and fourth movement, in the ‘karakia’ theme. The association of these thematic links is summarised in Fig. 83.
The ‘anguish’ theme is modified in bars 87-93 based on the melodic and rhythmic pattern of bars 83 and 85. This small fragment of melodic line, which reappears in later movements when the fight scene is recalled, is like the ‘anguish’ motif of the theme. Moreover, these last bars of the development section are marked with the expression “getting weaker” and are played quietly and slowly. With the use of semibreves rather than the dotted rhythm motif as the accompaniment, they signify the suspension of the fight as the two characters become exhausted.

Beginning at bar 96, the recapitulation is standard in structure, with some thematic variation, such as the shortening of the second subject group. Both the first subject group and the transition are the same as that in the exposition. Except for key change and the use of the instruments in certain segments, the main change of the second subject group in the recapitulation is the last appearance of the ‘hero’ theme, in which only the first phrase is played and is played only by the first violin. After that, it moves directly to the melodic line in the final section – the coda. With semibreves as the main accompaniment, this shortened ‘hero’ theme creates a restful atmosphere as the hero finishes his work.

In the coda (Fig. 15), “the hero’s work is accomplished,” and here Hill reintroduces his ‘anguish’ theme from the development. It is varied and extended into a lengthy statement:

![Fig. 15 Theme in coda](image)
As shown above, the rhythmic structure and melodic contour of the first four bars of the theme in the coda (bars 153-156) are similar to the second phrase of the ‘hero’ theme in the second appearance in the recapitulation (bars 141-145). The theme then develops based on the rhythmic pattern of the third bar of the ‘hero’ theme (such as bar 32 in Fig. 13). And as expected, we see the outline of the four descending notes of the “hero motive” appears in this theme (Fig. 16).

Fig. 16 Motivic link between the ‘hero’ theme and the theme in coda

‘Hero’ theme:

Theme in coda:

Since the coda describes the accomplishment of the hero's work and the weakening of the fight, it is not surprising that the theme is transformed from the ‘anguish’ theme, which is modified from the ‘hero’ theme. As the movement approaches the end, the double-stopping dotted rhythm motif appears again quietly in the second violin and the viola, and portray that “as evening falls restfully faint echoes of the combat reach the ear.” One main thematic idea, one grundgestalt, has been subtly, thematically transformed throughout the movement. This transformation serves to unify the movement and allows for the depiction of the programme.
Harmonic and tonal analysis

The tonal structure of this movement is conventional in terms of the large scale elements of the form: tonic minor $\rightarrow$ relative major. While the typical minor-relative major relationship of sonata form is adopted, the Romantic tendency to explore keys a third apart can be seen as well. Furthermore, the use of mainly major or minor keys for a particular theme is selected to give the contrasting quality of the characters that each theme represents.

Table 4 Tonal plan of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Keys</th>
<th>Relation to the home key</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Exposition</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>1-9</td>
<td>G minor $\rightarrow$ D minor</td>
<td>Home $\rightarrow$ Dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10-17</td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>Dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18-25</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>26-29</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>30-37</td>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Relative major (Minor third above tonic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>38-61</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Tonic major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Development</strong></td>
<td>62-95</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recapitulation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>96-104</td>
<td></td>
<td>Same as the exposition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>105-112</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>113-120</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>121-124</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>125-132</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Tonic major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>133-143</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Minor third below tonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>144-152</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Tonic major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Coda</strong></td>
<td>153-166</td>
<td>B-flat major $\rightarrow$ G minor</td>
<td>Relative major $\rightarrow$ Home</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 4, in the exposition, the first subject group is mainly in minor keys while the second subject group is in the relative major key. The use of tonic major (G) in both exposition and recapitulation enhances the sense of splendour and brilliance, which are designed to portray the Māori hero in the second theme. In the same way, the minor keys, which are often used to create an impression of roughness and agitation, are intended for the fight scene.
The tonic is established in the first four bars of the movement. However, the sustained dominant pedal creates a tonal instability, which drives the music to the new tonal area – the dominant (D minor) – in the middle of the theme (Fig. 17).

**Fig. 17** Harmonic reduction of first theme – first appearance in exposition

Although the second phrase (bars 6-9) has a much faster harmonic rhythm, there are only two chords – subdominant and dominant seventh – which alternate with each other. The resolution of these consecutive seventh chords does not occur until bar 10. A tension is thus created in the theme by its unstable second inversion tonic chord at the beginning and the subsequent unresolved seventh chords.

Like the first appearance, the theme in the second appearance is also harmonised largely with seventh chords (Fig. 18). In addition to the more frequent key change, the music finds its way to the dominant of the dominant where a chromatic passing chord (a diminished seventh chord) is added between the subdominant and dominant seventh chords in the second phrase (bars 14-15). Without any resolutions, the seventh chords continue in bar 18, where the first theme is developed. Thus, even greater harmonic tension is created in the second appearance of the theme by both frequent key change, and by unresolved seventh and diminished chords.

**Fig. 18** Harmonic reduction of first theme – second appearance in exposition
The harmonic progression of the development of the first theme is based on a sequence in bars 18-19 (Fig. 19). Bar 20’s A-flat chord (Neapolitan in the tonic key) pivots us back to the home key for the cadence in bar 24.

Fig. 19 Harmonic reduction of the development of first theme in exposition

Therefore, the first subject group is dominated by frequent and rapid key change, which creates a great tension in this section, which Hill no doubt intended to depict the fight scene.

Compared to the first theme, the ‘hero’ theme has a slower and more regular harmonic rhythm, and is considerably more stable in tonality. Except for the beginning two bars of the theme, which remain on the same chord, there is only one chord in each bar for all three appearances. Moreover, while the second phrase does not necessarily resolve itself in each appearance, the first phrase, which consists of only two chords – tonic and subdominant – always resolves before moving on to the second phrase.

As shown in Fig. 20, the ‘hero’ theme is initially in the relative major key (B-flat), but eventually modulates to the tonic major (G) for the repeat of the theme. This establishes a relationship of keys a third apart, which recurs elsewhere in the movement.

Fig. 20 Harmonic reduction of ‘hero’ theme – first appearance in exposition
The use of third-related key areas can be traced back to Beethoven, who occasionally used such a key relation for the second subject group. However, it was Schubert who was the first composer to frequently apply it to his music. In discussing the third-related tonal schemes in Schubert’s music, Richard Cohn proposes to look at harmonic relationships in terms of “voice-leading efficiency” rather than “scale-degree function”. In the cycles of triads based on this idea, which assumes enharmonic equivalence, triads are related by semitonal displacement.

Cohn mentions three types of harmonic relationships within the triadic cycles: (1) adjacent harmonies which “involve a single semitonal displacement,” (2) modally matched harmonies which “involve dual semitonal displacements in contrary motion,” and (3) polar harmonies which “have no common tones and so simultaneously displace all three voices semitonally.” If we look at Hill’s usage of third-relationships here from Cohn’s standpoint, the use of B-flat major in the second subject group is viewed as a substitute for the dominant (D major) rather than a diatonic mediant. This is explained by the modally matched harmonies, in which B-flat and F displace A and F-sharp respectively. Also, Cohn’s adjacent harmonies account for the relation of G major to G minor which is only a semitone apart. The use of this approach, as we shall also see later in the music, suggests that Hill intended to use keys a third apart as a way to substitute for the more standard primary tonal areas, including dominant and subdominant.

While the second appearance of the theme ends with a perfect cadence, the third appearance, which consists of only the first phrase, ends with an imperfect cadence (Fig. 21).

Fig. 21 Harmonic reduction of ‘hero’ theme– third appearance in exposition

---

87 Ibid., 217.
Without resolving the last chord, the music moves directly to the development section in bar 62, which starts with a diminished seventh chord. The unresolved status of the tonality here is intended to create a tense atmosphere for preparing the arrival of the agitated development section, which portrays the progress of the fight.

The development section can be divided into two parts. The first part (bars 62-77) has an unstable tonality. It is constructed mainly with seventh and diminished chords, of which the latter are chromatic passing chords, a common Romantic harmonic device. These chords again do not resolve until the arrival of the second part in bar 78.

At the end of the first part in bars 76-77, the dominant seventh chord in the key of F-sharp minor is established with an emphasis on the dominant (C-sharp). While this suggests that the music would go on with the same key, it unexpectedly resolves with a perfect cadence in the key of B minor in bar 78 where the second part starts.

The second part (bars 78-95), in which the ‘anguish’ theme appears, stays only in two keys until the end when it prepares for the arrival of the recapitulation (Fig. 22). It begins with B minor, a third above the home key, until bars 86-90 where the music starts to shift away from B minor, eventually modulating to D major in bar 91. If we look at the tonal relation here using Cohn’s approach, B minor would act as a substitute for G major (tonic major). This is explained by the adjacent harmonies, in which F-sharp (of B minor) displaces G (of G major). Using the same theories, D major becomes a substitute for F-sharp major, the dominant of B minor, with D displacing C-sharp.

Fig. 22 Harmonic reduction of development section (bars 78-95)
In addition, this part starts on a sustained dominant pedal (F-sharp). Similarly, the sustained dominant A pedal is seen in bars 91-93 as the development section approaches the end. The use of a dominant pedal, which is used to raise tension and evoke a sense of expectation, is a common device in Romantic music. Although the second part has a more stable tonality, chromatic passing chords are employed in order to add intensity to this passage.

In the recapitulation, the first subject group and the transition are the same as the exposition. While there is key change in the second subject group, the harmonic progression remains more or less the same as that in the exposition. Instead of returning to the tonic, the second subject group remains in the major keys in the recapitulation, which are now G major and E major. This echoes the relationship of keys a third apart seen in the exposition (B-flat and G), while itself being a third lower. Again, when looking at the key relation here using Cohn’s modally matched harmonies, E major acts as a substitute for the subdominant (C major) of G major, with G-sharp displacing G and B displacing C. Thus we have tonal balance: B-flat major is a third-related substitute for the dominant (D) in the exposition, and E major is a third-related substitute for the subdominant (C) in the recapitulation.

Before the key returns to the tonic in the coda, it modulates briefly to B-flat major, once again, which is the relative major of the home key. As well as being the mediant it is a substitute for the dominant (D major) of G major in the previous section. Thus, the relationship of a third in the tonality is used to replace the more standard tonal areas, and is significant in this movement.
Conclusion

This sonata form movement is unified with the dotted rhythm motif, which appears throughout the movement. It develops organically to transfer between the contrasting first and second themes, which represent the fight of the two characters and the Māori hero respectively.

The first theme, which gives the impression of roughness and intensity, is constructed with the expanding intervals and double-stopping melodies in parallel fifths, and characterized by minor keys. The ‘hero’ theme, which gives the impression of splendour and ‘otherness,’ features a mainly pentatonic melody, and emphasises the major keys. Thematic transformation creates coherence and depicts programmatic aspects. Furthermore, the predominant use of the seventh chords in the first theme creates a tense atmosphere while the use of keys a third apart in the tonality of the ‘hero’ theme substituting for the more standard tonal areas, and is a typical Romantic device for the time of Schubert onwards.

The exploration of pentatonicism and the use of the characteristic repeated notes in the ‘hero’ theme suggest the influence of Dvorak’s music from the American period. The adoption of the unusual instrumental effects – double pizzicato two octaves apart and the double-stopped parallel fifths – reflect Hill’s innovative approach, and are used to suggest exotic ‘otherness,’ enhancing the programmatic elements of the music.
The second movement is entitled “The Dream (Adagio),” and has the following programme given by the composer:

The first theme exquisitely evokes the fabric of the hero's vision - a dream flight. Fugitive thoughts of the noble canoe float across Rata's awakening sight until the second theme appears with a complete change of tonality. Again is heard the sad cry of Kotuku, hard beset by the grim monster. The music swells in a great crescendo as the dream grows more vivid. Then, as it fades, the slumber motive reappears, giving a sense of complete rest.88

This movement is in ternary form. Since there are modifications in the returning first section, the structure is expressed as ABA’. Following the basic scheme of this musical form, the middle section is highly contrasting in mood, tonality and thematic materials. As shown in the table below, each section portrays one of the two scenes (“dream flight” and “sad cry of Kotuku”), with the last section summarising the movement.

Table 5 Basic structure of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>No. of bar</th>
<th>Main keys</th>
<th>Programmatic scenes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>1-41</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Dream flight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>42-75</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Sad cry of Kotuku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A’</td>
<td>76-102</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Dream flight and Sad cry of Kotuku</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

88 Alfred Hill, Programme Notes for String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor in record sleeve, Two Australian Works: Alfred Hill: Maori Quartet No. 2 in G Minor and Edgar Bainton: Quartet in A Major performed by the Austral String Quartet, Festival Records FC-30802, vinyl LP.
### Table 6 Overview of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| A        | 1-8     | A-flat major   | • First theme – first phrase (bars 1-4) is on first violin and second phrase (bars 5-8) on viola.  
• First phrase – an unaccompanied mainly pentatonic melody.  
• Second phrase – emerges in bar 5 with accompaniment.  
• The first eight notes of the theme, which recurs later in the movement, are like a ‘dream’ motif. | “The first theme exquisitely evokes the fabric of the hero's vision - a dream flight.” |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9-16</td>
<td>A-flat major, F minor</td>
<td>• A variation of first theme on first violin.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| A        | 17-24   | A-flat major, F minor | • Second theme, also on first violin.  
• First phrase (bars 17-20) consists of a sequence of triplets while second phrase (bars 21-24) consists of chromatic notes, colourfully harmonized. | “Fugitive thoughts of the noble canoe float across Rata's awakening sight until…” |

![Violin I (bars 9-16)](image1)

![Violin I (bars 17-24)](image2)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>25-32</td>
<td></td>
<td>Return of first theme, on tonic A-flat.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>33-41</td>
<td><strong>A-flat major</strong></td>
<td>Another variation of first theme, with the incorporation of dotted rhythm motif from the first movement. The appearance of the dotted rhythm motif in this passage is used to anticipate the return of the fight scene of the first movement in the next section – the B section.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Musical notation for bars 33-39 and 40-41](attachment:image)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| B        | 42     | Enharmonic change | • Through an enharmonic change, the music modulates from A-flat major to A major, which marks the beginning of the B section.  
• It is linked by the recurring dotted rhythm motif. | “…the second theme appears with a complete change of tonality. Again is heard the sad cry of Kotuku, hard beset by the grim monster.” |
| B        | 43-51  | B minor       | • This theme, which the composer called the second theme, is actually the third theme in the movement.  
• It is a modification of the ‘anguish’ theme from the first movement with the dotted rhythm motif as the accompaniment.  
• Restless tonally, but moves towards B minor when reaching in bar 48. | |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 52-57    | B minor|                | • A variation of third theme.  
• Dotted rhythm motif continues in counterpoint with the melody. | “The music swells in a great crescendo as the dream grows more vivid.” |
| 58-70    | B minor|                | • A repetition of the ‘anguish’ theme (bars 78-90) from first movement with minor modifications in expression and melodic structure.  
• Dotted rhythm motif persists in accompaniment until bar 66. | --- |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| B        | 71-75  |                | • Transition passage to next section – the A’ section.  
<pre><code>      |         |                | • The chromatic progression here prepares the return to A-flat major. | “Then, as it fades…” |
</code></pre>
<p>| A’       | 76-83  | A-flat major   | • First theme returns, re-establishing tonic A-flat and signifying the final section. | “…the slumber motive reappears, giving a sense of complete rest.” |
|          | 84-92  |                | • A repetition of variation of first theme played at the end of A section (bars 33-41). | --- |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A’</td>
<td>93-96</td>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>• The reappearance of the beginning of the ‘dream’ motif of the first theme in bars 93 and 95 leads to the anticipation of the return of the first theme. &lt;br&gt; • However, the appearance of the ‘anguish’ motif in the following bars (bars 94 and 96) instead of the expected triplet of the ‘dream’ motif, reinforces the residual thoughts of the fight.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>97-102</td>
<td></td>
<td>• ‘Dream’ motif returns quietly in second violin, which gives “a sense of complete rest.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Melodic and motivic analysis

Since the A section portrays the hero’s dream flight, all parts in this section are played with mutes and no vibrato to create the purity and simplicity of the dream state. The use of no vibrato is an unusual effect in the context of Romantic music, and shows another aspect of Hill’s innovative approach. In addition to these, the first theme (Fig. 23) is played calmly and softly to reinforce the dream-like quality of the music.

Fig. 23 First theme in A section

The movement opens with an unaccompanied mainly pentatonic melody, which creates a sense of ‘otherness’ associated with the Māori hero. This melodic line, which is the first phrase (bars 1-4) of the first theme, is characterized by the triplet in the second bar. The first eight notes of this phrase, which appear whenever the restful atmosphere of the dream is evoked, are like a ‘dream’ motif. Also, we see the basic outline of the “hero motive” from the first movement is presented in this phrase (Fig. 24).

Fig. 24 Motivic link between the ‘hero’ and the first theme

‘Hero’ theme:

First theme:
The second phrase (bars 5-8) consists of the distinctive repeated notes in bars 6-7 and 8, which is a main feature of the ‘hero’ theme from the first movement. Since the theme here represents the hero’s dream, it is not surprising that it is transformed from the ‘hero’ theme with the important features retained – the mainly pentatonic melody and the characteristic repeated notes.

Immediately after the appearance of the first theme, a variation of it emerges in bar 9 (Fig. 25). The beginning two bars of this theme are the same as that of the first theme (Fig. 26) with both bars 2 and 3 repeated with variations.

**Fig. 25 First variation of first theme**

![Fig. 25 First variation of first theme](image)

**Fig. 26 First theme**

![Fig. 26 First theme](image)
The accompaniment to this theme has the characteristic repeated notes presented in the second violin in bar 9. Thus, this feature of the ‘hero’ theme from the first movement is not only used as the thematic material here, but also as the accompanying material as well. After that, the second theme appears in bars 17-24 (Fig. 27), which has links with the first theme.

**Fig. 27** Second theme

In addition to the use of triplets, an important element of the second theme is the outline of the notes in bar 17 (E-flat-C-F), which is based on that of the first theme as well. Thus, the trait of the “hero motive” can also be seen here (Fig. 28). The first phrase (bars 17-20) ascends and is played broadly with crescendo to represent the “thoughts of the noble canoe float.” The second phrase (bars 21-24) then descends and is played diminuendo to suggest the “fugitive” nature of the thoughts.

**Fig. 28** Motivic link between the ‘hero’ and the second theme

‘Hero’ theme:

Second theme:
The music is then played *a tempo* in bar 25, in which the first theme reappears and the restful atmosphere resumes. After that, there is another variation of the first theme in bars 33-41, which form the last part of the A section (Fig. 29). Thus, the A section itself can also be sub-divided into the ternary structure: first theme – second theme – first theme.

**Fig. 29** Second variation of first theme

In the middle of this passage, Hill introduces a dotted rhythm, relating the music back to the first movement. This dotted rhythm pervades much of the middle section, where the relationship with the first movement becomes obvious. Moreover, the characteristic repeated notes of the ‘hero’ theme are employed (bars 33-35) as an element for the accompaniment. The first phrase (bars 33-37) begins with the ‘dream’ motif of the first theme, which is repeated an octave higher, and has the dotted rhythm motif appeared in bars 36-37. The second phrase (bars 38-41) consists of only the dotted rhythm motif. Thus, while this theme, which is transformed from the first theme, continues to portray the hero’s dream, the incorporation of the dotted rhythm motif anticipates the return of the fight scene in the next section. However, in order to maintain the restful atmosphere of the dream state, it is played slowly and softly in a descending melodic line, with the quiet semibreves as the accompaniment.
The B section (bars 42-75) recalls the fight scene of the first movement. Since it has a totally different atmosphere, the music in this section is played without mute and vibrato resumes. The third theme emerges in bars 43-51 (Fig. 30), and is modified from the ‘anguish’ theme from the first movement.

**Fig. 30** Third theme

![Image of Third theme]

The melodic line of the first six bars (bars 43-48) is a sequence of the ‘anguish’ motif. As shown, the appearance of the characteristic repeated notes within the ‘anguish’ motif (as discussed in the last chapter), also appear across the barline. The embodiment of the ‘anguish’ motif and the element of the ‘hero’ theme in this passage create a connection between the theme of the hero, his dream and the fight scene.

The third theme is then transformed in bars 52-57 (Fig. 31). Apart from the faster tempo, the major differences in this passage are the octave doubling and the use of fast ascending scale notes in bar 53. Together with the use of the dotted rhythm motif as the accompaniment, the elements here are mainly from the fight scene of the first movement.

**Fig. 31** Variation of third theme

![Image of Variation of third theme]
The next passage in bars 58-70 is a repetition of the ‘anguish’ theme from the first movement (bars 78-90) with minor changes. Here, the theme is passionate in character rather than angry as in the first movement. The music is played poco lento in bar 62 and the mute is used by the first violin in bar 69, reinforcing the effect of “getting fainter” started in bar 67. The dotted rhythm motif persists in the cello (bars 58-61 and 66) and the second violin (bars 62 and 64). The main changes in the melody occur in the first violin, in which the fast ascending scale notes and the octave doubling in the corresponding bars 64 and 65-66 respectively are omitted. While the reappearance of the ‘anguish’ theme in this section is used to portray the hero’s dreaming of the fight, the modifications were intended to convey the more restful atmosphere.

The music at bars 71-75, which comes after the recall of the fight scene, not only portrays the fading of the vigorous fight, but also serves as a transition to the return of the section of a restful atmosphere – the A’ section. While the beginning of the melodic fragment in the first violin (Fig. 32) is very similar to that of the coda (bars 153-154) of the first movement (Fig. 33), it is also like the ‘anguish’ motif in the augmented note values. Thus, the characteristic repeated notes are also present here as shown. The embodiment of the restful opening of the first movement’s coda and the ‘anguish’ motif in these few bars perfectly illustrates the fading of the combat.

Fig. 32 Last five bars of B section

Fig. 33 First movement, opening of the coda,

The original tempo resumes in the A’ section (bars 76-102), and mutes are again used by all parts. The first theme returns in bars 76-83 with tremolo as the accompaniment. During the second variation of the first theme (bars 84-92), the cello plays ponticello, which was an unusual technique for string writing at the time of composition. The dotted rhythm motif here suggests the residual thoughts of the fight scene from the B section.
As the music approaches the end, the ‘anguish’ motif recurs in bars 94 and 96 (Fig. 34). It is played quietly and expressively to signify the fading of thoughts about the fight. The ‘dream’ motif then returns to conclude the movement.

**Fig. 34** The end of A’ section

Harmonic and tonal analysis

The movement starts in A-flat major – the home key, which is remotely related to that of the first movement (G minor). While it is not uncommon to have distant key relationships between movements in Romantic music, starting the movement with a completely different tonality also contributes to the dream-like quality of the music, which suggests the state of a far away place. However, Cohn’s adjacent harmonies show that A-flat major can be viewed as a substitute for the subdominant (C minor) of G minor.\(^89\) In this sense, the home key of this movement is not so remotely related to that of the previous movement.

While the A section is mainly in A-flat major with an occasional shift to F minor – the relative minor, the B section “with a complete change of tonality” eventually settles into B minor. The music then moves back to A-flat major in the last section – the A’ section. Again, while the tonality of the A and the B sections seems distantly related to each other (an augmented second/minor third apart), Cohn’s polar harmonies tell that B minor actually acts as a substitute for the dominant (E-flat major) of the home key.\(^90\)

---

\(^{89}\) A-flat (of A-flat major) displaces G (of C major).

\(^{90}\) B, D and F-sharp (of B minor) displace B-flat, E-flat and G (of E-flat major) respectively.
The tonic is firmly established through the opening unaccompanied melodic line of the first phrase of the first theme, which puts an emphasis on the dominant (E-flat). After that, the second phrase emerges with accompaniment in bar 5 (Fig. 35).

**Fig. 35** Harmonic reduction of second phrase of first theme in first appearance

This phrase has an unusual harmonic progression. The supertonic chord, which appears every other chord, is highly emphasised. Also, the sustained F pedal in the upper voice, which anticipates the later modulation to F minor in bar 11, creates a distinct sonority. The unusual and ambiguous tonality of this phrase reinforces the dream-like quality of the music.

Following this is the variation of the first theme, which temporarily modulates to F minor in bars 11-12 (Fig. 36). This melodic line starts on the tonic pedal in the bass, which anchors the theme to A-flat major after an ambiguous passage.

**Fig. 36** Harmonic reduction of the first variation of first theme
Similarly, the second theme stays mainly in A-flat major, in which bars 21-24 build on the sustained dominant pedal, which is set up in bar 20 (Fig. 37). These bars feature a sequence of chromatic passing chords, which include an augmented and a diminished chord in bar 23, and which serve to prolong the dominant chords. These chords then resolve onto the tonic in bar 25, where the first theme returns. The colour added to this passage through the use of chromatic passing chords again evokes a dream-like quality.

Fig. 37 Harmonic reduction of second theme
The return of the first theme in bars 25-32 is the same as its first appearance. The second variation of the first theme (bars 33-41) serves as the transition to the B section, with a tonic pedal developed in this passage (Fig. 38). The tonic chords in bars 36 and 37 have a chromatic passing chord between them, which is employed under the dotted rhythm motif, anticipating the return of the fight scene.

**Fig. 38** Harmonic reduction of second variation of first theme

Bars 38-40 build on a F pedal note. While they are constructed with the same chords, the note G-flat in bar 39 implies a shift to D-flat major. In addition to the new key signature of A major in bar 42 which belongs to the next section, the chord with a flattened note F in bar 41 indicates an enharmonic change. Thus, as well as being a D-flat minor chord, it can also be seen as a C-sharp minor chord in the key of A major – the mediant.

The B section (bars 42-75), which recalls the fight scene, can be divided into four parts. While it is primarily in B minor and has a slower harmonic rhythm, its tonality is rather unstable.
The first part (bars 42-51) begins with the seventh chords on the G-sharp pedal, implying a move to A major, which then modulates to G major in bar 45 and then to B minor in bar 48 (Fig. 39). The tonal instability here generates an atmosphere of agitation as it depicts the fight scene reappearing in the dream.

Fig. 39 Harmonic reduction of the first part of B section

Since the construction of the second part (bars 52-57) is based on the first part, it has a similar harmonic progression, but now in a B minor context (Fig. 40). Thus, this shorter passage, which has a faster tempo, starts with the chromatic passing chords over the G-sharp pedal. These chords do not resolve until the beginning of the next part. Thus, the use of chromatic passing chords with their unresolved status here create tension as the music suggests that dreams of combat go on.

Fig. 40 Harmonic progression of the second part of B section

As discussed before, except for the minor changes in the expression and melodic segments, the third part of the B section (bars 58-70) is a repetition of the ‘anguish’ theme (bars 78-90) from the first movement, where it is also in B minor. Thus, B minor is more firmly established here in this section. Also, the melodic line in bars 67-68, which builds on the G major chord, is the same as that in bars 45 and 56. Different parts of the B section are thus connected. However, instead of staying in that key, which is what happens in the first movement, the music in bar 69 suddenly
modulates to E-flat major for the preparation of the return to A-flat major, and the return of the opening theme.

The fourth part of the B section (bars 71-75) is the transition to the A’ section (Fig. 41). It starts with the chromatic progression in bars 71 and 72, where a ‘Tristan’ chord is used, possibly reflecting a Wagnerian influence. Bars 73-75 then build on the dominant seventh chord of A-flat major, which resolves onto the tonic in bar 76, where the home key is firmly re-established.

**Fig. 41** Harmonic reduction of the of the last part of B section (bars 71-75)

In the A’ section (bars 76-102), the first theme and its second variation return in bars 76-83 and bars 84-92 respectively. While the second variation of the theme here is the same as the one in the A section, its last bar (bar 92) now resolves onto the tonic in the following bar rather than shifting away as happened in the corresponding bar (bar 41) in the A section (Fig. 42). Since the music now enters into the tranquil final part of the movement instead of the tense B section, such a harmonic resolution gives a sense of restfulness.

**Fig. 42** Comparison between the ending of A and A’ sections

End of A section:

Equivalent passage in A’ section:
While the movement concludes in the tonic, there is alternation between the major and minor chord in bars 93-96, to accommodate the ‘anguish’ motif (Fig. 43). Major/minor alternation was a common Romantic device. The music ends with the tonic chord with an added major sixth reinforcing the pentatonic character of the music.

**Fig. 43** Harmonic reduction of the closing of the A’ section

![Harmonic reduction of the closing of the A’ section](image)

**Conclusion**

This ternary form movement contains various elements that have connected it with the previous movement. The themes in the A section, which portray the hero’s dream, are transformed from the ‘hero’ theme (first movement) based on its important features – mainly pentatonic melody and characteristic repeated notes. More significantly, the ‘anguish’ theme from the first movement re-appears in the B section, recalling the fight scene. Although the dotted rhythm motif and the ‘anguish’ motif are the main elements in the B section, they are presented in the A and/or A’ sections as well. All these elements link the two contrasting sections and the first two movements together.

The home key of this movement is distantly related to that of the first movement, reinforcing the dream-like quality of the music, while Cohn’s approach suggests that it is a substitute for the subdominant of the home key of the first movement. The contrasting middle section features elusive, chromatic and shifting harmony, and is typical of Romantic style. The shifting to B minor in the middle section, which is also the key of the ‘anguish’ theme from the first movement, emphasises the direct relationship between the theme in both movements. Again, Cohn’s theories tell that this contrasting key is a substitute for the dominant of the home key of the movement.

While the movement is conventional in structure and Romantic in style, there are innovative features, such as the chord with an added sixth at the end, and the use of no vibrato and *ponticello*. These, plus the pentatonic qualities of the opening,
create a sense of ‘otherness’ or exoticism in the music, related to the programme of the work.
Chapter 5: Third Movement

The third movement is entitled “The Karakia (Scherzo),” and has the following programme given by the composer:

It opens Adagio with the theme of the spell. The solemn revelation is followed by an ethereal tremolando, illustrative of the call and the coming of the birds. The Trio shows the birds felling and shaping the giant Kauri, and as they work “sweet jargoning” embroiders the theme of Rata and the dream maiden.\(^9\)

On the score, under the title, Hill has written “The karakia (Incantation) and the coming of the birds.” Like the first movement, the two characters mentioned in this descriptive sub-heading are represented by two of the themes in the movement.

This movement is a typical scherzo form, with scherzo followed by a trio, and then a concluding repeat of the scherzo. As shown in the table below, each section portrays one of the two scenes: “The karakia (Incantation) and the coming of the birds” and “Felling and shaping the giant Kauri”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 7 Basic structure of the movement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sections</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scherzo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scherzo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^9\) Alfred Hill, Programme Notes for String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor in record sleeve, *Two Australian Works: Alfred Hill: Maori Quartet No. 2 in G Minor and Edgar Bainton: Quartet in A Major* performed by the Austral String Quartet, Festival Records FC-30802, vinyl LP.
Keeping to the conventions of standard ternary form, the trio section has a lighter atmosphere. However, Table 8, which also includes the themes within each section, reveals that there are some unusual features in this section. As shown, the trio section, which consists of two exact halves, has a symmetrical structure. Furthermore, a slow first theme, which appears in this trio section, is added at the beginning of the scherzo section. And for the metre, quadruple and duple time are adopted rather than the usual triple time.

Table 8 Detail structure of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>No. of bar</th>
<th>Main keys</th>
<th>Programmatic scenes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scherzo</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1-6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>The karakia (Incantation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transition to theme 2</td>
<td>7-19</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>The call of the birds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20-35</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td>The coming of the birds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transition to theme 2</td>
<td>36-51</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td>The call of the birds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trio</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>52-59</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Felling and shaping the giant Kuari</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>60-63</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>The karakia (Incantation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>64-71</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Felling and shaping the giant Kuari</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>72-79</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Same as above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>80-83</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>84-91</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scherzo

Same as above
Table 9 Overview of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Scherzo  | 1-6    | G minor        | • First theme, a monophonic melody.  
• The composer called it “the theme of the spell,” signifying the karakia (Incantation).  
• While it is not likely to be a real Māori karakia, it bears certain features of this traditional song type. | “It opens Adagio with the theme of the spell.” |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7-14</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>• Transitional passage to second theme, signifying the call of birds.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scherzo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15-19</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>• Transitional passage continues to develop with semiquavers.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
<td>Bar no.</td>
<td>Main key areas</td>
<td>Comments/Observations</td>
<td>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20-35</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>- Second theme, made up solely of tremolo, portraying “the coming of the birds.”</td>
<td>“The solemn revelation is followed by an ethereal tremolando, illustrative of the call and the coming of the birds.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scherzo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36-51</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>- Transitional passage to second theme returns with minor changes, concluding the scherzo section.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
<td>Bar no.</td>
<td>Main key areas</td>
<td>Comments/Observations</td>
<td>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Trio     | 52-59  | G minor        | • Third theme on second violin, representing “the theme of Rata and the dream maiden.”  
• Melodic line of first violin portrays “the birds felling and shaping the giant Kauri,” embroidering third theme. | “The Trio shows the birds felling and shaping the giant Kauri, and as they work “sweet jargoning” embroiders the theme of Rata and the dream maiden.” |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 60-63    | G minor | • Opening ‘karakia’ theme from scherzo section, now being harmonised in parallel triads.  
• As a link between the two statements of main trio theme. | | --- |
| 64-71    | G minor | • Third theme returns on second violin, with a new counterpoint added to the theme on first violin, entirely in triplets with tremolo. | | |
| Trio     |         | • As shown in Table 8, the following passage (bars 72-91) is the repeat of the previous passage (bars 52-71) with small changes.  
• The key is changed from G minor to G major. | | |
| 72-79    | G major | • Third theme, now on first violin, in an octave higher.  
• Melodic line of triplets starting on upbeat of the bar, now on cello, being played legato. | | --- |
| 80-83    | G major | • ‘Karakia’ theme, on the three higher instruments only (first and second violins, and viola). | | --- |
| 84-91    |         | • Third theme, similar to the one before (bars 64-71), with first violin’s line of triplets now being played staccato. | | --- |
| Scherzo  | 1-51    | • Repeats once to end the movement. | | |

---
Melodic and motivic analysis

The movement opens with the first theme, which is played in unison by all parts (Fig. 44). It is two bars long and is repeated a perfect fourth higher with bar 4 then being repeated twice in bars 5 and 6. This theme represents the karakia (Incantation), which signifies Rata’s reciting of this spell to Tane (the forest god). Since this theme reappears elsewhere, in this and the final movement, for convenience I will refer to it as the ‘karakia’ theme.

Fig. 44 ‘Karakia’ theme (First theme)

Instead of being played in an expected fast tempo of a typical scherzo, this theme is played adagio, which creates a sense of solemnity. Also, it is in quadruple time instead of triple time, a rather unusual metre for a scherzo. Furthermore, it is transformed from the ‘anguish’ theme in the first movement – Fig. 45 shows the motivic link between the two themes. This implies that there is a link to the ‘hero’ theme as well. Since this theme signifies Rata’s reciting of the karakia after having killed the monster, the embodiment of both the ‘anguish’ and the ‘hero’ themes underscore the programmatic character of the work. In doing so, a connection with the first movement is created.

Fig. 45 Motivic link between the 'anguish' and ‘karakia’ themes

‘Anguish’ theme:

‘Karakia’ theme:
As shown in the programme and the title of the movement, karakia are incantations or spells. In traditional Māori chant, all song types can be grouped into two categories, namely the sung and recited styles. Karakia belongs to the recited styles, which are characterized by the “absence of stable pitch organization” and “the completely non-melismatic (syllabic) style of singing” 92 Thus, this theme is unlikely to be a real karakia since it would have been difficult to annotate in conventional Western notation. However, it does bear the characteristics of Māori traditional chant.

This theme is played in unison by the whole quartet, which is a common feature of traditional chant. As McLean says, all traditional songs “are unison or monophonic” when performed by groups. For this, he emphasises that, “Rhythmic unison is the rule for recited songs…” 93 Furthermore, this theme also bears the characteristics of the sung styles, which “have a strong emphasis upon a tonic (the note which occurs most often) in the centre of the range, which is generally limited to a $4^{th}$. Melodic intervals are mostly major and minor 2nds and minor 3rds” 94 Although this theme has a range of a fifth, its narrow range with stepwise movement imitates such a musical structure. While the note A is not the centre of the range of the theme, the stress on this note makes it similar to a durational tonic in Māori chant.

As a particular song type, “karakia are characterized by a rapid monotone punctuated by sustained notes and descending glides at the ends of phrases.” 95 In this theme, the tie over the note A across bars 1-2 and the descending movement of the notes from C to A in bar 2 resemble the “sustained notes and descending glides at the end of the phrases” respectively. Therefore, while this theme is likely to be Hill’s own melody, it may have been composed with the musical structure of traditional Māori chant in mind.

---

95 McLean and Orbell, *Traditional Songs of the Maori*, 20.
The transitional passage in bars 7-19, which introduces the second theme, represents the call of the birds (Fig. 46). This melody with the interval of an augmented fourth emphasised, an unusual ‘modern’ feature, reflects Hill’s forward-looking approach. The gradual increase in note values, with this augmented fourth being reiterated, portray the increasing numbers of the birds.

**Fig. 46** Transitional passage to second theme

The presto tempo is typical of a scherzo. While the metre is changed in this passage, it mixes compound and simple duple time together. A subtle shift is achieved in the cello from the semiquavers of the adagio to the triplet notes of the presto.
The second theme, which goes from the upbeat of bar 19 until the downbeat of bar 35, represents the coming of the birds (Fig. 47). The effect created by playing this passage ponticello was still an unusual technique in its time. Through using this technique in fast tremolo on the three higher instruments, the mysterious, strange and fleeting effects are generated. The theme has a fantastic quality that is typical of Romanticism. For example, a similar airy, fast and light texture can be seen in the opening of Mendelssohn’s Overture to *A Midsummer Night’s Dream* (Fig. 48). Furthermore, the basic outline of the beginning of this passage is similar to that of the ‘karakia’ theme in bars 1-2 (Fig. 49). Therefore, these two themes are connected, and in doing so the coming of the birds has embodied the magic power of the karakia.

**Fig. 47** Second theme

![Second theme](image)

**Fig. 48** Mendelssohn, Overture to *A Midsummer Night’s Dream*

![Mendelssohn's Overture](image)

**Fig. 49** Comparison between outline of second theme and ‘karakia’ theme

Melodic line of second theme:

![Melodic line of second theme](image)

Basic outline of second theme:

![Basic outline of second theme](image)

‘Karakia’ theme:

![‘Karakia’ theme](image)
The restless second theme is followed by the return of the music that introduces the second theme (bars 36-51), which closes the scherzo section. Except for the change in the harmony, there are only minor alterations in the melody.

The third theme (bars 52-59), which is on the second violin, starts the trio section (Fig. 50). Its rhythmic structure has similarities to that of the ‘hero’ theme from the first movement, with the use of the rhythmic pattern in the second bar of each phrase, particularly the appearance of the characteristic repeated notes in bars 57. Moreover, its melodic outline is also related to the ‘hero’ theme, with the former being the retrograde of the latter (Fig. 51). Since this theme is “the theme of Rata and the dream maiden,” it is musically and programmatically appropriate to construct the theme based on the elements of the ‘hero’ theme.

Fig. 50 Third theme

Fig. 51 Motivic link between the ‘hero’ and the third theme

‘Hero’ theme:

Third theme:
Apart from the connection with other themes in the quartet, the third theme also suggests the influence of Dvorak. The outline of the beginning of this theme resembles that of the main theme in the finale of Dvorak’s Cello Concerto in B Minor, which was completed in 1895 (Fig. 52).

**Fig. 52** Comparison between the third theme and the main theme in finale of Dvorak’s Cello Concerto in B Minor

Third theme:

Dvorak’s theme:

The countermelody in the first violin consists of triplets starting on the upbeat of the bar. The staccato triplet notes portray the pecking of the birds while they are “felling and shaping the giant Kauri.” Their appearance in every other bar embellishes the third theme, and also relates back to the 6/8 rhythm of the scherzo.

The ascending chromatic triplet notes in bar 59 bring the music back to the ‘karakia’ theme in the following bar. The reappearance of the ‘karakia’ theme in bars 60-63 evokes a sense of solemnity and recalls the magic power of the karakia. The use of consecutive parallel triads in this theme not only reflects Hill’s intention to create a sense of ‘otherness,’ but also a possible Debussy link. The Austral String Quartet, of which Hill was a member, had performed Debussy’s G Minor Quartet.

After the recall of “the solemn revelation,” the third theme returns in bars 64-71, which is similar to the one before with modifications. The major change occurs in the triplets of the melodic line in the first violin, which are now played tremolo instead of staccato. Also, they are played continuously throughout the passage instead of in every other bar. The more rapid movement of the notes and frequent appearance of triplets suggest the birds’ work gets harder as they continue working. Also, a strong aural connection is achieved between these triplets and the second theme in the scherzo section by the use of similar rhythmic structure, together with the use of tremolo and ponticello in both passages.

The following passage in bars 72-91 is the repeat of the previous passage in bars 52-71. Apart from the key change, there are only small variations in the repeated
passage. As a whole, the main modifications of the third theme are the use of a higher register, and a change of articulation for the triplet notes. The 'karakia' theme is now scored for only three instruments. The lighter atmosphere created suggests the materialisation of the canoe as the birds continue to work. Finally, the scherzo section is repeated once to end the movement.

Harmonic and tonal analysis

Compared with the last movement, this movement has a more stable tonality. This creates a sense of steadiness after the ambiguous and unstable tonality of the dream-like atmosphere in the second movement. This movement is mainly in G minor with brief modulation to G major, the tonic major. Cohn’s adjacent harmonies indicate that the two key areas are actually only one semitone apart. The return to the home key of both the quartet and the first movement could suggest a programmatic return to the forest.

G minor is set up in the monophonic melodic line of the 'karakia' theme in bars 1-4. With the dominant pedal (D) in the following two bars, the home key is firmly established in the opening passage.

The transition passage to the second theme (bars 7-19), which portrays the call of the birds, builds on the dominant pedal (D) until the last bar (Fig. 53). A tension is created in the first phrase (bars 7-14) through the use of the diminished seventh chord over the dominant pedal, which depicts the restlessness of the birds as they call. The heightened atmosphere is relieved at the end of the second phrase (bars 15-19) where the perfect cadence arrives.

Fig. 53 Harmonic reduction of transitional passage to second theme
The second theme continues in G minor (Fig. 54). There is a suggestion of B-flat major in bars 19-22, but in the context, and with the presto tempo marking, it makes more sense to interpret it all in G minor. While cadences occur a few times during this passage, the fast harmonic rhythm with frequent appearances of the chromatic passing chords adds intensity to this passage, which portrays the increasing number of birds as they come.

The music has a sense of relief on the G major chord at the end of the second theme, which anticipates the later modulation to the key of G major. However, the agitated atmosphere immediately resumes in the next passage.
The reappearance of the transition section’s first phrase (bars 36-43) retains the same melodic line as the one used previously. However, it has a different harmony (Fig. 55). It is now solely constructed around the ‘German’ augmented sixth chords over the E-flat pedal, which does not resolve until the arrival of the next phrase. The second phrase (bars 44-51) has the same harmony as the first time, but now three bars are added at the end for closing the scherzo section. Thus, while it is expected that the phrase would finish with the cadence in bars 47-48, it is unexpectedly extended with four more chords. The tonic chord in bar 48 is followed by the submediant chords, which finally resolve on the tonic.

**Fig. 55** Harmonic reduction of returned transitional passage to second theme

The third theme (bars 52-59), “the theme of Rata and the dream maiden,” continues in the key of G minor (Fig. 56). It is made up of only three chords with the first two phrases (bars 52-55) building on the tonic pedal, which give a sense of tonal stability.

**Fig. 56** Harmonic reduction of third theme

The supertonic seventh chord, which appears almost every other bar, is strongly stressed. Such an emphasis on the supertonic chord also occurs in the second
phrase of the first theme from the second movement. This passage represents the hero’s dream in which he hears the crying Kotuku. Thus, it is not surprising that the chord here is used in a way that is similar to the theme from the second movement since this theme is also about the dream maiden.

Following the unresolved ending of the third theme is an agitated passage where the ‘karakia’ theme reappears (bars 60-63). While this theme is now harmonized, it is done in an unusual way (Fig. 57).

**Fig. 57** Harmonic reduction of first theme in trio

The harmonisation is wholly constructed with consecutive parallel triads. As discussed before, the effect produced by such parallel movement could create a sense of ‘otherness.’ Also, it indicates a possible Debussian influence (see, for example, the “Sarabande” from *Pour le Piano*), and Hill’s willingness to explore innovative harmony.

After the turbulent passage of the ‘karakia’ theme, the heightened atmosphere finds relief on the tonic chord in bar 64 when the third theme reappears. The return of this theme now ends with the perfect cadence.

The passage (bars 52-71) just discussed is then repeated once before returning to the scherzo section. Except for the modulation to G major, the tonic major, there are only small variations in the repeated passage (bars 72-91). The main change occurs in the ‘karakia’ theme in bars 80-83, in which the parallel harmonies now form chords in first inversion rather than root position. Therefore, in addition to the changes discussed in the previous section on melodic and motivic analysis, the light atmosphere is reinforced through the use of the major key and the harmonic change in

---

96 This piece was composed by Debussy in 1901.
the ‘karakia’ theme. As mentioned before, these changes are intended to illustrate the materialisation of the canoe as the birds continue to work. After that, the scherzo section is repeated once, and the movement consequently ends in the home key.

**Conclusion**

While this movement follows the basic ‘scherzo and trio’ structure, there are modifications in this musical form, which include the integration of the slow opening, the use of quadruple and duple time, and the symmetrical structure used in the trio section.

The tonality of this movement gives a contrast to the last movement. In addition to its return to the home key of the quartet, it is centred around the tonic and tonic major only: this movement portrays only one scene in the programme – the birds at work in the forest.

The ‘karakia’ theme shows the influence of traditional Māori chant. Additionally, it has melodic connections with the ‘anguish’ theme from the previous movements, both of which have the same basic melodic outline. The two appearances of the theme in the trio section are harmonized with consecutive parallel triads, which is a small example of Hill’s innovative thinking.

The transition to the second theme, which portrays the call of the birds, consists of another innovative feature – a heavy emphasis on the interval of an augmented fourth between adjacent notes. The melodic outline of the second theme, which signifies the coming of the birds, is similar to that of the ‘karakia’ theme. The third theme is “the theme of Rata and the dream maiden.” While its melodic outline is connected to the ‘hero’ theme from the first movement, it also suggests the influence of Dvorak.
Chapter 6: Fourth Movement

The fourth movement is entitled “The Dedication (Finale),” and has the following programme given by the composer:

The movement opens Adagio with the Karakia motive sounded as the dedication of the canoe to Tane. Then the main theme appears, telling of the festivities at the launching. A lull in the gaiety is expressed by an impressive ritard, and the hero's motive is heard once more, significant of the realisation of a noble dream. The exuberant Coda sounds the note of high festival, and the legend ends in music of thrilling quality.\(^97\)

Written on the score, under the title, is “The dedication and launching of the canoe.” The “dedication” scene is represented by the theme in the introduction of the movement while the “launching” scene is portrayed by the rest of the movement.

This movement is in standard sonata form with references to themes from all the three previous movements.

Table 10 Basic structure of the movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>No. of bar</th>
<th>Main keys</th>
<th>Programmatic scenes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1-6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Dedication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>7-55</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>56-69</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>70-125</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>D major, F major</td>
<td>Launching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>126-185</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>186-245</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>246-259</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>260-291</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coda</td>
<td>292-326</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{97}\) Alfred Hill, Programme Notes for String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor in record sleeve, *Two Australian Works: Alfred Hill: Maori Quartet No. 2 in G Minor and Edgar Bainton: Quartet in A Major* performed by the Austral String Quartet, Festival Records FC-30802, vinyl LP.
**Table 11 Overview of the movement**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1-6</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>‘Karakia’ theme restated from the third movement.</td>
<td>“The movement opens Adagio with the Karakia motive sounded as the dedication of the canoe to Tane.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Exposition First subject group | 7-16 | G major | • Materials are based on the first bar of ‘karakia’ theme, preparing for the appearance of main theme.  
• This melodic fragment recurs throughout the movement, and serves as a ‘karakia’ motif (in box). | --- |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17-24</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td></td>
<td>• First theme – “telling of the festivities at the launching.”</td>
<td>• Starts from the head-motif in first violin in bars 17-18, which is then transferred to viola in bar 18. “Then the main theme appears, telling of the festivities at the launching.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>25-33</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• First theme repeats.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>34-37</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• Second theme on first violin, which is derived from ‘karakia’ motif.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>38-40</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• Variation of second theme.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>41-44</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• Second theme recurs in second violin.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>45-47</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• Variation of second theme repeats, with modified beginning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
<td>Bar no.</td>
<td>Main key areas</td>
<td>Comments/Observations</td>
<td>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First subject group</td>
<td>48-55</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• Extension of second theme on first and second violins.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>56-69</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>• This section is based on materials from first subject group and modulates away from the tonic.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td>70-77</td>
<td>D major</td>
<td>• Third theme on second violin.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>78-85</td>
<td>F major</td>
<td>• Third theme taken up by viola.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
<td>Bar no.</td>
<td>Main key areas</td>
<td>Comments/Observations</td>
<td>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition</td>
<td>86-93</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>• Third theme is developed and modulates.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>94-101</td>
<td>D major</td>
<td>• Third theme recurs on first violin.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>102-109</td>
<td>F major, A minor</td>
<td>• Third theme taken up by viola.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>110-117</td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>• Third theme is developed in second violin, with the last four bars being modified.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>118-125</td>
<td>B-flat major, D major</td>
<td>• Third theme returns on first violin.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections</td>
<td>Bar no.</td>
<td>Main key areas</td>
<td>Comments/Observations</td>
<td>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>126-133</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td></td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>134-157</td>
<td>E-flat major</td>
<td>• The materials are based on ‘karakia’ theme/motif.</td>
<td>“A lull in the gaiety is expressed by an impressive ritard…”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>158-165</td>
<td>C major</td>
<td></td>
<td>“…and the hero’s motive is heard once more…”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>166-177</td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>• ‘Hero’ theme from first movement returns.</td>
<td>“…significant of the realisation of a noble dream.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|          | 178-185 | A-flat major   | • Second theme from second movement reappears.  
• Represents the “thoughts of the noble canoe float across Rata's awakening sight” in second movement. | “…” |


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Bar no.</th>
<th>Main key areas</th>
<th>Comments/Observations</th>
<th>Description of the scenes in Hill’s programme notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recapitulation</td>
<td>186-206</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Fragmentation of first theme, anticipating its return in full.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>207-245</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Repetition of first subject group of themes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td>246-259</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Passage is altered with modulating sequence going up in bars 246-249 to allow second subject group to return in tonic.</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second subject group</td>
<td>260-291</td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>• Now in the tonic rather than dominant as occurred in exposition.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coda</td>
<td>292-307</td>
<td></td>
<td>• The melodic line is derived from ‘karakia’ theme/motif and combined with ‘hero’ theme.</td>
<td>“The exuberant Coda sounds the note of high festival, and the legend ends in music of thrilling quality.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>308-315</td>
<td></td>
<td>• ‘Hero’ theme appears on first violin.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>316-326</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Ends with main notes of ‘hero’ theme on cello (D, B, A, G).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Melodic and motivic analysis

The movement opens with the ‘karakia’ theme from the previous movement (Fig. 58), which represents “the dedication of the canoe to Tane.” The first four bars are similar to bars 60-63 of the third movement. The mood is very different, however, due to the use of mutes and quieter dynamics, along with a much slower tempo. Also, while the theme is played adagio, which is similar to the opening of the previous movement, the softer dynamics along with the use of a lower register evoke a sense of lightness. The modified ‘karakia’ theme is intended to anticipate a joyful atmosphere in the next section.

**Fig. 58 Introduction section**

Before the appearance of the first theme in bar 17, the melodic line in bars 7-16 is made up of the first five notes of the ‘karakia’ theme, which is a ‘karakia’ motif (Fig. 59). The playing of the ‘karakia’ motif in a much faster tempo without mute in this passage creates a delightful mood for the launching of the festivities, and may be designed to give praise to Tane. Furthermore, this motif keeps recurring throughout the music and acts as a unifying element.

**Fig. 59 Beginning of first subject group (bars 7-16)**
With the predominant use of crotchets, repeated notes and stepwise movement, the first theme (bars 17-24), which tells of the launching of the festivities, has a simple quality (Fig. 60). However, it is permeated with the elements of other themes. While the “hero motive” is seen in the head-motif in bars 17-18 (Fig. 61), the melodic fragment in bars 20-21 (as shown) is derived from the ‘karakia’ motif. The embodiment of these two motives in this theme signifies that it is through the help of Tane that the hero’s work is accomplished.

**Fig. 60** First theme

**Fig. 61** Motivic link between ‘hero’ and first theme

“Hero’ theme:

First theme:
After the first theme has been repeated, the second theme (bars 34-37) emerges with a similar simple quality in both melodic and rhythmic structure (Fig. 62). This theme is transformed from the ‘karakia’ motif, which is evident in the beginning five notes as shown. It illustrates that the giving of praise to Tane continues as the festivities go on. In addition, the melodic line of these few notes is very similar to that of the second subject group in the fourth movement of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony (Fig. 63). Since Hill was an ardent admirer of Beethoven, it is not surprising that he made a reference to the music of the composer. Indeed, it would seem that this allusion, along with the obvious reference of Fig. 66 below, are intended to resonate with the listener. Hill wants the Beethoven reference with its heroic aspect to be noticed as it is incorporated into this finale.

**Fig. 62 Second theme**

![Second theme](image)

**Fig. 63 Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, fourth movement, second subject group**

![Beethoven's Fifth Symphony](image)

Hill varies the second theme in bars 38-40 (Fig. 64).

**Fig. 64 Variation of second theme**

![Variation of second theme](image)

---

98 See, for example, Hill’s comments in *Harmony and Melody and Their Use in the Simple Forms of Music Together With Special Instruction on the Composition of School Music*, (London: Elkin & Co., 1927) preface.
The second theme returns in bars 41-44 (Fig. 65). While it is being played by the second violin, the accompaniment in the first violin is similar to that of the opening theme in the above-mentioned movement of Beethoven (Fig. 66). The Beethoven example like Hill’s, is a tonic major, triumphant, heroic conclusion after preceding tonic minor movements. Its quotation here is musically and programmatically appropriate.

Fig. 65 Second theme, second appearance

![Second theme, second appearance](image1)

Fig. 66 Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, fourth movement, opening theme

![Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, fourth movement, opening theme](image2)

When the variation of the second theme recurs in bars 45-47, it continues to develop using quavers until bar 55, to prepare the arrival of the transition section (Fig. 67).

Fig. 67 Variation of second theme (second appearance) and its extension

![Variation of second theme (second appearance) and its extension](image3)
The transition section begins in bar 56 and continues until bar 69 (Fig. 68). Its construction is based on the materials of the first subject group. For instance, the first four notes of the first violin in bars 56-57 are the same as the beginning of the extension of the second theme (Fig. 67), while the following three notes are based on the third bar of the second theme (Fig. 65).

**Fig. 68** Transition section

The second subject group starts in bar 70, where the third theme emerges (Fig. 69). Similar to the style of the previous themes, a simple musical structure is maintained in this theme. In addition, the ‘karakia’ motif is integrated into the theme in bars 71-72, with the motif now inverted. Furthermore, the beginning of this theme resembles that of the main theme in Tchaikovsky’s *Swan Lake* (Fig. 70).

**Fig. 69** Third theme

**Fig. 70** Tchaikovsky’s *Swan Lake*, main theme
After the repetition of the third theme in bars 78-85, it continues to develop until bars 93 (Fig. 71). The melodic line in the viola in bar 87 and from bar 89 onward is based on that of the extension of the first theme in bars 47-48 (Fig. 67). Thus, the two themes are connected. Moreover, with the grace note in the melodic line of the viola in bar 87, the outline of the triplet notes in the ‘karakia’ theme is subtly incorporated into this passage.

Fig. 71 Development of third theme

After the third theme reappears twice in bars 94-109, it is developed (Fig. 72). The parallel movement in bars 114-117 now moves more rapidly to intensify the atmosphere as the festivities continue. The third theme then reappears once more in bar 118 to conclude the exposition section.

Fig. 72 Development of third theme, second appearance
The development section (bars 126-185) grows mainly from the idea of the ‘karakia’ theme/motif. There are basically four variations of the ‘karakia’ theme/motif in this section (Fig. 78-81). The first eight bars (bars 126-133) are based on the motif presented at the beginning of the movement (Fig. 73). The melodic line in bars 134-145 begins with the ‘karakia’ theme, with augmented note values, which then continues with the ‘karakia’ motif (Fig. 74). This melodic line then repeats in bars 146-157 (Fig. 75). However, the interval of both the first two triplet notes of the ‘karakia’ theme and the first two notes of the ‘karakia’ motif expand. This small modification is intended to make a closer relationship with the later reappearance of the ‘hero’ theme. The passage in bars 158-165 is derived from the ‘karakia’ motif with augmented note values (Fig. 76). The thematic transformation based on the ‘karakia’ theme/motif in the development section not only adds variety to the music, but underscores “the dedication of the canoe to Tane” as well.

Fig. 73 First variation of ‘karakia’ theme in development section

Fig. 74 Second variation of ‘karakia’ theme in development section

Fig. 75 Third variation of ‘karakia’ theme in development section

Fig. 76 Fourth variation of ‘karakia’ theme in development section

In the second part of the development section, the ‘hero’ and the second theme from the first and second movements respectively reappear. Such reference back to previous movements is an important feature of cyclic form, which was commonly used in the Romantic period, as, for example, in the Finale of Beethoven’s Ninth
Symphony. Hill wants to make the connections between the movements of this quartet clearly apparent to the listener, emphasising musical unity as well as programmatic aspects.

The recapitulation section begins in bar 186 where there is a return to the tonic. However, the recapitulation does not start by repeating the first subject group from the first bar of the exposition. Instead, a new passage, which is a modification of the first theme, is used as a preparation for its reappearance. It is probably due to the extensive use of the ‘karakia’ theme in the development section that Hill decided to use the elements of the first theme instead. In doing so, a sense of freshness is created as the music enters the new section. After the first subject group and the transition, the second subject group is abridged with the G major scale at the end leading to a coda section.

The coda (bars 292-326) is mainly constructed with the ‘karakia’ and the ‘hero’ themes. Of particular significance is that the ‘hero’ theme in the viola is combined in counterpoint with the ‘karakia’ motif in both violins in bars 300-307 (Fig. 77). This signifies the dedication of the canoe to Tane by the Māori hero.

**Fig. 77** Coda, bars 300-304
Although both the second violin and the viola melodies in bars 316-321 are mainly constructed with quavers of scale notes, their melodic structures are also derived from the falling scale of the ‘karakia’ motif (Fig. 78).

**Fig. 78** Coda, bars 316-319

The start of the ‘hero’ theme appears one last time in the cello to conclude the quartet, signifying the accomplishment of the Māori hero (Fig. 79).

**Fig. 79** Coda, bars 322-326
Harmonic and tonal analysis

Compared to the previous movements, this movement has a slower harmonic rhythm and a more stable tonality. The home key – G major – is the tonic major of the home key of the quartet. Thus, this quartet ends with a large scale Tierce de Picardie, going from minor to major. While the first and second subject groups in the exposition are in the typical tonic-dominant relationship, the Romantic tendency to use keys a third apart is also seen. This will be shown again with reference to Cohn’s theories.

The movement starts with the ‘karakia’ theme (bars 1-6) in G minor before switching to the tonic major in bar 7. With the dominant pedal (D) in bars 7-16 of the first subject group, G major is firmly established. The tonic is highly emphasised in the first subject group (bars 7-55), which has a strong sense of tonal stability and harmonic simplicity. This is intended to depict the splendour of the festivities.

Like the opening ‘karakia’ theme, the variation of the second theme in bars 45-46 is constructed with the consecutive parallel triads in first inversion (Fig. 80). Through the use of this similar harmonic device, the two themes are connected.

**Fig. 80** Harmonic reduction of the variation of the second theme, second appearance

With an implication of B minor at the end of the first subject group in bar 55, the music returns to G major in bar 56, where the transition section (bars 56-69) begins. A modulating sequence is developed and passes through G major, E minor, B minor and A minor on the way to the dominant D major – the key of the second subject group.

During the second subject group, the music twice shifts abruptly from D major to F major in bars 78-84 and bars 102-107, emphasizing the relationship of keys a third apart. Here, Cohn’s modally matched harmonies indicate that F major acts as a substitute for A major – the dominant of D major.\(^99\) As the music approaches the end of the exposition, it unexpectedly modulates to B-flat major in bar 118, again a third

\(^{99}\) C and F (of F major) displace C-sharp and E (of A major) respectively.
away from D major. Similarly, Cohn’s approach shows that B-flat major acts as the substitute for D major itself. The music then quickly returns to D major in bar 121 to conclude this section.

In addition to the emphasis on the third-relationship for the second subject group, parallelism is again used. This is seen in the modulating sequences used in the third theme. The passages of both bars 89-93 (Fig. 81) and bars 114-117 (Fig. 82) are based on the dominant seventh chords that modulate chromatically, with the latter passage modulating in a more rapid rhythm. They have heightened the atmosphere of the music as it portrays the progress of the festivities. In addition, these bold passages again show an adventurous approach to harmony in Hill’s quartet.

Fig. 81 Harmonic reduction of second subject group, bars 86-93

![Harmonic reduction of second subject group, bars 86-93](image1)

Fig. 82 Harmonic reduction of second subject group, bars 114-117

![Harmonic reduction of second subject group, bars 114-117](image2)

With an emphasis on the dominant, the development section (bars 126-185) starts by suggesting the home key, but never actually arrives the tonic. With the interrupted cadence in bars 133-134, the music modulates suddenly and unexpectedly to E-flat major, where the augmented ‘karakia’ theme appears. This new key carries on until bar 166, and during this passage the dominant is again emphasised. Again, Cohn’s approach suggests that E-flat major is a substitute stands for the home key itself.

The ‘hero’ theme reappears in bars 166-177, with modulation to C major and a sustained dominant pedal. Here, C major acts as a substitute for the subdominant (A-

---

100 B-flat and F (of B-flat major) displace A and F-sharp (of D major) respectively.
101 E-flat and B-flat (of E-flat major) displace D and B (of G major) respectively.
flat major) of the previous key (E-flat major). With a C minor chord at the end of the ‘hero’ theme in bar 176, the music modulates to A-flat major in bar 178, in which the second theme from the second movement recurs. Similarly, A-flat major becomes a substitute for the previous key (C major) itself. Although there are key changes in the development section, the tonality is relatively stable and clear. While the keys involved – G major, E-flat major, C major and A-flat major – are always the submediant of the previous one, emphasizing the relationship of key a third apart, Cohn’s theories suggest that they are in fact a substitute for the related or same tonal area.

The new passage at the beginning of the recapitulation section (bars 186-206) builds on the D pedal, with which the home key – G major – is firmly re-established. To allow the second subject group to return in the tonic, the transition (bars 246-259) is a perfect fourth higher than the exposition through the modulating sequences in bars 246-249. The coda (bar 293-326) solidifies the home key of the work.

Conclusion

This sonata form movement is unified by the ‘karakia’ motif, which recurs throughout the movement. Following the structure of the cyclic form, this finale includes themes from all the previous movements serving both as a summary of the programme, and as a musical unifying device. The tonality of this movement is the most stable among all the movements although there are examples of bold modulations and progressions. The stress on the third-relationship in the tonality as a way to substitute related tonal areas, and the use of the tonic throughout the movement is also typical of Romantic tendencies. There are some influences from other composers in this movement, most noticeably Beethoven, Tchaikovsky and Debussy.

102 E and G (of C major) displace E-flat and A-flat (of A-flat major) respectively.
103 A-flat and E-flat (of A-flat major) displace G and E (of C major) respectively.
Motivic links between the four movements - a *grundgestalt*

Having discussed the quartet in detail, we see that almost all the themes in each movement are based on a basic four-note idea – the “hero motive” – first presented in the ‘hero’ theme of the first movement. While these themes may sound and look different from each other, they actually grow out of the same building block, which links all the movements together (see Fig. 83, over page). This way of using a fundamental structural shape for composing a piece of music became known as the *grundgestalt* (‘basic shape’) concept. This level of thematic or motivic unity in Hill’s quartet indicates a depth of thought and planning. It shows that Hill was not simply content to unite at a surface level, but was aiming to create a work of substance. Furthermore, it is possible the large number of modulations to keys a third higher or lower can also be seen as a background level use of the *grundgestalt*. This *grundgestalt* from which Hill derives most of his thematic material begins with a falling third (D, B, A, G). Hill’s use of key centres a third apart shows the *grundgestalt* bringing its influence to hear on background level tonal relationships as well as the foreground level of thematic relationships.
Fig. 83 Motivic links between the four movements

**Basic four-note idea – “hero motive”**

![Basic four-note idea](image)

**First movement**

‘Hero’ theme:

![‘Hero’ theme](image)

‘Anguish’ theme:

![‘Anguish’ theme](image)

Theme in coda:

![Theme in coda](image)

**Second movement**

First theme:

![First theme](image)

Second theme:

![Second theme](image)

‘Anguish’ theme:

![‘Anguish’ theme](image)

**Third movement**

‘Karakia’ theme:

![‘Karakia’ theme](image)

Third theme: (retrograde)

![Third theme: (retrograde)](image)
Fourth movement

‘Karakia’ theme: (inversion)

First theme – head-motif:

Second theme:

Third theme: (inversion)

‘Hero’ theme:

Second theme from second movement:

‘Karakia’ motif in counterpoint with ‘hero’ theme:

‘Hero’ theme – final statement:
Chapter 7: Findings and Conclusion

Alfred Hill’s music has been studied very little to date. This thesis set out to contribute an in-depth analysis of Hill’s work, to uncover the real nature of his music.

When Hill started working on String Quartet No. 2 in 1907, Western art music was still largely working within the Romantic idiom. The great upheavals that occurred in the twentieth-century were only in their formative stages. Although Hill’s compositional style is often perceived as conservative, this quartet, which shared many characteristics of his European contemporaries, indicates that this is not always the case. This study reveals that he was not entirely traditional nor exceptionally progressive, but could be innovative on occasions.

The structure of this work is a typical four-movement string quartet. It is unified by a basic four-note idea introduced in the first movement. The integration of this fundamental idea in all four movements is a grundgestalt. While this, along with the use of cyclic form were common techniques to connect a multi-movement work, the economy of materials used also reflects Hill’s practical approach in composition. The composer skilfully made use of this device, and the structure of the musical form of each movement, to match the music to the plot of the story.

The harmony and tonality indicate many Romantic tendencies, including the emphasis on keys a third apart as a way to substitute more standard tonal areas, sudden and dramatic modulations, and the exploration of pentatonic harmony. The frequent use of chromatic passing chords and tonic/dominant pedal were typical Romantic techniques used to raise tension and evoke a sense of expectation. However, the repeated use of parallel chordal movement suggests Hill’s more forward-looking approach. The exploration of the pentatonic scale reflects the impact of Dvorak’s compositions, while the adoption of the leitmotif idea and the ‘Tristan’ chord indicate Wagnerian influences. There are also other influences present in the music, which are most obvious in the finale. Hill’s mastery in constructing melodies, and skilfulness in the use of structure, of developing ideas, reflect his craftsmanlike approach in composition.
While the musical language of this quartet is essentially Romantic, the employment of certain unusual techniques and special effects on occasions reflect Hill’s innovative approach to timbre. These techniques include double pizzicato two octaves apart, double stopping in parallel fifths, triads moving in parallel motion, and the use of non vibrato and ponticello. There is also an emphasis on pentatonic sonorities. The composer writes very idiomatically for the instruments, and his scoring is frequently colourful.

Hill’s music is often described as old-fashioned or conservative since his works remained in the same style. While it seems that his compositional style did not really change throughout his life, this quartet shows that in 1907, at least, he was not conservative, with several elements in his music that illustrate an innovative approach.

The innovative approach is also reflected by Hill’s integration of Māori elements into the works, which reflects influence and attitude of Nationalist works. The Māori legend behind this quartet tells of a Māori hero saving a beautiful maiden, who is beset by a monster. The four main characters – Rata (the Māori hero), Kotuku (a crane – the beautiful maiden), Taniwha (the grim monster) and the karakia (talisman) – are all represented by particular themes. While it is unlikely that there is any direct use of existing melodies collected from the Māori, this thesis has uncovered possible Māori influences. Through using unusual techniques and devices, a sense of exoticism is generated. The impression of Māori qualities is created through building a sense of ‘otherness’ in the quartet, rather than incorporating real Māori melody into the music. Such an approach of using the indigenous elements makes him different from other Nationalist composers. A significant part of this analysis has concerned the relationship between Hill’s music and the Māori culture he experienced in the years leading up to the creation of the quartet. This aspect of Hill’s compositions also shows some boldness of approach, risking the disapproval of his Pakeha audience of the time.

While his Māori-inspired works are sometimes associated with the incorporation of Māori melodies, this quartet indicates that this is not always the case. Rowe concludes his analysis of this quartet by saying that “its Māori subtitle plainly comes from the programmatic intention of the composer to present a musical adaptation of the legend of Rata’s cave and contains nothing that could be reliably
identified from Māori music culture as it existed at the time of composition.”\textsuperscript{104} However, this study has shown that the influence of the Māori legend was more than solely programmatic. The musical structure of the ‘karakia’ theme does bear certain features of traditional Māori chant. Moreover, the way Hill develops the ‘karakia’ theme and weaves it into the fabric of the composition suggests he was conscious of integrating possible Māori elements into his overall style. We could conclude, therefore, that Hill attempted to incorporate elements of Māori culture into his quartet, rather than specifically quoting Māori music.

To conclude, this quartet represents two things: first, an attempt to create a unique identity in the music, through its association with Māori culture; and second, the further development of Hill’s own maturing style.

\textsuperscript{104} Eric Rowe, ”The Maori Musical Elements in the First Symphony and the String Quartets Nos. 1 & 2.” (A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the award of the degree of Bachelor of Creative Arts (Honours), University of Wollongong, 1998), 18.
Bibliography

Books and Articles


“Composers at Work Up To Last Illness.” *Sydney Morning Herald* 31 October 1960, p.4.


Hill, Alfred. Programme Notes for String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor in record sleeve, *Two Australian Works: Alfred Hill: Maori Quartet No. 2 in G Minor and Edgar Bainton: Quartet in A Major* performed by the Austral String Quartet, Festival Records FC-30802, Vinyl LP.


Lawn, Meredith. “Musings of a Music Archivist: Arranging and Describing the Music Manuscripts of Alfred and Mirrie Hill at the State Library of New South Wales” This article is a revised and expanded version of material originally published in *Continuo [journal of IAML (Australia)]* 30 (2001): 21-24.


**Sound Recordings**


**Scores**


Dvorak, Antonin. *Cello Concerto in B Minor.* London: Ernst Eulenburg, 19-?.

Dvorak, Antonin. *Quartet, op. 96 for Two Violins, Viola and Violoncello.* Leipzig: Ernst Eulenburg, 19-?.

Dvorak, Antonin. *Symphony No. 5 in E Minor “From the New World” for Orchestra.* London: Ernst Eulenburg, 1903.


String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor

Alfred Hill
String Quartet No. 2 in G Minor (1907-1911)

(Maori Legend in Four Scenes for String Quartet)

Alfred Hill (1870-1960)

No.1     The Forest (Allegro Agitato) p.1
No.2     The Dream (Adagio) p.12
No.3     The Karakia (Scherzo) p.18
No.4     The Dedication (Finale) p.23

Duration: 22:08

Editorial note

At the time of studying this quartet for my MA thesis, there was no full score available. I have reconstructed the score based on the parts published by Breitkopf & Härtel in 1913. There are also two sets of parts in manuscript held at the Mitchell Library, State Library of New South Wales, Sydney. These two sets are in different handwriting, and were consulted when inconsistencies were discovered in the published version. Mistakes have been corrected in this reconstructed score based on the manuscript, and on the analysis of the music. This reconstructed score is intended for study purposes only, and is an appendix to my thesis.

Yuen Ching Lam  (June 2006)
Programme note by Alfred Hill

In the forest guarded against man by the potency of a Karakia (talisman) grew the giant kauri (a beautiful New Zealand tree), from which Rata, the hero, would fashion the canoe to bear him across unknown seas. Entering the forest as Taniwha (the grim monster) and Kotuku (a beautiful crane) were engaged in deadly combat, Rata felled the tree. That night he dreamt he heard Kotuku's cry for aid. Changing into a beautiful Maiden, she told how the wicked Tohunga (priest) has cast a spell on her and Taniwha was endeavouring to make her reveal the Karakia. She informed Rata that his labours would be in vain unless he knew the magic formula, and promised to teach it to him if he would kill Taniwha. Next day Rata found the kauri waving gloriously again and beneath it lurked Taniwha. Rata boldly slew the monster and in its place stood the lovely maiden of his dream. From her he learned the formula which he recited to Tane (the forest god). As he did so the air became full of the cry of countless birds. Circling the tree they pecked and pecked until it fell, then fashioning it into the noblest canoe that the world has seen. Dedicating it to Tane, the lovers and birds chanted the mystic Karakia, "Ki te urunga te waka".

1. The Forest (Allegro agitato)
This carries the hearer into the mysterious shades of the forest, upon which break sounds of the struggle between the Kotuku and the Taniwha. Viola and cello are heard against the double pizzicato which here suggests the tapping of the woodpecker in the silent forest, and later, transferred to the cello, is employed to signify the thudding strokes of the Taniwha. Music suggestive of distant trumpets heralds the approach of Rata, whose splendid theme is allotted to the first violin and afterwards taken up by the cello. The vigorous development section illustrates the progress of the fight, while the reappearance of Rata's theme once more transfers the interest to the forest. In the Coda the hero's work is accomplished, and as evening falls restfully faint echoes of the combat reach the ear.

2. The Dream (Adagio)
The first theme exquisitely evokes the fabric of the hero's vision - a dream flight. Fugitive thoughts of the noble canoe float across Rata's awakening sight until the second theme appears with a complete change of tonality. Again is heard the sad cry of Kotuku, hard beset by the grim monster. The music swells in a great crescendo as the dream grows more vivid. Then, as it fades, the slumber motive reappears, giving a sense of complete rest.

3. The Karakia (Scherzo)
It opens Adagio with the theme of the spell. The solemn revelation is followed by an ethereal tremolando, illustrative of the call and the coming of the birds. The Trio shows the birds felling and shaping the giant Kauri, and as they work "sweet jargoning" embroiders the theme of Rata and the dream maiden.

4. The Dedication (Finale)
The movement opens Adagio with the Karakia motive sounded as the dedication of the canoe to Tane. Then the main theme appears, telling of the festivities at the launching. A lull in the gaiety is expressed by an impressive ritard, and the hero's motive is heard once more, significant of the realisation of a noble dream. The exuberant Coda sounds the note of high festival, and the legend ends in music of thrilling quality.
No. 1 The Forest

a) The fight of the Crane and the Monster
b) Rata enters the woods

Allegro agitato (\( \text{\textit{j}} = 132 \))

Alfred Hill
No. 2 The Dream

Adagio. \( \dashed{\d = 80} \) No vibrato until D.

Alfred Hill

Violin I

PP calmo

Violin II

Sordino

Solo esp.

Viola

Violoncello

PP calmo
Allegro, \( \frac{d}{d} = 132 \)
No. 3 Scherzo
The karakia (Incantation) and the coming of the birds

Adagio. (♩ = 80)

Presto. (♩ = 132)

Alfred Hill
No. 4 Finale

The dedication and launching of the canoe

Poco adagio. \( (\text{d} = 72) \)

Allegr. \((\text{d} = 132)\) senz\'a sord.

Alfred Hill