PROTECTION OF AUTHOR’S COPYRIGHT

This copy has been supplied by the Library of the University of Otago on the understanding that the following conditions will be observed:

1. To comply with s56 of the Copyright Act 1994 [NZ], this thesis copy must only be used for the purposes of research or private study.

2. The author's permission must be obtained before any material in the thesis is reproduced, unless such reproduction falls within the fair dealing guidelines of the Copyright Act 1994. Due acknowledgement must be made to the author in any citation.

3. No further copies may be made without the permission of the Librarian of the University of Otago.
Feeding the Lambs

The Influence of Sunday Schools on the Socialization of Children in Otago and Southland, 1848-1901

David Stuart Keen

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History of the University of Otago, Dunedin
New Zealand

1999
Abstract

Nineteenth century Otago, an isolated, migrant society within a wider world of change, sought reliable coordinates against which to plot its course. The pioneer settlers were torn between re-creation of the familiar and exploration and exploitation of a new environment, a dichotomy which is endemic to migration. Caught in a conflict of values, the settlement sought synthesis through its religious and educational institutions. Important among these were the Sunday schools, influential and effective because, as in Britain, they so often represented an autonomous rather than centrally planned response to local need and conditions; ironically it is this very autonomy which has contributed to the neglect of Sabbath schooling in interpretative commentary, both on the part of contemporary observers and later historians.

Sunday schooling in Otago and Southland responded flexibly to the changing demands of pioneering and settlement. As viewed in 1848 by the predominantly Scottish Presbyterian pioneers of the Otago colony, Sunday schools formed a link with home, a means of perpetuating a culture; in the eyes of the settlement's leaders, such perpetuation was, in itself, an act of mission. Later, to a colony geographically dispersed and socially fragmented by the experience of the gold rushes, Sunday schools came to offer a community focus, extending an ecumenical welcome to child and parent. In the closing decades of the century, as pioneering shaded into settlement, denominationalism tried to reclaim the schools, keen to exploit their potential as recruiting grounds for church membership and nurseries of church leadership. Within the schools, at the same time, changing perceptions of the nature of childhood created an individualised pedagogy and lent an emphasis to childhood conversion. Meanwhile, through their publicising of and support for overseas missionary work, the schools helped to develop a broader context for New Zealand's nascent sense of national identity, indirectly reinforcing the cultural and political imperialism of the period.

The schools' most consistent and important bequest to their scholars, however, not the less enduring for being intangible, was the nurturing of a sense of self-worth; this held true, not just for New Zealand or Otago, but worldwide. Such nurturing had significant implications wherever Sunday schooling touched the lives of the socially disadvantaged. In Britain the disadvantaged were the working classes, and British Sunday schools accordingly out-grew their Raikesian origins to accommodate working class aspirations. Products of the British Sunday school revolution brought with them, in migration to Otago, their agenda of upward social levelling. The Sabbath schools of
the Otago colony failed to maintain their impetus as far as outreach to the children of unskilled labour was concerned. Their most enduring influence, in effect rather than by design, was among the settlement's girls and women. For these the province's Sunday schools helped pave the way for the growth of Otago feminism. By retaining the active loyalty of successive generations of wives and mothers Sunday schools shaped the mores of colonial society, and maintained a myth of Christian identity which endured after male church attendance had become tenuous and the formal rites of religion an echo in the national consciousness.
Acknowledgements

I am deeply indebted to many people who have supported me through the research and writing of this thesis. I owe a large debt of gratitude to my supervisors, Associate Professor Dorothy Page of the University of Otago and Dr Peter Lineham of Massey University, whose unfailing encouragement and insightful criticism have made this study possible. Other readers and commentators have been generous with constructive advice; in this connection, my grateful thanks go to Associate Professor Tom Brooking, Associate Professor David McKenzie, Professor Erik Olssen and Dr John Stenhouse at Otago University. The Dunedin College of Education, both as an institution and through the individual kindnesses of many of its staff, has supported me generously throughout the period of my study; Jennifer Stevenson has provided excellent reprographic assistance. Librarians in many centres have been unstinting in the help they have given me, and it is my privilege to record my thanks to the staff of the Hocken Reference and Archive Libraries, the Hewitson Library, the Otago University Central Library, the Dunedin City Public Library, the Alexander Turnbull Library and, in Australia, the La Trobe Library, Melbourne, and the Mitchell Library, Sydney. I have the deepest respect for the knowledge and unfailing professionalism of David McDonald and Janine Delaney at the Hocken Library, and Yvonne Wilkie at the Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin. The archivists of the Otago Settlers' Museum, the Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Knox Presbyterian Church and Dunedin City Baptist Church have all given me invaluable assistance, making their time and knowledge freely available to me. I am similarly indebted to Joy and Jerry Dix of Balclutha, to Judith Cranefield and to Russell Duff of Dunedin, for opening up their private papers to me. In the field of oral and family history, Joyce Dyer, Isobel Ellen and Dorothy Leffly of Dunedin, and Noeline Michelle of Blue Spur, Lawrence, have willingly shared their knowledge with me. Underpinning all the professional help which I have received has been the patience and love of my family, of my wife, Lynne, and my son, Philip. They have modelled the ideals which the Sunday schools of nineteenth century Otago and Southland, the subject of my study, sought to uphold; they have practised while I have theorised.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1</td>
<td>Introductory</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2</td>
<td>Home Farm - the British Origins of Sunday Schooling</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3</td>
<td>Another Fold - Otago</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4</td>
<td>Pastures Green - Sunday Schooling in Otago and Southland in the Period 1848-1870</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5</td>
<td>Burn-off And Re-sowing - the 1870s As A Decade of Change in Sunday Schooling in Otago and Southland</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6</td>
<td>Homestead And Run - The Structure, Organization And Funding of Sunday Schools in Otago And Southland During the Later Nineteenth Century</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 8</td>
<td>Feeding the Lambs: Curriculum in the Sunday Schools, 1870-1931</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 9</td>
<td>The Shepherd's Craft - Pedagogy in the Sunday Schools, 1870-1901</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 10</td>
<td>Wether or Not: The Sunday Schools as Agencies of Socialization</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 12</td>
<td>Mustering the Conclusions</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td></td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>Candidates Gaining Awards in Examinations and Essay Competitions Organised by the Otago Presbyterian Synod Committee on Bible and Church History Classes</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>Subjects of Study: Presbyterian Synod Bible and Church History Class Examination and Essay Competitions, Otago and Southland, 1884-1893</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C</td>
<td>Bible and Church History Class Examination Papers, 1886 and 1888</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Statistical Tables

Table 1  Birthplaces of Otago and Southland non-Māori Populations (expressed in percentage figures, rounded to the nearest whole percentage) 37
Table 2  Religious Affiliations of the Population of Otago - Selected Churches 45
Table 3  Communicant Membership of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland 46
Table 4  Levels of Educational Attainment in Otago and Southland 50
Table 5  Public Primary School Attendance in Otago & Southland as a Percentage of the Population Aged 5-15 years 52
Table 6  Gender Balance Among Pupils and Staff in Private Schools in Otago and Southland, 1889 and 1890 52
Table 7  European Population of Otago & Southland, 5-15 Age Range 61
Table 8  Aggregate Attendance at Sunday Schools of All Denominations in Otago and Southland Expressed as a Percentage of Attendance at Public and Private Day Schools 62
Table 9  Patterns of Educational Attendance in Otago and Southland, 1848-1871 62
Table 10  Comparative Data Relating to Sunday Schools And Bible Classes Attached to Presbyterian Congregations, Otago And Southland, 1875-1896 116
Table 11  Comparative Data Relating to Bible Classes And Christian Endeavour Groups Attached to Presbyterian Congregations in Otago And Southland For The Year 1896 119
Table 12  Donations to Mission Work by Presbyterian Sabbath Schools in Otago and Southland for the Years 1881 and 1882 121
Table 13  Sunday School Enrolments in Otago and Southland, All Denominations, 1871-1901 136
Table 14  Aggregate Rolls of Presbyterian Sabbath Schools in Otago And Southland, 1874-1901 140
Table 15  Per cent Changes in Presbyterian Sabbath School Rolls in Otago and Southland and Public Day School Rolls Compared 141
Table 16  Comparison of Adult Church Membership, Sunday School And Bible Class Rolls At Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, 1865-1955 142
Table 17  Trinity Methodist Circuit, Dunedin. Numbers of Adult Church Members and Numbers of Sunday School Scholars Compared 142
Table 18  Number of Sunday School Scholars Per Hundred Adult Church Members At Hanover Street Baptist Church, Dunedin 142
Table 19  Average Attendances At Presbyterian Sabbath Schools in Otago and Southland, 1879-1901, Expressed As A Percentage of Nominal Roll 144
Table 20  Employment Status of Fourteen Boys Enrolled At Hanover Street Baptist Church Sunday School During 1883 152
Table 21  Staffing of Presbyterian Sabbath Schools in Otago and Southland, 1880-1901 158
Table 22  Gender Balance in the European Population of Otago and Southland, 1848-1901 259
Table 23  Gender Balance in Selected Religious Groupings in Otago, 1858-1896 260
Table 24  Gender Balance among Sabbath School Children and Children attending Public and Private Day Schools in Otago and Southland, 1871-1901 262
Table 25  Otago and Southland Presbyterian Sabbath School Staffing, 1872-1901 266
**Illustrations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Proposed Plan for a Sunday School Building</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Plan for a Sunday-School Building</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>A Suggestive Plan for a Sunday School</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Otago Sunday School Union Industrial Exhibition Certificate</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Golden Text for Sunday, May 30, 1897</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Superficial Social Graces from <em>More About Peggy</em></td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Christian Courtship from <em>More About Peggy</em></td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Moonta Mines Sunday School - Kindergarten Department</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Moonta Mines Sunday School - groupwork in the Kindergarten</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Moonta Mines Sunday School - Primary Department</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Moonta Mines Sunday School - groupwork in the Primary Department</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Moonta Mines Sunday School - Junior Department</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1  Introductory

Throughout recorded history, and in all areas of the world, people have shown a propensity to worship. The forms may have differed, but the instinct has been universal. The transmission of religious belief and practice has constituted a fundamental of socialization in human cultures. Religion has infused society's interpretative mythology, informed its perceptions, validated its mores and, accordingly, has often shaped its educational processes. The history of Sunday schooling constitutes a chapter in this far larger story.

To most of humankind across the ages secularism, the exclusion of religion from the public domain, would have seemed a concept oddly misplaced within an educational context; it would have betokened a curious, even incomprehensible, compartmentalization of experience. In the educational systems of some western cultures in the nineteenth century, however, a movement towards secularism developed, with migrant Australia and New Zealand well abreast of the trend. Secularism may emerge more readily in societies where migration, whether internal or external, has cut people off from direct access to traditional structures and sanctions, especially those of religion. In overseas migration, such as that undertaken from nineteenth century Britain to Australia or New Zealand, the elderly, uprooted from the known, may cling to the comfort of remembered usage; but for the young, adaptation to a changed physical environment, the mastering of its challenges and exploration of its opportunities may become overriding priorities, finding reflection in novel educational practices.

Most migration from Britain to Australia, initially, was artificial and involuntary. In convict New South Wales during the 1840s church influence was strong in the day schools, denominational education claiming for itself a supposedly civilising role.¹ Churches in Australia during the ensuing, post-penal decades, however, failed to adjust to the demands of a fluidly expanding gold-rush society, reliving the failure of Anglicanism in eighteenth century England to adjust to social change as manifest in the processes of industrialization and urbanization. The dynamics of social adjustment in Australia were complicated by the growth of a vigorous Irish Catholic lobby, fuelling sectarian rivalry. Tension between Protestant and Catholic was heightened by an allegedly Fenian attempt on the life of Prince Alfred, Duke of Edinburgh, in Sydney in 1868, and by the Vatican's promulgation

of the Syllabus of Errors in 1864 and the Bull of Infallibility in 1870. Accordingly, between 1872 and 1880, the states of Victoria, South Australia, Queensland and New South Wales each marginalised religious controversy by promoting the secularization of their day school systems.

New Zealand's migrant population, materialist in its ambitions and rendered uncertain of its spiritual orientation by the colony's lack of a religious establishment, committed itself to a secularised public elementary education system in 1877. The passage of the 1877 Education Act, however, was by no means a foregone conclusion. The Act inaugurated a system of compulsory, free, secular education through a network of public elementary schools, on behalf of a voting public, many of whose members either distrusted secularism or failed to appreciate its full implications. To cater for those with misgivings regarding secularism, denominational education through private schooling was retained as a legal option. Today the secularised state educational system in New Zealand continues to compromise with denominationalism under recently established provisions for integration. In the public schools, social studies teachers are enjoined by the requirements of their curriculum to act as the unconsecrated priesthood of liberal humanism, mediators of a materialist mythology; even a materialist society needs its myths.

The New Zealand parliamentarians who framed the 1877 legislation were not blind to the spiritual aspects of children's education, aspects which they saw as essentially underpinning community values. Many looked to Sunday schools to complement that which, they believed, could no longer be conveniently mediated through the state system. Nineteenth century New Zealand looked to interaction between its public educational and its voluntary religious institutions to resolve the antinomies of migration; through such interaction it sought to reconcile spiritual heritage with materialist aspiration, to sanitize the individualism of the frontier, to wed geographic mobility with social stability. In a frontier world Sunday schools were the seeding of the Spirit around which a temporal sense of community might coalesce.

In the flux of migration the forms of materialism were alluring but lacked self-consistency. E.G. Wakefield was not alone or necessarily wrong in identifying religion as a dynamic of successful

---

2 Hogan, pp. 93-94.
colonisation. At the frontier, the best interests of the settler in long-term, sustainable economic growth clashed with the unsustainable economics of crudely exploitative, extractive industry. Divergent pioneer economies presupposed different social structures and generated conflicting sets of values among migrants. Tensions were generated not only between but also within individual careers as evidenced, for example, in the history of Julius Vogel, speculator and conservationist; James Macandrew, socio-economic visionary and debtor; or in the tortured life of William Larnach, banker, entrepreneur, bankrupt and suicide. The frontier was a place of searching, not only for material wealth but also for a sense of stability and community. Along its edge, as in pioneer Otago and Southland, the permanent and the transient, the respectable and the footloose, sought coherence. The pioneer churches and Sunday schools, institutions at once religious and educational, offered a loom on which the warp and weft of society's myths could be worked into a coherent patterning. Secular toil at best shaped the migrant dream as an earth-bound golem; it took the breath of the Spirit to quicken the golem's clay into living identity, corporeally conscious, mythologically aware. Sunday schools worked on the frontier of myth making.

Myth, as understood in this study, is not inherently fictional. It is the distillation of the essence of a society's experiences. Socialization, in its broadest sense, is the transmission of myth. This transmission is informed by the religious perceptions of the society in which the process has its genesis. Every society spins the tale and weaves the poetry and magic of myth to render the transcendent intelligible to the temporal, to integrate the spiritual and the material, the imaginative and the literal, to point its own purposes and define the coordinates of its own existence. Myth is society's bridge, spanning the gap between the half-remembered dream of the past and the mystery of the future.

Socialization, 'the modification, from infancy, of an individual's behaviour to conform with the demands of a social life', is bedded in the mythology of the parent culture. The more differentiated the society, the more emphasized and prolonged do the formal aspects of its socialization become.

5. The point is made, for example by Jim Hicks in 'Earth's Only Paradise: A New England in America', in The British Empire series, No 5, p.126. It was current thinking among E G Wakefield's contemporaries, being posited for instance by W H Prescott (1796-1858)in his Conquest of Mexico.
reflecting the diffusion and sophistication of its mythology. A.C. Kerchoff, quoting Brim, offers as a definition of socialization: 'the process by which individuals acquire the knowledge, skills and dispositions that enable them to participate as more or less effective members of groups and the society'.

It is a life-long procedure, but is given overt, deliberate focus during the years of childhood and youth. It denotes particularly the processes by which children learn behaviours which their culture deems appropriate, by which society transmits its perceptions, values and mores to the rising generation. Its instruments are numerous, embracing both formal and informal controls, and including home and working environments, schooling, peer and leisure-related activities, and the powerful structures of worship.

The processes of socialization do not take place within a static environment; nor is mythology a museum exhibit. In the migratory context of nineteenth century Australia or New Zealand, flexibility could be crucial to survival, and socialization, Janus-faced, might speak simultaneously of past practice and future change. In such societies young people had to assimilate sufficient tradition to confer upon them a sense of identity. The cultural severance attendant upon migration had to be countered. The influence of the family, church and school thus became crucial concerns of the migrant community. Young people, facing an alien environment, also had to acquire sufficient resourcefulness and facility in problem-solving to survive. In this regard peer-group influence might be important and excite the concerned interest of community leaders, seeking to canalize forces which they could not properly control. As in the 'whisper games' of childhood, socialization's messages, in such a context, would undergo modification during the process of transmission. At the frontier myth evolves; the bridge moves to access a reconceptualised identity.

As a settlement planted for overtly religious reasons on an isolated frontier, at the interface of tradition and adaptation, nineteenth-century Otago provides a particularly suitable context for studying the role of Sunday schools in the socialization of a pioneer society. Otago's foundation was bedded in Scottish religious mythology. The roots of the settlement were significantly, although never exclusively, Presbyterian. Hence, this study will examine Sunday school activity across a

---

10 Kerchoff, pp.4-7.
range of denominations but with a special focus on Presbyterianism, the creed which defines the chronological boundaries of this research, commencing with the foundation of a Scottish Presbyterian class settlement in 1848 and ending with the union of New Zealand's Presbyterian churches in the year 1901; the conclusion of over a half-century of autonomy for Otago and Southland's Free Kirk coincided fortuitously with the passing of the Victorian age.

The usages of Presbyterianism inevitably colour this study and certain essential elements of Presbyterian, particularly Free Kirk, terminology will occur frequently in the ensuing chapters. These elements now require definition. The basic organizational unit of Presbyterian worship, brought to Otago by the migrant Scots, was the parish. A majority of the early migrants, some 60 per cent of them, were of Free Kirk rather than established Church of Scotland persuasion. They laid emphasis on independence of choice for the parish, each congregation being free to 'call' the minister of its own preference from among the ranks of those qualified. Free Kirk adherents believed that landlord influence, since the reintroduction of patronage in 1712, had moved the established church in Scotland too far towards Erastianism, a perception which lay at the root of the Disruption. Fuelled by successive disputed clerical appointments at Auchterarder, Lethendy and Strathbogie, controversy developed between Moderatism and Evangelicalism within the Scottish Church, causing the 1843 General Assembly to fragment. In a Scottish context such a schism was of huge importance; ever since the Act of Union of 1707 the General Assembly had been Scotland's only forum of national debate. The Disruption, born of concern at the parish level, overlaid religious and political issues onto a substratum of economic discontent, and provided the dynamism for migration from nineteenth-century Scotland.

Free Church forms, promulgated through the Disruption, emphasised much that appeared devolutionary, yet in their very democracy they prepared the way for quasi-populist responses to powerful leadership. By force of intellect and personality, Thomas Chalmers achieved immense personal influence within the Free Kirk in Scotland, while the undoubted courage, both moral and physical, shown by many of the Disruption's ministers strongly reinforced their prestige. The high status of the cloth translated in migration. In the shadow of its minister, each congregation in Otago

---

11 Kerchoff, p.60-103.
as in Scotland elected its own elders and deacons, the former to nurture the church's moral and spiritual life and the latter to look after its temporal affairs, including the relief of the needy. 'Session' provided the forum where the minister and elders took counsel. The Deacons' Courts were largely concerned with matters relating to church property and finance. Consulting with, and strongly influencing, these church courts, ministers in the early days of the Otago settlement remained figures of authority. Thomas Burns, chaplain to the infant Otago settlement and minister and mentor to its First Church, was one of the young colony's most influential men and, among the settlers on the Taieri Plain, there were many who stood in fear of the Reverend William Will's sharp tongue.

With the southward expansion of settlement on to the Taieri, Otago Presbyterianism continued to reduplicate the forms of its Scottish parent model. As Otago congregations grew in number, links between them were maintained through the institution of Presbytery. Meetings of this body theoretically featured the attendance of the district's ministers together with one lay representative from each of the component congregations. Scottish practice allowed co-option of a wider lay membership if need arose. When the Reverends William Will and William Bannerman arrived from Scotland in 1853 to take charge, respectively, of the East Taieri and Tokomairiro congregations, they joined with Thomas Burns of the First Church to constitute the Otago Presbytery. Each of the three kirk sessions provided a lay delegate. Paucity of numbers led to the cooptation of a further 19 men who had been kirk office-bearers or divinity students in their native Scotland, to constitute a viable membership. The Otago Presbytery's inaugural series of meetings commenced in June 1854. Subsequent sittings or 'sederunts' continued on a six-monthly cycle. The institution of Presbytery, whether in Scotland or Otago, constituted the powerhouse of the Presbyterian church; it was wide enough in catchment area to encourage the exchange of views while remaining close enough to its congregational roots to foster a lively sense of involvement.

16 Presbytery of Otago minutes, 1854-1860 (June, 1854), Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin BU4/1.
17 J.R. Elder, The History of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, 1840-1940, Presbyterian Bookroom, Christchurch, 1940, p.89.
Further expansion of settlement in Otago and Southland led to the creation of multiple presbyteries, necessitating another coordinating body, Synod, created in 1866. In Otago, as in Scotland, this body stood in the same relationship to the network of presbyteries as did each presbytery to its component congregations. In Otago and Southland, even before the onset of the gold-rush migrations, nine full parish charges had been established. Ongoing foundations soon caused the Otago and Southland Presbytery to subdivide into three parts, Dunedin, Clutha and Southland, with Oamaru being added in 1872, Dunstan in 1881 and Mataura in 1890. Synod met annually from 1866, with right of attendance open to all the province's ordained clergy, together with representatives from the eldership and diaconate. It was Synod which exercised overall supervision of the Church's collective purse. Diversity of task, however, linked with the need to develop an adequate data base, encouraged the creation of numerous sub-committees, enjoined to report to each successive sitting of Synod on designated aspects of church life such as the State of Religion, Temperance and Missions. Evolving needs continued to generate additional committees, the Sabbath Schools Committee appearing in 1872 and the Bible and Church History Class Committee in the early 1880s.

The Sunday school system, its development in Otago reflected in the unfolding structures of Presbyterianism, took on roles which neither day school nor church public worship could fulfil, not only for Presbyterians but across the Protestant denominations. A broad commonality of view tended to produce a broad commonality of Sunday school practice across the denominations, and generated similar patterns of development and change. To Presbyterians, Sunday schools were generally known as Sabbath schools, a term loaded with associations regarding the nature and use of time. The same term was general amongst Wesleyans during the earlier years of settlement, perhaps falling out of favour as more liberal social mores and a developing economy made connotations of strict sabbatarianism invidious. Sunday schools typically serviced the needs of school-age children, although adults sometimes attended. The schools inducted their scholars into simple forms of

---

18 Doctrinal concerns prevented the integration of Otago and Southland into a wider Presbyterian Church of New Zealand at this stage.
19 Elder, p.149.
20 Elder, p.155.
21 See Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1872-1882, Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
22 For example, the 40 children on the roll of Riversdale Presbyterian Sunday School, Southland, in 1895 ranged in age from 4 to 15 years. Riversdale Sunday School Registers (1891-1972), Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. B01/4.
worship and into the basics of religious training. Initially catechetical in emphasis, as the century progressed the schools drew increasingly on sacred song and moved to the exposition and interpretation of biblical narrative. The emphasis of their operation moved from the didactic towards the affective, especially among their younger classes. An individualised pedagogy reflected changing perceptions of childhood and underpinned a new goal for Sunday school teachers, the Christian conversion of the child at the youngest possible age. A Christian identity became the starting point rather than the destination of religious education.

The focus of religious schooling was different among Catholics. Roman Catholic education is too far-reaching a topic to be subsumed within the framework of this study; its omission constitutes a tribute to, not a denial of, its importance. The sacrament of the Mass, celebrated by a consecrated priesthood, is central to Catholic spirituality. The Catholics' Otago spokesman on education, Bishop Patrick Moran, distrusted the public day schools, both for their perceivedly Protestant bias prior to the impact of the 1877 Education Act, and for their secular bias subsequent to the Act. Less compartmentalised in their epistemology than most Protestants, Catholics regarded both the rituals of worship and the religious component of education as far too important to be vested primarily in the haphazard ministrations of Sunday schooling. Catholics invested huge effort in developing their own, denominationally-based day schools, staffed by ordained members of the Church's several orders, the extent of their effort underscoring their concern for a holistic integration of religion and education.

Such concern coincided with the nineteenth century's romanticization, and therefore heightened expectations, of its youth. Protestant churches too felt moved to provide ongoing facilities, linked with but reaching beyond Sunday schooling, for the nurturing and canalization of youth's potential, facilities which logically must form part of the present study. To service the developmental needs of the young, a variety of expedients, both home-grown and imported, was tried. Common across the denominations and in all areas of New Zealand were the Bible classes and the Christian Endeavour movement. Hand in hand with these, a proliferation of Mutual Improvement Associations, Young Men's and Young Women's Literary and Debating Societies and a range of sporting clubs tried to harness both the intellectual and animal energy of youth. The Bands of Hope fought the temperance battle on youth's behalf. No reliable generalizations can be made regarding the sequence of such foundations. One type of organization interacted with another in a rich variety of permutations across the denominations and in different parts of New Zealand. A coherent
examination of the work of the Sunday schools cannot ignore the records left by these supplementary agencies designed to link Sunday schooling to an active and responsible participation in wider church life.

The source materials on which this research is based require comment. Secondary sources which have provided interpretative background include T.W. Laqueur's *Religion and Respectability: Sunday Schools and Working Class Culture 1780-1850*, Anne M. Boylan's *Sunday School: the Formation of an American Institution 1790-1880*, Frank Hanson's *Sunday School in New Zealand Methodism* and D.J. Coles' thesis study 'The Remodelling of the New Zealand Sunday School'. Both Hanson and Coles, in their New Zealand-specific studies, highlight denominationally-focused expectations that Sunday schools would act as recruiting grounds for their parent churches. Writing in 1966, in response to the rapid decline of New Zealand Sunday schooling after World War II, Coles looks for a new paradigm that might reintegrate the community of day school, Sunday school and church. Laqueur and Boylan, writing of earlier Sunday schools in overseas contexts, both identify factors other than denominationality as central to the Sunday schools' influence. Laqueur outlines the dynamic, interactive relationship which developed between nineteenth century Sunday schooling and the British working classes, and traces flow-on effects from Sabbath to secular education. In an American setting, Boylan finds that Sunday schooling achieved special importance, not so much for working class people, as for women and for the socially disadvantaged southern black communities. She finds also that the Sunday schools played a significant role in helping settlements of recent migrant origin to achieve cohesion. As will be shown, a case study of nineteenth century Sunday schooling in Otago and Southland reflects in microcosm the findings of these wider national and international studies. The Otago and Southland schools were important, not as props of denominationality, despite attempts to use them for this end, but rather as community foci and as inculcators of an integrative sense of self-respect.

The primary sources for this study have proved to be, like an Otago fractured gold reef, uneven and tantalisingly rich. Since a writer is inescapably an interpreter and mediator of his sources, I must

---

declare my own position. I am a Christian, of no fixed denomination, but currently worshipping with the Baptist community. My boyhood included some years of interdenominational Sunday schooling through the Crusader movement in England. The primary source material for the Otago and Southland area, with which I have worked, is relatively sparse and inchoate for the years 1848-1870. For these early years, personal correspondence and diaries provide glimpses into Sunday school activity which often sprouted spontaneously at grass-roots level, independent of official fiat or formalised guide, the very spontaneity which was the strength of early Sunday schooling makes the movement elusive for the historian. Source material becomes diverse and abundant for the last three decades of the nineteenth century, and holdings are not confined to archives in the Otago region. Rich files of relevant documents can be accessed from collections outside Otago, especially from the La Trobe Library, Melbourne, and the Mitchell Library in Sydney, Australia, evidence of the frequency of nineteenth century trans-Tasman contact. Wesleyan Sunday school literature was published on an 'Australasian' rather than 'Australian' basis in Melbourne, and Otago Presbyterian divines such as the Reverend James McGregor of Oamaru were regular contributors to Australian ecumenical Sunday school publications. 24 There was frequent two-way movement of Sunday school children and staff, both short term and long term, between Otago and Victoria in the later nineteenth century, and Otago Sunday school leaders showed themselves well-informed on Australian conditions. An example is afforded by William Ings, converted at the age of 18 by Joseph Jackson, a fellow orchard worker in the Melbourne area, who moved to Otago and became the driving force behind the development of Baptist Sunday schooling in South Dunedin. 25 On the other hand, a total of 94 children out of a roll of 628 left the Knox Presbyterian Sunday School, Dunedin, mainly bound for Melbourne, in the year 1887-1888. 26

Archives located within Otago and Southland contain resources in many formats. Among these the reports of the Presbyterian Sabbath Schools' Committee are particularly informative. Usually systematic in its work and anxious to develop a clear picture of what was happening in its field, this committee reported annually to the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland from 1873 onwards. Records of individual churches also frequently contain reference to Sunday school,

---


Bible class and Christian Endeavour group activities; to cite a range of Dunedin examples, the records of the Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Knox Presbyterian Church, St Andrew's Presbyterian Church and St Paul's Anglican Church are invaluable sources of relevant information. Quarterly newsletters from these churches are especially illuminating regarding the fine detail of Sunday school and Bible class activity and rich in interpretative comment, whereas annual reports tend to confine themselves to bare outline and statistical summary. From some parishes incomplete records of Sunday school teachers' quarterly meetings and teachers' preparation sessions are available. A small number of roll books and Sunday school library record books, well thumbed and fragmentary, have survived. Contemporary newspaper reports which afford glimpses of the social dimension of nineteenth century Sunday schooling have proved well worth perusal. These sometimes give quite detailed accounts of Sunday school picnics, galas and festivals, events which at times attracted upwards of a thousand participants. The informal journals produced by churches' own youth groups give interesting insights into the issues which concerned young people at the time, while a study of the prizes which some Sabbath scholars gained through participation in Sunday school and Bible class life affords insight into the issues which their teachers thought should concern them.

Even when the archival files are rich, some types of information prove to be more accessible than others. For the later nineteenth century in Otago and Southland, statistical data is readily available. In their anxiety that Sunday schools should not suffer by comparison with the secular day schools, the planners and assessors of religious education paid attention to quantifiable outputs, to attendance figures and test results, to efficiency of structure rather than to the nuances of process. It is harder to establish exactly what was taught in the Sunday schools, from what philosophical position the teaching was delivered and through what pedagogy it was mediated; much has to be read between the lines, pieced together from an assortment of evidence. Disappointingly, the records of the Otago Sunday School Union appear to have vanished without trace. Very little of the textual material used by Sunday school teachers or the huge volume of pamphlet literature distributed to children has survived. Precisely because it was common and cheap, it was thumbed through and discarded. Such Sunday school syllabus material as remains is content-bound, offering little overt clue as to its interpretation or method delivery. Hymnaries afford some of the most interesting insights into the

---

26 Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, 1888.
Feeding the Lambs

theology that Sunday schools mediated to their children; myth is perhaps at its most effective when expressed in song.

The shamans of a migrant people are torn between chanting the myths of the past and prophesying the word of the future. A parallel and enduring challenge for Christians, who have always regarded themselves as migrants of the Spirit and pilgrims on earth, is to honour tradition without worshipping its form. There always will be an interactive tension between the human need of both structure and process, between the conservative systole and radical diastole of the human heart. It is this tension which gives human life its dynamism and tunes the traveller's poetry; a slackened string makes no music. Such tension is clearly evident through the history of Sunday schooling in nineteenth-century Otago and Southland, a microworld where myths were reworked and socialization looked in multiple directions, where the forms of the past were offered with hope at the altar of the future and blessing was sought in both spiritual and material prosperity. The rites of the offering and its outcomes for all concerned constitute the material of this thesis.
Chapter 2   Home Farm - the British Origins of Sunday Schooling

A)   England, Wales and Ireland

It is customary to look for the roots of Sunday schooling in the philanthropic revival of eighteenth century Britain.¹ The 'godfather' of the Sunday school movement in England was Robert Raikes, a journalist of Gloucester. In 1881 the Presbyterian Synod of Otago and Southland honoured Raikes' contribution to Sabbath schooling with a series of centennial meetings, scheduled for every population centre in the province from Oamaru to Invercargill: 'though dead, Raikes yet speaks, and the cause he loved, though cradled neither in palace nor lordly mansion, has reached dimensions such as no imagination has been able to describe.'² Nineteenth century British society, in the colonies as at home, canonized its spiritual and intellectual leaders. The pervasive influence which Sunday schooling came to achieve in Otago and Southland gave the colony's settlers good reason to venerate the pioneers of the movement.

In their earliest manifestations Sunday schools were not British. The seventeenth century Cardinal Borromeo of Milan may have been the first experimenter in the field.³ Claims have also been advanced for Martin Luther⁴. Within England, Sunday schools had long predated Raikes. As early as 1625 the Ferrar sisters ran a school at Little Gidding.⁵ At the turn of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries the Reverend Joseph Alleine opened another at Taunton, not far from Bristol.⁶ John Wesley experimented with Sabbath education half a century before Raikes.⁷ Other pioneers in the field were Madam Boevey at Faxley Abbey, and the Reverend Theophilus Lindsay at Catterick.

---

² Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1881, Appendix, p.25.
³ Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
⁵ Laqueur, p.24.
⁶ Jones, p.143.
in 1763. A Wesleyan woman, Hannah Ball, commenced a Sunday catechetical class for children at High Wycombe in 1769. In County Down, Ireland, a minister's experimental music class in 1770 spilled over into fully fledged Sabbath school work.

Inspiring and informing the growth of English Sunday schools during the later Hanoverian and Victorian periods were four disparate but interactive influences: the Enlightenment, Romanticism, Evangelicalism and the Agricultural and Industrial Revolutions. The diversity of these intertwined influences complicates analysis of the motives of a seminal figure such as Raikes. The Enlightenment propounded the concept of human perfectibility. John Locke had posited the infant mind as a *tabula rasa* on which the hand of education could write fair copy. Romanticism viewed infancy differently, as a condition closer than adulthood to humanity's spiritual roots. Both premises rejected the doctrine of universal human depravity and eroded the legacy of Calvinism in England's religious traditions. Seen either from a Lockean or a Romantic perspective, childhood became a condition significant in its own right and crucial in its formative potential. Among Evangelicals, childhood conversion came to be postulated as a valid experience, its lower age limits circumscribed only by the faculty of speech. From an evangelically Romantic point of view, it was possible to view the innocent child as a potential missionary to its corrupted parents. The missioners of the Evangelical Revival, even during the early phases of the movement, reached out across the age range; in the mission campaigns of John Wesley and George Whitefield the manifestation of the Holy Spirit in childhood conversion, equally with adult conversion, was both looked for and expected.

A society increasingly sophisticated in its structures and technology called for increasingly sophisticated instruments of socialization, and therefore Sabbath schooling, whether in England,

---

8 Jones, p.145.
10 *The Evangelist* (Dunedin), 1 March 1876, 'The Origin of the Sabbath Schools'. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
11 Jones, p.5.
12 Laqueur, p.3.
13 Laqueur, pp.4-8.
14 Sangster, p.125. See also Hanson, pp.8-9.
Wales or Ireland, sprang from prepared ground. Closely related precursors of the Sunday schools flourished from the later seventeenth century onwards. Circulating schools serviced by an itinerant teacher first appeared in Wales in 1737. In England benevolent movements such as the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge provided the children of the poor with access to a rudimentary level of education through the opening up of charity day schools. By 1730 some 1500 of these schools, partly endowed and partly funded by subscription, inculcated religious orthodoxy and social deference in the minds of over 20,000 young pupils. The daily opening prayer of the girls' charity school at Sheffield pleaded: 'Make me dutiful and obedient to my benefactors, and charitable to my enemies. Make me temperate and chaste, meek and patient, true in all my dealings and content and industrious in my station'. The schools' 'literary curriculum' was geared to the production of a malleable labour force. It sought the reform of manners through rote recall of the Anglican catechism, the paternoster and the decalogue. Rules of conduct, learned by heart from Mrs Sarah Trimmer's Teacher's Assistant, reinforced biblical precept. The schools taught some simple reading, less writing and still less arithmetic; mathematics, when taught at all, was taught mainly as a navigational skill to boys in coastal areas who were being prepared for a life at sea. Girls learned simple domestic skills, spinning, sewing, knitting, baking and cleaning. The agenda of the charity schools appears to have been social control but, whatever the limitations of their curricula, the proliferation of the schools is indicative of a keenly felt need, nationwide, for access to education.

The growth of charity schools eventually outstripped funding capacity, creating demand for a supplementary educational facility. The problem did not lie in a dearth of middle class benefactors; philanthropy became more, not less, fashionable. Rather, working class families could not sustain the loss of income entailed if their children attended day school. The quality of day school teaching of all types, moreover, was frequently very poor; the need felt by capital for a well-socialized workforce was not being effectively met. A deficiency thus existed in educational provision which both capital and labour would find it in their interests to address. Accordingly the work of the charity schools became supplemented with increasing frequency by Sunday schooling as the eighteenth

---

15 Sangster, p.117.
17 Cited in Jones, p.75.
century progressed. Across the denominations, whether Unitarian, Anglican or Methodist, foundations were numerous in the 1770s.

Raikes was the facilitator, not the author, of these developments. Although Raikes has been honoured as the pioneer of Sunday schooling, in his own home town of Gloucester a Methodist woman, Sophia Cooke, and also the Reverend Thomas Stock, head of the Gloucester Cathedral School, both set up Sabbath schools in advance of Raikes' own first venture in Sooty Lane. The cottage model of these early Gloucester schools was soon over-taken by the subsequent rapid growth of the Sabbath school movement. In this process Raikes played a major role, not only in England but also in Wales and Scotland, through his skills as a publicist and through the contacts and opportunities for publicity afforded him by his journalistic profession. Though not the founder of Sunday schools, [Raikes] was the founder of the Sunday school system. By 1784 there were a quarter of a million Sunday school scholars in England. Sunday schools began to be founded on municipal as well as individual or denominational initiative, and moves towards national coordination were in train. The London-based Sunday School Society appeared in 1785, with the particular aim of enhancing the quality of Sunday school teaching. By 1800 support for Sunday schooling became almost 'a form of cultural definition', especially for women of the middle classes. Businesses too, throughout Britain, made donations to building funds or provided facilities for meeting, for example partly paying for the great school at Stockport, Lancashire, which eventually housed over 2000 children. George Hepburn, looking back in New Zealand over half a century of involvement in Sunday school work, recalled teaching his first lesson in 1823 at the Prinlaw Works Sabbath School in Fife, Scotland, under the tutelage of his own father. Even after the school was forced to relocate, following a fire at the factory, it retained the 'Prinlaw Works' name.

19 Laqueur, p.53.
22 Laqueur, p.33. See also Hanson, p.12.
23 Laqueur, p.25.
24 The Evangelist (Dunedin), September 1878, 'Fifty-five Years' Reminiscences of Sabbath School Work in Scotland and Otago'.
To a modern observer it may seem that Raikes' own motives for becoming involved in Sunday school activity were as much secular as religious, reflecting capital's self-interested concern for social order.\(^{25}\) In Raikes' mind social and religious concerns were but two sides of a single coin; his concept of socialization was not differentiated. The Agricultural and Industrial Revolutions, while stimulating urbanization, had dislocated those traditional patterns of family life which Christ himself had proffered as metaphors of the eternal. Within a setting of local demographic shift, the Revolutions anticipated the socially atomizing influence of nineteenth century overseas migration. They also created a demand for a docile and diligent labour force.\(^{26}\) The impact of socio-economic change was felt alike in town and country, including the pin-making quarter of Raikes' home town, the rural service centre of Gloucester. The seemingly fortuitous factor which moved Raikes to action was an affront given to his Sabbatarianism by Gloucester's working-class youth, who made the streets of their quarter riotous on their day of rest. Earlier experience of prison visiting had convinced Raikes that idle, misspent Sabbaths were breeding grounds of petty crime. 'Scrumping' in landlords' orchards led to a gaol term for many a stripling. Association in gaol with mature criminals then generated a high rate of recidivism into more serious offences.\(^{27}\) To Raikes, therefore, a desecrated Sabbath was no trivial matter. It symptomised the undermining of parental control and the decay of family life, the cankerimg of society at its essential core, presaging a rising crime rate and ultimately the collapse of the social order. Raikes, a product of the English middle classes, saw the familiar social hierarchies as being divinely ordained, and their stability as a sublunary reflection of the harmony of heaven.\(^{28}\) To violate the Sabbath by larrkin behaviour was both sinful and socially subversive. For Raikes, far more than convention was at stake in maintaining the outward trappings of respectability.

Raikes accordingly, like the workers in the charity schools who preceded him, promoted religious education as a form of socio-spiritual control. This aim, in turn, could not be fulfilled until the rudiments of literacy had been put in place, a requirement producing dichotomies which Raikes tried to resolve.\(^{29}\) Biblical knowledge was held to promote socially responsible behaviour. Reading was

\(^{25}\) Sangster, p.111.

\(^{26}\) Laqueur, p.4.

\(^{27}\) The Evangelist (Dunedin), 1 March 1876, 'The Origin of Sabbath Schools'.

\(^{28}\) Laqueur, p.22.

\(^{29}\) Laqueur, p.8.
essential to biblical literacy. The early Sunday schools therefore taught reading, using Bible passages as primer material. Hanway’s *Comprehensive View of Sunday Schools* offered a more developed reading schedule through a graduated series of tables.\(^3^0\) The opening words in each table betray the socio-religious concerns of the programme:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I</th>
<th>ba</th>
<th>be</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>all</td>
<td>ake (sic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>bat</td>
<td>cat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>cat</td>
<td>plumb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>pound</td>
<td>beef</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>belly</td>
<td>bible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>funeral</td>
<td>monument</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inevitably there developed a confusion of aim within the Sunday schools, with the mechanics of reading tending to take precedence over biblical understanding, even when overtly biblical textual material was being used. The need for programme balance was proving, by 1800, to be a rich source of controversy and debate among Sunday school practitioners.\(^3^1\) Raikes himself was sceptical as to the efficacy of a single day’s schooling per week if literacy per se was to be the aim. He looked rather to the reform of manners among the erstwhile graceless employees of factory and mill to validate his plan:

The good effects of the Sunday Schools established in this city are instanced in the account given by the principal persons in the pin and sack manufacturies. Great reformation has taken place among the multitudes whom they employ. From being idle, ungovernable, profligate and filthy in the extreme, they say, the boys and girls are become not only more cleanly and decent in appearance, but are greatly humanized in their manners, more orderly, tractable and attentive to business; and of course more serviceable than they ever expected to find them.\(^3^2\)

---

\(^3^0\) Sangster, p.116.

\(^3^1\) Sangster, p.111.

\(^3^2\) *Gloucester Journal*, May 1784, cited in Booth, p.102.
The skill of writing, on the other hand, was played down by Raikes and many of his fellow pioneers in Sunday schooling, as unsuited to their concept of socialization for the working classes. The neglect of writing stemmed from numerous factors. It arose from a sabbatarian concept of writing as 'work' and therefore as an activity ill-befitting Sabbath observance. Wesleyans of tender conscience in this matter avoided the difficulty by teaching writing at weekday evening classes. Neglect of writing also reflected time constraints and the cost of materials. It stemmed too from fear of loss of control on the part of the governing class, both secular and ecclesiastical. Some wealthy laity felt fear at the prospect of their employees' gaining the power of the pen. Command of the written word, it was held, would generate an outburst of seditious pamphleteering. The outbreak of the French Revolution in 1789 heightened this sense of apprehension. At landlord instigation, Tom Paine was burnt in effigy near Gloucester. In relation to Sunday schooling, some of Raikes' contemporaries gave overt voice to fears of Jacobinism. Hannah More, conscious of widespread landlord mistrust of her Sabbath and adult education programmes in the Cheddar area, wrote to the Bishop of Bath and Wells in 1881 in an attempt to allay unease:

My plan of instruction is extremely simple and limited. They learn, on weekdays, such coarse works as may fit them for servants. I allow no writing for the poor. My object is not to make them fanatics, but to train up the lower classes in habits of industry and piety.

More significant than landlord and employer disquiet, however, were the growing doubts felt by some, although by no means all, of the ecclesiastical establishment at trends apparent in Sunday schooling by the year 1800. Control of the Sunday school movement effectively was being highjacked by its working class clients. Already the Evangelical revival had fostered an effusion of lay preaching among working people, and now the Sunday schools began to show signs of a vigorous autonomy. The schools' mechanisms became geared to working class aspirations of upward social levelling; working people spun and wove their own mythology of respectability. Sunday classes gave working people access to educational opportunities that did not eat into weekday earning capacity, and working families seized these opportunities on behalf of their children. The huge growth of Sunday schooling far outstripped the capacity of the middle classes to fund the teaching force. Sunday school teaching was taken over by unpaid volunteers, drawn largely from the

---

33 Laqueur, p.132.
34 Booth, p.142.
ranks of the workers. A long tradition of autonomous trade, benefit and friendly societies existed among workmen; even London's beggars and pickpockets had their own clubs.\footnote{Hind, p.205.} Working class traditions of mutual support were now transferred to Sabbath education. Thomas Broadbent of Stalybridge for example, a labourer who could neither write nor afford weekday school fees, taught reading to his own and his neighbours' children on Sundays; soon his venture became a two-teacher school.\footnote{Ibid., pp.206-207.} William Grummitt, a Lincolnshire farm labourer, opened a Sunday school in a shoemaker's shop in 1812; burgeoning demand soon forced him to relocate in a barn.

Within a generation of Raikes' first venture into Sunday schooling the movement which he publicised had thus taken off under its own dynamic, with a vigour and in directions which he had scarcely anticipated. The typical nineteenth century English Sunday school was locally controlled and lay dominated, independent of church congregation and minister alike. The schools developed their own administrative systems, with some involvement of churchwardens or chapel trustees, but with internal policy set by the teachers under the chairmanship of the school superintendent. Only 40 per cent of nineteenth century English Sunday schools met on church or chapel premises. Some 10 per cent rented accommodation. About half owned their own buildings outright. In 1851 only 12 per cent of teachers, all of Anglican persuasion, were still paid. Overwhelmingly the schools were staffed by unpaid volunteers. A significant proportion of these teachers were themselves working class products of the systems which they served; spiritual recycling made for cost efficiency. Funding for buildings and maintenance, while often supplemented by handsome donations from local industrialists, was raised largely among the working people of the school's catchment area. It was common for the hat to be passed round again and again at the school's anniversary celebration until annual budget needs had been met. Unsurprisingly, Sunday school autonomy was a situation to which Dissent adjusted more readily than did the established church; it had less to lose. Even Methodism, however, as it developed its own formalized structures and clerical hierarchy, began to express reservations regarding issues of Sabbath school control.\footnote{Laqueur, pp.76-84. See also Minutes of the British Methodist Conference 1817-1826, cited in Hanson, p.11.}

Developing into a feature of English folk culture, Sunday schools came to exert an incalculable influence on future social development. They enjoyed a burst of exponential growth, with schools
throughout Britain numbering in excess of 7000 by the start of the nineteenth century, with over three-quarters of a million scholars enrolled and a pupil-teacher ratio of better than ten to one. The ages of the scholars ranged from 5 to 30 years. Small class size compensated for the inadequate knowledge base of many of the volunteer teachers. Changes in the curriculum, evident after 1800, reflected working class aspirations, opening up to the children of the poor a variety of opportunity which notably exceeded in scope the limited programmes implemented by Raikes or More. Writing, spelling and arithmetic came to be widely taught, as well as reading and religious instruction, with the more advanced subjects sometimes being offered as rewards to the pupils who showed diligence and good behaviour. In the Birmingham area of England's industrial Midlands, mechanics and natural philosophy made their appearance in programmes for older boys. Curricular extension was particularly a feature of schooling among non-Anglicans who found compensation in technology for the privations of political and social discrimination; many of England's successful industrial pioneers, for example Abraham Darby and Henry Cort, had been Protestant Dissenters. In Wales the Sunday schools took on a yet more overtly egalitarian and democratic flavour, with parental as well as child attendance being actively encouraged. The father of Welsh Sunday schooling was a Methodist, Thomas Charles of Bala, who promoted both reading and religious instruction in the Welsh language. Because Wales had a sparse, rural population, especially in the central and northern districts, Charles concentrated initially on the development of circulating day schools with itinerant teachers. Experience showed him, however, that Sunday schooling was more effective; Wales was less industrialized than England, but the rural Welsh family, like its urban English counterpart, could not afford the loss of weekday earning power. Welsh Sunday schooling came to cut across both age and class structures. Study groups were set up which imposed no test of education or creed. Farmers, artisans and professional men attended, as well as the poor. Adults mingled with children. Massed inter-school meetings took place. Many schools became the nuclei of new churches.

While a realistic appraisal of their work must acknowledge their limitations, the Sunday schools did soften the harsh edges of socio-economic change in England, as in other parts of Britain. Evidence

38 Laqueur, p.150.
39 Garing, pp.13-17.
40 Jones, pp.315-318.
implicitly belittling the schools' effectiveness can readily be found. There was little enough the schools could do through brief, once-weekly periods of contact, for the exploited, exhausted and even brutalized victims of industrialization. Sarah Gooder, giving evidence at the age of 8 years before Ashley's Mines Commission in 1842, testified that she worked as a trapper at Gawler Pit from 4 a.m. to 5.38 p.m. She attended Sunday school, where she learnt her letters from Reading Made Easy. She could partly recite the paternoster, and also prayed: 'God bless my father and mother, sister and brother, uncles and aunts and cousins and everybody else. God bless me and make me a good servant, Amen.' She had heard of Jesus 'many a time', but she did not know why he had come to earth or why he had died. She knew 'he had stones for his head to rest on' - and she was certain she preferred attending Sunday school to working at the pit. Patience Kershaw, aged 17, 'hurried the corves' at the pit from 5a.m. to 5p.m. Working almost naked underground, she was verbally and sexually abused. With Sunday schooling her only education, she was illiterate. Mary Barrett, aged 14, was one of twelve siblings. Of these only three had received any formal education, in each case exclusively at Sunday school, and only one was functionally literate.\footnote{Testimony gathered by Ashley's Mines Commission, Parliamentary papers, 1842. Internet: http://ab.edu/~delcol_1/worker.html}

The schools, nevertheless, were a lifeline to the working class, and prepared the way for universal access to elementary education. They were the nurseries of many a future Chartist or trade union leader.\footnote{Jones, pp.216-217.} They disappointed those religious vested interests which looked to them as recruiting grounds for future church membership; the schools' working class supporters had their own agenda, which did not include trophy-gathering for the establishment. But Sunday schools did give, to many working people, a cloak of self-respect which, in a class conscious society, covered the nakedness of poor birth. The wearing of the cloak may have become stiflingly obligatory to the likes of Arnold Bennett's Anna, driven by social expectation to ape a conversion experience and embrace the forms of a morality which ran counter to her inner feelings.\footnote{But a novel such as Bennett's Anna of the Five Towns could only have been written in a society in which Sunday schooling had become normative. By 1860 their influence had become so pervasive that the Sunday schools were drawing in children of their erstwhile middle class patrons, at the cost of some departure from the schools' Raikesian normative.}
traditions. Bennett's fictional insight tacitly acknowledges this departure, highlighting the role of Sabbath schooling in the encouragement of contact across a broad social spectrum in England. The ambit of Anna's Sunday school experience, while excluding the socially disreputable whom Raikes had targeted, took in a sweep of local society, from industrial owner, manager and professional practitioner down to the artisan, from the prosperous down to the deserving poor. Involvement in Sabbath school activity led Anna from coarse origins to a wealthy, dutiful but loveless marriage. Through the wide social appeal which Sunday schools came to exercise in England, the concept of popular education was planted and nurtured. By the middle of the nineteenth century Sunday schooling had been institutionalised across most religious groupings, to the point where a universal system of elementary education had become a publicly acceptable social goal. The state, with its 1870 Education Act, belatedly followed where Sunday schooling had led.

Such a shift in public attitudes regarding educational access had important implications for English migrant settlements overseas, including those in Australia and New Zealand. Trends developed and attitudes fostered in the Sabbath schools of the home country were reflected in the colonial mirror, and colonial Sunday schooling proved itself as adaptable to migration, pioneering and settlement as it had to social change in England, Wales and wider Britain. The fact that migration manifested itself so clearly among the 'anxious' artisan and lower middle classes, themselves the agents of the English Sunday school dynamics, made Sabbath school influence especially important in colonies such as New Zealand. The influence of Sunday schooling would ensure that English migrants would concur, at least in principle, in a vision of educational development offering access to all at the elementary level. The increasing sophistication and differentiation of curriculum in the senior classes of some nineteenth-century English Sunday schools also helped to prepare public attitudes in the colonies for an expansion of secondary education. The propensity of English Sunday schooling to sprout its own autonomous forms would generate interesting parallels among migrant communities adjusting to the exigencies of a frontier lifestyle. English Sunday schooling left its mark too on the content and delivery of education in the colonies, in day and Sabbath schools alike. Fifty vigorous years of Raikesian and post-Raikesian development reinforced the concept that education was

44 See, for example, R.J. Sumner, 'Nineteenth Century British Working Class Education: a Model for Australian Colonial Efforts', in *Australian Journal of Adult and Community Education*, Vol 30, No 1, April 1990, pp.4-9.
fundamentally a religious activity. Religion played a major and overt part in the shaping of day-school as well as Sunday school programmes in New Zealand, at least in the earlier years of settlement. Even in the years which followed the secularisation of public elementary education, there continued in both New Zealand and Australia an overlapping of staff between Sunday schools and day schools which had major implications for day school curriculum and pedagogy.  

Flexibility was the hallmark of the response of Sunday schooling to local conditions, both in Britain and the colonies. Change is most effective when unimposed, when local communities react in response to their own perceived needs; it follows that change, at its most effective, is hard to monitor. Sunday schools were one of those elusively autonomous mechanisms through which socialization accommodated social mobility. The schools adapted readily to local need whether in England, Australia, New Zealand - or in Scotland. Since nineteenth century Otago was predominantly a Scottish settlement, it is to the Scottish Sunday school experience that this study must now turn.

**B) SCOTLAND**

In Otago and Southland the tartan is still worn with pride, its chequer pattern fittingly symbolising the diverse strands interwoven in a Scottish identity. Scots look back to an ancient heritage, comprising Celtic, Roman, Saxon, Norse and, in some degree, French elements. They honour the memory of the year 1314, when Robert Bruce's victory at Bannockburn gained for Scotland some four hundred years of independence from English rule. When monarchical union came, in 1603, it was the English throne which was subsumed into the Scottish Stuart dynasty, as James VI was crowned James I in London. Scotland retained its own parliament until the Act of Union, in 1707, gave shape to the political concept of Britain. Discrete cultural forms survived the political merger. Sunday schooling, transplanted during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries into a Scottish cultural setting, developed distinct features in reaction to local conditions. In Scotland, as in Wales, Sunday schools proved their serviceability to local need. They interacted in Scotland with established educational practices which had long afforded far more liberal access across the class and gender range of the population than had contemporary English systems. Scottish Sabbath schools complemented the parish day school to support a sense of community identity. Thomas Chalmers bedded this concept of Sunday schooling into Scottish and, especially, Free Church thinking. The

---

45 See Chapters 8 and 9.
concept travelled in the cultural baggage of nineteenth century Scottish migrants. Otago's micro-mythology still reflects a rurally Scottish sense of community.

Scotland boasted its own religious and educational traditions, mutually interactive and strongly held, and these traditions distinctively shaped the institutions of Scottish migrant settlement. Day school education in Scotland, conceived in reaction to French domination, tracing its inspiration back to the moral concerns of Calvin and Knox as enunciated, for example, in Knox's *First Book of Discipline* and given shape by the Scottish Education Act of 1696, became a crucial component in Scottish theocratic nationalism. Knox's dream of a system of elementary education that would be compulsory, and also free to the children of the poor, was not fully realised. Nevertheless the 1696 legislation, by rating landowners to fund the erection, staffing and maintenance of schools, made considerable educational expansion possible. By the end of the eighteenth century, under the auspices of the established Presbyterian Church, there had developed across the Scottish Lowlands a system of parish and burgh day schools which afforded the country's artisans and peasantry a remarkably high level of literacy. Nineteenth century illiteracy rates were, for women, 25 per cent and, for men, 50 per cent lower in Scotland than they were in England at the same period. The teaching staff of the Kirk-sponsored schools were university graduates, men of standing in the community, with relatively high rates of pay and, at least in the case of the parish school dominies, with security of tenure 'ad vitam aut culpam'.

Generous in scope, Scotland's parish and sessional schools imposed no deliberate drafting by social class. At the level of elementary education in Scotland all but the very rich mingled on an equal footing from an early age, and the social stratification which became apparent in nineteenth century urban education was not the result of policy, but rather the fortuitous by-product of developing residential patterns. Honouring an educational tradition going back to Knox himself, the Kirk had

---

never denied its poorer children access to basic literacy and numeracy. Its parish schools had long afforded a measure of upward social mobility. Sons of manual labourers could and did graduate from Scotland's universities. The charitable provision of elementary education in contemporary England looked paltry by comparison. With the fundamentals of literacy already in place, accessible across the class structure and available irrespective of gender, Scottish Sabbath schools, when they emerged, developed on lines rather different from those of the English model, even when reacting to similar pressures of socio-economic change.

The question might well be asked why a land with so rich a tradition of public education as Scotland possessed needed Sabbath schools at all. For all the strength of its educational system, Scotland's population during the late eighteenth century was stressed by the processes of adjustment attendant on the Agricultural and Industrial Revolutions. Economic revolution impacted later on Scotland than on England, and its effects were compressed within a shorter time-span. Agricultural innovation gathered rapid momentum after the foundation of the Highland and Agricultural Society in 1784.

Both agricultural and industrial change in Scotland were accompanied by an extreme application of laissez-faire individualism, the manifestations of which were closely analysed by post-millennial Evangelicals who asserted intellectual leadership over Scottish Presbyterianism in the early nineteenth century. Going beyond the 'evidences' of natural theology, which saw the hand of God in spatial design, Scottish Evangelicals saw divine ordering in the structures of time. They posited a quasiinist karma in which conduct, whether virtuous or evil, generated its own consequences with the inevitability of the laws of physics. Socio-economic stress of the type which Scotland was experiencing, far from being a curse, came to be seen as both providential and educative, a divinely-ordained and timely warning to a society in dire need of self-regulation. To Scottish Evangelical thought the 'Invisible Hand' of Adam Smith's vision was the shadow of the divine across the portals of human commerce. Its MENE, MENE, TEKEL, UPHARSIN chalked a warning open to interpretation by any Daniel of socio-economic insight, in every hall of self-indulgence, whether of

51 Smout, p.217.
54 Hilton, pp.12-17.
working class idleness or entrepreneurial speed. Any attempt at state provision or economic regulation was deemed a cruel hoax, a clouding of those market signals ordained by providence for the calibration of humanity's many-faceted material activities. State intervention, by encouraging the individual in inappropriate behaviour, left its unwitting victims ultimately to suffer the certain consequences of their folly. Christian education was held to be vital by Presbyterian apologists of Scotland's free market. Partnership between the Sabbath school and day school offered a spiritual, intellectual and social counter to the atomising influence of an unregulated economy. In its very essence deregulated, devolved, autonomous, yet simultaneously collaborative, Sabbath schooling enshrined Christian ideals in a laissez-faire of the spirit.

It was in the Lowland cities that Scottish Sabbath schooling most closely paralleled, but never cloned, the English experience, with Thomas Chalmers emerging as Scotland's Raikes. In Scotland, as in England, internal demographic mobility predated the socially fragmenting experience of overseas migration. The burgeoning slums of Glasgow and Edinburgh far outstripped the capacity of the traditional model of the rural Scottish parish to service their spiritual and educational needs, leaving a generation of dispossessed urban youth to be catered for by a motley assortment of adventure schools.\(^{55}\) Leaving a rural parish to minister in this environment, Chalmers developed a nationwide, even international, reputation of remarkable scope. He became the doyen of post-millennial Evangelicalism, a man whose influence in the disparate areas of theological, social, economic and even scientific thought shaped the Scotland of his day and spread far beyond his homeland, throughout Britain and to the colonies. Chalmers achieved patriarchal status in Scotland, a latter-day Moses in the Free Kirk's exodus through the wilderness of the Disruption. Scottish pioneers brought a mythology of Chalmers with them to Otago, imprinting its mark on their landfall at Koputai and writing its forms into the settler's evolving institutions, including the Sabbath schools.

Like Moses, Chalmers was a reluctant rebel. His social inclinations were conservative. As a young man his religious instincts had not been particularly evangelical.\(^{56}\) His early associates were 'Moderatists'. His keen interest in mathematics and the sciences made him initially a reluctant pastor

---

at Kilmany in rural Fife; his ambitions were secular and his absences from his parish to attend St Andrew's University were frequent and prolonged. It was through a major crisis in his health between 1809 and 1811 that he came to a singular experience of conversion, an experience which transformed his life and radically reshaped his future influence on Scottish religious and educational practice.

To an Evangelical, conversion, whether instantaneous or experienced as process, is a development at once intensely individualistic and transcendentally social. It entails a quintessential surrender, at the deepest levels and at the core of being, to the love of God incarnate and manifest in the life, death and resurrection of Jesus. Virtue as the fruit of human endeavour, circumscribed within the time frame of human experience, can never be a precondition, still less an alternative, to this act of surrender; the Evangelical's salvation comes not by works. To the Evangelical believer true virtue is never self-sufficient, but rather the dependent by-product of a higher order of activity, the by-product of a vital relationship between the finite and infinite, between the fallen and flawed and that perfection of divine love which actively seeks response in each of its creatures. It is the outward manifestation of justification by faith. Chalmers, like St Paul and Luther before him, came to internalize such justification. In his essentially pragmatic theology he never fully reconciled this process with his Calvinist heritage.57

Pragmatism, embracing the flexibility of Sabbath schooling, typified Chalmers' influence, whether upon Scottish society or among migrants to Otago. Chalmers was the apostle of the Disruption, yet he spoke in defence of the concept of religious establishment, whether in a Scottish or English context. He argued that only an established church could ensure efficiency of religious and educational coverage over time in any given geographic area.58 Establishment for Chalmers did not, however, imply exclusiveness; the year 1829 saw him vigorously supporting the concept of Roman Catholic emancipation, his stand being taken on the futility of coercion in religious matters.59 Chalmers' socio-economic programme sought to reconcile self-help with social conscience. Charity in the society of his vision would be a self-regulating activity, individually initiated, and rationally guided by the medium of education. The children of the prosperous were to be schooled in habits

57 Roxborogh, p.77.
59 Watt, p.90.
of responsible generosity towards the deserving poor, principally the victims of sickness, while the children of the undeserving poor were to be nurtured into habits of self-help, lest they languish under the baneful influence of their shiftless parents; children of all conditions would learn the value of thrift, a virtue which at once maximised the surplus for donation and minimized the need to beg. Chalmers looked for a robust society of Christian employers and working people who, by exercising free choice with responsibility, would synthesise harmony from the dialectic of conflicting economic interests and social interaction. His vision was romantic. His ideal was the close-knit community of the rural Scottish Lowlands, the area in which the Presbyterian parish system had borne its ripest fruit. He wished to transplant Kilmany to the stews of the West Port. A coordinated system of Sunday schooling was an important, even an essential, ingredient in Chalmers' recipe for community maintenance in rural areas, and for community development in the cities.

Chalmers did not actually pioneer Sabbath schooling in Scotland, any more than Raikes did in England. The first known Scottish Sunday school was set up by the Reverend David Blair at Brechin in 1760. It opened with some forty scholars, was nurtured for over fifty years by Blair and his kin, and was still flourishing at its centenary. Glasgow's first Sabbath school was founded in 1766. Four years later the city Magistrates and council gave the Glasgow Sunday School Society their seal of approval. Evangelical laity provided impetus to the movement. In Scotland as in England, many established clergy worried at their lack of control over these developments; the Kirk General Assembly of 1799 adopted a report against vagrant teachers and Sunday schools. The check was, however, only temporary, and foundations continued. Presbyterian Sabbath schooling was introduced into Edinburgh in 1812, in response to a New Year's Day riot which had left one policeman dead and had led to the public execution of three sixteen year-old boys. Nor were Sunday school ventures in Scotland confined to the Presbyterian communion. The years 1787 and

---

61 Smout, pp.181-209.
62 Roxborough, p.130.
63 The Evangelist (Dunedin), 1 March 1876, 'The Origin of Sabbath Schools'.
1806 have been severally claimed as marking the first Methodist foundations in Scotland.\textsuperscript{65} The Congregationalists followed in 1809, and were operating 23 schools by 1819.

It was Chalmers' organizational talent, however, which produced a coherent model for urban Sabbath schooling in Scotland and provided a future pattern for Otago. Chalmers saw education, including Sabbath school education, as an influence second only in importance to church worship. Sunday schools were flexible and cost efficient, affording the chance of a favourable teacher-pupil ratio. More than day schools, they opened up opportunities for home visiting, allowing the domestic missionary to inject the gospel of Christian responsibility at the points of greatest need. Serving as minister at the Tron Church, St Mary's, in Glasgow from 1815 to 1819, and for a further four years at St John's, also in Glasgow, Chalmers sought to capitalize on the Sunday schools' potential.\textsuperscript{66} The 1840s saw him active in the West Port, Edinburgh, trying to balance slum reclamation against the huge issue of duplication of facilities entailed by the Disruption.\textsuperscript{67} Using Sabbath schools as his focus, Chalmers experimented with the 'locality principle' both in the Tron and at St John's. His charge at the Tron was a working class parish of some 11000 souls, but its church congregation was drawn almost exclusively from the parish's middle class minority. To resolve the anomaly, Chalmers borrowed and extended the 'locality' concept already pioneered by David Stow, one of his Sunday school teachers who went on to achieve national reputation as an educator; the alienated working class was to be reintegrated into Chalmers' socio-Evangelical vision of community.\textsuperscript{68} To facilitate coverage and foster community identity and feeling, the whole parish was divided into cells, with a deacon and one or more Sunday school teachers assigned to each. Chalmers was insistent that these staff confine their recruitment to the catchment area of the cell, and that they be rigorous and frequent in home visitation. Subsequently, at St John's, Chalmers extended his system to facilitate the development of day schooling and the implementation of a system of poor relief, to be funded entirely on a voluntary basis, and from within the parish. About 100 staff serviced 25 cells. These staff were drawn largely from the middle classes and many lived outside the parish bounds; Chalmers' romantic dream saw the degraded social environment of the city being integrated into the surrounding rural model. Twenty years later Chalmers again resorted to his tested formula in the


\textsuperscript{66} Roxborough, pp.118 and 171.

\textsuperscript{67} Watt, p.379.
West Port, siting a Sabbath school in a disused tan-loft and developing it as a precursor to weekly services.\textsuperscript{69}

Chalmers' influence, for all its outreach, was not universal even in Scotland. In the Highlands there already existed a communal tradition equally as strong as, and more ancient than, anything which might be experienced in Chalmers' Lowland culture, grounded in the kinship-oriented, clan structure of the Gaidhealtachd. The Highlands had never been well catered for by the Church of Scotland. There, problems of geographic isolation were compounded by the divergent educational needs of a sparsely settled, Gaelic-speaking population.\textsuperscript{70} Parishes were huge and inadequately staffed. Ancient folk beliefs lingered, with human sacrifice allegedly being attempted as late as 1740. Subsequently, as post-Culloden society clung to the shards of its traditions, pockets of Catholic loyalty proved tenacious. Regarding the North as barbaric, the philanthropic 'Society in Scotland for Propagating Christian Knowledge' maintained a bar: on Gaelic as a medium of instruction in its Highland schools until the later eighteenth century. A full Gaelic translation of the Bible was not completed until after 1800. Highlanders themselves, seeing English as the language of career opportunity, sometimes sought an English-language education for their children.\textsuperscript{71} Conscious of its earlier failings the Church of Scotland, touched by the spirit of nineteenth century Evangelicalism, encouraged an educational mission to the Highlands during the 1820s.\textsuperscript{72} A proliferation of missioners, many of them Gaelic-speaking laity and operating beyond effective establishment control, helped to pave the way for the triumph of Free Kirk sentiment a generation later across the northern hills and isles.\textsuperscript{73} Otago's settlement, including its Sabbath schools, reflected community ideals deriving both from Scotland's Highland and rural Lowland traditions; no contemporary church leader in the province supported Sunday school and Bible class education more assiduously than Dunedin's Highland Christian humanist, the Reverend Doctor D.M. Stuart of Knox Church.

\textsuperscript{68} Roxborough, pp.131-132.
\textsuperscript{69} Watt, p.379. See also D J Withrington, 'Scotland, a Half-Educated Nation in 1834? Reliable Critique or Persuasive Polemic?', in Humes & Paterson, pp.55-74.
\textsuperscript{72} Roxborough, p.8.
Stuart's practice reflected an educational tradition more generous in its community appeal than its contemporary English cousin. Scotland and England alike shared something of Hannah More's concern over the proletarian potential for unrest. The two lands differed, however, in their views regarding the best way of maintaining the social equilibrium. The Reverend Henry Duncan asserted, in 1821:

There are circumstances which seem, at the present moment, to render it the duty of every friend of society to watch over the sentiments of the lower classes with peculiar anxiety, and to interpose the whole weight of his talents in giving them their proper tone. The truth is, that various causes have combined to bring us rather prematurely to that perilous crisis in the history of the world, in which public opinion acquires paramount force before it has become sufficiently enlightened to be safely trusted.\(^74\)

Duncan shared the unease of the English propertied classes at the pace of social change but, unlike them and echoing Chalmers, clearly believed that public opinion required an open-ended rather than a circumscribed educational development. Chalmers argued that ignorance was the natural soil of revolution, that illiteracy afforded the demagogue's best opportunity. Those men who shaped nineteenth-century Scottish Presbyterianism saw right conduct as being grounded in reason and, hence, regarded the cultivation of rationality as a proper way of promoting social stability.

Scottish commitment to educational access was enhanced rather than diminished by the Disruption, which split the General Assembly of the Scottish Church in 1843, re-quickened within Kirk the Covenanting mythology of the seventeenth century, and recalled the humble to heroism. The Disruption signalled that Evangelicals would no longer tolerate what they regarded as the untoward influence of Erastianism in the councils and processes of the church. A complete, duplicate set of devotional and educational facilities had to be created to service the break-away movement. Sabbath schools proved especially useful, cost-effective tools to a Free Kirk facing, during and after the 1840s, the urgent need to provide religious and educational provision outside the framework of the establishment. Migration relocated the need, and gave the efficacious Sabbath school a new context. The Presbyterian Scots who migrated to Otago and Southland were mainly, although by no means exclusively, of Free Kirk persuasion. Educational opportunity bulked large in their cultural baggage.

\(^{73}\) Robb, p.28.
embracing elementary educational provision for all through both day and Sabbath schooling, and provision of access to higher education for children who showed promise. Children of the Covenanting myth must be literate, catechised and historically aware. How else would they apprehend a reality whose beginning was the Word? How else would they translate that transcendent reality into the tangibles of social responsibility? How else would they honour a Chalmersian tradition which synthesised vital religion with high scholarship and intellectual excellence?

To respect the worth and range of Scotland's educational achievement is not to be blind to the Scottish system's faults. Both as regards curriculum and pedagogy there was much in nineteenth century Scottish practice which, by today's standards, appears illiberal. In Scottish day and Sabbath schools alike Biblical text often was learned by heart, ingrafting both moral precept and doctrinal tenet. Catechetical questioning, rigorously pursued, encouraged reflexive as much as reflective response. In day schools the tawse frequently addressed deficiencies both of behaviour and recall. A legacy of the Enlightenment which the Industrial Revolution reinforced was a tendency towards preoccupation with the 'factual' and empirically verifiable; works of fiction were suspect as subjective and shallow, even frivolous. History was held to furnish those desirable exemplars wherein literal truth, moral paradigm and affective appeal found resolution. A Scotland pre-conditioned by its joint traditions of rationalism and Calvinism ignored nineteenth century Europe's developing grasp of psychology, leaving Scottish teacher-training ossified in anachronistic forms and infant education, particularly, languishing in the grip of inappropriate technique. A spirit of innovation had been present in the classroom practice of early nineteenth century Scotland, manifest for example in the educational experiments of Robert Owen at New Lanark and also, allegedly, in the Sunday schools of some of the dissenting sects. But the close connection between Scottish education and a religious system wherein long, unstructured services were dominated by monologue and sermon did not encourage pedagogical reform. The concept of child-centred education came relatively late to Scotland, where the curricular focus was epistemological, not psychological.

Whatever the parochialism of Scotland's nineteenth century heritage, however, and whatever the deficiencies of some individual practitioners, the Scottish education system was, by the standards

---

75 D. Hamilton, 'Robert Owen and Education: a Reassessment', in Humes & Paterson, p.16.
of its own time, comprehensive, imaginative and generous. In the hands of a dedicated and sympathetic teacher it could provide a stimulating environment. Isabella Bonthron, having migrated to New Zealand as a young wife in 1863 and later recalling her Scottish childhood, looked back with affection to a parish school system which put elementary education within the reach of all. She recollected a firm but humane classroom regime which lightened the dead hand of rote learning and which, in the James Gall tradition of interactive questioning, insisted that children not merely remember but also think and understand. The collective acts of prayer and Bible-reading which prefaced each school day, she came to value as times of character building. The lessons and practice afforded by her Scottish background she implemented in her own Sunday school programmes both on board ship, en route to New Zealand, and during her subsequent residence in Southland.\footnote{77}{Diary of Mrs D. Bonthron, 'Helenslee', 1863, Otago Settlers' Museum, Dunedin. C11.1.}

Isabella Bonthron personifies the fruitful interaction which occurred between Scottish day schooling and Sabbath schooling. Otago and Southland imported schoolteachers from both England and Scotland, until the later nineteenth century afforded a supply of the 'native born'. The census of 1871 was the first to show Scottish migrants as a smaller proportion of the Otago population than people of local birth. By 1886 the New Zealand-born exceeded all the migrant groups combined.\footnote{78}{Smout, p.228.} Up until the advent of the gold rushes of the 1860s, however, it would be the Scottish influence which would clearly predominate in the province's educational practice, in both day and Sabbath school. The strong community focus of rural Scotland, whether of Lowland or Highland origin, hallmarked the work of the province's pioneer schools, and this was particularly true of its Sabbath schools. Sunday schools afforded educational access, across the range of gender and class, to numerous children whose geographic and family circumstances would otherwise have denied them all opportunity for literacy. Along the migrant frontier Sunday schools once again proved, as they had done already in both rural and urban contexts in England and Scotland, their ability to respond with fluidity to local need. Rather than being imposed by authoritarian fiat, time and time again the schools emerged as spontaneous responses by local people to local conditions. They were relatively simple to set up and cheap to run. The most democratic of conservative institutions, they were ideally suited to a pioneer lifestyle which sought to synthesize tradition with a world of change. Geared initially, in England, to a limited programme of class control, and in Scotland to a role of junior partnership with parish...
church and day school, they rapidly outgrew both functions in their lands of origin; in migration, as will be shown, they became key influences in moulding the values of the first and second generations of settlement.
Chapter 3  Another Fold - Otago

Otago in origin was a Scottish rather than an English settlement, the offspring of the Otago Association and the Lay Association of the Free Church of Scotland, and it was Scottish tradition which formed the main, although by no means the exclusive, influence on Otago's nascent culture. The province's Sunday schools proved to be one of the institutions effective in developing a social synthesis from the diverse strands of colonization.

'Godly experiment' though William Cargill termed it, the Otago settlement never aspired to the ethnic or cultural purity of a social laboratory. A small Kati Mamoe and Kai Tahu population had resided in the region for two hundred or more years before the arrival of the Scots. Sealers, whalers and adventurers, principally Australian although with American, British and French admixture, preceded the Scottish migration. A handful of Indian lascars, refugees from the coarse racialism of a sealing gang, were the first non-Maori permanent residents at Otago Harbour. When systematic migration overlaid sealing and whaling, the incoming batches of settlers were never composed solely of Scots; with work in railway construction becoming widely available in Britain after 1840 and luring away prospective migrants, selection criteria had to be compromised if migrant ships were to sail full and on schedule. The pioneer supply vessel of the 1848 settlement, the John Wickliffe, had sailed from London, not Greenock. The infant colony's elite of wealth was mainly English. Voluntary public service was traditional among the English squirearchy whose influence, ironically, was powerful in the politics of pioneer Otago until the 1852 Constitution Act enfranchised a Scottish majority. Even then migrant English capital continued to exercise political and economic influence in Dunedin. W. H. Valpy, long resident in India although born at Forbury, Berkshire, was the richest man in the young settlement, and more than once used his wealth to thwart the wishes of William Cargill, Resident Agent of the New Zealand Company and future Superintendent of Otago Province.

Even so, English influence never eclipsed that of the Scots in Otago and Southland. Statistics in the accompanying table show the Scots, despite an English presence, as consistently the largest single migrant group in the colony.

---

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Main Birth Areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aug 1848</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864*</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871*</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* = figures exclusive of Southland
~ = estimated figure


Scots enjoyed an absolute majority among the population during the 1850s, and a relative advantage during the gold rush period of the 1860s despite losing significant population share to English and Irish arrivals. They finally ceded pre-eminence in numbers, not to a rival group of migrants, but to the native born from 1871 onwards. It was Scottish cultural influence which predominated in early Otago, especially in the spheres of religion and education. The voice of socialization spoke with the Sassenach accent of the rural Scottish Lowlands, and at times with a Gaelic lilt.

It was an idealized derivative of Scotland's culture, integrating the best of the land's religious, educational and community heritage, which Captain William Cargill and the Reverend Thomas Burns transplanted to Otago and nurtured as a 'godly experiment'; such, at least, was the founding fathers' plan. Cargill and Burns shared a post-millennial vision which fused history and hope; their mythology looked forward rather than back. Colonising Covenanters, their vision of settlement projected a romanticized image of the past on to the veil of the future. Otago was to be 'Settlement' in Platonic form, casting the beneficent shadow of its ideal across the world's illusions. Cargill believed the settlement would excite worldwide interest. Burns was prepared to risk migration to the ends of the earth to rekindle the Covenanting myth. Having abandoned the secure tenure of a pleasant manse at Monkton, Ayrshire, he wrote of Otago:
It seemed to me that, under God, the effect of planting in that most interesting corner of the world a carefully selected section, in all its integrity, of our home Christian Society would far exceed that of any mission whatsoever.

Migration was the offering of a living sacrifice, a Victorian sublimation of the Caroline Covenanters' aspirations. In pursuit of the myth Burns was prepared to undertake physical toil, expose his family to hardship and uncertainty, and immerse them in the creation of a new society. His daughter Jane in later years recalled her Monkton childhood with nostalgia. She remembered, as a girl, approaching her father at study, asking whether it would have been sinful to cling to the comfort of the known, and receiving a quiet but uncompromising affirmative.

Burns' synthesis of colonization with a special sense of mission was an outlook shared and voiced in the colonial press. The editor of the Otago Witness, reacting in 1851 to the demise of the New Zealand Company, sought to rally the Lay Association of the Free Church of Scotland to its duty in a call which, typically, linked settlement, mission and education:

We say, then, to the Association and to the public at home, that the body whose foreign missions are to be seen in its colleges at Calcutta, Bombay and Madras, and whose missions are so significantly typified in the West Port of Edinburgh, can hardly fail, in its offshoot at Otago, to do its meed of service in the cause of systematic colonization.

Reflecting post-millennial idealism, the original plan for Otago focused on quality rather than extent of settlement. It envisaged a small, isolated community, the very compactness and remoteness of which would favour the maintenance of doctrinal and moral purity. Acting for the New Zealand Company in its partnership with the Lay Association of the Free Church of Scotland, Frederick Tuckett had surveyed the east coast of the South Island, from Banks Peninsula southwards. During June and July 1844 he worked to negotiate the purchase of the Otago Block, 400,000 acres of land comprising the Otago Harbour area and the Taieri and Tokomairiro Plains, from the rangatira of Kai Tahu; eventually a price of £2,400 was agreed.

Dunedin, it was envisaged, would be a close-knit

---

2 Cited in J.R. Elder, The History of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, 1840-1940, Presbyterian Bookroom, Christchurch, 1940, p53.
4 Otago Witness (Dunedin) No 1, 8 February 1851, p3
town of some 1000 souls. Reflecting E.G. Wakefield's belief in close settlement, land in the district would be sold to migrant developers in 603 acre lots, each purchaser acquiring a quarter acre town section, ten acres in the suburbs and fifty acres of rural land.

Cohesion and community of purpose, it was expected, would be hallmarks of the young colony, and prosperity its benison. Industry, exercised as an expression of faith and guided by right doctrine, would evoke God's blessing, made manifest in material as well as social and spiritual gain; a re-established Eden, over time, would arise from the Otago wilderness. God would seal his approval of his Elect as surely in the new settlement as, allegedly, he had for the Scotland of the past:

The prosperity of Scotland is justly attributed in a great measure to the thoroughly Protestant character of its Reformation. And we would only remark that we know not any other cause which has raised the entire British Empire to her present high position among the nations of the world.\(^6\)

Puritan consciences were not embarrassed by enhanced status and a full bank balance.

Religious conviction among Otago's Presbyterian migrants underpinned attitudes which contained elements of socio-economic expectation, even of racialism and incipient imperialism, and which, to a modern observer, seem ludicrously bombastic in the context of the tiny settlement of 1848. For a Burns or Cargill, on the other hand, this modern sense of irony would have betokened a miserably impoverished conception of the power of Almighty God and of God's willingness to be involved in human affairs. Pioneer attitudes in Otago blended self-confidence and insularity, creating a synthesis in which the dynamic of mission became absorbed in the process of cloning its own likeness, of reduplicating an idealized model of the sub-culture of Lowland Scotland. Far from feeling a sense of marginality, the colony's advocates saw themselves as moving in the mainstream of western culture. According to the interpretation of an observer, writing at the time of the golden jubilee of the Otago settlement: 'Presbyterian principles revolutionised western Europe and her populations, and inaugurated modern history'; the Otago venture was, in his eyes, isolated only because it was in the forefront of progress.\(^7\)

---

6 Otago Witness (Dunedin) No 7, 3 May 1851, p.2.
From its inception the reality of settlement never matched the singularity of the dream. Otago was neither the first nor only area in New Zealand to be peopled by Scottish migrants, nor the first to be settled by Presbyterians. As early as 1826 an abortive attempt had been made to plant a small Scottish settlement at Hokianga. In addition, numerous individual Scots, including the well-known figures of Gilbert Mair and John Logan Campbell, had made their way independently to New Zealand before 1840. Scots were prominently represented in the colonization both of Wellington and Auckland. The Bengal Merchant had sailed for Port Nicholson on 31 October 1839, four months before the Treaty of Waitangi was signed and nine years before Dunedin was planted, carrying 158 Scottish passengers including the Gaelic-speaking Reverend John Macfarlane, and other arrivals followed. Within three years the vessels Brilliant, Jane Gifford and Duchess of Argyle had landed over 500 Scots at Auckland. During the 1850s Norman McLeod organized a Gaelic sub-migration from Nova Scotia to Waipu. By 1871, admittedly, rather more than half the Scots who had migrated to New Zealand did live in Otago and Southland, but a large minority, of 47 per cent, was scattered across other regions. The migrants were predominantly from the central Lowlands, Midlothian initially providing the largest pool, with strong flows also from Ayrshire and Lanark. The coincidence of peak flow with years of economic recession removes the illusion that the motive for Scottish emigration was solely religious.

If Otago could never boast a monopoly of Scottish migration, still less could it claim exclusive credit for the development of Sunday schooling in New Zealand. Examples of Sunday schools elsewhere predated the Scottish planting of Dunedin by at least a generation. The earliest Sunday schools were developed by missionaries to meet the perceived educational needs of Maori, both children and adults; over time, for Maoridom, these schools came virtually to define the concept of 'Sabbath'. New Zealand's first example of a mission school was opened by the Anglican Church Missionary Society at Rangihoua in Northland in 1815, over thirty years before the Scottish settlement in Otago, with the Methodists following in the Anglican wake from 1822 onwards. At Paihia, by 1825, five

---

8 Pearce, p.40.
9 J. Dickson, History of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, J Wilkie & Co., Dunedin, 1899, p.20.
Anglican mission programmes were offering religious instruction on Sundays and the basics of an elementary education on the remaining six days of the week. Separate classes catered for Maori boys and girls, pakeha boys and girls, and infants. In northern areas day schooling for Maori adults appeared to languish after 1840, as Maori preoccupations turned towards trade, but Sunday schools continued to flourish. For example in Pipitea, Wellington, in 1848 there were five Wesleyan Maori Sunday schools with a total of 500 scholars. Wesleyan statistics for 1853 record 188 Maori Sunday schools, 88 day schools and 5846 scholars, constituting a twenty per cent increase in roll over a seven year period. The missionaries made no clear distinction between day and Sunday schooling; they wove a seamless educational fabric.

Further Sunday schools, similarly intertwining the sacred and the secular, and founded and operated by settlers, followed hard on the post-Waitangi migrations. Wesleyans were again in the van of such Sunday school development in many districts. The enthusiasm of migrant Methodist laity for promoting Sunday schools in New Zealand reflected the vigour of participation by working class Dissent in England both in Evangelical lay preaching and in the development of Sabbath education. A non-denominational Sunday school is reported to have been operating in Wellington from the settlement's earliest days. This may have been the Sunday school run by Charles Hunt, a Methodist lay preacher who arrived in Wellington in 1840 on the Adelaid; the school met in a raupo hut on the banks of the Hutt River. Hunt acted as its superintendent from 1840 to 1845, and then again from 1848 to 1854. Other Wesleyans were prominent in the further development of Sunday schools in Wellington. The 1862 annual report of the Wellington Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School noted that the school had been open for forty years, placing its foundation in 1842. Another region where Methodists figured as pioneers in Sunday school work was New Plymouth. A letter of Charles Creed

---

15 Stafford, p.3.
to the Wesleyan Missionary Society of London, dated 8 April 1842, speaks of attending the anniversary of the Sunday school on Easter Sunday; evidently the foundation occurred in 1841.\textsuperscript{18}

The laity of other denominations moved rather more slowly than the Wesleyans into Sunday school work although, in Nelson, there is evidence of Sunday school activity, of unspecified denominational leaning, as early as 1842.\textsuperscript{19} The first Nelson School Society's classes opened in 1844. These functioned on both a day school and Sunday school basis, with Sunday pupils outnumbering day scholars by more than two to one. The Sunday schools were popular since, echoing their appeal to the British working classes, they did not draw the child labour force away from pioneer farm and domestic duties and, unlike the day schools, they levied no fees.\textsuperscript{20} Presbyterians across the North Island moved tentatively towards Sunday schooling, compared with both Wesleyan and Anglican laity and missionaries, their preference being perhaps for day schools which did not compromise the Sabbath with labour; they launched their first New Zealand Sunday school in Auckland in 1847.\textsuperscript{21}

In Canterbury, an area of later European settlement, Sunday school activity developed vigorously from the outset, but was marked by more overt denominational rivalry than was typical elsewhere in New Zealand; migrant Dissent, embodied once more in Methodist form, found itself at odds with the transplanted pretensions of an Anglican establishment. The region's first Sunday school was, in fact, set up by a Congregationalist, Samuel C. Farr, at Akaroa in 1850.\textsuperscript{22} Methodist activity followed with the opening of a Sunday school by Mrs John Quaife in a whare on the present site of Hagley Park.\textsuperscript{23} Canterbury's Anglican elite did not welcome initiatives by Dissent and the Quaifes, man and wife, were threatened with denial of employment unless they burned their Methodist books, a threat

\begin{flushright}
18 R.L. Cooper, A Goodly Heritage ... with a Great Responsibility. Retrospect and Prospect: being a brief survey of the beginning and growth of Sunday school and youth work in New Plymouth among the people called Methodists, Trustees of the Whiteley Memorial Church, New Plymouth, 1958.


21 Coles, p.13.


\end{flushright}
which they stoutly resisted, asserting liberty of conscience. By 1859 five Methodist Sunday schools were operating in Canterbury, with an aggregate roll of over 300 children and 43 teachers. The Methodists were also running three denominational day schools with 109 scholars.

Within Otago, Scottish Free Kirk Presbyterianism proved a far more vigorous proponent of Sunday schooling than its English cousin had appeared to be in Auckland, but it was the ubiquitous Methodists who were the first mission group to be active in the south, the Reverend W. White visiting the South Island in April 1836. At the invitation of John Jones, sealer, whaler, land speculator and regional entrepreneur, the Wesleyan James Watkin became Otago's inaugural resident pastor, preaching the first Christian sermon in the region to a motley audience of whalers, settlers and Kai Tahu at Karitane in May 1840, almost eight full years before the landfall of the John Wickliffe and Philip Laing. Watkin's house served as church, meeting hall and schoolroom for both day and Sabbath school education. Watkin was succeeded by Charles Creed in 1844. Otago Methodism, however, found itself torn between missionary outreach to the Kai Tahu and its obligation to service the spiritual needs of the early settlers. As with the Lutheranism embodied in the person of J.F.H. Wohlers, Methodism's adherents remained sparse and scattered, and its early foci of worship were generally 'house churches'. Not until the gold rush days of 1862 did Dunedin boast a purpose-built Wesleyan chapel and Sunday school facility. This was an unsatisfactory wooden building with a shingled roof, located in Dowling Place; too tall and narrow, it rocked in the wind and transepts had to be added to buttress it. It was superseded, eight years later, by an R.A. Lawson design in Stuart Street.

Anglicanism also made an appearance in Otago and Southland well before the coming of the Presbyterian Scots. As spokesmen for the Church Missionary Society rather than for the wider Anglican Church, Tamihana Te Rauparaha and Matene Te Whiwhi attempted a mission to the Kai Tahu in 1842. The following year Bishop G.A. Selwyn visited Otago. During and after 1848 an

---

26 H Knight, Church Building in Otago, University of Otago Printing Department, Dunedin, 1993. The Lawson premises in Stuart Street is now the home of Dunedin's Fortune Theatre.
27 K Booth, 'Anglicanism', in The Farthest Jerusalem, pp.3-4.
English and Anglican presence continued, infiltrating the Scottish migration. Church buildings to service the Anglican community began to appear some ten years after the founding of Dunedin. St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti, an attractive weatherboard and shingle design dating from 1858, is the one church building of any denomination to survive in the Dunedin area from pre-gold rush days. Within the city St Paul's Church, built in brick on Dunedin's Octagon, opened for worship in 1862. But it was 1865 before effective steps were taken, at Selwyn's insistence, to elevate Otago and Southland into a separate Anglican diocese.\(^28\) Otago Anglicanism, like Methodism, had to await the input of the gold rushes to give a significant boost to its numbers.

Of the other religious groupings to achieve notable influence in the region, Catholicism touched the Otago coast even earlier than Anglicanism, with the visit to the Heads of Bishop J.B.F. Pompallier in November 1840.\(^29\) Initially, however, Pompallier's Marist mission was far too understaffed to maintain regular contact with southern New Zealand. Catholicism languished until the 1860s brought in a major influx of Irish miners, leading to the creation of Otago and Southland as a separate diocese, with Dr Patrick Moran appointed bishop in November 1869. A brick building housing St Joseph's Church, Dunedin, opened for worship in 1863, with the present cathedral, a Francis William Petre design, dating from 1886. Deeply distrustful of the 1877 Education Act, Catholicism came to invest a great deal of energy in the development of denominational day schooling, in Otago and Southland and nationwide.\(^30\)

The gold rush decade of the 1860s saw, also, the opening of Baptist and Congregational churches in Dunedin, with pioneer causes for both denominations being founded in the period 1862-1863 and with other, smaller sects also establishing a presence soon after. Baptist and Congregationalist church buildings were completed in permanent materials in 1864, the Baptists opening in Hanover Street, in a building yet again of R.A. Lawson design, and the Congregationalists in Moray Place. Both denominations lost no time in becoming involved in Sunday school work. The Baptists continuously occupied their Hanover Street site for 132 years. The Congregationalists, today far less numerous than Baptists in Dunedin, were initially more mobile. Almost contemporaneously with its Dunedin foundation, Congregationalism took root in Invercargill, and it was also well established

\(^{28}\) Ibid., p.15-17.
on the Tuapeka goldfield by the end of 1870. Other, later sectarian arrivals in nineteenth century Dunedin included the Associated Churches of Christ and the Salvation Army, the latter being especially active in youth work. Nor were religious foundations limited to Christian sects. The Jewish community built their first synagogue in Dunedin by 1864, a wooden structure which was later replaced by an imposing, colonnaded stone building on an adjacent site. Dunedin's Freemasons took over the original building.

Sharing their settlement with a range of other creeds, and with their dominance increasingly diluted by the ethnic mix of the gold rushes, Otago's Presbyterians looked to the sustaining power of their Sunday schools.

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Anglican</th>
<th>Presbyterian</th>
<th>Roman Catholic</th>
<th>Wesleyan</th>
<th>Baptist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1848</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864*</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867*</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871*</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Sources: Statistics of New Zealand for the Crown Colony Period: Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1871, 1878, 1886, 1891, 1896)

31 W.M. Grant, History of Otago Congregational Churches, Hocken Archives, Dunedin, np., 1920.
Table 3  Communicant Membership of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Communicant Membership</th>
<th>Communicant Membership expressed as a percentage of Adult Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1883</td>
<td>9,504</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>10,722</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>11,620</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>13,544</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>14,557</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Sources: Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1883-1901)

The trends illustrated in the preceding tables had major implications for the attitude of Otago Presbyterianism towards its Sunday schools. Levels of nominal Presbyterian adherence reached a peak at 65 per cent in 1858, as provincial control of immigration schemes boosted the inflow of Scots into Otago, but then fell from two-thirds to less than half of the population as a result of uncontrolled migration during and after the gold rushes. The proportion of active communicant support became heavily eroded, falling to little more than 1 in 10 of the adult population. Admittedly there was modest increase in levels of nominal adherence after 1888, and communicant participation appeared to edge ahead of population growth rates in the province; in gross figures the increase was substantial enough to put some pressure on church facilities. Relatively, however, the recovery was too weak to give the Presbyterian Church much assurance. Proportionally the gains were smaller than those being made among lesser Protestant groups, including the Wesleyans, Baptists and the newly arrived Salvation Army, and enrolment gains were offset by disappointing fluctuations in church revenue. Decreases in total public giving to the Presbyterian Church were recorded for seven of the closing fifteen years of the nineteenth century, with the decade 1885-1895 marking a particularly lean period; the 1883 total of giving was not matched again until 1898, and not clearly breached until 1900.33 Concerned for its future the Presbyterian Church began to look to its Sabbath schools, less as agencies of outreach but rather as defenders of the status quo; the schools' principal role became the retention of the children of the Covenant in due fidelity.

33 See annual financial statements in Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1883-1901.
During the early phases of settlement, however, the provision of day schools rather than Sabbath schooling was of more immediate moment to Otago's pioneers. This is not to belittle the Sabbath schools, but rather to underline their crucial importance in Otago's educational story. Both day and Sabbath schooling were sought and valued in the settlement. Both types of schooling addressed moral concerns. Both utilized scriptural and catechetical material. To Burns, the two systems represented complementary channels for the inculcation and maintenance of Protestant, and particularly Presbyterian, truth, but day schooling commanded a far larger share of children's time.

It required purpose-built accommodation and a professional staff. Unlike Sabbath schooling, its provision could not be left to local community initiative, the source from which Sabbath education, both in Britain and Otago, derived its adaptability, resilience and strength. On the pioneer frontier, as in Disruption-racked Scotland, Sabbath schooling provided the overstretched resources of the Free Kirk with a flexible, cost-efficient educational mechanism. For many Otago children, in the early days of settlement, weekly attendance at Sunday school was their only contact with any type of formal teaching.\(^{34}\)

Despite the best of intentions, building up and staffing a viable structure of formal day schooling, as compared with the more spontaneous, community-generated forms of Sabbath schooling, was a struggle. For Otago, a tone of educational optimism had been set during the Philip Laing's outward voyage, with dominie James Blackie conducting daily school classes on board at 11 a.m.\(^{35}\) Materials for construction of a schoolhouse were carried in the ship's cargo. Funding to maintain ongoing educational development was to be obtained through appropriation of one eighth of the proceeds of New Zealand Company land sales in Otago to the provision and maintenance of the church ministry, church and school buildings and teaching staff.\(^{36}\) The reality after landfall, however, of a cold, wet Dunedin winter made provision of shelter a priority even over religious and educational considerations. Completion of a combined First Church and school building was finally achieved in the spring of 1848; Blackie's ill health then cut short his teaching career.

Addressing a Dunedin soirée in January 1851, Burns voiced his disquiet that only 100 out of a total of 297 children in the Dunedin area, falling in the 5 to 15 year-old age bracket, were in regular

\(^{34}\) See Chapter 4.

\(^{35}\) Burns' inaugural address to the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, in Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 16 January 1866.
attendance at day school, with 60 per cent of these concentrated in the city area, and with access to central facilities lying out of reach for those youngsters from the more remote homesteads around the harbour or beyond Dunedin's North East Valley and Half Way Bush.\textsuperscript{37} Burns wanted more. As he wrote to Cargill in a letter of 2 October 1848: 'The children of the members of my parish should be provided with the means of education such as they have been receiving in the parish schools of Scotland.'\textsuperscript{38} The statement is without caveats of gender or social class. Burns and Cargill envisaged Otago as offering the same blend of day and Sabbath schooling, the same universal educational access and opportunities for full literacy as in the best traditions of their homeland, the model of which they were determined to recreate in the new settlement. Looking beyond elementary schooling, Burns also became a supporter of the founding of both Otago Boys' and Otago Girls' High Schools, and the inaugural Chancellor of the University of Otago.

Four years after the Scottish settlement of Dunedin, the passage of the 1852 Constitution Act created a provincial system for New Zealand, empowering each province to develop its own network of public day schools. In subsequent years, in divers locations of settlement, day school provision struggled under frontier conditions, where accommodation was makeshift and well qualified staff too often were unobtainable. Anxious settlers at times dug deep into their purses to maintain schooling. For example, a roofing appeal for an extension to the Dunedin church and schoolhouse was oversubscribed to the point where new school ventures could be undertaken at Port Chalmers, North East Valley and East Taieri.\textsuperscript{39} The first school house on the Taieri, a 30 x 12 foot wooden building, comprising both school room and teacher's quarters, was erected in 1853. The school was administered by a five man committee, empowered to co-opt two further members. The committee hired a Mr Gebbie, on a three year contract subject to three months' notice of termination by either party, as teacher. The salary was £46 per annum, augmented by right of use of the ground attached to the school house; dismissal would entitle Gebbie to compensation for the value of crop and fencing improvements. The salary was funded from school fees, these being set at 6d per week and

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{36} A H Reed, \textit{The Story of Early Dunedin}, A H & A W Reed, Wellington, 1956, p.74.
\item \textsuperscript{37} \textit{Otago Witness} (Dunedin) No 3, 8 March 1851, p.4.
\item \textsuperscript{38} Cited in D E Swinton, 'The Presbyterian Church and Education in Otago', MA Thesis, University of Otago, 1935, p.23.
\end{itemize}
payable monthly to the teacher, with the shortfall being made up by public subscription collected by the committee chair, a Mr Todd.40

The recruitment from Scotland of well qualified, day-school teaching staff, steeped in the tradition of the homeland's parish schools, constituted an exciting breakthrough for Otago's pioneer community. Two such recruits were Alexander Ayson and John Hislop. Ayson, having taught English and Gaelic at Lossiemouth, migrated to Otago in 1855 to join his brothers, Peter and James, and became the pioneer schoolteacher at Tokomairiro. His schoolroom was a 12 x 18 foot unused dairy building at Springfield, the home of James Chapman Smith; the Otago Education Board voted a maximum of £5 for its renovation, pending the provision of a purpose-built facility. This was to comprise a residence standing on 5 acres of school grounds with an 18-acre glebe attached, at a budgeted cost of £300.41 Classes, with an opening roll of 10, commenced on Monday, 5 May 1856, the Reverend William Bannerman having been asked to announce their inauguration from his pulpit on the Sunday. The Tokomairiro School Committee stipulated that each working day at the school should open with praise and prayer. Ayson's salary was fixed at £100, supplemented by some £20 per annum of school fees.42 Hislop meanwhile, an 1856 arrival in Otago, taught at East Taieri. Highly qualified, he had trained as a teacher at Edinburgh Normal School and Edinburgh University. A future holder of a doctoral degree, he became schools' inspector and Secretary to the Otago Education Board, a man of crucial influence in shaping educational development provincially and, later, nationally.43 His influence was decisive in the founding of Dunedin Teachers' College.44 He also left his mark as elder and chronicler at the Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, and he tried, under the aegis of the Church, to open up educational access for the underprivileged of its catchment area.

Statistical data confirms the ongoing influence, in Otago and Southland, of the Scottish tradition of equitable educational opportunity.

41 Otago Education Board, Fair Minutes, 7 May 1856, Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
42 Griffiths, Series 2, p.191.
43 Steedman, p.105.
Table 4
Levels of Educational Attainment in Otago and Southland

(Key: I = illiterate  R = reading knowledge only  L = literate
M = male  F = female  T = total
* = figure for Otago only)
(figures are in rounded percentages)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>I M</th>
<th>I F</th>
<th>I T</th>
<th>R M</th>
<th>R F</th>
<th>R T</th>
<th>L M</th>
<th>L F</th>
<th>L T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1848</td>
<td>all ages</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>over 7</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>all ages</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>under 12</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>over 12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864*</td>
<td>under 15</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867*</td>
<td>all ages</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>under 15</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>over 15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871*</td>
<td>all ages</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>under 15</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>over 15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>all ages</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5-15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>over 15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Sources: Statistics of New Munster, New Zealand, 1841-1848; Statistics of New Zealand for 1858, 1867; Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1871, 1886)

Direct comparisons across the year bands shown in Table 4 are not possible because of periodical changes in the census parameters. Evidently, however, there was a high rate of literacy among the adult population of Otago and Southland throughout the indicated period, something in excess of ninety per cent for both males and females. The 'all ages' bands for the years 1848, 1858, 1867 and 1871, which seem to imply markedly higher rates of literacy among men than women, are in fact quite misleading. When the data are broken down into adult and childhood groupings, the apparent attainment differences between the sexes decrease markedly if the cut-off point is selected at age 12, as in the 1858 survey, and virtually disappear if the cut-off point is at age 15, as in the 1867 and 1871 census returns. The distortion in reported attainment levels in the 'all ages' bands arises because the adult population was predominantly male. Only 28 per cent of Otago's male population in 1867 was aged under 15, compared with 42 per cent of females; the 1871 proportions were 32 and 48 per
cent respectively. In absolute terms there were more males than females among the population of nineteenth century Otago at all levels of the age spectrum, including the groups of school age, but relatively the female population was younger. The males, statistically, appeared more literate simply because their average age was higher.

True to its Scottish traditions, pioneer Otago afforded a high degree of gender equity in educational access. Admittedly the Otago Education Board, in its earlier years of operation, preferred male role models and discriminated against female teachers. In recruiting staff from Scotland in 1857, Education Board members J. McGlashan and W. Reynolds insisted that these staff should be men.45 Where a woman was recruited from Britain to teach in a public school, as in the case of Margaret Baxter Dodds, her salary was set at 60 per cent of the male rate.46 Women did not enjoy the male teachers’ security of tenure, as is evidenced in the unavailing complaints made to the Board by Mrs Edwards of Portobello School in December 1857.47

As far as child rather than staff involvement in day schools is concerned, the available census data shows consistently higher levels of public school enrollment among boys of school age than appears to have been the case for the comparable group of girls.

45 Otago Education Board, Fair Minutes, 31 January 1857.
46 Ibid, 24 March 1856.
Table 5  
Public Primary School Attendance in Otago & Southland as a Percentage of the Population Aged 5-15 years  
(figures rounded to nearest whole %)  (* = exclusive of Southland)  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Male %</th>
<th>Female %</th>
<th>Overall %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864*</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867*</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871*</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Sources: Statistics of New Zealand, 1853-1867; Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1871-1901)

The enrolment gap between the genders ranges from some three percentage points at the close of the century to eight percentage points during the gold rush era, with the differential at its widest between 1864 and 1871. Analysing similar data for the later nineteenth century, on a New Zealand-wide basis, McGeorge has suggested that girls tended to start school at a later age and leave earlier than was generally the case for boys.  

Data relating to private school attendance in Otago however, suggests a different story:

Table 6  
Gender Balance Among Pupils and Staff in Private Schools in Otago and Southland, 1889 and 1890  
(M = male F = female) (rounded percentage figures)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Under 5</td>
<td>5 to 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1889</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Statistics of the Colony of New Zealand, 1889-1890)  

---

A variety of private venture schools had proliferated in Otago, ever since the Carter brothers had advertised their educational services in the *Otago Witness* in 1851.\(^50\) The Carters' school was for boys, but statistical evidence shows a consistent female predominance in the province's private school rolls throughout the last four decades of the nineteenth century; the trend is particularly noticeable in data relating to older pupils and staff. If attendances at both public and private schools are aggregated and the results analysed on gender lines, then the proportion of boys and girls receiving full-time schooling closely reflects the gender balance within the 5-15 age group as a whole, never exceeding a 53/47 per cent male weighting even in the male-dominated mid 1860s, and achieving virtual gender parity through the last twenty years of the century. In other words, the relative under-representation of girls on Otago public school rolls does not necessarily imply a lack of parental interest in female education. It suggests, rather, that parents who could afford it preferred to send their daughters to private establishments. The caution must be borne in mind that the extant census data relating to schools give us roll totals, not average attendance figures, so they do not enable us to compare consistency of day school attendance between boys and girls. It seems, however, in the linking of gender equity and educational access, Otago remained faithful to its Scottish heritage, a feature which proved even more true of the province's Sabbath schools than its day schools.

Subsequent chapters of this study will develop comparisons and examine the interplay between day schooling and Sunday schooling in Otago and Southland, clarifying the important role played by the province's Sunday schools in the socialization of a new society. Conceived by the colony's pioneer leaders as mutually complementary aspects of an integrated system, Sunday school and day school continued to interact with each other in ways both overt and unintentional. They shared staff, and mutually influenced each other's curriculum and pedagogy.\(^51\) The Sunday schools, whether operating on an interdenominational or sectarian basis, also interacted laterally, sharing best practice across provincial, national and denominational boundaries. The fact that day schooling was an expensive investment for a struggling pioneer settlement opened up opportunity for the Sabbath schools, which showed themselves as well able to respond flexibly to the shifting geographic, ethnic and ecumenical demands of a fluid frontier as they had to socio-economic change in the old country. Sunday schools

\(^{49}\) The cited source contains data for the years 1889 and 1890 only.

\(^{50}\) *Otago Witness* (Dunedin), No 1, 8 February 1851, p.1.

\(^{51}\) See Chapters 8 and 9.
helped both to reconnect a migrant society with its roots and to weave the disparate strands of pioneering into a settler culture. In many cases the Sabbath school, as will be shown, preceded either church premises or the day school as the focal point of an emerging pioneer community. Sunday schools built both on the social aspirations of the English working classes and on Scotland's traditions of gender equality in relation to access to elementary education. Particularly for many young women of the colony, the influence of the Sabbath schools in the area of their socialization came to exceed that of either day school or church, shaping the mythology which would guide Otago settlement, at the fundamental level of the family, from the nineteenth into the twentieth century.
Chapter 4  Pastures Green - Sunday Schooling in Otago and Southland in the Period 1848-1870

From the earliest days of organized European settlement in Otago and Southland, close links were envisaged between religious and educational provision. This expectation held true across the denominations, from the Wesleyanism of James Watkin and the Presbyterianism of Thomas Burns to the Roman Catholicism of Bishop Patrick Moran. To the settlement's pioneer leaders, all truth was God's truth; the 'melancholy, long, withdrawing roar' of ebbing faith, which Matthew Arnold heard echoing across time and space from Sophocles' Aegean coasts to Dover beach, was but a murmur in the cabins of the Otago-bound migrant ships.¹ Scottish zealot and English 'Little Enemy' differed on perspective but, to each alike, church, day school and Sunday school constituted three facets of an educational trinity perceived as fundamental to humanity's social and moral advancement. The secularization of elementary education in New Zealand, which the 1877 Act enshrined, would have been a concept utterly alien to the thought of Otago's pioneer migrants.

Despite the commitment with which many of the first settlers embarked on Sunday school work, detail regarding the operation of the early Sunday schools is now inaccessible to us; but it would be wrong to equate archival inaccessibility with insignificance. Survival preoccupied the minds of those who pioneered along the shifting frontiers of settlement. Sabbath school arrangements were often improvised and records were kept haphazardly, in contrast to the more systematic approaches evident after 1870. But the ad hoc nature of pioneer Sunday schooling was, in itself, one of the movement's essential strengths. The schools were relatively cheap to set up and simple to organize. In Otago, as in Britain, they could emerge unofficially and spontaneously in response to community need, unlike the more sophisticated public day schools.² In fact Sunday school work in Otago frequently preceded church and day school foundation.³ The informality of its procedures and irregularity of its record-keeping denoted familiarity as much as carelessness, and constitute no grounds for dismissing Sunday school activity in the early period of settlement as trivial or unimportant.

³ J R Elder, History of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, 1840-1940, Presbyterian Bookroom, Christchurch, 1940, p.372.
Reduplicating a 'Robinson Crusoe' effect, the pioneer migrants sought to reproduce in Otago and Southland the comforting forms of home.4 Sabbath schooling was one of those forms with which they had become thoroughly familiar. For the earnest migrant, even the slow weeks of the long sea journey from Britain afforded educational opportunity. On board the John Wickliffe Thomas Ferens, a devout Methodist, found his wistful thoughts 'dwelling on East Rainton [County Durham] and the Sunday School'. A man who was somewhat anxious for public recognition, he attracted unfavourable attention by donning a severed pair of albatross' wings and flapping around the ship's deck. More productively, together with W.H. Monson, he began to round up the ship's children for Sabbath classes, competing with irreverent sailors for the young folks' attention.5

Similarly rural Scotland's symbiosis of religion and education was maintained throughout the Philip Laing's pioneering voyage. A contemporary commentator argued that the 'bald simplicity' of Presbyterian forms of worship, uninformed as they were by physical symbolism, rendered Sabbath schooling essential as an initiation for the youth of the church.6 Scottish theory conceived the church's formal services as maintaining the habit of worship; Sunday schooling was meant to provide a doctrinal foundation sufficient to justify the habit intellectually. Once inured to seasickness, James Blackie began holding conventional school classes daily on board ship at 11a.m., after Burns' morning service.7 Sabbath school classes predated shipboard day schooling. Blackie, assisted by three fellow passengers, Messrs Donaldson, Carnegie and Bruce, held the first session of what became a weekly Sabbath school class at 4.30 p.m. on Sunday, 26 December.8 In addition, Burns himself took charge of a Bible class for young adults aboard ship. In subsequent years the expectation remained common among migrants that, after landfall, the day-school dominie

---

5 T Ferens, "Copy of the Diary of the late Thomas Ferens from November 1847 to July 1852' pp.4-12. Otago Settlers' Museum Archives, Dunedin. C38.
6 C S Ross, Story of the Otago Church and Settlement, Wise, Caffin & Co., Dunedin, 1887, p.228.
7 Proceedings of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland; script of Burns' inaugural address to Synod, 16 January 1866. Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
8 T Burns, Diary. Otago Settlers' Museum Archives, Dunedin.
would also lead a Sabbath class, the minister a male Bible class and the minister's wife a similar class for girls.  

On arrival in Otago, formal provision for Presbyterian worship and education was made as fast as the exigencies of pioneering allowed. It took five months following the arrival of the Philip Laing in Otago to erect a Presbyterian combined church and school building in Dunedin. Three weeks after the completion of the church, a Sabbath school was started under James Blackie and Henry Clark, which was reported as being well attended. 

Presbyterianism spilled from Otago into Southland following W.B.D. Mantell's purchase of the Murihiku Block in August 1853. For three and a half years, between November 1856 and June 1860, the Rev A. Bethune maintained an informal Presbyterian presence in Invercargill, walking regularly from his home in Myross Bush to hold church services in the town on Sundays, and teaching day school in Tay Street on weekdays. Presbyterian Sabbath schooling in Invercargill commenced in August 1860, under the superintendency of Mr Thomas Watson, and at the instigation of the newly inducted Rev A.H. Stobo. Within ten years Invercargill's First Church, opened for worship in 1863, was coordinating the activities of its own Sunday school and satellite schools at Appleby, Clifton, Myross Bush, Roslyn Bush and Sylvan Bank, and through this network was servicing over 600 scholars.

Well in advance of the Presbyterian programme, however, successive Wesleyan missionaries, James Watkin and Charles Creed, had commenced both day school and Sabbath school work among the Maori of the Waikouaiti area, and amongst the children of the whaling fraternity. Thomas Ferens, providing supply during Creed's absence in Wellington during August 1848, recorded the pleasure he took in his Maori Sunday school class. Meeting times varied, but up to three sessions were held on any one Sunday. Ferens also paid regular Sunday visits to J. Jones' estate at Matanaka, holding informal services for adults on the farm property and keeping an eye on the progress of the settlement's European children, though on both counts achieving less tangible success than he desired. Novelty rapidly wore off. Ferens was scandalized by Jones' hard drinking and alleged acts.

---

9 Elder, p.376.
10 Elder, p.48.
of domestic violence, while whalers, farm labourers and their families soon tired of Ferens' touchy evangelicalism.\(^12\)

During the first fifteen years of settlement, in fact, most protestant denominations, not merely the Presbyterians and the Wesleyans, developed programmes of Sunday school activity throughout Otago and Southland. In Invercargill the Associated Churches of Christ had opened a Sunday school by 1860.\(^13\) In Dunedin their St Andrew's Street Sunday School was launched in 1864, with Francis Battson as superintendent.\(^14\) The Congregationalist and Baptist communities in Dunedin were operating Sunday schools within a year of their respective church foundations.\(^15\) Dunedin Baptists held an inaugural meeting at the Excelsior Hall, George Street, Dunedin in June 1863, with a view to organising a congregation. The first meeting for public worship took place in July, two months before the arrival of a permanent pastor, the Rev J.L. Parsons. Over the ensuing weeks the site for morning worship moved from the Court House to the Oddfellows Hall, with the Presbyterians offering facilities for evening service. In March the following year twelve men and three women from the congregation contacted the pastor, urging the speedy organization of a Sunday school and, 'feeling it a privilege as well as a duty', offered their services as teachers. Sabbath schooling at Hanover Street, Dunedin, thus took shape as a lay initiative in makeshift accommodation, before the contract for a permanent church building had been let and the foundation stone laid\(^16\). Mr Thomas Dick, formerly an Edinburgh auctioneer, presented his first report, in his capacity as Sunday school superintendent, to a quarterly tea meeting of church members in May 1865. There was strong interest in the work, which the Reverend Parsons proposed to further support through the opening of a minister's Bible class. Subsequent increase in congregational membership, over a three year period, saw Hanover Street becoming New Zealand's largest Baptist church, with its Sunday school

\(^{12}\) Ferens, July 1848; 13, 20 and 27 August 1848; 4 September 1848.


\(^{15}\) Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin, Archives. Minutes of Church Meetings, 30 September 1864. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG36.

\(^{16}\) Dunedin City Baptist Church Archives. Church Minutes, 10 June 1863, 23 October 1863, 3 March 1864, 31 March 1864, 19 April 1864. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
providing the dynamic for its overall expansion.\textsuperscript{17} The hall facilities which the Baptists eventually provided for their Sunday school, in 1880, were outstripped by roll growth even during the period of the building’s construction.\textsuperscript{18}

Anglicanism’s concern for education was motivated partly by a spirit of emulation. It galled Episcopalian migrants to Otago, bred to the privileges of establishment, to witness the pretensions of the sects in a colonial environment and to have to adjust to the role of junior partner in relation to Presbyterianism.\textsuperscript{19} While Otago Presbyterians defended the concept of a denominationally focused ‘class settlement’, on the grounds that it avoided wasteful scattering of scarce resources, Anglicans expressed resentment at the diversion of what they regarded as public money into sectarian channels. Especially they looked askance at the Presbyterian context of the province’s schooling.\textsuperscript{20} At its inaugural meeting held in the Dunedin Court House on 5 January 1852, an Episcopalian executive committee therefore voted to approach the Colonial Secretary seeking funding for the erection of an Anglican schoolhouse and maintenance of a master’s salary.\textsuperscript{21} The following year, public subscriptions were solicited for the ‘Dunedin Episcopal Church, School and Parsonage Fund’. It was naturally assumed that the proposed church, now St Paul’s Cathedral, Dunedin, would also provide Sunday school facilities. Within a decade of opening the ensuing Anglican Sunday school had swelled to an average attendance of 133, with a staff of 15 teachers, and had outgrown its original accommodation. After 1865 the overflow was catered for in a Sunday morning school held within the body of the church, to the great and forcefully vented annoyance of a Mr Smithers who found the familiar, rolling cadences of the liturgy interrupted by the chattering of boys in the seats immediately behind his rented pew.\textsuperscript{22}


\textsuperscript{18} H. Knight, \textit{Church Building in Otago} University of Otago Printing Department, Dunedin, 1993. The Hanover Street Baptist Church, having outgrown its nineteenth century premises, moved its Sunday congregations and its Sunday school activity to the Dunedin College of Education site during 1997. The former Sunday school hall is now a commercial site, although its strut facade has been preserved for heritage reasons. See also Chapter 6 for more information on the growth of the Hanover Street Sunday School.


\textsuperscript{21} Ibid, 5 January 1852.

\textsuperscript{22} Ibid, Sunday School Report, 31 January 1866.
The early proliferation of Sunday schools does not imply a formal infrastructure; improvisation preceded formalized systems. Record keeping in the early years of development was scanty. Anecdotal information on the operation of the early Sunday schools is available, but accurately quantified data is scarce. In a few instances parish records, such as those of Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, are helpful. Knox parish's records show its Sabbath school as opening on 13 May 1860 under the superintendency of Mr John Gillies, only a week after the formal opening of the church. In the same year a Bible class for older scholars was launched by Knox's new incumbent, the Reverend D.M. Stuart.23 Such was the importance attached to Sunday school work by the parish that, in July 1862, the church's afternoon service was rescheduled for 6pm, to create space for Sabbath school activity; it was also held that a later start would facilitate attendance at divine service by female domestic servants.24 By 1865, an adult congregation of between 800 and 900 at Knox Church was supporting a network of Sunday schools with an aggregate weekly attendance in excess of 300. The average good weather attendance in 1869 stood at 320 for the main church school, supervised by a staff of 17 men and 23 women; some 125 additional children were enrolled in outlying schools at Pelichet Bay and North East Valley.25

At its inaugural meeting in 1854, the Otago Presbytery, reflecting the limited availability of parish reports such as those from Knox Church and admitting its want of precise knowledge regarding Sabbath school work, called for fuller information on school distribution and student numbers.26 Despite the call, no systematic survey was carried out by the Presbyterian Church at this time. Data available in New Zealand Department of Statistics publications, particularly Statistics of New Zealand for the Crown Colony Period, the Statistics of New Zealand volumes covering the period 1853-1867 and census returns for the years 1871 onwards, do make it possible to quantify educational access, including Sunday school access. However, the Sunday school figures provided

25 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1869. Knox Presbyterian Church Archives. In 1955 the church's adult roll was of similar size to that for 1869, but the Sunday school had shrunk to 51 children. The years after World War II saw a dramatic decline in Sunday school adherence, exacerbated for Knox by the changing composition of its catchment area, as residential housing gave place to tertiary student flats.
in the census returns are cross-denominational aggregates; it is not possible, from the census material of this period, to identify Sunday schools by denomination.

The period 1851-1891 saw some dramatic increases in the school-age population of Otago and Southland. Census tables categorised the 5 to 15 year-old population sector as typifying school age:

### Table 7  
**European Population of Otago & Southland, 5-15 Age Range**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Male</th>
<th>Total Female</th>
<th>Overall Total</th>
<th>% Change in Total</th>
<th>% Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1851</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>409</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864</td>
<td>4,094</td>
<td>3,886</td>
<td>7,980</td>
<td>1,851</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>5,018</td>
<td>4,823</td>
<td>9,841</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871</td>
<td>7,223</td>
<td>6,922</td>
<td>14,145</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>10,226</td>
<td>9,911</td>
<td>20,137</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>14,730</td>
<td>14,667</td>
<td>29,397</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>20,008</td>
<td>19,463</td>
<td>39,471</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>20,842</td>
<td>20,138</td>
<td>40,980</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>20,152</td>
<td>19,571</td>
<td>39,723</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>18,997</td>
<td>18,863</td>
<td>37,860</td>
<td>-5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SOURCES:**  
Statistics of New Zealand 1853-1867; Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand 1871-1901

From 1851 to 1871 the European population of Otago and Southland falling within school age grew in number from 409 to 14,145, a thirty-five fold increase. Further strong increases were evident during the period of Vogelite migration in the 1870s. During the gold rush decade of the 1860s the school-age component, despite the appearance of growth, actually formed a shrinking proportion of the Otago population as a whole: 23 per cent in 1851, 14 percent in 1864 and 17 per cent in 1867. Clearly the early phases of the gold rushes drew a large number of single, childless migrants into Otago and Southland. Demographic evidence suggests the 1870s was the decade for consolidating family life. After that, migration rates eased, pioneers aged, and the number of children in the province fell in absolute terms. It is also notable that, among the population who were of school age, there was a slight but consistent male imbalance, 51 per cent being boys as opposed to 49 per cent girls.

For the young during these early years of Otago's settlement, educational access was patchy. Data set out in Table 9 shows Sunday school attendance, aggregated across all denominations, growing from 829 in 1858, to 3,331 in 1864, 5,165 in 1867 and 7,510 in 1871. The parallel figures for
aggregate attendance at public and private day schools were 599, 4,053, 5,388 and 9,555 respectively. Evidently for some children during the 1850s Sunday schooling was the only education available. In the 1860s, however, the Sunday schools failed to keep pace with school-age population growth. Table 8 provides a percentage quantification of this trend:

Table 8  Aggregate Attendance at Sunday Schools of All Denominations in Otago and Southland Expressed as a Percentage of Attendance at Public and Private Day Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE: Statistics of New Zealand 1858, 1864, 1867; Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1871

With each fresh injection of migration, whether gold rush during the 1860s or Vogelite during the 1870s, the Sunday schools found themselves left behind by day school growth. It is notable also that, counter to the small but consistent preponderance of males, cited above in the school-age population as a whole, Sunday school attendance figures for the period favoured girls.²⁷

More detailed analysis of the extant census data complicates and qualifies these findings. Even during years when Sunday schooling appeared to be losing ground to day school rolls, the Sunday schools remained an important educational factor in Otago and Southland.

Table 9  Patterns of Educational Attendance in Otago and Southland, 1848-1871  
B = Boy, G = Girl, T = Total

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Sunday School and Day School</th>
<th>Sunday School Only</th>
<th>Day School Only</th>
<th>No Schooling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1848</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>439</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864</td>
<td>1,371</td>
<td>1,366</td>
<td>2,737</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>2,096</td>
<td>2,115</td>
<td>4,211</td>
<td>470</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871</td>
<td>3,012</td>
<td>2,932</td>
<td>5,944</td>
<td>728</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCES Statistics of New Zealand for the Crown Colony Period; Statistics of New Zealand 1858, 1864, 1867; Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1871

The data shows a trend of increasing educational access over the tabled period, with the percentage of those children receiving no formal schooling falling from 42 per cent of the bracket aged 5 to 15 in 1864 to 21 per cent in 1871, but with Sunday school remaining the sole educational life-line for a minority. Although the number of children attending no school at all shows little change in absolute terms across this period, the figures must be understood relative to the doubling of the total school-age population already indicated in Table 7. Over the same seven year interval there were significant rises, from 34 to 42 per cent, in those enjoying both day school and Sunday school education, and from 17 to 25 per cent in those receiving day schooling only. From 1848 and 1871, between 40 and 58 per cent of the young people of Otago and Southland were enrolled in Sunday schools across the denominations. Even in 1871, for some 1,500 children, over a tenth of the 5 to 15 year age group, Sunday schooling was their only contact with formal education. Twenty years earlier this proportion may have exceeded a quarter or even a third, although lack of an overall total for the school-age population at that time prevents a precise calculation. For this reason Sunday schools in the earliest years of settlement provided some secular as well as religious education. Reading, using the Bible as the basic text, was emphasized, and some spelling and handwriting were taught; no evidence remains to assess how effective such once-weekly teaching might have been.28

The data is consistent in showing that over half of the children receiving exclusively a Sunday school education were girls.

Dedicated women in fact often took a leading role in initiating and implementing early Sunday school programmes. Thus Janet Somerville, of the well-known Dunedin pioneering family of that name, developed what was possibly Otago's third Sabbath school venture, teaching 10 children on Sunday afternoons in her own home at Anderson's Bay, Dunedin, from 1849; George Brown, a district elder, took over the programme in 1851.29 Louisa Hope Will, first wife of the Reverend William Will, was a driving force behind the development of Sabbath schooling at East Taieri.30

Isabella Bonthron, a future settler at Orepuki, Southland, travelling from Glasgow with her husband on the 'Helenslee' in 1863, took the initiative in setting up an on-board Sabbath school for the ship's migrant children.\(^{31}\) She taught the juniors, leaving Mr Bonthron to deal with the older boys. As the journey progressed, she developed a day school, then a prayer meeting for young women, and eventually organised the Sabbath school children into distributing religious tracts among the adult passengers.

On arrival in New Zealand, when remoteness of dwelling precluded regular church attendance, it was often the woman of the house who kept alive the practice of daily devotion among her own family and who catechized the neighbourhood's children. M.C. Orbell, recollecting a Waikouaiti childhood when access to Dunedin was only by whaleboat, recalled his mother's quiet insistence on daily family prayer and her habit of reading aloud the Anglican liturgy to all who might be at home on Sundays.\(^{32}\) At Kaikūkū Learmonth Dalrymple, future 'godmother' of the Otago Girls' High School, ran a Sunday school from her parents' home at 'Craiglea' while, in the same settlement, a Mrs Paterson organised a similar home-based venture.\(^{33}\) Mrs Waters, wife of the Presbyterian minister at Warepa, kept Sunday school at the home of William Young from 1865 until her tragic death in confinement in 1873.\(^{34}\) At Otago Heads, where a Sunday school operated from 1879 onwards, a Mrs Milne, wife of the local pilot boat captain, taught for over 28 years.\(^{35}\) John Collie, in his *Story of the Otago Free Church Settlement, 1848-1948*, dismissed the gospel according to the pioneer woman as typically simplistic. 'Many women in small country places ... taught Sunday school in a very simple way. It might be little more than the learning of Scripture texts and the telling of Scripture stories.'\(^{36}\) No doubt this was true in many cases, but it would be wrong to assume that all the settlement's women lacked an interpretative understanding of Scripture. The Reverend Dr D.M. Stuart spoke highly, for example, of a Miss Revell, a woman born and bred in London who had migrated to Otago in the service of a well-to-do family, as being 'a very successful teacher' in the

\(^{33}\) A. Cross, 'South Clutha, Full Circle', p.87. Among the private papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.
\(^{34}\) A. Watson, 'These Sixty-One Years: the History of the Warepa Presbyterian Church from 1854-1914', pp.3-5. Among the private papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.
Knox Church Sabbath School, a person who was 'well educated' and 'with great force of character'; Stuart remembered her, clad in leather gaiters, as the sole attendant at one morning session of the Bible class, when a week of rain had flooded the flats. If a zeal for and facility in education characterised Miss Revell, the same was equally true of the Reverend Thomas Burns' daughter, Jane Bannerman, eloquent diarist, Sunday school devotee and champion of overseas mission, or of Isabella Bonthron and Learmonth Dalrymple, women who were demonstrably neither simple nor ill-informed.

Despite the admirable dedication of such pioneer workers, both male and female, the problems of religious and educational provision in the early days of settlement were immense; the enormity of the challenge is the measure of the pioneers' faith. On the inchoate frontier, Sunday schooling proved itself as adaptable, resilient, and as useful a focus of community sentiment as it had been in Britain. Migrants, sundered from their religious and cultural roots, were preoccupied in the most literal way with the breaking of new ground. Thomas Burns himself, as his diary reveals, was much involved in pioneering's manual labour. The Anglican Sarah Street reflected, with a pang of conscience, how easily material imperatives crowded out spiritual exercise and worship. Writing from Warepa Bush in 1858 to her brother, Edward Lear, she observed; 'There is so much work to be done, so much time necessarily occupied in making a new earthly home, that we want a voice to remind us continually of the "House not made with Hands," our Heavenly home.' Many of the working classes were impatient of religious niceties, and many whalers overtly profane. After four years of debilitating and frustrating ministry among Maori, James Watkin expressed strong dislike of the 'sulky, testy' and 'rapacious' Kai Tahu character, but he nevertheless found his Maori charges to be both more literate and more approachable than the whaleboat crews. In more optimistic vein Burns, in correspondence dating from the early days of the Otago settlement, noted that, despite all difficulties, 'in several rural districts, as well as in Dunedin, there are springing up [Presbyterian] Sabbath schools and meetings for prayer.'

37 Hislop, p.23.
38 Letters of Mrs Sarah Street. Letter to her brother, 29 June 1858. Otago Settlers' Museum Archives, Dunedin.
40 Collie, p.18.
Burns' linking of Sunday school growth with adult prayer meetings is interesting, illustrating the adaptation and overlap that occurred as pioneer communities squared their aspirations with the constraints of time and money. Sunday schooling ultimately, in the straitened conditions of the pioneer frontier, proved as cost-effective and flexible as it had for the Free Kirk of the Scottish Disruption. The financial exigencies of a frontier society hindered the formal provision of church, day school and Sunday school facilities alike. Thus, Watkin wrote repeatedly to Port Nicholson 'beseeching books, slates and pencils' to support the work in his Wesleyan schools.  

On remote Ruapuke J.F.H. Wohlers, resourceful and resilient minister of the North German Mission Society, improvised his own school equipment: alphabet, books, calendars, even a sun-dial. To migrant Scottish Presbyterianism, its sense of stewardship honed by the privations of the Disruption, there was nothing new in worship in makeshift accommodation, or even in the open air. Thus foreshadowed, the Scots sought to establish a reliable flow of religious and educational funding by setting up an appropriation system. The slow pace of land sales in the early years of settlement, however, yielded disappointing returns to the appropriation account. Desire to attract and retain Presbyterian clergy of high professional quality soon led to the introduction in Otago of a sustentation fund, to ensure adequacy and reliability of clerical stipend.

For denominations lacking the endowment advantages of Otago Presbyterianism the pressure of providing facilities for worship and education was felt even more keenly. At St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti, for example, in spite of the 'great liberality' of the church's founding benefactor, John Jones, pew rentals were reluctantly considered as a funding option in the 1860s. Difficulties in gathering funds for the curate's stipend led to the farming of the collection system at 5 per cent commission in 1868. In many other foundations, both Anglican and Presbyterian and including First Church and St Paul's, Dunedin, pew charges became the norm. Debt servicing compounded with running costs to drain church resources. The Dunedin Baptists made an approach to William Lamach of the Otago and Southland Investment Company in 1872 for a reduction in their mortgage interest rate, an approach which must have been embarrassing to a leadership which took a punitive

---

41 Watkin, April 1843.
43 East Otago Parish Archives. St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti, Vestry and Church Committee Minutes, 1 February 1868. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 92-114.
attitude towards insolvency amongst its own members.\textsuperscript{44} Financial stress was experienced yet more severely by outlying rural churches. Within three years of his appointment to the Wakatipu Anglican parish the Reverend Richard Coffey's £250 per annum stipend was £200 in arrears, and the minister was obliged to attempt the collection of his own dues while on his round of parish visitations.\textsuperscript{45} Even within urban areas, churches of the smaller Protestant denominations floundered financially. At Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin in 1868, the Reverend Richard Connebee was owed £100 in salary and had not been paid for three months; the church had no reserves to meet its debt.\textsuperscript{46}

If a pioneer community, struggling economically, attempted the additional challenge of providing a purpose-built Sunday school, the initial capital outlay on the room had to be met, moneys being raised either by subscription or borrowing. The early push to establish Sunday schools proceeded, and succeeded, often in spite of the absence of reasonable physical facilities. Accommodation in the early days of settlement was spartan at best and, at worst, non-existent. The Waikouaiti Anglican Sunday School persevered for four years without rooms of its own, with the bulk of the scholars being taught inside the church, and the infants in the shelter of the church porch.\textsuperscript{47} Where a Sunday school room was provided, ongoing maintenance costs still had to be faced. Additional running expenses for a Sunday school included the purchase and repair of hymn books and catechetical texts, the purchase of roll books, the printing of information sheets for parents and the purchase of library books, as Sunday schools began to develop library facilities. Further incidental costs included outlay on prizes and the 'annual treat' or picnic. These expenses were sourced out of the parent church's courts, the Sunday schools' own weekly offerings and through special congregational collections. The Sunday School Treat Committee of the Dunedin Baptist community approached its deacons in 1868 for such a collection, thereby setting a yearly precedent for that church.\textsuperscript{48} The Deacons' Court of St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, a body habitually cautious with money, resolved in February 1862 that 'the whole of the funds received at collection, on behalf of the Sabbath school, in this particular instance be paid over to the Treasurer of the School, and that the Treasurer of the

\textsuperscript{44} Dunedin City Baptist Church. Deacons' General Committee Minutes, 31 May 1872.

\textsuperscript{45} A J De La Mare, 'History of the Anglican Church in the Wakatipu, 1863-1982', in Wakatipu Parochial District Anglican Church Archives. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG166 1043 A1.

\textsuperscript{46} Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin, Archives. Minutes of Church Meetings, 25 June 1868. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG36

\textsuperscript{47} E J Neale, 'Short History of Waikouaiti, Commemorating Sixty Years of Church Life and Work, 1858-1918', in East Otago Parish Archives: St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 92-114.
Sabbath School be requested to prepare a balance (sic) of their liabilities to be laid before the Deacons' Court at their next meeting.\textsuperscript{49} Normal practice at St Andrew's was for the Deacons' Court to retain a fixed sum tagged for general church expenses out of any dedicated collection. Sometimes this left so small a surplus out of a special collection that the exercise had to be repeated, as in the case of the January 1868 collection to fund the expansion of the Sabbath school library.\textsuperscript{50} At St Paul's Anglican Church, Dunedin, the Sunday school received £10 annually in Vestry funding during the 1860s. Edward Swire, the Sunday school superintendent, estimated the real running costs of the school at £40 per annum, exclusive of the 'annual treat' and of any saving for capital development, and urged that Sunday school teachers should not be expected to undertake private venture fundraising on top of their other duties.\textsuperscript{51} By 1866 the school's accommodation needs had become urgent, with teachers unable to adequately supervise the morning school because of lack of seating, and with parents allegedly withholding children from attendance at afternoon classes on the grounds that the unheated, overcrowded facilities constituted a health hazard.

Pioneering exigencies of this degree and type blurred nice distinctions, between formal and informal, young and old, the lowly and the well-to-do. Pioneer Sunday schooling countered privation with adaptability. It was common at the margin of settlement for Sunday school provision to predate and then interact with the opening of formal church and day school facilities, for the Sunday school and day school to share staff, and for the wealthy and humble to meet and interact in the provision of Sabbath education.\textsuperscript{52} In the immediate vicinity of Dunedin, Sabbath school expansion into Kaikorai Valley and Caversham paved the way for Presbyterian church development in these areas. George Hepburn, looking back in 1878 over fifty-five years of involvement in Sabbath school work in Scotland and Otago, recalled migrating to Dunedin with his eight children in 1850. He commenced Sunday classes for them in his own home in the outlying district of Wakari, and invited in the children of his neighbours. The class moved into the district school house, when this was eventually

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Dunedin City Baptist Church. Deacons' General Committee Minutes, 1 December 1868.
\item St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, 6 February 1865. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. The St Andrew's Deacons' Court continued, into the 1880s, its practice of deducting administration costs from dedicated collections. See Chapter 6 for more information regarding this.
\item Ibid, 13 January 1868.
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
erected. It merged, many years later, with the Kaikorai Valley Sunday School, after the Kaikorai Church building had been completed. Similar processes of interaction are personified in the day school dominies, William Somerville and Alexander Ayson. Somerville, day school teacher at Anderson's Bay, Dunedin, was also a particularly active temperance and Sabbath school worker, publicizing the work of the Sunday schools in his pamphlet *The Church's Nurseries*, and funding its distribution among parents at his own expense. Further afield, Ayson, Presbyterian Church elder and pioneer schoolmaster at Tokomairiro, was involved in Sunday school work wherever his career took him, as was George Reid, head teacher at Manuherikia in 1866 and Forbury in 1873. In Southland no less a figure than the enterprising Dr Menzies, mentor and future superintendent of Southland Province, taught a small Sunday school near his country home at Wyndham.

Significantly, denominationalism itself was among the distinctions blurred by the realities of a pioneering frontier. Migrants, especially Scottish migrants, came to Otago and Southland intending both to reproduce and perfect the forms of home, and they looked to the Sabbath schools as an instrument in this process. Even in Britain, however, Sunday schools had shown a marked tendency to develop their own dynamics, deviating from the Raikesian paradigm. Flexibility and responsiveness to local community need which, in Britain, often meant working class need, were keys to the schools' success. Under the frontier conditions of Otago and Southland an equal flexibility of response was typical, with an ecumenical style of Sunday schooling, and indeed of congregational worship, becoming common across the region, particularly in isolated rural areas. From the outset cordial relations existed in Dunedin between the Presbyterian leaders and the Otago Wesleyan mission although James Watkin's successor, Charles Creed, fell foul of William Cargill regarding evangelism in the Dunedin gaol. Contemporary Episcopalians sided with Creed on this issue, expressing regret that ecumenical 'acts of kindness should have exposed Mr Creed to so much

53 *The Evangelist* (Dunedin), September 1878. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
54 C S Ross, Early Otago and Some of its Notable Men, J Wilkie and Co., Dunedin, 1907, p.125.
55 W.D. Ayson, 'Looking Back: Glenshee to Otago. Clan Ayson of New Zealand Society'. Among the private papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.
56 Collie, p.98.
Feeding the Lambs

D S Keen

annoyance and opposition. Lacking ready access to the ministrations of ordained clergy, people often ignored denominational niceties. Catherine Valpy showed a catholic generosity of spirit, changing from Methodist to Anglican persuasion on her marriage, while attending without fail the occasional Presbyterian services conducted by the Reverend William Will in an unfinished barn in West Taieri.

Pioneer Sunday schooling breached denominational boundaries yet more easily than did adult worship. A person of goodwill in an emergent community would simply open a Sunday facility for the growing population of children, welcoming youngsters of all persuasions; the motive appears to have been community service far more than any consideration of sectarian proselytizing. In the Anderson's Bay suburbs of Dunedin Presbyterians and Anglicans combined their Sunday school efforts for a number of years because of accommodation and transport difficulties. In North Dunedin Mesdames Allen and MacGeorge, two foundation members of the Baptist congregation, taught children from non-church back-grounds in the rooms of a local sawmill. Further afield, at Warepa Bush in 1858 local household heads of whatever denomination took it in turns to run the Sabbath school, supplementing the three-weekly visits of the Reverend William Bannerman. Within the Dunedin area, the year 1863 saw the first attempt, through a meeting of teacher delegates from the various Sunday schools in the district, to create an interdenominational Otago Sunday School Union.

On the teeming goldfields nice distinctions of denomination became more blurred than in the city. Here the versatility of Sunday schooling, born of its very informality, could show to best advantage. A host of spontaneous Sunday school ventures preceded the formal denominational servicing of these districts, helping to shape both individual and community identity. Among the early, active

57 Saint Paul's Anglican Cathedral, Dunedin. Minutes of Episcopalian and St Paul's Committees, 10 March 1852.
60 Tonson, p.22.
61 Letters of Mrs Sarah Street, 29 June 1858.
62 Ross, p.230.
63 Elder, p.150.
Sabbath school workers at Tuapeka were Messrs Barker, Bentley, Matthews and Tolcher. At the Dunstan, R. Barlow was the founding teacher, and a Mr A. Bowmont at St Bathans, with the running of this school being taken over subsequently by the gold receiver, H.A. Stratford. The Mount Benger Sunday School, operational by 1869, drew in nearly all the Protestant children of the area. At Coal Creek a Sunday School established by Wesleyans was attended by all the children of the immediate neighbourhood. The Upper Drybread School in the late 1860s operated in a farmhouse kitchen under the care of a Mrs Davidson, wife of the manager of Matakani Station. It drew children of motley denominational origins to cross a wide tract of wilderness. The Reverend Henry Budd recalled in later years the fear which the big merino rams inspired in his six-year old heart as he walked to the school across the unfenced run. Other of Budd’s memories regarding the school were affectionate:

I remember the parting gift I received - a book entitled *Historical and Literary Celebrities*, of some 500 pages. This was rather a dull book for a boy of six, but books were scarce in those days, and from it I came to know something of Napoleon, Cromwell, Confucius, Wellington and other famous characters.

Presumably, Mrs Davidson funded the prize allocation at her own expense.

Even among the Anglicans on the goldfields, despite their commitment to a structured form of worship, the provision of church and Sunday school facilities did not wait for the tardy availability of ordained clergy. The Otago and Southland Rural Deanery Board noted in 1863:

At the Dunstan where, mainly owing to the unweari d exertions of the lay reader, Mr Stratford, a church has been built and a flourishing Sunday school established, the services of an ordained minister would be very acceptable.

Anglican dedication sometimes outran communication. At Queenstown in 1864, a request from a Mrs Worth for leave to establish a Sunday school in the church, to meet on Sunday afternoons, was queried on the grounds that, unbeknown to the would-be benefactor, a Sabbath class already

---

64 Ross, p.230.
65 *The Evangelist* (Lawrence), August 1869.
operated weekly, from 2.30 to 3.30 p.m. Mrs Worth was, however, encouraged to open a second class ensuant to the first, meeting between 3.30 and 5 p.m.\(^68\)

In default of formal church provision in outlying areas, amongst Maori on the coast and miners inland, adults sometimes attended Sunday school services for worship and fellowship; some came both to church and Sunday school. Dunedin's Evangelist, reporting on mission work amongst Maori in April 1869, noted that adults as well as children attended the Sunday school held prior to morning service at Otago Heads. On the Tuapeka goldfield Thomas Common, a devout Cornishman newly arriving in November 1871, sought out the Wesleyan Sunday school at Evans' Flat and found the teaching there to be good; in contrast, the singing at the small church service at 3 p.m. was execrable, 'reminding one of the noise made by sharpening a saw.'\(^69\) For Welsh gold miners at Cambrians, set apart by ethnicity as well as geographic isolation, Sunday school worship in the language of home provided an initial community focus for children and adults; vertical contact across the age range was the norm in Welsh Sunday school tradition. After 1877 the provision of an English-language Sunday school programme at Welshman's Gully assisted the process of cultural assimilation.\(^70\) Captain T.E. Donne, an early enrolment of the Queenstown Sunday School, subsequently recalled how the easy ecumenical relations of Central Otago linked Presbyterian with Episcopalian and spanned the age range from childhood to adulthood.\(^71\)

Ecumencism did not last unchallenged, as the development of settlement eventually provided resident denominational ministers, but neither did it disappear either in town or country. Critics contended that ecumencism inevitably generated imprecise teaching and therefore bred confusion rather than tolerance of belief.\(^72\) Traditionalists sought to recast Sunday schools as nurseries of denominational loyalty; synods began to seek firm data on Sunday schools affiliated to their specific denominations and to calculate the proportion of Sunday school teachers who were formally enrolled in membership with their respective churches. Improvisation, however, persisted at the margins, and

\(^{68}\) Wakatipu Parochial District Anglican Church Archives, Vestry, Church Committee and Parishioners Meetings' Minutes, 14 December 1864. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG166. 1043.


\(^{70}\) Don, p.100.

\(^{71}\) Ibid, p.265.

interdenominationalism remained the preferred option of some schools into the twentieth century. At Hamilton, near Naseby, the superintendent of the Union Church Sunday School, Paul Williams, was still reassuring local parents in 1879 that the principles adopted in class teaching were ‘founded on a broad and liberal basis and not denominationally’, a telling comment which suggests the importance of the frontier experience in preparing public opinion for the secularism of the 1877 Education Act. As late as 1882, ecumenical Sunday schooling was still sufficiently common in Otago's rural outback to merit specific mention in the Presbyterian Sabbath School Committee's report to Synod for that year. The same period saw the Baptist, William McKenzie, holding Sunday school and running non-denominational prayer meetings and services in houses, barns and schools in the Upper Owaka Valley of South Otago, prior to the opening of the Owaka Baptist Church in 1887. Closer to Dunedin, at Port Chalmers in December 1882, Mugford Grant welcomed without demur a Mr Evans, an Anglican day-school teacher at the Port Chalmers Grammar School, on to the staff of the Congregationalist Sunday school. Evans, it seems, wished to be of service but had found no outlet for his talents in the local Anglican Sunday school.

Issues relating to curriculum and pedagogy also, in the pioneer Sunday schools of Otago and Southland, reflected tension between the traditional claims of denominationalism and the practical advantages of ecumenicism, between a vertical vision of community centred on heritage and the lateral immediacy of community need. Catechetical exercises, in the view of traditionalists, provided an essential scaffolding for both individual and community development. The Sunday schools were suited, in the theoretical judgment of church leaders of the several denominations, to a complementary function, supplementing and reinforcing the work of family, day school and Sunday worship service. It was expected by such leaders that catechetical and textual knowledge imparted in the Sunday schools would underpin the later development of an adult, denominationally-robust faith - a faith with a context. Catechetical instruction rested on rote learning, reinforced with contextual explanation. At the end of a tiring Sabbath of preaching James Watkin still found time to catechize his own family. On the John Wickliffe the shipboard Sabbath school of Thomas Ferens

73 Mount Ida Chronicle and St Bathans Weekly News (Naseby), 11 February 1879. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.
74 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1882, Appendix, p.16.
76 Watkin, 28 June 1840.
and W.H. Monson had adopted a catechetical approach.\textsuperscript{77} Catechetical influence was especially strong in the dual day school and Sabbath school tradition of the Lowland Scottish parish. An 1861 observer in Otago noted that, under Burns, Presbyterian Sabbath schooling was 'conducted on strict Presbyterian rules', being based squarely on the Westminster Shorter Catechism, a name wryly ironic for generations of Scottish Sunday scholars.\textsuperscript{78} The Shorter Catechism consisted of a sequence of 107 propositions, set out in paired question and answer form, each pair pertaining to a fundamental of the faith as perceived from a Presbyterian perspective. Each proposition was supported by scriptural proofs.\textsuperscript{79} The opening pairs in the sequence related to the nature of God and the concept of the Trinity. The series then went on to consider Creation, the Fall, Original Sin, Retribution and the doctrine of Election. The Ten Commandments were studied in detail. The closing propositions examined the role of the sacraments and of prayer in the Christian life, with the paternoster being subject to specific and detailed analysis. The Shorter Catechism, in structure, was redolent of medieval scholasticism. It was legalistic in tone and mechanistic in its treatment of the vicarious suffering of Christ. Catechetical drill was, however, expected to provide a conceptual underpinning for the development of habits of worship. The scheduling of Sunday school sessions, typically for 2.30 p.m. or 3 p.m. on Sunday afternoons, was intended to afford teachers and scholars alike the opportunity of attending morning service, and such attendance was expected.

In curriculum and pedagogy as in structure and organization, however, Sunday schools showed a tendency to develop on lines of their own. The Sunday school movement continued to display, in colonial settings, the immediacy of response to community need and the autonomous involvement of lay membership which had hallmarked its activity in Britain; it functioned as a bridge between tradition and change at the margin of colonial settlement, expressing and synthesizing the duality of migrant community aspiration. Reaction against catechetical teaching had arisen among Presbyterians even before the transplanting of Sabbath schools from Scotland to Otago, with criticism focusing on the failure of the Shorter Catechism to emphasize the love of God and on the repetitive teaching style which its use encouraged. Such reaction was especially evident amongst

\textsuperscript{77} Ferens, p.12.
\textsuperscript{78} Cited in J. McKean, \textit{The Church in a Special Colony: a History of the Presbyterian Synod of Otago and Southland, 1866-1991}, Synod of Otago and Southland, Presbyterian Church of Aotearoa New Zealand, Dunedin, 1994, p.34.
\textsuperscript{79} \textit{The Shorter Catechism agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster. With Scripture Proofs}, New Zealand Bible and Tract Society, Dunedin, 189.?
women who became prominent in the ranks of Sabbath school teachers, and was strongly marked among teachers who taught the younger age groups. Burns' own daughter, Jane Bannerman, recalling a Scottish childhood across a gulf of years, remembered wishing at the age of seven that the detested Catechism could have been compressed into a single word; the psalms and paraphrases she found much more congenial. Isabella Bonthron, New Zealand-bound on the Helenslee, raised eyebrows by refusing to teach her shipboard class from the Catechism, deeming it unsuitable for the education of younger children. She preferred to focus on biblical narrative. In a counter-reaction evident in Otago by the 1870s, conservative Presbyterian voices were raised in stern warning against what was perceived as a falling away from catechetical rigour in Sabbath school classes; the secularization of public elementary day schooling had created a crisis of mythology for migrant traditionalists, which they looked to the Sunday schools to resolve. Catechetical drill remained the basis of Presbyterian Sabbath schooling during the opening decades of Otago settlement, and persisted commonly into the twentieth century, more so than among other denominations. Alternative programmes, nevertheless, did gain ground as will be seen, making the classroom of 1900 a radically different environment from that of 1848.

Offering both spiritual and social outlet, scope for community expression and lay involvement, the early Sunday schools, whatever their deficiencies, took root and flourished because they addressed a widely-felt need. Their tensions were growing pains, the dynamics of community development. Their summer picnics and winter festivals were significant community events, widely reported in the press. Contemporary observers saw them as reaching across differences of social class as well as of denomination and age. April 1851 saw the wealthy Englishman, W.H. Valpy, joining with Burns to run the Dunedin school picnic at Forbury; the event attracted detailed coverage in the Otago Witness. In a show of community solidarity the children of the Presbyterian First Church, Dunedin, returning from an annual picnic by the Water of Leith in 1861, stopped outside the Knox Church manse to serenade the Reverend Dr Stuart. Seventeen years later the Southland Times ran a particularly interesting report on the All Saints Anglican Parish Church Sunday School Bazaar, Invercargill. Quoting comments of Sir John Richardson, former provincial superintendent, the report

81 Diary of Mrs D Bonthron: 'Helenslee', 1863. Otago Settlers' Museum Archives, Dunedin.
82 Otago Witness (Dunedin) No 7, 3 May 1851, p.3.
83 Ross, Story of the Otago Church and Settlement, p.223.
juxtaposed denomination and social class, applauding the greater permeability of colonial as opposed to British society:

It was a blessed thing, however, to see the children enjoying themselves, and he was really glad to see stupid social barriers broken down by bringing children of all classes together. In a new country like this he thought children should be taught to understand that they were the sons and daughters of Christian parents, and might mingle on a common platform of friendly intercourse, apart from denominational considerations.  

Miles Fairburn has posited for mid-nineteenth century New Zealand a condition in which social organization was 'gravely deficient', community structures 'few and weak' and in which 'bondlessness was central to colonial life'. The story of Sabbath schooling in Otago and Southland does not appear to support Fairburn's thesis. Admittedly many Sunday school arrangements were ad hoc; implementation fell short of intention, and was often hallmarked by adaptation and compromise. The schools' story from 1848 to 1870 is one of process rather than product. The very versatility of the schools, however, and the prominence of lay initiative in their growth, argues for the strength rather than the weakness of community aspiration. Early Sunday school development in Otago and Southland reflected a robust effort which touched the lives of up to half the children in the province, helping to confer a community of values which reached across social, ethnic and gender differences. The schools fostered a cohesive sense of identity among both teacher and taught, nurturing a sense of self-worth which in turn encouraged further active community participation. They held before the aspiring migrant the promise of dignity, in this world and the next. They played a crucial role in helping to weave a mythology which integrated the several traditions of 'home' with hopes and a sense of purpose for the future.

---

84 All Saints Anglican Parish Church, Gladstone, Invercargill. Parochial Committee Minute Book, 8 February 1878. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG244 A1.

Chapter 5  Burn-off And Re-sowing - the 1870s As A Decade of Change in Sunday Schooling in Otago and Southland

The Sunday schools of Otago and Southland, after 1870, faced both new challenges and new opportunities. They brought to Otago and Southland echoes of the hopes and values of the ‘old country’: from England, the desire of the skilled working and lower middle classes for self-respect, expressed in the outward forms of economic and moral respectability: from England also, working class traditions of cooperation and mutual support through friendly societies: from Scotland, the reaffirmation of community in an environment of socio-economic uncertainty: also from Scotland, a mythology of Covenant between God and mankind. Fused in migration, the Anglo-Scottish strands rendered Sunday schooling as ductile and versatile in a colonial setting as it had been in the old societies of home. Sunday schools could react either defensively or expansively to the dynamics of change. In fact they did both in Otago and Southland after 1870. The Sunday schools faced the challenge of secularism, especially as embodied in the 1877 Education Act, and the intellectual challenge of the Higher Criticism, and against these challenges they erected the defensive barriers of traditional, often catechetical, forms. Romanticism on the other hand, in its idealization of motherhood and childhood, opened up new opportunities for youth mission, opportunities which the Sunday schools seized. The schools proliferated after 1870, widening their target age range and the scope of their activities, and achieving an integrative, normative influence in the socialization of a new community.

Sunday school rolls grew markedly during the period following 1870, in part simply reflecting demographic growth, as they had during the 1860s - more of the same. There was, however, a qualitative difference to the later phase of growth. There was increase, not only in absolute terms, but also in the proportion of children of school age attending Sunday school. At the same time, the efficiency of the schools became a matter of overt and conscious concern to church leaders. The immediate occasion, although by no means the sole cause, of this concern was the passage of the 1877 Education Act. A meeting of Session at the Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, responded to the passage of the act in a fashion typical of many Protestant churches throughout the region: The Session in view of the exclusion of all religious instruction from the day schools, seek earnestly to
impress upon all members of the congregation the increasing importance of this agency of the church [the Sabbath school].

The question arises as to why the Otago and Southland communities should have acquiesced in the secularization of their public day schooling when their strong feelings regarding the importance of religion in education led them to champion a vigorous Sunday school movement. The answer lies partly in the memories loaded in the southern settlers' cultural baggage. To a young society, a secularised public education system offered cohesion, the hope of a coherent identity unsullied by the bickerings of denominationalism or the arrogant pretensions of establishment; both of these were living memories in all parts of Britain. If migrant New Zealand, however, needed secularism to unite it at national level, migrant sub-groups could not forget the denominationalism which had once underpinned local, parish identities; nineteenth century New Zealand, and Otago in particular, was a land of the local. As far as Otago's Protestant groups were concerned, the necessary synthesis between wider unity and local diversity was found, after 1870, in an extended use of Sunday schools. If the day schools could provide the warp of secularism, then the Sabbath schools would provide the weft of religious, denominational education, weaving a new social mythology in all its fulness, a daring, splendid coat of dreams for a migrant Joseph.

Inevitably the cut of the coat fell short of the ideal and the garment chafed. During the closing decades of the nineteenth century, as frontier improvisation turned to stable settlement, the easy ecumenicism of much pioneer Sunday schooling faded and church leaders across the mainline denominations sought parochial commitment from their members. They showed concern at the disparity between active and passive participation in church life among both adults and youth. They looked to their Sunday schools to lay the foundations of a positive commitment to church membership. Their concerns were well founded. Among Otago and Southland's Presbyterians, for example, levels of congregational attendance were falling below, for communicant participation well below, the figures for nominal church membership, and were certainly not maintaining the levels recorded by the Reverend Thomas Burns for the colony's earlier years.

---


Weekly tallies for any given church might vary widely, dependent an incidental factors such as holiday festival or season of the year; a scattered population with poor roading facilities responded very much to vagaries of the weather. Thus, at Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Port Chalmers, attendance for worship during 1888 varied from a low of 12 on a 'very rainy' day to a maximum of 250 at a confirmation service when the weather was fine and clear. Christmas Day, 1888, was cold and wet and drew a congregation of only 105.\(^3\) Communicant attendances for the same year ranged between 6 and 32. All Saints Anglican Church, Dunedin, saw communicant numbers during 1862 fluctuate a low of 3 an 8 to highs of 66 and 82 at Easter and Christmas respectively, with a median attendance of 16.\(^4\) Dunedin's Moray Place Congregational Church experienced similar problems regarding punctuality and regularity among communicants; the deacons in 1887 toyed with ideas for a system of pledged giving that might weather-proof the church's finances.\(^5\)

Sabbath school attendances were watched anxiously as a barometer of future church fortunes. Quarterly and yearly roll totals and attendance averages came to be punctiliously calculated, and reported to the courts of the church concerned; statistical details will be furnished in a subsequent chapter of this study. School roll books provided comment explaining any instances of especially low attendance. The Roslyn Presbyterian Sabbath School, for example, during the year 1870 had a roll of some 35 children. On Sunday, 21 August, however, a 'stormy day', only 4 boys and 7 girls attended, while on 22 May, a day of 'very severe, bitter rain and sleet', no school at all was held.\(^6\) On occasion, epidemics of influenza and scarlet fever dented the generally impressive school attendance statistics at Knox Church, Dunedin. Less reparable were defections to schools of other denominations, an increasing likelihood as demographic growth stimulated denominational variety and viability. The unconventional methods of the Salvation Army attracted attention among the working classes during the 1880s. Early in the decade the Army developed its own version of Sunday school work in Otago, with an 'M.G' reported as captain of the 'Little Soldiers' in Dunedin.

\(^3\) Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Port Chalmers. Offertory Book II, 1887-1904. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. MS 1084.
\(^5\) Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin, Archives. Notes on the History of the Church. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 36.9.
\(^6\) Roslyn Sabbath School Record Book, 1870 and 1871. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
and a 'J.P' leading a march of 250 children through the main street of Timaru.\(^7\) As one contemporary Dunedin recruit noted:

> About this time the Young People's Corps or Junior Soldiers came in for my attention. For some reason up till now I had been sent to Trinity Methodist Sunday School. I was a bit shy when first confronted with the lively young soldiers, not being used to their free and easy manners.\(^8\)

In some quarters the Army's unorthodoxy excited emulation. The Reverend Rutherford Waddell proposed to the St Andrew's Church Session that Army members be invited to train St Andrews missioners in methods of outreach to the Walker Street slum; the Session's response is not recorded. Gibson Smith, in North Dunedin, gave the Army grudging admiration, acknowledging its zeal and impact while expressing his suspicion of its alleged superficiality and emotionalism.\(^9\) William Mugford Grant, of the Port Chalmers Congregational Church, on the other hand, was uncharacteristically waspish; he had lost young church adherents to the Army, and was resentful.

Generally among Protestant groups in Otago and Southland, however, it was the growth of Roman Catholicism which caused particular disquiet. Catholicism increased its presence in Otago with the arrival of Irish miners during the gold rushes. At the same time High Churchmanship, glibly equated with 'popery', spread among the Anglican communion.\(^10\) Irish Catholicism, with its popularly perceived connotations of Fenianism, sat uneasily with the Anglo-Scottish myth of Empire which had become important to Otago's isolated settlement. The *Evangelist*, in August 1871, voiced Protestant anxiety; it warned that 'the tocsin of sectarian warfare has sounded', expressing astonishment at 'the audacity of the Romish bishop' [Patrick Moran] and outrage at 'the priestly capers [he] has been cutting through the country'.\(^11\) Five years later, education had become the focus of the *Evangelist's* concerns. The *School Book of the Christian Brothers*, the *Evangelist* implied, was


\(^8\) R. Hughson, Memoirs, written in 1936. Information supplied by Salvation Army Territorial Headquarters, 202 Cuba Street, Wellington.

\(^9\) North Dunedin Monthly (Parish monthly newsletter of the North Dunedin Presbyterian Church, 1891-1892), Vol 1, No 1, May 1891, p.4. Hewitson Archive Library, Dunedin.


\(^11\) *Evangelist* (Dunedin), August 1871.
fostering among the young an idolatrous worship of the Virgin, and of Saint Bridget and Saint Patrick, while containing lamentably few references to Jesus as Saviour; the book's aim, it was alleged, was to turn the pupils 'into missionaries of Mary and of Rome'.12 Other Protestant reaction was even more lurid. The purportedly autobiographical Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk and the Thrilling Mysteries of a Convent Revealed damned Catholicism for a gamut of supposed vices, from authoritarianism and ritualism to the infanticide of the bastard offspring of nuns and priests. An American production with a Montreal setting, the book was, perhaps, the product of Anglo-Gallic rivalry in a region far distant from New Zealand, but it found its way into the literary diet of at least one girl in nineteenth century Otago. Examples from its chapter abstracts suggest the flavour of the book: the Bible cursed and burned; fierce exultation of the priests; the deformed nun; a meeting at midnight with Sister Theresa; despotism of the Mother Superior; fiendish exultation of Martina at the success of her scheme.13

From the soil of sectarian suspicion, particularly as evidenced between the Protestant denominations and Catholicism, grew the secularization of the New Zealand public education system, with all the implications of this process for the Otago's Sunday schools. From the early years of settlement a large degree of overlay had existed between the work of day schools, whether public or private, and Sabbath schools in Otago and Southland. The Provincial Council, in 1854, 'recognised the Bible as an indispensable textbook to be read daily in every school'.14 The Otago Presbytery, in the same year, urged the 'establishment of Elementary and Superior Schools, founded on a broad and liberal basis, affording instruction based on religion', and appointed a committee of nine to pursue this aim.15 The concepts of 'broad' and 'liberal' were never defined in the Presbytery resolution. It is clear, however, from correspondence between John Gillies, a prominent member of the Free Kirk in Otago, and the Anglican Reverend John Albert Fenton, that the likes of Gillies regarded the Westminster Shorter Catechism as affording, not an exclusively Presbyterian, but a properly catholic digest of Christian truth.16 Private schools also assumed a congruence of religious and educational aim. A Mr

---

12 Evangelist (Dunedin), July 1876, p.5.
13 'Maria Monk', Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk and the Thrilling Mysteries of a Convent Revealed! T B Peterson, Philadelphia, 1836.
Russell, advertising his services in 1856, outlined a programme for his scholars that blended the doctrinal, ethical and practical.

With respect to instruction, it has been his aim to give the Pupil sound views in morals and religion; to teach him to read well and also understand what he reads; to make him acquainted with the elements of general knowledge, geography and history; to enable him to express himself correctly and freely, whether by tongue or pen; to make him quick and accurate in the use of figures and accounts, and acquainted with some of the forms used in the conducting of business.\(^{17}\)

The Provincial Council's Educational Ordinances of 1856 and 1862 assumed the maintenance of religious instruction in the public day schools, refraining from making the use of the Westminster Catechism mandatory, but with an additional requirement under the terms of the 1856 Ordinance that teachers be certified as fit to give religious instruction by licence from an ordained minister.\(^{18}\) The 1862 measure relaxed this stipulation regarding the teachers, but then went on to demand that religious teaching in the day schools be in conformity with 'what are commonly known as Evangelical Protestant Doctrines', although subject to a parental conscience caveat.\(^{19}\) Henry Duckworth of Anderson's Bay, Dunedin, recalled his tutelage under William McKay at the local school during the 1860s: 'In those days school commenced with prayer and Bible lessons and, however it may have been with some teachers, it was a serious business with Mr McKay, who was a sincere believer in the value of the Bible as a lesson book.'\(^{20}\) An Otago Provincial Council survey of elementary day schools in 1871 found that twenty-four out of ninety schools still used the Presbyterian Shorter Catechism for religious instruction.\(^{21}\)

Some non-Presbyterian Protestants in Otago chafed at Presbyterian dominance of the province's education during the 1850s and 1860s. At a public meeting in Dunedin in March 1856, for example,

---

\(^{17}\) Cited in Reed, p.188.


\(^{19}\) D E Swinton, "The Presbyterian Church and Education in Otago", MA Thesis, University of Otago, 1935, p.82.


there was forceful criticism of the Presbyterian position with relation to education. Nevertheless, a minimalist compromise relating to nondenominational religious teaching in the province’s day schools might have been achieved, had the issue rested solely between Protestant groups without the complicating factor of Catholic migration.\textsuperscript{22} The absence of a religious establishment in a migrant situation opened up new options. The Anglican Fenton expressed hopes of cooperation in provincial education. John Hislop, inspector of the Otago Education Board and long-serving elder at Knox Church, testified in 1871 that he knew of Anglicans, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, Baptists and members of the Plymouth Brethren among the staff of the province’s public schools, all of whom, he alleged, read the Bible and gave simple religious instruction to their pupils. He also stated that he had recently certificated two women whom he knew to be Catholics.\textsuperscript{23} It proved impossible, however, to maintain an educational accord between the Protestant majority and the growing Catholic minority in Otago. Pressure from the Catholic Community, in 1864, caused the overtly Protestant wording of the Provincial Council’s 1862 Ordinance to be rescinded, an alternative requirement being substituted that:

In every school, the Scriptures shall be read daily, and such reading shall be either at the opening or close of the school, and no child whose parent or guardian shall object to such instruction shall be bound to attend at those times.\textsuperscript{24}

At issue between Catholic and Protestant was a fundamental and unbridgeable difference regarding the nature of religious authority; compromise such as that enshrined in the wording of the 1864 Ordinance was powerless to resolve the impasse which drove New Zealand education towards secularization.\textsuperscript{25} Offset against Protestant belief in the primacy of the Bible was Catholic belief in the primacy of the visible Church. Neither position was relativist; both assumed there was an absolute ‘truth’ to be known, a truth which education should pursue, but neither believed that the educational instruments of the other were apt or adequate to apprehend that truth. Any Protestant scheme for an educational ecumenicism, based on non-sectarian Biblical exposition, would inevitably fall short of the minimum, highly structured requirements of Catholicism, whose adherents had come to number in excess of ten percent of the national, and Otago, population. As

\textsuperscript{22} Mackey, p.123.  
\textsuperscript{23} Mackey, p.127.  
\textsuperscript{24} Swinton, p.83.  
\textsuperscript{25} Mackey, pp.156-157.
Catholics pressed, therefore, for state financial support for discretely denominational schools, Protestant opinion moved increasingly towards support for the separation of religious and secular education. Already, in another area where the sacramental and the temporal impinged upon each other, the Marriage Ordinance of 1847 had foreshadowed the principle of secularization. The 1852 Constitution Act also, in the very fact of its empowering the newly created provincial councils to fund and direct local educational policy, had marked an implicit but significant step towards secular schooling.

For some thirty years, therefore, central government had been signalling a trend which eventually engulfed regional religious preferences. Sensing the inevitability of further moves in the direction of secularization, by central rather than by the provincial government action, the Otago Presbyterian Synod called vainly, in 1872, for a nationwide application of the Otago provincial education system as structured under the terms of the 1864 Ordinance, a system overtly biblical and tacitly, although no longer explicitly, Protestant. In 1876 the New Zealand provinces were abolished, and access to the basics of education became a central government imperative. Any one of three systems could have emerged from the central government's intervention: secularized elementary schooling; a public system containing a supposedly non-denominational component of religious education; or state funding for overtly denominational schools, as preferred by the Catholics. Publicly-funded denominationalism had already been tried and rejected as wasteful within the provinces of Auckland and Canterbury. Overseas, the Australian state of Victoria had moved to a secular system of public education in 1872. Within the New Zealand government the advocates of each of the three viewpoints were fairly evenly divided. The two non-secular positions proved self-cancelling, however, and secularism won the day. Weighing the choices Presbyterians, New Zealand-wide, came to express preference for a free, compulsory, secular system as eventually set forth in the terms

---

of the 1877 Education Act.\textsuperscript{30} Other non-episcopalian voices, for example that of the Reverend Decimus Dolamore, Baptist Minister at Caversham, Dunedin, came also to concur.\textsuperscript{31}

The implications for Sunday schools of the 1877 legislation were enormous. Although no truancy officers existed to enforce the provisions of the 1877 Act, it was assumed that the fundamentals of literacy were now accessible to all through the day school system, whether public or private, an assumption which enabled Sunday schools to narrow and deepen their focus. To these schools fell the task of laying those foundations of religious knowledge and understanding, now excluded from the public day school programme, which were widely held to be crucial to public morality and social cohesion. The 1872 Annual Report of Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, assessing the impact on education of the Provincial Council's 1864 Ordinance, had already pointed the way ahead: 'The fact that the religious instruction of our public schools is now, from the religious divisions of the people, limited to little more than the reading of the Scriptures, is a loud call to the churches to increase the efficiency of the Sabbath school.'\textsuperscript{32}

It is no coincidence that the Otago Presbyterian Synod, in response to a Dunedin Presbytery 'Overture', created a Sabbath Schools Committee in 1872. The Sabbath schools had to be readied for their enhanced responsibilities which the schools' architects conceived in an interesting, if typical, mixture of local, imperial and apocalyptic terms; the shade of William Cargill still called the 'eyes of the world' towards Otago.\textsuperscript{33} The editor of the \textit{Evangelist}, J. Copland, writing in 1873, believed the region's Sabbath schools were not yet ready for the range of challenges ahead. He cited parental apathy at local level and the frequent failure of Sunday school membership to translate into adult church membership as grounds for concern.\textsuperscript{34} Offering the histories of ancient Greece and Rome as cautionary examples to Otago as a scion of Britain's younger Empire, he warned, in March 1876, that

\textsuperscript{30} I Breward, in D McEldowney (Ed) \textit{Presbyterians in Aotearoa}, Director of Communications for the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, Wellington, 1990, p.57.

\textsuperscript{31} I S Kemp, 'Decimus Dolamore - Pioneer Baptist Minister', in \textit{The Bulletin of the Baptist Historical Society}, No 6, August 1965.

\textsuperscript{32} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1872. Knox Presbyterian Church Archives, Dunedin.

\textsuperscript{33} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1872, Appendix (Overture from the Dunedin Presbytery), p.27.

\textsuperscript{34} \textit{Evangelist} (Dunedin), March 1873, 'Our Sabbath Schools'.
civilizations which neglected the proper religious instruction of their young inevitably perished.\(^{35}\) His outlook had become more optimistic by the crucial year of 1877, when he expressed confidence that a reinvigorated Sabbath school system in Otago was now adequate to furnish the region's education with an essential underpinning of spirituality which the day schools could no longer provide.\(^{36}\) He voiced correspondingly grave doubts regarding the ability of state secular education to properly socialize the colony's youth, accusing in particular Sir Robert Stout, champion of secularism, of a philosophic confusion between the ethically descriptive and the prescriptive;\(^{37}\) the confusion remains unresolved to this day in the structure and implementation of Social Studies curricula in New Zealand schools.

At Knox Church, Dunedin, the Reverend D.M. Stuart appears to have had doubts as to whether his church's Sabbath schools and Bible classes, despite their demonstrable vigour, were adequate, without further support, to counteract state secularism. Other church leaders showed an ongoing concern to reinforce the work of their Sunday schools. Stuart initially responded to the 1877 Act by launching a family-oriented series of catechetical sermons on Sunday evenings. The Knox congregation was urged once more, in 1878, to rally behind the Sabbath school cause.\(^{38}\) A decade later Presbyterian Synod's Sabbath School Committee reiterated the claims of Sunday schooling upon the attention of the whole province:

> The exclusion of distinctively Bible teaching from schools which are under the control of the state has magnified the importance of the instruction given in the Sabbath Schools, and your committee note with much thankfulness the growing desire of the Church to promote the efficiency of an institution whose sole aim is to instruct the children in the knowledge of those truths which alone can mould then into good and happy members of society, and make them meet for the kingdom of God.\(^{39}\)

\(^{35}\) *Evangelist* (Dunedin), March 1876, 'The Origins of Sabbath Schools'.

\(^{36}\) Breward, p.4.

\(^{37}\) *Evangelist* (Dunedin), June 1878, p.12.


\(^{39}\) *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland*, 1884, Appendix (Report of the Committee on Sabbath Schools), p.11.
Despite such efforts, a quarterly statement from the Session of Knox Church in March 1900 reported ignorance of Scripture as being rife among young people outside the pale of the Bible class, attributing this condition to two decades of secularism in the public schools.\textsuperscript{40}

Evangelical Protestants had not, in fact, foreseen the full implications of a secularised public education system. When they realised their mistake, their reaction generated a new dimension of educational debate of relevance to the future operation of Sabbath schooling, namely the Bible-in-Schools controversy. Protestants had wrongly imagined that objections, mainly Catholic, to a continuation of Bible reading in public schools could be brushed aside, and that a strand of non-sectarian Scriptural teaching could be maintained within a secular system.\textsuperscript{41} With the mistake discovered and the traditional symbiosis of day and Sabbath schooling lost, variations on the Reverend J.H. McKenzie's 'Nelson scheme' were explored in Otago. McKenzie had been a minister at Wallacetown before his transfer to Nelson province and had shared the gestation of his plan with the Otago Presbyterian Synod.\textsuperscript{42} The Synod Sabbath Schools Committee, looking forward to a revived symbiosis between the work of day and Sunday schools, was able to report hopefully in 1882 that 'advantage has been taken of the provision in the Education Act for religious instruction within school hours, leaving the legal minimum of four hours for secular instruction'.\textsuperscript{43} Parents could opt into the scheme on behalf of their children. Dunedin's Anglicans, in their Diocesan Synod, expressed more overtly denominational aims, petitioning the government in 1884 for 'the communication of religious instruction by Ministers of Religion, or persons duly authorised by them, to the children belonging to their respective communions during school hours'.\textsuperscript{44} Port Chalmers, on the other hand, became the scene for a militant ecumenicism. There in 1884 Presbyterian, Wesleyan and Congregationalist ministers pooled resources to bring the Bible twice weekly into the local public school; the children's lunch break was altered to enable the ministers to teach on Tuesdays and Fridays between 9.30 and 10.00 a.m. The Reverend W.M. Grant, of the Congregational Church, found himself controlling groups in excess of 140 scholars, observing 'this is of course far too many for one person to be able to manage properly, but I have to make the best endeavour possible to teach

\textsuperscript{40} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Quarterly Statement, March 1900. Knox Presbyterian Church Archives
\textsuperscript{41} Evangelist (Dunedin), 1 March 1873, p.5.
\textsuperscript{42} Breward, pp.37-38.
\textsuperscript{43} Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1882, Appendix (Report of the Committee on Sabbath Schools), p.17.
them a portion of God's word.\textsuperscript{45} Two years later an unsympathetic school committee rescheduled the classes to the less convenient starting time of 9.00 a.m., resulting in a 20 per cent drop in attendance. The three clergymen thereupon withdrew their charges, totalling 327 children, from the day school to the Presbyterian church premises for tuition at the preferred time of 9.30. An escort of some forty pro-Bible parents saw the scholars safely back to school at the close of the first such session, intending to force the school doors if the children were not readmitted.\textsuperscript{46} This proved not to be necessary - and the offending committee fell at the next election.

Bible-in-schools issues were still alive at the turn of the century, with ongoing implications for the region's Sunday schooling. Clutha Presbytery offered the Otago Presbyterian Synod in 1899 a more developed plan relating to Bible-in-schools than anything which had been tried in the province before, a scheme more closely allied to the Nelson system, proposing that statutory minima for secular teaching could still be met if schools, on at least one day of the week, delayed opening for their 'legal' work until 10 a.m. The use of the school premises before the stipulated opening time would then lie in the power of the school committees to grant as they saw fit.\textsuperscript{47} In this way, outside the framework of the legal hours yet on a regular weekly basis, ministers or their substitutes could, saving the parental right of withdrawal of any child, have access to the public schools' classes for religious instruction. Generally, however, public apathy combined with a shortage of suitable teacher 'substitutes' to vitiate experiments of the Nelson type, and reports and forecasts in the Otago Presbyterian Synod proceedings were not optimistic regarding outcomes: 'The attempts which have been made in many parts of the country at various times to supply this want [of Biblical instruction] outside of school hours have either signally failed, and been abandoned, or have attained only a very limited amount of success.'\textsuperscript{48} The burden of Biblical education, therefore, fell squarely on the Sunday schools. The Sabbath school teachers of the Presbyterian First Church, Dunedin, voiced their

\textsuperscript{44} Church of England Diocese of Dunedin Synod Proceedings, 1884. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. PSOi5 Chu.
\textsuperscript{45} W M Grant, Record of Services, Visits, Meetings, matters of personal interest, connect with the Congregational Church, Port Chalmers, New Zealand, 1 April 1884. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
\textsuperscript{46} Grant, 1 June 1886.
\textsuperscript{47} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1899, Appendix (Report of the Committee on Bible Reading out of School Hours), p.57.
\textsuperscript{48} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1899, Appendix (Report of the Committee on Bible Reading in Schools), p.73.
sense of the obligation: 'Let the work in which we are engaged be so vigorously carried out as to more than counterbalance this evil [of "godless schools"].49

The fears expressed by Otago's Sunday school leaders and teachers regarding 'godless' day schooling were compounded by the wider effects of socio-economic change in and beyond the region. Gold rush aspirations, mediated from province to nation through the agency of Vogelism, took Otago and New Zealand through a forty-year cycle of boom, bust and recovery between 1860 and 1900. Fin de siècle New Zealand was left breathless but optimistic, its emergent sense of identity swaddled in a new transport network and nurtured by the growing proportion of locally-born among the population. Optimism, however, did not come cheaply. Anxiety was fuelled by economic downturn during the 1880s, and was not readily assuaged by signs of recovery in the ensuing decade. Within Otago, during the depressed conditions of the 1880s, families struggled. The exodus of unemployed male labour to Australia left a legacy of broken homes. The phenomenon of solo parenthood became more common, as also did that of the two income family, striving for sufficiency on inadequate wages. The availability of female 'sweated' labour depressed male pay rates and exacerbated male unemployment. Within Dunedin, until the development of the tram facilitated the development of a wider suburbia, the plight of the children of the poor was plainly visible to more affluent neighbours; the hovels of the Stafford Street enclave abutted the residences of the wealthy in High Street. Accordingly, the successive Creche and Kindergarten Movements arose to offer redemptive, middle class mythology to the working classes' fallen offspring.50

The more expansive conditions of the 1870s and 1890s, on the other hand, engendered their own alternative crop of anxieties among church and Sunday school leaders in Otago and Southland, to the effect that materialism would erode more worthwhile social values, and that price would cheapen the things which most were priceless; myth, it was feared, was for sale. The Presbyterian Synod found that backsliding from the ideals, or even the norms, of Scottish worship was not confined to the labouring classes who, traditionally, had been seen as less godly than their social betters:

We find in this colony outside of our churches multitudes who had been brought up in Christian homes, who had been members of the Church in the Old Country, but who

49 Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Record of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 17 August 1887. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Dunedin.
have completely severed their connection with the Church since coming to the Colony, except perhaps to the slight extent that their children attend our Sabbath schools.\textsuperscript{51}

From North Dunedin the Rev. J. Gibson Smith lamented what he saw as a coarsening of the settlement's moral fibre which worked to the detriment of all classes, manifesting itself among the wealthy as 'a shameless and cynical worldliness which confesses without a blush that it lives for self alone.'\textsuperscript{52} Elsewhere, it was claimed that 'the very newness of the land' was a 'hindrance to genuine piety.' The colony was 'lacking in historical interest' and bereft of those traditions which 'nourish sentiment and kindle imagination.'\textsuperscript{53} Seduced by hope of material profit or the lure of entertainment, people increasingly condoned the desecration of the Sabbath by highway freight and harbour traffic. They showed a developing tendency to tolerate relaxed standards as expressed in 'promiscuous dancing' and 'attendance at theatrical performances'. They neglected to attend prayer meetings - 'in our towns especially.'\textsuperscript{54}

Most seriously, from a church point of view, the habit of family worship had been eroded, the Presbyterian Synod asserting unequivocally that 'in the great majority of households this important duty is neglected.'\textsuperscript{55} The very increases in Sunday school numbers, which were so marked in the 1870s and 1880s, were greeted with suspicion, as a sign that the family was abnegating its own crucial role in religious education. Increasingly the Otago Presbyterian Synod cast its Sabbath schools in a pivotal role as 'the Children's Church, undertaking what was once done in the public school, as well as what should be done in the family, but which to a greater or lesser extent is now neglected.'\textsuperscript{56} On the other hand, a congregational meeting at Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, in 1894 wondered whether Sabbath schooling undermined legitimate parental authority by providing

\textsuperscript{51} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1890, Appendix (Report of the Committee on the State of Religion for the Year 1890), p.35.
\textsuperscript{52} North Dunedin Monthly, May 1891, p.4.
\textsuperscript{54} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1869, Appendix (Report of the Committee on the State of Religion and Sabbath Observance), p.28.
\textsuperscript{55} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1880, Appendix, p.7.
\textsuperscript{56} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1893, Appendix p.62.
children with an alternative instructional framework.57 'Senator', in the St Andrew's Church Mirror, pondered the implications of peer group influence as the colonial family slid away from its more strictly patriarchal traditions.58

The Presbyterian Synod castigated the 'godless' family for sowing the seeds of its own demise in its failure to uphold the traditional bases of its claims to authority and respect.59 The Reverend Dr Michael Watt of Green Island, contemplating the changing role of the father in the Otago family, perceived that 'a wretched individualism has crept into modern religious life', leading fathers to allow their children independent judgment on points of duty and latitude in choice of Sabbath school and church attendance. Watt foresaw 'nothing but evil' ensuing from such 'domestic anarchy'.60 The Reverend James Chisholm enlarged on Watt's concerns, condemning the readiness of parents to condone their children's taste in amusement, and their refusal to rein in their teenagers' leisure activities.61 At Port Chalmers W.M. Grant fought against parental permissiveness, losing church adherents through his stand.62

The products of colonial parenting left some contemporary church leaders bemused. J. Gibson Smith has left us an interesting picture of the native-born male, depicting:

... a certain type of young colonial, growing up and making his appearance both in the towns and in the country districts, to whom religion is simply nothing. He is not particularly given to drink, nor even to gambling. He usually marries early, say at the age of 20 or 21, his wife being on the average 18. He is very fond of fun and of good living, and of a comfortable and easy billet. He talks a peculiar language of his own,

---

58 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. The Mirror: A Literary Journal for the Mental, Moral and Religious Improvement of the Members, pp.15, 40, 63. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. BB 3.6.
62 Grant, 25 January 1884.
composed of terms drawn from the racecourse, the farmyard, the cricket and football field, or the saw mill.\textsuperscript{63}

It is debatable to what extent teenage mores in the settlement were in fact changing, or to what extent such perceptions were the product of later nineteenth century Otago's romanticized expectations of its youth, a side effect of Romanticism's glorification of childhood. The well-publicized phenomenon of 'larrikinism' which scandalized the socially-correct on Dunedin's streets was to some extent a function, not so much of shifting patterns of teenage behaviour, but rather of a changing social yardstick. Gibson Smith has left us a pen portrait of the larrikin as someone who:

\begin{quote}
...will rob your orchard with never a pang of conscience, but he holds it a sin of deepest dye to peach on a partner. He has the minimum of respect for the powers that be, but then he fears no danger and will run any risk to help a comrade in distress. His heart is as hard as steel towards the sufferings he causes to his parents and friends, but he can easily - too easily - be melted to pity by the tale of some poor fellow "down on his luck" whom he never saw in his life before ... The larrikin's moral law is summarily comprehended in the one word "comradeship"\textsuperscript{64}
\end{quote}

Smith has, in fact, sketched for us a personified oxymoron, wherein the cult of 'mateship' competes with the cult of the 'man alone'. Interestingly, he has anticipated a tension the dynamism of which has provided the driving force behind much of New Zealand's emergent national literature. For Gibson Smith, the answer to the perceived larrikin problem lay not in an educational, maturational process but in a Christian conversion which would meet the larrikin at his point of present need, inviting the 'man alone' to pilgrimage and transferring mateship from a secular to a spiritual foundation.

The concept of conversion became a powerful factor in Christian education in the later nineteenth century. The term 'conversion' by definition implies change, but it was nevertheless interpreted in different ways by different authorities and commentators, clerical and lay, scholarly and amateur. The Reverend Horace Bushnell posited, as 'the true idea of Christian education', that 'the child is to grow up a Christian, and never know himself as being otherwise', arguing for the power of the Holy

\textsuperscript{63} North Dunedin Monthly, November 1891, p.18.
\textsuperscript{64} North Dunedin Monthly, June 189, p.3.
Spirit to generate a saving change of heart in any life, however young; logically therefore, Bushnell advocated infant baptism.\(^65\) Other commentators required conversion to be an experience consciously apprehended, but these again might differ as to whether conversion was the departure or destination point of the spiritual journey. At the age of 22 Fanny Bethune, day school and Presbyterian Sabbath school teacher of Invercargill, clearly remembered her teenage conversion. 'When I was fourteen years old, God brought me to a knowledge of myself and of Himself, and showed me that there is no true Happiness apart from Him'.\(^66\) For Fanny Bethune, arguing from personal experience, conversion was an encounter crucial in its literal sense and initiated by the Holy Spirit; it defined and empowered the human self in and through relationship with the Divine. Fanny Bethune knew that she had experienced the moment of spiritual rebirth which had so puzzled the biblical Nicodemus. The American liberal theologian, Henry Ward Beecher, differed from evangelical revivalists in seeing conversion as a product rather than a cause, as the outcome of an intuitively driven process, rather than a single, definitive, generative event. A Beecherite conversion was an aggregate of *al fresco*, Romantic encounters with God-in-Nature. Beecher was willing to tolerate proto-fundamentalist revivalism as a useful intermediary mechanism which sensitised public awareness and tended towards moral and social progress. Repelled, however, by his own father's anxious, Calvinist creed which demanded evidence of childhood conversion as proof of Election, Beecher shrank from goading the young with induced fears of damnation and Hell; he remembered well the feelings of bewilderment and repugnance which such psycho-religious manipulation had inflicted on him in boyhood.\(^67\)

To Otago's Sunday school teachers of the 1880s and 1890s, challenged by the secularism of the period, the concept of childhood conversion, whether Nicodemian or Beecherite, offered a new approach and wider opportunities. It was the Nicodemian model which came to predominate. Romanticism's worldwide influence in the sphere of religion, interacting with Evangelicalism with respect to childhood conversion, radically changed the focus of Sabbath schooling after 1870, and


the Sunday schools of Otago and Southland followed the trend. In emphasising the primacy of heart over head, Romanticism denied that meaningful experience required a highly developed analytical faculty. Sunday school teachers warmed to the perception that children can function intuitively more readily than their parents. They understood from Christ's teaching that there is a childlike dimension to the Kingdom of Heaven. The Kingdom, Christ implied, is an organic network of relationships between God the Father and the corpus of believers. The conceptual sophistication of adulthood can kill rather than quicken the nerve fibres of communication, deadening the ear of conscience to the promptings of the Spirit. As early as the 1790s, British Sunday schools had actively sought conversion among their children. 68 D.L. Moody, promoted conversion in the Sunday schools of mid-nineteenth century America. The Australasian Methodist Conference, in 1868, posited the Sunday school as a 'soul saving institution'. 69 Invercargill's Fanny Bethune, born in 1860, must have undergone her conversion experience, in a Presbyterian setting, in 1874. Quoting an American source, Dunedin's Evangelist, in its January 1875 issue, sought to legitimize the concept of youthful conversion before a conservative and doubtful Otago Presbyterian public, prone to dismiss the spiritual responses of childhood as ephemeral emotionalism:

The possibility of bringing religious truth effectually to the mind and acceptance of children, and of bringing children in the real acceptance of its power, to the knowledge of the Saviour and to an intelligent enjoyment of all the privileges of the Christian household, has been an attainment of the present generation of the church. 70

Ten years of age or even younger was suggested as affording sufficient maturity for access to the Lord's Table, and a special value was attributed to a 'literal, infantine faith'. To the Evangelist, the focus on the conversion of youth represented a shift in church thinking as revolutionary and significant as the Evangelical launching of overseas mission a hundred years earlier; it opened up a vibrantly new field of domestic mission work, among the young.

---

68 Laqueur, pp.168-169.
69 Cited in Hanson, p.21.
70 Evangelist (Dunedin), January 1875, 'Children and the Modern Church'. See also Chapter 8 for further discussion of the pursuit of conversion in Sunday schools in Otago.
"And after childhood 'conversion', what then?" might have been Beecher's response to the new trend. Obviously a process of spiritual maturation, a florescence of 'holiness' in the Keswick tradition, would have to follow the pivotal experience of conversion; babes in Christ needed weaning from spiritual milk to meat.\footnote{71} The weaning process was complicated for Sunday schools by intellectual changes which cast doubt on old certainties; reflexive catechetical responses were not adequate in a debate which challenged the very premises of paedehism, a debate which touched Otago and produced a range of reactions among the settlement's religious leaders. Across the western world methods of scientific and historical analysis were being applied to religious materials. A New Philology challenged the divine authority of the Hebrew language.\footnote{72} The Higher Criticism, a term first used in 1881 to describe an application of historical methodology to the fundamentals of Scriptural text, challenged catechetical exegesis on issues such as creation or the atonement, shaking the Biblical foundations of Evangelical Protestant belief and opening revelation to rational scrutiny.\footnote{73} Evangelical elements in Britain tried in vain to censor what they regarded as the pernicious influence of German scholarship, which was in the vanguard of these revolutionary intellectual developments. Ripples of the controversy soon reached Dunedin. The Australian Freethought lecturer, Charles Bright, visiting Otago during the year 1876, drew crowds of up to 3000.\footnote{74} Spiritualist experiments, attempting to synthesize religion and the inductive methods of the physical sciences, attracted considerable interest in Dunedin from 1870 onwards, drawing scathing comment from the Evangelist in October 1872.\footnote{75} Christian reaction in Otago to the new intellectual trends was by no means all negative. Rationalism in Otago shared much common ground with post-millennial Evangelicalism in the belief that the settlement was building for a better future; nascent social science partnered religious faith in Otago's socio-spiritual laboratory.

\footnote{71} For a summary of the origins of the Keswick Convention and a discussion of the 'higher life' movement, see A S Wilson, Definite Experience: Convention Aid and Deterrents, London, 1937.
Church reactions in Otago to innovative and liberal trends in theology were, in fact, diverse, both amongst clerics and laity. The Reverend Dr Rutherford Waddell, minister at St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, had already worked through doubt and dichotomy to a personal synthesis during his student days in Belfast, welcoming the stimulus of theological controversy and finding, in the personality of Christ, an integrative force sufficient to give coherence to his world view. Dr James Copland on the other hand, editor of the Evangelist, moved from a cautiously liberal to a proto-fundamentalist doctrinal position in response to the growing crisis of faith which he perceived in contemporary society.

Lay church members often reacted more conservatively than the clergy to the newly emerging issues, as evidenced for example in the prolonged and acrimonious debate at St Andrew's Church, Dunedin, regarding the introduction of instrumental music, or in contemporary events at the Presbyterian First Church. Here the Reverend J. Gibb wore his Calvinism too lightly for traditionalists in his own congregation and, at the instigation of long-serving elder, A.C. Begg, was successively arraigned for heresy before the Dunedin Presbytery and the Otago and Southland Synod. Conservative, rural lay opinion, marshalled by the Invercargill cleric, A.H. Stobo, finally swung Synod's vote against Gibb.

The more reactionary wings of religion in Otago, both Catholic and Protestant, vied in vigour of response to the Rationalist threat. The infant Salvation Army and Bishop Patrick Moran became unlikely polemical bedfellows. Evangelical revivalism blazed a 'sawdust trail' through conservative, rural areas of southern New Zealand during the closing decades of the nineteenth century. In the Catlins area of South Otago, the Baptists made common cause with the Salvation Army, with Mesrs

---

77 J Collie (Ed), Rutherford Waddell: Memoir and Addresses, A H Reed, Dunedin, 1932, pp.31-34.
79 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Session Minutes, 26 July 1875, 16 October 1876, 14 May 1877, 4 June 1883, 13 August 1883. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
William Faulkner and William McKenzie inviting two of the Army's 'Hallelujah lassies' from Balclutha to join them at Owaka and reinforce their preaching; the founding of the Owaka Baptist Church in 1887 was the eventual outcome.\(^{82}\)

Reaction was more muted from the ranks of Anglicanism and Congregationalism in Otago; among these, liberal theology was gaining ground. The Anglican Bishop Nevill played down the activity of Freethought in Dunedin as an understandable reaction to the city's Calvinist heritage.\(^{83}\) Among the Congregationalists the Reverend Dr T. Roseby, in an interesting farewell address to the Moray Place community in 1885, outlined what he saw as the issues facing contemporary Christians. He highlighted militarism, nationalism and imperialism as forces active, whether for good or ill, in the contemporary world; he cautiously suspended judgement on their long-term outcomes. He touched on scientific and technological change, seeing these as generating, through the channels of popular education, an unsettling although not necessarily unfruitful spirit of questioning. He alluded to the Higher Criticism and the quest for a 'historical Jesus', much espoused by the Ritschlian school of thought in Germany. He counselled his congregation, faced with so much that was uncertain, to adopt a policy of positive avoidance; he argued that it was more fruitful to sidestep debate on the imponderables and concentrate rather on practical manifestations of Christianity in philanthropy. In an Otago still traumatised by two decades of population explosion, bled by economic depression and dirtied by liquor abuse, Roseby saw much opportunity for the outworking of a social gospel.\(^{84}\)

Many among the Sunday school leaders of Otago and Southland, across the denominations and especially among the laity, shared neither Roseby's adroitness in sidestep nor his optimism concerning the direction and impact of change. During the Raikes Centenary celebrations in Otago in 1880, the chairman of the celebratory proceedings proclaimed a state of intellectual siege, expressing the hope that the Sabbath schools would successfully uphold the claims of Biblical fundamentalism.\(^{85}\) Otago's Sunday schools after 1870 needed to reassess the premises of their


\(^{84}\) Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin. Minutes of Church Meetings, 3 December 1885. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG36.1.

\(^{85}\) Proceedings of the Raikes Centenary Celebration, in *Supplement to the New Zealand Christian Record* (Dunedin), 3 December 1880, p.4. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
operation and belief if they were to maintain that flexibility of outreach which had rendered them severely so effective in previous generations of service in England and Scotland. Particularly disquieting to the Otago schools had been the apparent appeal to Dunedin working class males of public lectures, often confrontational and provocative in style, delivered by Rationalists. The local Sunday schools were touched on a raw spot, the general failure of their outreach to larrikins. They were falling short at the very point where Raikes had succeeded. Concern was strong in Otago Sabbath schools lest the creeping cancer of religious scepticism grow from the larrikin ulcer to canker the deeper core of male church support, and the Sunday schools experimented with both traditionally conservative and innovative remedies. The senior outgrowths of Sunday schooling, the Bible classes and Christian Endeavour groups, became the essential vehicles for both sorts of remedy, as a range of activities, catechetical, devotional, educational and social, grew out of the Sunday schools' reappraisal of their work. Bible classes, quite often in the hands of church ministers, tended to explore doctrine. Christian Endeavour groups, among which control was devolved into the hands of the scholars, tended to seek reassurance through an immediate experience of holiness.

The annual report of Knox Church, Dunedin, for 1875 stressed the importance, for the church's teenagers and young adults, of attendance at the minister's Bible Class so that their minds might be reconfirmed in the basics of belief.\textsuperscript{86} The Sabbath School Committee of Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church asserted, in 1893, that 'in the great conflict between Christianity and unbelief, the battle will be won or lost in the Sabbath School and the Bible Class'.\textsuperscript{87} The First Church Committee was not, however, advocating specifically a protofundamentalist strategy. The Committee came to see its Bible class particularly as the appropriate forum in which to tackle deep philosophical and doctrinal issues, raised by the growth of the physical and historical sciences, which were not readily amenable to pulpit address and the resolution of which seemed 'indispensable to a robust and intelligent faith'; dialogue and debate were to supplement ingrained catechetical response; reason and conceptual grasp were to validate reflex.\textsuperscript{88} Another generation passed, and a world war was fought, before Otago's Sunday school and Bible class lay workers became generally reconciled to theological liberalism, with the region's teachers of the 1920s being counselled that 'Christianity must be

\textsuperscript{86} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report, 1875.

\textsuperscript{87} Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1893, Report on the Sabbath School. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Dunedin.

\textsuperscript{88} Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1893, Report on the Bible Class.
recognised as a progressive historic movement', and being urged to find a resolution of doubt and dichotomy, as had Rutherford Waddell, in the personality of Christ.89

To the Protestant religious leaders of an isolated community emerging from migration to settlement, imperialistic in their Britishness, idealistic in their hopes, yet hard pressed by socio-economic and political change at the local level, and not so remote as to be spared the insistent pressure of world intellectual trends, Sunday schooling came, after 1870, to assume a critical importance. From the foundation of the Otago settlement in 1848, the symbiosis of education across home, day school and Sabbath school had always been assumed, and not only by Presbyterians. During the closing three decades of the nineteenth century that symbiosis could no longer be taken for granted, and the linkages became matters for conscious and urgent attention. Otago's Scottish founding fathers had imagined the foundations of their belief to be portable. The act of migration, interacting with the emerging intellectual trends of western culture, put a question mark after their spelling of 'truth'. Education became overtly compartmentalised. Materialism, hand-in-hand with secularism, led Otago's young society towards a vision of the future deviant from Free Kirk purity. Yet the benevolent state interventionism of the Liberal government of the 1890s could be viewed in Otago terms as a social expression of Covenant; myths transmogrify but do not die. Both visions, that of the pioneer idealist of 1848 and that of the Otago-born colonial of the century's turn, shared a quasi-post millennial optimism. Both sought the creation of a stable, prosperous, cohesive community. Both broadly accepted that the shared values essential to the maintenance of such a community had to be underpinned by a religious substratum. The absence of a definitive religious 'establishment' heightened the role of Sunday schools in providing this underpinning. A wide spectrum of parents sent their children and youth to Sunday school and Bible class in counter-proportion to the increasing hold of secularism on public education. A significant number of Otago's young people themselves sought an experiential Christology through conversion and the subsequent quest for holiness. The large degree of public support which the Sunday schools and Bible classes in fact attracted in Otago and Southland between 1870 and 1900 is a measure of the cohesion in diversity which the emerging settlement managed to achieve. Day schools could provide head-knowledge, but it was in the more intimate, interactive programmes of Sabbath school and Bible class that a migrant society socialized its young into the deeper levels of its mythology.

89 'Two Lectures to Sunday School Teachers: The Science and the Art of Teaching: The Moral Function of Literature', addresses delivered in Dunedin, 2 August 1923. Among T R Fleming, Papers, Alexander
Chapter 6  Homestead And Run - The Structure, Organization And Funding of Sunday Schools in Otago And Southland During the Later Nineteenth Century

Sabbath school ecumenicism, initially a function of the interaction between Sunday schooling and pioneering conditions, persisted in Otago and Southland into settlement days. Isabella Ker, Richardson scholar and the fourth woman to graduate with masters qualifications from Otago University, maintained the tradition of non-denominational Sunday schooling in the backblocks of rural Southland well into the twentieth century. Isabella Ker's marriage, in March 1891, to Queenstown storekeeper, William Cochran, had taken her to a bush block, and initially to a reinforced tent dwelling at Te Tua in the Waiau district. 'For years she ran a nondenominational Sunday school in her home, and worked both for the Presbyterian and Methodist churches. She also ran evening classes to teach adult labourers to read and write'.

Denominationalism, on the other hand, increasingly contested the ground with ecumenicism as pioneering shaded into settlement in Otago and Southland after 1870. Emergent communities expressed their sense of identity in increasingly well-defined institutions. Sunday schools, which had often served as coalescent nuclei of community in pioneer times, found their structures and procedures becoming formalised, in line with wider community trends. At the migrant frontier ecumenicism had expressed a generalised community aspiration. Once the lineaments of community were defined and recognisable, worshippers could return to the denominationalism of their several heritages, safe in the knowledge that the varied strands of denomination were held together in a wider weave. As settlements achieved prosperity, religious and educational facilities could be provided and staffed on a more appropriate scale than had been possible before. Churches seeking to expand their outreach would look to the Sunday schools, which had often preceded them, as agencies for the recruitment and retention of a denominationally-defined membership. Methodists especially gave an overtly denominational focus to their Sunday school operations; thus the Broad Bay Methodist Sunday School on the Otago Peninsula asserted categorically, in 1877, that 'this school shall be conducted in distinct and avowed connection with the Wesleyan Church, and shall

---

in every particular way be worked in harmony with its arrangements, and with a view to its increase and benefit. The increasing formalisation of Sabbath schooling in Otago and Southland after 1870 did not, however, destroy the movement's capacity for innovation and experiment, whether in structure, curriculum or pedagogy.

The interface between church and Sunday school long remained, therefore, an area of sensitivity. The Reverend T.L. Davies of Thames was thinking, perhaps, of the political history of an earlier British colony, later the United States, when he described the emerging Sabbath school structures that he saw in colonial New Zealand. Writing in the New Zealand Baptist in December 1882, he likened the New Zealand Sunday school to 'a religious educational republic, making its own laws, electing its own officers, and self-governed - friendly, but not united with the church.' Davies was not at ease with this situation. He believed that some clergy took too little interest in the Sunday schools, while some schools were jealously inclined to guard their independence, with 'unnatural and detrimental' results both for church and school.

Problems of definition in the relations between Sunday school and church were not unique, either to Otago or to New Zealand as a whole. In Britain, written constitutions were adopted to counter an earlier Sunday school autonomy which had worried many established clergy; the rules of a constitution could be so framed as to integrate the life of the Sunday school more smoothly into the wider life of the church. Factors specific to the region influenced Sunday schools in Otago and Southland towards the adoption and local adaptation of such British models. The gold rushes had created a large, fluid population, the developing requirements of which had to be serviced. There was, after 1878, a strongly felt need in the region that Sunday school delivery should be made more standardised and, by implication, more easily monitored and more efficient. In the light of the secularization enshrined in the 1877 Education Act, it seemed important to heirs of a Scottish

---

2 Interview with Mrs Lorraine Bruce, Dunedin, 5 April 1998. Mrs Bruce remembers, as a girl in Invercargill, attending both Presbyterian Sunday school on Sunday mornings and interdenominational Sunday school on Sunday afternoons.

3 Broad Bay Methodist Church. Sunday School Minute Book, 26 September 1877. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 30/6/01. See also Frank Hanson, The Sunday School in New Zealand Methodism, Auckland Colleges Printery for the Wesley Historical Society New Zealand, Auckland, 1998, pp.21-22.

4 T L Davies, 'The Relation of the Sunday School to the Church', in The New Zealand Baptist (Christchurch), Vol II, No 12, December 1882, p.177.

Presbyterian tradition to ensure that religious education was delivered with all the perceived rigour and efficiency of the 'three R's' in the day schools. Written constitutions were adopted on the initiative of the Sunday schools themselves in Otago and Southland as mechanisms for promoting cohesion; large urban Sunday schools with several sub-branches felt the need to facilitate internal consistency. Commonly such constitutions were modelled on published recommendations of the London Sunday School Union.

Extant examples of such constitutions, from Otago and elsewhere in New Zealand, afford valuable insight into the organization of the Sunday schools of the period. A surviving set of 'Rules for the Wellington Methodist Sunday School', dated September 1868, suggests a close identity of administrative practice across the denominations and in different localities. In Otago and Southland, a foundation list of rules for the Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School survives from July 1863. The greater detail and rigidity of the rules framed in 1877 for the Broad Bay Methodist Sunday School, to which allusion has already been made, suggest the heightened imperative for definition, felt by schools and churches alike, after 1870. Constitutions for the post-1870 period have been preserved also from the Balclutha Methodist Sunday School, and Dunedin's Knox and Mornington Presbyterian Church Sunday Schools. An informal set of administrative guidelines for Sunday school teachers survives, penned into roll records of the St Andrew's Presbyterian Sunday School in 1876. St Paul's Presbyterian Church Sabbath School, Invercargill, framed its rules on the Mornington model in 1893.

---

6 See 'Knox Church Sabbath Schools: Rules' and 'Rules of the Presbyterian Sabbath School, Mornington: 1 October 1889'. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
9 Port Chalmers Methodist Church. Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes, 10 July 1863. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 52/7/1.
10 Balclutha Methodist Church. Sunday School and Youth Committee Records. Minutes of Teachers' Meeting, 17 August 1876. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
11 St Andrew's Sabbath School, Dunedin. Roll Book kept by Miss Agnes Park, 1876. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. Misc MS 905.
12 St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 3 March 1893. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
The wording of constitutions from Otago and Southland at this time emphasizes the role of Sabbath schooling as a complement rather than an alternative to participation in formal church worship. The published guidelines of the London Sunday School Union assumed both morning and afternoon classes. In Otago the Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School, in 1863, reflected the English tradition, meeting both at 10am and 2.30pm, and with the morning classes spending at least part of their programme in church under the supervision of their respective teachers. Otago practice, Scottish-rooted, favoured Sunday afternoon classes, typically between 2.30 and 3.30 pm, leaving both teachers and children free to attend family worship in church in the morning. The Balclutha Methodist Sunday School's sessions ran from 3pm to 4.30pm. The Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School in Dunedin met initially at 11a.m., but switched after two years of operation to an afternoon meeting time. The expected benefits of an afternoon schedule did not always accrue. Presbyterian church leaders became concerned at a perceived trend among the young to attend Sabbath school only. The Sabbath Schools Committee of the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod encouraged ministers to work actively to bridge the gap between Sabbath public worship and Sabbath afternoon classes. It counselled both parents and clergy that 'the regeneration of the young should more frequently form part of all family and public devotion.'

The Otago Presbyterian Synod's Sabbath Schools Committee looked both to the ministers and to the wider leadership of the region's several churches to foster links with the Sunday schools. It was normal for the church minister, ex officio, to act as Sunday school president; the Mornington Presbyterian Sabbath school's constitution reflected typical practice in this respect. The Presbyterian Synod's Sabbath Schools Committee advised ministers to raise their profiles in the Sunday schools, visiting Sabbath classes on a regular basis. From time to time Synod earmarked a particular Sunday for family services. Clergy were encouraged to offer quarterly services specifically targeted at the young and to include a 'bairn's portion' as a regular feature of their weekly

---

14 Port Chalmers Methodist Church. Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes, 10 July 1863.
15 Balclutha Methodist Church. Minutes of Teachers' Meeting, 17 August 1876.
16 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1872, Appendix, p.17.
17 Rules of the Presbyterian Sabbath School, Mornington. Also The Sunday School Handbook, p.28.
ministrations. By 1883, two ministers within the Dunedin Presbytery were reported as preaching family sermons on a quarterly basis and three as including a 'children's portion' in each Sunday morning service. Synod offered no guidance regarding an appropriate content for children's services, and some ministers evidently fell back on the familiar catechism. In Oamaru, one minister made a practice of testing the children on their catechetical knowledge in the presence of the whole church congregation on the first Sunday of every month. Synod noted another as preaching fortnightly catechetical sermons. Synod's Sabbath Schools Committee also urged the session and deacons' courts, in 1879, to 'interest themselves efficiently in the work of the Sabbath Schools', and to further the schools 'as an integral part of the Church's organization'.

Despite the high profile of the minister and church courts in Sabbath school affairs, the day-to-day organization of the schools across the range of Protestant denominations remained in the hands of the teachers themselves, acting through their monthly or quarterly meetings. Methodism set out an internationally standardised code for the running of its Sunday school teachers' meetings. Australasian Wesleyan Sunday school recommendations listed fifteen wide-ranging questions as the basis for a typical agenda for a Methodist Sunday school organizational meeting. The questions covered roll movements and attendance patterns among both teachers and children, incidence of sickness, the conduct of teachers, evidence of spiritual growth and conversions among the children, current equipment needs, approval of library accessions and general issues relating to the welfare of the school. Records of the teachers' meetings at the Linden Sunday School, Dunedin, show this question format being followed to the letter, the responses yielding precise statistical data for the years 1878 to 1894. Where responses could not be quantified, however, the answers given were vague. The question 'Do the children make any visible improvement in divine knowledge?' was usually answered 'Yes' or 'Most do' or, in July 1883, 'it is thought they do'. Teachers offered little supporting evidence beyond generalized claims of attentiveness in their classes, usually among senior girls rather than senior boys. Few specific instances of conversion were noted, until the

18 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1878, Appendix, p.8. Also 1879, Appendix, p.7.
19 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1882, Appendix, p.15. See also 1882, Appendix, p.17, and 1885, Appendix, p.66
21 Australasian Wesleyan Methodist Church. Minutes of the Annual Conference, May 1875. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLT 287.194M
1890s.22 Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School records are similarly detailed regarding attendance and tentative regarding conversion data; a Sunday School Teachers' Minutes entry for 18 May 1881 states that some scholars have 'given satisfactory evidence' of conversion. An entry twelve months later states that further conversions have taken place, but again provides specifics neither as to numbers nor the evidence on which the claim is based.23

Presbyterianism, always more doctrinally focused and less systems focused than Methodism, never attempted to dictate the precise format of its teachers' organizational meetings. Instead broad guidelines reflected Presbyterianism's quasi-democratic heritage. It was normal for each Presbyterian school to hold an annual general meeting of teachers at which the school's executive was chosen, the annual report presented, constitutional amendments considered and policy for the ensuing year decided. Knox Presbyterian Church rules stipulated that any proposed change to the school's constitution required a minimum of three weeks' public notice before the teachers' annual meeting. At the Mornington school the annual general meeting was calendared for the first Monday in February.

More frequent organizational meetings, involving either a committee of the whole staff or a sub-group, depending on the size of the school, underpinned the working life of Presbyterian Sabbath schooling. The Mornington Sunday School's constitution required that teachers' business meetings should be held on the first Monday of every month from 7 pm to 9.30 pm. Decisions at these were to be taken by simple majority, with the quorum of attendance being fixed at seven. There was no prescribed agenda. At the Otago Presbyterian First Church, teachers' meetings took place on the second Wednesday of every month during 1886. The Knox Church Sabbath School, far larger than the Mornington School, countered unwieldiness by use of a two-tier system, with less frequent teachers' meetings than at Mornington, these being scheduled quarterly for the last Wednesday of the appropriate month, and with more power being delegated to a small executive sub-committee.24 Knox addressed the issue of flexibility in a large school by adopting a local government model, empowering its teachers 'to make such bye-laws... as they shall from time to time deem necessary.

---

22 See Chapter 8 for sources and fuller details of pre and post-1890 conversion levels.
24 Knox Church Sabbath Schools: Rules. Rule No III.
for the better regulation of the school', with the option of these being ratified or rescinded at the next annual general meeting.25

Despite calls for integration, tension between the Sunday school teaching force and church leaders occasionally surfaced, underscoring the need for a coordinating mechanism. It was held to be helpful if the Sunday school superintendent was also a high profile church office holder. A large and increasing proportion of Otago Sunday school teachers in the later nineteenth century were teenagers as, evidently, was also the case in contemporary Victoria. The Reverend E. Greenwood, at the annual conference of Congregational Sunday schools at Melbourne in December 1889, commented on the results of the generation gap within the schools. Teaching was left to the young because older people would not do the work. The Sunday school teachers meeting, usually left without oversight, then became 'practically an independent republic' plagued by 'immature counsels'.26 Within Otago complaint flowed both ways. Linden Wesleyan Sunday School teachers complained, in March 1885, that 'there seems to be no tie between church and school'; far from resenting interference, the Linden teachers evidently felt neglected and taken for granted.27 The issue was different at St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, where Sunday school practice was sometimes more venturesome than conservative members of the congregation liked. The St Andrew's Deacons' Court did not have the power to intervene in the governance of the schoolroom, but it could and did curb the type of programme which the teachers sought to offer outside. Thus, in May 1877 permission was denied to the Sunday school to hold a 'service of song' in the church building.28 The teachers had envisaged a festival entitled 'Christiana', centred on illustrations from John Bunyan's Pilgrim's Progress and making use of an American organ to lead the singing.29 Unfortunately for their plans, local Presbyterianism was in the throes of controversy regarding the roles of vocal and instrumental music in worship. Four years later, although a large majority of the congregation had voted in favour of liberalising the church's use of music, a Mr Smith of St Andrew's Session spoke out against the

25 Knox Church Sabbath Schools: Rules. Rule No XIV.
28 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, 7 May 1877. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
29 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Session Minutes, 16 April 1877. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
performance of a sacred cantata, regarding this as a perversion of Scripture for entertainment. In a counter-complaint in 1880, the St Andrew's Sunday school superintendent accused congregational members of upsetting seating arrangements through misuse of the Sabbath schoolroom. Friction evidently persisted for over a decade. Superintendent A. Burn, in 1892, informed the church session of 'the strong desire of the teachers for more sympathy' and sought to improve communication by encouraging session members to make regular visits to the school. Teachers at Knox Church too, in 1879, had complained of feeling neglected by church elders, and this despite the regularity with which the superintendents of the Knox Church Sabbath Schools were themselves members of the eldership. Ensuring that holders of key executive positions in the Sunday schools were also church elders ordeacons was an integrative ploy which the Reverend E. Greenwood had particularly recommended for better church-Sunday school relations.

The superintendent was head of the Sunday school patriarchy; executive positions in the schools were invariably male. The superintendent was expected to open and close each Sabbath session, briefly leading the assembled school in praise and prayer. As appropriate to the occasion, he sometimes addressed the whole school, and from time to time appraised the scholars' performance with oral or written testing. Depending on the size of the school and the burden, therefore, of his coordinating role, he may or may not have carried a teaching load. He drew up plans for the school's special services. He was responsible for appointing the school's teachers, who were unpaid; this is why the Sunday schools, despite some difficulties in recruiting volunteers on to the staff, were able to enjoy such a favourable pupil-teacher ratio compared with the day schools. In the absence of the minister, the superintendent generally chaired the teachers' monthly or quarterly meetings. Especially during the early years of a Sunday school's operation, the superintendent's dynamism could be crucial for the school's success, and his influence decisive or divisive according to his personality. Minutes of the Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School Teachers' Meeting, for October 1863, note that various matters were talked over but, in the absence of the Superintendent

30 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Session Minutes, 14 July 1884.
31 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, 10 May 1880.
32 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 4 May 1892. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
33 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1879. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.
of the School, nothing could be done'. Tension between superintendent and teachers at the Port Chalmers Sunday School, triggered by an outlay of Sunday school funds which the teachers believed they had not sanctioned, boiled over into 'acrimonious discussion' in 1869, and led to the resignation of both superintendent and school secretary in 1870. The last straw for the secretary, seemingly, was the superintendent's refusal to donate a cake to the Sunday school picnic; the Port Chalmers minister subsequently stepped in to convene another teachers' meeting in order to 'reconstruct the school'.

Besides his vital role in guiding and shaping teacher opinion, the superintendent assigned both teachers and children to their classes, making from time to time such transfers as he deemed necessary. He was responsible for the overall enforcement of the school's discipline, having the power to suspend or expel scholars according to his judgment. The teachers at Port Chalmers were reminded, in 1893, that they should not complain directly to parents about the behaviour of individual scholars but should direct all discipline concerns through the superintendent. The discipline of teachers likewise fell within the superintendent's province; he vetted the records of teacher attendance, and was expected to visit defaulting teachers in their homes. Voluntary work in nineteenth century Otago was not soft on commitment.

The roles of secretary and treasurer were predictable. The secretary kept the minutes of all business meetings and conducted all correspondence. At the Mornington Presbyterian Sabbath School, he was co-signatory with the treasurer for cheque transactions. He prepared the school's annual report, for submission to Session and inclusion in Session's overview of church activities. At Knox Church, he collated the weekly attendance of both teachers and scholars, was responsible for maintaining 'in perfect order' the General Roll Book, Scholars' Admission Book, Alphabetical Register of Scholars and Visitation Book, and he compiled the school's quarterly and annual digests of statistics. Granted the size of the Knox operation, the secretary's job would have been demanding. He was the superintendent's right-hand man. His counterpart in an English Sunday school bore an even heavier burden, maintaining detailed records twice every Sabbath, and with the extra imposition of editing

34 Rules of the Presbyterian Sabbath School, Mornington. Also Knox Church Sabbath Schools: Rules.  
35 Port Chalmers Methodist Church. Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes, 2 October 1863, 13 January 1869, 27 January 1870.  
36 Ibid, 26 January 1893.  
37 Rules of the Presbyterian Sabbath School, Mornington. Rule No. 5.  
38 Knox Church Sabbath Schools: Rules. Rule No VII.
the Sunday School Journal.39 A treasurer's duties, on the other hand, were simpler and included: receiving all monies contributed to the school; spending these at the direction of the school's committee, and preparing a financial statement for the teachers' annual meeting. In some schools, the offices of secretary and treasurer were combined.

Librarians were people of key influence in the schools. For many children in Otago and Southland, as in England, the Sunday school librarian was their main channel of access to the printed word.40 The Sabbath School Committee of the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod was keen to promote school libraries, especially in rural areas.41 To this end it tried to launch an implementation plan in 1874, seeking a £150 starter float to be funded by congregational collections organized through the deacons' courts. The float would enable the committee to purchase an initial store of books, cheap but sturdily bound, which it would then resell to individual schools on a cost recovery basis. The scheme would become self-funding, with successive cycles of resale money being used to purchase more books. Despite a somewhat haphazard initial response from the region's diverse congregations, the Sabbath Schools Committee reported steady growth in library stocking and use over subsequent years. By 1877, 37 out of 99 Presbyterian Sabbath schools in the region boasted libraries, with an aggregate holding of 10311 volumes, a 28 per cent increase on the previous year.42 The proportion had further improved by 1891, with 124 out of 196 schools running libraries, and holding a total of 26,858 books.43 Synod asked well-endowed urban schools to gift their surplus library stock to their needy rural counterparts. Streth Taieri, Orepuki, Taringatura, Macraes and Pukerau were listed, in 1892, as the only Presbyterian schools without libraries throughout Otago and Southland.44

As libraries expanded, so did the librarians' duties, encompassing oversight of the books, maintaining them in a fit state for circulation, preparing and updating catalogues, and recommending and vetting new purchases. Each Sunday afternoon, the librarian received returned titles from the

---

40 Laqueur, p.113.
42 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1877, Appendix, p.13.
43 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1891, Appendix, pp.61-62.
44 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1892, Appendix, p.59.
scholars and arranged new borrowings; at Knox Church the exchanges were delivered to the children at the end of afternoon school so as to minimize disruption to the flow of teaching. The librarian was also responsible for enforcing any rules relating specifically to the library's use. He reported to the teachers' monthly or quarterly meetings on the condition of the library. Some libraries were geared for teacher as well as pupil, or even for wider congregational, access and accordingly stocked an appropriate range of books. Other churches found it more convenient to run separate congregational libraries.

Besides specifying the roles and duties of executive officers, Sunday school constitutions set down in detail the standards expected of a teacher. The fulness and precision of the schedules reflected the unease felt by churches at the weight of responsibility being thrust upon a generally immature staff. Entry to the teaching body was by recommendation of one or more staff at the teachers' ordinary meetings, subject to the superintendent's scrutiny and approval. Having secured appointment, the new teacher was expected to be punctual and reliable, a role model of Christian service. In case of unavoidable absence, the teacher was to give notice to the superintendent and to provide a suitable substitute. At Mornington Sabbath School, any teacher absent from duty for two consecutive Sundays without due notice was visited by the superintendent. Four absences caused the offending teacher to be withdrawn from the school. The limit of tolerance at Knox Church was six consecutive absences. Voluntary resignation required submission of a written statement to the superintendent.

Teachers were enjoined, Sunday by Sunday, to be in their places five minutes before the opening of school. Sunday school constitutions said little directly about quality of pedagogy but were strong on the necessity for decency and order in class management. Nineteenth century socialization emphasized propriety, and the Sunday schools were to put discipline, patience and good manners into a spiritual context. Teachers were required to see that the scholars assembled in silence. With the pupils assembled, each teacher was responsible for marking his or her class roll and, at the Knox Church schools, for keeping an accurate list of pupils' addresses; at the smaller Mornington Sabbath School, the secretary maintained the address list. After opening prayers, each scholar's attendance

---

45 Knox Church Sabbath School: Rules. Rule VIII.
47 St Andrew's Sabbath School, Dunedin. Roll Book kept by Miss Agnes Park, 1876.
was recorded with a full stroke in the register. Late attendance was marked with a half stroke, noted at the end of class. Recurrent pupil absence called for a home visit; the visiting teacher was to ascertain, and inform the school secretary of, the cause of absence, and to make an appropriate note in the Visitation Book. 48 Throughout the duration of the Sunday school's programme, teachers were required 'to do their utmost to preserve attention and good order in their respective classes'. They were to remain with their scholars until these left the school premises, so as to secure an orderly dismissal and exit. Implicit in the word 'utmost' was an acknowledgement that Sunday school discipline, lacking the captive audience, professional staff and coercive force of the day school, would fall short of the ideal. Implicit, also, in the concept of home visiting was a humanely interactive teaching regime, which sought to match the rigour of day school pedagogy while avoiding its grosser brutalities.

At Knox Church, details of grade structure were built into the Sunday school's constitution. The Knox school was divided into four grades, primary, intermediate, junior and senior. 49 Promotion between the grades was based on both chronological age and attainment. Admission to the primary class was by approval of the superintendent. The London Sunday School Union's recommended form of admission required the name and address of the prospective pupil, birthdate and age next birthday, and a signed, albeit nebulous, parental pledge to support the work of the school; the Knox school may well have adopted a similar entry format. 50 Promotion from primary to junior level could occur at or after the age of seven, for pupils who could read, recite the Paternoster and answer the first twenty questions of the Mother's Catechism, a simplified catechism for young children. Bibles, hymn books and copies of the Westminster Shorter Catechism were provided at Knox for all scholars above primary level.

At the age of eleven, children could be promoted from junior into intermediate grade. Transfer depended on the ability to recite the Paternoster, Decalogue, the Twenty-Third Psalm and the Golden Text for the previous half year. The scholar also had to answer the first twenty questions from the Shorter Catechism and gain at least fifty per cent of marks in the annual examinations set by the Knox Church Sabbath Schools' Committee. Movement from intermediate to senior grade could

48 Knox Church Sabbath Schools: Rules. Rule No XII.
49 Knox Church Sabbath Schools: Rules. Rule No XIII.
50 The Sunday School Handbook, p.35.
occur at age thirteen for scholars who passed the intermediate grade examinations. The candidate for promotion at this level had to answer correctly questions 21 to 38 inclusive of the Shorter Catechism, and to recite the Apostle's Creed and the Beatitudes. Reliability in attendance was a further factor taken into account before promotion was allowed. No scholar could be considered who was absent on more than three consecutive Sundays in any one quarter, or for an aggregate of more than twelve in any one year, without satisfactory excuse.

Otago and Southland Sabbath schooling was schooling in the formal sense of the word, in its structures, administrative systems and classification procedures; many day school teachers in fact were also Sunday school teachers. Sunday school organization was a reflection, but not a slavish copy, of day school procedure. In some respects Sunday schools led the day schools down paths of reform. Mirroring the day school proficiency examinations, the Knox Church Sabbath Schools' Rules stressed the duty of teachers to prepare their pupils for promotion; October 1 was fixed as the day for the issue of promotional certificates. Homework also was tacitly assumed in the schools' constitution. The Knox rules 'earnestly requested' the aid of parents in assisting their children to prepare their lessons and learn their memory exercises. Smaller Sunday schools than those encompassed in the Knox grouping, unable to match the sophistication of Knox's appraisal procedures, frequently drafted their pupils according to the pupils' attainment levels in day school.

This was a practice which came increasingly to be questioned. The London Sunday School Union, while accepting an ability to read as an essential prerequisite for promotion, recommended that 'other things being equal, scholars get on better who are nearly of an age'. In Otago, the Sabbath Schools' Committee of the Presbyterian Synod, in 1885, encouraged debate on the issue: 'We commend the liberty that is taken to place a scholar of advanced age in an advanced class, his standard classification notwithstanding, and protest against failure to pass a public school standard involving loss of promotion in the Sabbath School'. The claims of socialization overrode academic considerations in driving Sunday schools towards changing their classification procedures, some more reluctantly than others; Sunday school teachers at the Otago Presbyterian First Church voted against the annual promotion of scholars in October 1889. Overall, however, Sunday schools led the

51 Laqueur, p.107.
52 The Sunday School Handbook, pp.87-88.
53 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1885, Appendix, p.64.
day schools in moves towards social promotion, moves which spiralled into the work of the Bible classes and parallel bodies such as the Christian Bards and Christian Endeavour.

Bible classes were promoted vigorously by the Presbyterian Church in Otago and Southland during the later nineteenth century to counter a perceived attrition in church male membership. Synod, in 1876, urged the formation of such classes in all churches where they were not already in existence. The classes flourished through the later nineteenth and into the twentieth century to become, not only Otago's, but New Zealand's largest voluntary youth movement, operating not just within Presbyterianism but across the Protestant denominations. Bible classes were designed to bring a spiritual dimension to the beliefs and values of the young men and women who are to occupy politically, socially, morally and religiously, places of trust, and who will influence for good or evil the destiny of this fair country; whereas Sunday schooling provided a spiritual introduction and, hopefully, led to the step of conversion, the Bible classes offered confirmation and growth in Christian faith. More specifically, it was expected that the classes would nurture the next generation of, preferably, male Sunday school teachers. Some success was claimed in replacing, through the classes, young male teachers who had left the colony for Australia during the 1880s in search of employment; losses had been reported as especially heavy during 1889, and the Sunday schools became concerned over gender role modelling.

The Bible classes, or at least their unions, have been claimed as a peculiarly New Zealand innovation. It would be preferable to regard them as an adaptation. Bible class work in Britain was well documented by the London Sunday School Union, which advocated separate classes for scholars in the 15-21 year age band, and for those who had reached young adulthood. Separation of classes by gender was also recommended. Bible classes came to Otago with the earliest Scottish migrants, although it is not always clear whether the term 'Bible class' in Otago parlance meant

---

54 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1876, Appendix, p.14.
56 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1891, Appendix, p.57.
57 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1892, Appendix, p.57.
specifically a study group for seniors or was used more loosely to mean the full age range of Sabbath scholars. The Reverend Thomas Burns ran a Bible class on the outward voyage of the Philip Laing. Bible classes specific to senior scholars were an inaugural feature of the organisation of Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin.\textsuperscript{60} The classes also reached into the rural areas; Thomas Connor, for example, opened a Bible class in the union parish at Hamiltons in February 1873.\textsuperscript{61} They influenced a range of Protestant denominations. Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School teachers discussed the merits of studying Old Testament History through the medium of a Bible Class in 1879; the idea presumably failed, because the opening of a class was debated again in 1884.\textsuperscript{62} Mornington Methodist Church, Dunedin, reported the presence of a successful Bible class as early as 1881.\textsuperscript{63} Nor was Bible class influence confined to Otago, with the Wesleyan Methodist Church in Wellington opening a joint class for teachers and senior scholars in 1861.\textsuperscript{64}

George Troup, who is popularly regarded as the architect of the New Zealand Bible class movement, stands in the same relation to Bible classes as does Raikes to British Sabbath schooling, as developer rather than inventor. He raised New Zealand's Bible classes, from their dependent status as senior outgrowths of the wider Sunday school system, to the position of a self-regulating movement.\textsuperscript{65} Catering for a sparse pioneer population, the early New Zealand Bible classes predated Troup, but they lacked consistency of organization. As late as 1891, classes were reported in Otago as servicing an age span of anything from 10 to 40 years. Typically the clientele was unmarried, and sometimes gender segregated, although one minister in 1891 reported eight married couples in his study group.\textsuperscript{66} The Reverend J. Gibson Smith also advocated a co-educational outreach among the youth of his North Dunedin parish. Generally the parish minister acted as teacher, with meetings squeezed into Sundays or weeknights, as best fitted a busy schedule. The Reverend Dr Stuart's Bible class at Knox Church, Dunedin, meeting an hour and a quarter before the start of Sunday morning worship,

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{59} The Sunday School Handbook, p.87.
\item \textsuperscript{60} J Hislop, History of Knox Church, Dunedin, J Wilkie & Co, Dunedin, 1892, p.20.
\item \textsuperscript{61} A Paterson, A Cornish Goldminer at Hamiltons, Otago Heritage Books, Dunedin, 1980, p.23.
\item \textsuperscript{62} Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School. Minutes, 6 March 1879 and 30 April 1884.
\item \textsuperscript{63} D J Phillipps, Mornington Methodism 1876-1976, Robertson McBeath Ltd., np., 1976, p.15.
\item \textsuperscript{64} Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Wellington. Minutes of Teachers' Meetings, 18 January 1861.
\item \textsuperscript{66} Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1891, Appendix, p.57.
\end{itemize}
included teenagers and young adults of both sexes, with thirteen fixed as the minimum age of entry. In the Knox parish a second Bible class emerged by 1881. The parish annual report for that year likened the new venture to 'the sixth form of the Sunday school'. Meeting on Sunday afternoons, initially for boys only, it continued to operate for many years under the tutelage of Mr Robert Chisholm JP, church elder and, by trade, a cabinet maker with North and Scouller. Although soon forced to resign for health reasons, Miss Fitzgerald of the Dunedin Normal School ran a similar class for girls at Knox Church, with the specific aim of recruiting and training young women for Sabbath school teaching. All the Knox Bible classes prided themselves on furnishing new young teachers for the lower classes of the Sabbath school. From a roll of 109 for the minister's Sunday morning Bible class at Knox in 1881, 26 became church members, and 15 became either Sunday school teachers or librarians with the Sabbath school or congregational library.

Into the motley Bible class system, dependent as it generally was on the circumstances and commitment of the local parish minister, George Troup infused an organization and energy which very much heightened the movement's impact and appeal. Troup himself had derived his vision from the dynamism of an Otago Presbyterian minister, the Reverend Rutherford Waddell, who was inducted to the St Andrew's parish, Dunedin, in 1879. Although a resident of Knox parish, Troup was drawn by his social conscience towards the domestic missionary work of St Andrews, where Waddell ran an interactive Bible class. It was a refinement and development of Waddell's methods which Troup took with him on his transfer to Wellington in 1888, implementing a programme at St John's Presbyterian Church, Willis Street, which became a model for Bible class operation nationwide and across the denominations. Otago and Southland shared in the spread of the movement:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Schools</th>
<th>Scholars</th>
<th>Bible Classes</th>
<th>Scholars</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1875</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>5,706</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>8,432</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1885</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>12,464</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>2,222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>12,674</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>2,611</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10  Comparative Data Relating to Sunday Schools And Bible Classes Attached to Presbyterian Congregations, Otago And Southland, 1875-1890

67 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Courts, 1877.
Between 1875 and 1898, there was a 118 per cent growth in the number of Presbyterian Sabbath schools in Otago and Southland, and a 254 per cent increase in the number of Bible classes. From 1885 to 1890, Sabbath school rolls grew by 11 per cent and Bible class rolls by 18 per cent. The adult and school-age populations of the region, over the same five year period, increased by about 5 per cent. For the first time, in 1893, a separate Bible Class Report was presented to the Otago Presbyterian Synod, indicating the growing status of the movement. The reputation of the classes also stood high in the lay world, employers sometimes preferring Bible class lads as apprentices.\(^{70}\)

Several other institutions either competed with or complemented the Bible classes in outreach to youth. There was frequent overlap between these institutions and their names were sometimes used interchangeably. Notable among these other groups were the Christian Bands and Christian Endeavour. The Christian Bands offered developmental programmes for committed Christians; they were designed to nurture in the faith young people who had 'made a decision for Christ'. The London Sunday School Union recommended the association of a Christian Band with every Sunday school, urging 'the necessity for care and oversight of scholars who are just beginning the Christian life'.\(^{71}\) Fellowship within the Band, it was held, would prevent backsliding and ready the novice for mature church membership. Many, although by no means all, churches heeded such advice. Hanover Street Baptist Church, Dunedin, operated a large and vigorous Band along the recommended lines.\(^{72}\) As early as August 1881, this Band was cited by commentators as being the church's most effective instruments of growth.\(^{73}\) Among Dunedin's Presbyterians, a Christian Band had opened at St Andrew's by 1886.\(^{74}\) A series of evangelistic meetings held in the Sunday school in 1890 generated


\(^{71}\) *The Sunday School Handbook*, p.115.


\(^{73}\) *The New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch), August 1881, p.107.

\(^{74}\) St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, 9 August 1886. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
an influx of new recruits. Knox Church launched its first Band in 1893. The group met fortnightly on Monday evenings, and the benefits of membership were publicised among the church's Bible classes. Open to both sexes, the roll fluctuated around the 40-50 mark over the next five years.

The Christian Endeavour movement, however, achieved a greater impact than the Christian Bands in Otago and Southland during the 1890s. The founder of the Movement was Francis E. Clark of Portland, Maine. Surveying his church, as a young pastor in 1881, Clark observed: 'The usual means of grace were available - services on the Sunday and in mid-week prayer meetings, Sunday School Bible Classes, but I soon become convinced that something more was needed.' Social activities were tried, but these failed to make the young people 'more useful, more loyal to the church, more ready for open confession'. After active consultation with the church's youth, Clark launched Christian Endeavour, a movement stiffened with a constitution, membership pledge and interactive programme. The movement soon become international. In Australia, the Associated Churches of Christ claim a surprisingly early Christian Endeavour foundation, with the opening of a class for women by a Mrs C.L. Thurgood of Geelong on 5 June 1883. Generally, however, credit for Australia's inaugural foundation is given to George R. Colby, a young visitor from Boston, who inspired the opening of an Endeavour group at Wharf Street Baptist Church, Brisbane, in February 1888. The movement spread rapidly across New South Wales and Victoria, reaching Perth in 1889 and Tasmania in 1890.

It is not clear whether or not Endeavour activity in New Zealand was Australian-inspired, or where the first venture began. A Ponsonby Baptist Young People's Society of Christian Endeavour was formed in July 1891, and has been cited as New Zealand's pioneer society. Its mentor, John Graham of the Ponsonby Church, was moved to act by information he received from his sister, a Mrs

---

75 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Session Minutes, 11 August 1890.
76 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacon's Courts, 1893-1896. See also Quarterly Statements, January-March 1898.
79 Bush and Kerrison, pp.10-12.
McGavin of San Francisco. The Otago Presbyterian Synod, meanwhile, in its 1891 report, commented favourably on the recent development of Christian Endeavour societies in the south, viewing them as having the potential to reinvigorate the church. The Endeavour group founded at East Taieri by Annie Jardine, third wife of the Reverend William Will, was the first in Otago and has also been claimed as the first in New Zealand. Synod, by 1896, found Endeavouring to be sufficiently influential to warrant statistical comparison with the Bible classes, with the newer movement apparently eating into Bible class membership. In the long run, however, the Bible classes' more structured programmes outlasted Endeavouring's spontaneity both in Otago and nationwide.

Table 11 Comparative Data Relating to Bible Classes And Christian Endeavour Groups Attached to Presbyterian Congregations in Otago And Southland For The Year 1896

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Presbytery</th>
<th>Bible Classes</th>
<th>Rolls</th>
<th>Endeavour Groups</th>
<th>Rolls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dunedin</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>734</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clutha</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southland</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>591</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oamaru</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dunstan</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mataura</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>2,088</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>1,247</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1896. Appendix. pp51-52*)

The statistical returns for 1896 in Otago and Southland show that, at that time, Bible classes were almost twice as numerous as the Endeavour groups but their rolls, on average, were rather smaller, especially in the Presbyteries of Dunedin, Clutha and Southland. This disparity becomes much more glaring when average real attendance rather than nominal membership roll is considered. Bible class average weekly attendance was about 75 per cent of the nominal roll whereas, for the Endeavour groups, real attendance generally exceeded the roll, as the groups' informal, vigorously interactive and flexible programmes attracted numerous interested spectators, drawn by motives as diverse as

---

81 *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1891, Appendix, p.61.*
spiritual quest, curiosity, friendship and flirtation. Endeavour groups certainly socialised. The fortnightly programme at rural Knapdale, 1896-1899, saw frequent exchanges of visit and greeting with societies at Greenvale, Riversdale and Gore.\textsuperscript{83} Conservatives in church congregations did not necessarily approve of these developments within Endeavour. The movement placed a lot of organizational freedom in the hands of youth. Some commentators feared the outcome would be at best an ephemeral emotionalism. Vandalism caused the St Andrew's Presbyterian Church Deacons' Court, Dunedin, to close its Christian Endeavour Room to the Junior Society except on those occasions when the Reverend Rutherford Waddell could be present in person.\textsuperscript{84} Deacons were guardians of church property and watchdogs of church costs.

The expansion of Otago Sunday school and Bible class activity in the later nineteenth century did not come without cost, and funding came largely, although not invariably, from the deacons' or similar church courts. The All Saints Anglican Sunday School, Dunedin, was reported as being entirely self-funding in 1894, its monies coming from the children's weekly collections and the teachers' own contributions, supplemented by specific fund-raising ventures.\textsuperscript{85} Generally in a young, undercapitalised society, Sunday schools could not sustain themselves on independent funding if they wished to develop their programmes with a degree of sophistication. Otago's Sunday schools usually did not have the financial autonomy of some of their British counterparts nor, generally, did they own their own premises. They did not have established business contacts from which to extract sponsorship on the scale of, for example, Stockport School in Cheshire. Laconic entries in the minutes of the Linden Wesleyan Methodist School, Dunedin, record the difficulties of providing even the most basic equipment for a small, new venture in Sabbath schooling. Records for 17 October 1878 show the mere purchase of a minute book for the teachers' meetings had been a problem, that a school library could only be launched if the congregation donated second hand books, and that a summer picnic would only be possible in collaborative partnership with the more established Mornington Methodist or Trinity schools. Six years later the Linden school still lacked the money to develop its library in the way it wished.\textsuperscript{86}

\textsuperscript{83} Knapdale Christian Endeavour Society Minutes, 1896-1899. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AN 2/1.
\textsuperscript{84} St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, 26 June 1899.
\textsuperscript{85} All Saints Anglican Church, Dunedin. Vestry Fair Minutes, 16 July 1894. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG80 A1.
\textsuperscript{86} Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School. Minutes, 17 October 1878 and 1 February 1884.
Otago's Sabbath schools did take up collections, either weekly or else on alternate Sundays but, especially among Presbyterians, these were donated to mission work rather than used for buying equipment for the school. Otago's Presbyterian leaders evidently felt that it was important to socialize the children into a culture of overseas mission support, sufficiently important to make the schools' ordinary running costs a charge on each church's wider pool of funds. The Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod noted in 1881 that 'it is joyful to know that, when rightly guided, children care for the missions.'\(^{87}\)

The average amount taken in through the children's own collections appears to have run at about a halfpenny per child per week. If an Australian example was typical, the act of offering was integrated into the school's pattern of worship, with the children filing past the collection box to the accompaniment of music or a hymn; *Hear the pennies dropping* became a favourite.\(^{88}\)

In some instances, children took mission boxes home and filled them over time. On appointed days the boxes, whether filled at home or at school, were ceremoniously opened and the contents counted. Table 12 sets out the aggregate mission receipts from Presbyterian Sabbath schools in Otago and Southland for the years 1881 and 1882.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Presbytery</th>
<th>Amount in £/s/d (1881)</th>
<th>Amount in £/s/d (1882)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dunedin</td>
<td>228/18/82</td>
<td>276/3/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clutha</td>
<td>57/19/10</td>
<td>33/8/112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southland</td>
<td>70/11/11</td>
<td>76/19/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oamaru</td>
<td>54/4/11</td>
<td>22/16/2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Despite considerable fluctuation of amount within each presbytery, the aggregate sums donated by the children, over £400 in each of the years 1881 and 1882, constituted a considerable proportion of total Presbyterian mission giving in Otago and Southland at the time. Across the Synod area, Sabbath school collections for 1883 totalled £506/13/10. Of this money, £259/1/22 was channelled towards the 'Dayspring' mission supply vessel and other aspects of outreach in the New Hebrides. The balance was divided between donations towards mission work in China and New Guinea.

---


88 W Shaw and H L Hancock, *A Sunday School of Today: an Illustration of Principals*, Hussey and Gillingham Ltd, Adelaide, 1912, p.49.
support for orphanages in India, the funding of local church extensions and the building up of Sabbath school libraries. Balance sheets from Waikouaiti Presbyterian Church show the practice of dividing Sabbath school collections between the 'Dayspring' Mission Fund and the New Hebrides Mission Fund remained the norm into the 1890s. The Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod commented most unfavourably on cases, infrequent though these were, where Sabbath schools diverted collection moneys away from mission support towards their own internal maintenance.

The Presbyterian practice of looking to the deacons' courts to cover the Sabbath schools' ordinary weekly running expenses did not always work out satisfactorily, and many additional difficulties arose in the case of one-off expenditures. The deacons of the respective churches would vote an annual sum, leaving the schools to make up the shortfall through a range of fund-raising devices if the grant was exceeded. These devices included special congregational collections, concerts or festivals of sacred song, and teachers in some instances dipped into their own pockets to plug financial gaps. Typical school outlays related to the purchase of roll books and tickets, the purchase of periodicals, replacement of Bibles and hymn books, library outlays and the printing of special orders of service, for example for anniversary meetings. Aggregate expenses might total anything from £5 to £70 per annum, depending on the size of the school. The Sabbath school of Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church, in 1899, recorded the following expenses: Crown Printing Co., outlays of £3/5/- and £2/7/6; Wise & Co., four outlays of £2/9/9, £3/12/5, £2/17/3 and £19/- respectively; Bible Depot, £9/16/4; purchase of library books, £13/15/-; subscription to the Otago Sunday School Union, £1/-/--; bank charges, £5/-. Deacons' court grants were also made to fund one-off expenses such as the annual treat or picnic, events which had community significance and which, in the case of a large church, might entail considerable cost. Records for the Presbyterian First Church of Otago for 1886 show the deacons' court as providing £45/8/5 towards the general expenses of the church's Sabbath schools. A further sum of £33/5/5, placed in the picnic account, was raised by congregational donation. In 1899 a First Church deacons' court grant of £60 largely covered both picnic and weekly running costs.

90 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1883, Appendix, p.15.
91 Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1899. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Dunedin.
92 Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1886.
Some Sabbath schools were less well supported than those associated with the Otago First Church. At St Andrew's Church, Dunedin, in the 1880s the deacons' court funded the church's main school to the tune of £15 per annum, with another £5 for its offshoot in Stafford Street. A further sum, not exceeding one guinea per year, was provided for Bible class prizes. Always canny with its funds the St Andrew's court, in December 1881, declined to make an extra grant to cover the cost of the schools' picnic but did give permission to the teachers to take up a special congregational collection for the purpose. The court made a practice of impounding £8 from such special collections to offset its own running costs. Controversy arose in 1885 when, through oversight, only £7 instead of the customary £8 was deducted from such a collection before the balance was handed over to the Sunday school. A further Sunday school request in 1890, for a £20 donation to pay for the school's annual treat, was tartly refused on the grounds that 'the expenditure asked for on a picnic is out of all proportion to the resulting good'.

The deacons' court showed itself no more willing to supplement the Bible class prize fund. An appeal in 1886, from the Bible and Church History Class Committee of which Rutherford Waddell himself was convenor, for a special offering to cover the purchase of prizes, met with refusal; their customary annual guinea marked the limit of the deacons' generosity in this direction. In response to the Sunday school's request for £22/10/- for its library fund in 1889, the deacons voted only £12, telling the school to make up the shortfall by cutting back on its support of overseas mission.

Difficulty arose, also, in the Waikola Presbyterian community. The Waikola Sabbath School Committee, in 1897, entered into curiously complex negotiations with the local church deacons regarding the purchase of a replacement piano, culminating in the constitution of a subcommittee of Sabbath school teachers as 'Trustees in the said instrument' and the framing of formal articles of agreement between the 'Trustees' and the Deacons' Court.

Questions of running cost or even piano purchase, for all the debate they engendered, were trivial in comparison with the problem of providing suitable accommodation for the Sunday schools; rolls were expanding rapidly after 1870, and churches of the later nineteenth century felt obligated to offer

---

93 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, 13 January 1890.
94 Ibid., 14 March 1881, 13 December 1884, 10 March 1885, 14 June 1886.
95 Ibid., 10 June 1889.
96 Waikola Deacons' Court Minutes, 13 August 1897. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. BM4/5.
Sunday scholars facilities of a standard to match those of the secularised day schools. The capital costs of Sunday schooling obliged Otago churches to seek subscriptions and bank loans. The ideal school facility, according to the recommendation of the London Sunday School Union, would be located conveniently near its pupils' homes, would be well lit and ventilated, and with ample surrounding space. It would contain a central auditorium or general room large enough for the assembly of all the scholars and, opening from the auditorium, a number of smaller rooms in which each class teacher could provide 'close, quiet' instruction.\(^7\) Sample plans published by the Union showed buildings varying in size and pretension, but sharing these common features of design (Illustrations 1, 2 and 3). Changes of shape and external shell did not change the basic concept. All the plans assumed a mixed class of infants, and gender segregation of the classes above infant level, even to the point of having separate entries and stairways for boys and girls (Illustration 2). The central siting of the assembly room fostered a sense of collegiality. The raised, central position of the superintendent's desk promoted respect for hierarchy and facilitated control. The Union was well aware, however, that the ideal would not often be realised, that many pious donors resisted giving money for 'bricks and mortar', and that the only accommodation option, for many Sunday schools, would be the adaptation of an existing shop or warehouse building.

If developed, industrial Britain found the provision of Sunday school facilities to be taxing, how much more would this be true of early Otago and Southland. Here cries for adequate school accommodation were loud and insistent. Among Dunedin's Anglicans, the All Saints Parish Sunday School was delighted to obtain free use of the North East Valley Council Hall in 1882. When the same school developed its own premises in 1890 at a cost of £405, the necessary monies were raised by the church's Ladies' Guild, the teachers' own fund-raising ventures and public subscription.\(^8\) Even the region's larger, well-endowed Presbyterian congregations found the need for Sunday school accommodation hard to satisfy. Frequently one building served the dual purposes of worship and teaching. The original premises of Knox Church, Dunedin, at the corner of Great King Street and Frederick Street, were multi-functional.\(^9\) When, in 1871, the purchase of the present Pitt Street site enabled the church to move to a better location, the vacated buildings on Frederick Street were modified for more convenient Sunday school use. St Andrew's Church Deacons' Court, in 1886, cast

\(^{7}\) The Sunday School Handbook, pp.22-23.

\(^{8}\) All Saints Anglican Church, Dunedin. Vestry Fair Minutes, 7 March 1882 and 20 January 1890.

about for the cheapest way of housing the church's mission school. A section could be leased, adjacent to the Golden Age Hotel, for £25 per annum. Inquiries showed that the infant room of Mr Park's school could be purchased and moved on to the site for a total cost of £150. A purpose-built wooden structure would cost £250. The deacons, feeling unable to risk even the cheaper option and arguing that outreach in the Walker Street area was a city-wide responsibility, attempted to canvass Presbyterian...
Illustration 1  Proposed Plan for a Sunday School Building

References - A, Partitions about 6 feet high; B, Superintendent's Desk

(Source: The Sunday School Manual, Sunday School Union)
Illustration 2  Plan for a Sunday-School Building

(Source: The Sunday School Handbook)
Illustration 3  A Suggestive Plan for a Sunday School

(Source: The Sunday School Handbook)
congregations throughout Dunedin, with disappointing results. The mission school struggled on in makeshift accommodation, leasing the ground floor of Choy Sew Hoy's Stafford Street premises for £42 per year, and arrangement about which the Reverend Rutherford Waddell clearly had reservations. As late as 1900, school accommodation was proving to be a dire problem for the Presbyterian First Church of Otago, to the detriment of the church's youth work. The Session and Deacons' Court Annual Report admitted that: 'It is only bare fact to say that the Church Sunday School is most wretchedly furnished in the matter of accommodation'. The church wanted to coordinate its Sabbath school and Bible or Continuation Class activity, but simply did not have the spare rooms to synchronise its junior and senior programmes.

A successful contemporary model of purpose-built Sunday school accommodation in Dunedin can be found in the lovely Edmund Roach design, commissioned for the fast-growing, influential school of the Hanover Street Baptist Church. This school came to play a leading role in the Otago Sunday School Union. Its stone, two-storey structure is owned today by a commercial operation, and the interior has been much modified. The street frontage is unchanged and is well maintained. Those who knew and used the building in earlier years testify that its original layout closely followed London Sunday School Union recommendations, with both lower and upper stories centred on a large school room, and small classrooms radiating off to the sides. Preliminary studies for construction of the building were begun in November 1876, in response to teacher concerns about overcrowding. Architect's plans were called for, at a maximum budgeted cost of £10. Two years later, building still had not commenced. The deacons were moved to expedite the plan, allowing £1,000 for its completion. They had underestimated. The Building Committee, in May 1880, reported the lowest tender for the work as being £1,235. Worried, the deacons required the Building Committee to 'remodel and reduce the plans within the assigned budget of £1,000'. Presumably this

100 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Walker Street. Deacons' Court Records, 8 November 1886, 29 March 1887, 14 April 1887, and 13 June 1887. 
101 Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1900. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Dunedin.
102 H Knight, Church Building in Otago. University of Otago Printing Department, Dunedin, 1993. See also Chapter 4.
103 Oral interview with Mrs Pam Chivers, Dunedin, 12 June 1997.
104 Dunedin City Baptist Church. (formerly Hanover Street Baptist Church). Deacons' General Committee Minutes, 29 November 1876, 25 September 1877, 1 October 1878, 11 May 1880, 4 July 1880, 26 August 1880. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
requirement created difficulty because we find the deacons, in July, calling for a consultative meeting with the church congregation before any extra building cost could be authorized. In August, it was 'resolved that the Church be recommended to raise the sum of £300 on account of the New School Buildings.' Hanover Street was proud of its dynamic Sunday school and supported it generously, in the best traditions of the British working classes. It was fitting that the Reverend Alfred North of the Hanover Street Church, a man of broad, humane sympathies and a champion of domestic and overseas mission and of religious education, should have chaired the interdenominational Otago Sunday School Union during the 1890s.

The Otago Sunday School Union influenced the region's Sunday schooling once more towards ecumenicism. The official records of the Union appear to have been lost, but we can infer much about this body from indirect local evidence, from references to it in Australian archives, from well-documented material relating to similar unions elsewhere in New Zealand and from comparisons with the parent London model. The London Sunday School Union, inter-denominational and international, had as its prime objectives the encouragement of Sunday school teachers, the improvement of pedagogy, the extension of Sunday schooling in Britain and overseas and the provision of cost-effective books, stationery and equipment; it claimed to supply children's books to Sabbath school libraries at one third of retail prices, and teachers' reference material at half-price. It ran Normal, Training, Hebrew and Greek Classes for teachers, and set Scripture examinations for teachers and for scholars. It operated a Biblical and Educational Museum, library and reading room. It made available table microscopes and polariscopes, oriental costumes and curiosities, and even a model of the Tabernacle, for the illustration of soirées and lectures.

In New Zealand, an Auckland union, founded in 1865, reflected in microcosm the London model. Its declared objectives were:

to promote a spirit of unity amongst Sabbath Schools teachers, and thereby extend the usefulness of Sabbath Schools; to promote a Depot for Bibles, Books, Tracts etc.; to assist in the formation of Sabbath Schools; to endeavour by every means to disseminate useful knowledge amongst the young.106

Its administrative structure comprised an executive committee of five, reinforced with representation from each member school. The affiliation fee was set at one guinea per school. Committee meetings and prayer meetings were held monthly, while the annual meeting of teachers for the election of officers was scheduled for February each year.

Talk of creating a similar, interdenominational union in Otago had surfaced in 1863, but had come to nothing. In November 1873, at a meeting at Knox Presbyterian Church, a Sunday School Teachers' Union of Dunedin was mooted, and a draft constitution was agreed. Membership was to be open to all Sunday school teachers connecting themselves with the Union and, ex officio, to ministers of all affiliated congregations. The objectives of the Union were; to promote the efficiency of Sunday school teachers, to advance the interests of religious education among the young, to organize regular Union prayer meetings, to teach demonstration lessons and to offer a programme of lectures and addresses. It is not clear what became of these proposals. An Otago Sunday School Union was, however, in existence in the early 1880s. The ecumenical Sunday school at Hamiltons, Central Otago, reportedly joined the Union at this time because, through affiliation, the school could buy books at discount prices, presumably more than recouping its ten shilling annual membership fee.

The South Dunedin Baptist Sunday School was reported as paying a fifteen shilling affiliation fee to the Otago Union in 1888.

Ironically statistics relating to the Otago Union can be accessed more readily in Australian sources than through records in Dunedin. Reports of the Union's activities appeared in issues of *The Australian Sunday School Teacher* for both June and November 1890. At this stage, the Otago Union included 37 schools from an undetermined range of denominations, with an aggregate roll of 777 teachers and 6,907 scholars. Bearing in mind that the Presbyterians alone, at this time, were running 190 schools in Otago and Southland, catering for 12,782 children, the Union's level of support evidently was not high. It is common to find contemporary Sabbath school teachers' meetings in Otago expressing reservations about joining the movement, for unspecified reasons. Perhaps teachers

108 *The Evangelist* (Dunedin), December 1873. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
felt overcommitted. More likely the Union was caught between pioneer ecumenicism and the resurgent denominational loyalties of a developing settlement. The Dunedin Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School teachers voted two to one against affiliation in October 1888. The First Church School did eventually affiliate, probably in 1891, but contemplated withdrawal again in 1895.\(^{111}\) It refused on more than one occasion to join in public rallies or 'demonstrations' which the Union organised in Dunedin. Teachers from the Knox Church schools and from the Hanover Street Baptist Church, on the other hand, remained positive towards the Union's program. Its activities included six conferences apparently convened by the Union during the decade of the 1880s, and monthly prayer meetings in both the city and suburban areas of Dunedin. The Union had established, also by 1890, two training classes attended by 60 teachers.\(^{112}\)

To service the needs of scholars, the Otago Union developed an inter-school examination system, and also ran a series of competitive 'industrial exhibitions' displaying the craft work of young people. Reports from the Session courts of several churches allude to good performance by their respective Sabbath scholars in the Union's examinations. In 1893 the St Andrew's Church Sabbath School resolved to award prizes to scholars gaining more than 60 per cent in these tests.\(^{113}\) Merit certificates were offered by the Union itself to children and young people placing creditable work in the industrial exhibitions. A surviving example of such an award, dating from 1898, encapsulates the Union's concept of socialization. (Illustration 4).\(^{114}\) The certificate was issued to an Elizabeth Dorecas South, daughter of a Primitive Methodist family, highly commending her for her entry in the Class E 'Doll' category.

The design of this certificate blends classical and Romantic influences and reflects some of the stereotypes of the period. Albeit in a Christian context, the symbolism used in the certificate is that of ancient Greece and Rome, an echo of the classicism of the English public schools. A robed, maternal figure, romanticised from Greco-Roman sculpture, watches over the children of the future.

\(^{111}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Record of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 16 October 1888 and 10 May 1895.


\(^{113}\) St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible Class Cabinet Minutes, 3 August 1893.

\(^{114}\) The original of this certificate is among the family records of, and is the personal property of, Mrs Judith Cranefield, Dunedin.
Emerging from the shelter of her embrace, cherubic boys cultivate literacy or clutch the ship of commerce and adventure. In appropriately submissive, kneeling pose, her back turned upon academic education, a girl arranges flowers; a Beecherite interaction with God-in-nature will fit her one day for motherhood and the awful responsibility of shaping the morals of the next generation of males. Idealised femininity both dominates and is dominated within the dichotomy of the certificate's design.

Illustration 4 Otago Sunday School Union Industrial Exhibition Certificate
The Reverend T.L. Davies likened the New Zealand Sabbath school to an autonomous republic, allied to the church but essentially self-governing. Otago's Sunday schools of the post-1870 period, often heirs to a Scottish tradition which had assumed a close symbiosis between Kirk, day school and Sabbath school, were more like provinces than republics, locally self-regulating but linked in many ways into the wider polity, the aims of which they shared and the ends of which they served. The pioneer years following 1848 had been the period of autonomous Sunday school in Otago and Southland, the period of frontier improvisation. The terms of the 1877 Education Act, universal and secular in their provision, drove the Sunday schools back into alliance with the parent denominations. The post-1870 phase of settlement was a time when systems were put in place. An emerging society needed its defining structures; Sunday school structures became formalised in line with the formalisation of other features of church and colonial life. The leaders of Otago's Sunday schools were usually men who were also important office holders in their respective churches, men who were in a position to shape and coordinate. The developing schools largely relied on their parent churches for accommodation and finance. The emergence of structure, however, did not necessarily imply ossification. Otago's Sunday schools and Bible classes continued to prove themselves resourceful and imaginative, mediators of their own mythology. The revival of denominationalism was far from absolute, and it did not preclude experiment, whether in organisation or, as will be shown, in curriculum and in pedagogy.
Chapter 7  The Lambs of The Flock: Who Attended Sunday School?

People living in the city of Dunedin today, who can remember the earlier decades of the present century, testify to the Sunday schools' pervasive influence in the world of their youth. As one current resident of Dunedin recollects: 'All my friends at Arthur Street School attended Sunday school. I can't think of anyone who didn't attend.' If imitation is the sincerest form of flattery, then the fact that a Freethought Sunday School operated in Dunedin in the 1880s and a Socialist Sunday School opened in Christchurch corroborates the effectiveness of the nineteenth century Sunday school movement. Throughout the closing decades of the nineteenth, and into the early twentieth century, Sunday schooling proliferated throughout Australasia, helping to mould the mores and values of settlement across a wide range of social strata on both sides of the Tasman. Primitive Methodist teachers in Victoria expected the schools of the several Protestant denominations to shape the 'miners, mechanics, farmers, merchants, statesmen and ministers' of the future. The Tasman was a highway for, rather than a barrier to, the exchange of Sunday school concepts and materials. Australasian Wesleyan Methodist Church Conferences, Melbourne-based, routinely carried reports from the Wellington District which embraced the entire South Island of New Zealand, and Otago clergy regularly contributed to interdenominational Sunday school publications in Victoria.

Teachers in Otago and Southland, across the denominations, took encouragement that their efforts, however localised and idiosyncratic, were subsets of an international pattern of outreach and an internationally validated paradigm of social consolidation. As will be shown, their work touched the lives of well over half the young people of the province, proving to be an especially significant influence among young women. Ironically, the Otago Sunday schools' greatest area of failure was among the very classes that the Raikesian movement had set out to serve, the children of unskilled labour.

---

1 Dorothy Leffley, oral interview, Dunedin, 11 March 1997.
4 Australasian Wesleyan Methodist Church. Minutes of the Annual Conference, 1855-1884. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLT 287.194 M.
Sunday school growth in Otago and Southland in the later nineteenth century particularly reflected community concern over developments in contemporary public education. Numerous parents, not always conscientious church attenders themselves, did not conceptually separate a religious and moral education, and responded to the secularization of the public education system, embodied in the 1877 Education Act, by sending their children to Sabbath School, as was the recommendation of main-line Protestant denominations to their members. Although no comprehensive, systematic survey of public opinion was conducted, sufficient to validate claims with hard data, the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland was confident that a clear majority of parents in the region, across the Protestant denominations, wanted a Biblical dimension to their children's education, and Synod stated this point repeatedly during its Bible-in-schools campaign. Doubtless some parents, of more prosaic motivation, also saw the Sabbath schools as a low cost baby-sitting service, but this would not explain the strong 64 per cent growth which took place in Sabbath school rolls during the late 1870s (Table 13). Conjunction is not causation, but the circumstantial evidence for linkage between the 1877 Education Act and Sabbath school roll increase is compelling, especially in the specific context of Otago Presbyterianism.

Table 13  Sunday School Enrolments in Otago and Southland, All Denominations, 1871-1901

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Enrolments at Sunday School*</th>
<th>Total as % of European School Age Population^</th>
<th>Total as % of Public and Private Day School Rolls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>% Change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871</td>
<td>1871</td>
<td>7,510</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>1874</td>
<td>10,252</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>1878</td>
<td>16,814</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>1881</td>
<td>21,194</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>1886</td>
<td>25,472</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>1891</td>
<td>26,510</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>1896</td>
<td>29,249</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td>28,461</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1871-1901
* Note: Sunday school attendance figures include teachers.
^ School Age = aged 5 - 15 years

5 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1887, Appendix. Report of the Committee on Bible-Reading in Public Schools, p.97.
6 Many rank-and-file Sunday school teachers in Otago and Southland in the later nineteenth century were teenagers, immediate recruits from the system which they served. Contemporary census aggregates relating to Sunday school rolls did not discriminate between teacher and school-age child.
The Sunday schools, apart from their role in forwarding the religious acculturation of society, also fulfilled a range of social purposes for both children and adults, in New Zealand as they had in Britain. Commonly during the 1840s in England, Sabbath schooling was the only sort of formal education that children received. The aggregate total of children in England receiving either Sabbath schooling only or a combination of Sabbath and day schooling far exceeded the tally of those solely attending day school.\(^7\) The move to compulsory elementary schooling in Britain, embodied in the 1870 Education Act, did not lessen the Sunday schools' appeal, even though the British legislation lacked the secularism of its New Zealand counterpart. For the children who attended, the Sunday schools were places where friendships were made and cemented. Thrown together in the expanding day schools, children found they could mingle in the Sunday schools in a more relaxed atmosphere. School picnics and similar entertainments were important for the vertical bonding of societies where work was hard and leisure opportunities limited. English working class parents and children often grounded their choice of Sunday school, not on religious or denominational principle, but on convenience and on the quality of the extras and treats which each school provided. Sunday schooling offered a few of the sweets of a more affluent lifestyle; at times it served a welfare function.\(^8\) For some adults, whose attendance at Sunday worship was infrequent, the attendance of their children at Sabbath school conferred, perhaps, a vicarious badge of respectability. Among artisans and the lower middle classes in Britain, Sunday schooling had become associated with upward social mobility.

Artisans and the lower middle classes, the groups who particularly used British Sunday schooling to their advantage, figured prominently in migration to Australasia, reinforcing a broad similarity of trans-Tasman Sunday school practice. For many migrants, expectations of the Sunday schools formed part of their cultural baggage. A guileless contemporary Australian comment illustrates clearly why some parents from these classes supported Sunday schooling:

> We were induced at first to send our children to the School, not because we cared for the teaching they might get, but because we saw the neighbours' children clean and nicely

---


dressed going away to School, and we thought it would be nice to dress our children and send them to School also.\textsuperscript{9}

Snobbery, in this instance, was rewarded. Edwin Clapham, the eldest son of the family concerned, took a 'decision for Christ' at the school, and prayed for his parents' conversion. The whole family became born-again Christians.

With an equally refreshing candour as to motive Bessie Turnbull, long-time resident of Mosgiel, Otago, recalled in her old age her childhood liking for Sunday school during the 1890s. The demands of her father's bakery sometimes cut across Bessie's attendance, underscoring in counterpoint the school's recreational value as a welcome break from the routine of a family business. The class which Bessie attended was an ecumenical venture run by a Baptist couple from South Dunedin, Mr and Mrs William Ings, to the displeasure of the local Presbyterian minister, the Reverend William Will. Bessie respected and valued the example of interdenominational tolerance shown by her Baptist teachers, in contrast to what she perceived as the narrowly judgmental attitudes of William Will. Particularly she recognised the strength of character underlying William Ings' blend of humility and sincerity; he was not a 'bombast'. Candid about range of motive, Bessie Turnbull recalled her pleasure in dressing in her best clothes on Sundays.\textsuperscript{10} Offering self-respect in this world and hope for the next to countless numbers of Bessie Turnbulls, Sunday schools flourished in Australia and New Zealand as they had in England, showing especial growth in the three decades following 1870.

The Sunday schools drew in rather over half the school-age children of Otago and Southland in 1871, about two-thirds in 1886, and three-quarters by the turn of the century (Table 13). Every census return during this period, except for that of 1874, showed Sunday school pupils as an increasing percentage of the school-age population. Consistently, Sunday school enrolments exceeded 75 per cent of the day schools' actual roll figures, despite the increase of day school pupil numbers under the impact of the 1877 Education Act, an increase later reinforced by the appearance of truancy officers, and further fostered by the growth of credentialling. The year 1878, immediately following the Act, saw particularly vigorous Sunday school roll growth as compared with that of the

\textsuperscript{9} T J Clapham, in E Stranger and W R Bennetts, \textit{Brunswick Street Wesleyan Sabbath School: Jubilee Records}. Griffith and Spaven, Melbourne, 1893, p.55. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLT 268.871945 B83.

\textsuperscript{10} H Frizzell, oral interview with Bessie Turnbull, taped at Mosgiel, 16 September 1986, Tape 7 of 25.
day schools. Admittedly Sunday schools lost some ground relative to the public schools during the 1880s. This was the decade when Otago and Southland passed beyond pioneer status. The family farm and household, now broken in, no longer demanded the daily input of child labour, freeing children for weekday education. Numerous individual Sabbath schools nevertheless boasted proud records of growth, even during the 1880s. The roll of the Mornington Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin, increased by a third during this decade, with similar gains apparent for the Congregational School at Port Chalmers. Growth rates of three or four per cent per annum were common. Between 1891 and 1896 Sunday school rolls continued to increase, at a slower pace relative to their own earlier performance, but now at a rate relatively faster than the day schools. By 1901, as the settler population aged, the number of children in Otago and Southland began to fall, leading to outright decline in both day school and Sunday school rolls. Despite this decrease, Sunday schooling more than held its own numerically relative to the day schools; at least four-fifths of day school attendees had some Sunday school affiliation by 1901. To children immersed in the movement, the loose assertion that 'everybody went to Sunday school' seemed literally true.

Gains in adherence were not equally shared across the denominations, and recruitment drives sometimes succeeded at the expense of other schools' attendance rather than by breaking new ground. Methodist schools, in common with those of many other denominations, often used a ticketing system to encourage loyalty. Children were given small cards or tickets for attendance, and perhaps for bringing a bible to school, or learning the week's 'golden verse' by heart. A predetermined aggregate of small cards entitled a child to receive a large 'reward card'. Port Chalmers Methodist Sunday School gave up the system in 1887, in favour of annual prizes based on aggregated marks. Similarly, in 1895, the Dunca's Street Primitive Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin, abandoned reward cards as being 'practically useless' except in the infant department. The Associated Churches of Christ St Andrew's Street Sunday School, in 1904, ran a recruitment competition, dividing its classes into 'Red' and 'Blue' divisions, and climaxing the recruitment

---

12 Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School. Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes, 22 March 1887. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 52 72.
13 Dunedin Primitive Methodist Church, Dundas Street. Sunday School Minutes, 29 May 1895. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 36 01 11.
campaign with a rally; the ploy almost doubled the school's roll.¹⁴ Otago's Presbyterians were concerned that their Sunday school retention rates were not keeping pace with demographic trends. St Paul's Sabbath School, Invercargill, considered offering prizes in 1888 to the scholars who brought in most new recruits.¹⁵ Statistical data relating specifically to Presbyterian school rolls suggests that the Presbyterians' fears had some substance.

Table 14  Aggregate Rolls of Presbyterian Sabbath Schools in Otago And Southland, 1874-1901

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Presbyterian Rolls</th>
<th>Presbyterian Rolls as % of Total Sunday School Rolls, all denominations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>4,822</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>6,891</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>8,935</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>11,683</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>12,801</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>13,672</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>11,808</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources:  *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1873-1901*

Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1874-1901

Growth rates for the Presbyterian Sabbath schools in Otago and Southland were uneven. During the early 1870s and the late 1880s Presbyterian school rolls, as a proportion of all Sunday school rolls in the region, matched the Presbyterian church's levels of adherence among the adult population. Presbyterians constituted 46 per cent of Otago adults in the early 1870s and 44 per cent in 1891, years when their children comprised almost half of aggregate Sunday school numbers.¹⁶ The decade 1881 to 1891 was a period when Presbyterian Sabbath school roll growth compared favourably with growth rates among Sunday schools of other churches. In the late 1870s and the late 1890s, on the other hand, Presbyterianism lost market share compared with other denominations among Otago and Southland's youth, with Presbyterian enrolments falling from 47 to 41 per cent of all Sunday school enrolments between 1896 and 1901.

¹⁴ Associated Churches of Christ, St Andrew Street. Teachers' meeting minute book 1902-1929, entry for 21 September 1904. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 520 22.
¹⁵ St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 6 February 1888. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
¹⁶ Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1871-1901.
Contemporaries, however, were more concerned over relativity with day school attendance rates than with interdenominational comparison.

### Table 15

**Per cent Changes in Presbyterian Sabbath School Rolls in Otago and Southland and Public Day School Rolls Compared**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Period</th>
<th>% Change in Sabbath School Rolls</th>
<th>% Change in Public Elementary School Rolls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1874-78</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878-81</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881-86</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886-91</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891-96</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896-1901</td>
<td>-14</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources:  
- *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1873-1901*
- Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1874-1901

Analysis of the data in Table 15 shows growth rates favouring the day schools during the 1870s and the Presbyterian Sunday schools during the 1880s, an outcome which correlates with the findings of Table 14 and reflects, perhaps, Scottish migrants' concerns over the issue of Bible-in-schools. All school rolls, by 1896, were affected by the falling numbers of children in Otago and Southland but day school figures, from 1896 to 1901, held up better than those specifically for the Presbyterian Sabbath schools. As Table 13 has already shown, the reverse was true of comparisons relating to day school attendance and Sunday school rolls aggregated across the denominations. If Presbyterian Sabbath schools were losing ground compared with the day schools by 1901, then the Sunday schools of some other groups must have been surging ahead.

In this connection, comparisons of sample studies of church and Sunday school membership and enrolment figures, in individual parishes and across a range of denominations, are instructive. Surviving records from Presbyterian, Methodist and Baptist parishes in the Dunedin area allow some cross-matching of statistics relating to adult, nominal church membership with Sunday school nominal rolls.
Table 16  
Comparison of Adult Church Membership, Sunday School And Bible Class Rolls At Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, 1865-1955

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Church Membership</th>
<th>Sunday School Roll</th>
<th>Bible Class Roll</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1865</td>
<td>over 800</td>
<td>over 300</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1875</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1885</td>
<td>over 1,000</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>over 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1895</td>
<td>1,185</td>
<td>610</td>
<td>over 130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1905</td>
<td>1,209</td>
<td>over 520</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1915</td>
<td>1,200</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>over 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>1,300</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1935</td>
<td>1,028</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1945</td>
<td>1,045</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1955</td>
<td>894</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 17  
Trinity Methodist Circuit, Dunedin. Numbers of Adult Church Members and Numbers of Sunday School Scholars Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Church Membership</th>
<th>Sunday School Roll</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>July 1888</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 1889</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>654</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 1889</td>
<td>296</td>
<td>653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 1890</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 1891</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>585</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 18  
Number of Sunday School Scholars Per Hundred Adult Church Members At Hanover Street Baptist Church, Dunedin

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Sunday School Scholars per Hundred Church Members</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1882</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1892</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1902</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


All three tables show Sunday school adherence as peaking during the late 1880s or early 1890s. At Knox Church at that time, there were about two-thirds as many Sunday school and Bible class enrolments as there were congregational members. Similar data for the Moray Place Congregational
Sunday School, Dunedin, shows a relativity of about 75 per cent.17 The Baptists and Methodists at this time were spectacularly successful in their youth work. Sunday school enrolments at Hanover Street far outstripped the adult membership roll. Within the Trinity Methodist Circuit, Dunedin, Sunday scholars at Cargill Road outnumbered church members by more than two to one. At Woodhaugh, North Dunedin, a sizeable Methodist Sunday school functioned for years in default of any adult congregation. One would assume, guessing an average longevity of 50 years for residents of nineteenth century Otago, that children of school age constituted about a fifth of the population of the region; census data for the years 1851, 1871, 1891 and 1901 indicate proportions of 23 per cent, 20 per cent, 27 per cent and 20 per cent respectively.18 The ratio of Sunday school enrolments to adult church membership far exceeded these levels, especially in the Wesleyan ranks.

It seems the greatest immediate success, relatively, attended Sunday schools of the minor rather than major churches in Otago and Southland. In the short term the Protestant churches least encumbered by hierarchy, and those with strong traditions of lay involvement, were best able to adapt to a colonial situation in servicing the needs of their young. Churches with strong structural traditions, on the other hand, possessed longer-term advantages. Wesleyans generally showed themselves eager for Sunday school work, ready to launch classes from small beginnings and build in faith; Methodists at Broad Bay, Otago Peninsula, inaugurated their school in August 1863, with a roll of 16, ranging in age from 4 to 24 years.19 Primitive Methodists were few but active in Sunday school work. Numerous references in the Journals of Robert Ward, pioneer of Primitive Methodism in New Zealand, echo the British tradition of dynamic Nonconformist involvement in the Sunday schools.20 Statistics relating to the large Anglican Sunday School at St Paul's, Dunedin, appear static by comparison, with 317 enrollments in 1879, 306 in 1887 and average weekly attendance steady on a figure rather over 200, some two-thirds of nominal roll.21 Taking marriage statistics, nationwide, as a measure of 'effective presence' in the community for the period 1881-1991, Rollo Arnold

---

17 Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin. Minutes of Church Meetings, 10 March 1873 - 3 August 1893. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 36.
18 Statistics of New Zealand for the Crown Colony Period. Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand 1871-1901.
19 Broad Bay Methodist Church, Sunday School and Bible Class Records. Sunday School Scholars, 1863-1933. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 30/6/03.
concludes that Methodists in New Zealand, relative to their numbers of adult adherents, were more successful than either Anglicanism or Presbyterianism in their youth outreach. In the year 1881 Anglicans numbered 405 per 1000 of the New Zealand population but only 222 of every 1000 marriages were celebrated according to Anglican rites. The parallel figures for Presbyterianism are 226 and 272 and, for Methodism, 101 and 153. Data for the year 1901 favours the Methodists even more.\footnote{It must be said however, in fairness to Anglican youth work in Otago and Southland, that Anglican Sunday school roll numbers aggregated across the Dunedin diocese grew from 2,828, in the year 1886, to 3,211 in 1896 and 3,568 by 1913, increases of 13 and 11 per cent respectively; the rolls of other Protestant Sunday schools were generally decreasing after 1901.\footnote{Structure as embodied in the hierarchical organisation of the Anglican and Roman Catholic churches is necessary for long-term survival, even if its processes of adaptation are relatively slow. Structure helps to compensate for discrepancy between nominal church or Sunday school enrolment and actual attendance rates.}}

Arguing from British data, T.W. Laqueur has estimated actual weekly attendance at Sabbath schools to have been about 75 per cent of nominal enrolments.\footnote{Table 19 Average Attendances At Presbyterian Sabbath Schools in Otago and Southland, 1879-1901, Expressed As A Percentage of Nominal Roll

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Average Attendance as a % of Nominal Roll</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1879</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1884</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1889</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1894</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1899</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1879-1901}


\footnote{J H Evans, Southern See: the Anglican Diocese of Dunedin, New Zealand, John McIndoe Ltd, Dunedin, for the Standing Committee of the Diocese of Dunedin, 1968, p.198.}

\footnote{Laqueur, p.107.}
Aggregates of average attendance for Methodist schools, also, in the Dunedin area accord with the Otago Presbyterian results and with the British paradigm. For schools in the Trinity Methodist Circuit, average attendance stood at 77 per cent of nominal roll in July 1888 and October 1889, and at 72 per cent in July 1891.\textsuperscript{25} If Sunday school rolls embraced some two-thirds to three-quarters of the school age population of Otago and Southland (Table 12) and if, overall, 75 per cent of this enrolment was reasonably regular in attendance, then Sunday schooling represented a consistent influence in the lives of between fifty and sixty per cent of the children in the region. The churches were not satisfied. Day school actual daily attendance rates within Otago in 1892 stood at 83 per cent of nominal enrolment, and at 80 per cent nationwide. Since some 90 per cent of school age children were on the day school rolls in Otago and Southland by 1892, an 83 per cent actual attendance rate suggests that three-quarters of the school age population was under consistent day school influence.\textsuperscript{26} The unfavourable comparison between Sunday school and day school actual attendance rates was not lost on the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod.\textsuperscript{27} Sunday schools did not enjoy the luxury of a legislatively captive clientele, and Sunday school leaders in the Protestant denominations in Otago pushed hard during the 1890s, with some success, to make up leeway against the day schools (Table 12).

Attendance aggregates may mask wide variation across the schools. Attendance tallies oscillated widely between Sunday school and Sunday school in Otago and, within schools, from quarter to quarter. At Knox Church attendance often exceeded 80 per cent of enrolment both in the Sabbath school and in the Reverend Dr D. Stuart's Sunday morning Bible class. Robert Chisholm's Sunday afternoon advanced Bible class achieved an 88 per cent attendance record in 1887. The Reverend Stuart, in 1882, noted with pride that his class contained 37 communicant members of the church, 16 Sunday school teachers, 3 assistant librarians, 1 congregational librarian, a secretary and 40 members of the Welcome All Total Abstinence Society; outgoing leadership and a supportive church culture produced high levels of membership commitment.\textsuperscript{28}

\textsuperscript{25} Trinity Methodist Church, Dunedin. Quarterly Meeting Minutes, 1888-1891. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 Box 11 1052.
\textsuperscript{26} Calculations abstracted from the data in Table 12.
\textsuperscript{27} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1892, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools' Committee for the Year 1891-1892, p.57.
\textsuperscript{28} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1882 and 1887. Knox Presbyterian Church Archives, Dunedin.
Data relating to smaller schools, on the other hand, suggests widely disparate attendance rates, both between schools and between individual classes in the same school. In Mr Andrew Todd's infant class at Caversham Road Baptist Sunday School, 2 out of 32 children achieved a 100 per cent attendance record during the winter quarter of 1886; half a dozen children attended fewer than half the sessions. Peak attendance during the quarter was 29, with a contrasting minimum of 9 on a very wet Sunday in August. Quarterly average attendances during 1893 and 1894 varied between 60 and 70 per cent of nominal roll, falling to 50 per cent in 1895. Among the Balclutha Methodists, March-May 1876, attendance at Miss Hope's class of 11 enrolled scholars varied from 1 to 9, with a weekly average of 5.75. Actual attendance levels at the Port Chalmers Methodist Sunday School, for the last quarter of 1880, stood at 61 per cent of nominal roll; comparable rates at the same school, mid-1881, were 72 per cent for boys and 82 per cent for girls. Attendance at the North East Valley Methodist Sunday School, between 1888 and 1891, similarly fluctuated from 52 to 82 per cent of nominal enrolment. Figures for Mosgiel Methodist Sunday School, over the same period, ranged from 54 to 73 per cent. Linden Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin, achieved a real attendance mean of 60 per cent over the 16 years, 1878 to 1894, with a high of 82 per cent in the October quarter of 1878 and lows of 48 and 49 per cent in the years 1883 and 1893 respectively, the July quarter of 1893 being marked by a measles outbreak. Institutions peripherally attached to the Sunday schools and Bible classes of larger churches often registered high enrolments but low attendance levels. At Knox Church, the Welcome Al. Total Abstinence Society boasted a roll of 206 in 1882, but an average meeting attendance of about 80. The range of demands on the time of a dedicated church supporter could be huge, as churches sought to fortify their young people's lives against a world of change and build a better society from migration; it was not possible to attend all that was on offer.

29 Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Superintendent's Register, 1883-1895. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. UN78.
30 Balclutha Methodist Church. Sunday School Class Roll, May 1876. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 26/6/1.
31 Port Chalmers Methodist Church. Sunday School Teachers’ Meeting Minutes, 10 December 1880, 20 July 1881. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 52/7/1 and 52/7/2.
32 Trinity Methodist Church, Dunedin. Quarterly Meeting Minutes, July 1888 to September 1893.
33 Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School. Minutes, September 1878 to February 1894. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 Box 42 1528.
34 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons’ Court, 1882.
Data relating to length of stay at Sunday school, like that pertaining to regularity of attendance, shows wide variation. The international tendency was towards lowered ages of Sunday school entry and longer exposure to Sunday school influence. Laqueur posits the average length of stay at British Sunday schools as growing from 1.75 to 3.75 years over the period 1800 and 1860.35 Australasian Sunday schools followed the trend, widening in successive stages the scope of their outreach to youth. Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, during the post-1870 decades, offered Sabbath school primary classes up to the age of seven years, junior from seven to eleven and intermediate from age eleven to thirteen years. Beyond the age of thirteen, senior schooling spiralled through Bible class activity into young adulthood, and shaded into full church membership.36 The minimum age for primary class entry at Knox and the maximum age for Bible class attendance were not made explicit in the church's constitution although, in the context of secular day schooling, Knox's minister, the Reverend D.M. Stuart, made it clear that he did not support the idea of kindergarten education for children aged under five. The Annual Report of the Knox Sabbath School for the year 1874, however, made specific reference to the formation of an infant class in association with the school. The Presbyterian Synod of Otago and Southland, in 1883, alluded to an 'infant' class at Knox Church, offering no definition of the term 'infant', but commending the class as a successful new departure in church practice and noting its large roll of 150 children.37 Lawrence Sabbath School, by 1883, had been operating a dedicated infant class of 35 children for at least eighteen months. Mosgiel Sabbath School, in the same year, praised the value of infant classes as 'feeders' for the levels above them, again providing no definition as to what constituted 'infancy'. A Methodist handbook however, published in Adelaide, South Australia, in 1912, outlined a fully developed ideal for Sabbath education, in which babies aged under three years had their names entered on a 'cradle roll'.38 The most elementary level of instruction was to commence after the age of three, in the 'Little Beginners' class, proceeding into the Kindergarten at four years of age, the primary grades at six and the junior at nine. The senior and Bible class stages were to follow, after the age of 12. Under this

38 W Shaw and H L Hancock, A Sunday School of Today: an Illustration of Principles, Hussey & Gillingham Ltd, Adelaide, 1912.
model it would have been possible for the children of the church to receive, through the church's educational instruments, almost twenty years of grounding in the faith.

Among a mobile population such continuity was hard to achieve in practice. The Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod, believing that the initial act of migration whetted people's appetite for further change, feared that ongoing population movement, whether trans-Tasman or internal to New Zealand, would erode the habit of worship, destabilising traditional links between the individual and the established religious institutions to the point where the links were lost.\(^3^9\) Sunday schools of all Protestant denominations voiced concern that an ongoing supply of sufficiently trained teachers would not be maintained in a fluid society. Records of the Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Kaikorai, Dunedin, afford a case study in mobility of membership. At this school a tally of 261 children was enrolled between 1881 and 1885, the total comprising 59 enrolments for the year 1881, 33 for the year 1882, 47 for 1883, 87 for 1884 and 35 for 1885; the annual inflows varied widely.\(^4^0\) The seemingly large influx in the year 1884 was somewhat illusory, the school itself choosing to cull 36 names from its books the following year because of the irregular attendance of the scholars concerned. The roll at any given time over the period 1881-1885 averaged about a hundred names. During the same four-year period, 111 young people left the Sunday school. The school's records indicate, in 29 out of the 111 cases of lapsed enrolment, why the lapse occurred. Removal to another area of New Zealand accounted for eight cases, promotion as a Sunday school teacher for another eight instances. Five children transferred to other local Sunday schools, two of these to the Anglicans and three to the Salvation Army. Four families moved overseas and three to another location in the Dunedin area. One boy was expelled from the school for bad behaviour. It is unfortunate that the roll information is incomplete. It is fullest for scholars enrolled in 1881, among whom removal to other districts within New Zealand was clearly the main factor in roll change; employment was cited as the key issue in two of these instances. The promotion of scholars to the rank of Sunday school teacher appears to have been faithfully recorded, accounting for about 7 per cent of roll changes. Knox Presbyterian Church Bible Class, Dunedin, recorded higher levels


\(^{40}\) Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School. Roll Book, 1881-1885. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 Box 42 1529.
of teacher recruitment, with 12 to 15 per cent of its members graduating to Sunday school work in 1898; however, allowing for the numbers of Knox scholars who never progressed from Sunday school to Bible class, the Knox and Linden proportions are probably not dissimilar. An estimate that about one in fifteen Sabbath Scholars eventually became Sunday school teachers would accord with what we know of teacher-pupil ratios in Sabbath schools in nineteenth century Otago and Southland.

Even if the reason for removal was often omitted, the Linden roll book did systematically record the initial enrolment and final withdrawal dates of its scholars, shedding some light on the typical duration of a Sunday school career. It seems likely that children who were regular in weekly attendance, already identified as between 50 and 60 per cent of the day school age population, also maintained their connection with Sunday schooling over periods of four years or more. Of the 1881 intake of 59 scholars at the Linden School, five stayed on the roll less than a month, another five less than 6 months, seven between 6 months and a year, and three from a year to 18 months. A further three stayed for 2 years, five for 3 years and two for 4 years. In total, therefore, thirty of the 1881 intake, about a half, completed four years or less of attendance. The other half, apparently, remained at the school for 5 years or more. This proportion rises to 56 per cent when the number of ex-scholars who stayed on at Linden as Sunday school teachers or who shifted to other Sunday schools in the Dunedin area is added into the calculation. This estimate is still too low, because it is not possible to establish how many of the Linden children and young people leaving the Dunedin district continued to attend Sunday school in their new locations, or for how long.

Evidence from other sources suggests patterns of long-term commitment among Presbyterian Sabbath scholars similar to those of the Methodists. Memorabilia from Knox Church, Dunedin, and evidence from data relating to the examinations run by the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee in Otago and Southland between 1881 and 1892 are, within limitations, helpful in this respect. The statistics afforded by the Bible and Church History Class Committee record only successful examination performance. They give no consistent data on total examination entry, still less any information on the numbers of loyal Sunday school attendees who might have shunned

---

41 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1882.
43 See Appendix A.
the examination system, or the sizeable group who attempted alternative tests such as those set by the Otago Sunday School Union. Of the 321 Sabbath scholars who competed successfully in the Bible and Church History Class examinations, between 28 and 25 per cent entered regularly over a period of three years or, more. There were eighteen who won awards annually during five or more years of entry. Notable for perseverance were Mary Galloway of Mornington, Dunedin, and Sarah Milner of Park Farm, North Taieri, who competed over a seven-year period, and Isabella McAdie and Janet Moir, both of Balclutha, whose entries were spread over eight years. Three of these young people made their first entries as juniors, probably aged in their mid-teens, and competed until their early twenties. Mary Galloway's sister, Georgina, married Robert Francis Crawley in 1903, when she was 30 years of age; she must, therefore, have been thirteen when she gained first place in the junior essay competition in 1886.  

Elizabeth Mille:Ralston of Blue Spur married Robert Backie Clack in 1904, when she was twenty-eight, making her twelve when she won her first of six Sabbath school awards in 1888. Annie Eliza Mary Jaggers was married at the age of 30, to James George Johnston in 1896, making Annie sixteen when she won her first award in 1882 and nineteen at her last success in 1885. Sarah Milner first entered as a senior, making her over eighteen years of age in 1881, so she must have been a mature Bible class student of 26 or more when she sat the last of her eight examinations.  

Loyalty and length of commitment were not exclusive to academically successful Sabbath scholars. Fanny Bethune, writing of her Invercargill Sabbath school and associated Bible class in 1882 when she was 22 years of age, noted that a Mrs Mentiplay was in charge of the 'highest class' in the school, and there were 'a number of young women in it older than I'.  

At Knox Church, Dunedin, some fifteen years later, Gladys Robertson gained a handsome, framed Robert Raikes Diploma for seven years of absence-free Sabbath school attendance. One year of unblemished attendance, apparently, earned her the basic diploma. Each subsequent year saw a seal appended to the diploma's margin:

---

45 Appendix A.
47 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Robert Raikes Diploma, awarded to Gladys Robertson, Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, 1905. Among the memorabilia currently held in the Knox Presbyterian Church Archives.
faithfulness for a second year, courage for a third, loyalty for a fourth, enthusiasm for a fifth, consecration for a sixth and influence for the complementary seventh year. The fact that Gladys Robertson’s certificate is unique in the current archival holdings of Knox Church indicates both the rarity of the achievement and the pride it engendered.

If few could emulate a septenary of perfect attendance, the proportion of young Otago lives untouched by religion at this time would have been relatively small. It has been argued above that about three-quarters of all young people in Otago and Southland enrolled at Sunday school, and a half or rather more of all young people attended with some regularity and also long-term continuity. For another third or so of all Sunday school enrolments on the other hand, comprising about 25 per cent of all the region’s youth, the connection with Sabbath education seems to have been more casual, in some cases even tenuous. Irregularity did not necessarily equate with ineffectiveness; for all the interruption to attendance imposed by the demands of her father’s bakery business, Bessie Turnbull of Mosgiel still looked back on her connection with the interdenominational Sunday school run by Mr and Mrs William Ings as a crucial, formative influence in her life. The remaining 20-25 per cent of the young people of Otago and Southland were raised without Protestant Sunday school affiliation. A minority of these, perhaps a third, would have been children from Catholic homes proceeding through that church’s independent day school system. A fifth or less or young lives in the colony would have been unaffected by direct religious influence at this time. The churches were concerned, as will be shown in a later chapter, that it was commonly the young men of the colony rather than the young women who figured among the unaffected or who, after brief contact with the Sunday schools, fell away from the faith.

Generalizations regarding socio-economic background can also be made in connection with Sunday school adherence. Surviving fragments of roll books give class address lists, enabling the researcher, in some cases, to track down parental occupations by cross-matching with entries in Wise’s or John Stone’s Directories. Occasional, and therefore doubly welcome, primary sources give glimpses of the scholars’ own employment.

---

48 This estimate is based on census data showing about one tenth of the total population of post-goldrush Otago and Southland to have been Roman Catholic.
Table 20  
Employment Status of Fourteen Boys Enrolled At Hanover Street Baptist Church Sunday School During 1883

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Employment Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alfred Paddon</td>
<td>Castle Street</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>painter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert Bacon</td>
<td>King Street</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>pupil, Arthur St School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Mellor</td>
<td>Leith Street</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>pupil, Union St School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Mellor</td>
<td>Leith Street</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>grocer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Edwards</td>
<td>Union Street</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>carter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Westlake</td>
<td>Castle Street</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>printer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alfred Nankervis</td>
<td>Castle Street</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>confectioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bertram Bacon</td>
<td>King Street</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>pupil, Albany St School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Cumming</td>
<td>Atholl Place</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>boot factory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Barclay</td>
<td>Stokes Buildings</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>pupil, Union St School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walter Steele</td>
<td>Clarendon Street</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>pupil, Albany St School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Milligan</td>
<td>York Place</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>boot factory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ross Milligan</td>
<td>York Place</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>pupil, Arthur St School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Evans</td>
<td>Leith Street</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>pupil, Union St School</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School Roll Book. Hanover Street Baptist Church Archives, Dunedin

It was normal, apparently, for boys in their teenage years to be in paid work. Girls of comparable age were in a different case, being far more likely to remain unemployed and economically dependent; the ideology of the era was in process of redefining work in the home as non-productive. The earning of the first pay packet, even if the pay packet was the modest remuneration of an apprentice, significantly changed a young lad’s status. If still living at home, as most were, the boy was now a family breadwinner. No wonder that churches were eager to open up Bible classes rather than Sunday school classes to lads over the age of thirteen, playing to these boys’ enhanced self-image. No wonder that many teenage boys appeared to feel Sunday school was beneath them, especially if the father of the household did not provide a role model of consistent church attendance!

For over half the boys listed in Table 20 it is possible to trace information on their family background. William Barclay’s father was probably a law clerk. James Evans’ father was a chair caner, Walter Steele’s a master mariner. The Milligan brothers were sons of a labourer. The Bacon

---

family kept a livery stable. Robert Edwards probably worked for his father. Alfred Paddon was the only boy in the list noted as boarding rather than living at home. He lodged with a Mrs Martin of Castle Street. The only 'Paddon' recorded in contemporary issues of Wise's Directory was a storekeeper at Athol, Otago. We can only guess as to what brought Alfred to Dunedin, if indeed Athol was his home. An interesting feature pertinent to the list is the frequency of solo motherhood. The Mellor brothers' mother kept a store in Leith Street; perhaps James worked in her shop. Alfred Nankervis' mother was a sempstress. James Westlake's father, John, was listed as a cook in Stone's 1884 edition. Mrs John Westlake's name, whether through bereavement or desertion, stands alone in Stone's subsequent issues. Solo mothers, it seems, sought the benefits of Sabbath schooling for their children, including perhaps the benefit of respectability.

To determine whether any social background can be established as typical for Sunday school scholars in Otago in the 1870-1901 period, evidence deriving from the small class sample at Hanover Street Baptist Church can be cross-checked against other samples, from the St Andrew's Presbyterian Church Sabbath School, Dunedin, the Caversham Baptist Church Sunday School, the Dunedin Primitive Methodist Church Sunday School, Dundas Street, and from information relating to lists of candidates for the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee's examinations. The following list of occupations can be verified for parents of children attending the Caversham School in 1894: baker, blacksmith (3), bricklayer (2), carter (2), coach-builder, express proprietor, fishmonger, gardener (2), grocer's assistant, hairdresser, hawkier, labourer (3), librarian, milkman, painter, plumber, railway guard, solo mother (3), storekeeper, tinsmith, town clerk, undertaker and warehouseman. A Harbour Board engineer, an engine driver, draper, grocer and blacksmith figure among the parents of children in Miss Agnes Park's small class at the St Andrew's School in 1876. Identifiable home backgrounds among the Dundas Street Primitive Methodist children, for the period 1881-1882, include: bricklayer, butcher, contractor, driver, sailmaker, tailor and two instances of solo motherhood, one of these running a confectionery business. The Sunday schools apparently drew on a wide social spectrum and were especially well supported by children of the self-employed, and by those from artisan and trading families.

---

51 Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Admission Book, October 1890-1905. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. UN78.

52 Dundas Street Methodist Church. Sunday School Minutes 1890-1903. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 36/01/11.
Information relating to prize and certificate winners in the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee's annual examinations is more abundant than evidence deriving from the fragmented Sunday school roll books but frustrating to use because, in many cases, the published lists of award winners did not include specific addresses; unfortunately, it is often impossible to make accurate comparisons with the occupational data in Wise's and John Stone's Directories for the period. The recipients of Bible and Church History Class awards are also atypical in that they represent the most determined and successful of Sabbath scholars. Such information as can be gleaned from the award lists is, however, especially valuable because it reaches outside the Dunedin area into wider Otago. The father's occupation can be positively identified in 117 of the 213 listed families from which prize winners came during the period 1881-1892. Farmers and goldminers comprise easily the largest discrete groups accounting, respectively, for 20 per cent and 12 per cent of the sample; children from the mining community at Blue Spur achieved remarkable levels of examination success, belying the popular stereotype of a goldfields settlement. In aggregate, the familiarly wide range of the self-employed and skilled trades dominates the socio-economic background of young people named in the award list and, naturally, boy prize winners named in the list sometimes grew up to work in the family business; thus Fred Arthur of Pine Hill, North East Valley, third-equal prize winner in the 1887 B grade examination, found employment in the family hosiery, J. & J. Arthur of George Street. Professional homes figure prominently in the awards, accounting for some 15 per cent of the total, with children of teachers and children of the clergy being especially successful competitors, and with the occasional prize going to the son or daughter of a lawyer or accountant; six per cent of prize winners were children of the manse, winning between then over 11 per cent of all awards gained. Solo motherhood remained a recurrent phenomenon; about 6 per cent of prize winners lived in one-parent homes.

Proportionally less well represented among award winners were the children of unskilled and semi-skilled labour, constituting about 4 per cent of the sample across urban and rural Otago and Southland. This statistic can be interpreted three ways. It might indicate that children from labouring families attempted the examinations but did not succeed at them, that labourers' children attended Sunday school but did not attempt examinations, or that labourers' children tended not to attend Sunday school. Corroborative evidence across the range of available sources suggests that the third

53 Appendix A.
54 Stone's Directory for 1898.
is the correct conclusion. For example, about twenty per cent of adults in Caversham in the early twentieth century were unskilled labourers.\textsuperscript{55} It may be more than coincidence that about the same proportion of children in the Dunedin area received no Protestant Sabbath schooling. Relatively few Sunday school attenders in Otago and Southland can be identified in any source as coming from labouring homes, nor were labourers any better represented among adult congregations. At the Dunedin City Baptist Church between 1863 and 1873 labourers, whether urban or rural, constituted about a thirteenth of the male congregation.\textsuperscript{56} There were over three times as many clerks, carpenters and drapers in the congregation as there were labourers, together with representatives from more than thirty other trades and professions. Among unmarried, female members of the congregation, domestic service and dress-making were easily the most common forms of employment with domestic servants outnumbering dressmakers in a proportion of about 2.5 to 1. Ironically, the Raikesian Sunday school in Britain had started out as a middle class mission to the working class larrikin. Alive to the benefits of Sunday schooling, the English working classes had highjacked the movement and used it as a vehicle for social advancement, thus pre-empting one of the major aims of migration. Such was the success of English Sunday schooling, mediated through working class aspirations, that its migrant offshoot, a hundred years after Raikes, had become distanced by respectability from the very elements that the movement had initially set out to serve. A Scottish symbiosis between Sunday schooling and the parish school system accentuated this outcome in migrant Otago. The colony's Sabbath schools struggled to reach unclaimed working class lads drifting in the limbo years between the completion of primary schooling and the start of serious employment. St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, with its mission hall, attempted to bridge the larrikin gap, as did the North Chatton Christian Endeavour group in the context of rural Wendonside; problems of teenage, male hooliganism were not confined to the towns. The young women of the North Chatton group were scandalised by the noisy behaviour of boys, non-members of the association, who gate-crashed the back rows of the society's meetings over several nights in the summer of 1897. A Miss McIntosh, bravely, sat herself in the middle of the offending bunch in a stand-off of embarrassment. A Mr Neale sternly reminded the lads of God's presence. The boys continued to haunt the society's meetings for the next two months, not venturing inside but cat-


\textsuperscript{56} Dunedin City Baptist Church. Church Minutes. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
calling from outside the meeting hall. For many New Zealand Christian youth groups, the problems of breaching stereotypes and communicating across socio-economic barriers remain unresolved to this day.

The witness of today's New Zealand young Christian is further complicated by the overlaying of multiethnicity upon socioeconomic variables. Nineteenth century Sunday schooling in Otago and Southland faced the challenge of witnessing to the Kai Tahu and Chinese communities. Little was attempted amongst the Kai Tahu. Although, among Presbyterians, work amongst Maori was classified as a branch of foreign mission, Otago's Presbyterian Sabbath schools focused their mission support on the Indian, Chinese and, especially, the New Hebridean fields. For years Otago's Presbyterian Synod left the Lutherans to maintain an outreach to the Kai Tahu. After the demise of Lutheran missionary activity in Otago, the Presbyterian Reverend Alexander Blake briefly serviced the spiritual needs of Maori at Otago Heads. His ministrations, commencing in 1869, included the running of a Sunday school, attracting an attendance of about 20 of unspecified age range. Maori and mixed blood children also attended Sunday school at the Neck, Stewart Island in this period. After Blake's ministry faltered, the Otago Maori flock was tended by its own catechist, Patoromo. The Otago Presbyterian Synod, in 1871, voted £10 to fund his work, a sum equivalent to the cost of a modest Sunday school picnic, and only on condition that the local Maori community match this amount, a condition which they more than fulfilled.

It fell to the Reverend Alexander Don to minister to the migrant Chinese in Otago and Southland. The most interesting instances of Sunday school and Bible class work among Chinese, however, relate to the Hanover Street Baptist Church in Dunedin. Adult classes for the Chinese gardeners and laundrymen of North Dunedin commenced under the auspices of the church on 18 June 1899 in a room above Walter Paterson's shop in George Street; nine scholars attended the opening session. A Mr Butler led the class, but the real driving force behind it was its secretary, Miss Jessie

58 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1870, Appendix, Mission Committee's Report, pp.21-22.
60 Dunedin City Baptist Church. Hanover Street Baptist Church Chinese Mission Register.
Buchanan. Rapid expansion of the roll, eventually to thirty or more members with people travelling from Forbury on the opposite side of the town to attend, led the class to move to an upper room of the Hanover Street Sunday School building, with its meetings rescheduled for Sunday afternoons. Desiring to support a programme of one-to-one instruction in English, with the particular aim of fostering literacy, several young women of Mrs Alfred North's Bible class became teachers in the Chinese school, and Miss M. Buchanan of the Bible class acted as organist. A student-teacher ratio of 2-1 was achieved by the end of the school's first year of working, and individual language teaching was provided in those cases where the remedial need seemed most urgent. The grateful Chinese, in 1900, donated a banner which the Hanover Street Baptist Church still possesses. To this day, the Hanover Street congregation includes a vigorous Chinese element, organised under its own pastor, sometimes meeting in plenary session with the main church for worship in English, but more usually for separate services in Mandarin or Cantonese. For several of the young women from Mrs North's 1890s Bible class, the decision to involve themselves in outreach among the Chinese community in Dunedin proved to be a personal turning point in their lives.⁶¹

The drafting of young people from the Bible classes on to the Sunday school staff was an earnest desire of churches across the denominations. The drafting of youth was essential if the Sunday schools were to have sufficient teachers to implement the personalised, interactive delivery which distinguished their pedagogy from that of the day schools, and which the Sunday schools came to see as lying at the heart of their effectiveness.⁶² A young teaching force, however, created its own perceived dilemmas. The Sunday schools required, ideally, a teaching force which would balance the experience of age with the freshness of youth. It was regarded as desirable that as many teachers as possible should be enrolled church members, affording role models of commitment both to their children and their less experienced colleagues. The 'Rules for the Management of the Australasian Wesleyan Methodist Sunday Schools' stipulated that teachers should be, if not members, at least regular church attenders, of good moral character, 'attached to the disciplines and doctrines of Methodism'.⁶³ Across the denominations, it was regarded as essential that the Sunday school superintendent should be a mature, experienced male with status in the church community. In practice, too few mature adults from the several denominations had the time or inclination to teach.

---

⁶¹ See Chapter 11.
⁶² See Chapter 9.
Many Sunday school teachers were teenagers, especially in respect of the female staff. Through the last twenty years of the nineteenth century, the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod anxiously monitored the number of Sunday school teachers who were also church office bearers.

Table 21  
Staffing of Presbyterian Sabbath Schools in Otago and Southland, 1880-1901

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>No. of Staff</th>
<th>No. of Staff who were not Church Members</th>
<th>No. of Staff holding Office in the Church</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1879</td>
<td>536</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>752</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1883</td>
<td>929</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1888</td>
<td>1,307</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1892</td>
<td>1,317</td>
<td>272</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1895</td>
<td>1,385</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>1,331</td>
<td>237</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source:  
Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1879-1901

Presbyterian Sabbath schools in Otago operated with a teacher-pupil ratio of about 1-10 of nominal roll, further improving to a ratio of better than 1-9 by the turn of the century. Since class actual attendance rates were typically 75 per cent and teacher attendance rates 90 per cent of nominal roll, real class sizes of 1-7 or 8 would have been fairly common. At St Paul's Anglican Church, Dunedin, in 1866 four teachers catered for a morning class of 47 pupils and fifteen teachers an afternoon group of 133.64 The Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School, in the late 1870s, worked a roll of 350-370 pupils with a teaching staff of about 35.65 The Congregational Sunday School in South Dunedin, in 1880, had a roll of 120 pupils and a staff of 12.66 The Associated Churches of Christ Sunday School, St Andrew's Street, Dunedin, ran a school of 220 scholars in 1904 with a staff of 24 teachers.67

Where similar proportions were exceeded, in any Sunday school, it tended to be in the infant classes.

---

63 Australasian Wesleyan Methodist Church. Minutes of the Annual Conference, May 1875, pp.24-30. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLT 287.194 M.
65 Dunedin City Baptist Church. Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School Roll Book.
66 Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin. Notes on the History of the Church. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG36 Box 5.
67 Associated Churches of Christ, St Andrew Street. Teachers' meeting minute book, 21 September 1904. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 520 22.
and, often, a senior teacher would jointly operate a large class with one or more teenage, usually female, helpers.

As Table 21 shows, it was normal among Presbyterians, in any given year, for about one Sunday school teacher in five not to be a church member. Another 60 per cent were church members, and the remaining twenty per cent both members and church office holders. Knox Church, Dunedin, preserved a good record in this respect. Of the 34 elders and deacons at this church in 1880, between a third and a half can be definitely identified as past or contemporary Sabbath school workers. Dr H. McDonald and William B. Harlow were joint superintendents of the Main School in that year while, for a long period, Robert Chisholm ran the Sunday afternoon Bible class. At the First Church, Dunedin, in 1898 all three vice-presidents of the Sabbath School Association, Messrs E. Cameron, W. Nicolson and A. Struthers, were also church elders, as was the secretary, J. Wallace. The treasurer, J. Armstrong, was a deacon, and two more church office bearers served on the Sabbath School Association committee. Identity of surname suggests that three out of the six unmarried woman who served as Association committee members at this time were sisters or daughters of church elders. In the same year, both the vice-presidents of the First Church Young People’s Society of Christian Endeavour, J. Hislop and H.L. Watt, were deacons of the church. The Presbyterian schools seem to have been particularly stretched for staff during the time of the 'Exodus' of migrants to Australia, at the height of the 1880s recession. The needy church relaxed its recruitment criteria during 1887 and 1888 to the point where over a quarter of its Sabbath school teachers were not church members. The trans-Tasman outflow of teachers was mainly, although not exclusively, male; Knox Church, Dunedin, farewelled Miss A.T. Gillies for Sydney in 1886. Statistics for Sunday schools other than the Presbyterian show similar teacher-pupil ratios and a similar concern, consistent across the denominations and over time, that the teaching force reflect church membership. At Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School in 1865, there were 15 teachers for 107 children. The School's regulations stipulated that, in recruiting teachers, 'a preference be given to members of some Christian church', not specifically Wesleyan, but that all teachers in connection with the School 'strictly conform' to its rules.

68 Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1898.
69 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1886.
Feeding the Lambs

Staffing strains were heightened, especially for the Presbyterians, by the expectation that a woman would retire from Sunday school teaching when she married; the reasons for this are not clear because other fields of church activity, for example the Ladies' Associations and Mission Committees, remained open to married women. The year 1886 saw Knox Church Sabbath School releasing Miss Davys on the occasion of her marriage to Mr G.D. Braik. Both were young teachers at the school. Braik remained on the staff roll, but his wife was released although the school acknowledged that Mrs Braik's ability to hold and retain the interest of her pupils would be sadly missed. In the same year Miss Anne Bennett, Miss M. Mitchell and Miss Ewing resigned from the Otago Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School staff because of marriage. Widows were welcomed back to the teaching fold, as is evidenced by Mrs Glasgow's long years of service in the Main School as well as in the Missionary Association and Ladies' Association at Knox Church. Similarly Mrs Annie Elizabeth Brand gave years of stalwart service to Sabbath schooling and to the Young Women's Guild at the Dunedin First Church, while maintaining herself through her private day school at Russell Street. The Baptists seemed less averse to having married women on their Sunday school staff; there were five on the staff roll of the Hanover Street School in 1878.

In many cases close in age to their charges, Sunday school teachers also shared their social background. A visiting British cleric, travelling in the far north of New Zealand in the mid 1880s, described the teachers there as 'chiefly of the working classes'; he did not define his concept of 'working class'. In Otago and Southland the teachers came from the same cross-section of society as the more dedicated care of their pupils, from whose ranks they were often recruited, the skilled trades, self-employed and the professions. Friendships among Sunday school staff sometimes cemented business connections. The fact that contemporary Sunday school staff lists seldom gave the initials or residential addresses of teachers makes identification difficult for today's researcher. It is hard to distinguish householder, brother and son, sister and daughter. Despite its limitations, the available evidence suggests a similar occupational mix among the school staff across each Protestant denomination. Among the 18 male staff of the Hanover Street Baptist School in 1878, there were

---

70 Port Chalmers Methodist Church. Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes, 26 September 1866. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 52/7/1.
71 Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1889-1896. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Dunedin.
72 Dunedin City Baptist Church. Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School Roll Book.
two bootmakers, two drapers, a grocer, a bookkeeper and a clerk. Mr Bardsley was either the father or the son from the family soap-making business at Great King Street. Of the 17 women staff at Hanover Street in the same year, one was a grocer's wife, another the wife of a carpenter. The single women included the sister or daughter, respectively, of a china dealer, a carrier and a shipwright. Miss Kincaid must have belonged to the Kincaid family associated with the successful Vulcan Foundry. Miss Jarrett ran a private school. William Ings, godfather of Baptist Sunday schooling in South Dunedin and mentor of Bessie Turnbull at East Taieri, was an orchardist and gardener.

Among the Presbyterians the architect, R.A. Lawson, Otago's church designer *par excellence*, was superintendent of the Main School at Dunedin's First Church in 1886. Included among his Sabbath school male staff in that year were a carpenter, grocer, packer, saddler, salesman, watchmaker, possibly a bootmaker, possibly an ironmonger and at least three day-school teachers. Of the twelve unmarried female staff, two can be identified as day-school teachers. At the Russell Street Mission School in the same year, the superintendent, Archibald Morrison, was a plumber. Trades and professions which can be identified amongst the male staff at Russell Street are: boilermaker, day-school teacher, ironmonger, newspaper publisher and printer. Two of the unmarried female staff were daughters of clergy. Another, Miss Dow, was a self-employed dressmaker and milliner, running a shop in lower George Street in partnership with her sister. Teachers used their Sunday school network to good effect in secular as well as church affairs. Robert Chisholm, for example, long-serving Bible class leader at Knox Church, Dunedin, was a cabinet maker in the employment of Arthur Scoullar, fellow elder and former Sunday school teacher at the same church.

The bedrock of Sunday school support in Otago and Southland came from families whose aspirations were upwards, socially and economically as well as spiritually. Sunday school attitudes were ambivalent towards socio-economic casualties Clement White, of Dunedin's Knox Church, personifies this aspect of Sunday schooling. Church work saw him rise from Sunday school teaching

---

74 Dunedin City Baptist Church. Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School Roll Book.
75 Presbyterian First Church of Otago. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1886. Also *Stone's Directory* for 1886.
76 See listed names and addresses of office bearers in the Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, and employment data listed in *Stone's Directory*. 
in 1880, to become superintendent of the infant department and a church elder by 1884. In secular employment he progressed, by 1887, from being a clerk to become managing partner in the Caxton Steam Printing Works.\textsuperscript{78} If prosperity was a by-product of Christian virtue, then equally, to the godly migrant, insolvency was a moral fault. Culpable debt not only rendered one unfit to teach; it could call church membership itself into question. The Deacons' Minute Books of the Hanover Street Baptist Church afford several instances where church members had their membership suspended for bankruptcy. Reinstatement would be offered later if the deacons' investigation cleared the suspect member of spendthrift or imprudent behaviour. Heirs of the Covenant, whether mediated through English or Scottish evangelical traditions, did not believe that God would abandon His faithful children to want.

As pioneering shaded into established settlement in Otago and Southland and material goals were achieved, the mythology of the settlers mirrored the new achievements. The Protestant Sunday schools, increasingly comprehensive in their outreach between 1870 and 1900 and operating from increasingly well developed organisational platforms, played a major role in socialising the firstborn of migration into the settlement's emerging culture. Schools relating to the different denominations experienced varying patterns of fortune across the several decades. Nevertheless, collectively they deeply touched the lives of over half of the settlement's children, often over sustained periods of time. The schools' failure was with the children of unskilled labour. Servicing particularly the offspring of the 'anxious classes', aspirants in a process of upward social levelling, the schools gave spiritual sanction to the aims and values of migration, while reaffirming connection with the traditions of home. They became society's antidote to the secularisation of the public education system, the perceived guarantors of a moral future. In affording opportunities for initiative as well as service, often for the young and especially for young women, they 'exalted the humble and meek', and helped to bridge the generation gap between the migrant parent and the colonially born. They cemented personal and community ties. At the same time, whether through mission contact or resource sharing, they helped local communities to define themselves in relation to a wider national and international context. As will be elaborated in later chapters, the practice of Sunday schooling in Otago and Southland reflected the full range of the migrants' aspirations, their material as well as their spiritual credo. Facing the onset of the twentieth century self-critically but with optimism, the

\textsuperscript{77} See Chapter 10.

\textsuperscript{78} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1880-1887.
province's Sunday schools offered their charges a world view encompassing accountability and responsibility, but also purpose, dignity and the Covenant promise of blessing for each child of God.
Chapter 8  Feeding the Lambs: Curriculum in the Sunday Schools, 1870-1901

'Occasionally hints are received, or indications are noticed, which give cause to doubt whether much really valuable scriptural instruction is received by many of the children, in spite of all the efforts made'. Uneasy perceptions, of the type articulated by the Sabbath Schools Committee of the Otago Presbyterian Synod in 1893, provided impetus for the curricular reform of Sunday schools in the later nineteenth century, a process which touched both lesson content and pedagogy. Faced with the secularization of public elementary education after 1877, and with the diffuse but alarming influence of the Higher Criticism, church and Sunday school leaders in the Otago and Southland region became concerned during this period about the effectiveness of Sunday school programmes. The vigorous growth of Bible classes in the 1890s correlated with the churches' desire to give maturing young people a strong intellectual foundation for their Christian faith. Ministers and Sunday school teachers of all Protestant denominations were anxious that the quality of religious education delivered in the Sunday schools and Bible classes should at least match that of opportunities foregone in the secularised public system, and they looked to curriculum design to remedy the Sabbath schools' alleged failings; effectiveness was generally perceived as a function of an appropriate choice of curriculum content. Conscious of their small, local resource base, church and Sunday school leaders in Otago and Southland often drew on interdenominational, international models in their programme planning. They sought to standardise their Sabbath schools' programmes as a way of ensuring that Sabbath scholars were given systematic rather than randomly selected teaching in the content of the Scriptures. Standardisation facilitated accountability through common systems of pupil testing, teacher training and teacher support. The thrust towards credentialling in Otago's Sunday schools after 1870 underlined a widely held assumption that the delivery of religious and moral education should duplicate the mechanisms of a secular system geared to the imparting of factual knowledge. The ethical, however, is at once a cognitive and affective domain. A curriculum which aspires to be effective in the field of values cannot neatly separate the epistemological and the psychological. The new emphasis on childhood conversion which developed in the schools in the post-1870 period had major implications for pedagogy as well as curriculum content. If the conversion of the child was to be Sunday schools' priority, then school programmes had to become more pupil-focused and interactive in delivery, and Christological rather than dryly catechetical. Both these points are illustrated in the greater prominence which was given to vocal and
instrumental music, to the 'service of sacred song', in Sunday school programmes in the years following 1870.

Evidence relating to the nature and effects of curriculum change in Otago and Southland is not always easy to find. Precisely because they were cheap and readily available, Sunday school teaching materials were seldom preserved. Today's researcher finds isolated treasures of information hidden in collections of personal papers; very little has been retained in official church archives. A picture of Sunday school curriculum has to be pieced together from rare surviving examples of lesson notes, especially those relating to the 'International Series of Lessons', from examination syllabi and test papers, from the content of hymns, from mission tracts, library catalogues, from articles written for children in the journals of the time, and from incidental references in conference and synod reports.

Despite the excruciating agonies of boredom which the practice sometimes engendered, a significant lobby of conservative church leaders in Otago and Southland remained committed to catechetical teaching in the Sunday schools. Catechetical drill had been normal practice in Sunday schools, internationally and across the denominations, at mid-century. Evangelical Christianity had revived what had been an obsolete custom as a preparation for adult conversion. In Scotland, the parish day schools were expected to provide a Biblically based education. The Scottish Sabbath schools' task was to reinforce the day schools' teaching with a thorough catechetical grounding in doctrine. Scottish Presbyterianism held that a mature Christian identity would emerge from ground so prepared in childhood. Once the validity of childhood conversion had been accepted, catechetical teaching could still be justified as a maturational aid, its doctrinal framework being held to provide a scaffolding for responsible judgment and moral living. The Scots transplanted their traditions to Otago and some, in the manner typical of migrants, clung to selectively remembered forms of home with more conservatism than the home culture itself. In January 1887 the Sabbath Schools' Committee of the Presbyterian Synod of Otago and Southland offered the award of an Oxford Bible to each Sunday school scholar under the age of fifteen who tested word-perfect in the Westminster

---

2  For a summary of the content of the Westminster Shorter Catechism, see Chapter 4.
Shorter Catechism. Rejecting charges of pedantry, the Committee maintained that only in the achievement of perfect oral accuracy would catechetical practice yield its ripest fruit. Supplementary instructions to examiners in October 1887 directed that the slightest error must be counted, ‘even if it does not affect the meaning of the answer’. The following year, 1888, the Committee denied that its rules were too stringent, arguing that similar conditions had proved to be well within the capacity of Presbyterian children in England and Scotland. It had, nevertheless, to compromise with reality, Otago and Southland candidates for the Committee’s catechetical test now being accorded a tolerance of five mistakes. Only eight entrants, all Maori children from the Native School at the Neck, Stewart Island, met the prescribed conditions in 1889. Proving unpopular, the scheme was abandoned after 1890. A single entrant, Isabella McKay of Wyndham, aged nine, had been able to perform without mistake in two tests, spaced by a week’s interval, during the last year of the scheme; two others from the same parish had passed with one and two mistakes respectively.

Catechising, together with the rote learning of Biblical texts, remained an important feature of Sunday school teaching, in Otago and beyond. Mr R. Chisholm’s Bible class at Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, worked on passages of the Shorter Catechism, together with material from Pauline epistles, for its course of study during 1888. Doctrinal drill continued to be perceived as a necessary and effective foundation for right conduct, even by critics of conventional churchmanship. Harry Albert Atkinson, nephew of New Zealand’s conservative premier of the 1880s, launched a Socialist Church in Christchurch in October 1896. It operated a Sunday school and took its children through appropriately adapted forms of drill, espousing a humanist model of the Decalogue:

5 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, October 1887, Appendix, Conditions of the Shorter Catechism Examination, p.57.
7 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1889, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools Committee for 1889, p.15.
8 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1890, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools Committee for 1889-1890, p.42.
9 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons’ Court, Bible Class Report, 1888.
* love your schoolfellows ...
* love learning
* make every day holy by good deeds and kindly actions
* honour good men ... bow down to none
* do not hate or speak evil of anyone
* do not be cowardly
* remember that all good things on earth are produced by labour
* observe and think in order to discover the truth
* do not think that those who love their country must hate and despise other nations
* look forward to the day when all men and women will be free citizens of one fatherland.¹¹

A Rationalist Sunday School, the Dunedin Lyceum, opening in the Oddfellows Hall in May 1881, moved away from dogmatic formulae, promising its seventy or so young adherents a religion of Reason and a ritual 'whose only laws are Beauty and Truth and whose sole end is Goodness'.¹² The school's leaders, among whom were numbered future premier Robert Stout, and a Dunedin bookseller, Joseph Braithwaite, mingled rationalism, theism and spiritualism in their personal philosophies. A local press observer reported on the operation of one of the Dunedin Lyceum's Sunday classes in 1881. The children were divided into eight groups, each group carrying flags symbolic of aspects of the natural world, each aspect in turn a metaphor for a facet of personal development, whether physical, mental or moral. The school's psycho-romantic vision was highlighted in discussion and reading of poetry, its group dynamics reinforced in marching exercises and the singing of Thomas Bracken's 'National Song'.¹³ Laws of beauty and truth, however, transcend rationality, and ritual is an affective rather than cognitive device. Within five years the experiment of the Rationalist Sunday School foundered on the dichotomy between the Enlightenment and Romanticism, between liberal humanism and moral direction. A disillusioned


¹³ Information kindly supplied by Shaun Broadley, from his post-graduate research currently being conducted under the auspices of the History Department of the University of Otago.
Braithwaite joined the Anglican communion, serving on Synod from 1892, and also on the City Mission Committee and the committee of the Bible in State Schools League.\textsuperscript{14}

The Rationalist Sunday School failed, but Otago's church leaders continued to worry over the wider socio-intellectual impact of liberal humanism. They were concerned especially for its impact on young male minds, because it was among young men that the churches faced their greatest retention problems. Imaginative Christian leaders saw that conventionally catechetical approaches in religious education, however time-honoured, were not enough on their own for the needs of young people in the later nineteenth century. Otago's Christian spokespeople worried over the cumulative effect, particularly on males, of interaction between a secularised education system and the elusive but widespread influence of the Higher Criticism, an interaction which they saw potentially as severing public and private morality at its source.\textsuperscript{15} The Higher Criticism cut across Biblical literalism, requiring a rethinking of the foundations and nature of faith. Human morality, from a traditionally Christian perspective, was derivative from God's absolute standards, the Bible was God's revelation of His standards, and catechetical exposition was a human summation of God's revealed truth. The interplay of a secularised education system with a secular exegesis threatened a scission of the logic on which a cohesive community was held to depend. Protestant denominations in Otago and Southland had generally acquiesced in the secularism of the 1877 legislation, but had not anticipated the exclusion of non-expository Bible reading from the schools.\textsuperscript{16} In 1891 the Otago Presbyterian Synod argued the educational claims of the Bible as the 'authoritative exposition of true morality', as the force which had largely 'moulded' the English language and shaped English literature, as 'an integral part of the British constitution', the inspiration of much British legislation and as the arbiter of British justice.\textsuperscript{17} The Presbyterian Synod drew unfavourable comparisons between public education in New Zealand and the alleged ready access to Scripture enjoyed in the elementary schools of Great Britain. The spokesmen of Otago's migrant Presbyterian community were often well-read scholars who had thought through and beyond the illusory clash of religion and scientific and historical methodology, men who were not afraid of mental challenge but who had a real fear


\textsuperscript{15} For a fuller discussion of the nature of the Higher Criticism, see Chapter 5.

\textsuperscript{16} See Chapter 5.

\textsuperscript{17} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1891, Appendix, Report of the Committee on Bible-Reading in Public Schools, p 54.
of ignorance. The D.M. Stuarts, James Gibbs and Rutherford Waddells of Otago foresaw a rising generation of Biblical illiterates in the colony, young people who had been legally denied access to the Scriptures, who had never been exposed to sustained theological debate and who would fall easy prey to glib, shallow half-truth.

For some Sunday school teachers childhood conversion, an adaptive approach to Sabbath school work which swept the western world after 1860, seemed to provide a laterally conceived answer to the rationalist threat, and Otago followed the international trend. Otago's church and Sunday school leaders of the later nineteenth century understood well that a secure Christian identity called for a development of the whole person. It needed both a doctrinal and devotional foundation, an underpinning both of Sunday school teaching and experientially shared worship. As North Dunedin's Reverend J. Gibson Smith explained: 'The Sunday school is necessarily mainly devoted to instruction. The devotional element by which alone the spirit of reverence is fostered cannot be made very prominent'.

Childhood, rather than adult, conversion was a formula which held promise of bridging the gap between the doctrinal and the devotional and, through a radical reorientation of the Sunday schools' focus, of solving the problem of loss of youth from the church.

The formula of conversion which gripped the Sunday schools of the period defined Christian identity as a universally available but individually accepted gift of Grace, and as the departure rather than arrival point of spiritual pilgrimage. Its manifestation might be instantaneous or develop in sequential steps; it was not up to human instrumentalities to dictate process to the Holy Spirit. It was, however, not the same as the development of the 'higher life', of which it was a precondition. It was not hereditary. William Groser of the Sunday School Union explained in his *Elementary Handbook of Sunday School Instruction*, 'All distinctions of social rank or mental culture melt away in the presence of the searching truth "Ye must be born again". The 'supreme object' of the Sunday school teacher must be to lead the young to repentance and faith in Christ, following this step with a programme of spiritual nurturing akin to a Keswick quest for holiness.

---

19 *Victorian Primitive Methodist* (Melbourne), No 2, Vo. 2, October 1876, p.30.
21 See Chapter 5 for a broader discussion of the nature of conversion.
Validation of the conversion process gained international impetus during the last three decades of the nineteenth century. D.L. Moody's revitalising of the Illinois Sunday School Union was reputed to have generated 10,000 conversions a year among the youth of the American mid-west in the late 1860s. In Australia, the Sunday School column of the *Victorian Independent and Journal of the Congregational Church* counselled, in 1872, 'Aim at conversion... Christ's lambs do not have to grow into sheep before entering the fold'. The *Victorian Primitive Methodist* stated, in 1876: 'We firmly believe in the conversion of children and desire to see Sunday schools become a greater agency in this work'.

A new urgency to promote childhood conversion, at the earliest possible age, reached across to the Protestant denominations in New Zealand. The *New Zealand Baptist*, while explicitly rejecting infant baptism, commented in October 1882: 'We believe it is possible that a child may come to exercise faith in Christ at so early an age that, in after years, he will be unable to recollect a time when he was not a believer'. In the *Baptist's* December issue of that year, the Reverend T.L. Davies drew a distinction between childhood and adult conversions, while arguing for the validity of both. To confine conversion to adult experience, he argued, was tantamount to saying that a full florescence of sin was a necessary precondition for Christian identity. Conversion, for Davies, was a surrender of the self to Christ. The adult came in penitence, the child in infant helplessness; in neither case would God reject the suppliant. A Baptist itinerant preacher Mrs Hampson, had reached Dunedin on Wednesday, April 6, 1881, in a mission which successfully crossed denominational boundaries and which touched young and old alike. Her preaching was 'richly owned and blessed' with hundreds of adult conversions and, for the Hanover Street Baptists, it produced encouraging spin-off in the Sunday school, 'a number of our boys and girls having been

---

24 *Victorian Primitive Methodist* (Melbourne), No 2, Vol 2, October 1876, p.30.
25 *The New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch), October 1882, p.166.
27 *New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch), May 1881, p.61.
led to decision for Christ. Over the next two years the Hanover Street Baptist Church noted a flow-on effect in heightened levels of support for the Christian Band. The South Dunedin Baptist Church Sunday School, also in 1881, listed the names of 5 boys and 14 girls who had made 'decisions for Christ', during the previous year. Perhaps because of considerations of age, some but not all of these had been baptised. Among the Methodists, the Sunday School Teachers' Minutes of the Linden Wesleyan Church, Dunedin, reported quarterly on the numbers of conversions among the scholars during the 1870s and 1880s. The numbers were not high; 5 out of a total Sunday school roll of 89 were converted in November 1883. Linden's rates improved during the 1890s, with 16 conversions from a nominal roll of 170 scholars noted in August 1892 and an aggregate of 44 conversions during the year 1893.

Reports regarding campaigns with a focus on youth conversion, run by Wesleyans overseas, moved Otago and Southland's staid Presbyterian Synod to emulation in 1900:

Youth is the most impressionable time. Figures are quoted from those who have made the subject a speciality, and from these the conclusion is irresistible, that on our boys and girls, our young men and women still in their teens, our Church should concentrate her efforts. Would it not be a good thing to have a "Decision Week" universal throughout the Church every year at the same time? And let the whole energy and prayer of the membership be thrown into the business. The Methodists in Australia adopt that plan and this year they report between two and three thousand conversions.

Youth conversion, however, was far from being a new concept to Otago Presbyterianism in 1900. Young converts among the Christian Endeavour group at Otago's Presbyterian First Church in the 1890s had pledged their commitment to a life renewed by faith: 'As a believer in the Lord Jesus Christ I promise, trusting in Him for strength, that I will strive to do whatever He would have me

28 New Zealand Baptist (Christchurch), June 1881, pp.77-78.
29 New Zealand Baptist (Christchurch), June 1883, p.28-.
31 Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin. Minutes, 2 November 1883. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 Box 42 1528. See also Chapter 6.
do...33 The Knapdale Christian Endeavour Society minutes for the period 1896-1899 show the members, typically aged 15 to 25, as repeatedly 'giving their testimony', relating their individual experiences of conversion, testifying to their ongoing sense of the power of Jesus in their lives, predicated the growth of holiness on conversion and calling on others present to 'choose Christ'.34 Otago Presbyterianism did not confine its evangelism to the teenage years. Dunedin's Evangelist, as early as 1872, quoted a young Sunday school teacher, asking her class: 'How soon should a child give its heart to God?' Suggested ages ranged from 6 to 13 years. The reply of the last child in the class clinched the argument: 'Just as soon as we know who God is'.35

The conversion process offered an affective approach, friendly in its immediacy and simplicity for young children and also for teachers who might be young and inexperienced. Positing Christianity as an entry into a vital relationship, the new approach was confusing for teachers who had trodden the traditional road where the catechism was a prelude to, rather than a development of, Christian commitment. Conversion short-circuited the niceties both of traditional theology and of contemporary abstract speculation. D.L. Moody himself, challenged regarding the Higher Criticism, rejoined, 'I don't know what it is. They ask me if I think there were two Isaiahs. Before taking up that question seriously, I believe we should try to see what the prophecy itself contains'.36 Damned by its critics as shallow emotionalism, childhood conversion called for the establishment and subsequent nurturing of the child's conscious relationship with the living Spirit rather than the cumulative apprehension of a set of ideas. Conservative Sunday school teachers in Otago, treading catechetical paths towards a post-millennial tomorrow, found themselves challenged in unfamiliar ways. A visiting Anglican missioner and exponent of holiness in the Keswick tradition, G.C. Grubb, arriving in Oamaru in 1893, was struck by 'the absolute ignorance, even of Sunday school teachers, about present salvation. One of them said to Jackson (a companion of Grubb) "What do you mean by conversion? I have always supposed that I am as good as I can be and do all I can. I should be all

35 The Evangelist (Dunedin), October 1872.
right in the end." Aghast at such attempts to accrue salvation from the application of a
decontextualised morality, Grubb launched his own Sunday school meeting in Oamaru and many
children were 'led to look to Jesus'. His subsequent Young Men's Meeting produced twenty-five
conversions.

The other prong of the Sunday schools' counter-thrust against secular humanism, their attempts to
standardise the schools' curricula, appears at first glance to negate the informal spontaneity of
childhood conversion. Curricular standardisation and conversion, in reality, were parallel rather than
mutually exclusive trends in the Sunday schooling of the day. A set curriculum did not preclude
conversion but rather provided a framework within which it might occur, in a pairing of head and
heart, and more importantly it provided a context within which the newly converted child could be
nurtured into maturity of faith and practice. A coherent, Scripturally-based curriculum plan could
be viewed as a spiritual weaning device, leading babes in Christ from milk to the meat of the Word.
It would allow monitoring of children's progress in knowledge through the Sunday schools through
internal or interschool testing. It would provide a scaffolding of continuity for schools servicing a
mobile population, and it would facilitate Sunday school teacher training. Importantly, also, it would
keep schools in touch with international and, very likely, interdenominational models and trends.
Within Otago, it would enable church and Sunday school leaders more readily to gauge the pulse
of activity across the several schools. Realising its own ignorance regarding typical Sunday school
usage, the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod mounted a survey of Presbyterian Sabbath
school practice in 1875 and its Sabbath Schools Committee reported in the following year. The
report highlighted the need for a rationalisation of approach across the schools. The Bible and the
Westminster Shorter Catechism, the survey showed, were the standard Presbyterian Sunday school
sources. Their use was almost universal. A few schools used the Bible alone, a small number
employed the Bible and the Mother's Catechism as being more suited to younger children, and a
single school had replaced the Shorter Catechism with the First and Second Catechisms of the
Presbyterian Church of Victoria. Bateman's Hymn Book was the preferred musical source. Despite
commonality of texts, however, selection of Biblical topic and sequence of coverage varied at
random from school to school. Already, in 1874, the Presbyterian Sabbath Schools Committee had

---

recommended that catechetical teaching be supplemented by the series of 'Notes on Bible Lessons' prepared by the Edinburgh Sunday School Union. A further recommendation, in 1879, suggested that a subcommittee of Synod draw up its own scheme of lessons, to counteract 'the unconnected nature of subjects frequently taught'.

The 'International Series of Lessons' finally brought some coherence to the Sabbath school curriculum, not only for Presbyterian schools in Otago and Southland but on a much wider transdenominational scale. This series of Sunday school lessons, initially an American publication, became a joint Anglo-American project under the auspices of an international committee of the London-based Sunday School Union, geared to the purpose of providing generic support materials. Popular in Britain and America and allegedly used by 6 million children, the series became the preferred vehicle for instruction in Sunday schools of Protestant denominations across Australasia. Versions for use in worldwide mission schools, in languages such as Urdu, were produced. The Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod endorsed the adoption of the International Lessons in 1880, and the series was used by Congregationalist and Baptist Sunday schools. The interdenominational Otago Sunday School Union promoted the use of the Lessons leading the Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, for example, to adopt them in 1887. The availability of 'copious and helpful Notes for Teachers' published through the Sunday School Times, London, increased the series' appeal.

Locally some teething troubles were experienced in using the International Lessons. An internationally standardised system for mediating a universal gospel could not differentiate satisfactorily for local conditions and requirements. The earlier issues of the Lessons, it seems, were

---

40 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1879, Appendix, Report of Synod's Committee on Sabbath Schools, 1879, p.8.
43 Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin. Minutes, 22 June 1887.
too slanted towards Bible class rather than junior Sunday school work. Otago Presbyterian teachers found the Lessons 'useless' for their burgeoning infant classes, and many had reservations about their suitability for children under the age of 12.45 Nevertheless, in 1891, Sunday schools in at least fifty Presbyterian parishes in the region were reported as using the International material, with budgetary constraints alone preventing more from following suit.46 A Synod survey in 1895 found that, out of 64 responding schools constituting about a third of the region's total, 46 were satisfied with the Lessons, 9 were acquiescent and 9 dissatisfied.47 Another survey the following year produced a similar result. The dissatisfied minority of schools favoured the 'Free Church Schemes of Lessons', with the method of grading the lessons remaining the main point at issue.48 The Main School at First Church, Invercargill, and the Roxburgh Sabbath School opted for the Free Church alternative. The Anglicans at St Paul's Church, Dunedin, preferred to give their Sunday school teaching an overtly denominational thrust. They used Eugene Stock's *Acts of the Apostles* with their senior Sunday school classes in 1887, but were looking for a text that would more directly mirror Anglican teaching.49 Perhaps reflecting liturgical concerns, they also distributed printed forms among their scholars to serve as guidelines for private prayer.

Despite its widespread use, very little of the International Lesson material issued in Otago and Southland has survived. The schedule for the year 1905, probably typical of the programme, set out a full year's curriculum of Sabbath readings, subdivided into 'morning subjects' and 'afternoon subjects'; international Sunday schooling did not necessarily accord with the usual Otago practice of running a single Sunday school session in the afternoon. The scheduled topics covered an even spread of Old and New Testament material.50 A motto for the year was provided, 'Cleave to that which is good', and each week carried a 'golden text' for memorization. A substantial book of notes

45 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1885, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools Committee, p.64.
46 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1891, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools Committee, p.60.
49 St Paul's Anglican Cathedral, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, 7 August 1887. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 147 1002 N1.
accompanying the schedule, published by the London Sunday School Union and aimed at the Sunday school teacher, provided background information and also hints for weekly class teaching. The background information included a glossary, maps and half-page, referenced biographical outlines on each major figure appearing in the scheduled Biblical texts, for example: Cyrus, Daniel, Esther, Ezra, Hezekiah, Jeremiah, Nehemiah, John the Baptist, the disciple John and Pontius Pilate. Strong emphasis was given in these outlines to character analysis and evaluation, mirroring the moral concerns of Old Testament prophecy.\(^{51}\) The introductory notes offered a further two pages of Christological commentary, upholding Christ as the definitive portrayal of the Divine in human terms.

Notes relating directly to Sunday school exposition provided the teacher with lesson structures, Scriptural cross-references and brief textual annotation to support his or her weekly delivery in class. Three or four-step sequences of lesson development were set out for teachers at junior, intermediate and Bible class levels. No infant section was provided. The sequences were concerned almost entirely with content, and made no distinction of material across the age grades. The differences between the recommended junior and senior approaches lay in vocabulary and sophistication of illustration, not in underlying concept. The morning study for the first Sunday in January, 1905, took Psalm 27 as its text: 'The Lord is my light and my salvation whom should I fear?' In the context of Absalom's rebellion against his father, David, the study emphasized God's immanence as a friend to needy human beings. The study notes advised teachers of junior classes to gather relevant illustrations from family life, suggesting as an example a word-picture of a child holding its mother's hand; the feminization of role model is interesting. Bible class teachers were advised to link Scriptural discussion with literary reference. Exemplary quotations from Ruskin, Robert Browning and Shakespeare were provided, highlighting the way advanced Sunday schooling was conceived as a complement to a liberal education.\(^{52}\) The planners of the International Series of Lessons seemingly believed that all human creativity, whether consciously or unconsciously, had its source in the Divine.

Cheap, printed material relating to the International Lessons was available to pupils as well as to teachers. Double-sided information sheets which interpreted and enlarged on the Sunday programme,

\(^{51}\) Notes on the Scripture Lessons for the Year 1905, pp.xvii-xxiv.

\(^{52}\) Notes on the Scripture Lessons for the Year 1905, pp.1-4.
were available in New Zealand through the Bible, Tract and Book Society and were issued weekly to many scholars. Surviving examples issued at the Kaikorai Presbyterian Sunday School, Dunedin, during 1896 and 1897 were based on the Book of Proverbs, on the Old Testament stories of David and Solomon, and on the New Testament Book of Acts cross-referenced with extracts from the Pauline epistles.\textsuperscript{53} The standard format for each sheet included an illustrative line drawing, memory verse and a schedule of daily Scripture readings thematically linked to the week's 'golden text'. Supplementary notes, in brief allusions to Biblical authorship and in frequent but peripheral annotatory comment relating to the history, geography and natural history of the Holy Land, implicitly acknowledged the influence of historical and scientific methodology upon contemporary Biblical exegesis. The sovereignty of God on the other hand was confidently asserted. The role of Jesus as the incarnate bridge between humanity and the Divine, the unconditional love of Jesus and the universal availability of forgiveness were recurrent and significant themes developed from the weekly 'golden texts'.

Conversion was preached through the International Lessons, but it was not antinomian. Children were left in no doubt that good conduct and salvation were co-conditional. Good works, although not the cause, were certainly the fruit of salvation; prosperity in this world, if not happiness in the next, was the complementary fruit of good works. The drawing illustrating the note sheet issued at Kaikorai for Sunday, 22 November 1896, under the heading 'Rewards of Obedience', showed a rural idyll, far more British than colonial in conception, with a man and boy, perhaps father and son, seated under a tree reading a Bible, an obedient dog at their feet, a harvest field and church in the distance.\textsuperscript{54} A contrasting note sheet for Sunday, 28 September 1896, reconstructed material from the Book of Proverbs as a Temperance lesson. Its line illustration showed two well-heeled young men, both sporting bowler hats and strutting with walking canes, about to enter a public bar. The golden text cautioned: 'There is a way that seemeth right unto a man, but the end thereof are the ways of death'.\textsuperscript{55} The drawing for Sunday, May 30, 1897, based on the Second Epistle of James, focused on charitable relief (Illustration 5).\textsuperscript{56} The recipient family, as depicted, were poor, their floor bare

\textsuperscript{53} Kaikorai Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, 1896-1897. Sunday School Ephemera. Among the papers of Peter Randall, Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 90-107.
\textsuperscript{54} Kaikorai Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, 1896-1897. Sunday School Ephemera, 'Rewards of Obedience', 22 November 1896.
\textsuperscript{55} Ibid., 'Destructive Vices', 20 September 1896.
\textsuperscript{56} Ibid., 'Christian Faith Leads to Good Works', 30 May 1897.
boards, their windows broken, their children thin and clothed in patched rags. They were, however, the deserving poor, the husband-breadwinner with a broken arm and the wife dutifully personifying the virtues of motherhood, enthroned as domestic queen and nursing an infant. All showed signs of proper gratitude towards their benefactress, significantly but not unexpectedly a woman, soberly but decently dressed, the embodiment of benevolent respectability.

Illustration 5   Golden Text for Sunday, May 30, 1897

Presumably the interschool examinations which the Otago Sunday School Union ran during the 1890s, and possibly earlier, were based on the International Series of Lessons, encapsulating one of the anticipated benefits of a standardised curriculum. Evidence from other sources, however, shows
how keenly Otago Sunday schools of the later nineteenth century tried to match the rigour of day school assessment procedures, whether or not the Sunday schools concerned were linked into the Otago Union's scheme. Unfortunately the test papers and prescriptions relating to the Union programme have been lost, along with the rest of the Union's archive, doubly regrettable because examination schedules shed light both on content emphases and pedagogy. Records from Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church show twenty or more of the Church's Sabbath scholars as competing annually in the Otago Union examinations from the early 1890s. Selina Pretsch, in 1894, became the Church's pioneer prize-winning candidate at this level. But the First Church, like many other churches from many denominations in Otago and Southland, had also run its own internal tests for its scholars during the 1880s, well before it decided on Union affiliation. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings at the Church for the years 1882 and 1883 recorded the setting of quarterly examinations by the teachers, and listed the names of boys and girls winning prizes at senior, junior and infant levels. The setting and marking of such examinations appears to have been a chore, because in 1883 the First Church decided to change its system of testing. In future children under the age of 13 were to be examined orally on the Shorter Catechism by the Sunday school superintendent, while formal written papers for the older children were to be replaced with two extended essays, each requiring six months' preparation. The topics chosen for the coming year were the lives of Peter and Samuel. Both life stories provided a conversion focus, and Samuel's offered a proto-Christian model of childhood conversion. But the essay system found little favour with the First Church's scholars; the 1884 Sabbath School Teachers' Annual General Meeting reported only five entries and these of poor quality. Accordingly the quarterly written examinations were revived the following year.

Denominationally-based, interschool examination schemes also operated during and after the 1880s. The Otago Anglican Synod developed its own examination programme at this time. The richest examination-derived source of curricular information lies in the well-preserved records of the Bible and Church History Class Committee of the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod. This examination scheme, which operated from 1882 to 1892, was foreshadowed in an overture from the Dunedin Presbytery to the annual meeting of the Otago and Southland Synod in 1881, expressing concern that the migrant Kirk was failing to ground its youth in 'a sound knowledge of the history

57 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of the Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 1882-1901.
and principles of Presbyterianism'. The overture's denominational focus reflected the pioneers' desire to preserve a cultural as well as a spiritual heritage among the rising generations of settlers, and contrasted with the ecumenicism of the Otago Sunday School Union and the International Series of Lessons; it was time for a migrant society to retell its defining myths to its offspring. The collapse of the resulting examination scheme after only a decade of operation suggests that the colonially born preferred an alternative, Curnowesque mythology; their emerging world view was 'something different, something nobody counted on'.

During the period of the scheme's implementation, a detailed plan to address the issues raised in the Dunedin Presbytery overture, modelled on a programme already implemented in Scotland by Dr Alexander Whyte, was developed by the Reverend Rutherford Waddell. A committee of Synod was established to prepare an annual examination syllabus reflecting the tenets of Presbyterianism, together with a list of required textbooks, and to organize a system of testing. In addition, supplementary study guides were to be published monthly in the *Presbyterian*. In the event these proved to contain little beyond an expansion of content. Although the Bible classes were the main target group, a prescription in two sections, 'junior' and 'senior', was developed for 1882. After 1886 the prescription was further subdivided into Sections A, B, C and D. These, respectively, were for candidates under 14 years of age, for the 14 to 18 year-old bracket, for those over 18 and for senior 'honours' candidates.

The syllabus requirements showed little differentiation across the age range. They were catechetically Presbyterian, and Scottish in the standards of scholarship, or at least in the volume of output, expected from candidates. Entrants at all levels sat written tests on catechetical and Biblical knowledge, and all grades were offered the option of an extended essay. In the catechetical questions senior entrants were required to show mastery, not only of the fundamental articles of Presbyterian doctrine, but also of the accompanying scriptural 'proofs'. Prescribed Biblical material for all grades alternated between a study of Old Testament and New Testament books, with St Luke's gospel and

---

58 *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland*, 1881, Appendix, Overture from Presbytery of Dunedin on the instruction of the youth of the Church, p.65.


59 *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland*, 1881, Appendix, Proposed Scheme for a Formation of a System of Bible and Church History Classes throughout the Province of Otago. pp.66-67.

60 See Appendix A.

61 See Appendix B.
his Acts of the Apostles providing the favourite sources. A study of interpretative commentaries was usually required; among these Professor Lindsay's Primer and Handbook figured prominently. The essay topics for younger candidates centred exclusively on Biblical, and particularly Old Testament, biography. Without exception, the selected biographical models were male, generally men whose lives were stories of action. The essay themes for senior students exposed them to the study of Protestant, and especially Scottish, church history; they were themes which put the Covenant in context. Seniors were also encouraged in wider Protestant hagiography in the form of extended research into the lives of Wycliffe, Bunyan and, in the 1892 schedule, the contemporary Scottish hero, David Livingston (sic). A doctrinally-based essay, 'Why am I a Presbyterian?', was offered to seniors in the first year of the scheme's operation but attracted only small numbers of entrants; few, even of the scheme's more mature candidates, were ready for speculation at that level of abstraction.

At the height of the programme's impact, however, the volume of essay material submitted by all grades was remarkable. The 1887 prescription found it necessary to restrict junior candidates to a count of 5,000 words for their essays, 7,500 words for intermediate candidates and 10,000 for seniors. The following year the maxima were further tightened to 2,500, 5,000 and 7,500 words respectively.\textsuperscript{62}

Far less restrictive than a specifically Presbyterian examination schedule were the attempts undertaken by Otago's Sunday schools to make a range of reading material accessible to their scholars, and to the scholars' parents, through gift, prize, purchase or loan through the fast-growing Sunday school libraries.\textsuperscript{63} In this area interdenominationalism and internationalism outpaced denominationalism and, for many children, the Sunday schools were probably their main channels of access to the printed word. The Sunday School Union, London, and the London Religious Tract Society were prominent in supplying the growing demand for children's religious literature. In Otago and Southland numerous religious periodicals, both locally produced and imported, were available and distributed to children, either free or at minimal charge. Popular titles were: The Otago Good News, The Missionary Record, The Children's Friend, The Messenger, Words of Grace, The Band of Hope and The British Workman.\textsuperscript{64} The titles suggest the types of perceptions which teachers

\textsuperscript{62} See Appendix B.

\textsuperscript{63} See Chapter 6 for information regarding the organisation of Sunday school library systems in Otago and Southland.

\textsuperscript{64} Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1879, Appendix, Report of Synod's Committee on Sabbath Schools, p.8.
wished children to gather from a Christian education. The Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod's Sabbath Schools Committee reported, in 1878, that 24,000 copies of the *Otago Good News* had been purchased during the year for distribution to schools across the region; that figure averages out at between three and four copies of the *Good News* per scholar per year. Similar purchases were noted for each of the following two years. Further titles reported as being in wide circulation five years later, in 1883, included *The Advertiser, The Banner of Mercy*, and *The New Zealand Missionary Record*, proudly acclaimed as a home-grown product. The Presbyterian First Church of Otago alone distributed 6,704 assorted periodicals to its 535 scholars during the year 1890, an average of about one periodical per scholar per month.

Libraries were also important in supplementing Sabbath school children's reading, although some of the purchases made by Otago and Southland Sunday schools during the 1870s, in the early period of their library building, allegedly proved unsuitable and were little used. The editor of the *Christian Outlook*, in 1894, suggested that a well-balanced reading programme should include works that combined imaginative appeal with moral paradigm. He went on to outline a reading list which tacitly acknowledged his own optimism, for the future of Otago, of colonial society and of western culture. He cited John Ruskin's *King of the Golden River* as a model choice of reading for young people. He recommended the promotion of stories of character, history, adventure and travel, 'not for the adventure's sake, but for the cause of civilization and missionary effort'. Science, on the other hand, was best left as something which the children could pick up from their 'annuals'. The young were to be socialized, through the Sunday schools, into a culture self-critical yet confident of its moral superiority to non-Western mores, rich in its technology but anxious to show its children they could not live by bread alone.

Older scholars needed reading material which would compensate for the perceived cultural, moral and spiritual deprivation engendered by the 'Bible-out-of-schools' and the inchoate flow-on effects

---

67 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1890.
68 'Women's Outlook', in *Christian Outlook* (Dunedin), 8 December 1894. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
Feeding the Lambs

of the Higher Criticism. Studies were attempted, in the Bible classes, which were designed to give weight and depth to the faith of, hopefully, the next generation of Sunday school teachers and church office holders. The Reverend J. Gibson Smith of the North Dunedin Presbyterian Church, in 1892, called for Bible class programmes with structured book lists which would hone young minds, 'to counter the aimless, desultory reading which is so much in vogue these days and which too frequently has a very demoralising effect, unfitting the reader for any intellectual exercise involving real mental strain'.69 The previous year he had nominated the Men of the Bible series at 2/6 per copy as quality, accessible library material.70 Bunyan's Pilgrim's Progress and Stalker's Life of Christ were other supplements commonly used in Presbyterian circles. Bible class programmes also branched into the study of such topics as 'Early Church History', the 'History of the Reformation', 'Historical Geography of the Holy Land' and 'How We Got The Bible'. Sabbath school libraries had to be equipped to support these approaches for both scholars and teachers.71 'Religious Movements of the Nineteenth Century' appeared as a Presbyterian Bible class topic in 1901.72 Integrated themes such as 'Prophecy', 'Inspiration' and 'Revelation' were also attempted by some classes.73

There was, understandably, a gap between what church and Sunday school leaders thought their charges should read and what they actually read. Religious novels were popular with the churches' reading public, but these were frowned upon by those whose concern was 'the faithful exposition of divine truth'.74 Even more suspect was the secular romance. Bessie Turnbull, recalling a late nineteenth century childhood in Mosgiel, Otago, remembered sharing a novel in secret with school friends so as to avoid the censure of dominie and parent alike.75 The choice of reading by contemporary children negated pious theory. On the Otago-Southland border, at Pukerau, during the 1890s, when the small Presbyterian Sunday school sited there achieved the luxury of a library, the

70 'North Dunedin Monthly', Vol 1, July 1891, p.15.  
71 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1895, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools Committee 1894-1895, p.56.  
74 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1872, Appendix, Report of the Committee on Sabbath Schools, p.18.  
75 H Frizzell, Bessie Turnbull, Her Story (audio tape), Presbyterian Support Services, Dunedin, 1991.
books most frequently read by the local children were light but moral tales, centring on the experiences of a boy or girl icon with whom they could identify. Andy's Friends, Elsie's Footprints, Olive's Story and The Gamekeeper's Daughter were but four of some thirty similar, well-thumbed, well-used titles. Books which reflected the contemporary ideal of 'improving reading' were largely ignored. The Old Curiosity Shop, The Life of General Gordon and Scots Worthies attracted few readers. Galilee in the Time of Christ seems never to have been borrowed by any young Sabbath scholar.

Books awarded as Sunday school prizes in the 1870s and 1880s were similarly 'improving', but Sabbath school teachers did learn by experience. From the selection offered to her by the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod for her success in the Synod's annual examinations in 1881, Fanny Bethune, at the age of 21, chose Macaulay's Essays, Milton's Poetry and Roger's Eclipse of Faith. Presbyterian teachers, urged in 1883 to discover the 'characteristic traits' of their younger scholars and to choose books that would meet and extend the youngsters at their present point of need, began to vary and lighten the scholars' literary diet. Books selected as Sunday school prizes from 1890 onwards showed increasing latitude of choice, focused on youthful role models and increasingly reflected a feminized clientele and the Victorian idealization of motherhood. Perhaps they also reflected changing social perceptions among the publishers and stockists of religious literature. Ester Ried Yet Speaking, for example, given as a prize at the Anderson's Bay Sunday School, Dunedin, in 1890, combined apotheosis with realism in outlining the career of a fictional young female Sunday school teacher as she tamed a class of larrikins. Not only were the lads graceless louts, chewing tobacco and spitting; they were also tainted with Darwinian notions. 'Oh, I came from a tadpole', boasted one boy. Ester saw 'Evolution staring her in the face'. More About Peggy was offered as an attendance prize in a Dunedin Methodist Sunday school in 1901. Published by the Religious Tract Society, it was a moral but not overtly religious book. Its heroine, Peggy Saville,
urbane, self-confident and self-centred after three years of girlhood with her family in India, had all the superficial social graces (Illustration 6); she made her plain friend, Mellicent, feel inadequate and gauche. She needed, and received, a reorientation of her materialistic values before she could be suitably married (Illustration 7). Christian courtship, the means of introducing her to the spiritual value of sacrifice, was the catalyst for her moral regeneration. Her story reversed the usual stereotype of the period, in that it posited the refinement of female moral coarseness through the love of a good man. It sang the 'Song of Solomon', allegorising the love of Christ.

Illustration 6  Superficial Social Graces from More About Peggy

---

In addition to prize awards and library facilities, further low-cost reading for young Sunday scholars, and for a wider child audience, was provided in most contemporary church periodicals. The range of published articles drew on both the Puritan and Romantic traditions in their treatment of childhood, tuned to the tension between Original Sin and Innocence. Children were warned, usually through pseudo-biographical exemplars, as to the necessity for right conduct; emphasising moral cause and effect, the articles preached a 'Christian karma'. On the other, hand, the romanticised child was empowered, equipped by its own innocence to be an exemplar to the backsliding adult. The topics featuring in the 'Corner for the Young' in the Dunedin Evangelist during the 1870s were, in
descending order of frequency of occurrence, articles focusing on God's concern for mankind, moral exemplars and mission stories. Death stalked the published stories of the period. Victorian society lived close to death and coped by sentimentalising it; stories of adult conversion brought about by the influence of a dying infant saint were commonplace, with an alcoholic father being their favourite target. Cautionary tales and stories upholding the ideal of motherhood featured regularly. Occasional articles in the *Evangelist* modelled on elementary school 'object lessons', derived a simple natural theology from the natural history of Otago.

Issues of the *New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch) for the period 1881 to 1883 contained material similar to that in the *Evangelist*. The moral influence of womanhood, especially of motherhood, was again a recurrent emphasis; conversely the fallen woman emerged as a traitress to her Divinely-imparted trust. 'The Lamp in the Dark', from the July 1881 issue, likened the light which 'Mrs Rogers' set in her window to the illuminating power of Scripture in the lives of spiritual travellers.  

'How Uncle Tom Ran Away', quoted from the *Victorian Freeman*, told of the formative power of a mother's love, resolute against sin but unconditionally accepting of a penitent child. The obvious, yet feminized, parallels with the parable of the Prodigal Son are striking. Marianne Farningham wrote a story on the 'Children's Crusade', published in the September 1881 edition of the *Baptist*. This story outlined the failure of the historical Children's Crusade but then went on to encourage young people in a moral crusade, giving instances of feats of spiritual bravery which contemporary children could achieve; for example 'a girl, whose home is often the scene of family quarrels, has set herself to be the peacemaker, for she wants Jesus to dwell there as he did at Bethany'. On a gothic note, the 'Christmas Ball', from the *Baptist's* December 1881 issue, told the story of Rosina, aged 20, the beautiful and sole-surviving daughter of godly parents. Having resisted conversion, Rosina disobediently attended a Christmas dance, a 'scene of vanity and dissipation'. At the height of the revelry, an 'uneartly scream' was heard. 'The young and lovely Rosina had fallen lifeless to the floor'. But 'the ball went on'; the material world, seemingly, cared little for its flotsam. Caring was of God.

---

81 *The New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch), July 1881, pp.94-95.
82 Ibid., November 1991, p.159.
84 Ibid., December 1881, p.195.
Real life was less sentimental. Real children, and perhaps especially colonially-born children, lived close to the earth; their garden was not Eden, for all the post-millennial optimism of settlement. Nor was it rural Scotland. Some of the older migrants found the easy manners of colonial children hard to stomach, and were determined to uphold traditional forms and standards. 'Uncle Tom', writing the 'Children's Page' in the Presbyterian 'North Dunedin Monthly' in 1891, with a spleen which was not typical of Sunday school writing or preaching at this time, ignored fiction and focused on the Parish children themselves. He had watched the young girls of the local congregation, finding their conduct to be 'ridiculously vulgar and silly, until they made me wish I could take them by the shoulders and give them a good shaking'. The girls' crime, apparently, had been to say 'hello' when greeting adults; Uncle Tom did not explain what form of greeting he would have considered appropriate. The boys, as 'Uncle Tom' had observed, spent their mission box pennies on lollies, thus 'defrauding little heathen boys and girls of the Bread of Life, and deceiving their parents and teachers, all to satisfy their own greediness'. Uncle Tom was determined that a Puritan conscience should continue to permeate the consciousness of settler society.

Similar tensions, between conservative acerbity and the optimism of new settlement, arose in connection with the increasing use of vocal and instrumental music by Sunday schools in Otago at this time. 'Sacred song' had become an important arm of outreach and socialization for the schools; myth was the voice of a muse. The deacons at St Andrew's Presbyterian Church and at Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin, conservative and cautious, drew fine distinctions between music as worship, music as entertainment and music as a vehicle for fundraising, also between vocal and instrumental music. Most Sunday schools, however, fostered music in a range of forms. St Andrew's School promoted it in defiance of the deacons' scruples. Knox Church encouraged it, as did Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church School through its Friday night singing classes under Mr George Smith, with Miss Mollison at the harmonium. About a quarter of the First Church Sabbath School roll attended these classes in the winter of 1882. Support then fell away while Miss

85 'North Dunedin Monthly', Vol 1, July 1891.
86 Ibid., November 1891.
87 Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin. Minutes of Church Meetings, 4 March 1875 and 29 April 1875. See Chapter 7 regarding relations between the St Andrew's Presbyterian Church Deacons' Court and the St Andrew's Sabbath School.
88 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Record of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 7 July 1882, 13 October 1882, 22 January 1883, 25 January 1884, 24 February 1886.
Mollison took two months' leave in Melbourne. The class was revived the following year, and split into Main School and Russell Street School divisions, with prizes offered in the Main School division to induce regular attendance. The Russell Street class continued to prosper; there, apparently, George Smith's personality was attraction enough. Miss Mollison filled the gap for the musically-challenged Main School by offering ten minutes' hymn practice, with organ accompaniment, before the start of class each Sunday.

Children's hymns particularly were vehicles of evangelism, and were more powerful agents of socialization than prose statement or text. Revivalism, whether in the English Wesleyan or the American Moodyite tradition, promoted religious feeling through music as a precursor to spiritual commitment. Revivalism's influence encouraged, but did not originate, song in the Sunday schools. The English Dissenter Isaac Watts, as early as 1715, had written religious songs for the young. He was a pioneer in writing hymns for, rather than about, children. Watts tried to mediate spiritual truth at a level appropriate to the child, and his work became influential enough to invite parody in Lewis Carroll's 'How doth the little crocodile improve his shining tail...'? The explosion of Sunday schooling in the century and a half following Watts' death produced an outpouring of music for children, often by female composers. Prominent among these was Cecil Frances Alexander, wife of the Bishop of Derry. To her we owe a magnificent translation, from the Irish, of St Patrick's Lorica and, for children of all ages, such immortal songs as Once in Royal David's City, the Nicene Creed made accessible to youth.~


---

89 S. J. Rogal, A Bibliographical Survey of Hymnals for Infants, Youth and Sunday Schools Published in Britain and America 1655-1900, Greenwood Press, Westport, 1983.
92 St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 27 February 1885. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
St Andrew's Presbyterian Sunday School, Dunedin, bought 250 copies of *Songs of Gladness* in July 1892 and resold them to its scholars at 3d per copy, clearing its entire stock within a month.93

Among the most successful hymn collections was *Golden Bells: or Hymns for our Children* (Children's Special Service Mission, London, 1878). It was a collection which highlighted the positives of Christianity for children, emphasizing the individuality of God's concern for them. Overtly, it sought the conversion of the young. It ran through numerous editions and sold millions of copies. It became well known in Otago and Southland Sunday schools. After nine months' trial, it was adopted in 1895 in the Dunedin Presbyterian First Church Sabbath schools, the teachers finding it to be 'a fine collection, much better than Bateman'.94 Consistently, in his hymns for children, Watts had emphasized the ever-presence of God. A minority of his hymns painted the consequences of disobedience. Far more they extolled the benefits of piety and the attentiveness of God to prayer, even to infant prayer; they made it clear that children mattered to God. Successive *Golden Bells* editions included instances of the best of Watts' work and took Watts' message further. They upheld the authority of the Bible, either directly by extolling Scripture as revealed truth or indirectly by paraphrasing significant Biblical passages in their verses. The bulk of the *Golden Bells* hymns dwelt on the life, death and resurrection of Jesus, on His love, on His unconditional offer of forgiveness and salvation to the penitent sinner, and on the universality of His invitation. The selected hymns were musical preparations for conversion, and some applied overt pressure:

"Almost persuaded" - harvest is past.
"Almost persuaded" - doom comes at last.
"Almost" cannot avail!
"Almost" is but to fail.
Sad, sad that bitter wail,
"Almost" - but lost.95

More typical were invitational hymns describing the delights of Paradise. Those less successful in their imagery received, and probably deserved, parody from irreverent British, and doubtless from Otago, Sunday school boys:

---

93 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 6 July 1892 and 3 August 1892.
94 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 14 October 1895.
There is a happy land
Far, far away,
Where the little piggies run
Three times a day.
You should see the piggies run
When they see the farmer come ...

The subsequent lines do not improve in telling.96

Satire and parody did not negate the message of the Sunday schools. Generations of young children sang the words of New York's Anna Bartlett Warner:

Jesus loves me! This I know
For the Bible tells me so.
Little ones to Him belong.
They are weak, but He is strong.

Simple, easily remembered verse may well have had more long-term impact than hours of catechetical drill. Jeanine Graham's oral history research has shown that 'God was a very real presence to many children' in New Zealand at the start of the twentieth century.97 Over half the children in Otago and Southland had heard the message, on a regular weekly basis in their Sunday schools, that they individually mattered to a God of infinite love who met them at the level of their human, and specifically infant, need. They heard that the attributes of childhood, far from being a disadvantage, were preconditions of a meaningful relationship with the Divine. So it was that Sunday schools, far more than the contemporary day schools, fostered the children’s self-respect. These learnt attitudes outlasted the demise of regular church attendance among the adult population.

The claims of foreign mission work constituted another theme strongly emphasized in Sunday school hymnaries; for a culture moving away from Calvinist exclusiveness, the universal love of God was for sharing. The ancestral Church of Scotland, despite its Calvinist roots, boasted a vigorous missionary tradition, and Otago's Presbyterian Sunday schools rapidly outgrew the introspection of

96 Oral recollections of the researcher's father.
the initial settlement. In the Presbyterian schools missionary exemplars were held to afford the young excellent role modelling in the ideals of Christian service and self-sacrifice. Children during and after the 1870s filled mission boxes with items ranging from clothing and fabric to beads, penknives, mouth organs and Jew's harps. The bulk of the money accruing through the children's Sabbath school collections was devoted to mission support, some going to the Chinese field both locally and overseas, but more to Presbyterian outreach in the New Hebrides. Sunday schools 'adopted' individual missionaries and paid for the training of native catechists. Above all, the succession of 'Dayspring' vessels, operated in conjunction with Australian Presbyterianism to give the Islands' mission a measure of logistical flexibility, was maintained with the help of donations from the Sabbath schools. A Mr McDonald of Emerald Hill, Victoria, addressed the Otago Synod in 1869 in connection with 'Dayspring' funding, urging Sunday school support.

The Reverend James Copland, writing the 'Corner for the Young' in the November 1871 issue of the Evangelist, listed for the children the sorts of freight which the ship carried: furnishings, food, clothing, utensils, medicines, tools, prefabricated housing, educational materials, books, magazines, items for barter with the natives - fish-hooks, hatchets, knives, bells, beads. When the vessel delivered missionaries on furlough to Dunedin, as it did in 1876, Sunday school children from throughout the region were given the opportunity of visiting the ship 'for the maintenance of which they have given a fair share'.

For all the generosity of intent, it was a paternalistic example of mission which the Otago Sunday schools held up for the emulation of their young. Children of the Covenant were left in no doubt that they were heirs to a superior culture; the mission gospel was proclaimed de haut en bas. The Reverend James Copland, writing an open letter to the children of Otago in the Evangelist in 1871, portrayed the New Hebrideans as 'suspicious, selfish, cruel, revengeful and treacherous'. Their lives allegedly were blighted by poverty. Otago children were 'much happier because your God is the

99 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1880, Appendix, Report of Committee on Missions, p.16.
100 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, Session V, 13 January 1869, p.9.
Lord, and because you live in a civilised country.\textsuperscript{102} Copland urged upon his male readers especially their future duty of mission service to culturally inferior groups. 'Aunt Sally' gave a more empathetic, but nevertheless blinkered, message to the girls of the North Dunedin Presbyterian Sunday School in 1891, reflecting again the difficulty which contemporaries found in distinguishing between gospel truth and social norms of Victorian Britain:

I think those little [New Hebridean] boys and girls are more like you than you imagine. Not in the face - I dare say you are far prettier; but then God made them to think, and it is the "think" in us which makes us what we are. They will be so delighted when they see and wear the bright things you have given them and I am sure when they are pleased and happy, they will listen better to their teachers who are trying to make them Christian civilized boys and girls.\textsuperscript{103}

There were more than coincidental parallels between mission and imperialism, between Sunday school visits to the 'Dayspring' and attempts by the Navy League to arrange day school visits to warships visiting Otago Harbour. British imperialism, to the contemporary Otagoite and Southlander, was God's cause; the plausible, if fictitious 'British race' was a chosen people. The Reverend William Bannerman, in 1885, had called for the declaration of a British protectorate over the New Hebrides, to secure the 'liberty of the natives' and promote their welfare both temporal and spiritual, in the face of an anticipated French occupation.\textsuperscript{104} French rule, to Bannerman, signalled 'popish domination', and he feared the establishment of a French penal settlement. The Otago Presbyterian Synod expressed its satisfaction, in 1900, at the levels of regional Sunday school giving to both the Indian Famine Fund and the Patriotic Fund.\textsuperscript{105} Christian imperialism encouraged recruitment during World War I. A.H. Reed, who operated a Dunedin-based business supplying materials to Sunday schools nationwide, surprised his clients in 1916 by announcing his enlistment

\textsuperscript{101} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1876, Appendix, Report of the Mission Committee, p.5.
\textsuperscript{102} J Copeland, Open Letter to the Children of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, \textit{Evangelist} (Dunedin), 1 May 1871, p.8.
\textsuperscript{103} 'North Dunedin Monthly', Vol 1, No 6, October 1891.
\textsuperscript{105} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1900, Appendix. Report of the Sabbath School Committee, 1899-1900, p.44.
in the armed forces and soliciting their ongoing patronage of his successor, Magnus Johnson. Numerous Sunday school teachers replied to Reed's circular letter, extolling his 'noble sacrifice', his 'leading example' and his willingness to lay down 'life if necessary for God and Empire'; only one letter in a dozen or so expressed the slightest reservation about the righteousness of the war effort. Old Testament prophecy traced the judgment of God in the events of history. Otago's heirs to a Bible-based, Puritan tradition read the will of God in the entrails of an Empire's story. The far-flung and successful British Empire - although, like David of the Old Testament, it sometimes sinned - evidently did that which was right in the sight of the Lord. Otago and Southland's Sunday school children were made aware of their godly heritage, and of their several duties to defend, share and sustain it.

In the context of an imperialist socialization, it is not surprising to find the Otago Sunday school children of the late nineteenth century being conditioned to regard Christian outreach among the Kai Tahu as a branch of foreign mission; it was unfortunately, a branch which attracted less financial support than more widely flung endeavours. The Reverend James Chisholm, writing in the mid-late 1890s, subscribed to the 'fatal impact' theory, regarding the extinction of Maori as inevitable; the 1890s was the decade when the Maori population plunged to its lowest point in New Zealand, and Kai Tahu had never been numerous in the south. Chisholm expressed shock at the allegedly filthy Maori habits and cannibalistic traditions. He grieved over the decimation of Kai Tahu by muskets and disease, and lamented what he believed to be the pernicious influence which whalers had exerted on Maori moral fibre. Missionaries, he maintained, had arrived in Otago just too late to save the Kai Tahu from social collapse. Interestingly he suggested that Christian outreach among Maori was both a duty and 'quid pro quo' for fifty years of land alienation. Chisholm would, presumably, have seen little logic in returning land to a people purportedly destined to cultural assimilation; better furnish them with title to a mansion in heaven, the title deed guaranteed under the approving seal of British culture.

The curriculum offered to Sunday school children in Otago and Southland in the later nineteenth century encapsulated the world view of the settlement's religious leaders. Otago's young people were

---

106 Letters to A.H. Reed concerning Sunday School Business during World War 1. In A.H. Reed, Personal Correspondence, New Zealand Collection, McNab Room, Dunedin Public Library, Dunedin.

107 J Chisholm, Fifty Years Syne: a Jubilee Memorial of the Presbyterian Church of Otago, J. Wilkie and Co, Dunedin, 1898, pp.5-10.
socialized by the Sunday schools into a microcosm of Empire, into the life of a colony planted in faith and affirmed by the material evidence of its own development. The Sunday schools fostered both individual confidence and patriotic pride, while tempering these with a keen sense of dependence on the sustaining power of God. The school's catechetical drills grounded the colony's children in doctrine, affording insights which were held to link the traditional with the eternal. Credentialling fostered endeavour, supporting the schools' claims to academic respectability. Standardised lessons set out guidelines for social cohesion. Wider programmes of recommended reading provided moral paradigm. The quest for conversion linked the cognitive and affective, reinforcing the behavioural with personal commitment. Hymns, a powerful interpretative medium, provided an accessible scaffolding both for the apprehension and practical outworking of theology. The favoured hymns of Sunday schools hymns were songs of optimism, born not of self but of the certainty that Omnipotence intervenes in love at the level of individual human need, subsuming the need into a transcendent plan. They celebrated a mythology capable of integrating many diverse strands, a mythology which still grasped the post-millennial hopes of theocratic migration. It was a mythology which gave purpose to the lives of young colonial women and, in its temporal echoes, sent young colonial men to adventure and battle, on the Veldt or on the beaches of Gallipoli, in the naivety of joy and conviction.
Chapter 9 The Shepherd's Craft - Pedagogy in the Sunday Schools, 1870-1901

As Sunday schooling in nineteenth century England led that country towards acceptance of universal access to elementary education, so Sabbath schooling in nineteenth century Otago and Southland led the settlement in significant aspects of educational reform, particularly with reference to a child-focused pedagogy and a reappraisal of the use of corporal punishment. The Sunday schools sought not only to match, and to be seen to match, the secular system in academic attainment, attempting to rival day-school education step for step in credentialling, but also to mediate their programmes to children through an interactive teaching method. The dialectic of controversy, relating to educational secularism, theological liberalism and the romanticisation of childhood, proved fruitful of pedagogical change. Christian conversion is predicated upon what P.H. Phenix called synoetic knowledge, experiential knowledge of a relationship. Inescapably, a focus on childhood conversion in the Sunday school curriculum impacted on Sunday school pedagogy generating, however imperfectly, a more individualised teaching. Teachers aiming at the conversion of their pupils had to develop a rapport with those pupils. Monodimensional, content-bound teaching could not produce the desired result. Equally, in the context of Sunday school education, the mass conversions of revivalism would, for all the revivalists' calculated technique, wither without a schedule of ongoing, individualised support. As churches accepted the validity of conversion at decreasing age levels, so the gospel had to be mediated to young children in terms and with a style suited to their level of maturity. Evangelism made common cause with psychology in adapting knowledge to the child rather than moulding the child to knowledge; teaching became psychologically as well as epistemologically focused, and the concept of a child-centred pedagogy evolved. It is notable that corporal punishment played a rapidly decreasing part in later nineteenth century Sunday school practice, its constraints being seen as negating what the schools ideally stood for, the fulfilment of the individual child, both intellectually and spiritually, in and through a relationship of unconditional love.

The twin issues of academic attainment and an interactive pedagogy, which interested Sunday Schools during the 1870-1900 period, were current on both sides of the Tasman. Victorian Sunday schools, having faced the challenge of a developing and secularised public education system several years before New Zealand, had rethought the basis and purpose of their delivery. They were

constrained, their teachers felt, to analyse the secular curriculum and show its 'bearings or relation to things spiritual ... We must not only teach our scholars to think, but to qualify them for thinking'.

The mind had to be reclaimed for Christ, reason to be regrounded in the Divine, requiring a revision of pedagogy as well as teaching content. Sunday school leaders in Otago and Southland studied trans-Tasman parallels, and learnt and applied the lessons of comparison. The Presbyterian church in Otago demanded, in 1882, that the region's Sunday schools be brought 'to the highest state of perfection possible', lest their performance should in any way lag behind that of New Zealand's recently secularised public system, whether in intellectual attainment or teaching method. Unsettled by the Higher Criticism, the Sunday schools felt obligated to uphold the intellectual validity of a religious faith. The very concept of faith, however, by definition is relational. Teaching for faith is personalised teaching. A significant number of young day school teachers, especially young women, experienced their first taste of teaching as teenagers, leading small instructional groups in the Sunday schools. They took with them into the day schools patterns of supportive, interactive practice first experienced in a Sunday school environment.

This is not to deny that pedagogy within New Zealand's day schools was also in process of change. Legally enjoined attendance in a context of secularism posed its own problems for the day school classroom, as teachers attempted to mediate ethical as well as cognitive concepts to children of diverse age and attainment. Attempts to face these problems were hobbled by the appalling pupil-teacher ratios typical of the day schools of the period. In default of overtly Scriptural studies, day school teachers gave moral overtones to secular instruction. Individual subjects were perceived as linked to a range of moral, mental and social virtues. Thus, arithmetic and English grammar were held to provide mental discipline. Spelling trained the memory and developed attentiveness, and handwriting schooled young people in precision, while exposing them to moral precept through the painstaking copying of proverb and saw. Through 'object lessons', nature study promoted a feeling of awe before the wonder of creation. History afforded moral exemplars and nourished a national

---


3 The Evangelist (Dunedin), March 1873, Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

4 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1882, Appendix, Sabbath Schools Committee, 1882, pp.18-19.

and imperial identity. Besides considering curriculum in its moral context, day schools also paid regard to the need to deliver programmes flexibly, as far as pupil-teacher ratios allowed, according to the age range of the classes concerned. The 'Order and Behaviour Book' of George Street School, Dunedin, issued by the school's headmaster in 1901, was explicit that children had rights, that times of play and relaxation were important. For all its insistence on classroom regimention, the book provided different codes of behaviour for the infant and senior schools; the infant regulations had the flavour of guidelines rather than rigid prescription. George Street School, however, professionally led though it was, could not match the immediacy, the flexibility and the intimacy of atmosphere found in a successful Sabbath school, because a professionally paid day-school staff could not match the favourable teacher-pupil ratios of amateur volunteers.

A typical session in a well-run Protestant Sunday school at the turn of the twentieth century would have displayed the following features. The illustrative plates which accompany this chapter derive from the Moonta Mines Methodist Sunday School, South Australia. There was, however, a widespread sharing and similarity, although not identity, of practice between Sunday schools in New Zealand and Australia, and across the denominations, giving the illustrations generic validity. At the appointed time on a Sunday afternoon, the children would file into the school hall, perhaps to music, and exchange greetings with the superintendent. A hymn and prayer would follow. The 'Golden Text' for the week, prominently displayed, would be learnt by heart. The past week's birthdays would be noted and new children welcomed to the school. The offertory would be taken, with the proceeds usually dedicated to the support of overseas mission work. The children, perhaps, would file to the offertory box, again to the accompaniment of music; 'Hear the pennies dropping' was a common choice. It was customary, also, for the school to close in plenary session, with singing, a prayer and, if appropriate, a word from the superintendent.

The school would divide into its component classes for the core teaching of the session. Guidelines for teachers recommended that this be split, 50/50, into exposition by the teacher and expression on

---

6 George Street School Order and Behaviour Book, 1901, in George Street (Normal) School Archives, Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG81.
7 William Shaw and H Lipson Hancock, A Sunday School of Today: an Illustration of Principles, Hussey and Gillingham Ltd., Adelaide, 1912.
8 See Illustration 10. From Shaw and Hancock.
9 Shaw and Hancock. Also Joyce Dyer, oral interview, Dunedin, 23 September 1996.
the part of the children; the younger the class, the more the balance should be tilted towards child-based activity. Singing was an important part of the programme at all levels. Ideally each room had its own piano or equivalent. Often the classrooms were decorated with national and imperial flags. The infants' room was set out in such a way as to encourage a family feeling. Pictures illustrating Biblical stories and characters were hung on the walls. In Illustrations 8 and 9 the Moonta Mines' Kindergarten Department's lesson for the day, the story of the Lost Sheep, is sketched out on the blackboard. The children sit in a circle for instruction, then break into small sub-groups for developmental activity, guided by the teachers. Small, low blackboards and sand-trays are set round the walls for expression work.

There was rather more formalism in primary classes. At Moonta Mines, the primary children sat in rows. Their chairs, however, were movable, and painted circles on the floor guided the children with the minimum of fuss when it was time to break into groups for developmental activity. The primary classroom, like the infant room, had its children's wallboards and sand-trays for expression work. Teachers were recommended to allow time at the end of each session for the children to move around, so that activity groups could compare each other's work. Full formalism did not appear at Moonta Mines until the junior department, the stage preceding the teenage, Bible class years. The junior children sat at tiered, schoolroom benches, the boys sitting separately from the girls. The Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School, Dunedin, provided more intimate teaching spaces for its junior children. Even at Moonta Mines, however, the favourable teacher-pupil ratio created a far more interactive atmosphere than would have been possible in a day school classroom.

10 Shaw and Hancock, p.38.
11 See Illustrations 8-11. From Shaw and Hancock.
12 See Illustrations 8 and 9. From Shaw and Hancock.
13 See Illustration 11. From Shaw and Hancock.
14 Shaw and Hancock, p.38.
15 See Chapter 6.
16 See Illustration 12. From Shaw and Hancock.
Illustration 8  Moonta Mines Sunday School - Kindergarten Department

Illustration 9  Moonta Mines Sunday School - groupwork in the Kindergarten
Illustration 10  Moonta Mines Sunday School - Primary Department

Illustration 11  Moonta Mines Sunday School - groupwork in the Primary Department
Illustration 12  Moonta Mines Sunday School - Junior Department
Small class size in the Sunday schools, whether in Otago, Australia or the British homeland, was a crucial factor in the evolution of the schools' pedagogy. It softened the hard edges even of catechetical and similar drills centred on memorization. Sunday scholars remembered not just the content of the drills but, perhaps, the personality of a sympathetic teacher. Traditions of rote learning were strong in Britain, and the traditions travelled to Otago. Sabbath scholars under the auspices of the Sunderland Sunday School Union in 1835 had managed to remember an aggregate of 1015 complete chapters of Scripture, 22,190 separate verses, 9906 catechisms, 6076 spelling lessons and 3502 hymns. The Reverend C.L. Drawbridge, seventy years later, noted and regretted the persistence of rote learning in religious education in Britain. He felt it necessary to draw a distinction between catechising and Sunday schooling. 'These two institutions', he argued, 'are rivals'; catechising produced a mere parroting of doctrine whereas Sunday schooling, properly conceived, nurtured spirituality. In Otago, Dunedin's Evangelist in 1875 still championed rote learning. Quoting an American source, New York's Professor Lewis, in support of catechetical drill, the Evangelist recommended it as an antidote to the flaccidity of religious novels and the 'Romantic gospel' of natural theology; catechetical truth, memorised in youth, would provide a foundation to which the adult could return at times of stress in later life. Records of the Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, illustrate the ongoing value placed on rote learning in Otago's Sunday schools. The annual report of the church's Main Sabbath School in 1872 boasted: '...the children are encouraged to store their memories with choice Psalms and Hymns, and lessons of faith and duty'. Knox children, in 1881, won prizes for writing out and committing to memory all the verses in the Book of Proverbs containing the words 'son' or 'sons'. The children's target task for 1882 was to remember the whole of the Shorter Catechism, the Lord's Prayer, Apostles' Creed and two Graces.

19 The Evangelist (Dunedin), August 1875, p.10.
20 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Knox Church Sabbath Schools for 1872. Knox Presbyterian Church Archives, Church Office, Dunedin.
21 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Knox Church Sabbath Schools for 1881.
Repetition, however, did not necessarily kill the life of the schools. The claim of the Otago Presbyterian Synod in 1879 that 'the little ones love their Sabbath School and wend their way thither with alacrity' was not an empty boast. 22 Jeanine Graham's research has confirmed that, for many children in New Zealand in the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, 'attendance at church or Sunday school was the high point of the week', a reassuring counterpoint within a wider rhythm, and an opportunity for companionship and relaxation. 23 The Sunday schools showed an ability to develop a pedagogy which blended tradition and change, and which responded sympathetically to need.

Moves in New Zealand Sunday schooling from benevolent autocracy towards a more dynamic classroom, from rote learning towards a more experiential learning, from a teacher-centred towards a pupil-focused delivery, were evident, albeit haltingly and unevenly, from 1870 onwards. Voices from both sides of the Tasman had begun to call for more a more imaginative approach in the schools. Concerns touched the role of the teacher, the classroom environment, the equipment used and the way this was used. The Victorian Baptist Magazine of November 1868, even though it recommended chorused reading as a teaching ploy, urged teachers to get to know scholars in their classes as individuals. 24 A letter to the editor of the Victorian Independent, Melbourne, in June 1870, commented on environment as well as technique, criticising the 'traditional four bare walls' of the Australian Sunday school room and the treadmill format of its programme: singing, reading, prayer, lesson, singing, prayer. 25 The writer had just returned from America where he had seen 'large, airy and beautiful rooms, decorated with pictures', and had been astonished at the range of magazine material available to American scholars. The New Zealand Baptist, Christchurch-based, in a sequence of articles devoted to Sunday school practice, refocused on the teacher, but in terms of role-modelling. The Baptist, in August, 1881, enumerated qualities deemed necessary in an effective

24 Victorian Baptist Magazine (Melbourne), November 1868, p.42. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLT 286.05 V66M.
25 Victorian Independent and Journal of the Congregational Church (Melbourne), No 3, Vol 1, June 1870, p.43. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLTF 205 V661.
Sunday school teacher: piety, prayerfulness, preparation, patience, perseverance, personal example.  

Another article, in the December 1881 issue of the Baptist, claiming to look specifically at pedagogy, emphasised the teacher's bearing. Delivering a Christ-centred message, the teacher was to adopt a 'calm, yet earnest, decided and interesting manner', and to speak in 'earnest, pleading yet loving tones'. The article went on, despite its limitations, to offer germs of pedagogical reform. Lessons were to have a clear structure. They were to start with brief recapitulation of the previous week's work; oral repetition was necessary since children had little access to the written word. Teachers were, however, to avoid lecturing and go beyond memorization. They were to foster understanding by a sequential questioning technique.

The processes of reform were very much assisted by the small size of Sunday school classes, as compared with those of day schools. Sunday school buildings, with their screened teaching spaces surrounding a central hall, were tailored to an intimate, individualised pedagogy which public elementary education could not rival. The central hall was for administration and group worship, the small side-rooms for instruction. The Sunday schools' numerous, non-professional teaching force admittedly contained members who were young, inexperienced and unqualified. The advantages of small class size more than compensated for the disadvantages of inexperience, allowing Sunday schools to develop a benevolent discipline and an interactive teaching dynamic which were hard to achieve in the large classes of the public system. Research by C. McGeorge shows teacher-pupil ratios in public day schools, nationwide, standing at approximately 1150 teachers for 65,000 pupils in the year 1878 and at some 2600 teachers for 130,000 pupils in 1900. In other words, discounting the supportive role of between 500 and 1,000 pupil teachers, day-school staff taught classes typically of 60 children. Even admitting pupil teachers to the calculation, the best teacher-pupil ratio that could be achieved was in excess of 1 to 30.

---

26 T Harrison, 'Requisites of Sunday-School Teacher', in *New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch), August 1881, p.100.

27 W.E. Glanville, 'Sunday School Teaching', in *New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch), December 1881, pp.169-170.

28 See Chapter 6.

29 *The Evangelist* (Dunedin), March 1873.

Data relating to the nominal rolls of Presbyterian Sabbath schools in Otago and Southland over the same period, aggregated across urban and rural areas, shows that 563 teachers taught 6891 Sunday school pupils in the year 1878 and 1365 teachers taught a total of 12,223 pupils in 1900, indicating an average Sunday school class size of about 12 children, assuming full attendance. The attendance register for the Queenstown Presbyterian Sunday School shows a ratio of 8 teachers to 76 children in 1868 and 10 teachers to 72 children in 1884. Figures relating to the Presbyterian First Church of Otago, for the period 1896 to 1900, show a best teacher-pupil ratio of 1 to 7 and, at worst, of no more than 1 to 10 of nominal roll. The report of the Sabbath School Committee to the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod in 1890 commented favourably on the proportion of teachers to scholars, citing one adult to nine or ten children as being the norm. While the committee noted with concern the current 'Exodus' of young men to Australia, it was able to report that the recruitment of female Sunday school staff had immediately made up the shortfall. Statistics for the Sunday schools of other denominations show similarly favourable ratios. Among the Methodists, Port Chalmers Wesleyan Sunday School, Dunedin, operated with 15 teachers for 107 children in 1865, and 18 teachers for 88 children in 1869. Dunedin's Methodist Trinity Circuit, in 1888, reported an aggregate of 71 teachers for 660 children, spread over 6 Sunday schools; in no single school did the teacher-pupil ratio exceed 1 to 11. Twenty years earlier, at the Caversham Baptist Sunday School, there was an average of one teacher for every ten children. The Caversham Sunday School Teachers' Minutes, for one Sunday in January 1868, showed the following teacher-pupil distribution:

\[ \text{Calculations derived from data in the Sabbath Schools Committee Reports to the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1886 and 1900.} \]
\[ \text{Queenstown Presbyterian Church Sunday School Attendance Register, 1868 and 1884. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. BR1/1.} \]
\[ \text{Calculations derived from data in the Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, Presbyterian First Church of Otago, 1886-1900.} \]
\[ \text{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1890, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools Committee for 1889-1890, p.39.} \]
\[ \text{Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School. Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes, 28 October 1869. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 52/7/1.} \]
\[ \text{Trinity Methodist Church, Dunedin. Quarterly Meeting Minutes, July 1888. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 Box 11 1052.} \]
The uneven scattering of pupils probably reflects the combination of small classes when a teacher was away and no substitute was available. This, according to the Minutes, was normal practice at Caversham, and two out of ten teachers were absent on the Sunday in question.\textsuperscript{37}

Small class sizes enabled Sunday school teacher, in New Zealand as elsewhere, to turn away from the practice of corporal punishment, leading community opinion in this respect. Caning and strapping were so routine in day schools as to be a matter of jest in the \textit{Otago Witness} at mid century.\textsuperscript{38} Henry Duckworth, recalling a boyhood at Tomahawk, Dunedin, in the 1850s, commented on the adherence of his teacher, Andrew Russell, to the proverbial principle: 'He that spareth the rod spoileth the child.'\textsuperscript{39} The community apparently expected no less, with a parental thrashing at home in the evening frequently reinforcing the dominie's discipline. Fifty years later, over the period October 1896 to March 1899, the registered instances of corporal punishment administered by the sole charge teacher, Mr J.W. Hardy, at Otakou School varied between 31 and 175 strappings per month, with a marked increase in physical punishment evident during the winter months.\textsuperscript{40}

Contemporary instances of parental complaint against teachers, however, indicate a gradual change of public attitude towards corporal punishment between 1850 and 1900. Assault charges against a Miss N. Coull were lodged in the Dunedin Court in November 1880, but overturned on the grounds that a teacher had an obligation to maintain both mental and moral standards.\textsuperscript{41} The Forbury School

\textsuperscript{37} Caversham Baptist Church, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, January 1868. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. UN78 5.6.

\textsuperscript{38} \textit{Otago Witness} (Dunedin), No 5, 5 April 1851.

\textsuperscript{39} H Duckworth, \textit{A History of Anderson's Bay and Tomahawk}, Coulls Somerville Wilkie Ltd, Dunedin, 1923, p.16.


\textsuperscript{41} Van Hasselt, Chapter 3.
inquiry of 1896 showed educational thinking discriminating between the mental and the moral in the context of punishment. The teacher concerned, a Mr Graham, defended his actions on the grounds that 'he had tried to bring the bad [children] up to the good ones rather than allow the good ones to degenerate' and that if the good children were allowed to degenerate ... bad reports would come from the inspectors'. Graham denied that he had ever punished a child who was 'weak in the intellect'.

Sunday schools, internationally by 1900, had come to reject corporal punishment, whether in a mental or moral context. The schools' children were not angels. Unfortunately from the historian's point of view, the schools' respect for confidentiality kept their discipline records fairly uninformative. Dunedin's Reverend J. Upton Davis, writing in the Evangelist in 1875, had cautioned Sunday school teachers against sentimentalising their charges. Children, he said, were usually sleepy after mid-day dinner on Sunday. They were also fluent liars, especially girls who were driven by physical weakness to verbal defence. Boys, however, caused Sunday school teachers more discipline problems than girls, in schools far beyond Otago. It was resolved at the Lydiard Street Methodist Sunday School, Ballarat, Australia, in January 1861, that 'ten of the worst boys in the school be selected from the various classes and formed into a class by themselves as soon as a teacher can be found competent to take charge'. The 'Question Box' in the October 1890 issue of the Australian Sunday School Teacher, a Melbourne publication with strong Otago connections, sought advice on what to do with a class of rowdy boys who had boasted of the ease with which they 'put away' teachers. The 'Puzzled Superintendent' at the school in question was reluctant to expel the lads because many of their parents were 'thoroughly respectable and regular churchgoers' and some of their fathers held 'high positions' in the Church. Within Otago, at the Caversham Baptist Sunday School in 1876, 'Brother Oswald requested that three lads in his class be removed as he had no control over them'. Unspecified discipline concerns were discussed at the Linden Wesleyan

42 Van Hasselt, Appendix, p.165.
43 The Evangelist (Dunedin), September 1875, p.11.
46 Caversham Baptist Church, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, 3 January 1876. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. UN78 5.6.
Methodist Sunday School teachers' meeting in April 1891.⁴⁷ At the Presbyterian First Church of Otago Sunday School, Superintendent R.W. Scott was pleased to report, in 1893: 'The discipline is better and one particular class which for years proved a source of trouble to the school has capitulated'.⁴⁸ What is remarkable is not the boys' behaviour in Sunday school classes but, generally, the patience of the Sunday schools' staff in dealing with it. Christ died for sinners, including unruly boys.

Raikesian Sabbath schools had allowed the value of a judicious application of the rod. By the later nineteenth century, conservative British Sunday school apologists suggested that physical punishment be used only when requested by parents as an alternative to expulsion, and that it be administered only by the school superintendent.⁴⁹ For girls and for younger children it was judged, even by its apologists, to be inappropriate and unnecessary. The growing body of Sunday school critics of corporal punishment, from 1870 onwards, condemned the practice as 'repugnant to the very spirit of a religious institution'.⁵⁰ The Victorian Independent, Melbourne, claimed in 1870 that a resort to force was incompatible with the law of love, that 75 per cent of Sunday school teachers rejected corporal punishment and that scholars resented its use in the context of Sunday schooling; not having the luxury of a captive audience, Sunday schools could not ignore the children's voice.⁵¹ The Sunday School Handbook of the Sunday School Union, London, was unequivocal that corporal punishment should not be allowed 'under any circumstances'. Even expulsion 'should be resorted to only in the most extreme cases of disobedience and criminality'.⁵² Otago Sabbath school opinion showed itself well abreast of international trends. The superintendent of the Port Chalmers Methodist Church Sunday School, Otago, made controversial use of the cane to check unruliness among his scholars in the mid-1860s; the teachers' meeting minutes for October 1864 note that 'there was

---

considerable talk on School matters, in the course of which some of the teachers objected to corporal punishment being resorted to in the Sabbath School.\footnote{Port Chalmers Methodist Church. Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes, 28 October 1864.} Writing some ten years later, in Dunedin's \textit{Evangelist}, the Reverend J. Upton Davis, who had vivid memories of the use of corporal punishment during the Sabbath addresses of his boyhood, saw no place for the practice in the Sunday schools of Otago during the 1870s. He cautioned not only against physical but also against the verbal violence of heavy sarcasm. A well-timed scolding, he allowed, was sometimes necessary, but he warned teachers to avoid the petty irritability which simply produced a restless class.\footnote{The \textit{Evangelist} (Dunedin), 1 October 1875, p.5.} At Broad Bay on the Otago Peninsula, one Sunday during the 1890s, a spider descended from the church rafters and spun a web in the ostrich feathers and ribbons of a hat worn by a Miss Wellbourn, a member of the congregation. Giggles convulsed the children nearby. Their superintendent, Mr Botting, was also the local day school principal. He felt it inappropriate to intervene during the church service but he did strap the offenders later, at Bible class.\footnote{Notes by Ian Church, Curator, Port Chalmers Museum.} He was out of step with the spirit of a decade when Sunday school teachers, conscious that they were moving ahead of public school practice, boasted: 'The ferule, the cane, and even the palm, are relegated to the day school, and are gradually disappearing even thence'.\footnote{Groser, \textit{Manual}, p.263.}

Contemporary manuals of advice to Sunday school teachers concentrated on the positives rather than the negatives of discipline. Journal articles and manuals of practice urged the Sunday school teacher to show patience and sympathy, to correct behaviour by moral rather than by physical force, and to hold the class's attention not by command but by technique. The \textit{Sunday School Handbook} of the London Sunday School Union pointed out that quiet, individual approaches, directed to miscreant pupils after class had finished, were generally more productive than public reprimands made in full session.\footnote{The \textit{Sunday School Handbook}, p.101.} Superintendents in Otago Sunday schools in the later nineteenth century counselled young staff in the prevention rather than cure of discipline problems. The Reverend Q. Bacon, chairing the St Paul's Anglican Sunday School teachers' meeting in April 1889, stressed the importance of establishing regular classroom routines. The fly leaf of Miss Agnes Park's roll book at St Andrew's Presbyterian Sabbath School, Dunedin, offered simple pointers on preventative control to the young
teacher: 'Be in your place five minutes before the opening of the School ... Place yourself and your Scholars in such a position that you can easily, and at all times, have command over them, and see what they are doing'.

Increasingly, after 1870, successful Sunday School staff perceived the correlation between interactive teaching and an attentive, well-behaved class, and they developed their technique accordingly. Implicit in Dr J.M. Gregory's 'Seven Laws of Teaching', cited in Dunedin's Evangelist in 1875, was the truth that a busy and interested class is not a discipline problem:

Know thoroughly and familiarly whatever you would teach.
Gain and keep the attention of your pupils and excite their interest in the subject.
Use language which your pupils fully understand, and clearly explain every new word required.
Begin with the known, and proceed to the unknown by easy and natural steps.
Excite the self-activities of the pupils, and lead them to discover the truth for themselves.
Require the pupils to restate fully and correctly, in their own language and with their own proofs and illustrations, the truth taught there.
Review, review, review - carefully, thoroughly, repeatedly - with fresh consideration and thought.

Twenty years later the Christian Outlook, Dunedin, moved further towards a child-focused pedagogy, quoting an American source, the Reverend Edward M. Chapman, on the importance of teaching for understanding: '...Children at a very early age are actively engaged in reasoning and speculating upon religious themes... children are far keener than we commonly fancy in detecting the unsatisfactoriness of meagre and shallow definitions'. Chapman went on to cite instances of the ability of children as young as four to cut through the specious and the superficial. Some teachers found children's capacity for honest analysis to be frightening. The Australian Sunday School

58 St Andrew's Sabbath School, Dunedin. Roll Book kept by Miss Agnes Park, 1876. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. Misc MS905.
59 The Evangelist (Dunedin), January 1875, p.6.
Teacher, in 1890, was disappointingly cautious in its counsel to such staff: 'Questions must arise in a child's mind which one cannot satisfy logically. It is better therefore to adopt a mode of treatment which will teach the desired lesson indirectly without inviting difficulties.'

An increasing counterflow of published advice encouraged Sunday school staff to risk the uncertainties of classroom dialogue. H.C. Trumbull, publishing through Hodder and Stoughton Ltd, London, urged teachers to distinguish between teaching and preaching. Purposeful teaching, he asserted, 'includes the idea of two persons, both of them active'. The London Sunday School Union advocated pupil discovery of knowledge through questioning although, admittedly, it envisaged questions generated by the teacher rather than the scholar. The Union's Sunday School Handbook counselled: 'Scholars should never be told what they may be reasonably expected to tell the teacher... Question out.' The Handbook went on to recommend a Sunday School Union tract on The Art of Questioning by J.G. Fitch. Teachers, the Handbook suggested, could use what today would be called a cloze sentence technique, omitting key words for the children to complete; this was especially recommended as a useful review activity for younger classes. W.H. Groser, a science graduate with an interest in psychology and Secretary of the London Union over the last two decades of the nineteenth century, spelt out mechanisms for promoting more open discussion. He advised Sunday school teachers to capitalize on the advantages of small class size, seating the children in a horseshoe to ensure eye contact and promote active participation.

At kindergarten level Sunday school teachers showed a growing facility in applying Froebelian principles to their work, with Wesleyan best practice in the Marlborough region of New Zealand being upheld as a model for day school emulation in the early years of the twentieth century. Froebel's emphasis on the importance of the visual, symbolic and allegorical was especially relevant to the Sunday school situation. For the previous three decades, Froebel's ideas had permeated American Sunday schooling, particularly in the infant departments, and especially after the acquittal of Sarah Cooper on a heresy charge in relation to her Froebelian methods, in a trial in San Francisco in 1881. In England, Froebelian approaches were fostered from 1875 onwards by John Faunthrop

---

61 The Australian Sunday School Teacher (Melbourne), 6 July 1890, 'Commentary on International Lesson Helps (Junior Section)', Mitchell Library, State Library of New South Wales, Sydney. Q268.05A.
at the Church of England's Whitelands Training College.64 Infant teaching particularly alerted Sunday school teachers to the visual dynamics of the classroom, and the need to mediate understanding through effective symbol. Teachers sought to link visual stimulus to the interactive rapport which they cultivated as a precondition of conversion. Groser held that the predominant intellectual faculties during infancy and early childhood were those of perception and memory, and the predominant emotional faculties were sympathy and trust.65 He went beyond visually static illustration to advocate mime as a technique in Sunday school infant education.66 For an infant audience, he saw mime as effectively linking visual stimulus with empathy. Otago's Sunday schools kept well abreast of the region's secular development of creche and kindergarten education in the period 1881-1889. The annual report of the Knox Presbyterian Sabbath School, in 1874, announced the formation of a large infant department under the supervision of Mr David Ferguson and Miss Gourley; 'with the help of a blackboard and pictures and lively hymns, lessons are taught to about 128 little children, in a way suited to their capacity.'67 Evaluating the Knox infant class in 1883, the Otago Presbyterian Synod noted that the monitorial system worked 'admirably' there, and that 'biblical instruction by means of diagrams is systematically carried on'. At Lawrence, a 'competent' teacher ran an infant class, using a set of 21 'beautiful pictures illustrating the life of Christ'. Biblical quotations provided captions for each picture.68 St Paul's Presbyterian Sunday School, Invercargill, purchased a blackboard and a set of pictures for use with its infant class in the autumn of 1883.69 Infants at Mosgiel received attendance rewards in the shape of illuminated cards. Over the ensuing decade Berean leaf clusters, pictorialised lesson sequences named perhaps in connection with the Apostle Paul's preaching at Beroea as outlined in the Book of Acts, became widely used in the infant departments of Sunday schools.70 They were known in Invercargill schools by 1888.71 South

---

69 St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 25 April 1883. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
71 St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 23 April 1888.
Dunedin Baptist Sunday School found them a useful help, deciding in July 1891 that 'the Leaf Clusters be distributed one to each home among the scholars of the Infant Room'. They were available in rolls through the New Zealand Bible, Tract and Book Society, 22, George Street, Dunedin, priced in 1894 at 25 shillings per quarterly issue.

The *Australian Sunday School Teacher*, developing lesson plans from the content laid out in the International Series of Lessons, recommended combining the verbal and pictorial in the infant classroom. The suggested approach for Sunday, 14 September 1890, for a lesson entitled 'Servants for Jesus', was set out like a sum in elementary arithmetic. Simple line drawings of parts of the body were listed in a single vertical column: two eyes, two ears, two hands, two feet, one tongue and one heart. The tally at the foot of the list totalled '10 Servants'. Where short Biblical quotations were used, the teacher was advised to have the class repeat them, requiring the children to spell the several words and enumerate each on their fingers until the text was known and the meaning of each word understood. Physical action would reinforce the message. For example, chorusing 'It is right to do good and not to do evil', the children would raise their right hands on the word 'right' and their left hands on the phrase 'not to do evil'. The possible embarrassment of left-handed children in the class, evidently, was not considered; 'left' was 'sinister'.

As children moved from the infant to junior department of the Sunday school, a readjustment of pedagogy was required. For this age level Groser advocated a teaching method approximating to the principles of gestalt psychology, although he did not use the term 'gestalt'. Groser maintained that imagination, curiosity and the desire for praise were the key intellectual and emotional motivators of junior-age children. An appropriate teaching approach, he suggested, would be 'synthetic', moving from the discrete elements of the child's limited knowledge and perception towards a more self-organised understanding. For junior children, visual images were to expand into 'word pictures', which might assist the children to integrate their scattered visual perceptions into a coherent

74 *The Australian Sunday School Teacher* (Melbourne), 14 September 1890, p.77.
75 Ibid., 6 July 1890.
conceptual framework.\textsuperscript{76} The teacher was to sketch verbally a Biblical character or scene, vividly enough to gain the children's interest yet allowing scope for each child's 'mind's eye' to make its own projections and establish its own connections.\textsuperscript{77} 'Our Young Folks' Corner' of the \textit{Christian Outlook} adapted the method, publishing word pictures of a Biblical event and leaving it to child readers to identify the event in question.\textsuperscript{78} The familiar 'object lesson' of the day schools was also recommended for Sunday school use. In essence this was, as the \textit{Sunday School Handbook} pointed out, a relational technique sometimes used by Jesus himself, especially in his institution of the sacrament of Holy Communion, with almost two thousand years of impact to testify to its effectiveness.\textsuperscript{79}

The blackboard, or equivalent wall chart, was used with children at this level, and by schools which could either afford this simple equipment or which had teachers resourceful enough to make it, to provide visual support for gestalt formation, to create a focus for a key understanding and to provide a patterned illustration of conceptual relations. The Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin, claimed in 1890 that its children were gaining in 'divine knowledge' because teachers were making novel use of illustration in their lessons.\textsuperscript{80} Journals and similar publications for Sunday school teachers at this time abounded with word games and mnemonics, tagged to lesson outlines, which could be copied on a board and used to underpin teaching. Groser's \textit{Manual} offered teachers copious models, for example:

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{ll}
Well at & Sychar \\
Weary & Saviour \\
Woman of & Samaria \\
Water of & Salvation.\textsuperscript{81}
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{76} \textit{The Sunday School Handbook}, p.98.
\textsuperscript{77} J.M. Sutherland, 'Address to the Raikes Centenary Conference', in \textit{Supplement to the New Zealand Christian Record}, 3 December 1880, p.9.
\textsuperscript{78} \textit{The Christian Outlook} (Dunedin), 30 June 1894.
\textsuperscript{79} \textit{The Sunday School Handbook}, p.99.
\textsuperscript{80} Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin Minutes, 12 February 1890. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 Box 42 1528.
\textsuperscript{81} Groser, \textit{Manual}, pp.207-224.
The *Australian School Teacher* published many similar examples of nineteenth century approximations to the modern mind-map:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KEEP</th>
<th>DAY</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GOD'S</td>
<td>HOLY</td>
<td>To do good:</td>
<td>Not to do evil:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>school</td>
<td>buy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>sick</td>
<td>sell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>work.(^{82})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Illustrative maps, topographic and historical, either pre-purchased or teacher-sketched, were increasingly used in some schools to help in the patterning of understanding. The superintendent of Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School reported, in October 1893, that 'several teachers prepared maps with which to teach the last quarter's lessons, evidence of a desire to do the best they can'. Commercially produced teaching aids could be costly. Miss Waters, of the St Andrew's Presbyterian Sunday School, Dunedin, asked for a model of the Old Testament tabernacle to be purchased in 1901, and was refused.\(^{83}\) Not every school could afford even the most basic visual equipment, driving teachers who had the necessary skills to self-help. The South Dunedin Baptist Sunday School, in May 1893, had been trying for some time to borrow a blackboard from Caversham. Having secured the loan in July, the South Dunedin teachers found the board so helpful, they resolved to make their own, to take advantage of the range of published lesson guides which were becoming available.\(^{84}\)

The senior levels of Sunday school teaching called for a further refinement of pedagogy. Of course there is now no way of accurately quantifying the extent to which Sunday school and Bible class teachers in Otago and Southland effectively followed the best of the pedagogical advice offered to them. The schools and Bible classes, however, could not have achieved the remarkable level of influence which they enjoyed by 1901 if their teaching had been commonly perceived to be bad. Groser held that young people in their teenage years developed powers of reflection and judgement, and that their allegedly innate faculty of conscience was quickened by experience. Appropriate approaches for the senior Sunday school and Bible class, Groser argued, should encourage analysis,

\(^{82}\) *The Australian Sunday School Teacher* (Melbourne), 6 July 1890.

\(^{83}\) St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 12 June 1901. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

\(^{84}\) South Dunedin Baptist Church. Sunday School Minute Book, 9 May 1893 and 6 July 1893.
nurturing the students' critical facility, and encouraging student-generated questioning to run its course. The class should be conducted in a lively, conversational atmosphere, 'not too dignified' and 'with very little starch'; the students would certainly test the teacher's knowledge to its limits, and a false dignity would end up looking ridiculous. The Bible class teacher had to 'win' the scholars' interest, be sensitive to the 'teachable moment' and follow lines of inquiry initiated by the class itself. The teacher should, however, avoid situations where a vocal minority sidetracked and dominated discussion; there should be a balanced encouragement and acceptance of a range of intellectual and affective response in the class. These recommendations were a far cry from the imposed standards of the public school. Only the teacher with a captive audience can, in the long run, get away with bad teaching.

Some Otago Bible class experiments found, to their cost, how stringent are the requirements of a voluntary audience. Voluntary participants often wish to be consulted and wish to be involved. North Dunedin's J. Gibson Smith, anxious to avoid the mistakes of some of his contemporaries and to see an effective study group planted in his Presbyterian parish, analysed what he saw as common causes of Bible class failure. 'First the ordinary Bible class does not leave any room for the principle of self-government ... The conductor usually chooses what he thinks is a "safe" topic. The burning questions of the day, the dangerous unsettling questions, are usually ignored'. Gibson Smith echoed Victorian Primitive Methodism in advocating that Bible classes should be co-educational. The story of the class at Otago's Presbyterian First Church squared so closely with Gibson Smith's analysis, it could have been its inspiration, had the dates agreed. Held under the minister's tutelage on Tuesday evenings, the First Church's Bible class peaked in 1893 with an average attendance of 113 young men. Within three years a decline in membership drove it to become co-educational. By 1898, it had degenerated into a small, fortnightly theological study group. It had focused on doctrinal themes, for example 'The Doctrine of Man', 'The Doctrine of Salvation', 'The Doctrine of Redemption' and 'The Function of Prophecy', its aim being to retain young men in church

---

85 Groser, Manual, p.110. See also Supplement to the New Zealand Christian Record, 3 December 1880, p.6. See also Victorian Primitive Methodist (Melbourne), No 11, Vol II, January 1879.
86 See Chapter 6 for discussion on the origins and development of the Bible class movement.
88 Victorian Primitive Methodist (Melbourne), No 11, Vol II, January 1879, p.244.
89 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1893.
membership by providing then with toughness of theological sinew. The class seems to have been minister-directed in both content and delivery. It followed a programme tailored to the perceived needs of the church, when the teenagers and young adults of the 1890s wished to follow a programme tailored to their needs as individuals. It was not that the First Church's Reverend James Gibb had the slightest fear of theological controversy, but Gibson Smith had put his finger on the core issue when he spoke of the quasi-democratic functioning of the successful Bible class.

The key to effective Bible class operation lay, not in predetermined curriculum content, but in a devolved, interactive pedagogy. The Reverend D.M. Stuart wistfully observed that, at his Sunday morning Bible class at Knox Church, Dunedin, over half of his otherwise loyal attendees would not attempt formal, written exercises.91 Fanny Bethune on the other hand, writing from Invercargill to her fiancé in Melbourne in March 1882, described with obvious satisfaction an instance when her Bible class supervisor, a Mr Ferguson, had asked her to lead the class in an interpretative discussion on the parable of the Lost Sheep; her interpretation embroiled her in a stimulating debate with another class member, Jack Watson, Fanny Bethune looking at the universal, even cosmic, applicability of the parable and Watson locating it more specifically within the context of Jewish culture.92 The dynamic of effective Bible class reform sprang from St Andrew's Presbyterian Parish, Dunedin. Here the Reverend Rutherford Waddell was the instigator of a regime of delegated peer teaching which, in the long run, had an influence far beyond Otago. The interactive atmosphere of Bible class life which Waddell fostered in St Andrew's parish inspired George Troup to lead New Zealand's Bible class movement, nationwide, in new and autonomous directions.93 Troup took his Dunedin-learnt skills to Wellington. A notable figure who remained to develop new methods in the south was William Gray, an aspiring young school teacher and future schools' inspector and training college principal, who ran a seminar system at the Russell Street Presbyterian Bible Class, Dunedin, in the late 1890s. Gray adopted a student-oriented programme based on questioning, small and whole-group discussion and independent research. He functioned 'as the guide, philosopher and

90 Ibid., 1898.
91 Knox Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1893.
93 See Chapter 7.
friend of the class, rather than teacher in a technical sense'. Within three years of opening, a burgeoning roll had necessitated the building of a new meeting room. The class's members were engaged in evangelistic outreach among Dunedin's male population four nights a week. Enthusiastic church elders claimed that the 'missing link' between the senior Sabbath school classes and committed church membership had now been discovered.

In ironic contrast to the devolved and ultimately successful methods of the Bible class movement were the much more restrictive, if widely practised, procedures of Sunday school credentialling. The contrast is especially ironic in connection with the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee's examination system, which temporarily flourished under the encouragement of Rutherford Waddell but then faded over the eleven year period from 1881 to 1892, and which had been designed primarily to service the needs of scholars of Bible class age. The inadequacy of nineteenth century testing procedures was starkly illustrated in the carelessness with which the Committee compiled the examination syllabus in its last year of operation, when its proposed schedule made virtually no allowance for range of age and maturity among candidates. The church's concern over credentialling had outstripped its skills in the field, of assessment. The Committee's members had struggled, throughout the scheme's operation, to find an examination format which would validly test the fruits of 'reading and thinking' and the development of 'mental and moral faculties'. Cognition they cited as 'just the very element which cannot be made to show itself in any examination paper'. Their questioning at all levels, as seen in surviving examples of examination papers from 1886 and 1888, centred largely on factual recall. A large majority of questions asked in the 1886 test were prefixed with the verbs 'state' and 'relate'. Questions pitched at senior students generally called for more extended rote learning rather than higher-order thinking. Catechetical responses in the 1888 examination were to be written verbatim. About a fifth of the junior and intermediate questions in the 1888 schedule probed reasoning and character analysis. For seniors, questions relating to 'The Church' in Professor Dunlop's section of the 1888 examination did

94 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1899.
95 Ibid., 1900.
96 See Chapter 8 for a discussion of the curricular aspects of Sunday school credentialling.
97 See Appendix B.
98 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1883, Appendix, Report of the Committee on Otago Bible and Church History Classes, p.21.
call for analytical explanation. Their argument was, however, directed towards the support of predetermined Protestant, and especially Presbyterian, positions; geared to a denominationally focused programme, they were not couched to encourage lateral, independent thought. The question arises as to why even more denominationally focused Catholic education programmes should have proved far more durable.

Rutherford Waddell, a man ahead of his time in social and educational insights was sensitive to the dichotomy between testing and creativity. He urged participants in the Bible and Church History Committee's programme to attempt its extended essay exercises as well as, or instead of, the formal, timetabled examinations. Waddell believed the essay to be more beneficial to the candidate, in that it allowed unfettered scope for the development of individual inquiry and sustained reasoning. Essay markers did not necessarily share Waddell's vision. Generally clergy, few of them had classroom teaching experience and they had no pedagogical criteria to guide them. Assuming the young were capable of little beyond narrative, markers reported to the Committee generally in terms which emphasized volume and accuracy of information and precision in the notation of sources as areas of key concern. The Reverend A.H. Stobo noted incorrect spelling as 'a serious blemish' in the 1889 scripts.\textsuperscript{100} Two out of four markers' reports in the 1882 cycle did allude to conceptual grasp and the ability to perceive relationships as considerations which were borne in mind.\textsuperscript{101} The reports for the year 1885 showed a general concern with essay structure.\textsuperscript{102} Originality of thought was commented on by one marker out of four in 1884 and by one out of five in 1888.\textsuperscript{103} Energetically supported by Sunday school and Bible class leaders in a minority of Presbyterian parishes in Otago and Southland, the essay option did not save the Bible and Church History Class scheme from collapse after 1892. Assessment procedures, even the innovative and allegedly enlightened assessment procedures of today, generally have a pernicious effect when they are allowed to become the dominant consideration in education. Otago's Sunday schools flourished, not on the strength of the testing which they implemented, but through the supportive, collegial ethos which the schools nurtured.

\textsuperscript{99} See Appendix C.
\textsuperscript{100} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1889, Appendix, p.69.
\textsuperscript{101} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1882, Appendix, pp.13-14.
\textsuperscript{102} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1885, Appendix, p.70.
The ongoing recruitment and training of a high-quality teaching force was seen as essential if this ethos was to be maintained. Teachers' role modelling was crucial if the Sunday schools were to go beyond the modelling in secular citizenship provided in the day schools. If Christian conversion is an apprehension of the Ultimate Relationship, then relations within the Sabbath school itself assume vital importance as patterns. At the South Dunedin Baptist Sunday School Teachers Meeting in July 1879, 'a discussion took place regarding whether Mr Glass was a believer in the Lord Jesus Christ, and ultimately it was resolved that he be not received'. The School was insistent that no teacher could lead children to Christ who had not, himself or herself, experienced conversion. The Caversham and South Dunedin Baptists were fastidious in monitoring the ongoing conduct of their teachers. Mr Alexander Innes, a Caversham teacher, was subjected together with his brother to an inquiry in 1876 for allegedly carrying on improper proceedings at Green Island. In January 1881 'Mr Ings was requested to see one of the [South Dunedin School] teachers as her actions, as reported in the Star, were not in accordance with her profession'. The teacher concerned, apparently, was not a Baptist as she resigned three months later, stating that 'it was her determination to labour in connection with the denomination to which she belonged'. In April 1883 Mr Ings reported that 'one of the [South Dunedin] Teachers had fallen into sin, and it was resolved that he be asked to come and confess his fall before the Teachers'.

Christian role modelling spilled into an individualisation of teacher-pupil relationships, pedagogical and social, both during and out of class hours. Sunday school teachers in Melbourne in the 1890s were advised to be at their classrooms early, ready to greet each child on arrival with a handshake and a kind word. With the lesson started, teachers were to maintain eye contact with the scholars, encourage their answers to 'rapid, simple questions', and 'never [to] ridicule a wrong answer'. In Otago as in Australia, teachers were exhorted to develop rapport with the individual members of students.

---

103 *Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland*, 1884, Appendix, p.16. See also 1888, Appendix, pp.66-67.
104 South Dunedin Baptist Sunday School. Minute Book, 10 July 1879.
105 Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 5 October 1876.
107 Ibid., 4 April 1883.
their classes through home visiting or other appropriate forms of contact.\textsuperscript{109} Initially home visits were intended to counteract absenteeism, reflecting the churches' concern over roll maintenance in relation to the day schools.\textsuperscript{110} Home visits could also be discipline-related and, in such cases, might well be put in the hands of senior church members rather than left to the care of younger, less experienced teachers. At the South Dunedin Baptist Church in 1882 Mrs Ings and Mrs Fitzger were delegated to contact two female scholars, and 'Mr Wix and Mr Carpenter were appointed to see one of Mr Feltham's class regarding his conduct on several occasions.\textsuperscript{111} Home contact must have been time-consuming, and possibly embarrassing, because Presbyterian teachers needed almost annual reminders from their Sabbath Schools' Committee to maintain the practice. By the end of the nineteenth century, however, visiting was being strongly advocated on educational grounds. Knowledge of home circumstances, it was held, helped the teacher to develop a more personalised, and therefore more effective, teaching practice.\textsuperscript{112} Archdeacon Edwards, chairing the St Paul's Anglican Sunday School teachers' meeting in March 1887, alluded to the good results which he believed had accrued from systematic visiting, and parents from the church congregation expressed their pleasure at the continuance of the visitation programme.\textsuperscript{113} Staff in many schools were encouraged to open their own homes to older children from their classes, perhaps for Sunday afternoon tea, or to meet them, if preferred, in a more neutral setting. The annual report of the Russell Street Sunday School, Dunedin, in 1892 alluded to a series of winter social gatherings which had been organised to 'strengthen the bonds of friendship and esteem between teachers and their scholars'.\textsuperscript{114} Similar gatherings at the Main School associated with Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church in 1898 enabled 'scholars of the same age and sex' to meet their teachers and superintendent

\textsuperscript{109} The Australian Christian Advocate (Melbourne), Vol VIII, 1879, p.352. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLTF 205 AU 78 CW1.

\textsuperscript{110} South Dunedin Baptist Church. Sunday School Minute Book, 15 July 1879. See also Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1878, Appendix, Report of Synod's Committee on Sabbath Schools, 1878, p.9.

\textsuperscript{111} South Dunedin Baptist Church. Sunday School Minute Book, 28 June 1882.

\textsuperscript{112} Groser, Manual, p.284. See also South Dunedin Baptist Church, Sunday School Minute Book, 3 October 1883.

\textsuperscript{113} St Paul's Anglican Church, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, 27 March 1887 and 28 September 1887.

\textsuperscript{114} Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1892, Report of the Russell Street Sunday School.
in a 'spirit of friendliness and intimacy'. The school was working to foster its links with the next generation of its teachers and church office holders.

If an individualised teacher-pupil rapport in the Sunday schools was to be reinforced with an effective pedagogy, teachers needed ongoing schedules of training. An obvious ploy was to put responsibility for these on to the local minister, whether or not the minister concerned possessed the necessary skills. It remained hard for laity, conditioned by their own day school experiences, and for some ministers raised in a catechetical tradition, to see teaching as more than content delivery. The Victorian Independent of December 1870, claiming that senior scholars were leaving Australian Sunday schools through disillusionment with the shallowness of their teachers' knowledge, recommended that ministers should offer fortnightly training classes in biblical and natural theology. Dunedin's Evangelist, in 1873, argued the need for weekly preparation classes in all schools and, two years later, the paper urged pastors to raise their profiles in the Sunday schools attached to their churches; the pastor should make it his business at least to 'walk through' the school every week. Anglicans particularly looked to their ministers to provide Sunday school training. Unfortunately, clergy were often too busy and, where they did become involved, their pulpit skills did not always equate with classroom effectiveness. At the St Paul's Anglican Sunday School, Dunedin, the minutes for 26 November 1885 noted that the Reverend Mr Hobbs had been unable to prepare the expected 'sketch lessons'; teachers were advised to recycle an 'old lesson' for the coming Sunday. Sometimes the minister's influence was divisive. At St John's Anglican Sunday School, Roslyn, Dunedin in 1889, the Reverend Algernon Kirkham overrode the scruples of his own superintendent to circulate through the school a leaflet, in question and answer form, setting out the doctrine of transubstantiation. He also admitted young people to auricular confession. During the ensuing fall-out Kirkham demanded the superintendent's resignation, the Vestry withheld Kirkham's

---

116 The Victorian Independent and Journal of the Congregational Church (Melbourne), Vol 12, No 1, December 1870, p.154.
117 The Evangelist (Dunedin), March 1873, 'Our Sabbath Schools'. Also September 1875, 'Sunday School Guardians', p.7.
118 St Paul's Anglican Church, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, 26 November 1885. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 147 1882 N1.
stipend and several parents withdrew their children from the school, sending them to the schools of other denominations.\textsuperscript{119}

Proposals which attempted to put Sunday school teacher training on a more systematic basis indicate the growing pedagogical maturity of the schools. Some of these proposals were centrally directed, some denominational and some ecumenical, and most maintained an overfocus on content to the exclusion of technique. The most successful were the products of autonomous action by the teachers themselves. The Sabbath Schools' Committee of the Otago Presbyterian Synod, in 1880, mooted the establishment of a 'Normal class with especial reference to Sabbath School work' and with the power to certificate teachers. Ever alive to day school comparisons, the Committee continued to call for an examination-based credentialling of teachers during the 1890s.\textsuperscript{120} The secretary's report for the Dunedin Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School, in October 1894, echoed the call for a Synod-based training scheme as 'a good step towards more efficiency in our efforts in the schools'. The proposed Presbyterian scheme did not eventuate. Training classes for teachers, operating on an ecumenical basis, were provided by the Otago Sunday School Union.\textsuperscript{121} It is not clear what programme of training these classes offered, but it is likely to have been modelled on London Union recommendations. Groser, the Union Secretary, had counselled Sunday school staff to master first the content of their lessons and then consider the appropriate delivery. For content preparation, he advised focused study in depth rather than wide shallow reading, and suggested the committed teacher build up an 'essential library'. A Bible, a concordance, Mathew Henry's Bible commentary, a Bible dictionary and cyclopedia were Groser's cited essentials. A polished delivery of the mastered content would include accuracy of pronunciation and accuracy of spelling in blackboard and other visual work; teachers suspect in these areas were recommended to take a course of dictation exercises.\textsuperscript{122}

The real gains in staff performance in the Otago Sunday schools after 1870 came haltingly but, in the long run, effectively through teachers' mutual support and self-help. Teachers resident in the

\textsuperscript{119} St John's Anglican Church, Roslyn, Dunedin. Vestry and Parishioner's Meetings: Fair Minutes, 6 April 1889 and 20 May 1889. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 142 1.1.

\textsuperscript{120} Minutes, 1880, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath School Committee for the Year Ending 1879, p.10.

\textsuperscript{121} See Chapter 6.

Dunedin area held a one-day conference on 29 September 1876, reportedly well attended, at which they discussed: the qualifications and training of teachers; aids in the work of teaching; Sunday school libraries; titles of periodicals suitable for distribution to children; hymn books; development of choirs among older scholars. Specifics relating to 'the best methods of instruction' were dropped from the agenda because of time constraints. Evidently at this conference curriculum content and administrative procedures rather than pedagogy remained the teachers' paramount but not exclusive concerns. A potpourri of recommendations from the conference urged the planting of new Sabbath schools and the continued development of Sabbath school libraries. It called for regularity and punctuality of teacher attendance. It reaffirmed the faith of Presbyterian teachers in the value of the Westminster Shorter Catechism. Significantly, it directed teachers towards mutual support through regular attendance at meetings for prayer and lesson preparation.\(^{123}\)

Since the year 1872, at Knox Presbyterian Sabbath School, Dunedin, teachers had been meeting 'from time to time' both for prayer and to discuss 'the best means of imparting their knowledge of the Gospel'.\(^{124}\) Their concerns embraced teaching practice as well as lesson content. Knox teachers converted these informal beginnings into a regular preparation class in 1876.\(^{125}\) The Knox Sabbath School annual report for 1893 showed an average of 30-35 teachers attending this class, about half the school's teaching force. Similar meetings were held fortnightly in connection with the Sunday school at Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church, with individual teachers taking it in turns to prepare the lesson material. 'Junior' teachers were urged to attend these at least monthly.\(^{126}\) Teacher attendance at the First Church meetings appears to have been more patchy than at Knox. Out of a total teaching force of 58 in the year 1883, 23 individuals never attended preparation sessions. The highest attendance at any one session was 26, the lowest 8, and the average attendance was 17. Three stalwart teachers attended all 25 sessions held during the year. After a run of disappointing attendances, the meetings were reorganised on a monthly basis in 1887.\(^{127}\) About this time, teacher

---

125 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1876. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.
126 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Record of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 7 July 1882 and 22 January 1883. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Parish Office, Dunedin.
127 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Record of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 25 January 1884.
preparation classes were begun in the schools associated with St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. At least the Dunedin First Church teachers did better than those at the Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, where preparation classes were abandoned in July 1892 for want of attendance. The move was regretted and the classes were resumed in April 1893, meeting fortnightly on Tuesday evenings from 7.30 to 8.30 pm.

Preparation at the Knox Church classes was based on the International Series of Lessons, focusing on content, lesson structure and illustration of delivery for the coming Sunday. In addition, a more generalised paper relating to an aspect of Sunday school teaching, prepared by a class member, was read and discussed at 'nearly every meeting'. Teachers at the Presbyterian First Church preparation classes, as at Knox, researched and read seminar papers before their colleagues. Topics covered at the First Church during 1883 included: 'What I saw of Sunday school work in Britain and America' by Mr Moore; 'Preparing the lesson and teaching it' by Mr Comissiong; 'The end and object of Sabbath School teaching' by Mr J. Agnew; and 'The order of service in the Sabbath School' by Mr Wood. The papers delivered during 1889 included: 'A defence of the present system of home lessons in the Sunday school' - presumably there had been controversy over the setting of homework by Sabbath schools; 'Influence in the Sunday school'; 'The New Testament illustrated by the lives of Old Testament characters'; and 'Questioning'. Evidently the enthusiasts among the First Church Sabbath School teachers shared their Knox colleagues' growing awareness of, and interest in, issues of pedagogy and wider school philosophy, as well as content mastery.

In the processes of study and research, collegiality and interactive delivery, teachers as well as scholars found self-respect in the life of the Sunday school. Many teenagers, especially young women, cut their pedagogical teeth on small-group work in the Sunday schools before taking up training as day school teachers. There was in fact a high degree of overlap between the staff of the day and Sunday schools, with permeability of staffing working both ways, and perhaps with the balance of benefits from the exchange accruing to the day schools rather than the Sunday schools. It has a common expectation in pioneer, days that the day school dominie would also teach Sunday

---

128 St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 9 September 1886.
129 Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin. Minutes, 1892-1893.
130 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1893.
school; conversely, as pioneering shaded into settlement, the growing generations of the native-born moved through the Sunday schools into day school teaching. James Blackie, Dunedin's pioneer day school teacher, also taught Sunday school. The Reverend Alexander Bethune acted both as home missionary and private school teacher in Invercargill in the 1850s. Q.W. Traill, at The Neck on Stewart Island, fulfilled the several functions of home missionary, day school teacher and Sabbath school superintendent during the 1870s. George Reid, successively headmaster at Manuherikia in 1866 and Forbury in 1873, was also an active Sunday school and Temperance worker. Jane Dow in Dunedin, Charlotte and Margaret McGregor, daughters of Columba Manse at Oamaru, and Robert Neill, principal at Blue Spur, were further examples of teachers who served both in the Sabbath schools and the public education system. A comparison of the staff list for the Otago Presbyterian First Church Sunday School for the year 1888 with the New Zealand Gazette lists of certificated teachers shows that at least 7, and possibly more, of the 35 Sabbath school teachers also worked, or would subsequently work, in public education. Ncr was this a feature solely of Presbyterianism. For example, among the founder members of the Dunedin Baptist Church, Mrs Jarratt taught both day and Sunday school. The Congregationalist Reverend Mugford Grant of Port Chalmers sadly farewelled one of his former Sabbath scholars and rising young Sunday school teachers, Bella McIntyre, as she left to take charge of the public school at Raes Junction in March 1888. Sunday schools perhaps counted themselves lucky to win the services of an experienced day school teacher. C. Stuart Ross tells how Otago Sunday schooling benefited from the experience and practical knowledge of W.S Fitzgerald, principal of Dunedin's Training College. Interestingly Fitzgerald, an expert on contemporary educational theory and a man abreast of trends, expressed strong reservations as to whether day school experience fitted a person for Sunday school work. Fitzgerald's reservations vividly illustrate the contrast between the formal procedures of day schooling and the increasingly flexible approaches of the Sunday schools, indicating that Sunday

---

131 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Record of Sunday School Teachers’ Meetings, 9 October 1889.
132 C S Ross, Early Otago and some of its Notable Men, J. Wilkie and Co. Ltd., Dunedin, 1907, p.109.
133 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons’ Court, 1888. The seven are: Flora Allan, M Allan, M Cameron, T A Finlay, James Grant, Isabella McLandress and Bella McLeod.
134 Dunedin City Baptist Church. Church Minutes, 1863-1890. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
135 W M Grant. Pocket diary, 13 March 1888. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. M1 951 B.
136 Ross, p.117.
school teachers were attempting to implement progressive pedagogical ideas in their classroom practice. Young people passing from Sunday school into day school teaching injected their Sabbath school-generated ideals and approaches into the secularised public system.

Since three quarters of all children in Otago and Southland were receiving some exposure to Sunday schooling by 1900, and since a large proportion of the minority that did not attend Sunday school were children from labouring homes who would have been less likely than others to become day school teachers, it would be a tautology to equate day school teaching with some sort of Sunday school background; such a background would have been the norm.  

It is interesting, however, to analyse the career choices of young people who showed an unusually strong measure of commitment to Sunday school programmes. Of the 321 young people listed in Appendix A as gaining awards in the Bible and Church History Class Committee examinations in Otago and Southland, it can be established with reasonable certainty that 47 became day school teachers, with another 24 possibly entering the profession, giving a ratio of between 15 and 22 per cent.  

Nationwide, in 1886, there were 2721 adult and pupil teachers in New Zealand public schools. The total non-Maori population in that year was 576,524.  

Extrapolation from figures specific to Otago suggests that a third of the total population in 1886 was of pre-school or school age. Public day school teachers thus comprised rather under one per cent of the country's European adult population. Even if all private and secondary school staff were to be included in the calculation, it is unlikely the ratio would have exceeded two per cent, with the figure falling even lower if allowance is made for a Maori population of between forty and fifty thousand. Extrapolating gender proportions from Otago census data, and estimating generously, it seems unlikely that any more than three percent of the adult female population were dayschool teachers at any given time; the true figure is probably less than two percent. A goodly number of this group were former Sunday school devotees. Day school teaching attracted a considerable proportion of young Christian idealists, particularly women, with

---

138 See Chapter 8. See also Helen Frizzell, Bessie Turnbull: Her Story, (audio-tape), Presbyterian Support Services (Otago), Dunedin, 1991. Bessie Turnbull alludes to teacher training as an option beyond the social aspirations of the working class girls of her day.  
139 See Chapter 11.  
140 McGeorge, p.42.  
prior, significant Sunday school experience, and with relatively few other career options. Having enjoyed Sunday school as a forum for personal development, capable young Christian women found respectability in dayschool teaching, either career-wise or as a clearing house for marriage. Particularly high proportions of young women progressing during the 1888s and 1890s from Sunday school as far as university degree status eventually taught in either primary or secondary schools, and many of these never married.\(^{142}\) Both the secularism and the impersonality of the public education system were subverted from within by the steady infiltration of Sunday school influence, mediated through some of the best and brightest of its young products.

The careers of some of the young infiltrators can be tracked through personal correspondence and through the records of the Otago Education Board. Young teachers did not always make an easy transition from the Sunday school class to the day-school room. Fanny Bethune of Invercargill was saved by marriage from an uncongenial day-school environment. At times unsettled by verbal abuse from boy pupils, she nevertheless despised the physical bullying that passed for discipline among some male day-school teachers. Idealistic, dutiful and honest, she wrote to her fiancé in 1882: 'I never was and never will be a good teacher. I have often tried to like it: but somehow I can't'.\(^{143}\) William Renton, raised in Balclutha Sabbath School traditions, floundered in his first public school position. The Otago Education Board inspectors, in their 1882 and 1883 reports, noted his diligence, earnestness, integrity and kindliness, but commented on his deficient classroom control. Isabella McLandress progressed through the Otago First Church Sabbath School as a scholar, examination award winner and Sunday school teacher. She trained at Dunedin Teachers' College and graduated with an M.A. from Otago University, entering Otago Education Board service in 1891 at Arthur Street School, after a short period of employment on the West Coast. Inspectors' reports between 1891 and 1893 commented on her difficulties with regard to control, in relation to the boys of her class especially, difficulties which are understandable in the light of the fact that, at one stage, she was teaching a form of 82 children! Detail of the inspectors' comments suggests that she was trying, in public school conditions, to replicate the interactive methods of her small Sabbath schoolroom. She appears, however, to have been a determined and resilient young woman. The 1895 inspector's


It was a significant achievement of the Sunday schools in Otago and Southland in the later nineteenth century to have supplied the region's day schools with a pool of young teachers who had learnt a humane pedagogy in the Sabbath school classroom, and who maintained Christian convictions while serving in the secularised public system. Although they tried to match day schooling in academic rigour, and although their assessment practices followed the conventions of the period, the Sunday schools exercised an influence which transcended narrowly defined conceptions of education. The Sabbath schools' message of Christian conversion mediated in a small-group environment encouraged an interactive, individualised pedagogy. Sunday schooling was especially to the fore in helping to turn public attitudes away from corporal punishment. The greatest importance of the schools lay not so much in their imparting of Biblical knowledge or upholding of standards of morality, although they certainly did both these things, giving the powerful sanction of religion to social norms. The schools combined the normative with an engendering of self-respect. 'Golden texts', learnt by heart week by week in the Sabbath schools, hammered home the concepts which Victorian society perceived as essential, core truth. The 'golden text' shown in Illustration 11 derives from the Moonta Mines Sunday School. An Australian example which nevertheless parallels Otago practice, it shows the warning, 'God's Displeasure of Disobedience', set out in huge capitals across the schoolroom blackboard, but the warning is paired significantly with, and also in bold letters, the text of 1 John 4.19: 'we love him because he first loved us'. People raised through the schools, and those who taught in the schools, received from their participation a sense of acceptance under a regime which gave dignity to the individual while recognising his or her limitations, which offered a forum for friendship and which, at its best, sought to role model the inclusive love of Christ. More successfully than the day schools of the period, and more significantly than much of the later educational practice in New Zealand, the Sabbath school regime of Otago and Southland, 1870-1901, created an atmosphere which affirmed self-worth while recognising human mortality, frailty and failure. A message of universal acceptance, role modelled, personalised and interactively delivered, treasure held in admittedly earthen vessels, made attendance at Sunday school an important, enduring and fond memory, cherished in the minds of many of the schools' former

---

144 Otago Education Board, 'Register of Teachers Employed by the Board', also 'Otago Education Board Pupil Teachers Register, 1886-1918'. Hocken Archives, Dunedin, AG294 and AG629 6/3/1-3.
scholars; through oral history many raised in the Sunday schools of the early twentieth century have continued to voice their appreciation of what they received in the Sunday school environment.
Chapter 10  Wether or Not: The Sunday Schools as Agencies of Socialization

Committed Sunday school workers in late nineteenth century Otago and Southland had little spare time. For teacher and scholar alike, Sunday schools sometimes became the foci of social life, with an outreach passing well beyond narrowly defined conceptions of instruction or worship. Otago's Sunday schools of the period sought to subsume the physical and the mental into the spiritual, projecting the ideals of *Tom Brown's Schooldays* on to a colonial screen. If the physical and the mental needed the spiritual for direction, equally the spiritual needed the physical and the mental to locate it within a human context. The region's Sunday schools were aware that they were of proud but dour lineage, outliving a Puritan and, in many cases, Calvinist heritage. They were aware of the geographically centrifugal effects of migration and the intellectually compartmentalising effects of scientific rationalism and educational secularism. They knew that they were fighting for the hearts and minds of a young audience whose attendance they could not compel. In response, the Sunday schools of Otago and Southland increasingly tried to show Christianity as a religion of integrative joy, the influence of which underlay, synthesized and validated the full range of human experience. The challenge of the secular forced Sunday schools to consider socialization in its widest sense. Many schools developed an impressive range of support services for their children. Seeking to monitor and nurture the progress of young people until they were safely gathered into full church membership, schools tried to cater for the wider physical, social and intellectual needs of their scholars, not in the sense of usurping the role of the day schools but through providing a remarkable range of complementary, extension activities. Capitalising again on the benefits of a favourable student-teacher ratio, some Sunday schools provided an enrichment education in many ways beyond the scope of the public day schools. Although many of the schools' activities were targeted specifically at young men, the main beneficiaries in the long run were female.¹

T.W. Laqueur, writing in the context of British Sunday schooling in the earlier nineteenth century, notes how the scope of the schools' activities helped communities to face both life and death. The schools functioned as employment and welfare agencies, and fulfilled social and recreational purposes. Feasts were among the earliest Sunday school innovations. Beer and buns were provided for the scholars when the new parish school was opened at Medmenham, Buckinghamshire. The Norwich Sunday School’s seaside outing to Yarmouth in 1846 drew an attendance of 6125 parents,

¹ See Chapter 1.
teachers and students, together with 500 other interested ladies and gentlemen.\textsuperscript{2} Laqueur sees the influence of the Sunday schools as having transformed British working class leisure to a large, if indefinable, degree.\textsuperscript{3} The schools were essential agencies of socialization to an age which believed: 'In nothing is childhood more strongly distinguished from manhood than this, that the child has no purpose, no plan of life'.\textsuperscript{4}

The busy range of Sunday school activity which the migrants to Otago and Southland developed in the new settlements from 1848 to 1900 both echoed and extended British usage and expectations. Otago Sunday schools concerned themselves with the wellbeing of the whole person: corporeal and spiritual, physical and mental, individual and social, at work and in leisure. Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, between 1865 and 1893, complemented its Sabbath schools and Bible classes with a Young Men's Association for Mutual Improvement, later recast as the Literary and Debating Society, a Temperance Society and Band of Hope, Young Women's Society, Young Men's Fellowship Association and Christian Band.\textsuperscript{5} North Dunedin's Presbyterian Church, during the 1890s, offered its young people, in addition to scheduled Sabbath school and Bible class activity, the options of involvement in the Choir, the Literary Society, the Girls' Dorcas Society, the Boys' Own Club, weeknight drill classes, Saturday sport, periodic socials and access to a growing library. With some satisfaction the Church, in June 1892, refused all applications for the use of its hall for secular purposes on the grounds that no uncommitted nights were available.\textsuperscript{6} This might have soothed 'Aunt Sally' who had complained, in the December 1891 issue of the 'North Dunedin Monthly', that she had seen children 'out playing'. 'Have you no lessons to learn?' she queried. 'It is a very dreadful thing to be called lazy'.\textsuperscript{7} The boot was on the other foot for harassed teachers at

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{3} Ibid., p.227.
\item \textsuperscript{4} L T Haines and L W Yaggy, \textit{The Royal Path to Life: or Aims and Aids to Success and Happiness}, World Publishing Company, London, 1885, p.10.
\item \textsuperscript{6} 'North Dunedin Monthly', June 1892, p.2. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
\item \textsuperscript{7} 'North Dunedin Monthly', December 1891, pp.9-10.
\end{itemize}
Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School who, in 1892, refused to support the formation of a Christian Band on the grounds of their own over-commitment.\(^8\)

Rural Sunday schools showed, proportionally, as much or more involvement than their urban counterparts. Mr Robert Neill, principal of the Blue Spur public school, was also the Presbyterian Sabbath school teacher. His influence helped to turn both day and Sabbath schools at Blue Spur into catalysts of community self-respect. In the day school he was remembered with some affection as a teacher whose style was both thorough and innovative, punctilious as regards accuracy of spelling and handwriting but with a lively sensitivity to the affective and creative appeal of literature. In the Sabbath school his scholars achieved remarkable results in the Bible and Church History Class Committee's examinations, surprising the markers, who had expected urban children to dominate the prize lists. For the year 1888, 20 out of a total of 72 examination candidates were from the Blue Spur class, as were a quarter of all the essay candidates.\(^9\) Among those gaining awards in that year was Neill's own son. During the decade of operation of the Bible and Church History Class Committee's examination scheme, one in eight of its three hundred or more award-winning candidates was a Blue Spur scholar.\(^10\) Neill was also a choir leader and he pioneered a Band of Hope in the Blue Spur community, providing popular weekly entertainment as well as moral instruction for the young, accentuating the positives of temperance rather than the negatives of prohibition. Neill's influence represented Sabbath school socialization at its constructive best.

The joy of the Lord, for rural and urban, young and old alike, was a message both of social and spiritual significance, a message which Sunday schools aimed at traditionalists among the adult laity of their parent churches. Teachers at the Presbyterian First Church of Otago, rationalising the effort which they put into organising both the annual Sabbath school picnic and mid-winter festival, argued for the benefits of a socially open, celebratory religion, benefits which they expected to accrue into the future, far beyond the confines of the school itself:

This aspect of our work will do much towards cementing the bonds of friendship of our scholars, and will bring into closer union the members of the church. It will teach the church that Christians can enjoy themselves with as much pleasure as the worldling...

\(^8\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 20 April 1892. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Church Office, Dunedin.

appears to - and that religion does not wish its members to be gloomy but happy and joyous, having a cheering and glorious life - let us try!\textsuperscript{11}

Implicitly, the First Church Sabbath School saw itself as a beacon to the adult congregation, one of whose elders subsequently arraigned the Minister, the Reverend James Gibb, for heresy; Gibb's offence had been to depart, in his preaching, from the letter of the Westminster Confession, Gibb having found love to be too broad a concept to fit within the limits of conventional Calvinism. Sunday school sentiment lay with the likes of Gibb, the schools' spokespeople reasoning that healthy social foundations would reinforce spiritual growth. The London Sunday School Union's W.H. Groser, applying his understanding of psychology to evangelism in 1898, argued, from the force of association of ideas, that celebration in the love of Christ would be far more powerful than the fear of Hell in drawing young people to conversion.\textsuperscript{12}

The validity of Groser's ideas in the context of the 1890s cannot be objectively verified. Contemporary Sunday schools in Otago and Southland certainly had success in prompting celebratory, over and above penitential, religion. Their anniversary teas, winter festivals and summer picnics spanned the generation gap. They were major community events, widely reported in the local press, events which projected the family ideal on to a larger canvas. Crowds of up to a thousand people were reported at Knox Presbyterian Sunday School picnics, and 2500 attended an inter-school meeting organised under the auspices of Knox Church in 1877.\textsuperscript{13} Over a thousand people - children, teachers parents and friends - attended the South Dunedin Baptist Sunday School picnic in 1873. The children were taken to William Ings' orchard in large coal drays, 'preceded by young men carrying banners with embroidered texts'.\textsuperscript{14} St Leonards and Sawyers Bay, on the western shore of Otago Harbour, were favourite venues for the Presbyterian First Church picnics, with trains often being chartered for these occasions. At the 'very successful' picnic at Mosgiel in the summer of 1896, over

\textsuperscript{10} See Appendix A.
\textsuperscript{11} Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of the Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 22 January 1883.
\textsuperscript{13} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1877.
\textsuperscript{14} South Dunedin Baptist Church. 'Sabbath School on the Swamp', South Dunedin Baptist Church Jubilee Material. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 94.174 1-30.
600 children and adults travelled by special train, with 'many others' arriving by later trains. The First Church's midwinter festivals were just as well patronised. Seven hundred children, parents and friends attended the winter social held at the Temperance Hall in 1882, where an ecumenical panel of clergy and lay presenters spoke on mission themes.

These large gala occasions were supplemented with smaller gatherings on a more regular basis, the callisthenics of the body of Christ, integrating member and member, sometimes across age, congregational or denominational division; the spiritual community nourished the secular. The Russell Street Presbyterian Sabbath School, Dunedin, ran 'a scheme of small social gatherings on Friday evenings, two or three classes at a time' during 1889, to foster 'a better attitude of the scholars' and promote 'social intercourse between teacher and scholar.' Sunday school teachers also held their own socials. The Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School ran both a winter and summer social for teachers in 1883 and again in 1886. An outing in 1889 saw the teachers joining with the church choir on a trip to the city reservoir. In the winter of 1895 the First Church School extended invitations to teachers from the schools associated with Trinity Methodist Chapel, Moray Place Congregational Church and Great King Street Independent Church to share a planned ecumenical gathering. The South Dunedin Baptist teachers, in 1891, organised a joint picnic with their colleagues from the Mosgiel, Mornington and Caversham Baptist schools.

The Bible classes, Christian Bands and Christian Endeavour groups, cartilage in the church body linking Sunday school to adult membership, also developed a social life, both for the benefit of their own members and to draw in new recruits. Again connections were made, through these social activities, across age, congregational and denominational divides. The Hanover Street Baptist Young Christians' Band, in 1883, had a total membership of 119, made up of 75 senior and 44 junior members. Its weekly meetings, reportedly, were well attended. At its second social gathering, held

---

15 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 21 October 1896.
16 Ibid., 13 October 1882.
17 Ibid., 9 October 1889.
18 Ibid., 25 January 1884 and 22 February 1887.
19 Ibid., 14 October 1895.
20 South Dunedin Baptist Church. Sunday School Minute Book, 1 October 1891. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 94-174 2.2.
on Wednesday, July 18, 1883, about 150 members and 'friends' were present. 'Tea and provisions were passed round as the friends sat about the schoolroom, and all seemed to enjoy themselves heartily. The abundance of cakes, provided by the members themselves, proved the warm interest taken in the Band.' 21 A range of solos, duets and recitations was presented during the entertainment, including: 'Oh, Word of words, the Sweetest', 'Nearer Home', 'We cannot do without Him' and 'Must I Go, and Empty-handed'. Echoing the theme of the entertainment, those present were exhorted to 'shine brightly for the Master in their homes and in business' and to 'seek to win others for Jesus', and the wish was expressed that 'none would be content to go to heaven empty-handed'. Response was quick and positive. Mr Paterson, one of the Baptists' guests from the St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, spoke of 'the encouragement one of their teachers had received years ago, through the Hanover-street School'. Impressed with what he himself had seen at the social, Paterson went away to form a similar Band in his own church. 22

Songs and recitations, like those used at the Hanover Street Band social in 1883, figured prominently in winter gatherings, whether for children or young adults, music playing an important part in the Victorian use of leisure; alternative activities had to be on hand, even for summer events, in case of bad weather. Books of ditties and monologues suitable for Sunday school or Bible class use could be purchased through outlets dealing in religious literature. E.L. Loehr's Paramount Sunday School Recitations, a Chicago publication offering 'three hundred choice selections' aimed at the infant and junior age levels, was used by the Auckland Sunday School Union and also in Otago. 23 Most of its poems were moral rather than evangelical exhortations; social occasions in the life of the Sunday school and Bible class were times, evidently, to focus more directly on the fruits rather than the roots of conversion. 'Smile whenever you can' explained the utilitarian value of cheerfulness; a light heart encourages good health which, in turn, promotes a circularity of happiness. 'Do a kindness' praised the worth of good works done without thought of reward: 'What you lose the angels find'. 'One of God's Little Heroes' reworked the theme of an adult saved by the example of a dying child-saint. 'The Town of Nogood' offered a brief caution against a 'Pilgrim's Regress'. Some items in the kindergarten section were metrical object lessons; 'The Rain Coach' used raindrops, river, and sea to typify the gathering of believers into God. 'It isn't far to Jesus' was one of the few directly

21 The New Zealand Baptist (Christchurch), September 1883, p.331.
22 Ibid., pp.331-332.
devotional poems in the book to urge early conversion. Significant sections of the collection were
devoted to temperance and mission work.

The planning and running of such a range of Sunday school and allied social activities on a regular
basis required a major commitment of time, making heavy demands on the teaching team. Socialization into the local community was a type of socialization into the body of Christ and could
not be taken lightly, whether by Sunday school staff or their community contacts. Local landholders
were usually generous in allowing the use of their property for a gala event, but transport had to be
booked, food purchased and prepared, games organised, and necessary adjustments finalised. The
St Paul's Anglican Sunday School, Dunedin, picnicking at Burnside in January 1885, travelled by
train, leaving at 10.15 am and returning at 7.30 pm. Tents were hired for the occasion, and swings
were borrowed from St John's Church, Roslyn.24 Choosing a picnic site proved to be a problem two
years later for the St Paul's teachers; they seemed to be fussier than the Presbyterians. Quarantine
Island in Otago Harbour was attractive, but the ,15 steamer fare was too dear. Sawyers Bay was
inspected. It was judged too far out of town, the grass was too long, the ground was swampy and
there was no shelter. St Leonards was eventually accepted as a suitable venue, if the School was
'willing to rough it a bit'.25 Teachers in large schools often spread the organisational load by forming
themselves into picnic subcommittees. Among the Caversham Baptists in 1881 these were: boiler,
tent, amusements, cutting up, provisions, singing and 'swinging' - what the last-named group's
responsibilities were is not clear.26

The schools' willingness to face financial outlay, as well as making sacrifices of time, underlines
the importance which they attached to their social activities; 'where your treasure is, there will
your heart be also'. Sums of ,20 to ,30 per event were common among large schools. The
Caversham, Forbury and Mary Hill Schools pooled their resources in January 1878 and, for an
outlay of ,25 purchased: 248 cakes, 660 buns, 33 loaves, 120 lbs of meat, 20 lbs of butter, 11
gallons of milk, 1 lb of mustard, 6 lbs of tea, 61 lbs of sugar, 20 lbs of Barcelona nuts, 10 lbs of

---

23 E L Loehr (Ed), *Paramount Sunday School Recitations, comprising Three Hundred Choice Selections*,
Meyer and Brother, Chicago, 1902.
24 St Paul's Anglican Church, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, 7 December 1884 and 11 December 1884.
25 Ibid., 9 December 1887, 15 December 1887 and 18 December 1887.
26 Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 5 December 1881. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. UN78
5.6.
almonds and 68 lbs of lollies. They also bought an inflatable ball, rope and admission tickets, and they paid a gatekeeper, 8 shillings; free-loaders, evidently, were a problem at picnics, although they might be accommodated as potential converts at the Christian Band and Christian Endeavour socials of some churches.\(^{27}\) Even for small schools, in proportion to their size, the financial outlay on a picnic was burdensome. The Queenstown Sabbath School function in 1868 entailed an outlay of 11 shillings on 'lollies' and 8 shillings on raisins and almonds, almost as much as was spent on classroom equipment for the whole year.\(^{28}\) Roslyn Sabbath School, in 1870, spent about \(\$0.4\) on food for the annual picnic and some 10 shillings on balls, skipping ropes, poles and flags.\(^{29}\) Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School budgeted for an outlay of \(\$8\) on their summer 1889 picnic, with Messrs Allnutt and Randesson authorised to spend up to 30 shillings on toys.\(^{30}\) St Stephen's at Invercargill were canny and resold their unused picnic sugar and biscuits in 1889 for six shillings and three pence.\(^{31}\) The Dundas Street Primitive Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin, in 1891, evidently shopped around for bargains. James Dickson supplied twenty pan loaves for 9s 2d. Butter was bought from D.M. Miller, 10lbs of it at 8d per pound. J. Stevens provided a 20lb ham, again at 8d per pound, while 24lbs of beef from E. Allen cost 8 shillings. J.W. Roberts supplied three dozen lemonade and ginger ale, 3lbs of tea and 14lbs of sugar. A whopping 32lb cake, together with nine dozen 9d buns, was bought from Helmkey's. T.Aitchison, dairyman, sold 10 gallons of milk at 10d per gallon. In addition to its outlay on food, the Dundas Street School spent 23 shillings on toys, 10 shillings on the rent of the North Dunedin Hall and 4 shillings on advertising. Unconsumed provisions, resold at the end of the picnic afternoon, generated 14 shillings of income.\(^{32}\)

Church courts were not always willing to reimburse Sunday schools for social expenses, sometimes leaving teachers with hard choices; some church elders, perhaps more remote than Sunday school

\(^{27}\) Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, January 1878.


\(^{30}\) Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin. Minutes, December 1889. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 Box 42 1528.


\(^{32}\) Dundas Street Primitive Methodist Church, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, December 1891. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 640 36/01/11.
teachers from contact with young families, looked for a healthy bank balance rather than an intangible credit in the balance of social activity. On being refused funding for a picnic in the summer of 1890, the disappointed teachers of St Andrew's Presbyterian Sunday School, Dunedin, cancelled the event.\(^{33}\) The St Andrew's Deacons' Court, in 1899, debated whether to vote 5, 4 or nothing to subsidize that year's Sabbath school picnic. By a majority of one, the vote was for 'nothing'; the Reverend Rutherford Waddell ordered that his dissenting vote be minuted.\(^{34}\) Schools made up funding shortfalls in a variety of ways - special congregational collections, the selling of tickets, cover charges, the raising of subscriptions, donations in cash and kind, and gala concerts. The South Dunedin Baptists made their annual winter tea meeting free to scholars in 1878, with visitors admitted at a shilling a head.\(^{35}\) In the same year the Linden Wesleyans supplied their senior boys and girls with collecting cards, a good three months before the summer picnic fell due.\(^{36}\) Sometimes teachers themselves agreed to make up the deficit if fundraising proved inadequate.\(^{37}\) The underfunded, undersupported St Andrew's staff agreed to a levy of a shilling per teacher to offset a large debit in the 1897 picnic account.\(^{38}\)

As T.S. Eliot suggested, human beings cannot bear very much reality, and the requirements of joyfulness eventually become a burden; humanity then seeks the escapism of discontent. The cycle of festival preparation eventually became a chore to Otago's Sunday schools and Bible classes, as the settlement became more sophisticated and choice of secular leisure activity increased. At Dunedin's First Church School, 'overkill' was first evident in the teachers' socials. Because of 'want of interest' and 'the unsocial [sic] feelings of some', the teachers' picnic was not held in 1884.\(^{39}\) A sad cloud also hung over the previous children's picnic; a boy had been killed because of the 'pell-mell way of getting in and out of the conveyances'.\(^{40}\) There was only a relatively 'small attendance'

\(^{33}\) St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, Dunedin, 13 January 1890 and 10 February 1890.

\(^{34}\) Ibid., 13 February 1899.

\(^{35}\) South Dunedin Baptist Church. Sunday School Minute Book, 15 July 1878.

\(^{36}\) Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin. Minutes, 17 October 1878.

\(^{37}\) Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 30 November 1868.

\(^{38}\) St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 1 July 1897.

\(^{39}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 15 October 1884 and 28 January 1885.

\(^{40}\) Ibid., 25 January 1884.
at the School's Abbotsford picnic, held on Boxing Day in 1887, and there were too few teachers to administer all the arrangements smoothly.\textsuperscript{41} Presbyterian Scots had not traditionally celebrated Christmas, and it had been common for Christmas Day or Boxing Day to be earmarked for the annual 'treat' in Dunedin and Invercargill schools.\textsuperscript{42} A society made more multiethnic by the gold rushes and Vogelite migration reordered its family priorities by 1887. With Christmas becoming a family holiday, the First Church Sabbath School, by one vote, had taken the decision to close down for four weeks of that summer, making the Boxing Day picnic that year at Abbotsford unviable.\textsuperscript{43} Eventually the church's annual picnics were rescheduled for February but, by the turn of the century, the very concept of church socials was being questioned. The teachers resolved, in 1897, to proceed with a Sunday school picnic on a ticket-only basis, with the School supplying tea but with participants bringing their own food.\textsuperscript{44} The Sabbath School Report to Session in 1899, reviewing a successful picnic at Sawyers Bay, nevertheless concluded:

\begin{quote}
There are so many of these outings nowadays, and they go so much further afield than it is within the means of the Association to take our scholars, that the young people are a little inclined to be indifferent to this yearly excursion.\textsuperscript{45}
\end{quote}

The St Andrew's Sunday School picnic, Dunedin, was postponed for a week in 1901 because of 'the visit of the Indian troops' to the city.\textsuperscript{46} As regards winter socials, teachers rather than students showed flagging enthusiasm. Pupil demand at the First Church School, apparently, kept the winter function alive in the face of teacher scepticism in 1893. Comment from teachers wearied by the demands of use and wont noted that pupils appeared to regard the winter social 'as the correct thing to do'.\textsuperscript{47}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{41} Ibid., 11 April 1888. \\
\textsuperscript{42} St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 5 December 1882 and 28 November 1883. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. \\
\textsuperscript{43} Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 22 February 1887. \\
\textsuperscript{44} Ibid., 14 April 1897. \\
\textsuperscript{45} Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1899. \\
\textsuperscript{46} St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 6 March 1901.
\end{flushleft}
The growing sophistication of settlement, which undermined the relevance of picnics, led teachers to look to the economic as well as the social lives of their scholars. Sunday schools in Otago and Southland had once sanctified the secular in the teaching of literacy; they now resisted rationalist attempts to secularize the sacred, reasserting Christian faith as the only integrative catalyst for all human activity. The Evangelist, in June 1878, took Dunedin's rationalist spokesman, Robert Stout, to task for confusing the descriptive with the prescriptive in ethical issues; Stout allegedly had claimed that scientifically descriptive studies of society would suffice to foster right conduct among students by providing the students with a factual basis for comparison.\(^{48}\) The Sunday schools responded to the competition of materialism and rationalism by reclaiming daily work, together with leisure crafts, for Christ, reviving a neo-Marsdenite linkage between spiritual efficacy and a training in the trades. Mirroring Nonconformist practice in Britain, the Congregationalist Sunday school in Caversham, Dunedin, in the early 1900s, taught bookkeeping, woodcarving and shorthand, in addition to Biblical and literary knowledge and twice-weekly gymnastics classes.\(^{49}\) 'Industrial exhibitions' became an annual feature of Sunday school life among many of the city's denominations during the 1880s and 1890s. The teachers at the St Paul's Anglican Sunday School, Dunedin, meeting in March 1885, suggested an 'Industrial Exhibition' for the following spring and, in a culturally callow attempt to hallow multiethnicity, proposed pairing the Industrial Exhibition with an exhibition of 'Maori Curiosities' and 'Works of Art'. The church's Young Men's and Young Women's Associations were to be asked to assist with the project.\(^{50}\) A total of 79 entries had been received by May. Children from Sabbath schools affiliated with the Otago Presbyterian First Church put together a similar display in 1892 where many of their exhibits 'in the mechanical and, indeed, in all departments were highly meritorious, and spoke well both for the patience and skill of the young exhibitors'.\(^{51}\) The display was spread over two days, Friday and Saturday, 25 and 26 March. Entries were numerous and, evaluating the event, the teachers decided that a larger hall would be needed for next year. Following this success, the First Church teachers decided to organise a

\(^{47}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of the Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 11 October 1893.

\(^{48}\) The Evangelist (Dunedin), June 1878, 'The Teaching of Morals in our Schools', p.12.


\(^{50}\) St Paul's Anglican Cathedral, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, 1 March 1885.

\(^{51}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, Sabbath Schools Report, 1892.
Cookery Competition and also a Flower Show, reasoning that 'the cultivation of flowers, "stars of the earth's firmament" someone has called them, cannot fail to have a gracious and refining influence on the mind and heart of our scholars'.\(^\text{52}\) The Flower Show attracted over 200 entries, the church was decorated and a children's floral service held, the teachers hoping that this would become an annual event. They believed that, through such ventures, 'the scholars will be brought into closer contact with the teachers and the real work of teaching furthered'.\(^\text{53}\) Similar craft shows were arranged by the St Paul's Presbyterian Sunday School, Invercargill, and among the St Andrew's and North Dunedin Presbyterian Sabbath Schools.\(^\text{54}\) By the turn of the century, the Otago Sunday School Union had taken an organizational lead in this aspect of Sunday school activity, offering prizes and merit certificates for entries in its inter-school craft exhibitions; there were numerous categories, for example model-making, doll-dressing, needlecraft and cookery, with these further sub-graded by age.\(^\text{55}\)

Sunday schools and Bible classes in Otago and Southland extended the integrative scope of religion into the physical as well as the mental and spiritual spheres. The *Evangelist* in 1869 advocated Mutual Improvement Societies or kindred clubs as likely to confer many benefits on young Sunday scholars.\(^\text{56}\) Such clubs asserted the Christian's responsibility to maintain physical as well as mental and spiritual health, arguing that the three were interdependent. The *Evangelist*, six years later, warned young people that God would hold them responsible if they fell into invalidism through their own fault.\(^\text{57}\) Visits to the gymnasium became part of Christian stewardship, and diet became a moral issue. 'Put a man of mild disposition upon the animal diet of which the Indian partakes, and in a little while his blood will change its chemical proportions', rendering him 'fierce' and 'cruel'. The aboriginal Indian, evidently, remained an unregenerate prisoner of his environment, darkened by the ignorance born of original sin, awaiting the emancipating touch of the Christian gospel. Touched by, but largely rejecting, the biological Calvinism of pure eugenics, Otago's Sunday schools argued for

\(^{52}\) Ibid., 1893.

\(^{53}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of the Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 12 October 1892.

\(^{54}\) St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 3 May 1894. See also St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 5 October 1892 and 8 August 1895.

\(^{55}\) See Chapter 6.

\(^{56}\) *The Evangelist* (Dunedin), June 1869, 'Mutual Improvement Societies'.
the influence of the environment upon children's physical and moral development while positing, at least implicitly, the ability of a redeemed humanity to make beneficial environmental changes. Post-millennial optimism was alive and well in the Sunday schools of Otago during the 1870s.

Recognition of, and an appropriate canalization of, the animal spirits of youth became part of the brief of Sunday schools and their associated agencies in the later nineteenth century. While New Zealand day schools of the period promoted rugby among boys to tame the playground, Sunday schools integrated physical activity and ethics. A contemporary Australian teacher, preaching the interaction of body and soul, claimed:

"It is the trying that does you most good, not the prize. "What have you got for all your months of training and hard work?" said a lazy onlooker to one who had lost his race in the Olympian games. "STRENGTH FOR LIFE", said the muscular athlete as he held out an arm of steel."

Implicit in the athlete's claim was a conceptual fusion of physical, mental and spiritual 'life', an accession to, and extension of, the doctrine of 'mens sana in corpore sano' which Otago's Sunday schools and Bible classes increasingly reflected in their practice. At North Dunedin's Presbyterian Sabbath School, Saturday afternoon rugby or cricket, according to the season, was available for those who met Sabbath attendance criteria, while the Gymnastics Club met weekly on Wednesday evenings. An observer from the congregation noted:

The evenings commence with a reading or recitation by one of the boys, after which the dumb-bell and Indian club exercises are gone through, the boys standing in lines at equal distances from each other and facing the platform where the instructor stands and directs their movements. Then the boys are exercised by a run around the Hall in single file, gradually changing to double and quadruple file until, when a halt is called, the lads find themselves arrayed in a solid column. Thereafter the horizontal bar is rigged up and here the most amusing part of the evening occurs - some of the boys finding it anything but

---


easy to follow their leader through all his movements. Excellent discipline combined with great good humour and hearty enjoyment seems to reign.59

Well adjusted conduct was held to flow from well regulated motor control.

Among older students, Bible classes and Christian Bands encouraged camps and intergroup sports fixtures, emphasising that the linkage between the physical and the spiritual finds its proper expression in wholesome social activity. Wellington's Wesley Sunday School Young Men's Bible Class played cricket and rugby fixtures against Taranaki Young Men's Institute at Wanganui in 1899. Stopping overnight at Palmerston North, the lads had a water fight. At Wanganui they lost both sports matches, but found other consolations. As they drove past Wanganui Girls' High School, they saw the girls of the school flocking to the windows. The lads stopped to give them three cheers, and another for the 'lady principal'. Sunday morning saw the group taking an early swim before attending church. On Sunday afternoon they debated against a Taranaki team on the issue 'that recreation is carried to excess in our day'. Sunday evening found the group once more in church.60 Their Sabbath observance would have been far too loose to satisfy an Otago purist such as William Will, but they did seem to be seeking a spirituality which would knit the fragmented experiences of colonisation and settlement; heirs to the hopes of migration, they were seeking to make spiritual sense of their secular surroundings.

Activities similar to those enjoyed by Wellington's young Wesleyans were enjoyed by young men in Dunedin under the aegis of their church classes and clubs. Some surprisingly liberal attitudes and practices among these groups were tolerated by church authorities as the price of retaining the interest of Otago's increasingly independent-minded youth. The Russell Street Bible Class developed a Week Night Club with the aims of fostering social contact among the members, promoting the reading of good books and providing an 'outlet for the athletic spirit so prevalent among young men'. The programme included chess, dominoes, draughts, quoits, drill with Sergeant W. Kirkham as the chief instructor, and dumb-bell exercises. A 'Harriers' Club' met on Saturdays and, at Easter 1900, the class went camping at Omimi. Through the programme's attraction lads were 'kept in connection

59 'North Dunedin Monthly', September 1892, p.10.
with the school who, under ordinary conditions, would almost certainly leave it. Members of the St Andrew's Young Men's Mutual Improvement Association espoused the Christian virtues of gymnastics, which 'fits us all the more for the daily duties of life'. The Christian's exercise should be moderate but regular, its aim not being bodily strength but economy of effort and muscular motor skill. Some of the St Andrew's young men's weekend camping activities showed a casual disregard of Sabbath observance; Sunday morning camp activities included fishing at Taieri Mouth and rabbit shooting at Clinton. Comments by group members suggest the amused contempt with which the young Dunedinite, even of the 1880s, regarded his parochially isolated country cousins. The nearest church was ten miles from Clinton and one of the settlement's locals allegedly 'wiled [sic] away his time on Sunday by mesmerising hens'.

The St Andrews Young Men's Mutual Improvement Association was typical of many similar groups attached to Otago churches of the day. Its membership was male. 'Dorcas societies' proliferated to uphold the conventionally-defined identity of womanhood, an aspect of Otago Sunday school activity so large as to require treatment in a chapter of its own. The St Andrew's male group reflected, 'warts and all' the need of the young colonially-born to define an identity and reaffirm a purpose for their lives, a need expressed in their self-conscious analysis of their own leisure activities. The group's journal, the Mirror, reflected the Victorian male's passion for verbal, literary and mental self-improvement. Some older commentators found the group to be shallow. 'Senator', writing in the Mirror in 1885, deplored the way in which the young men of the St Andrews Association 'spoiled' young women on ladies' nights by over-effusive thanks for their attendance. On the other hand, he regretted the grossness of unrefined male behaviour. While denying that he had a 'down' on colonial youth, he levelled numerous charges at the association's members: that they showed too much 'push' and 'smartness'; that their speech was slovenly, flouting the norms of syntax and pronunciation; that their eating and drinking were immoderate; that horse racing and, particularly, football intruded even into their Sabbath conversations; above all that their outlook was

61 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, Russell Street Bible Class Reports, 1897 and 1900.
62 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. 'The Mirror: a Literary Journal for the Mental, Moral and Religious Improvement of the Members of St Andrew's Church Young Men's Mutual Improvement Association', July 1885, Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. BB3/6.
63 Ibid., July 1885 and October 1885.
64 See Chapter 11.
Feeding the Lambs 246 D S Keen

too secular, a fault which 'Senator' found reflected in the lack of religious activity in the Association's programme. Senator's criticisms represent, perhaps, disappointment in a misplaced romanticisation of youth as much as an objective appraisal. Certainly, however, many of the seminar papers presented by young men at the St Andrew's association meetings were functional and utilitarian, dealing with technological topics, for example, coal mining, assaying, the phonograph and the electric light. Material on comparative religion was descriptive rather than devotional. Many papers related to leisure pursuits. Some highlighted the virtues of self-achievement; Samuel Smiles was reckoned a 'great author'. Among the papers showing overt moral concern were those on temperance, yet in this area too young speakers tried to deduce ethical conclusions from the inductive evidence of the physical sciences.

The North Dunedin Presbyterian Church in the later nineteenth century countered the lure of secularism among its young men with an idealistic programme, more structured and directive than the one operating at St Andrew's, but similar in aim. It was a two-part programme, running on alternate Thursday evenings. In the literary section, a study of Holmes' *Handbook of English Literature* together with a selection of Tennyson's poetry was mandatory; North Dunedin's J. Gibson Smith appreciated and wrote poetry. Optional authors for study included Scott, George Eliot, Carlyle, Macaulay and Ruskin. The second section of the programme was historical, embracing eighteenth century British history:

> It was during this period that Britain conquered India and lost America, and the study of the causes that led to these momentous events, with the lives of the great men who figured in their accomplishment, cannot fail to give the student much insight into the Britain of the present day.66

The Bible is a book of history and poetry, fused in interpretative prophecy. The prophets of nineteenth century Otago, transposing Biblical exegesis into their local circumstances, looked to their own literary and historical exemplars to reinforce Biblical precept, provide a secular hagiography and hallow their British heritage. For all the casually liberal behaviour of some of the colonially-born, Cargill's heirs still saw themselves as a chosen people.

65 The Mirror, October 1885.
66 'North Dunedin Monthly', Vol 2, July 1892, p.17.
Records of other associations in Otago and Southland, similar to the St Andrew's and North Dunedin groups, further illustrate the difficulties which such associations found in striking a just balance in their activities between the social and devotional, the secular and the spiritual, the permissive and the directive, in being in the world but not of it. Some groups were markedly more successful than others in sustaining an integrated programme. The Young Men's Literary Association at Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church faced an identity crisis in the 1890s through gender differentiation. In spite of disappointingly low attendances, its committee banned amusements from the association's programme in 1893 and, in 1896, ruled against female membership as being conducive to frivolity, with vocal and instrumental music likely to take the place of serious debate. By 1898, however, the languishing association had evolved, or degenerated, depending on one's point of view, into a social club, holding only two debates in that year and failing in its efforts to encourage its members to speak without notes.\(^\text{67}\) Associations which made a virtue of co-education perhaps had more success. The Hanover Street Baptist Church junior and senior Christian Bands numbered over 100 members in 1905, and the church's Literary and Debating Society had over 70 members offering readings and lectures on 'several evenings' each week.\(^\text{68}\) The Mutual Improvement Association of Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin, functioned effectively in the 1890s under a committee composed equally of young men and women. Besides offering practical courses on First Aid, its programme during 1895 included discussion and debate on the socio-political issues of the day, reflecting a strong interest in social justice: 'Should ladies be members of parliament?'; 'Is the present system of dress advantageous to women?'; 'The Aid to Settlers Act'; 'What proportion of the benefits that accrue from machinery should go to the operative?' 'Should New Zealand federate with Australia?' Voting on this issue produced a tie.\(^\text{69}\) Inter-club debates were organised with the Caversham Presbyterian Literary and Debating Society and the Dunedin Catholic Literary Society. A mock parliament, a science night and two 'author's nights' were held, the authors of choice being Oliver Wendell Holmes and Browning. Another paper, in an interesting parallel with the concerns of the contemporary St Andrew's group, debated the respective merits of town and country life; evidently this was a lively issue for young people whose lifestyles were in transition from pioneering to

\(^{67}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1893, 1896 and 1898.


\(^{69}\) Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin. Minutes of the Mutual Improvement Association, February-April 1895. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 36.24.
settlement. Discussion among the urban audience concluded that town experience was necessary for the development of a rounded, strong character.

The envisaged 'character' was a projection of middle class, although not exclusively British, values, a distillation of upward social mobility. During and after the 1880s Sunday school teachers in Dunedin promoted these values among their junior classes, either through the direct outreach of domestic mission or by actively involving scholars in works of private charity. Under the auspices of St Andrew's Church, Dunedin, the Stafford Street Mission School was set up in the mid 1880s by a Norwegian migrant, Oscar Michelsen. It operated in a hall loaned by the Reverend Dr Burns' widow, servicing the needs of Dunedin's infamous 'devil's half acre', and its clientele were almost exclusively the children of parents who were 'connected with no church'. The hope was entertained that these children would become, consciously or unconsciously, missioners to their unbelieving parents, that the Sabbath school would provide a point of contact with the home which the church could develop and that, eventually, an adoption of middle class mores would provide tangible evidence of conversion among children and parents alike. Michelsen added to his programme a Sunday evening meeting which both children and parents could attend. 'The number steadily increased. Gradually one after another felt they would like to join a more respectable company; and of course we were pleased to see them go over to the big church'.

Other of Dunedin's Sunday schools organised their junior classes during the 1880s towards the outdoor relief of poverty among casualties of economic recession. Such externally-focused programmes confirm the impression that it was the children of vulnerable, unskilled labour who predominated among the twenty per cent of Otago youngsters not attending Sunday school. The schools attached to the Knox Presbyterian Church ran gift days to support relief work from 1885 through into the 1890s. At first the gifts were meant to be of clothing, but they grew in number and variety. The 1887 gift day drew over 759 donations, with 988 articles received in 1889 and 1329 in 1890. The teachers associated with Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church schools suggested a

---

70 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1887, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools' Committee for the Year 1886, p.59.
72 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1885, 1887, 1889, 1890.
Sunday school gift day for the poor of their congregation in 1890.\textsuperscript{73} At the first gift festival, a total of 330 gifts was received, ranging from a ton of coal to 'a pinafore for Mary'; 29 cases of poverty were relieved. The successful venture was projected as an annual event. At an 1893 festival, 176 items were distributed among 53 'less fortunate people'. Cash, fuel, clothing and groceries were received, including: 102lb bags of oatmeal, 50 lb and 25 lb sacks of flour, 15 loaves, 41 bars of soap and a tin of coffee.\textsuperscript{74} The 1895 haul included 330 garments, 22 tons of coal, and gifts of flour, oatmeal, tea, sugar, bread, butter, potatoes, candles and soap. After the first festival the allocation of the gifts was decided by a committee of the Sunday school teachers, the Young Ladies' Guild and the Ladies' Association. Controversy arose at once. The Sunday school teachers, having done the hard organisational work, wanted to have sole charge of the gift distribution, but the church clearly doubted the ability of young, apparently inexperienced people to judge what constituted a deserving case for relief. Mrs Brand, of the Sunday school, coordinated the distribution of gifts in 1893. A private school teacher and probably a widow, she was an ideal compromise choice as coordinator. After the 1894 distribution, she was commended as having devoted 'a considerable amount of time and tact in investigating the need of particular cases'.\textsuperscript{75} It was hoped, overall, that the exercise in charitable giving would 'largely help in educating the young people in house mission work in a very practical way. If we are sorry for the poor, we help them'.

In an age alive to temperance issues, cases granted outdoor relief had to be the 'deserving poor'. The temperance movement pushed hard to get its message across to the young, and its attempts to influence the Sunday schools constitute the most striking example of a sectional lobby attempting to use Sunday schooling as a vehicle for its own programme. The targeted age groups were the junior classes or older. In some cases pledged Bible class devotees were employed in outreach to the younger children, using the leverage of role modelling. The club atmosphere of the temperance bands and the format of their 'pledges' appealed to the psychological need of young people for inclusion. C. McGeorge has commented on the temperance movement's failed attempts to create a compulsory slot in the New Zealand day-school curriculum.\textsuperscript{76} The Women's Christian Temperance

\textsuperscript{73} Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 13 October 1890.
\textsuperscript{74} Ibid., 11 October 1893.
\textsuperscript{75} Ibid., 11 October 1894.
\textsuperscript{76} C McGeorge, 'Schools and Socialization in New Zealand, 1890-1914', PhD Thesis, University of Canterbury, 1985, Ch.18.
Union distributed information charts to all schools in New Zealand through the Education Department.\textsuperscript{77} It also approached Sunday schools, for example the Sunday school of the St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill, asking that one Sunday in every quarter be dedicated to temperance themes.\textsuperscript{78} Sunday schools offered hope of an easier access for temperance workers than the day schools did; the 'beer and buns' of the Medmenham School were half a world and half a century away. The idea was fostered in the young Christians of Otago that alcohol was a vice of the 'lower classes' which the aspiring migrant should leave behind; temperance linked upward social and upward spiritual mobility.\textsuperscript{79}

The impact of a temperance programme in any particular Sunday school often depended on the attitude of the school superintendent towards the issue. In Otago in 1869 the region's Presbyterian Synod was urged by its Temperance Committee to direct a publicity campaign at the young, 'to bring them up, if possible, with a prejudice against drinking and the trade in liquor'.\textsuperscript{80} The same committee, in 1880, urged the formation of Bands of Hope, in association with Otago and Southland's Sabbath schools.\textsuperscript{81} Synod acceded to the appeal. Local teachers responded with varying levels of interest. Because of 'the untiring zeal and energy' of the young people of the Bible class, about half the Knox Presbyterian Sunday School was enrolled in that church's Band of Hope in 1883. The Knox Band, however, did not seem able to sustain a programme. It went into recess for four years, was revived in 1891, allegedly with 'crowded' monthly meetings, then failed again, to be revived in 1898.\textsuperscript{82} The Otago First Church's Temperance Association in the mid-1890s boasted a membership of 121, comprising mainly Sabbath school scholars. Rather more than a quarter of the


\textsuperscript{78} St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 14 October 1885.

\textsuperscript{79} St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. 'The Mirror - a Literary Journal for the Mental, Moral and Religious Improvement of the Members of the St Andrew's Church Young Men's Mutual Improvement Association, 1885-1887', p.117.

\textsuperscript{80} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1869, Appendix, Report of the Temperance Committee, p.30.

\textsuperscript{81} \textit{Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland}, 1880, Appendix, Report of Committee on Temperance for 1880, p.19.

\textsuperscript{82} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1883, 1891, 1898.
Sabbath school joined the association. Three years later the enthusiasm of J.W. Comissiong, superintendent at the Russell Street Sabbath School, led to the formation of the Russell Street Band. Half of its office holders were also Sabbath school teachers. The Band combined a social and morally didactic programme. 'While aiming at the entertainment of its members by recitations, dialogues and songs, it has in especial sought their instruction in Scriptural truth and temperance principles'. Its average attendance for the year 1898 was 55, almost a third of the average for the Russell Street Sabbath School itself. Over half of Otago and Southland's children were regular Sunday school attenders. If the attendance data for the Dunedin First Church and Russell Street Temperance Bands was typical and consistent among schools of all denominations across the region, then an eighth to a sixth of Otago's young people experienced significant exposure to temperance programmes. The Russell Street Band claimed that its older members, on leaving, 'in many cases' joined the Good Templars and that a supply of new recruits was 'always forthcoming'.

To the disappointment, however, of the Otago Presbyterian Synod's Temperance Committee, not every Sabbath school linked itself with a Band of Hope. The Committee believed that smaller Sunday schools in centres of under 200 population were escaping the net, although remote Hamiltons boasted a Good Templars' branch. Committee pessimists believed that other denominations were more zealous for the temperance cause than were the Presbyterians; the Baptists evidently, although not uniformly, were active. In January 1870 Messrs Cole and Todd, teachers at the Caversham Baptist Sunday School, entered into dispute with a Mr Paul, landlord of the Edinburgh Castle Hotel, over 'the disorderly and illegal manner in which the business of the hotel

83 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1895, Temperance Association Report.
84 J W Comissiong, William Smart, and Misses Bella Gillies, Mary Ramsay and M J Hall. See Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, Presbyterian First Church of Otago, 1898, Report of the Russell Street Band.
85 Ibid., 1898.
86 See Chapter 7.
87 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1898, Appendix, Report of Synod's Temperance Committee 1898, p.67.
88 Mount Ida Chronicle and St Bathans Weekly News (Naseby), 10 April 1879. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.
89 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1889, Deliverance on Temperance, p.19.
was conducted. Misses Langmuir and Boyes, also of the Caversham Sunday School, were embarrassed by the line Cole and Todd had taken but the men refused to apologise and the church upheld their stand. The Hanover Street Baptists held a preliminary meeting to form a 'temperance society in connection with the church and school' on 2 September 1881. About 50 people were present of whom 20, not a particularly high proportion, immediately joined the society. The Baptist Blue Ribbon Society in North East Valley, Dunedin, actively involved Sunday school children in its meetings throughout 1885; a programme on 31 July of that year was 'aimed at the young principally'. During this meeting there were three recitations, 'The Pledge', 'The Homeless Boy' and 'The Noble Boy', a dialogue entitled 'What Beer and Porter are made of' and a song, 'The Village Blacksmith'. Nine pledges were taken at a similar meeting of recitations by North East Valley Sunday school children in October 1887. The South Dunedin Baptist Sunday School sent three teachers as delegates to the Temperance Political Association in 1894. The Moray Place Congregational Church also ran a Band of Hope among its young people from 1877 onwards with an inaugural membership of over 100, at least half the Sunday school roll for that year. The Dundas Street Primitive Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin, regularly included the Band of Hope Review among the assorted periodicals which it purchase for resale to its scholars during the 1890s and, in May 1896, its teachers' meeting resolved to keep a Pledge Book in the schoolroom.

Roman Catholic and Anglican attitudes to temperance were more relaxed than those of other denominations. Liquor was part of the cultural tradition of French and Irish Catholic priests. It was common for Otago Anglican churches to allow temperance work among their young people, but without the zeal of stricter sects. The Good Templars' Lodge was authorised to hang its charter over the fireplace at in the Sunday school room at St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti, in October 1893. St John's Anglican Church, Roslyn, had a temperance society with a juvenile branch in the mid

90 Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 12 January 1870.
91 *New Zealand Baptist* (Christchurch), October 1881, p.139.
92 North East Valley Baptist Blue Ribbon Society Minute Book, 31 July 1885.
93 Ibid., 7 October 1887.
94 South Dunedin Baptist Church. Sunday School Minute Book, 11 October 1894.
95 Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Deacons, 30 September 1877.
96 Dunedin Primitive Methodist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 4 May 1896.
1880s. However, for the 'English Fair' which the Roslyn church ran in 1882 to raise money for its Sunday school, Dunedin's Garrison Hall was decked out as a medieval village street. A maypole, round which the children danced, formed a central feature. The stalls along the sides of the 'street' were given the familiar names of English 'pubs', for example 'The George and Dragon'. At the fundraising 'Fair of All Nations' two years later Mother Shipton, aided by Zarina, presided over the 'Tent of Mystery, wherein glimpses of the Future may be obtained by those who so desire'. Liquor was not served at either fair, but the looseness of the imagery at both events would have scandalised less liberal denominations.

The temperance vision was not confined to alcohol. The best of its publicity preached moderation as a way of life, underpinning a just world order predicated on a healthy, stable home environment. The Grand Lodge of New Zealand of the International Order of Good Templars admittedly had a narrow focus. Its imagery was military. It justified its discipline and ritual as necessities in the war against the 'numerous and dashing cavalry of Beer and Bacchus'. The policy of the Women's Christian Temperance Union of New Zealand was explicitly committed to securing pledges of total abstinence among old and young. WCTU concerns, however, internationally influenced and both local and global in their scope, encompassed 'total abstinence from the use of all narcotic poisons; the protection of the home by outlawing the traffic in alcoholic liquors, opium, tobacco and impurity; the suppression by law of gambling and Sunday desecration; the enfranchisement of women of all nations; and the establishment of courts of international arbitration which shall banish war from the world'. Temperance was interpreted to Sunday school children as an issue universal in its applicability and wider than the avoidance of alcohol. Commentaries on temperance themes in the International Series of Lessons, commonly used by Sunday schools, stressed that the concept upheld

98 St John's Anglican Church, Roslyn, Dunedin, 'Book of an English Fair', 1882. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 88/84 5-8.
99 St John's Anglican Church, Roslyn, Dunedin, 'Pamphlet of the Fair of All Nations', 1884. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 88/84 5-9.
101 Wood, pp.3-4.
102 Women's Christian Temperance Union of New Zealand: Souvenir ... 1885-1910, Smith and Anthony Ltd., Christchurch, 1910, p.6.
moderation in all things including eating and sleeping.\footnote{103} During the season of weekly meetings run by Dunedin's Russell Street Band through the winter of 1901, over half of the Band's 77 young members signed its pledge:

I desire to join the Band. I promise not to smoke, use profane language or stay out late at night. I promise to do all I can to make the meetings helpful, pleasant and profitable by my regular attendance, attention and obedience.\footnote{104}

Ignoring alcohol, the wording of the pledge concentrated on the more probable temptations of childhood, presumably premised on the belief that the child armed against the sins of its age group would most likely wear the armour of moderation into adulthood. The pledge focused the child more on the positive contribution which he or she could make to the general good rather than on the negatives of prohibition.

In an age when death was a far closer, more conscious companion of the living than it is today, there was urgency in the message to live well. The journals of the Reverend William Mugford Grant, Congregationalist minister at Port Chalmers during the 1880s, for example, vividly highlight the realities of life and death in an age preceding antibiotics and accessible medical care, and some of the Otago migrants would have left behind them an impoverished environment where the incidence of death and suffering was even higher. Children were encouraged to turn their lives to good account from an early age and to think of the potentially far-reaching effects of the simplest acts of righteousness. They were urged not to delay their own attempts at outreach for Christ. They were encouraged to see themselves, even in infancy, as missioners to backsliding or unregenerate peers or parents and to see the manner of dying, equally with living, as an opportunity for Christian witness. Exemplars held before the children were often heavily sentimental. Robin, child hero of 'A.L.O.E.'s' 1887 publication \textit{Pictures of Saint Peter in an English Home}, was instrumental in saving both siblings and acquaintance from a range of snares, including alcohol, involvement in the secular world of politics and involvement in the allegedly idolatrous world of Roman Catholicism.\footnote{105} The Christian child-hero of 'An Atheist Nonplussed', in the September 1872 issue of the \textit{Evangelist},

\footnote{103} Kaikorai Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, in Peter Randall, Personal Papers. Sunday School Ephemera, 'Scholars' Helps', 20 September 1896. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 90-107.

\footnote{104} Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1899 and 1901, Reports of the Russell Street Band.

challenged a scoffing adult to face death without fear.\textsuperscript{106} Accident and death were common enough real-world Sunday school experiences. Of the Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School children, Maggie Ball lost her arm and L. Snowden broke her leg during the summer of 1885.\textsuperscript{107} The deaths of three scholars from the Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School roll during the year 1883-1884 impressed upon the teachers 'the necessity of urging home \textit{Now} is the time to accept Christ'.\textsuperscript{108} Annie and Louisa Clark, of the Caversham Baptists' senior girls' class, 'had been led, through the medium of the Sunday school, to give their hearts to the Saviour, and died [in 1880] fully trusting in Jesus for Salvation, and leaving a bright testimony for him behind them.'\textsuperscript{109} Nellie Brough and Jean Beattie of the Caversham School were 'taken home to be with Jesus' in 1892.\textsuperscript{110} The April 1869 issue of the \textit{Evangelist}, describing the death of Queen Elizabeth I of England, schooled the young in the futility of a life lived without Faith:

\begin{quote}
The power she had worshipped all through her earthly career was even now passing away like a vapour from her grasp ... At Death's icy touch, earth's vanities receded and disappeared while the eternal world, with the infinite God to meet and answer, rose before her terrified gaze.\textsuperscript{111}
\end{quote}

Sunday schools taught the young that the life and death of children in Christ counted for more than the pomp of the great ones of the world. Point and purpose dignified even the youngest and humblest whose souls were given in faith to God.

Otago and Southland's Sunday schools of the later nineteenth century were agencies of a colonial synthesis, between the aspirations of body, mind and spirit, and between many diverse influences imported through migration. Synthesis was not easy to achieve. In Otago the post-millennial optimism of the migration of 1848 interacted with a pre-millennialism that was more pessimistic about humanity's capacity for self-improvement. Post-millennialism looked to build a better human society, a society fit for Christ's return. Pre-millennialism looked to Christ's return to save society

\textsuperscript{106} \textit{The Evangelist} (Dunedin), Vol 4, September 1872, p.276.

\textsuperscript{107} Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin. Minutes, 11 March 1885.

\textsuperscript{108} Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 25 January 1884.

\textsuperscript{109} Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 13 April 1880.

\textsuperscript{110} Ibid., 19 July 1892.
from its own inescapable degeneracy. Good works, to the pre-millennialist, were the outward and visible sign of miracle, of the powers of the Holy Spirit in the converted life. The marriage of evangelicalism with developmental psychology, on the other hand, gave post-millennialism a new lease of life. Liberal theologians and exponents of the social gospel, waiting in the wings of colonial settlement, were post-millennialists. Post-millennial teaching remained strong in Otago's Sunday schools and Bible classes, being implicit in the teaching of all those who advocated physical fitness, sport and mental training as stepping stones towards spiritual growth. Otago evangelical Protestantism reviled the Catholic church and also High Anglicanism for its alleged 'popish superstitions', yet its own post-millennial exponents at times seemed to come close to preaching salvation as the fruit of human endeavour, as a prize for running well in the race of life, as the natural outgrowth of a satisfactory diet.

Additional factors, both imported and domestic, further complicated the synthesis of colonial religious perceptions. The understanding of the region's Sunday school teachers was torn: between Calvinist teaching on original sin and the Keswick doctrine of universally available holiness; between election and universal evangelical outreach; between rationalism and revivalism; between Biblical literalism and the Higher Criticism. These imported skeins were tangled afresh by locally controversial issues: the secularisation of public day schooling; temperance; social justice and welfare in a context of economic uncertainty. Since the earliest days of settlement, Otago's microworld had never been homogeneous. Bearing in mind the youth of many of Otago and Southland's Sunday school teachers in the 1890s, it is not surprising that individuals were at the mercy of half-understood concepts, acquired second-hand, and that many found comfort in an easily accessible fundamentalism. What is surprising is the real depth of scholarship of many of Otago's contemporary church leaders, and the trouble which some Sunday school laity took to keep themselves abreast of international trends. Material published by the London-based Sunday School Union was very influential in this connection.

Whatever influences were imported from overseas had to be mediated to a society geographically isolated, modified by migration, and to new generations of the colonially born, conditioned by an environment radically different from that of 'home', sometimes evincing a free and easy manner that shocked their conservative elders. The enormity of the challenge gave the Sunday schools across the

---

111 The Evangelist (Lawrence), April 1869, p.9.
Protestant denominations in Otago and Southland a measure of homogeneity. The small local population base meant that the schools tended to teach from the same imported source materials, especially the International Series of Lessons. Different schools, sometimes of different denominations or of no denomination at all, actively sought to keep in touch with each other and to copy the best of each other's practice. Ecumenical trends, strong under pioneering conditions, remained important during more developed phases of settlement; thus the young men and women of the Moray Place Congregational community, Dunedin, were prepared to enjoy social debate with teams from St Joseph's Roman Catholic Cathedral. Sunday schooling, relatively cheap and easy to implement, was at the cutting edge of migrant society's desire to express its sense of community, its social activities reaching across differences of age and class, and its welfare efforts, however clumsy and patronising, expressing the duty of social outreach. During the early years of secularised day schooling, when worried Otagoites doubted the day schools' capacity to uphold the values necessary for a cohesive society, the Sunday schools provided comforting reassurance that such values were being taught with Biblical grounding, and acted as a safety valve for concerns such as those raised in the temperance controversy. The schools certainly taught that 'God had his eye on you'.

They inculcated conscience. And yet they consciously sought, also, to emphasize the love, the forgiveness and the joy of Christianity in their teaching; young Presbyterians consciously tried to move away from the dourness of their Genevan heritage, to teach the gospel as a cause of celebration. Otago's Sunday schools were isolated, and yet they were the plantings of migrants who had travelled with high hopes. The schools' practitioners, still in 1900, retained the feeling that they were in some sense special, the chosen of God; mission was a theme strongly emphasized in the Otago schools' teaching at the century's turn. The 'godly experiment' had changed, but it had not died; the founding myth, filtered and refracted by time and distance, still touched people's lives. The sense, whether conscious or unformalised, that they remained part of the experiment, children of an unshakeable Covenant, gave self-respect to many of Otago's young people. Many gained, through the Sunday schools, a lifetime's reassurance that their lives had a purpose. Echoes of such reassurance can be found among the Sunday school products of Otago's adult population down to the present day.

---

112 Joyce Dyer and Isobel Ellen, oral interview, Dunedin, 23 September 1996.
113 Lynne Aldridge and Barbara Ferguson, oral comment, Dunedin, 21 January 1998.
Chapter 11  Ewe Lambs - The Feminisation of Sunday Schools in Otago And Southland, 1870-1901

It was a common perception of later Victorian society that women, intuitive rather than rational, moved more easily than men in the uncharted realms of faith, that they possessed a finer moral sensibility than men, that the habit of prayer was best learnt early at the knee of idealised motherhood. Charity, personified in art, was romanticised and female. A doubting Alfred Tennyson, penning his great threnody In Memoriam, envied the naive efficacy of womanhood's unsophisticated faith: 'Leave thou thy sister when she prays, her early heaven, her happy views ... her hands are quicker unto good.' Whatever the underlying causes of the stereotype, it impacted powerfully on western Christianity and philanthropy during this period.

Geographically remote, but always open to overseas influences, the contemporary Sunday schools of Otago and Southland responded to the stereotype. Otago drew on a Scottish educational tradition that, for centuries, had been more generous than its English counterpart in opening up educational access to girls. In the Otago region's Sunday schools, the trend towards feminisation was consistent and gathered pace as the century drew to its conclusion. It was a trend more accentuated in the Sunday schools than among either the adult or school-age populations as a whole, more accentuated than among the nominal adherents of the several denominations. Feminisation was not a feature of the several churches' infant classes; this is why gender data, aggregated across the age range of Sabbath education, can appear misleadingly bland. Gender imbalance became increasingly evident among the senior Sunday school classes and young people of Bible class age, and its prevalence among Sunday school teachers became an embarrassment to church leaders. It was the young women of the church rather than the men who persevered in Sunday schooling, developing into committed church members and active workers, in a self-generating spiral of female role modelling. Young women found dignity and self-fulfilment through their Sabbath schooling. They practised skills of self-expression, organization and leadership through the schools. For some, the Sunday schools proved to be gateways to travel and adventure, in wider educational medical or mission work, in which contexts they modelled a feminised theology, preaching a nurturing Christ. Less glamorous but equally important was the influence of those who stayed at home, the rising generation of wives and mothers who mirrored Sunday school-engendered values in the kitchen, around the table and at the fireside.
The feminisation of the Sunday schools which became especially marked during the 1890s did not reflect the gender distribution either of the population as a whole or of that group which was specifically of school age, the 5 to 15 year age range.

### Table 22  Gender Balance in the European Population of Otago and Southland, 1848-1901

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Population</th>
<th>% Male</th>
<th>% Male among Population of School Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1848</td>
<td>640</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851</td>
<td>1,776</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1855</td>
<td>2,852</td>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>6,995</td>
<td>56</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1861</td>
<td>29,039</td>
<td>77</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864</td>
<td>57,104</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>56,520</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>85,113</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>134,077</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>153,097</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>173,145</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Statistics of New Munster 1841-1848  
Statistics of New Zealand for the Crown Colony Period  
Statistics of New Zealand 1853-1867  
Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand 1871-1901

At no stage in the second half of the nineteenth century did the region's population show full gender parity. Despite E.G. Wakefield's commitment to a structural balance, including gender balance, in immigration, the Scottish settlement commenced in 1848 with a male excess which provincial migration schemes tried and failed to correct. It was not easy for the respectable single woman of the day to migrate. The gold rushes of the 1860s, on the other hand, made migration both easy and alluring for the single man, rapidly creating a situation where men outnumbered women in the population of Otago by over three to one. Peaking rapidly in 1861, this huge imbalance then began to correct itself. The bachelor miner was mobile, and the married miner was not always reliable when down on his luck. Many men left Otago for Westland in and after 1865. Many more left for Australia during the 1880s recession, bringing Otago and Southland's population much closer to gender parity by 1891. The predominance of the native-born over migrants among the population of Otago and Southland from the mid-1880s onward also affected gender ratios; boys and girls were
born in roughly equal proportions. The school-age population from 1851 to 1901 showed a consistent but very slight male preponderance, of about one per cent at each census count.\footnote{See Chapter 7.}

Analysis of statistics relating to adult church nominal membership shows differing gender ratios in the various denominations' bases of support. Circumstantial evidence suggests that feminisation was more pronounced among active rather than nominal adult church adherents. Among Roman Catholics in Otago and Southland, an overwhelming bachelor weighting of nominal membership during the 1860s reflected the influx of unattached Irish gold miners. By 1901, however, Catholicism almost redressed its gender balance. A shift towards feminisation was evident, even among nominal adherents, in all the smaller Protestant denominations except the Lutherans, who remained 84 per cent male in 1896.\footnote{Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1896.} In the same year the Salvation Army was 52 per cent female, the Congregationalists 53 per cent and the Brethren 54 per cent. The Church of Christ was 55 per cent female in 1891.\footnote{At the St Andrew Street Tabernacle, Dunedin, in 1904, female members outnumbered males in a 70-30 ratio. Associated Church of Christ, St Andrew Street, Records 1864-1968. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.} The Baptists had achieved gender parity as early as 1878. Anglican and Presbyterian nominal membership more closely mirrored the gender balance of Otago's population as a whole.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Anglican</th>
<th>Presbyterian</th>
<th>R. Catholic</th>
<th>Wesleyan</th>
<th>Baptist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M%</td>
<td>F%</td>
<td>M%</td>
<td>F%</td>
<td>M%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Statistics of New Zealand 1858-1867
Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand 1871-1896.
Many hints that feminisation was a feature of active rather than nominal church membership, and was also a feature of recruitment, can be traced in the records of individual churches. In November 1884, among confirmations at St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti, 20 were of young women aged 14 to 28, and 13 were of young men aged 15 to 37, a 60-40 per cent ratio. Recruitment at St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, between 1889 and 1899, reflected a similar gender ratio, with female first-time communicants outnumbering male by 195 to 133. Of 435 new members joining the Hanover Street Baptist Church, Dunedin, between 1890 and 1901, 159 were men, 88 were married women and 188 were spinsters, a 36-74 per cent gender imbalance in favour of women.

Senior classes among Sunday schools amply reflected these trends during the 1890s. Reliable gender-differentiated data is not available for the Presbyterian Sabbath schools during the first twenty years of settlement, but the Sabbath Schools Committee of the Otago and Southland Synod did record the gender proportions on Sabbath school rolls from time to time during the last three decades of the nineteenth century. Some quantified data relating to Anglican rolls is also available.

In tables of aggregated data, gender parity among the infant classes of Sunday schools masks the loss of male support which the schools were experiencing among their teenage scholars at this time. Even aggregated tables cannot conceal the trend towards feminisation of membership which accelerated in Sunday schools after 1890, especially in urban areas. The female imbalance in the older classes of urban Sunday schools paralleled that in private day schools, with gender ratios of 60-40 or more in favour of girls becoming common. While many teenage boys sought apprenticeships, teenage girls of sufficient means continued to imbibe combinations of secondary, private and Sabbath education.

---

4 St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti. Vestry and Church Committee Minutes, 22 November 1884. East Otago Parish Archives, Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 52-114.
5 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Session Minutes, 1889-1899. Hewitson Archives, Knox College, Dunedin.
6 Dunedin City Baptist Church. Minutes, 1890-1901. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
Table 24  Gender Balance among Sabbath School Children and Children attending Public and Private Day Schools in Otago and Southland, 1871-1901

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>All Denominations % Male</th>
<th>Presbyterian % Male</th>
<th>Anglican % Male</th>
<th>Public Primary % Male</th>
<th>Secondary and Private % Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1871</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>55</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1872</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1873</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1879</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>52</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Gender ratios relating to Sabbath education followed consistent patterns across the denominations in Otago and Southland. Girls outnumbered boys on Presbyterian Sabbath school rolls, modestly but consistently through the 1870s and to an increasing degree in Dunedin city schools during the 1880s and 1890s. There were 201 girls to 135 boys on the nominal roll of the Knox Presbyterian Main Sunday School in 1887. In 1891 at the Presbyterian First Church of Otago, worried Sunday school teachers reported a decline not only in boys' nominal enrolment's but also in actual attendance and, by 1895, they noted that their aggregate Sunday school roll was 62 per cent female, 'a difference which [did] not exist in the day school.' Class records at St Andrew's Presbyterian Sunday School, Dunedin, over eight Sundays during the first quarter of 1895, showed a 57-43 per cent female imbalance in actual attendance. Teachers of the Senior Sunday School at Knox Church in 1897...

---

7 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacon's Court, 1887.
8 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Record of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 16 October 1891 and 14 October 1895. Presbyterian First Church of Otago Archives, Parish Office, Dunedin.
9 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 6 March 1895 and 3 April 1895.
lamented that only 15 out of a total nominal register of 95 were boys, a mere 16 per cent. They pleaded with the wider congregation to target likely lads in the 15 to 20 year age group as possible Senior Sunday School recruits.\textsuperscript{10} The trend towards feminisation took hold more slowly in rural areas. Boys usually, although not uniformly, outnumbered girls at the Queenstown Presbyterian Sabbath School from 1868 to 1885, by as much as 53 to 42 per cent in some quarterly returns.\textsuperscript{11} At the Riversdale Sunday School the shift to a predominantly female roll took place after 1896; a 60-40 male weighting in the Riversdale returns during the mid-1890s was completely reversed by 1901.\textsuperscript{12} At Warepa Sunday School, from 1907 to 1909, girls were in a minority on the nominal roll but were regular attendees and, interestingly, the Warepa girls were avid users of the school library with a quarter to a third of then borrowing books frequently, compared with about a tenth of boys.\textsuperscript{13}

Statistics relating to the Sunday schools of other denominations in Otago and Southland show trends similar to those of the Presbyterians. The Anglican data, as recorded in the Church of England Diocese of Dunedin Synod Proceedings, unfortunately, is incomplete. As far as it goes, it shows increased levels of feminisation in the Anglican Sunday schools in the last three decades of the nineteenth century, markedly so in the case of individual Dunedin city schools. At St Paul's, Dunedin, in 1866 there had been 83 boys on the Sunday school roll and 80 girls.\textsuperscript{14} By 1874, both at St Paul's and at the Port Chalmers Sunday School, girls outnumbered boys in a ratio of 5 to 4.\textsuperscript{15} The ratio of girls to boys at All Saints Sunday School, Dunedin, in the same year was almost 2 to 1. More boys than girls, on the other hand, attended Anglican Sunday schools in the outlying towns of Invercargill and Oamaru and in many, but not all, small rural centres such as Lawrence, Tokomairiro and Naseby. Similar patterns are seen in data relating to Baptist Sunday schools.

Numbers of boys and girls were almost equal at the Caversham Baptist Sunday School in 1868.\textsuperscript{16}

\textsuperscript{10} Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1897.
\textsuperscript{11} Queenstown Presbyterian Church. Sunday School Attendance Register, 1867-1872 and 1879-1886. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. BR1/1.
\textsuperscript{13} Warepa-Kaithiku Sunday School Register, 1907-1909. Frequent readers among the girls were: Annie and Emily Ayson, Emilie Johnston, Ella and Bessie Mackie, Dolly Munro and Mabel White. The boys were: George Downie, Donald Fletcher, Andrew Mackie and Willie Wilson.
\textsuperscript{14} St Paul's Anglican Church, Dunedin. Vestry Minutes, Sunday School Report, 31 January 1866. Hocken Archives, Dunedin.
\textsuperscript{15} Church of England Diocese of Dunedin Synod Proceedings, 1874. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. PS015 Chu.
\textsuperscript{16} Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 5 June 1868. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. UN 78 5 6.
Likewise, the proportions were in balance on the Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School nominal roll in 1878. By 1887, however, a change had taken place at Hanover Street, with no consistent gender imbalance emerging among the infants but with the main school attendance at least 68 per cent female.\(^{17}\) Girls comprised 135 out of a roll of 240 at the South Dunedin Baptist Church Sunday School in 1887, approximately 56 per cent.\(^{18}\) Among scholars named in the Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School Roll Book from 1881 to 1885, girls outnumbered boys in a ratio of about 3 to 2; the data is, however, doubtful since between a third and a half of the 261 pupils were listed by surname and initial only.\(^{19}\)

Gender ratios in the nominal rolls and among the active attendance of Bible classes in Otago and Southland during the 1880s and 1890s, whether anecdotally or statistically assessed, favoured girls as strongly, in some cases more strongly, than those for junior classes. The Presbyterian Synod's Bible and Church History Class Committee, reporting in 1890, complained that 'except in a few cases the number of young men attending [Bible classes] is lamentably small, frequently not more than a third', an irony in that many Bible classes had been specifically designed to retain male youth in church attendance and had been gender-segregated for this purpose.\(^{20}\) The Committee blamed lack of parental control and a proliferation of secular amusements for the losses in male support. Young women, aged typically between 15 and 25 years, were reported as comprising 56 per cent of an aggregate Presbyterian Bible class nominal enrolment of 2180 in 1893.\(^{21}\) The Presbyterian Synod Report on the State of Religion in 1899 observed that 'the elder girls hold by the Sabbath School until they are able to join the Bible Class or other young people's societies. The number of boys and young men of whom the same can be said is much smaller'.\(^{22}\) Synod resigned itself to the inevitability of some 'leakage' of male support, arising from the mobility of the labour force, and it reiterated the importance of parental role-modelling: '..the tendency on the part of young lads to lapse is not great in the case of those whose parents are exemplary', a pious hope at a time when

---

17 Dunedin City Baptist Church. Hanover Street Baptist Church Sunday School Roll Book.
19 Linden Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Dunedin. Roll Book, 1881-1885. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. 91-144 1529 Box 42.
20 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1890, Appendix, Report of the Bible and Church History Class Committee, p.49.
21 Ibid., 1893, Appendix, Report of the Committee on Bible Classes, p.65.
adult male support for the church was being eroded. Case studies of individual classes in several instances confirm and highlight the trends shown in the aggregate data. Girls outnumbered boys by 27 to 20 at the Port Chalmers Congregational Bible Class in 1886.\(^{23}\) The nominal roll of 148 at the Knox Presbyterian Church Bible Class, Dunedin, was 61 per cent female in 1891, and 59 per cent female in 1893. Superintendent E. Cameron, reporting on behalf of the Main Sunday School to Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church in the same year, described as 'pitiable' the propensity of boys to 'leave the school as a rule at an earlier age than the girls' and then to 'drift away from all church connection or take only a languid interest in Divine things.'\(^{24}\)

Among the Christian Endeavour groups, which flourished in Otago and Southland during the 1890s, the gender balance was upset to the point where young women took on executive roles in uncharacteristically large numbers. Endeavour societies constituted, for Otago, the field of youth work where the 'higher life' movement made its greatest impact, and young women were attracted by the strongly devotional element in Endeavour programmes. Only nine of the thirty Endeavour society committee members were men at the Mosgiel Baptist Church during 1895, with young women filling five of the six main executive positions, excluding that of president which the Reverend F.W. Boreham held ex officio.\(^{25}\) In the same year at the Presbyterian First Church, Dunedin, three out of four senior executive roles on the committee of the Christian Endeavour society were filled by males, but women outnumbered men by two to one in the body of the committee, and Misses M. Sinclair and B. Gillies breached the male monopoly of power in successive years by acting as correspondence secretary.\(^{26}\) These young women were also Sunday school teachers, in the Main Church and Roslyn schools respectively. Both the correspondence secretary and treasurer's positions fell to women on the 1897 committee, with Miss B. Brydone taking the former role and Miss M.D. Dickson the latter. Again, the two women were also Sunday school teachers.\(^{27}\) Female leadership was even more likely in small rural Endeavour ventures with, for example, Sister L. McKinnon taking the chair at the Knapdale Christian Endeavour Society

\(^{23}\) W M Grant, Journal, 21 December 1886. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. M1 951 C-E.

\(^{24}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Record of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 11 October 1893.


\(^{26}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Reports of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1895 and 1896.
meeting on 13 September 1896, Sister Mary Wilson on 3 January 1897, Sister Nellie Peter on 1 August 1897, a visitor from Dunedin, Miss Black, on 16 January 1898, and a visitor from the Chatton Road Society, Miss Macdonald, on 20 November 1898.

Gender ratios among the Sunday schools' staff followed patterns of feminisation similar to those seen among the Christian Endeavour groups. The Presbyterian Christian Outlook commented in 1894: 'It will be found that the membership of the church, its office bearers, and its best workers, come up out of those who have passed through the ranks of the Sunday school'. Otago and Southland's churches drew their workers and recruited their Sunday school staff from an increasingly feminised pool, in a circularity of cause and effect. The Committee on the State of Religion for the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod, reporting on the results of a survey which it conducted in 1891, found some respondents 'very desponding' over male recruitment. Many girls, on the other hand, were becoming committed church members and 'hearty workers in all departments of the Church's work'. Survey and census data confirm the Committee's fears in relation to Sabbath school staffing.

Table 25: Otago and Southland Presbyterian Sabbath School Staffing, 1872-1901

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>No of Teachers</th>
<th>% Male</th>
<th>% Male in Provincial Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1872</td>
<td>374</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>536</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>842</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>1,155</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>1,317</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>1,493</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>1,331</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1872-1901. Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1872-1901.

27 Ibid., 1897.
28 Knapdale Christian Endeavour Society Minutes, 13 September 1896, 3 January 1897, 1 August 1897, 16 January 1898, 20 November 1898. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. AN 2/1.
The proportion of male teachers in Presbyterian Sabbath schools through the last three decades of the nineteenth century was consistently below the proportion of men in the provincial population as a whole and the gap grew progressively wider, from 6 percentage points in 1878 to 13 percentage points in 1896. The shift towards feminisation in Presbyterian Sabbath school staffing between 1872 and 1901 proceeded further and faster than the growth of female numbers in the general population. The proportions of boys and girls of school age remained roughly in balance in Otago and Southland throughout this period so, despite the youth of many of the Sunday school teachers, feminisation did not represent a demographic quirk of their age band. It was not a function of nominal church adherence which, for Presbyterians, remained over 58 per cent male throughout the 1890s.

As the churches paid increasing attention to childhood conversion, male church leaders saw women with their perceived moral sensibility as the preferred teachers for infant classes, but the predominance of women among the ranks of Sunday school teachers reached beyond the infant room. Even at Dunedin's Presbyterian First Church where there was a relatively vigorous male presence among the Sabbath school teachers, 43 out of 71 teachers at the First Church's Main, Russell Street and Roslyn Schools in the year 1888 were women, a proportion of rather over 60 per cent. Of these 29 had risen as scholars through the school's own feminised ranks. The ratio of female teachers remained fairly consistent at the First Church Schools through to the turn of the century. The staff was 56 per cent female in 1895, 54 per cent in 1896 and 1899, 66 per cent in 1897 and 55 per cent in 1900. In small rural schools, gender imbalance on the staff could be yet more striking. At Queenstown Presbyterian Sabbath School, in 1897, female staff outnumbered male by four to one. Although the Queenstown classes were gender-grouped, male teachers had become so scarce that only the oldest boys' classes were taught by men. About half of the Queenstown teachers in the 1890s can be identified as having themselves grown up through the school.

---

31 See Chapter 4. The proportion of boys among the population of Otago and Southland in the 5-15 age range remained at 50-51 per cent throughout the period 1851-1901.
32 See, for example, Church of England Diocese of Dunedin Synod Proceedings. Annual Report of the St Paul's Sunday School, 1888. Miss Yorston, responsible for the overall supervision of the school's infant class of 80, was cited as someone with a special aptitude 'for this difficult branch of Sunday school work'.
33 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of the Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 16 October 1888.
34 Queenstown Presbyterian Church. Sunday School Attendance Register, 1892-1897. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin. BR 1/1.
In many places the shortage of suitably experienced men put pressure on Presbyterianism's traditional assumptions about male role modelling and male office holding. Speaking in 1880 at the Raikes centennial celebrations the Dunedin Normal School principal, W.S. Fitzgerald, took it for granted that Sabbath school superintendents would be male, and it remained the norm for Presbyterian Sunday school executive appointments to be men.\(^{35}\) Ordinary committee membership and actual meeting attendance, on the other hand, became feminised while, in the classroom, young women stood in as relievers for absent males. The Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod's Sabbath Schools' Committee complained, as early as 1873, not only that male teachers were scarce but also that they were 'too young and too inexperienced' for responsibility.\(^{36}\) The annual general meeting of the Otago Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School Teachers' Association, in 1886, noted the irregular attendance at class of 'gentlemen teachers' who had 'not upheld the hands of the superintendent as they might have done'.\(^{37}\) The superintendent of the First Church Main Sabbath School reported, in 1901, that he was 'much indebted to the members of the young women's [Bible] class, nearly all of whom [were] willing to assist with the junior classes on short notice'.\(^{38}\) At Sabbath schools associated with Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, the pool of female relieving teachers outnumbered male by four or five to one in 1889, with a 2:1 female imbalance among the regular staff. Female leadership became a condition of survival for some Presbyterian Sunday schools servicing isolated outposts. At Mount Cargill, for example, Miss Moir proved herself until her marriage 'a perfect Phoebe' in maintaining Sunday school services and offering hospitality.\(^{39}\)

Other Protestant Sunday schools, whether Anglican or of smaller denominations, reflected patterns of feminisation in staff even more accentuated than those among Presbyterians, perhaps because, unlike the usage of Presbyterianism, they did not necessarily expect a woman to cease Sabbath school work after marriage. The proportion of women among Anglican Sunday school teachers in

\(^{35}\) W.S Fitzgerald. 'Address to the Raikes Centenary Convention', in Supplement of the New Zealand Christian Record (Dunedin), 3 December 1880, p.3. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

\(^{36}\) Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1873, Appendix, Report of the Committee on Sabbath Schools, p.22.

\(^{37}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Records of the Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings, 24 February 1886.

\(^{38}\) Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, Report on the Church Sunday School, 1901.

\(^{39}\) Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1891.
Otago and Southland increased from 61 to 71 per cent between 1873 and 1892, touching 72 per cent in 1888 and 75 per cent in 1891.\textsuperscript{40} Holy Trinity, Port Chalmers, had one male teacher out of a staff of ten at its Sunday school in 1886, with two out of eleven in the same year at St John's, Milton. A mere five out of twenty-five Sunday school staff at St Paul's Cathedral, Dunedin, in 1888 were men; of the rest, one was a married woman and the remaining nineteen were single women. Classes were gender-segregated, meaning that seven of the twelve all-boy classes had to be taught by women.\textsuperscript{41} Matilda Lo Keong, a Chinese Christian and trusted ex-scholar, was put in charge of the morning Sunday school in 1891.\textsuperscript{42} Among the Otago Baptist community, four out of thirteen Sunday school teachers active at Caversham in 1868 were men, three were married women and six were spinsters.\textsuperscript{43} The gender balance of staff at South Dunedin Baptist Sunday School underwent a mirror reversal, from a 71 per cent male weighting in 1875 to the exact obverse by 1890.\textsuperscript{44}

Admittedly some, but not all, of the work undertaken through the Sunday schools by female teachers was gender-stereotyped. Men were happy to leave to the women folk the routine catering that sustained the Sunday schools' social life. The schools trained their girls in the role of 'colonial helpmeet'. Across all denominations, whenever a social event needed food, the ladies of the church were asked to organise and provide, with the women and girls of the Sunday schools in the van of the labour force. It was assumed at the North Dunedin Presbyterian Church that the kitchen and table were female domains. Women on the staff of the Otago Presbyterian First Church Sabbath School catered for the school's midwinter socials and summer treats. At social events at St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill, men arranged the entertainment and women the food.\textsuperscript{45} Female teachers catered for the Wakatipu Anglican Sunday School picnics.\textsuperscript{46} At St John's Anglican Church, Roslyn, in 1887 young ladies recruited from the Sunday school put together a farewell tea for the

\textsuperscript{40} Church of England Diocese of Dunedin Synod Proceedings, 1873-1892.
\textsuperscript{41} Ibid., 1888.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid., Report of the Saint Paul's Sunday School, 1891.
\textsuperscript{43} Caversham Baptist Church. Sunday School Minutes, 1868.
\textsuperscript{44} South Dunedin Baptist Church. Minute Book, 1875-1894.
\textsuperscript{45} St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill. Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings, 31 May 1884. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.
\textsuperscript{46} Wakatipu Parochial District Anglican Church Archives. Clipping from the Lake Wakatipu Mail, 8 January 1886. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 166 1043.
curate, the Reverend F. Watson. St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, less typically had two men and two women on the catering committee for its Sunday school picnic in the summer of 1893-1894, Messrs Burn and Patterson and Misses Black and McNaughton.

Women's domestic and catering experience spilled readily into fund-raising activity, and fund-raising spiralled into control of the welfare or mission organization which the fund-raising was designed to support. Conservative opinion, among women themselves, put limits on the level of female responsibility. Six out of eight members of the executive of the Young Women's Guild, formed at the Otago Presbyterian First Church in April 1888 as a junior partner to the Ladies' Association, were Sunday school teachers. Within weeks of its founding, the Guild resolved 'for the present ... to confine its operations to the furnishing of a stall: the forthcoming bazaar'. The young women in this instance knew and accepted their stereotypical role. It was the sort of role mapped out for girls by British mentor Phillis Browne, in her publication *What Girls Can Do: A Book for Mothers and Daughters*; at least one copy of this work reached contemporary Otago as a Sunday school prize. The book highlighted charity work together with Sunday school teaching as fit areas of aspiration for the young woman, devoting full chapters to each. A girl should learn to 'knit and read at the same time', stockings and gloves always being acceptable gifts to the poor. She should also learn to make 'coarse aprons with bibs for women who go out charring'. Articles so made should not be given away since that undermined the recipient's self-respect. They should be sold at half market price or at material cost only. The thoughtful girl should also learn to make food for the poor, especially soup. 'A pint of soup with plenty of sippets will supply an average meal for one child ... The sippets can well be made of stale bread and crusts that are left from the table'. Bones, ox-cheek, cow heel or lentils, pease and haricot beans were to provide the protein base of the soup. The advice was efficiently thrifty and was supplemented with thoughts on home-visiting, which Phillis Browne felt was a task beyond the capacity of the typical young woman.

---

47 St John's Anglican Church, Roslyn, Dunedin. Vestry and Parishioners Meetings: Fair Minutes, 12 December 1887. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 142 1.1.
48 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Bible School Cabinet Minutes, 1 November 1893.
In this judgment Browne acknowledged that hers was a dissentient voice. Capable young women both in Britain and New Zealand were looking for wider opportunities for responsibility, as well as for a reciprocal measure of gender equity in the drudgery of service. The romanticised bedside scene shown in Illustration 13 is taken from another contemporary British source. It depicts a young
woman visitor comforting a female invalid. For all her apparent diffidence and inexperience, the young visitor is evidently taking charge of a desperate situation. The bedroom is squalid. The patient, having been fed with cup and spoon, lies exhausted with hands clasped in prayer. The young visitor, suitably modest regarding her own pastoral talents, has sought support in reading. Now, emboldened by pity, she lifts her eyes to heaven in direct appeal, finding in the immediacy and masculinity of Christ all the support she needs. Contemporary female voices in Otago called for a better equalization of philanthropic effort between the genders. When the North Dunedin Presbyterian congregation, in 1891, planned a bazaar to fund the building of a new hall, the provisioning and staffing of the stalls was left almost entirely to the church's women. The Sabbath school girls were diverted from sewing for the mission field to making articles for domestic sale. It irked 'Aunt Sally' of the 'North Dunedin Monthly' that the boys of the congregation did so little relatively towards supporting the venture, leading her to suggest that ornamental basket work using materials gathered from the local bush, or the carving of walking sticks made from local timber, should not be beyond the lads' creative capacity; for the normally conservative Aunt Sally, evidently, it was time to question the stereotype of 'women's work'.

Not simply women but, significantly, young women of the Sunday schools in Otago and Southland moved confidently beyond Phillis Browne's restrictive advice. Pastoral provision and pastoral initiative could not conveniently be separated, and young women found a measure of self-respect and fulfilment in taking initiatives. The Otago Presbyterian First Church Young Women's Guild, having completed their bazaar project, met weekly in 1889 and 'relieved the more pressing wants of such poor and deserving persons as were brought under their notice'; seemingly a person or persons unnamed, presumably older and more experienced, vetted and recommended suitable candidates for the Guild's philanthropy. The following year Guild members were proactive in outreach. They collected 'for the heathen missions' and, domestically, they conducted weekly sewing meetings at which girls were taught to make their own clothes; reportedly 'not a little good has resulted from this effort to foster habits of thrift and industry among the young women of the

52 'North Dunedin Monthly', Vol 1, No 6, October 1891, pp.18-19. Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin. 3P6.N.
Feeding the Lambs. Two Sunday school teachers, Miss Dow who was a self-employed dressmaker with her own business in George Street, Dunedin, and Miss Ewing, were the driving force behind this class. It operated in two sections the following year, one section for girls aged 10 to 13, with a roll of 44, and one for girls over the age of 14, with a roll of 20.54 A cookery class with parallel aims was launched in 1892.

Another large sewing class, sophisticated and efficient in its organization, was running at Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, in the winter of 1891, supervised by a Miss Smith with a band of female helpers associated with Mr R. Chisholm's Bible class. With a nominal roll of 87, it had an average weekly attendance of 60. The average age of those attending was eleven years, with the minimum age for entry being set at seven. In an initiative designed to reach back from the child to the parent, mothers were invited to join the class 'if they could thereby gain any information'. Children participating promised to attend regularly, with clean faces and hands. Sessions opened with a hymn and prayer. Tidiness, good behaviour and sound work were insisted on. Fabric was donated by the Mosgiel Woollen Company and Messrs Ross and Glendining. Tuition in sewing, patching and darning was provided free, together with needles, thimbles and thread purchased with money donated through subscriptions and through a special collection among the Bible class. Old clothes could be brought to class for mending. New garments were distributed to the makers every two months, with a total of 250 items being completed during the year.55 Children bought the articles they had made on a cost recovery basis, but were given them free if the family was too poor to purchase; Miss Smith and her band of helpers took charge of their own pastoral decision-making. The group evidently survived over a period of years under Miss Smith's tutelage, maintaining its connection with Mr Chisholm's Bible Class. A report in the autumn of 1895 named Miss Smith as still leading the class, which built up a roll of 104 during the following winter with an average attendance of 75.56

54 Ibid., 1890.
'Dorcas societies', named after the Biblical Dorcas who 'filled her days with acts of kindness and charity', encompassed domestic philanthropy and foreign mission. These societies, female but not necessarily for children, nevertheless proliferated internationally among the Sunday schools of all denominations during this period, the Sunday schools of Otago and Southland included. The British example of a hypothetical Dorcas class depicted in Illustration 14 on page 282 appears to show the drawing room of a married couple. It is a substantial room, but the voluminous drapes which frame the picture hint at the virtues of inconspicuous consumption. Girls of all ages are sewing. The woman of the house gives practical advice, while the man seems to be reading Scriptural texts to groups while they work. Dorcas societies, espousing middle class morality and centred on Sunday schools in Otago and Southland, sewed and knitted for charity, with the impact of the 1880s recession providing the catalyst. Moray Place Congregational Sunday School had a Junior Dorcas Society running a fund-raising sale of work in tandem with the school's winter social as early as 1877. With the Walker Street slum area on their doorstep, St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, launched their Dorcas group at the beginning of 1880. Girls of the St John's Anglican Sunday School, Dunedin, were grouped into a Dorcas society in 1888 to make clothing for needy families. Presbyterian Sabbath school girls in North Dunedin were similarly organised into sewing both for the city's destitute and for the New Hebridean mission. 'Aunt Sally' of the 'North Dunedin Monthly', in 1891, found a Puritan's satisfaction in 'seeing all the bright, happy faces of the girls and seeing their busy fingers. No wonder they looked happy'.

Young women of Otago's Sabbath schools, like many of their kind across the western world, moved beyond the stereotypes of the Dorcas societies, finding in Christian service a heightened self-esteem and 'a sense of place and direction'. Analysis of the dynamics of Christian Endeavour groups, democratic, trans-denominational and increasingly feminised, gives insight into the developing

58 'A working party or Dorcas meeting', from F K Prochaska, Women and Philanthropy in Nineteenth-Century England.
59 Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Deacons, 30 September 1877.
60 St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Deacons' Court Records of St Andrew's Church, Walker Street, 9 February 1880.
62 'North Dunedin Monthly', Vol 1., No. 5, September 1891.
aspirations of young Otago women, aged 15-25, during the later nineteenth century. Endeavour groups excelled in giving young people opportunities to plan and run their own programmes, to the unease of conservative Church elders who sometimes belittled the movement as an outpouring of ephemeral emotionalism, and who feared the loss of control which its autonomy implied; admittedly, in the long run, the more structured programmes of the Bible class movement outlasted Endeavouring, and Bible classes made a more definite pitch for male support through the sports and gymnastic activities which they fostered. Young women in Otago in the 1890s, however, embraced opportunities for self-expression which they found in the Endeavour movement. Group members took one of a range of pledges: active, associate and junior members pledges, and affiliated pledges 'for those no longer young'. Joint participation in the life of the society, without differentiation of gender role, was implicit in the wording of the Endeavourers' active member's pledge. It was the custom at Knapdale for Endeavourers to call each other 'Brother' and 'Sister' after the manner of Friendly Societies. Knapdale young women were prolific in presenting papers at meetings. By way of comparison, at Sunday school teacher preparation classes in Dunedin, women did offer papers on a limited scale, being responsible for rather over a quarter of those read at Presbyterian First Church of Otago in 1885; Flora Allan, Otago University graduate, First Church Sunday school teacher, activist in teacher training and regular contributor at Sunday school teacher meetings, was the intellectual equal or superior of her Sabbath school male colleagues. Christian Endeavouring in a rural environment gave opportunity and confidence for the homely and the humble to participate. Papers presented by young women at Knapdale meetings during the 1896-1897 period included: 'Trifling with Salvation, a call to come to Christ', by Isabella Wilson; 'The Good Samaritan, an "emblem" of Christ', by Maud Wilson; 'The Strait and Narrow Way', by Lizzie Peters; 'God's People as Witnesses', by Hetty Wilson; 'Christ the Doer', by Nellie Peters; 'Lessons from the Life of St Paul', by Lizzie McKinnon; and 'The Good Shepherd', by Jeanie Marshall. Evidently, and expectedly in an isolated rural area,
Illustration 14 'A working party or Dorcas meeting.' from F.K. Prochaska
several of the presenters were blood relatives. Their themes, typically, were Christ-centred, focusing on Christ's love and his sufficiency for all human need; mission topics and monographs on virtue also figured in talks by women. Assiduous in attendance, Knapdale's young women obviously found fulfilment and fellowship in Endeavouring, a fellowship which they extended through their frequent, goodwill visits to neighbouring associations. Catherine McQueen, secretary of the North Chatton group during the same period, often interspersed interpolatory comment in her minute records, reflecting the pleasure which she took in her society's meetings: 'a nice meeting'; 'very good singing'; 'a very nice meeting'; 'the meeting was a splendid one'; 'the speakers were very earnest'.

Larger Endeavour groups in urban centres organised themselves into subcommittees, geared both to self-improvement and to outreach. At the Otago Presbyterian First Church in 1897 George McCracken, Sunday school teacher and deacon, kept a fatherly eye on the affiliated Christian Endeavour Association's proceedings in his capacity as vice-president, with the Reverend J. Gibb as nominal chair, but the association's activities were driven by its women. Office holders in 1897 were: Miss B. Brydone as correspondence secretary; Miss M.D. Dickson as recording secretary and treasurer; Misses Duncan and Omand as conveners of the prayer committee; Miss Smart and Mr Wright as conveners of the look-out committee; Miss Robertson and Mr McArthur, the temperance committee; Misses McCracken and Dickson and Mr Cook, the social and Sunday school committee; Misses Dick and Dickson, the flower and musical committee; Miss M. Peden and Mr Smart, the literature committee. Evidently the choice of officers showed an attempt to maintain gender balance but the following year, 1898, all the committee convenors were young women. Some two-thirds of the Endeavour Association office holders were Sunday school teachers. Girls from the senior Sunday school classes were well represented among the Association's rank-and-file membership. The 1898 executive organised a new 'Sunshine Committee', coordinating hospital visits to patients lacking friends or relatives. They sent flowers to the sick. They held quarterly mission meetings, and their home mission effort spilled over into weekly cottage meetings. They distributed religious periodicals to underfunded rural areas, and arranged a 'gift night' to help the needy. Three years later the Association raised funds for the China Inland Mission, the Canton Village Mission, the I'chang Mission, and to support a native teacher in the New Hebrides. Miss Alice Niven, former secretary and treasurer of the Association, left Dunedin for Melbourne, for missionary training. The

---

72 Presbyterian First Church of Otago, Dunedin. Annual Report of the Session and Deacons' Court, 1897.
group continued to maintain its full range of activities on the domestic front, including quarterly publication of a journal. It sent two delegates to the conference of the Christian Endeavour Union. Its scheduled meetings, reportedly well attended, focused on study of the International Series of Lessons. 73

Young women in Otago and Southland showed an active commitment to academic study in the context of their religion, as well as to the devotional and philanthropic aspects of Christianity. Religious education, whether undertaken in Roman Catholic day schools or Protestant Sunday schools, answered the secularism of the 1877 Education Act by trying to demonstrate rigour in its own procedures. Rising to the challenge, the young women of Otago and Southland's Sunday schools left their male peers behind in both persistence and attainment. Of the 321 candidates who gained awards in the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class examinations, held annually in the region from 1881 to 1892, 200 were young women, 95 were men and the gender of the remaining 26 is unclear because the published examination results identified them by initial only. 74 About a third of the prizewinners came from four particular parishes, Balclutha, Blue Spur, First Church Invercargill and Mornington, a tribute to the enthusiasm and efficiency of a small group of teachers. There is no evidence that geographic distortion affected gender ratios. At Blue Spur, 29 out of 43 successful entrants were women, as were 17 out of 24 at Balclutha, proportions roughly in line with average for the cohort as a whole. Many candidates attempted the examinations severally over a period of years and gained more than one award. Comprising rather more than 60 per cent of all individual prize winners, female entrants won over 70 per cent of all awards gained; in other words more women than men gained awards, and they gained more prizes per head than their male peers. Of 34 candidates winning more than five awards, 26 were female. Women showed more sustained interest in the examinations than their male counterparts did. Of winners in the C and D categories for entrants over the age of 18 years, over 80 per cent were women; contemporary church leaders complained that there were too many secular attractions and stimulants competing for the attention of teenage and young adult males. 75 About a tenth of all the prize winners in the examinations came from five particular families. It is not clear from the data whether these were five households or

73 Ibid., 1901.
74 See Appendix A.
wider kinship groups living in the same geographic area. Among the award winners from these five families the gender imbalance was very marked, with 27 from the total of 31 being female. Sisters perhaps, or groups of cousins living in geographic proximity, fed each other's aspirations.

Although data from the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee gives us the fullest available profile of a late nineteenth century Sunday school examination cohort, other contemporary sources confirm the trend to the feminization of entry and attainment. The Minister's Bible Class at Knox Church, Dunedin, in the spring of 1890, sat internal written and oral examinations on the Shorter Catechism and the Creed. Prizes for 'almost flawless work' went to: Misses C. Bartleman, Jessie Campbell, E.M. Calder. E.L. MacKay, Mary S. Reid, Laura Reid, Sarah I. Ross, Emma M. Thomson, Lena Stewart, Evelyn White and Clara Wilson. Male winners were; George Calder, William A. Durie, David H. Thomson and Thomas Thomson. The eleven successful female entrants outnumbered the males by about three to one. Some three-quarters of them were daughters of church elders or deacons, and about half were present or future Sunday school teachers at Knox. In the St Paul's Anglican Sunday School internal examinations in 1885, eight out of the ten prize winners were girls. They included Emily Siedeberg, who would subsequently become Otago University's first female medical graduate, and Flora Campbell, who would graduate with an MA from Otago University in 1896 before teaching for over thirty years at Otago Girls' High School.

Many young women moved from successful Sunday school scholarship to Sunday school teaching and thence to day school teaching, although for some, of course, an early marriage precluded any career. Feminisation in both areas of teaching proceeded simultaneously and interactively. Misses Rankin and McCarthy left the staff of the St Paul's Anglican Sunday School, Dunedin, in 1887 to take up, respectively, day school teaching positions at Catlin's River and Naseby. Among the Presbyterians Flora Allan, successively pupil, teacher and principal at Otago Girls' High School was for years a pillar of the Dunedin First Church Sabbath School, as was Isabella Duncan, future teacher

---

76 Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin. Quarterly Statements, December 1890.
77 St Paul's Anglican Cathedral, Dunedin. Sunday School Minutes, 2 January 1885. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. AG 147 1002 N1.
78 See Chapter 9.
at Koromiko, during her period of study at Otago University. Of the young women who won awards in the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee competition during the 1880s and 1890s, at least a quarter turned to day school teaching; a relatively smaller proportion of the less numerous, male award winners took up day school work. The following female prize winners entered the Dunedin Training College as teacher trainees between 1894 and 1896: Charlotte and Margaret McGregor of Columba Manse, Oamaru; Agnes and Helen Baird of Winton; Rose Mildred Davey; Catherine Fraser; Marion Frances Early; Marion Loan. Others, for example Katherine MacGregor, combined Sunday school with pupil teacher experience. Some share listing with Flora Allan and Isabella Duncan as being among the earliest women graduates at the University of Otago; Rose Davey attained masters qualifications in 1895, Isabella McLandress in 1890 and Charlotte McGregor in 1899. Marion Steel gained her BA in 1886, Katherine MacGregor in 1894 and Helen Baird in 1899. Many remained to teach in the day schools of their region. Examples of these are Eva Ash of Mornington, Jessie Christie of Dipton, Jane Gellatly of Invercargill and Mary Lea of Winton. Rose Davey worked for a while at Tomahawk. Isabella McLandress returned to teach in Dunedin after a brief spell of service on the West Coast. Helen Birss of Invercargill was elected the first woman president of the Southland branch of the New Zealand Educational Institute in 1914, and the first woman member on the Institute's national executive in 1915. Mary Swap of Otagatau and Martha Burley of Blue Spur, on the other hand, married too young to develop any career. Mary Swap, winner of a merit certificate at junior level in the 1891 examination, married Percy Arthur Acheson, salesman and eventually grocer of Otagatau, in 1898. He was 23 years old and she was 18. Martha Burley, who also gained a merit certificate in the 1891 examination, married William

See, for example, Annual Report of the session and Deacons' Court, Presbyterian First Church of Otago, 1886.
Evidence collated from multiple sources, especially the Supplements to the New Zealand Gazette, John MacKay, Government Printer, Wellington.
Dunedin Training College Students' Register, 1894-1896. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. Dunedin Teachers' College predating 1894 were destroyed in a fire in 1968.
Notes by K C MacGregor, kindly supplied by Dr Dorothy Page, Department of History, University of Otago.
See Chapter 9.
Paganini, a miner of Blue Spur, in November 1893. He was then 22 years old and she was 16.\textsuperscript{88} For some, a teaching career itself became a stepping stone to marriage. Fanny Bethune, daughter of the Reverend Alexander Bethune of Invercargill and conscientious Sunday scholar, won successive awards in the Bible and Church History Class Committee senior examinations during the years 1881-1883 while working as a day-school teacher at the Invercargill Central School.\textsuperscript{89} At the same time she was conducting a postal romance with Frederick John Cato, a young teacher of Australian birth, with whom she had shared a Central School Standard 6 classroom, he teaching the boys at one end of the room and she the girls at the other. Cato had left Invercargill for Victoria in 1881, forsaking teaching for the retail grocery trade. Three years of correspondence followed, sealed with a happy marriage, and migration to Melbourne, in December 1884.\textsuperscript{90}

There were many other parallel instances where, for Otago and Southland's former Sunday school scholars, the path from Sunday School led far afield. Annie Jaggers, formerly of Invercargill, took her teaching skills to Annandale on the Mason River in North Canterbury in 1888. Her sister, Charlotte, taught in South Canterbury. Katherine MacGregor took a position at Westlake Girls' High School until settling in Wellington after her marriage to William Alexander Patterson.\textsuperscript{91} Jane, Mary and Martha, three of the seven talented daughters of a Blue Spur mining couple, Gilbert and Mary Ralston, had interesting careers. Jane topped the intermediate and senior sections of the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee's examinations in 1887 and 1888 respectively, with marks of 96 per cent and 97 percent. Mary achieved first placing as an intermediate entrant in 1889.\textsuperscript{92} Jane also won a medal in the intermediate essay competition in 1887. She wrote under the pseudonym 'Uriel', a choice perhaps revealing of her self-concept. Professor Watt, in his examiner's report for that year, noted of her essay: 'The author, in point of maturity of thinking and command of the pen, is head and shoulders above his (or her) fellow-competitors'.\textsuperscript{93} Martha, born in 1882, was too young to compete before the demise of the Committee's examination scheme. Both Jane and


\textsuperscript{89} See Appendix A.

\textsuperscript{90} J Thomson, (Ed.), p.44.

\textsuperscript{91} Notes by K C MacGregor.

\textsuperscript{92} See Appendix A.

\textsuperscript{93} Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1887, Appendix, Report of the Committee on Bible and Church History Classes for the Year 1887, p.68.
Mary subsequently qualified for day school teaching, Mary gaining a distinction in history at the Dunedin Training College. Neither Jane nor Mary married. Mary remained in the Otago area, teaching at Manuka Creek, Lawrence District High School and Forbury. She died in 1957, aged 84. Jane volunteered in 1901 to serve in South Africa as one of a contingent of female New Zealand teachers working in the territory's concentration camp schools during the Boer War. She never reached the camps, accepting instead a better paid teaching position in Johannesburg, at the cost of foregoing her paid return ticket to Dunedin. It is not known under what circumstances she left South Africa. Eventually, however, she reappeared in New Zealand, rising to a senior rank in the Social Welfare Department and, at one time, being in charge of the industrial school for girls at Caversham, Dunedin. She died in 1956 at the age of 86. Martha, for many years, worked for the Treasury in Wellington. Marriage took the other Ralston girls the length of New Zealand, from Dunedin to Auckland. The fifth daughter, Janet, sometimes called Jessie, worked in a Dunedin library, and is remembered by her son as a voracious reader. The sole survivor of Gilbert and Mary's three sons, James, eventually lived at Takaka, Golden Bay.

Helen Baird made a career switch equally as dramatic as Jane Ralston's. A daughter of the Winton manse, she competed with perseverance and with outstanding success in the Bible and Church History Committee examinations over a six year period, from 1886 to 1892, gaining nine awards including four third and four first placings, a medal in the 1888 essay competition and marks in excess of 90 per cent on two occasions. She was also dux at Southland Girls' High School in 1891. Helen's mother played an important role in the academic success which all the Baird children achieved, personally coaching her young family for scholarships. After entering Dunedin Training College at the age of 19 and grappling with the difficulties of tertiary-level mathematics, Helen Baird graduated with a BA from Otago University and then left New Zealand for five years of medical training in Glasgow. The voyage to Britain, accompanied by one of her sisters, gave Helen the chance to experiment with Anglican worship, flirt with male passengers and sip whisky in the

95 Information kindly supplied by Mrs Noeline Michelle (née Ralston) of Blue Spur, 26 May 1998.
96 See Appendix A.
captain's cabin. That well-bred girls should be considering a medical career caused no little surprise among shipboard society. On her return to Invercargill, as the first woman doctor in Southland, Helen Baird married a fellow practitioner, James Cowie. For many years they ran a shared practice at Masterton in the Wairarapa, covering the area by bicycle and motor cycle until James' death and the outbreak of World War II left Dr Helen, for a while, as the practice's sole incumbent, prior to her son's return from military service overseas and her own retirement.98

Another career option, often devolving from a background of Sunday school and day school teaching, and attractive to some women because of its blend of adventure with Christian service, unconventionality with respectability, was overseas mission work. Of some 4000 Christian missionaries in China in 1910, 2300 were women.99 Sunday schooling, through its wide publicising of and fund-raising for missionary activity, and through the opportunities which it afforded for female self-expression, encouraged this trend.100 Missionary activity could be any or all of a duty, an opportunity and a proto-feminist sublimation. Charged with a message of salvation yet denied speaking rights in most domestic pulpits, the intelligent and determined woman could compensate abroad. Mrs T.S. Gladding, writing in the 'Presbyterian Women's Missionary Union Harvest Field' to explain the appeal of mission work to young women, spoke of their interest in 'sociological questions', in questions of 'national regeneration', and of their concern for the 'intellectual awakening' of their sex. She saw the contemporary girl as having 'a very high sense of the tremendous value of her individual life'.101 Miss Small, also writing in the August 1910 issue of the 'Harvest Field', noted with satisfaction the equality of status enjoyed by female and male missionaries. Miss Jane Mawson, writing in the same 'Harvest Field' issue, saw New Zealand female missionaries as role models of emancipation for their less fortunate Asiatic sisters.102

Among Otago and Southland Christian denominations, the Baptists were in the van of promoting female overseas mission work. Rosalie MacGeorge was the first female missioner to be sent overseas.

98 Dr Graham Cowie, private correspondence, information kindly provided by Dr Dorothy Page.
99 'Presbyterian Women's Missionary Union Harvest Field' (Christchurch), No 25, October 1910. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.
100 See Chapter 8.
101 T S Gladding, 'The Appeal of Mission to Young Women', in 'Presbyterian Women's Missionary Union Harvest Field' (Christchurch), No 24, August 1910.
from the Hanover Street congregation in Dunedin. She was born in Melbourne in 1859 but, as a child, migrated with her family to New Zealand. She was baptised in 1873 and taught in the Hanover Street Sunday School. She then trained as a day school teacher and took a position at Portobello. The New Zealand Baptist Missionary Society, formed in October 1885 at the Fourth Annual Baptist Conference, held in Dunedin, sought to recruit women for 'zenana' work among Hindu married women and children. The Reverend Alfred North of Hanover Street supported the call, arguing that 'if the women of India are to brought to [Christ's] feet, it must be by the agency of women ... Our hearts are touched by the misery of these women. We long to see them uplifted in the social scale, set where women should be, by the side of men'. Encouraged by North, a Miss Fulton considered training then thought better of it, but not before she in turn had engaged the interest of Miss MacGeorge, who was farewelled in September 1886. In Bengal Rosalie soon learned the lesson, painfully mastered by early Anglican missionaries in New Zealand, that fluency in the vernacular was a key to success. She went further, identifying with the local culture, wearing Muslim dress over her usual clothing and refusing her salary lest income set her apart from the local people. She supported herself by teaching English to two Bengali families, one Hindu and one Muslim, in return for board. She corresponded copiously with New Zealand through the Baptist and Missionary Messenger until, after five years, failing health forced her from her work. She died at Colombo, Ceylon, at the age of 31, during her homeward journey. Her sacrifice lent lustre to the mission cause, particularly in the eyes of young women, raising its profile through Sunday school and Christian Endeavour groups, and encouraging prayer and sponsorship for individual missionaries. August 1898 saw the women of the Mosgiel Baptist Christian Endeavour group preparing for a 'monster missionary meeting'; a large fabric banner was made, with the name of 'our missionary, Miss Beckingsale', highlighted in letters cut from wadding. Other young women from the Hanover Street Baptist Bible Class followed the overseas missionary call, especially from among those who had ventured into domestic mission work among Dunedin's Chinese community. From this group, Miss Ingleby left for India in 1901, and another eight, almost exclusively female, were working in

102 J Mawson, 'Women's Work for Women in South China', in 'Presbyterian Women's Missionary Union Harvest Field' (Christchurch), No 24, August 1910.
103 B Jones, 'Introducing Rosalie McGeorge', in Encourage, Vol 9, No 4, September-October 1995, Hanover Street Baptist Church, Dunedin.
105 See Chapter 7.
India or China by 1913. Meanwhile the Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin, sent Miss Jean Begg to Samoa in 1911 and Miss Maud Ridley to Amoy in 1912.

Presbyterian women from New Zealand were first involved in overseas missionary work as the wives of male missioners. They sewed western-style clothing and taught English to Kanaks in the New Hebrides in a programme of unconscious cultural assimilation. Within New Zealand female Presbyterian volunteers bagged and sold arrowroot, literally by the ton, to finance South Pacific missionary outreach. Thomas Burns’ daughter Jane Bannerman, in 1892, launched the Ladies’ Mission Aid Association, a body concerned particularly with the education of the children of expatriate mission families. Shortage of male labour increasingly feminised the Presbyterian system of mission support. Publicity through the Presbyterian Sabbath schools, although targeted particularly at boys, often drew a female response. Jane Mawson and her elder brothers, William and David, were three of eleven children of a Port Chalmers bootmaker and pioneer smallholder. Both the boys were prize winners in the Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee examination scheme. David was a future mayor of Milton. William, an Otago University biology graduate, was influenced by the example of the Reverend Alexander Don towards holy orders and mission work, eventually becoming secretary of the Auckland Presbyterian Chinese Mission. Jane trained as a Presbyterian deaconess before matching her brother, William, with nineteen years of service on the Chinese mission field. A married retirement then took her to America. Rose Mildred Davey was another young woman who moved from a Sunday school background, through day school teaching, to mission work in the domestic field as a deaconess, and then overseas to India. She eventually returned to Anderson’s Bay where she married Percival Haxton Matthews, a widower and travelling salesman, on 11 September 1919, when he was 46 years old and she was

---

110 See Appendix A.
111 Thomson, p.335.
112 Material collated from Bible and Church History Class Committee, Dunedin Training College and Otago Education Board records.
Matthews' previous marriage, to Ellen Pryor, had lasted only a year with the untimely death of his young wife in 1908. Other young Presbyterian women, like Rose Davey graduates of Otago University, who undertook overseas mission work included Maggie Gordon, Emilia Moore, and Isabella MacKellar who worked in Argentina and Peru. From Oamaru, Helen MacGregor proceeded from Sabbath school to day school teaching, and eventually to educational mission work in Madras.

For some churches, allowing women an active leadership role in the domestic mission field was more problematic than sending them overseas. Sunday school work and overseas mission service were the first open opportunities which most churches allowed their women folk. The employment of deaconesses in youth counselling and domestic welfare work was a logical outcome of the high profile of women in the Sunday schools, where they were already actively involved in home visiting. The issue of female leadership had never been difficult for the Salvation Army. The advertisement for its opening 'attack' on Invercargill in 1883 highlighted the role of 'Mrs Burfoot' and an unnamed 'Hallelujah Lass'. Reportedly a Salvation Army Captain in Queenstown, a tall, red-haired woman, won instant respect by knocking an abusive larrikin unconscious during a street altercation. Trinity Methodist Church, Dunedin, brought Sister Olive, a deaconess from Australia, to work in the city during the 1880s. Despite the liberalism of the Reverend Alfred North at Hanover Street, the notion of female leadership was a controversial novelty among the sister Baptist community at South Dunedin in the 1890s, and the church moved cautiously. A South Dunedin Baptist Sunday school minute of March 1893, referring to female speaking rights, recommended that 'as this matter depended on the teaching of Scripture, we devote the evening of the 23rd to the study of the subject

113 'Otago and Part Southland Presbyterian Marriages at Hewitson Library: Index to Brides and Grooms, 1848-1920', Vol 1, A-L.
114 Information supplied by Dr Dorothy Page.
115 Information supplied by Dr Dorothy Page.
in the Bible to learn the word of God'.\footnote{118} Always a creative innovator and a long-standing advocate of youth work, the Reverend Rutherford Waddell at St Andrew's, Dunedin, pushed Otago's Presbyterians into widening the opportunities for women to serve in the church. At his initiative Miss Christabel Duncan, a student of the Presbyterian Deaconess' Institute in Melbourne, was appointed to St Andrew's on a twelve month trial basis in 1900, as a 'trained Sister to work chiefly among the young'.\footnote{119} The experiment proved so successful that both Dunedin's First Church and Knox Church followed suit the following year, with the respective appointments of Miss Evelyn Macadam, a Middlemarch schoolmistress, and Sister Mary McQueen. Otago's Presbyterians opened their own training facility for deaconesses in June 1903.

The feminisation of church activity in western societies in the later nineteenth century changed the way the gospel was mediated to young people. Sunday schools in the western world, including in its outposts of Otago and Southland, were an interactive part of this process. Female Sunday school teachers were ahead of men in moving away from a catechetical approach to teaching and, in departing from catechetical practice, they moved away from a legalistic gospel.\footnote{120} Whether deliberately or unconsciously, they were at the forefront of modifying both a Calvinistic theology and a directive pedagogy. Women in the later nineteenth century, whether or not they initiated the process, found themselves at the cutting edge of the churches' quest for childhood conversions in the infant and junior classes of the Sunday schools. They centred their teaching on the personality of Christ, on his universally available, all-inclusive love and on the sufficiency of the power of his Spirit to help the believer live a fulfilled and moral life. They promoted a personalised, devotional rather than contractual religious experience. They wrote papers on these themes to encourage each other, and delivered them during Christian Endeavour and Sunday school preparation meetings. They jotted poems and contributed to magazines to the same effect. They popularised their perceptions in the hymns which their contemporaries wrote and which they had their Sunday school classes sing, hymns which further exemplified the international nature of the process of which Otago and Southland Sunday schooling formed part. With Frances Ridley Havergal, they sang:

\begin{quote}
Take my life, and let it be
\end{quote}
Consecrated, Lord, to thee,

and they reaffirmed the individuality and immediacy of their faith:

I am trusting Thee, Lord Jesus,

Trusting only thee.

Of the 'three hundred choice selections' in E.H. Loehr's Paramount Sunday School Recitations, a contemporary American publication already noted as being used in New Zealand, well over half were written by women.\textsuperscript{121} Themes within the edited collection self-selected their gender-grouping. Patriotic songs tended to be by male authors while songs to be sung at religious rallies were often by women. Harvest songs were written mainly by men. Moralistic poems and temperance hymns were largely, and mission hymns almost exclusively, by women. Approaches to the celebration of Easter suggested a different style between the genders. Charles Crandall welcomed the 'million, million emerald spears' of Easter morning, while Mary Lowe Dickinson, in 'eager groping', stretched 'frail, trembling hands' towards the empty tomb. Benjamin Schmolke welcomed the 'Victor in the strife', while Flora Hazeltan Bailey and Alice E. Ellen heard the Christ of 'peace and love' in the notes of the 'sweet Easter bells'.

Jane Bannerman, wistful that her church underplayed the contribution of its womenfolk, conscious of her own mother's sacrifices and conscious, no doubt, of the influence of women at the margins of western Christian development, commented: 'I have often thought that there might be more written on the women of the Disruption than has been done'.\textsuperscript{122} She sensed an inadequacy in the evolving mythology of the Otago settlement. It was the Sunday schools of the region which began to redress the imbalance of recognition to which Jane Bannerman alluded. In many ways nineteenth century Sunday schools reflected and reinforced the gender stereotypes of their day, but they did more than that. Just as the British working classes took control of the Raikesian school and adapted it to their own agenda, so, to some extent, did the young women of Otago adapt the colonial school.

\textsuperscript{120} See Chapters 4, 8 and 9.
For young women of Otago and Southland in many churches, the Sunday school was their first opportunity for active, formative contribution to the life of the church. They contributed abundantly, modifying the curricular and pedagogical emphases of the schools and thence, ultimately, the ethos of the parent churches. Regular and continuous attendees, more assiduous than men in supporting the schools and their derivative activities at the older age levels, many young women of the region found companionship in their Sunday schools, and the sense of solidarity which companionship brings. Some found an intellectual extension and enrichment, enlarging what the day school provided, and possibly providing an enhanced foundation for future tertiary study. For some, examination success through the Sunday schools offered status and self-assurance. Invercargill’s Fanny Bethune, telling her fiancé of the happy outcome of her entry in the 1882 Presbyterian Bible and Church History Class Committee examinations, commented 'It was rather a stiff paper, and I did not expect to get anything; but contrary to my expectations, I have come out second best in the Senior Section, and of course I am delighted. Are you not too?'¹²³ Many young women came to believe that they were special to an Almighty yet loving God, who had a purpose for their lives and who empowered them to fulfill it. This realization sent some to the backblocks, whether of New Zealand or of China, as educators, nurses and missionaries. Others it sent some no further than marriage and the domestic hearth, where their influence was no less powerful. Deborah Valenze has shown, in the context of the Wesleyan revival in Britain, how cottage meetings enhanced the religious influence of women; the hearth was the woman’s domain, the natural area for expression of her sensibility and perceived superiority of moral refinement.¹²⁴ It is from their mothers that most children learn the earliest syllables of their vernacular. The statement is equally true both of the linguistic and spiritual vernaculars. The Sunday schools of Otago and Southland in the later nineteenth century wrote the moral and spiritual idiom of the next generation.

Chapter 12  Mustering the Conclusions

Sunday schooling was a significant influence in the lives of a majority of the children in Otago and Southland in the second half of the nineteenth century, as it was in other parts of New Zealand and in other English-speaking countries. The fact that the story of Sunday schooling has, until recently, attracted little analysis and comment among New Zealand historians tells us more about the preconceptions of twentieth century scholarship than about the realities of a nineteenth century Weltanschauung. Post-World War II societies that turned their backs on Sunday schooling assumed that the nineteenth century was similarly impervious to the schools' influence in anything more than a cosmetic sense; it is time for modern New Zealand society to acknowledge its religious as well as its economic roots. The Sunday schools had been conceived from the earliest days of colonisation in Otago as having an essential role in the socialization of a Christian society. Their high degree of autonomy and spontaneity squared well with a Chalmersian, liberal faith in the efficacious outworking of natural forces in the life of the individual. Spanning the gap between a predominantly, but not exclusively, Scottish heritage and a pioneer frontier, they proved themselves serviceable and cost-effective instruments for meeting spiritual and community needs in a developing colony. Commonly critical of their own performance, the schools nevertheless drew the goodwill of migrant parents, were attended by the colony's children and were popular with the scholars, especially with girls. The Sunday school movement was an agency of socialization in its broadest sense, the transmitter of a mythology that was both integrative and adaptive, able to reinterpret Covenanting myths to a youthful, and increasingly feminized, army, able to translate catechism into gospel and reconceptualize the abstraction of the Spirit in terms of the humanity of Jesus. It can be argued that the Sunday schools were more important than adult church congregations as an influence on the religious life of the settlement. Educationally the Sabbath schools both mirrored and reacted to trends and events in the development of public day schooling. They actually came to lead and shape day school practice in important aspects of pedagogy. Socially the Sunday schools played a crucial role in defining the values and self-concept of the first and second generation native-born settlers of the region.

By the end of the nineteenth century, three-quarters of all school-age children in Otago and Southland, and four-fifths of those actually on day school rolls, were nominally enrolled in the Sunday schools of the several Protestant denominations. The proportions had risen steadily over the previous three decades, with over a half of all school-age children enrolled in the Sunday schools
during the 1870s, and two-thirds or more during the 1880s. Between 40 and 50 per cent of all Sunday school enrolments in the Otago-Southland region in the later nineteenth century were at Presbyterian Sabbath schools, with other Protestant churches, especially the Wesleyans and Baptists, also playing an important role in youth work, and the Salvation Army making its mark among the children of the working classes. Nominal enrolments at Sunday school included casual entries, and perhaps also cases where children figured simultaneously in the records of more than one school. About three-quarters of the children on the Protestant Sunday schools' nominal rolls, however, constituting about sixty per cent of all children in the region, were regular and consistent weekly attenders at the Sunday schools and maintained their membership over a period of several years, not necessarily at the same school because of demographic mobility. Some of the 25 per cent of Otago and Southland children who figured on no Sunday school roll would have come from practising Catholic homes, and may have attended that church's developing system of denominational day schools; Catholics constituted some twelve per cent of the population of the region during the 1890s. The relatively small number of children in Otago raised without church or Sunday school contact came mainly from the homes of unskilled labour. It seemed to the majority of Otago children who were regular Sunday school attenders that 'everyone went' to Sabbath school. The observation was not literally true, but people act on the basis of perceived, not absolute, truth. The numerous children actively involved in the life of the Sunday schools perceived the schools as a normative influence which both shaped and enlarged their small world.

In the context of a migrant, secular, allegedly atomised society in Otago and Southland, the Sunday school movement succeeded in building up a comprehensive infrastructure, spanning both sophisticated urban and pioneer rural society. Among the Presbyterians of Otago and Southland there were 228 Sabbath schools in operation by 1901: of these, 53 were in the Dunedin Presbytery, 41 in Clutha, 37 in Mataura, 49 in Southland, 22 in Dunstan and 26 in Oamaru.¹ In addition, at least eleven non-denominational Sunday schools operated in affiliation with the Presbyterian Synod, the majority of these being in Southland. Weekly actual attendances among the Presbyterians averaged out at 52 scholars per school, although roll tallies varied hugely between school and school, from several hundred in major urban parishes down to a dozen or so in small rural locations. The 228 Presbyterian schools were serviced by 1331 teachers, at a ratio of about one teacher to every nine

¹ Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1901, Appendix, Report of the Sabbath Schools' Committee, p.25.
scholars. All the staff at the Presbyterian Sabbath schools in 1901 appear to have been either church office holders or church members, and 61 per cent were women. Over half the Presbyterian Sabbath schools in 1901 ran their own lending libraries, with an average of over 200 books in each library. Affiliated to the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod in 1901, there were also 91 Bible classes with 1668 scholars on their rolls and 57 Christian Endeavour Societies with an aggregate membership of 1396; there was a tendency for Presbyterian Bible classes to locate in urban centres, perhaps because two-thirds of them were led by church ministers, while the more self-sufficient Christian Endeavour movement was represented relatively strongly in rural areas. It must be remembered that this Presbyterian array constituted less than half the Sunday school infrastructure operating in Otago and Southland by the turn of the century. Protestant schools across the denominations had developed a network stretching from the Wesleyan cradle rolls to the Bible study groups of young adulthood, and embracing a range of peripheral groups catering for specific purposes, the Christian Bands for young converts and aspiring church members, the Bands of Hope for temperance outreach, and a host of literary and sporting facilities. A minority of the schools were active members of the interdenominational Otago Sunday School Union. The Catholic Church was equally assiduous in its youth outreach. It is ignored in this study, not because it was unimportant, but precisely because the comprehensiveness of its educational work deserves exclusive treatment.

This impressive infrastructure was not constructed by any one agency to any unified plan. Its development was implemented through the actions of many individuals and groups, both clerical and lay, denominational and ecumenical. The pervasive spontaneity of Sunday schooling in Otago and Southland could be construed as a weakness, a recipe for randomness, but it also indicates a remarkable consensus of purpose among the pioneer population. The infrastructure of Otago Sunday schooling exhibited many self-consistent features because it was shaped by the migrants' collective memories of home practice. Moreover Sunday school leaders and teachers in Otago and Southland showed themselves keen to keep abreast of contemporary trends in Sunday schooling, drawing heavily on material available through the London Sunday School Union. For all their geographic isolation, perhaps in reaction to it, and too small to develop their own teaching resources, the Otago schools dipped eagerly into the international pool, with the International Series of Lessons becoming a cornerstone of much Sunday school and Bible class work by 1890, and with the Sunday School Union recommendations regarding constitutions becoming the paradigm for much Otago structural planning. To a lesser but significant extent, the Otago schools followed American models, and they interacted freely with Australia both as regards ideas and personnel.
Anne M. Boylan's *Sunday School: The Formation of an American Institution* suggests numerous parallels of Sunday school development across a trans-Pacific stage. American Sunday schooling was launched at Philadelphia in 1791, among the ecumenical First Day Society. It was spurred by the conviction that the young must be fittingly socialised into the life of the emerging Republic, a 'godly experiment' on an earlier, larger stage. It was predicated on the post-millennial premises of the Enlightenment, that human rationality can be fostered in the cause of progress. Initially operated by professional managers who hired the teaching staff, the American Sunday schools changed during the nineteenth century to become more denominationally focused and more overtly evangelical in ethos. They adapted to the disparate needs of urban growth and of the pioneer frontier. Amateur teachers, predominantly women, supplanted paid management, gearing their message to childhood conversion. Serving their commonly observed role as the voice of the dispossessed, American Sunday schools became especially important forums for black communities in the southern states. Sated with success, the schools then reabsorbed the children of the middle classes into their newly achieved respectability. Evangelical outreach to the young, an unpaid and increasingly feminised workforce and an ethos of upward social mobility were all features which the Sunday schools of Otago and Southland shared with their American cousins.

The numerous parallels in the story of Sunday school development in Britain, America, Australia or New Zealand, far from implying rigidity, indicate a heritage of flexibility. G.A. Phillipson, in his 'Thirteenth Apostle', discusses colonial cultural cloning in connection with the life of Bishop George Augustus Selwyn in New Zealand. Phillipson tackles a question raised by Professor Ian Breward of the Presbyterian Theological College, Dunedin, in 1985: 'Have the mainline Protestant churches moved out of their colonial status?' Breward's question, applied in the context of Otago Sunday schooling, becomes a non-issue. A key feature of Sunday schooling in Britain, America and Australia had been the adaptability of the movement, and a successful migratory transplant would be, by definition, a transplanting of adaptability. On the Otago and Southland pioneer frontier Sunday school access proved far cheaper and easier to implement than the more rigid systems of

---

3 Boylan, pp.4-16.
either day school education or formal denominational worship; indeed Sunday school provision was frequently a precursor to church foundation, and in pioneer times in Otago it had been common for the informal school to cater for the spiritual wants of visiting adults as well as children. The Otago and Southland Sunday schools married the amateurism and informality of English working class practice, nurtured in traditions of self-help through the friendly societies, with the high educational expectations of the Presbyterian parish system of the Scottish Lowlands. The result for the Otago region was an effective Sabbath school implementation, able to respond with great flexibility, often ecumenically, to the exigencies of life on the pioneer frontier, but which was then capable of sophisticated development as pioneering shaded into settlement, an implementation which synthesized international paradigm with local need. The creation in 1872 and subsequent achievements of a Sabbath Schools Committee by the Otago and Southland Presbyterian Synod and George Troup's pivotal refinement of the Bible class model constitute good examples of adaptive local response to wider stimulus.

The means were flexible but the aim overarching; the overriding goal of those who promoted Sabbath schooling was the eternal salvation of the scholars. The ultimate in socialization was the integration of the believer into the timeless society of heaven, expressed temporally in a fellowship, born of Grace between the Christian and the Holy Spirit. The schools were to be agencies of Christian conversion. This term itself was open to a range of interpretations and its application changed over time. Catechetical training in the Presbyterian tradition, the lifeblood of Sabbath schooling during the first twenty years of the Otago settlement, was intended to provide the young with the doctrinal underpinning of a future Christian identity. A Beecherite conversion, romantically liberal, was a process of a different kind, a process rooted in the affective and intuitive rather than the doctrinal. Moodyite revivalism required that conversion be a moment of decision, a conscious albeit faltering step of faith. A young female Sunday school teacher, 'A.C.', approached the Reverend Mugford Grant in June 1885 'in great anxiety' that she was not saved. She had been a Port Chalmers Congregational Church member for three years. Grant was 'glad to find such spiritual anxiety

---

5 See, for example, references in Chapter 5. Audrey Peterson, A Cornish Goldminer at Hamiltons. Also A Don, Memories of the Golden Road. A History of the Presbyterian Church of Central Otago.

6 For a detailed analysis of the origins and growth of the Bible class movement, see M N Garing, 'Four Square for Christ: the Presbyterian Bible Class Movement, 1902-1972: its rise, its influence and its decline', MA Thesis, Victoria University of Wellington, 1985. Clive Sage's Jubilee History of the Bible Class Movement, which underpinned Garing's research, and which was formerly located in the Hewitson Library, Dunedin, has unfortunately been lost.
manifested by her', and prayed with her regarding her 'instant decision' for Christ.\(^7\) Romanticism in
its purest form posited the validity of childhood experience, pushed the threshold of conversion
beyond the bounds of memory and, in its Anglican manifestation, reaffirmed the efficacy for
salvation of infant baptism. Quasi-revivalist 'decisions for Christ' were increasingly sought in Otago
and Southland's Sunday schools after 1875, with conversion being promoted even among infant
classes.

The success or otherwise of such aims of Sabbath school defies objective analysis; the historian,
child of time, cannot measure the salvation of the soul, but can register the social attitudes which the
search for salvation engenders. Otago and Southland's Sunday schools of the later nineteenth century
were significant influences in shaping the social attitudes of the next generation of settlers. If
reception into committed, active adult church membership was to be the benchmark of conversion,
then the churches of contemporary Otago themselves expressed disappointment at the outcome of
Sunday school evangelism, with especial concern expressed at the loss of young male support from
the senior classes of the schools; about 8 per cent of the aggregate nominal roll of Presbyterian Bible
classes in the region was received into church membership during 1894.\(^8\) Attendance at evangelistic
rallies, on the other hand, was sometimes numbered in thousands rather than hundreds. Young
people among the swelling rolls of the Christian Endeavour Association during the 1890s testified
eagerly to the work of Christ in their lives, linking conversion to the 'higher life'; the Reverend
George Lindsay, in 1893, noted the 'marvellous' progress of evangelism under the Association's
aegis.\(^9\) The majority of Otago's youth heard, through their Sunday schools, Bible classes and
Endeavour groups, the message that, body, mind and soul, they were of individual concern to an
omniscient God, the perfection of whose justice condemned their sin but who then, in the sacrificial
perfection of his love, offered full and free forgiveness and restorative power in their lives. It was
a message of egalitarian optimism, apposite to the migrant frontier of the heart. Bessie Turnbull of
Mosgiel, child of an interdenominational Sunday school run under Baptist auspices during the 1890s,
knew that she had 'a place in heaven', but was 'not looking for a higher place there than anyone

\(^7\) W M Grant, Record of Services, Visits, Meetings, matters of personal interest, connected with the
Congregational Church, Port Chalmers, New Zealand. Entry for 11 June 1885. Hocken Archives, Dunedin

\(^8\) Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1894, Appendix, Report of
Sabbath Schools Committees 1893-1894, p.55.

else. More than the day schools, the Sunday schools were seed beds of a socially integrative self-respect.

Socialization, as offered by Otago and Southland nineteenth century Sunday schools, was indeed a comprehensive package. Otago's pioneers and early settlers largely shared a post-millennial vision, that is they looked for the Millennium to precede the Second Coming of Christ, and therefore emphasized the temporal evidences of spiritual conversion. Post-millennial preparation required the Sunday school and its associated agencies to nurture the whole person, mind and body as well as spirit. For a quarter or more of all children in Otago and Southland in the earliest days of settlement, Sunday schooling had been the only schooling available, and this was still the case for at least 10 per cent of the region's children in 1871. For this reason some pioneer Otago Sunday schools, like their Raikesian progenitors, taught basic literacy as well as the elements of religious doctrine. Once the 1877 Education Act had shifted responsibility for the inculcation of basic literacy and numeracy on to the public education system, the Sunday schools, through their derivative literary and cultural societies, continued to foster cognition. On a scale which day schools before 1900 could not match, Sunday schools promoted 'suitable' reading among scholars of all ages by offering access to periodicals and libraries, and by the liberal award of prizes. The range of intellectual endeavour encouraged through the Sunday schools of all denominations reflected both Victorian society's passion for self-improvement and also the desire of the schools, at least among their older classes, to answer the intellectual challenge of the Higher Criticism. Romanticism, meanwhile, celebrated the body as well as the mind; a Christian Romanticism had to reclaim the physical for Christ. Physical education and sporting facilities, increasingly offered as aspects of church youth work after 1880, were bait to retain the interest in church affiliation of, particularly, young males. Sunday schools and Bible classes justified these aspects of their outreach as a constructive canalization of the otherwise unregenerate animal spirits of youth. Through these ploys, together with the Industrial Exhibitions run under the auspices of the Otago Sunday School Union during the 1890s, the schools tried to reassert spiritual ownership of the secular, reinterpreting the concept of 'godly experiment' in a post-1877 environment.

---

11 See Chapter 10 for fuller discussion of, and comparison between, the pre and post-millennial positions.
12 See Chapter 4.
Even more important for post-millennial preparation than the suitable exercise of mind and body was the exercise of the heart, made manifest in moral conduct,13 hence the Sunday schools' assiduous cultivation of the Puritan conscience. Good works did not in themselves constitute salvation, but they were the outward, visible sign of redemption and regeneration; thus Mugford Grant addressed the Port Chalmers Congregational Sunday School, on 9 December 1883, on the theme 'Christ wants your hearts to love Him; He wants your lives to serve Him'.14 The logical converse of Grant's position was that an unredeemed society could not be moral. The perception of religion as an ethical prerequisite was common to the cultural heirs of British Puritanism, and the conceptual linkage between religion and right conduct persisted even among those who did not maintain the habit of personal church attendance. In England, by 1900, populist understandings of evolution mingled religion's essential social role with crude derivatives from the ideas of natural selection and the 'survival of the fittest'. My own paternal grandfather, West Country English and not an overtly 'churchy' man, instructed my father shortly before the outbreak of World War I: 'Man is the most savage animal on the face of the earth and the fear of religion is the only thing that holds him in check'.15 The forms of religion, whether or not perceived to be true in any absolute sense, remained as an essential social cement. Of especial concern to Otago parents were the moral implications of secularisation, embedded in the public education system under the terms of the 1877 Education Act.16 Parents in Otago and Southland in large numbers sent their children to Sunday school to preserve the religious underpinning which they saw as crucial for maintaining an ethical community. Proportionally, enrolments at Sunday schools of all denominations in the region grew 50 per cent faster than the overall increase in school-age population between 1878 and 1886.17 At Sunday school a message of positive morality was delivered to the children, through lesson content, sacred song and festival recitation, its promptings reflected in the pseudonyms under which scholars submitted their entries in the Presbyterian Synod's interschool examinations; 'Dare to be True', 'Dun Spiro Spero',

13 A point stressed, for example, in the Report of the Sabbath Schools Committee to the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1889.
14 W M Grant, Record of Services, Visits, Meetings, matters of personal interest, connected with the Congregational Church, Port Chalmers, New Zealand. Entry for 9 December 1883.
15 Personal recollections of the researcher's father.
16 See reference in Chapter 5 to C McGeorge and I Snook, Church, State and New Zealand Education, Price Milburn, Wellington, 1981.
17 Calculations based on data contained in Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand, 1886. The 5 to 15 year-old population in Otago and Southland increased from 29,297 to 39,463 over the period 1878-1886. Over the same period aggregate Sunday school enrolments grew from 16,814 to 25,472.
'Fides', 'Truth Shall Prevail', 'Lux Veritatis', 'Light in the Darkness', 'Fiat Lux', 'Felix', 'Do', 'Speranza' and 'Ich Dien' were typical examples from the mid-1880s. 'Maori', chosen by a senior candidate in the Presbyterian Synod's essay competition in 1888, constituted an interesting departure from the norm. Specific morality lobbies falling within the ambit of the temperance movement targeted the Sunday schools during the 1890s, with patchy success, touching the lives of perhaps a sixth of the young people of Otago and Southland; incomplete data makes the figure an educated guess, and the long-term significance of the act of 'taking the pledge' defies quantification. The uneven impact of a sectional lobby does not negate the overall importance of Sunday school influence upon the mores of Otago society. The scholars' concerns regarding both their own standards of conduct and contemporary social issues emerged repeatedly in the encounter sessions of Christian Endeavour and Bible classes in Otago and Southland, forums which were modernist in debate but traditionalist in their assumption that there were absolutes to be apprehended, whether through revelation, reason or a synthesis of the two. Sunday school, of the range of agencies of colonial socialization, was the channel which most consistently interfused moral training with the reinforcing sanction of religion, mediating a Christo-Judaic tapu to pakeha culture.

Morality is intrinsically a social phenomenon. Sunday school activity in pioneer Otago, morally focused and triple rooted in the communal traditions of the Scottish Lowland village, Highland glen and English working class friendly society, does not fit a Fairburn paradigm of atomization. Commonly the setting up of a Sunday school was the frontier's first gesture towards community, an act of socialization in the most immediate sense. Sunday school foundations were among the easiest, cheapest ways of re-creating in migration the remembered communalities of 'home'; some of the earliest schools, indeed, were literally 'home' ventures, overflows from the domestic hearth as pioneer parents catered for the educational needs of their own and their neighbours' large families. Sometimes the Sunday school preceded the day school. Sometimes it anticipated the provision of formal Church worship. Frequently the pioneer Sunday school was ecumenical, the social imperative of sharing in worship overriding doctrinal niceties; commonly it was patronised by adults as well as children. Its example of interdenominational and intergenerational tolerance was often recalled with affection by former scholars. Occasionally the schools cemented ethnic identity among a

---

18 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1888, Appendix, Report of the Committee on Bible and Church History Classes, p.67.

19 See Chapter 10.
migrant group, as among the Welsh on the Otago goldfields.20 As pioneering shaded into settlement and provision for denominational worship became accessible, the schools continued to show a high degree of ecumenical goodwill, expressed for example through shared rallies, through exchange of ideas on best practice and through the participation of some in the interdenominational Otago Sunday School Union, Dunedin's Knox Presbyterian and Hanover Street Baptist Schools being prominent in this respect. Within the context of a specific denomination, a Sunday school might claim more affinity than the adult congregation with the pulse of the local community, an affinity fostered by the immediacy of its contract with parents and by its schedule of home visiting.

Denominationalism vied with ecumenicism in the unfolding story of settler Sunday school development. If a reconstituted migrant society was to reduplicate the complex forms of home, it would have to reconstruct the vertical community of creed within the horizontal community of settlement. Scottish Otago, conceived but never fully functioning as a Free Kirk entity, was one province in a colony unconfined by formal religious establishment. Otago's Sunday schools found themselves torn between pioneer interdenominationalism, with its camaraderie and its practical advantages, and the hunger of ageing settlers for the comforting security of remembered, including denominational, practices. Reports of the sundry sub-committees of the Otago Presbyterian Synod during the 1880s encapsulated the dilemma. Reflecting on the work of the region's Sabbath schools in 1882, Synod rejoiced that 'an excellent spirit seems to pervade the people, and where numbers are small, instead of establishing two or three inefficient little schools, we find Episcopalian, Wesleyans and Presbyterians bringing their children together and uniting harmoniously in the work of religious instruction'.21 In the same year Synod's Bible and Church History Class Committee launched a catechetically focused examination scheme, directed at the region's Sabbath school's and Bible classes and specifically intended to nurture the young colonial in the traditions and doctrine of Presbyterianism. The Presbyterian Synod looked to its Sabbath schools as recruiting agencies for denominationally discrete church membership and as nurseries of future church leadership. Some Presbyterian elders, assessing the options open for older scholars, preferred the Bible classes to Christian Endeavour, judging the Bible classes to be more biddable instruments of denominational control. Otago Anglicanism similarly looked to its Sunday schools to foster its liturgical tradition,

20 See Chapter 4.
21 Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland, 1882, Appendix, Sabbath Schools Committee, 1892, p.16.
but was too divided in its own sacramental stance to speak with a coherent voice. Sunday schooling in Otago was a failure if the criterion for judgment is to be the inculcation of denominational zeal. Under the same criterion the Sunday schools of contemporary England were also failures. They were too autonomous to serve sectarianism, and the fostering of denominationalism was not a high priority of the English working classes who patronised the schools.\textsuperscript{22} Otago and Southland's Sunday schools, self-conscious in their isolation, turned repeatedly towards a tolerant internationalism which sought to rally the inchoate ranks of doctrinal dissent against the worldwide challenges of secularism, rationalism and the Higher Criticism. The unresolved claims of conservative denominationalism constituted, perhaps, one of the factors which weakened the Sunday schools during the twentieth century as traditionalism in wider society ceded to modernism, and modernism to post-modern relativism.

The most obvious area of failure for the Sunday schools of Otago and Southland in the later nineteenth century related to the paucity of their outreach among the children of unskilled labour, insofar as this category can be defined in a fluid migrant society, a failure which the schools shared with their parent congregations. It was the Sabbath schools' sense of failure in this respect which helped to drive the development of the kindergarten movement in Otago. Of the adult Protestant congregations of Otago and Southland, the Salvation Army marched among the labouring classes where tradition feared to go, earning the resentment of Mugford Grant at Port Chalmers, the grudging respect of North Dunedin's Gibson Smith and the emulation of St Andrew's Rutherford Waddell. The Reverend George Lindsay observed in 1893: 'It is feared that there is among the working people of this Colony an idea that the church is disposed to side with the capitalist ... It is at least very evident that the relation of the industrial classes to the Church is not so close and hearty as it ought to be'.\textsuperscript{23} Some clergy were pessimistic regarding the children of the undeserving poor. Mugford Grant saw evidence of criminality irredeemably etched in the faces of waifs at the Caversham Industrial School, and was thankful that none of these were the offspring of Congregationalist homes.\textsuperscript{24} In Britain as in America, the Sunday schools' achievements had bred a

\textsuperscript{24} W M Grant, Record of Services, Visits, Meetings, matters of personal interest, connected with the Congregational Church, Port Chalmers, New Zealand. Entry for 10 May 1883.
respectability which, sustained in migration to frontier Australia or to Otago, continued to exclude the children of the socially dispossessed.

The Otago and Southland Sunday schools saw their failure among labourers' children as an ironic negation of their Raikesian ancestry. In partial remedy they offered gala events such as summer picnics and winter festivals, conceived as broad-screen projections of the family ideal, which sometimes facilitated contact across social divides, at the same time making life difficult for harassed organisers. Picnics could be huge, drawing a thousand or more participants, and attracting detailed press coverage. The presence of irregulars and hangers-on at such events made planning difficult and led to some formal ticketing, and even to the hiring of paid gate-keepers, in the later 1890s. Some schools attempted more sustained programmes of social outreach. At Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, the Otago Presbyterian First Church and the South Dunedin Congregationalist Church, the associated Sunday schools offered a mix of weeknight and Sunday programmes variously combining trade skills for boys and domestic arts for girls, and integrating these with outdoor welfare schemes. Dorcas societies operating under the ambit of the Sunday schools in many churches knitted and sewed for charity, and some Sunday schools responded to the 1880s recession with gift days for outdoor relief. The relief was patronising and the programmes culturally assimilationist. They ensured, on the other hand, that the proportion of young lives untouched at least indirectly by religion during the later nineteenth century in Otago and Southland would have been small indeed. The St Andrew's Presbyterian Church School, Dunedin, tried to reach the children of the poor directly through domestic mission work, initiated by the Norwegian evangelical, Oscar Michelsen. St Andrew's Church, sited hard by Dunedin's Walker Street slum, developed an ethos rich in social and educational experiment. The St Andrew's congregation itself was a creature of philanthropy, embodied in the person of Rachel Selina Reynolds. Australian-born and West Otago raised, Rachel Reynolds was a driving force behind the opening of the Walker Street church in 1870. She was also president of the Kindergarten Association in 1889, co-operating with St Andrew's Reverend Rutherford Waddell and Lavinia Kelsey in developing a Froebelian agenda for the movement. Experiments in specialist infant classes among the Sunday schools predated the

---

introduction of the kindergarten movement to Otago by some ten years. The Christian Romantic wanted to reach the young heart at its most malleable and guileless, before it was calloused by the influence of an unregenerate home. The St Andrew's community, in fostering kindergartens, projected and focused a decade of prior Sunday school experience on to the screen of secular society. In an interesting parallel with the evolution of Sunday schooling in England, the kindergarten movement in Otago, which started as a socially redemptive mission among the children of the unsaved proletariat, found itself organizationally highjacked by the parents of the families it was designed to assimilate.\textsuperscript{28}

The essential impact of Otago and Southland's nineteenth century Sunday schools has to be assessed in a context wider than social class or sectarianism, the context of the schools' own pervasive and evolving mythology. It was a mythology synthesized from diverse sources, traditional and migratory, reflecting the pride integral to a Scottish heritage, reflecting the self-assurance of heirs of the Covenant, yet apposite for the socialization of an emergent settlement never uniquely Scottish and re-ordered by gold rush and Vogelite migration. From disparate elements it welded a sense of purpose, thoroughly and effectively mediated to Otago Sunday school children through their involvement in overseas mission, the target of many schools' collections every Sabbath. Overseas mission as interpreted to children by James Copland in the \textit{Evangelist} or by 'Aunt Sally' in the 'North Dunedin Monthly', linked Christian identity to a sense of British cultural superiority, enjoining speedy outreach to civilize benighted natives and to forestall the predations of the culturally inferior French. Mission became an exercise in justificatory self-definition, locating a tiny, isolated British settlement within its proper imperial context, and the British Empire within the wider context of the Kingdom of Heaven. Through overseas mission Sunday schools maintained Otago's status as a 'godly experiment' at times like the 1880s, when analysis of the experiment's domestic status was painful, and into the years of World War I when the pain of analysis became greater. When A.H. Reed, although a married man, volunteered for active service in the war, his Sabbath school correspondents, almost without exception, not only saluted his courage but hoped his example would spur others, expressing unqualified support for the Christian righteousness of the cause for which he fought.\textsuperscript{29}

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{29} A H Reed, Letters to A H Reed concerning Sunday School Business during World War I. New Zealand Collection, McNab Room, Dunedin Public Library.
\end{thebibliography}
It is easy but unacceptable to look patronizingly at the mythology of an earlier generation. The same mythology that drove Sunday school teachers to uphold the claims of overseas mission also spurred the claims of childhood conversion. This, in turn, drove Sunday school classes to an interactive, individualised regime, facilitated by extraordinarily favourable teacher-pupil ratios, on a scale which day schools with their overcrowded rooms could not hope to match. The broad proscription of corporal punishment in Sunday schools, across Australasia and internationally at this time, was not simply a concession to the sensibilities of a non-captive audience. It was also a reflection of an ideal, that each individual, however humble, had their dignity, and Sunday school teachers in Otago prided themselves that they led the day schools in this respect. It was common for young people with prior Sabbath school and Bible class teaching and learning experience to cross over into day school teaching, taking the ideals and derivative practice of the Sunday school into the secularised world of post-1877 public elementary education. As British Sunday schooling had prepared the way for the British 1870 Education Act, so New Zealand Sabbath schooling favourably influenced and qualified the impact of the 1877 Education Act. Migrant derivatives of the Sunday school helped to prepare colonial society for the concept of universal access to elementary education and, with this access secure and free in New Zealand, the Sunday schools then prepared the way for a more personalised pedagogy on the part of the day schools, with exponential implications for the socialization of children into the twentieth century.

Young women, especially, made the switch from Sunday school to elementary day school teaching. It was among the girls of the colony that Otago's Sunday schools did perhaps their most effective work. Nineteenth century Otago provided the young colonial woman with education, stimulus from the opportunities of a new society, and sufficient traditional obstacles to self-fulfilment to make her feel frustrated; but it also equipped her to tackle her frustration. Sunday schooling was the first area of church work among the mainline Protestant denominations to give women significant outlet and, in Otago, young women responded in large numbers, and in increasing proportion compared with males. Overwhelmingly a male preserve among Presbyterians in 1848, Sunday school work was dominated in a ratio of 3 to 2 by young female workers in 1900, with the imbalance being yet more pronounced in specific areas such as infant teaching and involvement in Christian Endeavour. Executive positions in Sunday schools remained male-controlled, but the adventurous young woman moved laterally from the Sabbath class into other fields, including overseas mission. The Sunday school was a stepping stone upon which many a young Otago and Southland woman found poise.
and confidence, in academic exercise, organizational practice and oral or written presentation. The benefits of Sunday schooling went deeper. When I played to one of my own tertiary classes, in March 1998, taped extracts of interviews with the centenarian Bessie Turnbull, the students were astonished that a person who had faced so many personal frustrations could have lived such a well-integrated, fulfilled life. They wondered at the source of her inner strength. Few of those students had ever attended Sunday school. For the young woman of Otago and Southland in the later nineteenth century Sunday schooling offered opportunity and purpose, a mythology for life. It therefore retained her loyalty, markedly more so than the loyalty of the contemporary young man. The schools' spokesmen were often unaware that herein lay colonial Sunday schooling's most significant social achievement. The young women from the Sunday schools in Otago in the 1890s spoke the moral vernacular of the colonially born, as mothers and grandmothers shaping the values of their descendants with an influence that proved inescapable even for those who, in the mould of R.A.K. Mason, purported to rebel against it, the very parameters of their rebellion defined by the imagery of the Sunday school world:

   Each one of us must do his work of doom
   and I shall do it even in despite
   of her who brought me in pain from her womb,
   whose blood made me, who used to bring the light
   and sit on the bed up in my little room
   and tell me stories and tuck me up at night.30

Bibliography

Primary Sources

A) Church Records

All Saints' Anglican Church, Dunedin.
Register of Preachers, Readers and Collections, 1881-1889.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG80. A1, A2, C1.

All Saints' Anglican Parish Church, Gladstone, Invercargill.
Parochial Committee Minute Book, 1876-1883.
Parochial Committee Minute Book, 1883-1907.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG244. A1, A2.

All Saints' Anglican Church, Tapanui.
Vestry Minutes, 25 February 1876-15 November 1916.

Associated Churches of Christ. St Andrew Street, Dunedin
Elders' Minute Book 1893-1895
United Meetings of Elders and Deacons' Minute Book 1893-1901
Deacons' Minute Book 1883-1890
Sunday School: Roll of Superintendents, Teachers and Scholars 1864-1907
Teachers' Meetings Minute Book 1902-1929
Christian Endeavour Society: Minute Book 1905-1911
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 520 10, 11, 12, 21, 22, 32

Australasian Wesleyan Methodist Church.
Minutes of the Annual Conference, 1855-1884.
Melbourne: La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria. SLT 287.194 M.

Balclutha Methodist Church
Sunday School and Youth Committee Records: Sunday School Roll Book 1871-1882
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 26/6/1

Bluff Methodist Church
Christian Endeavour Minutes 1898-1906
Sunday School Records: Sunday School Roll 1880-1881
Sunday School Roll 1881-1883
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 29/5/1, 29/6/2, 29/6/3

Broad Bay Methodist Church
Sunday School and Bible Class Records: Sunday School Minute Book 1863-1940
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 30/6/01
Feeding the Lambs

Caversham Baptist Church, Dunedin.
Admission Book, 1890-1905.
Deacons' Minute Book, 1917-1927.
Library Register, 1893-1896.
Sunday School Minutes, 1868-1880.
Sunday School Minutes, 1881-1894.
Superintendent's Register, 1883-1895.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. UN78 3.2 and 5.1-10.

Church of England Diocese of Dunedin.
Synod Proceedings, 1869-1894. (Includes reports from the Sunday School Committee of St Paul's Anglican Cathedral, Dunedin, 1887-1894.)
Dunedin: Hocken Reference Library. PS0i5 Chu.

Church of England in Australia
General Synod: Proceedings. 1872-1921.
Melbourne: Abbotsford Depot, State Library of Victoria. YA 283.94G.

Dundas Street Methodist Church
Band of Hope Minutes and Members' Roll 1881-1884
Sunday School Minutes 1890-1903
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 36/01/10, 36/01/11

Dunedin City Baptist Church
Church Minutes, 1863-1890. 1890-1908.
Deacons' General Committee Minutes, 1873-1882, 1882-1890, 1890-1901.
Deacons' Minute Book, Baptist Church, Great King Street, 1864-1875.
Hanover Street Baptist Church Chinese Mission Register, 1899-1912.
Hanover Street Baptist Sunday School Register, 1878-1884.
New Zealand Baptist (Christchurch). 1881-1883.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives.

East Otago Parish Archives: St John's Anglican Church, Waikouaiti.
Neal, E.J. "A Short History of Waikouaiti, Commemorating Sixty Years of Church Life and Work, 1858-1918."
Vestry and Church Committee Minutes, 1859-1888, 1889-1910.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. 92-114.

Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Port Chalmers.
Offertory Book II, 1887-1904.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. MS 1084.

Jubilee Memorial of the South Clutha Parish.
Part I: 1854-1884 (Jane Bannerman).
Part II: 1884-1904 (Rev A.M. Dalrymple, MA)
Among the private papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.

Kaikorai Presbyterian Church, Dunedin.
Sunday School Ephemera, 1896-1897.
In Randall, Peter: papers.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. 90-107.

*Knapdale Christian Endeavour Society.*
Minutes. 1896-1899.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College. AN2/1.

*Knox Presbyterian Church, Dunedin.*
Annual Reports of the Session and Deacon's Court. 1864-1901.
Quarterly Statements. September 1887, September 1888, September 1889, June 1890,
December 1890, March 1891, June 1891, September 1891, December 1891,
March 1898, December 1899, March 1900.
Records held at Knox Presbyterian Church Parish Office.

*Knox Church Sabbath Schools*
Knox Church Sabbath Schools Rules.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College.

*Linden Methodist Church, Dunedin.*
Sabbath School Library Catalogue and Minutes, September 1878-2 February 1894.
Sabbath School Roll Book. 1881-1885.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 43/2/1, 43/2/2

*Milton Methodist Church*
Wesleyan Christian Band Minutes 1898-1899
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 46/13/1

*Moray Place Congregational Church, Dunedin: Archives, from 1862*
Christian Band Minutes. 9 October 1895-12 December 1898. AG36.25
Minutes of Church Meetings. 24 October 1862-3 August 1893. AG36.1.
Minutes of Deacons' Meetings. 7 November 1864-January 1884. AG36.2
Minutes of the Mutual Improvement Association. 11 February 1895-27 June 1904.
AG36.24.
Notes on the History of the Church. AG36.9.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives.

*Mornington Methodist Church*
Mornington Sunday School: miscellaneous file including historical information
Mornington Wesleyan Improvement Society: the "Journal" Vol 1 1886-1888
Mornington Wesleyan Bible and Mutual Improvement Society: the "Journal" 1890-1893
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 47/08/18, 47/09/1, 47/09/2

*Mornington Presbyterian Sabbath School*
Rules.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College.

*Mosgiel Baptist Church*
Christian Endeavour Society Minute Books. 1892-1901.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG263. D1, D2.

*North Chatton Young People's Society of Christian Endeavour*
Minutes. 1896-1904.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College. AN1/5.

*North East Valley Blue Ribbon Society*
Minute Book. 1885-1889.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. MS 670.

*Port Chalmers Congregational Church*
Membership Records and Statistics. 1864-1905. AG 141.4.1.
Minutes of Church Meetings, 1872-1923. AG 141. 2-4
Sunday School Records: Minutes. 1898-1903. AG 141.9.1
Sunday School Records: Annual Reports, 1901-1902. AG 141.9.2.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives.

*Port Chalmers Methodist Church*
Sunday School: Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes 1863-1881
Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes 188-1895
Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes 1895-1911
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 52/7/1, 52/7/2, 52/7/3

*Presbyterian First Church of Otago*
Annual Reports of the Sessions and Deacons' Courts. 1886-1901.
First Church Deacons' Court Minute Book, Vol II. 7 April 1856-10 September 1862.
First Church of Otago Roll of Deacons.
Records of the Sabbath School Teachers' Meetings. 1882-1901.
Records held at the Presbyterian First Church of Otago Office, Dunedin.

*Presbytery of Otago*
Minutes. 1854-1860. 1860-1865.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College. BU4/1.

*Pukerua Sunday School and Bible Class*
Library Registers. 1891-1919.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College. BN1/1.

*Queenstown Presbyterian Church*
Christian Endeavour Roll Book. 1895.
Sunday School Attendance Register. 1867-1872. 1879-1886. 1892-1897.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College. BR1/1.

*Riversdale Sunday School*
Registers. 1891-1972.

*Riverton Parochial District Anglican Church*
Church Committee Minutes. 1860-1874.

Roslyn Methodist Church

Roslyn Sabbath School

St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Dunedin

St Andrews Sabbath School, Dunedin
Roll Book kept by Miss Agnes Park. 1876. Dunedin: Hocken Archives. MS 905.

St John's Anglican Church, Roslyn, Dunedin

St Matthew's Anglican Church, Dunedin

St Michael's Anglican Church, Shiel Hill, Anderson's Bay, Dunedin

St Paul's Anglican Cathedral, Dunedin
Feeding the Lambs

St Paul's Central Methodist Church, Invercargill
Sunday School and Bible Class: St Paul's Sunday School Teachers' Meeting Minutes 1893-1917
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 60/7/01

St Paul's Presbyterian Church, Invercargill
Minutes of Sunday School Teachers' Meetings. 1882-1894.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College.

St Peter's Anglican Church, Caversham
Vestry Fair Minutes. 2 October 1882-8 January 1889. 22 January 1889-13 May 1914.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 60/7/01

St Stephens, Invercargill.
Sunday School Cash Book. 1889-1812.

Socialist Sunday School Material (Christchurch) n.d.
Wellington: Alexander Turnbull Library. MS - Papers - 0445-47.

South Dunedin Baptist Church
Minute Book. 1887-1894.
Sunday School Minute Books. 1875-1896. 2.1 and 2.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. 94-174.

Sunday (Sabbath) School Committee, North
Minute Book, 1893 - 1897.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College. PCNZ/GA.

Sunday School Committee
Minute Book, 1907-1919.
Dunedin: Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College. PCNZ/GA.

Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland
Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland. 1866-1901.
Dunedin: Alexander Don Room, Hewitson Library, Knox College

Tokomairiro Presbyterian Church
Baptism Register: Index 1859-1873. 1901-1920. Compiled for Dunedin Group of the NZSG
by Mrs Alison B. Durry. nd.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives.

Trinity Methodist Church, Dunedin
Quarterly Meetings Minutes 1888-1896.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. 91-144 Box 11 1052.

Two Lectures to Sunday School Teachers
Feeding the Lambs


Waihola Deacons' Court

Waihola District Sabbath School

Wakatipu Parochial District Anglican Church

Warepa-Kaihiku Sunday School

Wellington Baptist Church Sunday School
Subject File. ca 1886-1908. Wellington: Alexander Turnbull Library. MS - Papers - 17/14/19.

Wesleyan Methodist Church (Cargill Road, Hillside Road)
Sunday School Records: Cargill Road Methodist Church Teachers' Meeting Minute Book 1890-1897 Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG 640 32/12/1

Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, Wellington

B) Official Records (Central and Local Government, and Educational Institutions)

Dunedin Teachers' College

Dunedin Training College
Students' Register, 1894-1912. Dunedin: Hocken Archives.

George Street School
Feeding the Lambs

Gore Birth Registrations, 1875-1920
Dunedin: Hocken Reference Library.

New Zealand Census of Population and Dwellings
Results of a Census for the Colony of New Zealand: 1871, 1878, 1886, 1896, 1901.

New Zealand Department of Statistics
Statistics of New Zealand for 1853, 1854, 1855, 1856, 1858, 1864, 1867.

Dunedin: Library of the Otago University History Department.

Otago and Part Southland Presbyterian Marriages at Hewitson Library
Dunedin: Hocken Archives.

Otago Education Board
Fair Minutes. 1856-1857.
Otago Education Board Archives. 1856-.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. UN57.

Pupil Teachers' Register, 1886-1910.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. AG294 6/4/1

Registers of Teachers Employed by the Board. 1878-ca1883. 1883-ca1901. 1894-ca1901.

Testimony Gathered by Ashley's Mines Commission
Parliamentary Papers, 1842.
Internet: http://ab.edu/~delcol_l/worker.html.

C) Personal Correspondence and Diaries

Bannerman, Jane
Among personal papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.

Bannerman, Jane (Burns)
Reminiscences of her Life to 1855.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. M1 536/B.
Feeding the Lambs

Bannerman, Reverend Dr William
Early Days in the Clutha and South Otago.
Dunedin: Otago Settlers' Museum Archives. 136A.

Bonthon, Isabella
Diary of Mrs D. Bonthon: 'Helenslee'. 1863.

Burns, Reverend Dr Thomas
Diary.
Visitation Book (1848-1858) of Reverend Thomas Burns, Dunedin, New Zealand.
Dunedin: Otago Settlers' Museum Archives.

Cato, Frederick John
Growing Together: Letters between Frederick John Cato and Frances Bethune, 1881 to 1884.
Dunedin: Hocken Reference Library.

Christie, Reverend John
Dunedin: Hocken Archives.

Ferens, Thomas
Copy of the Diary of the Late Thomas Ferens from November 1847 to July 1852.
Dunedin: Otago Settlers' Museum Archives. C38.

Fulton, Catherine Henrietta Elliott (Valpy)
Diary. 1849-1915.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. MS846.

Grant, Reverend William Mugford
Diaries, Journals, Sketchbooks, Photograph Album. 1877-1925.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. M1 951 A-H.

Orbell, M.C.
Dunedin: Otago Settlers' Museum Archives. C85.

Reed, A.H.
Personal Correspondence.
Letters to A.H. Reed concerning Sunday School.
Business during World War 1.
Sunday Schools' Change from Afternoon to Morning Sessions. 1930-1938.
Dunedin: New Zealand Collection, McNab Room, Dunedin Public Library.

Short, Gladys Ella
Memories.
In personal papers of Judith Cranefield, St Clair, Dunedin.

*Street, Sarah*
Letters of Mrs Sarah Street.
Dunedin: Otago Settlers' Museum Archives.

*Tily, Thomas*
Diary. 1892-1911.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. Misc MS 460.

*Ward, Robert*
Journals 1844-1872.
Dunedin: Hocken Archives. M.1 893/A-B.

*Watkin, Reverend James*
Journal. 1840-1844: kept at Waikouaiti.

**D)**

**Newspapers and Periodicals (Church and Secular)**

*Australian Baptist Magazine,* July 1858-June 1860. La Trobe Library, Rare Books Collection, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLT 204 V66.

*Australian Christian Advocate* (Melbourne: T. Smith, Printer and Publisher), January 1874-December 1880. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLTF 205 AU 78 CWI.


*Christian Outlook* (Dunedin, weekly), 1894. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.


*Evangelist*

(Lawrence), 1869
(Dunedin), 1870-1876, 1878.
Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

Magazine of Anderson's Bay Mutual Improvement and Literary Association (Dunedin: J. Wilkie & Co), 1892. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.


New Zealand Christian Record (Dunedin), 29 October 1880 and 3 December 1880. Hewitson Archive Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

New Zealand Good Templar Tracts, No 2, The Order: Its Organization, issued by the Grand Lodge of New Zealand, IOGT. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. Misc MS 448.

New Zealand Presbyterian (Dunedin), 1879-1832, 1883-1886, 1887-1889, 1890-1893. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.


New Zealand Missionary Record (Dunedin), Vol 1, No 2, December 1882. Hocken Archives, Dunedin. Misc MS 448.

Otago Witness (Dunedin), 1851-1853, 1854-1857. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin. YVPW Dn O.

Presbyterian Women's Missionary Union Harvest Field (Christchurch: Association of Presbyterian Women, Presbyterian Church of New Zealand), Nos 24 - August 1910; 25 - October 1910; 27 - February 1911; 28 - April 1911; 30 - August 1911. Hocken Reference Library, Dunedin.

No 164 - December 1923. Among private papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.


Victorian Baptist Magazine (Melbourne), October 1868 - November 1869. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLT 286.05 V66M.

Victorian Independent and Journal of the Congregational Church (Melbourne), 1870-1880. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLTF 205 V66I.

Victorian Primitive Methodist (Melbourne), 1873-1879. La Trobe Library, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne. SLTF 205 V66P.
E)  **Contemporary Published Works**


Chiniquy, Father C., *The Priest, the Woman and the Confessional*, J.U. McNaught, Brisbane, 1879.

Chisholm, Reverend James, *Fifty Years Syne: a Jubilee Memorial of the Presbyterian Church of Otago*, J. Wilkie & Co., Dunedin, 1898.


Henderson, Alice E., *Golden Gate of India: A Study of the Panjab Mission of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand*, Foreign Missions Committee of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, Dunedin, 1922.


Henderson, Alice E., *Shield of India: A Study of India and the Panjab Mission of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand*, Foreign Missions Committee of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, Auckland, 1933.


Monk, Maria, (pseudonymous), *Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk and Thrilling Mysteries of a Convent Revealed!*, T.B. Peterson, Philadelphia, 1836.


Watson, Reverend A, *These Sixty-One Years: the History of the Warepa Presbyterian Church from 1854-1914*, among the private papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.


F) **Contemporary Works of Reference**


*Shorter Catechism agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster. With Scripture Proofs*, New Zealand Bible, Tract and Book Society, Dunedin, 189?


*Universal Songster; or Museum of Mirth*, Jones & Co., London, 1834.
Secondary Sources

G) Unpublished Theses and Papers


Ayson, William Douglas, 'Looking Back: Glenshee to Otago', Clan Ayson of New Zealand Society, among the private papers of Jerry and Joy Dix, Balclutha.


Fitchett, Joan P., 'The Contribution of the Church of England to Education in New Zealand since the Arrival of Bishop Selwyn', MA Thesis, University of Otago, 1941.


Green, J.E., 'Captain Thomas Wing, Master of the 'Deborah', 1810-1888', Hocken Archives, Dunedin. M 1440/26 15174.


Stafford, G.L., 'Growth and Development of the Sunday School Movement from 1885 to 1926: an inquiry into the development of the Sunday School Movement in New Zealand and an attempt to appraise it', typed manuscript; thesis draft? Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin, undated.


H) Published Texts and Articles

Brouwer, Ruth Compton, New Women for God: Canadian Presbyterian Women and India Missions, 1876-1914, University of Toronto Press, Toronto, 1990.


Elder, John Rawson, *The History of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand 1840-1940*, Presbyterian Bookroom, Christchurch, 1940.


Johnston, Carol Morton & Morton, Harry, *Dunedin Teachers' College; the First Hundred Years*, John McIndoe Ltd, Dunedin, 1976.


Knight, Hardwicke, *Church Building in Otago*, University of Otago Printing Department, Dunedin, 1993.


Feeding the Lambs


McEldowney, Dennis. (Ed.), Presbyterians in Aotearoa 1840-1990, Director of Communications for the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, Wellington, 1980.


McGeorge, C & Snook, I., Church, State and New Zealand Education, Price Milburn, Wellington, 1981.


Robb, Paul, 'Popular Religion and the Christianization of the Scottish Highlands in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries', in *Journal of Religious History*, 16 (1) 18-34, June 1990.


Watt, Hugh, Thomas Chalmers and the Disruption, Thomas Nelson and Sons, Edinburgh, 1943.


I) Oral Sources

Dyer, Joyce & Ellen, Isabel, interview, Dunedin, 23 September 1996.
Leffly, Dorothy, interview, Dunedin, 11 March 1997.
Appendix A Candidates Gaining Awards in Examinations and Essay Competitions Organised by the Otago Presbyterian Synod Committee on Bible and Church History Classes

Source
Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland. 1881-1892: Appendices. Reports of the Committee on Bible and Church History Classes. Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

Key
F = Female
M = Male
U = Gender Unspecified
J = Junior (pre-1886 category)
S = Senior (pre-1886 category)
A = under 14 years of age
B = 14-18 years old
C = over 18 years old
D = senior 'honours' candidate

'Merit certificates' were awarded to candidates exceeding a score of 50 percent.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Candidate</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Exam/Essay</th>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Placing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adam, Robert</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affleck, Christina</td>
<td>Otautau</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allan, Alice J</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1st (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allan, Henrietta L</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anderson, Jane</td>
<td>North Taieri</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3rd (87%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arthur, Fred</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3rd (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ash, Emily</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1st (92%) medal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2nd (95%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ash, Eva</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asher, Bella H</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>7th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1st (86%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1st (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2nd (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asher, Jane C</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bailone, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>6th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>6th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>8th (83%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bailone, Martha</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baird, Agnes</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1 (99%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baird, Helen S</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>prize</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1 (78%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1= (medal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3 (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3= (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3= (95%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baird, James H</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baird, Jessie E S</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5 (77%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(St Paul's, Oamaru,</td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6= (87%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1886?)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>6= (81%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>4 (81%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>commended</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2= (84%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balmic, Martha</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6= (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beattie, Robert M</td>
<td>Cumberland Street,</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dunedin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beattie, Robert Y</td>
<td>Leith Street, Dunedin</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bee, James</td>
<td>High School, Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bee, John</td>
<td>St Paul's, Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bethune, Fanny</td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bethune, Maggie</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birss, Helen S</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1855 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2= (85%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birss, Lizzie A F</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birss, William</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2 (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black, Anderina</td>
<td>St Andrew's, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blackadder, Susan L</td>
<td>London Street, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Essay (aged 15)</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borland, James</td>
<td>Riverton (Groper's Bush)</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1 (83%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1 (medal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>3= (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borland, Jessie</td>
<td>Riverton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borrie, William</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5= (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bowden, Charles</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brass, James</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4= (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2 (72%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown, William</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buchanan, Margaret</td>
<td>Gore</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burley, Martha</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burnside, Catherine D</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4= (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burnside, Mabel</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butler, Emily</td>
<td>Roxburgh</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cairney, I J</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cameron, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Palmerston</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4 (86%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>3 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4 (90%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>4= (92%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campbell, James</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campbell, Maggie</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carswell, John T</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1 (95%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2 (96%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carswell, Nellie</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carswell, William</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christie, Emma C</td>
<td>Kaikorai</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christie, James</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christie, Jane W</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christie, Janie C</td>
<td>First Church,</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>6=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christie, Jessie C</td>
<td>Glencairn, Dipton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christie, Mary</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>9 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christie, Robert</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>5 (78%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark, D S</td>
<td>Waitaki</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark, Henry E</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark, Isabella J</td>
<td>Palmerston</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2= (84%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1= (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2 (77%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1 (98%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark, James J</td>
<td>Palmerston</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>4= (92%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2 (86%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark, Patrick L</td>
<td>Palmerston</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Essay</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark, William</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cowie, Edith</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craig, George</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crawford, Andrew</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crawford, Balfour</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crawford, Gillies</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3 (83%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crawford, Hugh</td>
<td>St Paul's, Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuming, Jane</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuthbertson, Helen D</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2= (93%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuthbertson, Margaret EH</td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuthbertson, J.R.</td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Davey, Rose M</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 (97%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 (93%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 (99%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doig, Helen</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drummond, Alex P</td>
<td>Beaumont Cottage,</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frederick Street,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dunedin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duguid, William D</td>
<td>Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6= (77%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early, Marion</td>
<td>Kaikorai</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ennis, A T</td>
<td>First Church,</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erskine, J A</td>
<td>First Church,</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finlay, T A</td>
<td>Waihola</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>5=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finlayson, Annie</td>
<td>Blueskin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fitzgerald, Annie N</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fleming, Kate</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forbes, Johanna</td>
<td>Otatua</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forsyth, Katie</td>
<td>Tokomairiro</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraser, Catherine J</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frederic, Isabella</td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fullerton, James A</td>
<td>Havelock Street, Riverton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>(aged 13) 4= merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fullerton, Mina</td>
<td>Riverton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galloway, Georgina</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galloway, Mary D M</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>6 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1 (99%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1 (83%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gellatly, Jane C</td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gibb, William</td>
<td>Port Chalmers</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilkinson, Effie</td>
<td>St Andrew's, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilkinson, Norah</td>
<td>St Andrew's, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilkinson, Robert</td>
<td>Manor Place, Dunedin</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gillanders, A</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gillanders, Isabella</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilmour, E</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilmour, Jessie D</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilmour, J (Gilmore?)</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>6 (77%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6 (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilmour, Robert</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilmour, Robert (Gilmore?)</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldberg, J</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goodwin, Georgina</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gray, Thomas</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>7 (84%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grigor, Janet</td>
<td>Stirling, Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grigor, Jessie</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grigor, Margaret B</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grigor, Mary F</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grigor, Robert R</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2 (92%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guardiola, O</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gunn, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Ettrick</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagen, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hain, Christine</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton, Martha M</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2 (84%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvie, Mary</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Henderson, Christina</td>
<td>Stirling</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heron, Margaret</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>(aged 16), merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houston, Helen</td>
<td>Hampden</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howes, Emily</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4 (71%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2 (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1 (97%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1 (97%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howes, George</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1 (86%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>5 (84%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1 (85%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howes, Maggie</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4 (79%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howes, Willie</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunter, Annie</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunter, C.J.</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunter, Katie</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hush, Maggie</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>6 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hutton, Jean L</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3 (81%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hutton, Lena</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huxtable, Robert B</td>
<td>St Paul's, Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inglis, James S</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irwin, George</td>
<td>Wyndham</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jack, Elizabeth</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jack, Jessie</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>5 (69%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jackson, George G</td>
<td>Waiareka</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaggers, Annie E M</td>
<td>First Church,</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>5=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaggers, Charlotte</td>
<td>First Church,</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaggers, Emily F</td>
<td>First Church,</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2= (92%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamieson, Jane</td>
<td>St Paul's,</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamieson, Lizzie</td>
<td>St Paul's,</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>8 (73%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnston, Annie</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnston, William</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3 (74%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5 (87%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4 (92%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jowett, Gertrude J</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kidd, Herbert</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>8= (83%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3= (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6= (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kidd, Maria</td>
<td>Tapanui</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirk, Agnes</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laing, Minnie</td>
<td>Kaikorai</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landels, E</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lea, Albert G</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3= (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lea, Mary</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lea, William</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ledlie, Samuel (Laidie?)</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ledlie, Sarah J</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4 (74%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3= (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6= (77%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liddell, Ada</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lindsay, Alexander</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2 (95%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little, Alice</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little, Bessie</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan, Helen</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan, Marion</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logan, Minnie</td>
<td>St Andrew's, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowden, Mary</td>
<td>Walton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowe, Jeannie</td>
<td>St Andrew's, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAdie, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>special award</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1= (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2= (92%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2 (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3= (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAdie, Isabella</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>6 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>5 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>5 (90%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAdie, Jessie</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAllister, Helen</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAllister, Isabella</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>6 (67%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAllister, James</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAuley, James</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAuslin, Elizabeth</td>
<td>St Paul's, Oamaru</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McCallum, Jessie</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McCaw, W. Armstrong</td>
<td>Glenore, Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>(aged 18)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McDiarmid, James</td>
<td>St Paul's, Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McDonald, Donald</td>
<td>Palmerston</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>7 (66%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McDonald, Jane</td>
<td>South Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McDonald, Janet</td>
<td>Eglinton, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McDonald, Jeannie</td>
<td>South Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McFarlane, Agnes</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6 (87%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McFarlane, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2 (76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McFarlane, Isaac</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McFarlane, J</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McGregor, Agnes C S</td>
<td>Columba Manse, Oamaru</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MacGregor, Charlotte E</td>
<td>Oamaru</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>prize</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McGregor, Grace E</td>
<td>Columba Manse, Oamaru</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McGregor, Katherine M</td>
<td>Columba Manse, Oamaru</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McGregor, Margaret</td>
<td>Columba Manse, Oamaru</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McGregor, M</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McHutcheson, Blanche</td>
<td>Riverton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenzie, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Blueskin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLandress, Isabella</td>
<td>First Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLandress, Jessie H</td>
<td>First Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLaren, Isabella</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLaren, John</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLaren, Marjorie R</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1 (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLean, Maggie</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLennan, J</td>
<td>Maheno</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLeod, Bella H</td>
<td>First Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNally, David</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNally, Martha</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNaught, Thomas</td>
<td>St Paul's, Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNeill, Margaret</td>
<td>Walton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNeilly, David</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McPhaill, Janet</td>
<td>Wyndham</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>5 (81%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>7 (76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marshall, Annie</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matheson, Henry</td>
<td>Otepopo</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1885 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matheson, Mary</td>
<td>Kaikorai</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mawson, David M</td>
<td>Port Chalmers</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examinations</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mawson, Hannah</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2= (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>5= (83%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mawson, William</td>
<td>Port Chalmers</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>7= (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2 (97%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1 (94%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Menzies, F L</td>
<td>Wyndham</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milburn, Mary</td>
<td>Walton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milburn, Philip</td>
<td>Walton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milligan, R</td>
<td>Waiareka</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1 (99%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milne, Christina</td>
<td>Palmerston</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milner, Sarah</td>
<td>Park Farm, North Taieri</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2= (85%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1= (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>3= (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchell, Andrew</td>
<td>Opoho, Dunedin</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>(aged 16) merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchell, Annie E</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>4= (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>5 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchell, F.W.</td>
<td>Dunedin</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>6'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchell, William L</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moir, Janet H</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>9 (71%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moir, Maggie</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moir, Maria</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moir, Mary Ann</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moir, Sarah</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morgan, Mary Ann</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1893 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morgan, Mary Jane</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3 (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morrison, Mary</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murray, Elizabeth</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murray, Henry E</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neave, Jane</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neave, Florence</td>
<td>Riverton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neave, Thomas</td>
<td>Riverton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neill, George</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nichol, John B</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nimmo, E P</td>
<td>St Andrew's, Dunedin</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oliver, Elizabeth</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oughton, Jane</td>
<td>North Taieri</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Park, Lizzie</td>
<td>Caversham</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Park, Madeline</td>
<td>Caversham</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parlane, James</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paterson, Thomas</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4 (81%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percy, Donald</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralston, Agnes</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralston, Annie</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralston, Elizabeth M</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2 (76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6 (86%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>7 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>7 (90%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralston, James</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralston, Jane G</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralston, Janet (Jessie) H</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4 (79%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1 (96%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1 (medal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1 (97%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>6 (76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralston, Mary</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rattray, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rattray, William</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redpath, George</td>
<td>Waitahuna</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, Allan G</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, Charlotte</td>
<td>North Taieri</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, Frances</td>
<td>North Taieri</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>2=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, James G</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, Minnie</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renton, J</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renton, R</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renton, William</td>
<td>Stirling</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richings, Grant</td>
<td>Outram, West Taieri</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodie, Jane</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose, John</td>
<td>Patrick Street, Dunedin</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ross, Agnes</td>
<td>Otepopo/Herbert</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4= (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ross, Agnes J</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ross, Donald S</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2= (84%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ross, Donald</td>
<td>Palmerston</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ross, Helen</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ross, Maggie Rose</td>
<td>North East Valley</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(formerly of Tapanui)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russell, Anna</td>
<td>Ravensbourne</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salmond, Lucy</td>
<td>First Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sangster, Janet A</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sangster, Lewis</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott, James</td>
<td>Walker Avenue, Dunedin</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott, Jemima</td>
<td>Wyndham</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scoular, Ellen S</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2= (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4= (81%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>4= (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scoular, Maggie</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scoular, T</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1888 Essay</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sievwright, James D</td>
<td>Clutha Leader Office, Balclutha</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>(aged 18) 4=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sloan, J</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith, Nellie</td>
<td>Port Chalmers</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2 (72%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somerville, M D</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1886 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spence, Andrew</td>
<td>&quot;Williamsburgh&quot;, Mornington</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1884 Essay</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1886 Essay</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3= (71%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spence, Bessie</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stables, A W</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stables, Lily</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steele, Marion</td>
<td>&quot;The Nook&quot;, Queen Street North, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1= (aged 162) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stewart, Annie</td>
<td>Anderson's Bay</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strang, Eva</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sutherland, Bella</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3 (89%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5 (92%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sutherland, Maggie</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swanson, Ina</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swap, Mary</td>
<td>Otautau</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1883 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tait, Jeanie S</td>
<td>Port Chalmers</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2 (93%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tait, William</td>
<td>Port Chalmers</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2 (95%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thom, Annie</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomson, Caroline J</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomson, Frank</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>7 (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thompson, Alexander</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thompson, Ida</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tippet, Phillipa</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tippet, Susan</td>
<td>Blue Spur</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Todd, James H</td>
<td>Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twemlow, Emily S</td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1882 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walker, Annie</td>
<td>Winton</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walker, John</td>
<td>Milton</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1883 Essay</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watson, Jane G</td>
<td>Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1881 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilkins, Nellie</td>
<td>First Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1887 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>5 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilkinson, Elizabeth</td>
<td>First Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson, A</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>1882 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson, Agnes</td>
<td>Otautau</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson, Agnes O</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Essay</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Exam/Essay</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Placing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson, Janet</td>
<td>Mornington</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1889 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1890 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson, Walter</td>
<td>Oamaru</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1888 Examination</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyse, Charles</td>
<td>St Paul's, Invercargill</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>1891 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>6 (77%) merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1892 Examination</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young, Elizabeth</td>
<td>Balclutha</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1884 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>merit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1885 Examination</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix B  Subjects of Study: Presbyterian Synod Bible and Church History Class Examination and Essay Competitions, Otago and Southland, 1884-1893

Source
Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland. 1884-1893: Appendices. Reports of the Committee on Bible and Church History Classes. Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

1884
Examinations
Junior Section  The Life of Moses (Rev. Jos. Iverach, MA)
Senior Section  Genesis (Rev. Marcus Dods, DD) ch 1-20, exclusive of introduction

Essays
Junior Section  Joshua
Senior Section  Why am I a Presbyterian?

1885
Examinations
Junior Section  Genesis xxv - 1 (Dod's Handbook)
Senior Section  The Gospel of Mark (Professor Lindsay's Primer)

Essays
Junior Section  Elijah
Senior Section  The English Reformation

1886
Examinations
Section A  Acts of the Apostles, ch 1-12 of Professor Lindsay's Primer, without introduction
Section B  Lindsay's Primer, with introduction
Section C  Acts of the Apostles, introduction and first 12 chapters of Professor Lindsay's Handbook for Bible Classes
### Essays

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>John the Baptist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Christ's ministry in Galilee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>John Bunyan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1887 Examinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>a) The first 28 questions of the Shorter Catechism, without proofs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Acts of the Apostles, second part (xiii-xxi), in Professor Lindsay's Primer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>a) The first 28 questions of the Shorter Catechism, without proofs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Professor Lindsay's Primer, second part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>a) The first 28 questions of the Shorter Catechism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Acts of the Apostles, second part in Professor Lindsay's Handbook, exclusive of introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>a) The first 28 questions of the Shorter Catechism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Acts of the Apostles, second part in Professor Lindsay's Handbook, with introduction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Essays

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Word Limit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Joseph</td>
<td>Not more than 5,000 words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>John Wycliffe</td>
<td>Not more than 7,500 words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>The Scottish Reformation</td>
<td>Not more than 10,000 words</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1888 Examinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>a) Shorter Catechism, questions 29-62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Thomson's <em>David</em> (in Salmond's series), ch 1-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>a) Shorter Catechism, questions 29-62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Thomson's <em>David</em>, the whole book</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>a) Shorter Catechism, questions 29-62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) <em>The Church</em> Binnie's Handbook to page 82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>a) Shorter Catechism questions 29-62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) <em>The Church</em>, Binnie's Handbook to page 110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Essays

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Word Limit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Daniel</td>
<td>Not more than 2,500 words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Aaron</td>
<td>Not more than 5,000 words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>The Sabbath</td>
<td>Not more than 7,500 words</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1889 Examinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>a) Shorter Catechism, questions 63-83 inclusive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Luke's Gospel - Primer, Part I (text only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>a) Shorter Catechism, questions 63-83 inclusive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Luke's Gospel - Primer, Part I (with notes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>a) Shorter Catechism, questions 63-83 inclusive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Feeding the Lambs**

**Section D**
- a) Shorter Catechism, questions 63-83 inclusive

**Essays**
- Section A: Abraham
- Section B: Samuel
- Section C: The Covenanters

**1890 Examinations**
- Section A
  - a) Shorter Catechism, questions 84 to end
  - b) Luke's Gospel - Lindsay's Primer, Part II (ch xiii to end). Text only
- Section B
  - a) Shorter Catechism, questions 84 to end
  - b) Luke's Gospel - Lindsay's Primer, Part II (with notes)
- Section C
  - a) Shorter Catechism, questions 84 to end
- Section D: Same as for Section C

**Essays**
- Section A: Elisha
- Section B: Jacob
- Section C: The last week of the life of Christ

**1891 Examinations**
- Section A
  - a) Shorter Catechism, questions 1-38
  - b) *Joshua* (text only)
- Section B
  - a) Shorter Catechism, questions 1-38
  - b) *Joshua* (Bible Class Primer)
- Sections C and D
  - a) Shorter Catechism, questions 1-38
  - b) *Joshua* (Douglas Handbook)

**Essays**
- Section A: The Life of Jonathan
- Section B: The Life of the Apostle John
- Section C: The History of the English Bible

**1892 Examinations**
- For all Sections
  - a) Salmond's *Life of Christ*
  - b) Shorter Catechism, questions 39-62

**Essays**
- Section A: The Life of Daniel
- Section B: The Life of Paul
Section C  The Life of Dr Livingston

Appendix C  Bible and Church History Class Examination Papers, 1886 and 1888

Source

*Proceedings of the Synod of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland.* 1886-1889: Appendices. Reports of the Committee on Bible and Church History Classes. Hewitson Library, Knox College, Dunedin.

Examination Papers for 1886

**Section A  Junior Division, No 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Christ's last command to his Apostles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>His promise to them personally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>His prediction regarding their work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>II</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The occasion which led to the appointment of a new Apostle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The duty he was required to fulfil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The qualification necessary for it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The mode of appointment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What is meant by the Jews of the Diaspora</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The number of Jews present in Jerusalem at the Passover in the time of Nero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The nationalities represented by the Jews present in Jerusalem on the Day of Pentecost, when the Holy Spirit was bestowed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IV</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The circumstances which led to the arrest of Peter and John</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The persons who assembled to judge them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The decision to which they came</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| V   | Name the cities round about Jerusalem from which sick people were probably brought to be healed by the Apostles |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VI</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What led to the appointment of assistants to the Apostles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>How many were elected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Their proper names</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>By whom they were selected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>How they were set apart to office</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VII</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What Jews excited persecution against Stephen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The charges brought against him</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VIII State
1. The behaviour of Stephen before his martyrdom
2. The conduct of the multitude
3. The mode in which Stephen was put to death
4. The name of the onlooker, and
5. The circumstances of Stephen's burial

IX State
1. The name of a sorcerer who was baptised, and where
2. His previous conduct
3. The offer he made to the Apostles, and
4. The rebuke given him by Peter

X State
1. Where Saul was converted
2. Why he went there
3. In what state he was for three days afterwards
4. By whom he was delivered from it
5. The danger to which he was there exposed
6. The mode of his escaping it

XI State
1. What led to Peter's first preaching to the Gentiles
2. Where did he do so
3. With what result

XII Relate the circumstances of Peter's imprisonment and deliverance

Section B  Junior Division, No 2
(Questions I to VI as for Junior Division, No 1)

VII Relate the circumstances of Stephen's martyrdom and burial

VIII Relate the history of a certain sorcerer whose name is used to designate a certain crime

IX How was Peter led to preach to the Gentiles? Relate the circumstances.

X State what is known from the Scripture of Luke's history

XI State the various stories or incidents recorded in the first twelve chapters of the Acts which formed historical crises of the Christian Church, and the results of each of them

XII Give the dates of the following events:
1. The Martyrdom of Stephen
2. The Martyrdom of James
3. The Famine in Jerusalem
4. Expulsion of the Jews from Rome
Section C  Senior Division, No 3

I  Give a brief history of the writer of the Acts of the Apostles, and show reasons for believing him to be the author of the Third Gospel

II  State the various recorded appearances of Christ after His resurrection, and detail the circumstances of each

III  Describe the condition of the Jews of the Diaspora in their various countries, and the modes in which their connection with Jerusalem was maintained

IV  State the number, functions and constitution of the Sanhedrin

V  Give an account of the revolt of Judas of Galilee

VI  Give a brief account of Stephen's defence before the Sanhedrin, and show how it was adapted to rebut the charges brought against him

VII  Relate the history of the Ethiopian Eunuch

VIII  Give an account of the journeys of Peter, with the circumstances of each

IX  Relate the history of Saul at Damascus

X  State what is recorded of the history of Barnabas in the first twelve chapters of the Acts

XI  Give an account of the origin and progress of the Church at Antioch

XII  State the leading events of the second persecution under Herod Agrippa I, and the circumstances of his own death

Section D  Additional Questions for Senior Division, No 4

I  State what you know of
   1  The Pharisees
   2  The Sadducees
   3  The Scribes
   4  The Essenes

II  State
   1  What was the special function of the Apostles
   2  The occasion which led to the appointment of the Seven
   3  The first official name applied to the latter
   4  Other names applied to them
III  Give examples to prove that the advance of the Christian Church was brought about, not by the impulse of the disciples, but by Divine guidance.

IV  Give illustrations to show the special prominence given in the Acts to the dispensation of the Holy Ghost.

Examination Papers for 1888

Section A  Candidates under 14 years of age

Shorter Catechism, Questions 29-62.
Time  1 hour
Examiner  J Reid, Esq

Division I
Write the answers to the questions:
a  What is Sanctification?
b  What is forbidden in the First Commandment?
c  How is the Sabbath to be sanctified?

Division II
Write out the answer that states:
a  What great thing Faith does for us.
b  That the souls of those who die in Christ are at once with Him.
c  That the Christian Sabbath dates from the Resurrection of Christ.

Division III
Explain what is meant by:
a  "Renewing our wills".
b  "Act of God's free Grace".
c  "God's sovereignty over us".

Bible History
The Life of David. Thomson's Primer, ch 1-5.
Time  2 hours
Examiner  J Reid, Esq

1  For what reasons was Saul rejected by God as King of Israel?

2  Why did Samuel choose David, the youngest of the sons of Jesse, and not Eliab, the eldest?

3  What recommendation did Saul's servants give concerning David when he first came to Saul's Court?

4  What made Saul jealous of David?

5  What covenant did Jonathan make with David?
6 Give an account of Jonathan's last interview with David.

7 Name in order the places at which David sought either help or refuge during his flight from Saul.

8 On what occasions during the same flight was David guided by the answers he received through the priestly oracle?

9 Give an account of the revenge that David took on the Amalekites for burning Ziklag.

10 How did each of these men come by their death - Saul, Asahel, Abner, Ishboseth?

Section B  Candidates 14 and under 18 years of age

Shorter Catechism
Time  1 hour
Examiner  J Reid, Esq

Division I
Write the answers to the questions:
 a  What is Sanctification?
 b  What is forbidden in the First Commandment?
 c  How is the Sabbath to be sanctified?

Division II
Write out the answer that states:
 a  What great thing Faith does for us.
 b  That the souls of those who die in Christ are at once with Him.
 c  That the Christian Sabbath dates from the Resurrection of Christ.

Division III
 a  What is meant by "Privileges of the Sons of God"?
 b  In what ways are Sanctification and Justification related to each other?
 c  Why is it necessary for us to give heed to the Second Commandment?

Bible History
The Life of David. Thomson's Primer.
Time  2 hours
Examiner  J Reid, Esq

1 Why was Saul's raid against David unsuccessful:
   a  at Keilah?
   b  at Maon?
   c  at Hachilah?

2 What considerations induced the Elders of Judah to choose David as their King?
3 What was David's lament over the death of Abner?

4 Give an account of the removal of the Ark from the house of Obed-Edom to God's holy hill of Zion.

5 What were the causes of the rebellion under Absalom:  
   a on Absalom's own part?  
   b on the part of the people?

6 In what way did David fulfil his oath of friendship to Jonathan?

7 State how Hushai defeated the counsels of Ahithophel.

8 Say what you know of the character of Joab.

9 What part did David take in regard to the building of the Temple?

10 What were the weak and what the strong points in David's character?

Section C    Candidates 18 years and upwards

Section A    Candidates under 14 years of age

Shorter Catechism

Time    Three-quarters of an hour allowed for the First Part of this Paper.
Examiner  Professor Dunlop

1 What is Justification?

2 What is Adoption?

3 What is the preface to the Ten Commandments?

4 How is the Sabbath to be sanctified?

5 What is the meritorious ground and what the condition of Justification?

6 When do we become the sons of God in the Scriptural sense of the word?

7 What is the motive of all holy obedience?

8 Explain by examples what is meant by works of Necessity and Mercy.

The Church, Binnie, pages 1-28.

Time    Two hours and a quarter allowed for this part of the paper.
Examiner  Professor Dunlop
1 Specify the notes or marks of a true Church of Christ conceived as a visible society.

2 Why is the Catholic Church properly so called said to be Invisible?

3 In what two respects is Christ the head of the Church? State briefly what is included under each of these aspects of Christ's Headship.

4 In what sense is the Church a voluntary association, and in what sense is it not so?

5 What is the chief end of the Church? Specify some of the constituent parts of this supreme end.

6 Explain what is meant by the Means of Grace, and enumerate the principal agencies included in the Means of Grace.

7 Among Christian Ordinances or the Means of Grace, which is the most important, and why?

8 Point out the distinction between the two questions "For whom is the Lord's Supper intended?" and "Who are to be admitted to the Lord's Table?"

Section D

Additional Questions on "The Church", Binnie, pages 1-110.

Time One and a half hours allowed for this paper.

Examiner Professor Dunlop

1 What is the leading Scriptural principle regulative of the Ordinance of Public Prayer, and how may it be violated?

2 Explain the distinction between Liturgical and Free Prayers, and give the reasons which have induced English-speaking Presbyterians to give up the use of the former.

3 Give a historical account of the authorship of "The Book of Common Order" and its use in the Scotch Kirk.

4 What are the two classes of compositions used in the service of praise, and which is the most important?

5 If Singing ought to be Congregational, what does this imply as to the Music? Has the propriety of Congregational Singing ever been questioned and, if so, on what grounds?

6 Give the main Scriptural directions bearing on Christian giving.

7 In what respect does evil doing become the proper object of Church Discipline?

8 Why is the observance of the Sabbath obligatory for Christians?