PROTECTION OF AUTHOR’S COPYRIGHT

This copy has been supplied by the Library of the University of Otago on the understanding that the following conditions will be observed:

1. To comply with s56 of the Copyright Act 1994 [NZ], this thesis copy must only be used for the purposes of research or private study.

2. The author's permission must be obtained before any material in the thesis is reproduced, unless such reproduction falls within the fair dealing guidelines of the Copyright Act 1994. Due acknowledgement must be made to the author in any citation.

3. No further copies may be made without the permission of the Librarian of the University of Otago.
Men and Masqueraders:

Louise Pearman.

A thesis submitted for the degree
Master of Arts
at the University of Otago
New Zealand
29th February 2008.
Dedication.

This thesis is dedicated, in loving memory, to Glen Galt, 17\textsuperscript{th} May 1947 - 16\textsuperscript{th} March 2008, who will be remembered for his strength, humour, support and love of the cases contained in this thesis.
Abstract

This thesis contributes to the study of New Zealand historiography and gender historiography by examining female-to-male cross-gender identity and behaviour between 1906 and 1950. The primary source material is New Zealand media, specifically the New Zealand Truth newspaper. Sexological theories of the early twentieth century create a framework for reflection on language and ideas present in the New Zealand media. I will show, using both Foucauldian and feminist discourse analysis, the complex and discontinuous history of cross-gender identity and behaviour in New Zealand.
Acknowledgements.

A number of people have been integral to helping me complete my thesis.

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr Chris Brickell, whose patience, intelligence, insightful comments, and guidance has made the whole process more enjoyable. The enthusiasm for his own work is instantly contagious and I feel privileged to have him as my supervisor.

Many thanks goes to Dr Jenny Bryant-Tokalau, Dr Annabel Cooper, Dr Rebecca Stringer and Dr Cyril Schafer, in the Anthropology, Gender Studies and Sociology department who have employed me and have helped out with support, chats and resources.

Thanks to the Hocken Library Staff who have helped when microfilm machines have broken down and to the Anthropology, Gender Studies and Sociology Department for assistance with resources.

My parents, Geoff and Jan Pearman, have helped out financially over the last few years, and from an early age they encouraged me to go to university.

Finally, thanks to many friends and family, and people I have shared offices with who have helped keep me sane throughout the writing process. Special mention to Phil Gilies, Shelley Taylor, Casimir Macgregor, Glen Galt, and Nene and Allan Gilies.

Special thanks to Brett Rogers who has always been there and believed in me and Lucy Gregory for lamenting with me when we have both been working over weekends and for proof reading my footnotes and bibliography.
Table of Contents

Abstract i
Acknowledgements ii
Table of Contents iii
List of Illustrations vi

Introduction 1

Language and Terms 1
The Research Context and Theoretical Approach 2
Chapter Outlines 5

Chapter One: Discourse Analysis, The Sexological Framework and Contemporary New Zealand Research 8

Discourse Analysis 9
Foucauldian Discourse Analysis 9
Feminist Usage of Discourse Analysis 11
Sexologists 12
Westphal 12
Krafft-Ebing 15
Hirschfeld 18
Ellis 23
Henry 25
Cauldwell 27
Sexological Discourse 30
Contemporary New Zealand Research 31
Laurie Glamuzina Coleman Conclusion

Chapter Two: The Masqueraders

William/Bill Edwards and

Other Less Prominent Cases Pre-Bertha.

'Boy' Bertha
Amy Bock
Henrietta Agnes Berland
Annie Read/Thomas Parkes
Small Cases After 1914
Deresley Morton/Peter Stratford
Conclusion

Chapter Three: The Men

World War One
Less Prominent Cases in the Mid-1930s
Mary/Mark Weston
Zdenke Koubkova
Sexology and Science in the Print Media
Surgery, Science and Cross-gendered Individuals
Peter Alexander
Mr X
Conclusion

Chapter Four: The New Zealand Cross-gendered Landscape

Peter Alexander and Foucauldian Theory
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inconsistency and Dislocation</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers' Reporting Patterns</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Bock, New Zealand's Anti-Hero</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexology and Medicine</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anatomy, Surgery and Cross-gendered Identity</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflections on the New Zealand Research Context</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Alexander, the Exception?</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual History of Cross-gendered Identity and/or Behaviour</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engagement with Gender Historiography</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding Comments</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conclusion: Future Investigations** 134

**Bibliography** 140
# List of Figures.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 'Boy' Bertha</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Amy Bock in the Dock of the Dunedin City Police Court</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Amy Bock</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Amy Bock, The Female Bridegroom I</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Amy Bock, The Female Bridegroom II</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Amy Bock, After Seven Whiskies</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Deresley Morton/Peter Stratford</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Stratford's wife Mrs. Rowland Disillusioned</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 The Marriage Certificate of P. Stratford and E. Rowland</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Mary/Mark Weston</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Zdenke Koubkova</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Anna John Budd</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Peter Alexander Shaving</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Peter Alexander on a Motorcycle</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Peter Alexander and Friend</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 New Zealand's Medical Wonder Enjoys a Pipe</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Peter Posed for Truth</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Peter Alexander with Miss Jean Traylor</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

'Masqueraded as a man... New Zealand woman becomes a man...
How the Secret was Revealed.'

These phrases are illustrative of headlines and articles that appeared in the New Zealand Truth about female-to-male cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour during the first half of the twentieth century. The figure of Amy Bock is well-known in the canon of New Zealand history but the question is: was Amy Bock the only cross-gendered individual in early New Zealand? The female-to-male cross-gendered figure has largely been ignored in recent New Zealand gender history. My thesis centres on female-to-male cross-gendered individuals who appeared in the Truth newspaper. I will explore the narrative and discourse of the cross-gendered figure and trace how sexological theory impacted on self-narrative and media accounts. Whether the individual lived as man, was reported as behaving as a man, or whether the identity was uncertain, I will address and explore various modes of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour in New Zealand between 1906 and 1950.

Language and Terms

An explanation of the terms and language used in my thesis is required to facilitate ease of reading. There is some debate on whether the term 'sex' or 'gender' should be used in historiography.¹ I acknowledge the term 'gender' was not used until the 1960s; though I believe that in the framework of my thesis it is useful as I am discussing both the legal and medical definitions of sex as well as the social ramifications of individuals narratives and their perceived sex and/or gender. Therefore, I will use the term 'gender' in the discussion of social/cultural ideas and individual behaviour, following the conventions of other scholars in the field of gender historiography.² However, if the primary sources use the term 'sex' so will I, otherwise the term sex will only be used in

conjunction to intercourse and sexual reproduction, and scientific constructions of biological sex.

I intend to use the term 'cross-gender' as the descriptive term for individuals in my thesis. The term 'cross-gender' has been used by a number of scholars to describe people in history who have crossed gender/sex boundaries. It has become the most widely acknowledged means of describing individuals who challenge social norms of sex and/or gender. Although problematic in terms of historical accuracy, it is the term that allows for a wide understanding and broad encompassing ideas of cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

I separate 'identity' from 'behaviour' in my thesis. I have not assumed that behaviour detailed by the media as crossing gender norms necessarily meant the individual identified as male or cross-gendered. Nor will I make assumptions on an individual's behaviour and place them in an identity category. Identity in itself is problematic when examining historical sources, and therefore I am careful in my use of pronouns. When a person self-identifies as a man/male, I will use male pronouns. If they identified as female/woman for a time then I will revert to female pronouns. When identity is ambiguous, I will use both female and male pronouns. Throughout my thesis there are places where the judicial court, medical and sexological figures may use different pronouns than were used by the cross-gendered individual. I will acknowledge and discuss these differing views of sex and/or gender, but will always default to self-identification if it is known.

The Research Context and Theoretical Approach

The lack of existing research and literature examining the female-to-male cross-gendered figure is the prime motivation for this thesis. In the last ten years, as queer theory started to challenge dichotomous constructions of sexuality, research on cross-gendered

---

identity and behaviour has increased. From queer theory and cultural studies emerged 'Trans-studies', an academic discipline challenging binary constructions of gender and/or sex. Trans-studies, along with queer theory, has led to a reframing and questioning of knowledge on sex, sexuality and gender and to more complex accounts of cross-gendered identities and behaviour in history. An academic environment is emerging where multiple discourses of sex and/or gender are explored and individual complexities highlighted.

My theoretical and methodological approach is primarily informed by Foucauldian discourse analysis and its intersections with feminist theory. Chapter One includes an explanation of the tenets of Foucauldian discourse analysis and how feminist theory's usage of discourse analysis pertains to my thesis. I will indicate throughout Chapters One, Two and Three how various discourses that emerged from both sexology and newspaper reports. Chapter Four will extrapolate the discursive themes and disjunctions present in my thesis. Throughout my thesis two ideas will become evident. Firstly, the case studies were complex and multiple narratives were contained in almost every article published on cross-gendered identity and behaviour in the Truth newspaper. Secondly, I will argue that the role of the researcher is to highlight and unpack these multiple discourses. This means a complex historiography based on contradictions and the multiple discursive elements of history is developed.

My primary research material is the New Zealand Truth, which was first printed in New Zealand in 1906.4 The period 1906 to 1950 is important in cross-gendered history. Sexologists were cataloguing the experiences of cross-gendered individuals in the early twentieth century. 'Sex change' operations were performed throughout the early twentieth century, though it was not until the 1930s, with increased sophistication of medicine and science, that the discourse of 'sex changes' entered the public realm. In 1949, the term 'transexual' was first used in a sexological journal, and in 1952 Christine Jorgenson received widespread media attention as the American GI who

4 John Norton, who was involved in the publishing the Sydney Truth, initially published the New Zealand Truth. In the early years of the Truth in New Zealand there were numerous articles written by John Norton and a strong link developed between to the two newspapers.
became a Blonde Bombshell. The international impact of Jorgenson's 'sex change' influenced the media and social discourse of cross-gendered individuals. Christine Jorgenson became a landmark figure in cross-gendered history and historians have cited Jorgenson as a turning point in cross-gendered historiography. Historians, among them Joanne Meyerowitz, have used the terms, pre-Jorgenson and post-Jorgenson, to separate the cross-gendered canon. My research is 'pre-Jorgenson', though I will question the influence Jorgenson had in New Zealand in my conclusion.

The Truth had a wide readership throughout my research period and often printed stories of social misdemeanours, scandal and court cases. Therefore, the Truth is a rich resource of stories on sexuality, gender and/or sex in New Zealand. Transgressions were the main reason cross-gendered people appeared in the Truth. Whether criminal or social misbehaviour, the Truth drew upon numerous sources in the compilation of their articles. There were often detailed accounts of court trials, as well as interviews with the person and related individuals. However, it is important to note the Truth did not publish all details of cross-gendered cases and scholars of sexuality note that the Truth either left out or censored details. For example, there was no information as to how sex was medically confirmed and, from the 1930s onwards, what methods constituted a medical sex change. The Truth only ever alluded to details of medical examinations and treatment on cross-gendered individuals. Because of the Truth's sensationalist nature, only those cases that transgressed social norms or those considered 'good press' were reported. Therefore, one of the limits of this thesis is the medium; nonetheless, the number of cases that appeared in the print media is an indication of the body of knowledge on cross-gendered people and/or behaviour. Once a case appeared in the Truth, I searched other New Zealand daily newspapers for similar reports, thereby giving a wider context to accounts of cross-gendered identity and behaviour in New Zealand.

5 Meyerowitz, Popular Press and Meyerowitz, Sex Changes.
6 Meyerowitz, Sex Changes.
7 Daley, C., 'Puritans and Pleasure Seekers', in A. Kirkman and P. Moloney, eds., Sexuality Down Under: Social and Historical Perspectives, Dunedin, 2005, pp.47–62. Daley stated 'by the late 1920s its print run was almost 100,000 copies a week'.
Sexology and, later, medicine and science, had a large impact on the discourse associated with cross-gendered identity and behaviour. There were clear indications of sexological ideology slipping into the media consciousness and this increased as the years progressed. Sexological discourse on cross-gendered individuals was more complex than the popular account of a ‘wrong body’ discourse, the idea of an individual born into a body different from their identity. My thesis will illustrate how cross-gendered individuals actively negotiated and used ideas circulating in sexology. I will show that cross-gendered individuals had more ‘treatment’ options available as years progressed and science and medicine became more advanced. The examination of sexological ideas maps out the range of theories and methods available to cross-gendered individuals, and is useful in unpacking the multiple discourses that appeared both in the Truth and in individual narratives.

Chapter Outlines

The following chapters contain case studies of the prominent articles relating to cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour that emerged between 1906 and 1950. Chapter One contains three sections, an overview of Foucauldian discourse analysis, an examination of the work of five major sexologists and an analysis of current New Zealand research on cross-gendered individuals. Together the three sections form a theoretical framework for the examination of case studies contained in Chapter Two and Three. Discourse analysis is discussed to show how Foucauldian analysis lends itself to the study of cross-gendered identification. Feminist usage of discourse analysis will also be examined as the feminist enquiries into the historical construction of the category ‘women’ contribute to the broader framework of cross-gendered research. The second section is an overview of six major sexologists of the early to mid-twentieth century with two exceptions. The work of the nineteenth century psychiatrist Carl Westphal and sexologist Richard von Krafft-Ebing is included, due to the impact their research had on framing future sexological theory. The sexological theories of Magnus Hirschfeld, Havelock Ellis, George Henry and David Cauldwell form the rest of the sexological investigation. The sexologists are chosen for their impact on cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour and I will refer to their theories throughout my thesis.
Section three of Chapter One contains an overview of current New Zealand research that has included cross-gendered individuals. The work of Alison Laurie, Julie Glamuzina and Jenny Coleman is overviewed and placed in the context of cross-gendered research. Chapter One gives a structure to my thesis, as it will help form a picture of cross-gendered identity and behaviour in New Zealand.

Chapter Two, ‘The Masqueraders’, centres on cases from 1906 to 1929. The predominant theme in these years was women masquerading as men. I have chosen not to use Amy Bock as a central case study, preferring to focus on cases that have had less academic attention. I will, however, examine Bock’s narrative in regard to the themes that emerged in New Zealand cross-gendered history. The impact of Amy Bock’s actions is briefly examined as a way to explain the dominant and recurring headline of ‘Another Amy Bock’. The two main cases I give close analysis will be ‘Boy’ Bertha and Annie Read/Thomas Parkes before moving to briefly examine the only case that appeared in the 1920s. I intend to outline the 1929 case of Deresley Morton, a New Zealander who died in California, before shifting focus to the period 1930-1950 in Chapter Three.

Chapter Three, ‘The Men’, examines the increased number of cases of cross-gendered identity and behaviour reported in the *Truth* between 1930 and 1950. The central theme of these articles changed from ‘masqueraders’ to ‘men’. Masqueraders referred to individuals who were ‘discovered’ to be women after living for a period as men as opposed to cross-gendered people who had medical and sexological treatment to live as men. This chapter will examine the international cases that appeared in the *Truth* and will turn to closely look at the story of Peter Alexander, dubbed by the *Truth* as New Zealand’s sex change miracle. The last case I give close attention to is Mr X, who was arrested in 1945 for breaches of the Marriage Act. I will highlight the medical and scientific discourses that emerged throughout the 1930s and 1940s as part of the entwining sexological and individual narrative. The complexities of both cases, Peter Alexander and Mr X, will be unpacked and emphasised.
Chapter Four, 'The Discursive Picture' will draw together the threads of the case studies and sexological theory to paint a picture of cross-gendered identity and behaviour in New Zealand. The individual narratives, sexological approaches, and the media formed a discursive landscape within which a range of people made sense of and negotiated cross-gendered identity and behaviour. This chapter draws out the themes, the exceptions and the intricacies of cross-gendered identity and behaviour in the New Zealand context. I conclude by placing my research alongside with current work in sexuality and gender historiography.
Chapter One: Discourse Analysis, The Sexological Framework and Contemporary New Zealand Research

The purpose of this thesis is to examine the way female-to-male cross-gendered individuals and behaviour were framed and discussed in New Zealand newspapers from 1906 to 1950. Therefore, it is important to create an analytical framework for the cases I will discuss in later chapters. There are three parts to the framework: Foucauldian discourse analysis, sexological theory and the New Zealand research context.

Foucauldian discourse analysis provides a way of reading text that highlights discrepancies and conjunctions in history. Feminist theorists have utilised discourse analysis to examine the classification of ‘women’ in history and these observations are drawn upon to further synthesise the usefulness of discourse analysis in the examination of cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

Sexological research has been an important historical tool for tracing theories and responses to cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour in the early twentieth century. In the last ten years a number of articles have attempted to re-read the sexologist’s works in order to highlight the existence of a cross-gendered discourse. 9 I have chosen six major sexologists who wrote between 1906 and 1950, and who are known for their influence in the field. My interest is in the sexologist’s theory and any female-to-male case studies they analysed in their texts. I will also highlight any theoretical shifts in sexological discourse during this time period. The sexologists are Carl Westphal, Richard von Krafft-Ebing, Magnus Hirschfeld, Havelock Ellis, George Henry and David Cauldwell.

In the third and final section of this chapter I will examine the work of Alison Laurie, Julie Glamuzina, and Jenny Coleman to form a knowledge base on current New Zealand concepts of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. The theoretical approaches of Laurie, Glamuzina and Coleman will be discussed and critiqued as a basis for further development of cross-gendered research in New Zealand.

Discourse Analysis

Discourse analysis is the main method of examination in my thesis. Newspapers are texts, and on that basis, I intend to examine the diverse narratives and language of cross-gendered individuals as they appeared in the media. The use of discourse analysis in this thesis centres on four theoretical presumptions. Firstly, using Foucauldian discourse analysis, I argue that words and meanings produce each other. Secondly an investigation into various discourses can highlight discontinuities in history, and, thirdly, the concept of reverse discourse needs to be re-examined in light of cross-gendered identity. Finally I will give an overview of feminist usage of discourse analysis.

Foucauldian Discourse Analysis

What is meant by discourse and how might Foucault’s approach be useful in the study of cross-gendered identity and behaviour? Discourse refers to a statement, phase, or set of words that appear in texts but it can also be applied to the study of images, theatre and art and the signs and signifiers related to words, images and behaviour. There are two main concepts involved in Foucauldian discourse analysis. Firstly, there is an awareness of the meanings attached to words, both as abstract ideas and concrete definitions. Secondly, the analyst is interested in how such explanations are reproduced and strengthened by social practices. Foucault did not see this as a one-way process. Instead, he suggested,

12 Foucault, *Archaeology*, pp.50-51.
The analysis of the discursive field is oriented in a quite different way; we must grasp the statement in the exact specificity of its occurrence; determine its conditions of existence, fix at least its limits, establish its correlations with other statements that may be connected with it, and show what forms of statement it excludes.\textsuperscript{13}

Discourse analysis, then, involves a succinct investigation of how disciplines such as medicine, sexology and science have integrated their ideas into wider discourses. Foucault theorised that this did not mean 'power' was automatically associated with domination but that power was multifaceted and exercised from numerous points.\textsuperscript{14} Some scholars have assumed the hegemonic power of medicine, science and sexology in individual's lives. However, a discourse analytic approach highlights individual negotiations of power. An awareness of cross-gendered individuals' active negotiations with sexology, medicine and science leads to a complex history of cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

History has often been conceived as a linear progression of ideas, theories, and 'truths'. Foucault disputed this understanding and suggested discourse analysis as a means to examine the emergence of multiple themes, ideas and language, that don't necessarily play out in a linear way. The integration of discourse analysis with the idea of a discontinuous history has allowed for perplexing, entangled and possibly paradoxical narratives and ideas to sit within a similar historical era.\textsuperscript{15} The discourse of cross-gendered identity was not a linear progression of ideas. Discourse analysis is useful in the examination of ideas and language that surround cross-gendered identity and behaviour in sexology, science and medicine. Throughout my thesis I will highlight particular discourses as they arise.

Foucault also theorised that despite disruptions in history by multiple discourses, certain patterns would still become apparent. One pattern that emerged was 'reverse discourse'. Foucault used this term to explain the counter dialogue that appeared in

\textsuperscript{13} Foucault, \textit{Archaeology}, pp.30-31.
\textsuperscript{15} Foucault, \textit{Archaeology}, p.84.
opposition to the nineteenth century medical construction of homosexuality.Reverse discourse was conceived as 'homosexuality['s] desire to be acknowledged often in the same vocabulary, using the same categories by which it was medically disqualified'. However, this did not mean the medical and sexological definitions attached to categories remained the same when 'reversed' by sexual communities. Terms such as 'homosexual' and 'lesbian' were taken as categories from medicine, then reformed to create a positive and political movement; homosexuality began to speak for itself.

Cross-gendered individuals' engagement with sexology, science and medicine was complex and distinctive, and therefore previous theoretical notions of reverse discourse need to be revised. I argue for a re-examination of the process of 'reverse discourse' in the narrative of cross-gendered individuals. A cross-gendered individual was required to take an active role within medical communities, especially when engaging with treatment and legal definitions of biological sex. The 'sex-change' process required an individual to actively reconstruct the body and to then live in their chosen sex/gender. However, this does not mean cross-gendered individuals always accepted sexological and medical discourse in their lives. They resisted particular categories in some cases. Therefore I argue for more breadth and depth to the concept of reverse discourse; we might move towards an examination of exactly what discourses were 'reversed' and how individuals or groups negotiated such a reversal. Chapter Four will further illustrate these ideas as it examines the case of Peter Alexander.

Feminist Usage of Discourse Analysis

Feminist discourse analysis has both explored and challenged how the category of 'woman' and 'female' had formed in history. The method, questions and theoretical concerns of feminist theorists can complement research on the formation of cross-gendered categories in history. The meaning of the word 'women' has changed in

17 Foucault, Sexuality, p.101.
18 For an overview of the different modes of feminist thought regarding discourse analysis see Chapter Four of Mills, pp.77-104.
relation to the historical discursive landscape and a similar process is seen with cross-gendered behaviour and identity. As Denise Riley stated:

women is historically, discursively constructed, and always relatively to other categories which themselves change; ‘women’ is a volatile collectivity [sic] in which female persons can be very differently positioned, so that the apparent continuity of the subject ‘women’ isn’t to be relied upon.19

Post-structuralist feminist history has critiqued the place of the gendered subject in history and started to examine the ‘discursive aspects of experience’.20 Both Kathleen Canning and Joan Scott argued for a re-evaluation of discourses that surround women in order to ‘provide new perspectives on old questions’ and to be aware of ‘the domain in which subjectivities emerge’.21 These ‘new perspectives’ concerned the analysis of gender as an amalgamation of theoretical perspectives with personal experiences to challenge the reductive and oversimplified versions of women’s history.22 Combined with Canning’s argument for the use of the body as a ‘complex site of inscription and of subjectivity/resistance’ these feminist revisions of history create a powerful position to examine cross-gendered identity.23 I will return to feminist theory and the cross-gendered experience in my conclusion, as the similarities led to new approaches in gendered historiography.

Sexologists

Carl Westphal

Carl Westphal’s article *Contrary Sexual Feeling* was written in 1870, and deserves attention, due to the impact his ideas had on sexology.24 *Contrary Sexual Feeling* was used

---

20 Downs, p.95. The chapter ‘Gender, Post-Structuralism and the Cultural/Linguistic Turn’ illustrates the debates and ideas circulating and informing the writing of gender history.
22 Scott, p.1055.
23 Canning, pp.395-396.
by contemporaries of Westphal, in the development of sexological, medical and theoretical discourses of homosexuality and cross-gendered behaviour and/or identity.\textsuperscript{25} Westphal considered 'contrary sexual feeling' an innate disease.\textsuperscript{26} He was unclear on whether the origin of the 'disease' was pathological, physiological or patho-psychological and he did not consider every individual who 'indulge[d] in unnatural illicit sex to be a pathological character'.\textsuperscript{27} Although Westphal's interest lay in recording the aetiology of contrary sexual feeling, it is unclear how he defined 'contrary sexual feeling' itself. The only clues lie in Westphal's description of Miss N, who had the 'phenomenon of the reversal of sexual feeling, [and] the feeling of representing a male being'.\textsuperscript{28}

The case study of Miss N illustrated the complexities and contradictions of Westphal's theory. Westphal diagnosed Miss N with 'contrary sexual feeling' by way of a physical examination and detailed conversations. After 'a maniacal stage' Miss N was admitted to Charité hospital.\textsuperscript{29} Miss N's symptoms were described as a 'sexual arousal [that] appear[ed] aimed in a strange direction' and 'a violent headache with dizziness'.\textsuperscript{30} Westphal regarded Miss N's involvement with young women as the catalyst for her 'episode'. Two incidents with young women were described by Westphal; the rejection by a young woman at Miss N's sister's boarding house and a relationship with a female

---

\textsuperscript{25} Foucault argued Contrary Sexual Feeling signified the beginning of the medicalisation of homosexuality. More recent scholarship has used Westphal's theory in relation to cross-gendered behaviour and/or identification. See Foucault, Sexuality, p.43; Prosser, Transsexuals and the Transsexologists; Prosser, Second Skins. For further discussion on Prosser's articles and sexology at the turn of the century see Breger, C., 'Feminine Masculinities: Scientific and Literary Representations of "Female Inversion" at the Turn of the Century,' in Journal of the History of Sexuality, 14, 1/2, 2005, pp.76-106.

\textsuperscript{26} See Dorland W., The American Illustrated Medical Dictionary, Philadelphia, 1917, p.306. 'Any departure from a state of health; an illness; more frequently the genus or kind of disturbance of health to which any particular case of sickness may be assigned.'

\textsuperscript{27} These terms were defined by Dorland as follows: Pathological: 'Pertaining to pathology, that branch of medicine which treats of the essential nature of disease, specially of the structural and functional changes caused by disease', p.733; Physiological: 'the science that treats of the functions of the living organism and its parts', p.765; Pathological: 'the psychology of mental disease; pathologic psychology,' p.734.

Westphal, p.19.

\textsuperscript{28} Westphal, p.10

\textsuperscript{29} Westphal, p.13.

\textsuperscript{30} Westphal, p.13.
patient at Charité hospital.\(^{31}\) Westphal saw the rejection by the young woman at Miss N's sister's boarding house, as the catalyst for Miss N's 'episode'.\(^{32}\)

There were three strands of Miss N's narrative related to Westphal's theory of contrary sexual feeling; these were Miss N's sexual behaviour, cross-gendered feelings and finally, Miss N's denial of a disease process. In relation to sexual behaviour, Miss N insisted she had no interest in men and she 'could live and sleep among men without the slightest arousal'.\(^{33}\) Miss N described her attitude:

> in general like a man and would like to be a man; I have actually always hated feminine jobs, I would like to have a masculine job, for example I have always been interested in mechanical engineering.\(^{34}\)

Westphal recorded Miss N had enjoyed dressing and playing as a boy and was attracted to girls from the age of eight.\(^ {35}\) The ideas of sexual attraction and cross-gendered behaviour, compounded with Miss N's refusal to see her condition as pathological, led to the formation of Westphal's diagnostic picture. Each of the three behavioural traits, sexual behaviour, cross-gendered behaviour, and the individual's denial of disease process, became part of the aetiology and discourse of contrary sexual feeling.

Westphal gathered further information on Miss N when he performed a physical and mental evaluation. Westphal found nothing 'physically unusual' in his examination of Miss N as her 'physiognomy and clothing d[id] not deviate in any way from the feminine type'.\(^ {36}\) He was concerned about Miss N's mental health, and observed 'a slight degree of mental limitation' but decided, overall Miss N was free from 'more definite, affective conditions, hallucinations, delusions'.\(^ {37}\) Westphal concluded Miss N suffered from a type of moral insanity and folie circulaire, also known as circular insanity.\(^ {38}\) Although Westphal was unclear on the cause of Miss N's insanity he

\(^{31}\) Westphal, pp.2-3.
\(^{32}\) Westphal, pp.2-3.
\(^{33}\) Westphal, p.2.
\(^{34}\) Westphal, p.4.
\(^{35}\) Westphal, p.2.
\(^{36}\) Westphal, p.3.
\(^{37}\) Westphal, pp.3-4.
proposed that her masturbation, while thinking about young girls, was a primary cause.\(^{39}\)

Westphal was interested in the pathology and aetiology of contrary sexual feeling, the disease. There were contradictions in Westphal's approach to Miss N's self-narrative and how he fitted his theory to Miss N's symptoms. Westphal asserted that an innate disease process caused Miss N's behaviour, but he was unclear on how to relate the complexities of sexuality, cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour in defining contrary sexual feeling. I hesitate to claim Westphal's article as a defining moment in the history of sex/gender and/or sexuality, though I do acknowledge the importance of the case of Miss N in the formation of categories of behaviour in sexology.

**Richard von Krafft-Ebing**

Richard von Krafft-Ebing subsequently developed Westphal's ideas about pathological illness and innate behaviour. Richard von Krafft-Ebing's *Psychopathia Sexualis* was a seminal study in sexological research.\(^{40}\) *Psychopathia Sexualis* contained numerous case studies and theoretical summations written and revised between 1886 and 1893. A major section of his work was dedicated to theorising and cataloguing the pathology of 'deviant' sexual behaviour. Krafft-Ebing's ideal sexual type was a 'heterosexual' male or female and any deviation from this 'type' he considered a pathological illness. Whether an individual could be cured depended, in Krafft-Ebing's opinion, on how far along a four-stage process the 'illness' had progressed. Cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour was discussed in two places in *Psychopathia Sexualis*, firstly, in his overview of congenital sexual inversion in women, and secondly in the section of general pathology.

---

\(^{39}\) Westphal, pp.12-13. 'From the age of 23 until last October, she says she did not have opportunity again for such intimate intercourse; on the other hand she masturbated, especially right before and after her period, while vividly imagining a beloved girl.' Also see Laqueur, T., *Solitary Sex: A Cultural History of Masturbation*, New York, 2003, especially Chapters 4 and 5 for a discussion on masturbatory insanity. Although the term 'masturbatory insanity' was not coined until 1868, the ideas had circulated for many years. Masturbatory insanity was linked with religious ideals and historical medical theories on humours, p.363. Masturbation has a long legacy of being linked with insanity and degeneration.

\(^{40}\) See Bullough, *Science in the Bedroom*, pp.40-43, for a brief history of Krafft-Ebing's life and work.
under the title 'Homosexual feeling as an acquired manifestation in both sexes'.\textsuperscript{41} In both sections Krafft-Ebing placed cross-gendered behaviour and/or identity under the category of homosexual desire, although he was beginning to clarify the categorical complexities of gender and sexuality.

My examination will focus on Krafft-Ebing’s use of a four-stage model of sexual degeneration. Each stage involved a ‘process of physical and mental transformation’\textsuperscript{42} Krafft-Ebing described the first stage of degeneration, \textit{homosexual feeling}, as a ‘simple reversal of sexual feeling’.\textsuperscript{43} The main ‘symptom’ was an attraction to the same sex. The ‘character and instinct’ of the individual would match their sex and the person would recognise that their sexual instinct was ‘an aberration’ and seek medical help.\textsuperscript{44} Krafft-Ebing used the case of Ilma S., a 29-year-old woman, to illustrate the aetiology of the first stage. Ilma’s ‘inclination and impulse towards the same sex’ was discovered when she was admitted to hospital and ‘became troublesome on account of passionate love for female nurses and patients’.\textsuperscript{45} Ilma lived and dressed as man for some time but at the time of hospitalisation had returned to living as a woman.\textsuperscript{46} After two years in an asylum Ilma was ‘entirely freed from her neurosis and sexual inversion, and discharged cured’.\textsuperscript{47} If an individual did not recover from this stage, it was Krafft-Ebing’s view that a ‘deep and lasting transformation of the \textit{psychical} [sic] personality may occur’.\textsuperscript{48} This would lead to the second stage of degeneration.

The second stage of degeneration was named ‘eviration’ (in men) and ‘defemination’ (in women). It was exemplified by a person’s ‘deep change of character, particularly in his [sic] feelings and inclinations, which thus become those of a female [male]’.\textsuperscript{49} Krafft-Ebing considered mental and behavioural characteristics changed at the stage and this

\textsuperscript{42} Krafft-Ebing, p.289.
\textsuperscript{43} Krafft-Ebing, p.190.
\textsuperscript{44} Krafft-Ebing, p.190.
\textsuperscript{45} Krafft-Ebing, p.194.
\textsuperscript{46} Krafft-Ebing, pp.192-194. This illustrated some of the complexities of sexuality and gender identity in Krafft-Ebing’s work.
\textsuperscript{47} Krafft-Ebing, p.194.
\textsuperscript{48} Krafft-Ebing, p.195.
\textsuperscript{49} Krafft-Ebing, p.195.
would facilitate a long-term psycho-sexual transformation. Defemination was typified by a ‘strong preference for male garments’. Any chances of recovery from this stage were slim and it was likely symptoms of the third stage of degeneration would develop.

There were similarities in the way Krafft-Ebing articulated the symptoms of the third and fourth stages of degeneration. Both stages related to a physical and mental change and an embodiment of a person’s identity. The divergence between stages three and four was related to the extent a person believed they embodied the opposite sex. The third stage was called ‘stage of transition to change of sex delusion’ and the final stage was called delusion of sexual change.

Krafft-Ebing used the case of Mrs X to illustrate the indicators of stage three. As a young woman Mrs X enjoyed male attire and sports, though Krafft-Ebing noted there was little ‘homo-sexual inclination’. She married at a young age and had six children and at thirty-six years of age had a stroke and was confined to bed for two years. ‘Psychical and physical feelings’ developed during her illness that included not combing her hair, use of ‘curse words’, and ‘she felt mortified at being a woman’. Physically, Krafft-Ebing observed Mrs X’s breasts disappeared, ‘her pelvis grew smaller and narrower, her bones became massive, and her skin became rougher and harder’. She ‘assumed more and more the character of a man...and often had the sensation of possessing a penis and a scrotum’. Krafft-Ebing believed Mrs X’s case was a pathological illness he could not cure, though he reflected on Mrs X’s ability to be ‘reconciled to her change of sex, brought about by her severe illness, and bore her fate with resignation, finding much support in her religious convictions’.

50 Krafft-Ebing, p.264.
51 Krafft-Ebing, p.200, and p.216.
52 Krafft-Ebing, p.214.
53 Krafft-Ebing, p.214.
54 Krafft-Ebing, p.215.
57 Krafft-Ebing, p.216.
The final stage was a process described as ‘sexual neurasthenia that has developed into general depression, resulting in a mental disease, paranoid’. In this final stage an individual ‘believed’ they were the opposite sex. The final stage in women was explained, by Krafft-Ebing, as ‘the woman [who] possesses of the feminine qualities [of] only the genital organs; thought, sentiment, action, even external appearance are those of a man’. The label ‘men-women’ was also used to describe individuals in this final stage.

Although Krafft-Ebing conflated cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour with sexuality he did express some important themes in regard to cross-gendered aetiology and sexology. His case studies isolated ideas, such as childhood behaviour and physical traits, which would become embedded in future sexological discourse. These ideas were further examined and developed in the work of Magnus Hirschfeld.

Magnus Hirschfeld

Magnus Hirschfeld’s Transvestites: The Erotic Drive to Cross-Dress introduced a new period in sexological research on cross-gendered behaviour and/or identity. Hirschfeld’s interest in the diversity of sexual characteristics formed the basis of his examination of the experiences of sixteen ‘men’ and one ‘woman’. Hirschfeld created the term ‘transvestite’ to describe:

the strong drive to live in the clothing of that sex that does not belong to the relative build of the body. For the sake of brevity we will label this drive as transvestism (from “trans”= over or opposite, and “vestis”= clothing).

---

58 Krafft-Ebing, p.216.
59 Krafft-Ebing, p.264.
60 Krafft-Ebing, p.264.
One of the core principles of Transvestism were the links between emotional well-being, clothing and self-expression. The confinement an individual felt when attired in the clothing of their sex was described as:

In the apparel of their own sex they feel confined, bound up, oppressed; they perceive them as something strange, something that does not fit them, does not belong to them; on the other hand, they cannot find enough words to describe the feeling of peace, security and exaltation, happiness and well-being that overcomes them when in the clothing of the other sex.\(^{63}\)

Hirschfeld argued that transvestism ought to be examined as a separate category from other sexual 'anomalies' such as homosexuality and fetishism.\(^{64}\) Hirschfeld used differential diagnoses, a discussion and comparison of symptoms and categories, to cement a discourse on transvestites.

The first 'anomaly' separated from a diagnosis of transvestism was homosexuality. Hirschfeld challenged previous theories of Westphal and Krafft-Ebing who both related homosexuality with effeminacy [in men] and masculinity [in women].\(^{65}\) The important diagnostic clue for homosexuality, according to Hirschfeld, was the 'direction of the sex drive'.\(^{66}\) The examination of an individual character, behaviour and physical characteristics as well as sexual attraction allowed Hirschfeld to separate homosexuality and transvestism. Hirschfeld's theory meant an effeminate or masculine homosexual could also be a transvestite and he explained 'not all homosexuals are effeminate, and not all effeminate men are homosexual'.\(^{67}\) Hirschfeld observed homosexuals often found transvestism 'unpleasant' and the difference between homosexuality and transvestism was 'the sex drive of the one, namely, the transvestite, better matches the physical characteristics; the homosexual, more the psychological complex'.\(^{68}\) Hirschfeld

\(^{63}\) Hirschfeld, p.125.
\(^{64}\) Hirschfeld also examined in his differential diagnosis, sexual metamorphosis, hallucinations, monosexuality and masochism. He did not offer any new insights into the relationship between transvestism and monosexuality and masochism, except to eliminate them from the category of transvestism per se.
\(^{65}\) Hirschfeld, p.147. The idea of contrary sexual feeling has previously been discussed in the work of Westphal and Krafft-Ebing.
\(^{66}\) Hirschfeld, p.147.
\(^{67}\) Hirschfeld, p.148.
\(^{68}\) Hirschfeld, p.148.
used the case of Miss Katharine T, who lived in Berlin, to emphasize the difference between homosexuality and transvestism.

Miss T made an application to the Imperial Police in Berlin to dress as a male and take a male name.\(^6^9\) Certification was required from a medical expert and Hirschfeld was called to examine Miss T's 'physical and mental condition, with special emphasis on her sexuality'.\(^7^0\) Miss T stated she never felt she was a girl.\(^7^1\) She told Hirschfeld she wanted 'a man's career' and she felt 'completely a man, especially in the company of women'.\(^7^2\)

Miss T had no interest in women's clothing or make up as she preferred male attire and collected 'ties and walking sticks'.\(^7^3\) Hirschfeld also observed Miss T 'smoke[d] much,' mainly cigars, cigarettes and a short pipe.\(^7^4\) Miss T had 'mutually masturbated with other girls' between the ages of six and eleven and had throughout adolescence had no interest in boys; she cared only to form romantic attachments to girls.\(^7^5\)

Hirschfeld found no signs of 'mental or nervous disorders' in his examination of Miss T and suggested 'her mind st[ood] [in] glaring contradiction to her body'.\(^7^6\) Miss T's application to the Berlin Imperial Police to wear men's clothes was granted, and Hirschfeld's reason for recommending approval was:

> considering her sexual abnormality and psychological characteristics, wearing men's clothing is natural for the patient. The granting of permission is a question of existence for her...from a medical standpoint, we have to state that Miss T. has valid grounds for her petition.\(^7^7\)

---

\(^6^9\) Hirschfeld, p.151. Hirschfeld stated part of the petition was for Miss T to use a masculine name, however it was not discussed what name was given. Therefore 'Miss T' is used throughout this section. Hirschfeld referred to Miss T in the feminine throughout his case study, therefore I am following his convention.

\(^7^0\) Hirschfeld, p.151. The examination included a physical description of Miss T, and a history of her family and her medical history.

\(^7^1\) Hirschfeld, p.151.

\(^7^2\) Hirschfeld, pp.151-152.

\(^7^3\) Hirschfeld, p.152.

\(^7^4\) Hirschfeld, p.152.

\(^7^5\) Hirschfeld, p.152.

\(^7^6\) Hirschfeld, p.153.

\(^7^7\) Hirschfeld, pp.154-155. Miss T was granted a petition to continue to wear men's clothing though she was not allowed to change her name.
The case of Miss T supported Hirschfeld's argument that transvestism was a separate diagnostic category from homosexuality.

The next differential diagnosis Hirschfeld examined was fetishism. Hirschfeld's interest in fetishism was to separate the link between transvestites and clothing fetishists. Both transvestites and fetishists, he wrote, 'seek to put themselves in possession of pieces of clothing that belong to that sex which they do not belong'. The difference between the fetishist and the transvestite was the meaning and emphasis placed on the item of clothing by the individual. Transvestites identified the objects of clothing as a feature of their true selves.

The difference between transvestites and individuals with sexual metamorphosis emphasised complexities in Hirschfeld’s differential diagnosis. According to Hirschfeld, transvestites were aware they were not the epitome of opposite sex. Hirschfeld considered cross-dressing problematic and pathological when an individual believed they were the embodiment of the opposite sex:

If they consider themselves actually women, whether crossed dressed or not ...the condition would have to be addressed as mental illness, as being insane, as paranoia. Such cases of the illusion of sexual metamorphosis - *metamorphosis sexualis paranoica* - also do occur, even [if] only rarely in relation to other delusions.

Hirschfeld was cautious in generalising conditions:

in spite of the fact that the drive to dress in the clothing of the other sex and the illusion of sexual metamorphosis express themselves differently in each case and truly one can hardly be taken for the other, as with all the other forms of limitation and transition, anomalies used up until now for comparison are also present here again, forms in the case of which the guarantee of the differential diagnosis presents certain difficulties.

---

78 Hirschfeld, p.158. Krafft-Ebing discussed elements of clothing as fetish objects.
79 Hirschfeld, p.159. Hirschfeld further discussed the idea of clothes relating to a 'sense of self' in the differential diagnosis of sexual metamorphosis and transvestism.
80 Hirschfeld, p.182.
81 Hirschfeld, p.184.
Each of the differential diagnosis for transvestism contained complexities and contradictions that Hirschfeld applied to his Theory of Intermediaries. Hirschfeld’s ‘Theory of Intermediaries’ concluded there were a possible 43,046,721 combinations of sex and gender attributes, proving no one person met the quintessential characteristics of their birth sex. The premise of his theory follows:

we understand manly formed women and womanly formed men at every possible stage, or, in other words, men with womanly characteristics and women with manly ones. Therefore, if a woman has a full beard or a man has milk-producing teats, we register such people, who exhibit such obvious characteristics of the other sex, as mixed sexual formations or intermediaries. Hirschfeld acknowledged that the identification of a ‘manly’ or ‘womanly’ characteristics, required for his theory, was ‘difficult and controvers[ial]’. His solution was to categorise the biological, physical and emotional differences between men and women. Four groups of features, sexual organs, other physical characteristics, sex drive and other emotional characteristics, were developed and Hirschfeld placed individuals into a category based their case history. The final category, other emotional characteristics, related to the mental and emotional differences in men and women and anyone whose ‘mental’ characteristics had more in common with the opposite sex. Transvestites were placed in the last category of ‘other emotional characteristics’ as, by Hirschfeld’s definition, they constituted an emotional ‘intermediary’ between the male and female sexes that was more naturalised and less biological than a person’s sex drive.

Hirschfeld challenged previous notions of gender by examining cross-gendered identity and behaviour and adding the category of ‘transvestite’ to sexological discourse. Throughout his analysis Hirschfeld maintained transvestites were not psychologically ill

82 Hirschfeld, p.215.
83 Hirschfeld, p.227.
84 Hirschfeld, p.215.
85 Hirschfeld, p.215.
86 Hirschfeld, p.215.
87 Hirschfeld, p.219.
88 Hirschfeld, p.219.
but part of human diversity. The book *Transvestites* was the beginning of a new era in sexology and piqued the interest of Havelock Ellis who responded with *Eonism*.

### Havelock Ellis

Havelock Ellis was a popular sexologist of his time. He published many works between 1896 and 1928 including the seven volumes of *Studies in the Psychology of Sex*. The final volume, *Eonism and Other Supplementary Studies*, discussed cross-gendered identity and behaviour. Havelock Ellis was important in the introduction of new language to the study of cross-gendered identity and behaviour and cementing the relationship between science and identity. Ellis summarised and critiqued previous theories on cross-gendered behaviour and put forward his own theory supported by case studies. Ellis explained female-to-male cases were difficult to find on public record, so he concentrated on male-to-female case studies.

Ellis used two interchangeable terms to describe cross-gendered behaviour and identity. *Eonism*, the term most commonly associated with Ellis' theory, was named after Chevalier d'Eon, a famous French cross-dresser who lived in the late seventeenth and early eighteenth century. Ellis used *Eonism* in conjunction with the term *Sexo-aesthetic inversion*, sometimes shortened to *aesthetic inversion*. Ellis explained the main characteristic of aesthetic inversion as 'the impulse to project themselves by sympathetic feeling into the object to which they are attracted, or the impulse of inner imitation'. Ellis considered an individual with *Eonism* would take on characteristics of the

---

90 Ellis acknowledged the contribution of Magnus Hirschfeld in the study of cross-gender identity and/or behaviour. However, Ellis questioned the depth of Hirschfeld's work and he argued Hirschfeld had not covered all areas of the cross-gendered experience. Ellis criticised Hirschfeld for not examining d'Eon closely and suggested Hirschfeld may have overlooked the relationship between *Eonism* and homosexuality.
91 Ellis, p.32.
92 See Ellis, pp.1-8 for a brief biography on d'Eon.
93 Generally the term 'sexual inversion' was used to discuss homosexuality. Ellis used the term *Sexual Inversion* as the title of one of his works on homosexuality.
94 Ellis, p.27.
opposite sex and would have a complete 'emotional identification which is sexually abnormal but aesthetically correct'.95

Ellis compared aesthetic inversion with heterosexuality and suggested it 'be regarded as an abnormal and perhaps pathological exaggeration of the secondary component of the normal heterosexual impulse'.96 Eonists were typically 'educated, refined, sensitive and reserved' and concealed their Eonism from friends and family.97 Ellis was more well-known for his theories on sexuality and the terms Eonism and aesthetic inversion did not have the same impact on the discourse of cross-gendered identity and behaviour as Hirschfeld's term 'transvestite'. However the scientific and medical ideas Ellis associated with Eonism left a long-term impression on cross-gendered theory.

At the time Ellis was writing Eonism, medicine and science were constructing increasingly sophisticated theories of how the human body worked. Developments in the field of endocrinology, the study of the hormone system, presented Ellis with information to construct a theory about the relationship between Eonism and the endocrine system, the body's hormone release system. Ellis suggested Eonism was a psychic version of Eunuchoidism, the 'congenital or pathologically acquired approximation to the artificially acquired condition of the eunuch'.98 Ellis rejected environmental conditions, for example the upbringing of a child, as the main cause of Eonism and claimed aesthetic inversion was linked to a 'deeper organic foundation'.99 The 'peculiarities' associated with Eonism related to an imbalance in the endocrine system that was either 'inborn' or 'inherited'.100 Therefore, in Ellis's opinion, if Eonism was related to an imbalance of hormone levels, the implantation of a 'suitable' gland could result in balancing hormone levels.101 It was unclear whether Ellis considered all

95 Ellis, pp.107-108.
96 Ellis, p.104. This argument was originally made by Hirschfeld in Transvestites.
97 Ellis, p.29.
98 Ellis, p.109. Eunuchoidism was a concept taken from Griffiths and Duckworth's early 1900s scientific research on the 'pathological and congenital' background of Eunuch's. See Ellis p.109 for an explanation of this research.
99 Ellis, p.109.
100 Ellis, p.110.
101 Ellis, p.110. Also see Benjamin, H., 'Eugen Steinach, 1861-1944: A Life of Research', in The Scientific Monthly 61,6, 1945, pp.422-427. This article gave an overview of Steinach's work and his
Eonists needed medical or psychological treatment. The link between science, medicine and cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour was cemented by Ellis and continued firstly by George Henry and then, David Cauldwell.

George Henry

George Henry was one of the members of the 1935, New York, research committee who wrote *Sex Variants: A Study of Homosexual Patterns*. The study aimed to draw together various specialists involved in sex research, to examine ‘homosexuals’ or people with ‘homosexual’ tendencies. The study considered cases of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour as part of the homosexual continuum. The term ‘sex variant’ was used to define the ‘person who had failed to achieve and maintain adult heterosexual modes of sexual expression and who had resorted to other modes of sexual expression’. Henry suggested a sex variant was a ‘by-product’ of society and not a well-adjusted individual.

The study contained concise documentation on each patient. The records included a detailed family and personal history, a ‘sex and personality test’ and a physical examination that included a gynaecological exam. The ‘sex and personality test’ was devised by Terman and Miles and involved a combination of word association, inkblot tests, emotional, ethical and interest/hobby tests. At the end of each case Henry gave a ‘resume’ on the person in regard to their sexuality and pathology. The use of the ‘sex and personality test’ meant cross-gendered identity and behaviour were categorised experimentation with the implantation of sex gland onto rats and the observation of the changes in their behaviour due to this implantation. Also see Meyerowitz, *Popular Press*, p161.

102 Henry G., *Sex Variants: A Study of Homosexual Patterns*, New York, 1941. George Henry wrote up the majority of the research, even though a number of people were involved in the study, therefore I will refer to him throughout this section. The other researchers included Robert Dickson, Jan Gay and Thomas Painter. See Terry, J., *An American Obsession: Science, Medicine and Homosexuality in Modern Society*, Chicago, 1999, pp. 182-192, for a discussion on the formation of the study group.

103 Henry, p.vii. There were plans for further research into other areas of sexology including intersex individuals see Terry, *An American Obsession*, pp.449-450, footnote 25.

104 Henry, p.1023.

105 Henry, p.1023-1027.

106 Henry, p.vii.

107 Terman, L. and Miles, C., *Sex and Personality: Studies in Masculinity and Femininity*, London and New York, 1936. See Terman and Miles, p.344, for a comprehensive study of the test and results. Terman and Miles also contained a case study on a woman arrested for masquerading in men’s clothes.
together with sexuality. Therefore the Sex Variant study preferred to represent cross-gendered cases in terms of homosexuality. I will expand on this argument in the next section.

Henry's case studies were divided into three categories; bisexual, homosexual and narcissistic. There was some degree of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour in each category. Henry associated masculinity in females with aggression towards society and intolerance with the social role of mother or wife. One conclusion of the study was 'a sissy or a tomboy' began their lives with a 'psychosexual' disadvantage. In females, adult psychosexual development would be impeded unless 'adjustment' took place through a 'union with a correspondingly feminine male'. The sexual variance could be passed down through generations except when a successful 'union' took place between a feminine man and a masculine woman. The idea of psychosexual development and the ability to 'adjust' the behaviour and/or identity was linked with medicine and science. It appeared Henry believed sexual variance could be inherited and, if this was the case, could also be cancelled out by a successful match of partners.

Although Henry discussed gendered behaviour and attributes, he referred to gender variance under the rubric of sexuality. The case of Patricia D, who was placed in the homosexual category, illustrated the complexities and complications of Henry's study. The impression of Patricia was of a 'boyish feminine adolescent' who was 'sophisticated beyond her twenty-two years'. Patricia had a 'consistent desire to be a boy' and 'her behaviour as a boy strongly suggest[ed] a predisposition to masculinity'. Patricia's 'masculine identity' stemmed from childhood. She was told to call herself Tommy from the age of two and felt comfortable in boy's attire and playing boy's games. Patricia married a young man as she was unaware homosexuality existed until her eighteenth year. Her personal history stated '[I] wished I was a boy so I could make love to the

---

108 Henry, p.1024.  
109 Henry, p.1026.  
110 Henry, p.1024.  
111 See Henry, p.1024 for his discussion of this point.  
112 Henry, p.867.  
113 Henry, p.877.  
114 See Henry, pp.871-872 for detailed personal biography.  
115 Henry, p.873.
The physical examination was written up in terms of male and female sex characteristics, for example 'body form slight and boyish...Skull type female...Large android pelvis male'. Patricia's case study demonstrated how gender, sex, and sexuality intermingled in the committee's research. It is not possible to ascertain from the sex variant report if Patricia was cross-gender identified. I suggest a number of narratives could be examined in Patricia's history. There were contradictions between her desire to be a man, her masculinity and Henry's association of masculinity with homosexuality. The paradoxical use of gendered language in the discussion of Patricia's body and her sex drive also adds to the complexity of Henry's research categories. Sex Variants exemplified the movement of cross-gendered characteristics into the discourse of sexuality. In the late 1940s the areas of sex, gender and sexuality would start to move again into separate distinctive classifications, helped in part by Dr David Cauldwell.

David Cauldwell

David Cauldwell was a medical doctor and he wrote pamphlets for Haldeman-Julius Publications on sex, sexuality and sex education. His interest in cross-gendered identity and behaviour came from letters on 'sex changes' posted to him at his job at the Sexology journal. Questions Cauldwell received became the catalyst for his research and subsequent article Psychopathia Transexualis, where he coined the term transexual. Cauldwell's article showed amalgamation of previous theories associated with cross-gendered identity and behaviour and the beginning of discussions on surgical intervention.

116 Henry, p.873.
117 Henry, p.876.
118 Meyerowitz, Sex Changes, p.42.
120 Psychopathia Transexualis was a play on Krafft-Ebing's Psychopathia Sexualis. This observation was also made by Meyerowitz, Sex Changes, p.42. Also note the difference in the spelling of 'transsexual'. The modern spelling of transexual with 2 's's has been associated with Harry Benjamin, though the theory underpinning the two terms remained similar. There has been some debates surrounding the first time transexuality was used in medical discourse and both Cauldwell and Harry Benjamin have been cited as the first people to use the word. See Meyerowitz, Popular Press, p.160 and pp.168-169. See Bullough, Science in the Bedroom, p.219 for a different view of the coining of the term transexuality.
Cauldwell used the term *Psychopathia transexualis* to describe the 'desire' to be a 'full member of the opposite sex'.  

Cauldwell explicates on the background of *Psychopathia transexualis*:

> when an individual fails to mature according to his (or her) proper biological and sexological status, such an individual is psychologically (mentally) deficient. The psychological condition is in reality the disease.\(^{122}\)

Cauldwell considered people who desired to live fully as a member of the opposite sex as mentally unwell. The condition was related to a 'poor hereditary upbringing and a highly unfavourable childhood environment' although Cauldwell also observed it was more 'prevalent in the well-to-do than the poor'.  

The psychopathic characteristics of transexualism were:

> [not just] the adoption of a male role and career, but in practices as seduction, parasitism, violation of the social codes in numerous ways, frequently kleptomania and actual thievery, pathological lying, and other criminal and unsocial tendencies.\(^{124}\)

Transexualism, in Cauldwell's opinion, had a psychological origin and therefore the individual could be rehabilitated, even though Cauldwell only knew of a few organizations that were able to provide such a service.\(^{125}\) Social education as a preventative to transexualism, though Cauldwell did not explain the content of such an 'education' programme.\(^{126}\) Cauldwell only deemed surgical intervention as an option if the individual had pre-existing pathological condition.

Cauldwell used the case study of 'Earl' to further explain his theories. Earl was from a 'well-to-do family' and although 'born female', had grown up 'thinking [of] herself as

---

121 Cauldwell, p.274.  
122 Cauldwell, p.274.  
123 Cauldwell, p.274.  
124 Cauldwell, p.279.  
125 Cauldwell, p.279.  
126 Cauldwell, p.279.
being a boy.' 127 At the age of 18 Earl had 'discarded feminine attire completely' and was
‘determined’ to live as a male. 128 Cauldwell questioned Earl on ‘her’ sexuality and one
‘homosexual crush’ was discussed but Earl explained sexual relations were not
‘bestowed lower than the breasts’. 129 Earl was, by Cauldwell’s assessment, a pseudo-
homosexual.130 This meant Earl’s physical sex (female) was distinct from Earl’s mental
sex (male) and therefore ‘with males she [Earl] would still be a sexological female and
with females she would be an imagined or fantasied [sic] psychological male’.131

In a physical examination Cauldwell determined Earl was a ‘normal’ physical female
with no signs of ‘pseudo-hermaphroditism’.132 Earl requested Cauldwell:

find a surgeon who would remove her breasts, her ovaries, and close the vagina
and then create for her an artificial penis. She would then take male hormones
and that she thought would, with masculine attire and occupation, solve her
problem.133

Cauldwell explained ‘what she desired was impossible’ since:

it would be criminal for any surgeon to mutilate a pair of healthy breasts and it
would be just as criminal for a surgeon to castrate a woman with no disease of
the ovaries or related glands and without any condition wherein castration
might be beneficial.134

Earl expressed ‘her’ displeasure with Cauldwell’s refusal to operate but continued to
live as a man by binding her breasts and dressing in male attire.135 In Cauldwell’s
opinion Earl’s actions were narcissistic and he claimed Earl ‘revealed[sic] in just seeing
and feeling herself (as much when alone as otherwise) in the role of a man’.136

127 Cauldwell, p.275. Earl was not the real name of the ‘subject’. Cauldwell called his case study ‘Earl’ as
it was a ‘name... frequently borne by members of both sexes.’ Earl had initiated contact with Cauldwell
and, after swapping several letters, requested they meet.
128 Cauldwell, p.275.
129 Cauldwell, p.276. On a second visit to Cauldwell, Earl reported that s/he had been asked to withdraw
from college due to homosexual activities.
130 Cauldwell, p.276.
131 Cauldwell, p.278.
132 Cauldwell, p.276.
133 Cauldwell, p.277.
134 Cauldwell, p.277.
135 Cauldwell, p.278.
136 Cauldwell, p.278.
Earl's wish to 'change sex' had not previously been so clearly articulated in a sexological case study. Not only did Cauldwell describe the medical techniques Earl sought in order to change sex, but he also critiqued them. Historically, this valuable case study gives an indication of both method and opinion on female-to-male cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour.

Sexological Discourse

A number of discourses emerge in the discussion of the sexological theory on cross-gendered behaviour and identity. All the sexologists examined struggled to find a balance between sexological and medical discourse, and personal narrative and identification. The observation and cataloguing of cross-gendered behaviour and identity by the sexologists revealed the presence of a number of discourses. All of the sexologists had masculine attire as a central discourse in their study of cross-gendered individuals. The discourse of 'masculine' behaviour both throughout childhood and as an adult became a strong indicator in sexological accounts of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. Smoking, 'rough and tumble' play as a child, interest in 'masculine work' and the rejection of 'feminine' activities such as playing with dolls would become the core of sexological theories on cross-gendered individuals. The body of cross-gendered individuals was always described in terms of masculine and feminine features but as science developed Ellis, Henry and Cauldwell started to speculate on the causes on cross-gendered identity. A moralistic discourse on 'sex change' treatment emerged from the 1930s in the work of Henry and Cauldwell and would continue through into post-1950s sexology. The diagnosis of pathological illness, in cases of cross-gendered experience, started to develop in the work of Carl Westphal and was further expanded by Richard von Krafft-Ebing's four stages of degeneration. Magnus Hirschfeld emphasised numerous categories of sexual diversity and formed a differential diagnosis for transvestism, and consequently, countered the link between cross-gendered behaviour and pathological illness. Havelock Ellis influenced by the growth of medicine and science proposed that a hormone imbalance was the reason for Eonism. In 1935, the methodologies of previous sexologists were combined in the research of the Study
of Sex Variants. Cross-gendered behaviour, identity and sexuality became indistinct from each other and were all examined as characteristics of sexual anomalies. Sex, gender and sexuality were split into different categories again in 1949 when Cauldwell formed a theory of transexualism and debated the validity and morality of surgery in individuals with transexualism. Throughout these fifty years language and theory ebbed and flowed but eventually became fixed in the discourse of science and medicine. The legacy of these sexologists is apparent in the work of Alfred Kinsey, Harry Benjamin and John Money.

Contemporary New Zealand Research

Research in the areas of sociology, gender and women's studies and social psychology has contributed to a growing literature on cross-gender identification and behaviour in the New Zealand context. Three researchers have contributed to the broad area of female-to-male cross-gender identity and behaviour in New Zealand. I will examine the work of Alison Laurie, Julie Glamuzina and Jenny Coleman and show how they have utilized two approaches in their respective research. Laurie and Glamuzina used a lesbian-feminist methodology and Coleman employed a historical framework along with discourse analysis.

Alison Laurie

Alison Laurie's PhD thesis, Lady Husbands and Kamp Ladies: Pre-1970 Lesbian Life in Aotearoa/New Zealand, was a seminal work on pre-1970 lesbian history in New Zealand.


138 My opinion is the researchers have made a significant impact on research into female-to-male cross-gender identity and behaviour in New Zealand. The scholars themselves may not agree.
Zealand. Laurie's thesis adopted a lesbian-feminist approach and seeks to place people onto a lesbian continuum, a broad encompassing concept of 'lesbian' and 'lesbianism' that included romantic friendship. Laurie argued that 'proof of genital sex was an unworkable requirement' in attributing lesbian identity. Laurie places several individuals, who will be examined in later chapters of my thesis, were placed under the rubric of lesbianism; she regarded five individuals, Amy Bock, Bert Rotciv, Eugenia Falleni, Dersley Morton and Mr X, as 'cross-dressers' and 'lesbians'.

Laurie gave a brief overview of such theorists as Judith Halberstram and Leslie Feinberg, who argued for the inclusion of 'cross-gendered' individuals into the category of 'multiple genders'. Laurie also acknowledged the work of Julie Wheelwright, Randolph Trumbach, and Alison Oram and Annmarie Turnbull who questioned the relationship between cross-dressing, heterosexual identity and economic opportunities. Each author argued to some extent that cross-dressing allowed 'women' to access more work opportunities, to avoid marriage, and in some cases attract women lovers and also be involved in male social circles. Laurie rejected these theories and concluded the 'figures in her study lead lesbian lives'.

In each case Laurie situated 'cross-dressers' on her lesbian continuum. Amy Bock, Boy Bertha and a 'case similar' to 'Boy Bertha' were cited as people who used cross-dressing to access male employment privileges as well as having a 'lesbian' identity. Laurie regarded the life of Eugenia Falleni, who was born female and lived and married as a

140 Laurie, p.12. Laurie also referred to the scholarship of Adrienne Rich when arguing for a 'lesbian continuum' and that 'silence' surround lesbian identity was akin to lying, pp.11-13.
141 Laurie, p.33. Lisa Duggan has challenged the concept of the 'lesbian continuum' arguing the need to have some reference to sexual practice within a lesbian identity. See Duggan L. 'The Trials of Alice Mitchell: Sensationalism, Sexology, and the Lesbian Subject in the Turn-of-the-Century America', in R. Corber, and S. Valocchi, ed., Queer Studies: An Interdisciplinary Reader, Malden, 2003, pp.73-88;
143 Laurie, pp.33-34.
144 Laurie, p.34.
145 Laurie, pp.171-174.
man, as 'motivated by lesbian desires' and 'better paid employment'.\textsuperscript{146} Eugenia's use of a phallus in sexual relationships was considered by Laurie as a means to 'deceive' his/her wives and she argued that 'perhaps the women chose to believe the deception, rather than admit to a lesbian relationship'.\textsuperscript{147} Laurie briefly described the case of Deresley Morton/Peter Stratford whose 'biological sex was revealed' upon death and described the case as 'another apparently successful deception'.\textsuperscript{148} Mr X was the final case cited under 'cross-dressing women'. Laurie quoted the media's use of the term 'lesbian', which I will explain further in Chapter Four, as evidence of Mr X's lesbian identity and argued Mr X cross-dressed to 'access male employment opportunities'.\textsuperscript{149} Although Laurie does concede 'some of these women, particularly Mr X who had surgery, actually believed they were men' her use of words such as 'deception' lend to a denial of self-identity in each narrative.\textsuperscript{150} I will re-evaluate the cases of 'Boy' Bertha as well as Mr X, in Chapters Two and Three. In each case Laurie examined, she prioritised biological sex over gender presentation and self-narrative, therefore missing the complexities and fine distinctions of cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

Laurie's analysis discounted the possibility of cross-gendered identity and behaviour and cemented hegemonic categories of sex and/or gender within historiography.\textsuperscript{151} Although Laurie did recognise the problems of using contemporary terminology, such as transgender, to describe historical identities, she also left no space for other articulations of gendered identity. As Laurie asserted:

\begin{quotation}
\textit{it is difficult to justify why these women should be eliminated from the supposed category of lesbianism, only to be placed within other modern categories of transgender or heterosexual transvestism.}\textsuperscript{152}
\end{quotation}

The problem lies in her claim that an individual can be 'eliminated' from one identity category and placed into another. In order to acknowledge same-sex desire and cross-gendered lives in history a framework needs to be created that closely attends to the

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{146} Laurie, p.173.  \\
\textsuperscript{147} Laurie, p.173.  \\
\textsuperscript{148} Laurie, p.173.  \\
\textsuperscript{149} Laurie, p.34.  \\
\textsuperscript{150} Laurie, p.174.  \\
\textsuperscript{151} The lesbian-feminist approach also discounts the possibility of bisexuality or fluid sexual identity.  \\
\textsuperscript{152} Laurie, p.35.
\end{flushright}
experiences, lives, and ideas of the time period. I argue for acknowledgement of the complexities of people’s lives and identities, rather than re-categorising experiences.

Julie Glamuzina

Julie Glamuzina’s approach can be summarised by the title of her 2005 article ‘Containment of lesbians and lesbianism in the early and mid-twentieth century.’ Her primary interest was in a lesbian history, ‘for and by lesbians’. Glamuzina aimed to ‘position’ the category of lesbian/s into history and contribute to a body of knowledge constructed from a ‘lesbian view’. Glamuzina acknowledged the validity of other readings of history, suggesting ‘transgender’, and ‘gay historians’ may have different interpretations and conclusions, so long as the interpretations were ‘beyond [the] simply straight’. The ‘pattern of regulatory response’ by ‘hetero-culture/worldview’ had, in Glamuzina’s view, hidden lesbians from history. There were ‘three strategic categories’ Glamuzina associated with social responses to lesbianism. The three categories, were reinforcement, containment were the most prominent in Glamuzina’s article, and leverage for the future. In Glamuzina’s theory, reinforcement involved the enforcement of a heterosexual world-view through the media, medical, psychological, and legal commentaries. Containment was described as the use of the media, medical and legal practises to normalise behaviour considered ‘deviant’.

Given Glamuzina approached her work from a ‘self-conscious’ lesbian perspective, her choice of case studies was curious. Her first article was an in-depth account of Mr X and her second article discussed a range of case studies from ‘Boy’ Bertha to Mr X. On one hand, Glamuzina acknowledged there may be different approaches to the figures she

---

154 Glamuzina, Containment, p.36.
155 Glamuzina, Containment, p.32.
156 Glamuzina, Astonishing, p.63; Glamuzina, Containment, p.32.
157 Glamuzina, Astonishing, p.63; Glamuzina, Containment, p.32.
158 Glamuzina, Astonishing, p.63; Glamuzina, Containment, p.32.
160 Glamuzina, Astonishing, p.63; Glamuzina, Containment, p.32.
studied, such as ‘transgender’ and ‘gay’, but on the other hand, this appeared to be a
token acknowledgement to deflect possible criticism as she always used female
pronouns in her discussions.\textsuperscript{161} As I will show in the following chapter, every case study
in her research showed evidence of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour, and very
little in the way of a self-identified lesbian identity. If Glamuzina was going to prove her
theory of containment and to place ‘lesbians in history’ why didn’t she start with self-
identified lesbians?

A close examination of Glamuzina’s response to the case of Mr X will illustrate some of
the problems of her approach. Glamuzina used newspaper reports on Mr X and his/her
trial to claim Mr X did not have a masculine identity and therefore should be included
in lesbian history.\textsuperscript{162} Glamuzina critiqued Mr X’s presentation and identity and stated
there was:

no evidence to suggest that she experienced a confused gender identity or that
she had ambiguous genitalia. Neither did she indicate that she considered
herself, for example, to be a male trapped in a biologically female body.\textsuperscript{163}

What is interesting is the way Glamuzina articulated ‘gendered identity’. As I have
already illustrated in my examination of the sexologists, the discourse of the ‘wrong
body’ was only beginning to emerge in the late 1940s. Therefore the use of language
like ‘confused gender identity’ and phrases such as ‘male trapped in a female body’ is
problematic in a historical investigation.

In her 2005 article, Glamuzina softened her position, stating that ‘people in this paper
would not necessarily identify themselves, or be identified, as lesbians - despite how
contemporaries view them...any interpretations beyond the ‘simply straight’ are to be
welcomed’.\textsuperscript{164} Glamuzina briefly examined a number of cases using her containment

\begin{footnotes}
\item[161] Glamuzina, Containment, p.32.
\item[162] Glamuzina, Astonishing; Glamuzina, Containment.
\item[163] Glamuzina, Astonishing, p.71.
\item[164] Glamuzina, Containment, p.32.
\end{footnotes}
thesis and ignored any aspect of cross-gender identification and behaviour. In the case of ‘Boy’ Bertha she stated Bertha was ‘contained’ by the legal system, to signal to other women that such behaviour was not ‘normal’. In the case of Deresley/Peter, Glamuzina claimed Deresley’s relationships were ‘normalised in their replication of the male-female/hetero model, or monsterised as an oddity by the fact that two women being “married”, and finally contained by Peter’s death’. Glamuzina argued that ‘whether Deresley defined herself as a lesbian or in some other way is unclear – what is unambiguous is that while living as a man, but still biologically female, her intimate and sexual interests were towards women’. As I will show in Chapter Two, it appears Glamuzina essentialised the discourse on Deresley’s gender and/or sex. Glamuzina used a similar argument with the case of Peter Alexander. She stated:

In this case, the threatening possibility of a biological female having sexual relations with other females was averted because of Peter’s intention to undergo surgery in London so that she could ‘become a real man.’ Even though Peter carefully pointed out that he was not a ‘real man’ yet, this information nevertheless enabled the situation and the person to be contained. Everything would soon be back to normal, with real men (albeit chemically and surgically re-mastere) marrying real women.

Glamuzina concluded that she had shown the containment of lesbianism to be ‘one strategy used by the dominant hetero-culture to maintain heterosexual worldview’.

Jenny Coleman

Jenny Coleman has written two articles on Amy Bock, and by focusing on history and language in the media, takes a different approach than either Laurie or Glamuzina. Coleman’s first article ‘Unsettled Women: Deviant Gender in the Late Nineteenth and

---

165 Glamuzina, Containment, p.34. Glamuzina discussed the case of Matene Ropiha Te Ahurangi who ‘presented’ as a ‘female’ and described how Te Ahurangi as; ‘his[sic] circumstances did not meet heterosexual specifications’.
166 Glamuzina, Containment, p.34.
167 Glamuzina, Containment, p.34.
168 Glamuzina, Containment, p.34.
169 Glamuzina, Containment, p.35.
170 Glamuzina, Containment, p.36.
Early Twentieth-century New Zealand' appeared in an anthology of lesbian studies. Coleman was interested in the 'intersections between discourses of sexuality, gender, and deviancy' in New Zealand and used Amy Bock as a case study to highlight 'the mutable boundaries of intelligible genders'.

The advancement of women's rights in the 1860s and 1870s was a catalyst to a changing media representation of women. Coleman stated 'female advocates of women's rights were considered to not be “real” women, but unsexed lunatics exhibiting masculine qualities'. These ideas developed into the early twentieth century as the 'new women' along with social and legislative changes created a view of women as 'autonomous beings'. The reaction was a 'media backlash' and Coleman argued the media saw women's place in a traditional role. This was the historical context Coleman used as background in the discussion of the media's reaction to the Amy Bock case.

Both Laurie and Glamuzina located Bock in a lesbian category. Coleman did not fix an identity onto Bock, though she stated:

in her persona and exploits as Percy Redwood, it could be assumed that in disrupting the requisite correspondence between sex and gender, she clearly transgressed the boundaries of culturally intelligible and acceptable womanhood (Butler 1990). It might be assumed that her transvestism masked what might now be claimed as a lesbian identity.

However, Coleman argued 'there is no clear evidence to suggest that she [Bock] appropriated a male gender for any reason other than as a strategic intervention by which she could maximise her strategies to ameliorate her financial circumstances'.

---

172 Coleman, Unsettled Women, p.13.
173 Coleman, Unsettled Women, p.17.
174 Coleman, Unsettled Women, p.17.
175 Coleman, Unsettled Women, p.19.
176 Coleman, Unsettled Women, pp.20-21.
178 Coleman, Unsettled Women, p.21.
What interested Coleman was the fact that 'neither her sexuality, her sexual morality, nor her essential womanhood appeared to be in question'.

The media used medico-legal language and a number of identities to characterise Bock. Bock was represented as a female who masqueraded as a male and once in the court system Bock was pathologised as a mad woman. Coleman saw the pathologising of Bock as a 'discursive shift from earlier constructs of genders which described those who transgressed normative femininity as either not 'real women' or masculine, or unsexed.' Therefore Bock's gender deviancy was explained through medico-legal discourses that 'replicated the mad/bad/woman tautology in a manner which simultaneously legitimated the 'naturalness' of the existing sex/gender order and expanded the boundaries of culturally intelligible genders'. The medico-legal discourse that surrounded the Amy Bock case was important as it set the scene for the usage of further medical and legal discourse in the media.

In 'Convenient Fiction: The Case of Amy Bock' Coleman shifts her focus to a biographical account of Bock's life and eccentricities. She did this to 'trace the ways in which Amy Bock became established as a “case” in institutional and public records'. Bock became 'public property' though Coleman observed that the media prioritised the 'labels and rationales' of Bock's actions over the 'criminal acts'. Bock's plea that 'I can't help it, it's in my blood' solidified the 'case' of Amy Bock in the

---

183 Coleman, J., 'Convenient Fictions: The Case of Amy Bock', in A. Laurie and L. Evans, eds., *Outlines: Lesbian and Gay Histories of Aotearoa*, Wellington, 2005, p.24. 'Published biographical information is based on three key sources: details gleaned from the Police Gazettes and newspapers about her various criminal activities and convictions; information compiled by Robert William Robson, a newspaper journalist, during Amy's high profile court case in 1909; and reminiscences from W. Christophel held in manuscript form at the Taranaki Museum.' Coleman argues these past sources were problematic and she adds new source material in her discussion of the life of Amy Bock.
184 Coleman, *Convenient Fictions*, p.25.
185 Coleman, *Convenient Fictions*, p.25.
media. Coleman noted that the 'plea of insanity proved a convenient fiction to which Amy Bock resorted on numerous occasions throughout her criminal career'. The examination of Bock's biography allowed Coleman to draw attention to the difficulty of placing Bock within a distinct framework of identity and/or behaviour as it was 'difficult to state with any real conviction what boundary of legitimate ordinariness she overstepped'. Coleman argued 'records of her [Bock's] life and institutional concerns regarding her “deviancy” have clearly established her as a “case”, Amy Bock was, and remains, a bit of a hard “case”'. In this article Coleman highlighted the complexities of studying both archival material and self-narrative and therefore synthesises a number of theoretical positions and medico-legal discourses.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have discussed three main theoretical and analytical frameworks that are engaged in my thesis. I have given an overview and critique of Foucauldian discourse analysis, the six sexologists who theorised on cross-gendered identity and behaviour and three New Zealand authors involved in the study of cross-gendered individuals in New Zealand. Together discourse analysis, the sexologists and New Zealand researchers form a framework of knowledge essential to my thesis. Discourse analysis is integral in allowing multiplicity and discontinuities in history to be part of the canon to cross-gendered research. Sexological theory, influenced by science and medicine, became more complex, and as following chapters will illustrate, impacted upon the lives of cross-gendered individuals. The sexological theories give context to the language and ideas circulating in the media between 1906 and 1950. I will show, in Chapter Four using discourse analysis, how the sexological concepts were employed both by individuals and the media in the construction of multiple narratives.

186 Coleman, Convenient Fictions, p.29. Coleman cites this phrase to highlight that Bock was 'opening a defence based on either an inherited mental instability or physical disease condition.' In this article Coleman traces the family history of medical problems that were used in Bocks defence.  
187 Coleman, Convenient Fictions, p.29.  
188 Coleman, Convenient Fictions, pp.24-30.  
189 Coleman, Convenient Fictions, pp.29-30.
Two main approaches have been used in New Zealand to study cross-gendered individuals. Firstly, the use of lesbian history and theory has placed cross-gendered identity in a sexuality-based narrative. There are times when it is difficult to separate the gendered identity and the sexual identity of the individuals. At these times it is more important to highlight the intricacy of the information and narrative and to place any historical information into a framework that reflects the time period. This is the strength of Coleman's research. Coleman placed the life and times of Amy Bock into two themes; the place of women in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century and the influence of language and institutionalisation on Bock's identity. By using an historic framework Coleman is able to highlight the complexities of the media accounts of Bock and her narrative.

The sexological discourses formed and reformed throughout the 1906-1950s. The most constant discourses revolved around dress, behaviour and the bodies of individuals studied by sexologist. There was constant debate and theorising on the 'cause' of cross-gendered identity and behaviour and the influence of science and medicine helped create a powerful discourse - the inherent natural cause and possible cure of cross-gendered behaviour. There was however a fluctuating melding of sex, gender and sexuality throughout the sexologists' work. At times sexuality and gender/sex were connected and became one and the same, for instance in the work of Henry, and would then separate again in the work of Cauldwell.

Both New Zealand approaches have their merits and it important to recognise the complexities of identity and behaviour and to state them where possible. This is where an understanding of the sexological theories as well as discourse analysis can provide the tools for highlighting complexities and multiplicity in history. In order to further illustrate this I will examine cases taken from the New Zealand Truth from 1906-1950.
Chapter Two: The Masqueraders

‘In Man’s Attire,’ ‘Masquerading as Male,’ ‘Another Amy Bock’

These are some of the headlines in the *Truth* between 1906 and 1929, associated with cross-gendered identity and behaviour. The cases were dominated by the discourse of the ‘masquerader’, unmasked after the discovery of ‘true sex’. Two major themes arose in the newspaper articles during this time period – social transgressions and criminal behaviour. This chapter contains brief outlines of the less prominent cases of cross-gendered individuals in the *Truth* as well as detailed examinations of the narratives of ‘Boy’ Bertha and Annie Read/Thomas Parkes.

William/Bill Edwards and Other Less Prominent Cases Pre- ‘Boy’ Bertha

In Man’s Attire. Romance in Real Life: Marion Edwards’ Extraordinary Escape. An Alleged Melbourne Burglar Masquerading in Brisbane.190

The earliest reported instance of a cross-gendered individual in the *New Zealand Truth* was William/Marion Edwards. The case of Edwards was famous in Australia and appeared in the *Truth* in 1906.191 Edwards took the name ‘Bill’ at the age of sixteen and worked various jobs around the states of Australia.192 Edwards was initially arrested in Melbourne on charges of breaking and entering and gave the name William Edwards to police.193 Bail was granted, but Edwards broke bail conditions and moved to Brisbane where s/he was placed under ‘observation’ and eventually arrested by police, who suspected Edwards was a ‘woman masquerading as a man’.194 The *Truth* article

192 ODT, 29th April 1909, p.2.
193 NZT, 27th October 1906, p.3.
194 NZT, 27th October 1906, p.3.
described Edwards as ‘a well-built Welshwoman of medium build, with a somewhat handsome, masculine type of features’. In court s/he appeared as ‘a dapper, well-dressed woman, wearing a dark-blue suit, white shirt, with a Panama hat’ and had ‘exemplary’ behaviour. The Truth suggested there was some illegality in Edwards’ ‘masquerade’ but did not deliberate on the subject. The criminal component to Edwards’ case was juxtaposed to the by-line of a ‘real life romance’. The newspapers did not expand upon the nature of the romance and the assumption was the other man arrested with Edwards was his/her lover. The main emphasis of the Truth article was the story of the masquerade and the ‘masculine’ character of Edwards. The Truth suggested Edwards ‘disguise[d] her small feet’ by wearing ‘men’s boots and stuff[ed] them up with paper,’ and had ‘small hands’ and ‘white throat’ that attracted the attention of the police. Despite observations on Edwards’ masquerade the Truth commented that ‘even now it is doubtful whether she would have been discovered, had it not been for the long arm of the law’.

The social columns on the front page of the Truth sometimes contained brief mentions of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. ‘The Critic,’ a columnist, discussed ‘the up-to-date she, a “lady” attired in a borrowed dress suit (man’s) who attended the 1906 Turner-Tracy boxing match. Later, in the December 1906 Truth, Miss Button, a horse breeder and trainer from New Brighton, caused ‘a lot of talk’ among visitors to O’Neill’s ‘buckjumping’ competition. Miss Button possessed a ‘touch of masculinity in her countenance’ and it was reported that ‘she wishes she was a man’. These articles led up to the January 1907 appearance of ‘Boy’ Bertha in the Truth.

195 NZT, 27th October 1906, p.3.
196 NZT, 27th October 1906, p.3.
197 NZT, 27th October 1906, p.3.
198 NZT, 27th October 1906, p.3.
199 NZT, 8th December 1906, p.1. The place of the boxing match was not mentioned in the article.
200 NZT, 29th December 1906, p.1. The city the competition was held was not mentioned in the article.
201 NZT, 29th December 1906, p.1.
‘Boy’ Bertha

Boy Bertha; A Perplexing Puzzle: A (sic) Ex-New Zealand Girl in Male Attire: Tortuous Tale of Tantalising Trouble; Her fads, her follies, and her freaks; The Sapphic singularities of “Bert Rotciv” 202

The stories of ‘Boy’ Bertha wound their way through the New Zealand Truth between 1906 and 1915. Bertha appeared in a Sydney, Australia, court in 1906 and, from 1907 onwards, in the New Zealand court system. The later trials in New Zealand often used the 1906 trial in Sydney as a reference point for Bertha’s character. I will discuss each case in turn before examining some of the key themes of Bertha’s story.

Bert/Bertha was arrested in Sydney with a man named John “Curley” Harris and charged with having no visible means of support. After being discharged from court Bert/Bertha went to the Truth office in Sydney and threatened to take ‘libel action’ for ‘inaccurate accounts’ written about him/her in the evening papers.203 Bertha gave the Sydney Truth an account of events that led up to his/her arrest. The account was printed in the Sydney Truth court pages and later reprinted in the New Zealand Truth.

According to the Truth, Bertha was born in Hokitika to a German-Jewish family and brought up in Christchurch.204 She had lived in Australia from the age of eighteen and was twenty-three when s/he appeared in the Sydney court. Bertha had lived with a ‘lover’ three weeks prior to the court trial.205 Bertha claimed her lover was a ‘bludger’ and she had kept him financially by ‘immorality,’ and her lover disappeared three weeks before the trial.206 What Bertha meant by ‘immorality’ can only be conjecture. After the

202 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5.
203 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5.
204 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5. Her Jewish background was frequently mentioned in the newspapers and became integrated into the overall media picture of Bertha. This was partially related to the place of Jewish people in New Zealand/Australia at the beginning of the twentieth century.
205 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5.
206 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5.
disappearance of her lover, Bertha took John ‘Curley’ Harris as a ‘companion’ and they both moved to Helensburgh, south of Sydney.\(^{207}\) In Helensburgh, Bertha searched for her lover and reported to local police that he had stolen some of her jewellery. Bertha also became involved in a fight at a hotel, ‘knocking down two men that insulted her.’\(^{208}\) The ‘friendship’ with Curly ended when they returned to Sydney.\(^{209}\) According to the \textit{Truth} article, once Curley departed Bertha started living as a man.

A North Shore J.P, name unknown, assisted Bertha in her ‘dress transformation.’\(^{210}\) Bertha’s hair, according to the \textit{Truth} once long and flowing, was ‘cropped close off to the head’ and with male clothes s/he ‘fixed a manly masquerade’.\(^{211}\) Once Bertha had donned male attire s/he reacquainted her/himself with Curley Harris introducing her/himself as the ‘brother of the injured young lady’; the ‘young lady’ being Bertha before s/he took to wearing male clothing.\(^{212}\) Curley believed Bertha’s claim, though the \textit{Truth} was sceptical of it. Both Curley and Bertha spent the days until their arrest at ‘restaurants in Sydney’ and they ate at ‘certain tearooms on Bathurst Street’.\(^{213}\) The \textit{Truth} recounted that Bertha had spent a night with a prostitute. Both Bertha and Harris were arrested on a Wednesday night and charged with ‘no means of visible support’.\(^{214}\) The \textit{Truth} report claimed Bertha was discharged although no information was specified in regard to any jail sentence. In a 1912 article on Bertha the \textit{Truth} recalled a sentence of twelve months, though it is unclear whether Bertha served her sentence as she appeared in New Zealand courts four months after the original 1906 Australian trial.\(^{215}\)

[Continued on page 46.]

\(^{207}\) \textit{NZT}, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5.
\(^{208}\) \textit{NZT}, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5.
\(^{209}\) The friendship ended after Curley had sold some of Bertha’s dresses at her request.
\(^{210}\) \textit{NZT}, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5.
\(^{211}\) \textit{NZT}, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5.
\(^{212}\) \textit{NZT}, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5.
\(^{213}\) \textit{NZT}, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5.
\(^{214}\) \textit{NZT}, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5.
\(^{215}\) \textit{NZT}, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5.
Figure 1 ‘Boy’ Bertha.

‘One well-known sketch artist got away up near the office for safety, where he gazed meditatively, and not till the lady had bid ta-ta to the quizzing group of loungers [sic] did he [the sketch artist] leave his bodyguard of constables to once more tread the pave. But the masquerader took no notice, and continued to puff at a cigarette’. 216

216 NZT, 5th January 1907, p.5.
A number of discourses emerged from the court trial and the *Truth*’s account of Bertha’s Sydney adventures. I will now draw attention to Bertha’s behaviour and clothing, and the *Truth*’s subsequent approaches to her story. *Truth* paid close attention to her clothes:

Appearance denoted femininity despite the cut of the trouser and hat, and on closer inspection revealed the woman’s neck and hair, the female bust, hips, and, last but not least, the broad hips, while the voice betrayed at once the woman. 217

Despite this ‘femininity’ it appeared the judge was confused:

[H]is Worship glanced uneasily at the charge-sheet before him and then at the accused, and seemed puzzled until Constable Best whispered, ‘This side [sic] person is a woman’. 218

The judge was not the only person to see Bertha/Bert as a man. The *Truth* discussed one of Bertha/Bert’s ‘freaks’: the night s/he spent ‘with one of her own sex’, a female prostitute. Bertha/Bert ‘laughed’ when asked why she wasn’t ‘discovered’ and claimed the ‘other woman was too drunk’ and s/he left before the woman woke. It is unclear whether Bertha and the prostitute had any sexual contact. However, some contemporary lesbian scholars have cited the incident with the prostitute as evidence for Bertha’s placement in a framework of lesbian identity. 219 I will return to this shortly.

The *Truth* was also curious about Bertha/Bert and Curley’s sleeping arrangements. They slept in single beds and Bertha/Bert ‘used to turn out the light, so “Curly” couldn’t see her feminine undergarments’. 220 A picture started to emerge of Bert’s as a ‘man,’ ‘found out’ to be ‘female’ due to criminal behaviour.

Bertha/Bert’s narrative was free of an obvious medical or sexological discourse, though the media seemed to have some comprehension of these ideas as the phrases

---

217 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5.
218 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5.
219 See Glamuzina, 2005.
220 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5.
‘perplexing puzzle’ and ‘psychological puzzle’ were used to describe Bertha/Bert. In the 
Truth’s opinion Bertha/Bert’s ‘masquerade’ was evidence of ‘insanity’.221 The Truth 
surmised that Bertha’s ‘quick eye’ indicated ‘a very active brain’ and her/his 
‘conversation’ showed her to be an ‘abnormal woman’.222 Her speech patterns were 
evidence of ‘erratic waywardness’.223 The Truth concluded: ‘notwithstanding her 
admitted naughtiness, Bertha’s demeanour and manner of speaking denote more of an 
erratic waywardness than downright wickedness’.224

Bertha/Bert appeared in the Truth between April 1907 and May 1915 and each time 
the 1906 case was revisited. At some stage soon after the Sydney trial Bertha returned 
to New Zealand and in April 1907 was arrested twice. The first time, a policeman 
reported, s/he had been found ‘wandering around in male attire’ and s/he appeared in 
court on a charge of drunkenness.225 A doctor was summoned after Bertha/Bert was 
found ‘insensible’.226 The doctor revived Bertha and discovered ‘the supposed male was 
a woman’.227 Bertha ‘retained the forbidden garments’ despite the police station’s offer 
of clothes of her sex.228 In court Magistrate Kettle inquired about Bertha’s ‘love of 
pants’ and Bertha replied:

That having failed to get work when clothed in the garb of her sex, she thought 

male attire would be more useful, because, she added, “I am more able to do men’s 
work.”229

The magistrate commented that Bertha/Bert’s ‘eccentric conduct cannot do you any 
good’ and ‘she must give up wearing male attire’.230 The magistrate was reported by the 
Truth to be lenient as Bertha agreed to give up wearing male clothing.231
Bertha soon appeared in court a second time, arrested in male garb, for the use of 'shocking language' and resisting arrest. Bertha was remanded for a week before a judge remanded Bertha for three months at the Door of Hope, an industrial school in Auckland, though it appeared s/he was discharged on each count. The judge was disinclined to place Bertha in jail, and suggested her behaviour should be viewed as social deviancy as opposed to criminal deviancy. Interestingly, it was not until Bertha/Bert appeared in the New Zealand courts that s/he was told not to wear male clothes. Although the Sydney courts considered her cross-gendered appearance deviant, either they did not make the same request or it was not reported.

Bertha's 1906 escapades were retold in the Truth when in 1912 s/he was arrested yet again and charged as an 'incorrigible rogue, a vagabond, without lawful means of support'. The 1912 Truth gave the following summary of the 1906 case:

In defence of all the traditions of her sex, she had clothed her nether limbs in the latest thing in trouser [sic], her shapely waist and heaving 'busserin' [sic] were hidden under a masculine coat, vest, and shirt with a stripe in it, whilst her golden hair nestled sweetly (what was left of it), under the “hard-hitter” of modern civilisation. Miss Bertha's disguise was a most successful one and wouldn't have been penetrated at the time if she hadn't taken to sinful, wicked, mixed drinks.

The Truth reporter considered Bertha/Bert's 'disguise' a success in this recollection of Bertha's 1906 antics. The Truth led their crime pages with 'Bertha the Boy Barmaid' and discussed the reasons for Bertha's latest arrest. Bertha/Bert was found on the street, apparently drugged, and taken to a house where a Dr Milsom was called. The

---

231 The judicial sentence was not reported in the Truth for this case.
232 New Zealand Herald (NZH), 23rd April 1907, p.7.
233 NZH, 23rd April 1907, p.7.
234 NZT, 26th October 1912, p.5.
235 NZT, 26th October 1912, p.5.
236 NZH, 17th October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26th October 1912, p.5; Auckland Weekly News (AWN), 24th October 1912, p.25. There was no reason given for the use of 'boy barmaid' in the Truth headline. It could be part of the reporting pattern of the Truth who frequently used alliteration in their headlines.
237 NZH, 17th October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26th October 1912, p.5; AWN, 24th October 1912, p.25.
doctor decided Bertha was under the influence of drugs and called the police.\textsuperscript{238} In court, Bertha provided a detailed narrative of events since her last court appearance. On 31\textsuperscript{st} March 1908 Bertha married Mr Wise but soon after the wedding left Auckland for Sydney with her brother. In Sydney, Bertha spent time in hospital (no reason was stated) and returned to Auckland once she had recovered in order to set up a teashop. The teashop was eventually sold when Mr Wise, Bertha’s husband encountered financial hardship.\textsuperscript{239} After the sale of the business Bertha moved around New Zealand.\textsuperscript{240} She eventually returned to Auckland and started work at the Royal Albert and United Services Hotels. The judge demanded to know how she was able to afford the dresses found on her person, and Bertha stated that she had been able to hold down a steady job for some months before coming down with pneumonia.\textsuperscript{241} Bertha left her belongings at the Star Hotel when she ran out of money and stayed at various places around Auckland. At the time of her arrest, Bertha claimed she was on her way to Dr Horsley for medication for her chest but had collapsed. Subsequently arrested, her trial dealt with the money she owed to the Star Hotel.\textsuperscript{242} The judge was concerned by Bertha’s lack of accommodation and work. Bertha claimed there were many people she could stay with but she would not reside with her husband, Mr Wise, as he was by now living with another woman.\textsuperscript{243}

Although the \textit{Herald} and \textit{Auckland Weekly News} in 1912 led with the headline ‘Masquerade as Man’ there was no clear indication of Bertha living or dressing as a man at the time of the arrest.\textsuperscript{244} It appeared her cross-gender behaviour in 1906 and 1907 was used as a selling point to draw people to the article. Bertha crossed social lines of decency in 1912 by wearing male attire and drinking heavily, and her relationships with men were used as evidence of her status as a hopeless case. However, it appeared Bertha made use of her liaisons with men to keep her in money and housing. The judge

\textsuperscript{238} NZH, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; AWN, 24\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.25.

\textsuperscript{239} NZH, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; AWN, 24\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.25.

\textsuperscript{240} In Palmerston North she almost divorced Mr Wise in order to marry another man but that marriage did not eventuate. She met a Mr Healey and professed to the court what a ‘dear kind man’ he was and they returned to Auckland.

\textsuperscript{241} NZH, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; AWN, 24\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.25.

\textsuperscript{242} NZH, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; AWN, 24\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.25.

\textsupers{243} NZH, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; AWN, 24\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.25.

\textsuperscript{244} NZH, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; NZT, 26\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.5; AWN, 24\textsuperscript{th} October 1912, p.25.
explained he ‘did not know quite how to deal with [the] accused’. Bertha was quoted as mentioning a number of places she could stay, and places she could work. She gave her health as a reason for her behaviour.

In 1914 and 1915 the story of Bertha took a new turn. The Truth led an article with ‘Boy Bertha; She masquerades as a male; says she has lived down her past’. Bertha took Mr Wise, her husband from whom she had been separated for five years, to court to claim maintenance. Bertha was questioned about the length of time elapsed from the separation until the court summons, and she explained ‘he said if I ever took him [Mr Wise] to Court he would shoot me and rake up my past in the court. I have lived down my past’. Bertha succeeded in getting 10 shillings a week in maintenance from Mr Wise, with the promise that ‘neither party would molest or interfere with the other in any way. In 1915 Bertha returned to court to appeal for more support from Wise, though the result of the appeal was not printed. She claimed her lawyer, without her consent, had made the previous 10 shilling arrangement. The 1915 article was the last time Bertha appeared in the Truth.

There was a tension in Bertha/Bert’s narrative between her cross-gendered behaviour and her social and criminal deviancy. In all likelihood Bertha would have been arrested whether or not she was wearing male attire. In the early twentieth century cases of women drunks started to appear in both the New Zealand court system and the Truth. Bertha’s ‘masquerade’ added a spicy dimension to the case but was not the only defining part of Bertha’s narrative.

In Chapter One I discussed how Laurie and Glamuzina incorporated individuals like Bertha under the rubric of lesbian history. They included Bertha in lesbian history on

---

245 AWN, 24th October 1912, p.25; NZH, 17th October 1912, p.5.
246 NZT, 1st August 1914, p.5.
247 NZT, 1st August 1914, p.5.
248 NZT, 1st August 1914, p.5.
249 NZT, 8th May 1915, p.4.
the strength of a single phrase in the *Truth*; ‘The Sapphic singularities of Bert Rotciv’.\footnote{NZT, 7\textsuperscript{th} January 1907, p.5. It appeared that 'Rotciv' was used by Bertha as it was possibly her last name 'Victor' spelt backwards. This point was also mentioned by Laurie, p.34 and p.171.} Alison Laurie, and later Julie Glamuzina, assumed there was a wide understanding of the term ‘Sapphic’ in 1906 and therefore the *Truth*’s readership would categorise Bertha as a lesbian.\footnote{Laurie, p.171.} However, there was little evidence in the 1906 media to suggest the term Sapphic was understood in relation to lesbianism. It is quite possible the term Sapphic was used to describe an independent woman. One explanation is that Sappho’s writing had an influence on female artistic circles in the early 1900s and was linked with feminism and the ‘new woman’.\footnote{See Benstock, S., *Women of the Left Bank: Paris, 1900-1940*, London, 1989.} The transmission of the term Sapphic may well have begun as an expression of women writers and artists and later moved to encompass a community and sexuality. The only report of same-sex behaviour in this case was Bertha/Bert’s night with the prostitute and there were no further reports of Bertha being sexually attracted to women or having any sexual relationships with women. I will return to the discussion of sexuality and cross-gendered identity and behaviour in Chapter Four.

The discourse of the masquerader, until 1909, was exemplified by ‘Boy’ Bertha and her story presented a number of discourses. There were glimmers of sexological ideas in the reports on Bertha’s attire and behaviour, as the court viewed Bertha as ‘naughty’ and appeared to link her masculine appearance with a social transgression. The *Truth* described Bertha as having psychological issues and considered her ‘abnormal’. The discourse of a ‘woman’ wearing male clothes along with reported masculine behaviour epitomised the masquerader.

The *Truth*, prior to 1909, used Bertha’s narrative as a benchmark for other cases of cross-gendered behaviour. On May 4\textsuperscript{th} 1907, the ‘Christchurchmania’ section of the *Truth* contained a small article titled ‘In Male Attire: Another Boy Bertha’.\footnote{NZT, 4\textsuperscript{th} May 1907, p.6.} A ‘lady’ who ran a refreshment room ‘borrowed the togs of her cook; ... and, buying a packet of
fags, she marched along the streets smoking and ogling girls'. The *Truth* stated that 'she [the other 'Bertha'] certainly makes a better Vision of the Tea Tray than a male masquerader'. The brief article implied Bertha/Bert's story had influenced other women to act out in male attire. The *Truth* concluded 'pure devilment' or a 'new sensation' was the reason why women and young girls were wearing men's attire and 'actresses are used to that sort of thing, but the ordinary female isn't and when they “put 'em on” they no doubt want to have street larks with other girls'. These attitudes in the *Truth* also reflected the tension in society at the time as roles of men and women started to change and the 'new women' began to emerge. This was the last time Bertha/Bert was used as a benchmark for cross-gendered behaviour in the *Truth*. In 1909 another figure became associated with cross-gender identity and behaviour: Amy Bock.

Amy Bock

In 1909 the *Truth* reported:

> We have all sorts and shades of the over-smart she...we have had them donning the pants and living and talking and drinking like men, but never have we had one of these [sic] smart she's taking another young miss as her wife and then turning seductive "scoundrel" and then vamoose, leaving a "bride" to lament her cruel loss...  

Amy Bock achieved notoriety in New Zealand in 1909 after police tracked her down and arrested her in Nugget Point, south of Dunedin. At the time of arrest Amy Bock was known as Percy Carol Redwood and had recently married a Miss Ottoway. Bock

---

254 NZT, 4th May 1907, p.6.
255 NZT, 4th May 1907, p.6.
256 NZT, 4th May 1907, p.6.
257 See Coleman, *Unsettled Women* for a discussion on these changing roles and the place of cross-gendered identity and behaviour within this context.
258 NZT, 1st May 1909, p.5.
was originally arrested on charges of false pretences.²⁵⁹ Later, two more accounts of false pretence and making a false statement were added. The false statement was 'touching on particulars required under the provisions of The Marriage Act 1908 - to wit, that her name was Percival Leonard Carol Redwood and that her condition was bachelor.'²⁶⁰ Numerous recent publications in New Zealand have described Bock as everything from a 'confidence trickster', a female bridegroom to the 'notorious Amy Bock'.²⁶¹ There is also a range of archival material, press clippings, and visual culture connected with Bock, but I will not be looking at these sources in detail.²⁶² Due to the amount of existing scholarship on Bock's life, I will only examine the main ideas of Amy Bock's case as they pertain to my thesis. These are, first, the language associated with Bock's cross-gender behaviour and/or identity and, second, the discourse surrounding her mental health.

[Continued on page 55.]

²⁵⁹ NZT, 1st May 1909, p.5. Bock was originally charged with 'obtaining £30 from Arthur Ellis by means of false pretences.' More charges were later added.

²⁶⁰ NZT, 15th May 1909, p.5.


²⁶² For example, Amy Bock, MS Papers1828; W. Christoffel Papers, Amy Maud Bock, MS Papers5269; Weiland Christoffel collection, PAColl 4861.
Figure 2 'Amy Bock sketched in the dock in the Dunedin City Police Court'.\textsuperscript{263}

\textsuperscript{263} OW, 12\textsuperscript{th} May 1909, p.48.
The *Truth* revealed Amy Bock to their readers with the headline:

Another Adventuress. The Booking of Amy Bock. Amazing Masquerades of a Woman. Poses as Percy Carol Redwood. Weds a Wife and is then Arrested. The Champion Female Crook of the Century.\(^{264}\)

The *Truth* stated 'though she was in male attire, Amy wasn't a man. Though she called herself Percy Carol Redwood she wasn't entitled to it, because Amy is a woman'.\(^{265}\) The discourse of a 'masquerade' became more prominent as the case progressed. The most detailed description of Bock's male attire came from the *Herald*:

Many women, indeed, have turned eager eyes on less attractive men than this woman attired as a man. A front view showed a diminutive man, well dressed, neat of limb, with neater feet, and rather good-looking. The way she had her hands sunk in the pockets of a light grey overcoat was the way of a man when the wind is raw and his undergarments thin. She seemed to be holding the coat close to herself, as if to hide her figure. Her face was neat rather than pretty... A back view made it almost impossible to believe that the little man between the detectives was a woman. She seemed a man. She walked with the slight stoop of the scholar, but with a firm tread ... In a word, the woman was a man!\(^{266}\)

The media discussed Bock the criminal before Bock the masquerader and eventually integrated both ideas into the wider discourse of the criminal, the forger and the 'champion female crook of the century'.\(^{267}\) Newspapers reported that 'her easiest victims were men as they were altogether too soft' and the possibility Bock took on the role of a man to show 'the stern sex how to be smart, and this she did by marrying one of her own sex'.\(^{268}\) There was curiosity in regard to her ability to remain undiscovered as male.

\(^{264}\) NZT, 1st May 1909, p.5.
\(^{265}\) NZT, 1st May 1909, p.5.
\(^{266}\) NZH, 3rd May 1909, p.6. The article also described the 'masculine' walk of Bock and how the measurer of Bock's wedding suit was 'deceived'.
\(^{267}\) See the headlines of various articles on Bock: NZT, 1st May 1909, p.5; NZT, 8th May 1909, p.5; NZH, 4th May 1909, p.6; NZT, 5th June 1909, p.4; Evening Post (EP), 8th May 1909, p.9; EP, 26th April 1909, p.8; EP, 19th March 1911, p.5.
\(^{268}\) NZT, 1st May 1909, p.5.
The media alluded to some details, while other ‘excuses’ were printed, such as using doctors’ orders as an excuse to not partake in public baths.\textsuperscript{269}

The discourse of Amy being barmy, mad or suffering from a mental illness was solidified in the newspapers during 1909. Bock was described as having ‘a touch of insanity about her all the time’ and an ‘almost unnatural, perhaps perverted female’.\textsuperscript{270} This discourse related to all her activities not just her masquerade. Mr Moore, Bock’s defence attorney, requested she be admitted to a mental hospital though this did not happen.\textsuperscript{271} Bock’s last word in her court case was: ‘I have also to thank the press for remembering I was a woman in spite of all I have done. There is no use expressing my regret yet, because I would not be believed’.\textsuperscript{272} Bock appeared in the \textit{Truth} numerous times in the 1930s and 1940s either as a point of comparison or because of her own activities. Under the name Mrs Amy Maud Christofferson, Bock appeared in a Hamilton court in 1931 charged with obtaining money and goods by means of false pretence.\textsuperscript{273} The \textit{Truth} recalled the events of Bock’s 1909 marriage and masquerade, thereby reinforcing the discourse of Bock’s criminality and mental instability.\textsuperscript{274} An article and two pictures of Bock were published under the heading ‘Man-Woman’ and the caption described Bock as ‘as a typical man, her attire correct down to even the smallest detail, and with facial express perfect’.\textsuperscript{275} In 1945, in association with a case of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour, Bock’s life was again brought into the media spotlight. The \textit{Auckland Star} gave a short summary of the 1909 events and subsequent imprisonment with the headline ‘Previous case; Women “Married;” Notorious Amy Bock’ and the \textit{Truth} gave an extensive overview of Bock’s life.\textsuperscript{276}

Amy Bock was intelligent, articulate and seemed able to manipulate the sympathy of the media. A mythical figure, a trickster and a New Zealand antihero her ‘masquerade’

\textsuperscript{269} NZT, 8\textsuperscript{th} May 1909, p.1.
\textsuperscript{270} NZH, 7\textsuperscript{th} May 1909, p.9; NZT, 8\textsuperscript{th} May 1909, p.5.
\textsuperscript{271} NZT, 5\textsuperscript{th} June 1909, p.4.
\textsuperscript{272} NZH, 8\textsuperscript{th} May 1909, p.6.
\textsuperscript{273} NZT, 15\textsuperscript{th} October 1931, p.5. See article for complete details of case.
\textsuperscript{274} NZT, 15\textsuperscript{th} October 1931, p.5.
\textsuperscript{275} NZT, 22\textsuperscript{nd} October 1931, p.5.
\textsuperscript{276} \textit{Auckland Star (AS)}, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6; NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.14.
became a blue print for the media. The story began as a criminal arrested for false pretences and became Amy Bock the female bridegroom, the masquerader and the criminal. The large volume of information obtained on her life built a solid base of information for the media and the court to pathologise, humour and love her. It is important to note the impact Bock had on New Zealand media and New Zealand history.\footnote{There is to be a movie made on Bock’s life. See Dominion Post (DP), 21st May 2005, E.18 and The Star (STR; Dunedin community newspaper) 4\textsuperscript{th} November 2004, p.20. Brief overview of Bock’s life and the possibility of a movie based on her life by Judith Tyne. Also there was a play written by Fiona Farrell; Farrell, F., \textit{In Confidence - Dialogues with Amy Bock}, unpublished play, first performed 1982.} I will demonstrate in Chapter Four how the headline ‘Another Amy Bock’ haunted New Zealand for many years.\footnote{See NZH, 10\textsuperscript{th} May 1909, p.6. Woman as Ploughman; Remarkable episodes; Keeping company with a girl.}

[Continued on page 62.]
A consumer culture surrounded Amy Bock. This postcard, as well as the following three images, was sold after Bock’s arrest in Nugget Point for false pretences. There was also an auction of Bock’s effects in Samson’s sale rooms Dunedin as well as a ‘subscription list’ that was circulated in ‘Christchurch to buy Amy Bock a Moustache’. 279

279 NZH, 18th May 1909, p.5; NZT, 8th May 1909, p.8.
AMY BOCK,
Alias PERCY CAROL REDWOOD, &c.
The Female Bridegroom.

Figure 4 Postcard of Amy Bock, The Female Bridegroom.
This photo was taken on Amy/Percy's wedding day and became widely distributed as a postcard. The photo is attributed to Pattillo, Bridal Photographer, Dunedin.
Figure 5 Amy Bock, The Female Bridegroom.

Another Bock postcard, the photo again attributed to Pattillo in Dunedin.

‘Postcards from the only Photograph in Male Attire, taken just previous to the famous Wedding. Beautifully Lithographed – Post paid, 3½d; or sex for 1/6; or 2/9 for dozen. Real Brominide Photos – Post paid, 6 ½ d each; six for 3/- or 5/6 dozen. Wholesale rates on application’.  

---

280 OW, 12th May 1909, p.1.
Figure 6 After Seven Whiskies! Amy Getting into Her Nighties.

Another Postcard from The Universal Post Card Company, Dunedin.
Henrietta Agnes Berland

In 1912, the Truth reported the case of Henrietta Agnes Berland with the headline ‘Another Amy Bock; A Senseless System’. There was little information reported about Berland’s life. Berland was admitted to the Caversham Industrial School as an impoverished orphan, and released at the age of 21 when she was considered legally an adult woman. It was unclear why Berland was arrested although the Truth described the ‘crime’ as follows:

she shipped to Wellington, where the usual man transpired. Her adoption of male attire, her hair-cut, her purchase of a packet of cigarettes, her smoking of the same, and her poor attempts at whistling and assumption of careless unconcern when she met the police, were all part of her desire to conceal her identity, and wish to avoid the joyless existence she had said good-bye to. But her unmistakable feminine figure beat her; her broad hips and the inward curve of the knees revealed her to the police...

Berland was sent back to the reformatory home after the court case. The Truth was critical of the industrial school system, and theorised that the ‘denial of pleasure’ resulted in ‘many of them going to the devil’. The Truth seemed to use the Berland case to draw attention to the ‘senseless system’ of reformatory schools. The comparison of Berland to Bock lay mainly in the male attire and masculine behaviour.

---

285 NZT, 13th January 1912, p.7; NZT, 20th January 1912, p.7. The Truth was critical of the mixing of ‘orphans with thieves, degenerates and children torn by the law from the city hotels...’
Annie Read/ Thomas Parkes

In 1912 the Truth led its crime page with:

Another Amy Bock! Annie Read, Alias Thomas Parkes. Sensational Discovery in a Dunedin Lodging-House. Woman, Masquerading as Male. Gives Birth to Child. How the Secret was Revealed - What her Correspondence Disclosed. 386

The importance of Annie Read/Thomas Parkes to this thesis is twofold. Firstly, a clear self-identification engaged in Annie/Thomas' narrative and secondly newspaper discourse on cross-gendered identity and behaviour changed at the time s/he featured. Most of the information contained in the newspaper articles about Annie/Thomas came from letters found in Annie/Thomas' possessions and the inquest after her/his death. What follows is an overview of events as reported in the Truth and other newspapers, and an analysis of Annie/Thomas' narrative. Throughout the thesis I will use both names, Annie/Thomas, in order to reflect Annie/Thomas' self-identity.

Annie Read was born in Australia and attended school in Dubbo, New South Wales. She worked in a timber mill in Adelaide for a time, and told an employer s/he 'had lost her father and mother from apoplexy in Sydney, and had no relatives in the Dominion'. 287 The first recorded mention of Annie using a male name was September 1911 when, after an accident, s/he was admitted to Ararat hospital, Victoria, Australia. 288 Annie was admitted as Thomas Ralph but discharged as Annie Read. 289 Annie/Thomas gained passage to Invercargill, New Zealand on 22nd January 1912, claiming a family relationship to a 'man called Russell'. 290 Russell paid for Annie/Thomas' fare to New Zealand after Annie wrote to Russell, who owned an

386 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5. Annie/Thomas also had a brief mention in the following article; Lévesque, A., 'Grandmother Took Ergot: An Historical Perspective on Abortion in New Zealand [1897-1937]', Part 2, in Broadsheet, Nov, 44, 1976, pp.26-31.
287 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
288 ODT, 6th November 1912, p.5. No details of the accident were reported.
289 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
290 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5. It was not mentioned in the media how Annie knew of Thomas Ralph. No more information was given about the relationship in the papers.

63
Invercargill garage, using the name Thomas Russell. While in Invercargill Annie/Thomas stayed with a Father Peter who was reported to be 'aware that she was a female masquerading as a male'. Annie/Thomas moved to Dunedin, changed her/his name to Thomas Parkes and took a job in a second-hand bookstore on George Street, owned by Mr H. H. Driver.

Details of Annie/Thomas's life while in Dunedin were scarce. S/he lived in a boarding house at 1 Albert Street, St Clair, and on Saturday nights regularly frequented the Central Dining Rooms on Manse Street. S/he had been seen with friends on motorcar rides, and had also been seen in the company of someone described as a 'Holy Bhurger' at a band concert in St Kilda.

Annie/Thomas was discovered to be 'female' upon death. Mrs Pledger, who was Annie/Thomas' landlord, reported s/he had arrived home early on the Monday evening, and went to bed 'unwell'. At 1am moans were heard from Annie/Thomas' room and at 5am Mr Pledger went to check on him/her. The Truth described the rest of the incident:

about 6.30 on Tuesday morning, the landlady went to see if anything was the matter, but found the door locked. She told a boarder named Newland, a painter, to get a ladder...saw the body of the supposed young man lying on the floor with the bedclothes around “him”. On turning back the bedclothes Newland was horror-stricken to find the body of an infant, apparently dead, and a young woman, not a young man, in an unconscious condition under the bedclothes.

---

291 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
292 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
293 NZT, 16th November 1912, p.5; NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
294 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
295 NZT, 16th November 1912, p.6. A Holy Bhurger referred to a well respected person in the community.
296 NZT, 16th November 1912, p.6.
297 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
The doctor was called and the female child pronounced dead.\textsuperscript{298} Annie/Thomas was taken to hospital where s/he later died from puerperal eclampsia.\textsuperscript{299} The reason for the baby’s death was not given, though a ‘slight mark of constriction round the neck’ was reported.\textsuperscript{300} H. H. Driver paid for the funeral expenses so Annie/Thomas would not have a ‘pauper’s grave’.\textsuperscript{301}

Inquests were held on the deaths of both Annie/Thomas and the infant. The individuals present at the inquest were in no doubt that, before the ‘discovery,’ they viewed Annie/Thomas as a man. Mr Driver, Annie/Thomas’ employer, stated he never doubted ‘the applicant for the position was a man’.\textsuperscript{302} Mrs Pledger, the owner of the boarding house, was questioned on her response to the moaning she heard at 1am; ‘being a man, I thought he might have eaten something for supper which did not agree with him, and he might have a stomach ache’.\textsuperscript{303} Mrs Pledger’s husband was sent to investigate as ‘it was a man. If it had been a woman, I would have gone myself’.\textsuperscript{304} I will now relate the sexological discourse of the time with Annie/Thomas’ cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour.

In Chapter One I discussed various sexological writings associated with cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour. The work of Krafft-Ebing was available in New Zealand during the early 1900s as the Truth advertised copies for sale via mail order. Krafft-Ebing discussed four stages of degeneration, each stage illustrated by a degree of cross-gendered behaviour and identity. I am going to examine Annie/Thomas’ clothing, behaviour, physicality and self-identification in relation to Krafft-Ebing’s aetiology.

\textsuperscript{298} ODT, \textit{6th} November 1912, p.5. Only the ODT printed the sex of the baby.
\textsuperscript{299} NZT, \textit{9th} November 1912, p.6; ODT, \textit{6th} November 1912, p.5.
\textsuperscript{300} NZT, \textit{9th} November 1912, p.6. Annie/Thomas also ‘suffered from Bright’s disease, and no matter what treatment she received would not have survived.’
\textsuperscript{301} NZT, \textit{16th} November 1912, p.6.
\textsuperscript{302} ODT, \textit{6th} November 1912, p.5.
\textsuperscript{303} NZT, \textit{9th} November 1912, p.5.
\textsuperscript{304} NZT, \textit{9th} November 1912, p.5.
Krafft-Ebing thought secondary sexual characteristics could be ‘inverted’, and in the case of women, the individual would pursue masculine activities, wear masculine attire and would move towards believing they were the embodiment of a man.\textsuperscript{305} The media affirmed the discourse of Annie/Thomas’ masculine body and strength. The \textit{Otago Daily Times} stated Annie/Thomas ‘lacked nothing in the essential factor of appearance... she had a strong masculine appearance, was dark almost to swarthiness, and was very well set up, though somewhat on the short side for a man’.\textsuperscript{306} Mr H.H Driver, the owner of the bookshop, considered Annie/Thomas to be strong enough to do ‘all the heavy work necessary in a bookshop’.\textsuperscript{307} In terms of Annie/Thomas’ attire the newspapers reported the clothing found at the boarding house consisted of ‘three suits of male clothing’.\textsuperscript{308} The \textit{Truth} pointed out the only feminine items were ‘a handbag with a back comb’.\textsuperscript{309} Annie/Thomas was described as being ‘dressed in a light grey or dark suit of a smart cut and natty style, and always wore a light cap’.\textsuperscript{310}

Krafft-Ebing considered masculine pursuits such as ‘rough boyish manners’ and ‘at times smoking and drinking’ as part of the aetiology of stages three and four of degeneration.\textsuperscript{311} This, however, was not the case with Annie/Thomas, who was reported to be:

[a] quiet, orderly, well-behaved ‘young man’ and as an employee faithful servant, attentive to duties, obliging to customers, did not drink or smoke and was not addicted to any particular vice, so far as he knew.\textsuperscript{312}

Although not all of Annie/Thomas’ activities were known it seemed s/he was well respected among those who knew her/him.

\textsuperscript{305} Krafft-Ebing, pp.42-48.
\textsuperscript{306} ODT, 6\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.5.
\textsuperscript{307} ODT, 6\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.5.
\textsuperscript{308} NZT, 9\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.5; NZT, 16\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.6.
\textsuperscript{309} NZT, 9\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.5; NZT, 16\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.6.
\textsuperscript{310} NZT, 9\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.5. The infant was found with ‘men’s underpants’ around her neck.
\textsuperscript{311} Krafft-Ebing, p.39.
\textsuperscript{312} NZT, 9\textsuperscript{th} November 1912, p.5.
We might also consider Annie/Thomas' sexuality and her/his pregnancy. Annie/Thomas remained living as a man while s/he carried a child to full-term. Mr Driver disclosed; 'neither he nor his wife ever suspected that she was a woman masquerading in a man’s clothes, nor, of course, that she was in the condition she proved to be'. Since Annie/Thomas had conceived a child, sexual intercourse took place although the question of consent, of either party, remains unanswered. The inquest revealed Annie/Thomas didn’t always sleep at home and on Saturday nights 'he used to stay somewhere about Manse-street [sic]'. Later in summing up the inquest 'it was suggested that Mr R. Dickson, of the Central Dining Rooms, Manse-street [sic], who was present during the proceedings, could have thrown some further light on matter'. It is unclear from the report as to whether Mr Dickson was sexually involved with Annie/Thomas or whether he was just the owner of the Manse-street dining room. Later newspaper reports suggested the police were searching through Annie/Thomas' correspondence in the hope of finding more information and the Truth called for 'the man responsible for the condition should have been exposed to the public'. The Otago Daily Times approached Annie/Thomas' case differently and used the headline: 'sad end to a romance'. The headline was the only suggestion of a relationship in the article. There were no new details, apart from what was alluded to in the headline, as to whom Annie/Thomas was involved with or the nature of the relationship.

An important phrase in the discourse of cross-gendered identity and behaviour arose from the initial Truth article on Annie/Thomas. The Truth reported:

When there [Invercargill], she said she was neither a male nor female, but a half boy, half girl and, therefore, dressed in male attire.

313 ODT, 6th November 1912, p.5.
314 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
315 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
316 NZT, 16th November 1912, p.6.
317 ODT, 6th November 1912, p.5.
318 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
The statement of self-identification was one of the first reported in the Truth. Annie/Thomas’ use of the phrase ‘neither a male nor a female’ showed a sense of self-awareness and also reflected ‘sexological’ discourse. Krafft-Ebing used the phrase ‘men-women’ in his discussion of individuals at the final stage of degeneration.³¹⁹ Krafft-Ebing’s theories on criminology, sexual deviancy and marriage were printed in the media and it is possible Annie/Thomas was aware of sexological language and ideas, and was placing her/himself into a similar category.³²⁰ In Chapter Four, I will integrate the discourse of ‘half boy, half girl’ into the broader picture of New Zealand cross-gendered landscape.

The Annie/Thomas case used the phrase ‘Another Amy Bock’ in the headline and was described as: ‘an Amy Bock personage’.³²¹ On this occasion the woman, Annie Read, who masqueraded as a male, has met her death under painful and pitiful conditions.³²² In later articles this changed to Annie/Thomas a ‘foolish female who masqueraded as a male’.³²³ Similarities between Bock and Annie/Thomas were reinforced in the ‘Critic’ section on the front page of the Truth:

“Ahem” rebukes this callous newspaper for having headed the sad story of the girl who masqueraded as “Thomas Parkes” in Dunedin as “Another Amy Bock”, and hopes the poor soul is where uncharitable language can harm her not. Jusso. But why such snufflesome [sic] sentiment? There was much similarity in the two cases, and little virtue to waste sympathy on in either.³²⁴

There were, however, two similarities between Amy Bock and Annie/Thomas. Firstly, both Bock and Annie/Thomas wore male attire and lived as men for a period of time, and secondly both Bock and Annie/Thomas immigrated to New Zealand. I will discuss

³¹⁹ Krafft-Ebing, p.399.
³²⁰ Krafft-Ebing was discussed in; NZT, 16th February 1907, p.1; 4th May 1907, p.5; 9th April 1910, p.5; 11th June 1910, p.5; 19th August 1911, p.1. Havelock Ellis was mentioned; NZT 16th February 1907, p.1; 18th May 1907, p.7; 4th May 1907, p.5; 9th April 1910, p.4; 11th June 1910, p.5; 7th January 1911, p.1; 19th August 1911, p.1.
³²¹ NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
³²² NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
³²³ NZT, 16th November 1912, p.5.
³²⁴ NZT, 23rd November 1912, p.1.
in Chapter Four in more detail the links between the media and discourse of Bock and other New Zealand cross-gendered cases.

**Brief Mentions After 1914**

Annie/Thomas was the last case in the *Truth* to receive such widespread attention until the late 1920s. However, between 1914 and 1919 the *Truth* printed some small pieces on cross-gendered behaviour. The term 'shemale' was used a number of times in the *Truth* to describe women who transgressed gender norms. In 1914 a woman was found drunk in Ashburton and was described as a 'nineteen year old shemale'.\(^{325}\) In 1917 a divorce case in Auckland drew the headline 'A fighting female who was called Jack Johnson. A Bride who was a bigamist. Queer divorce case at Auckland'.\(^{326}\) Johnson was described as 'a woman of somewhat remarkable appearance, tall, of dark complexion, and of pugilistic tendencies and that because of her abilities in this direction she was called “Jack” Johnson'.\(^{327}\) It appeared the term 'shemale' was used to describe behaviour considered by the media as outside 'normal' female behaviour. I would hesitate to argue the individuals above were exhibiting cross-gender identity, though it is important to make note of the term 'shemale' and its use in the description of the transgression of normative social behaviour.

**Deresley Morton/ Peter Stratford**

Between 1919 and 1929 stories on morality, venereal disease, World War One and the plight of returning soldiers dominated the pages of the *Truth*.\(^{328}\) There were no significant stories published on female-to-male cross-gendered individuals although

---

325 *NZT*, 20th June 1914, p.4. Ashburton was under prohibition at the time.
326 *NZT*, 26th May 1917, p.11.
327 *NZT*, 26th May 1917, p.11. 'Pugilistic tendencies' was used to refer to boxing ability.
328 For example, Morality: *NZT* 8th October 1921, p.1; 7th February 1925, p.5; 23rd August 1928, p.1. Soldiers: *NZT*, 20th March 1920, p.6; 30th October 1920, p.5; 21st January 1922, p.3. Venereal disease and the 'scarlet scourge': *NZT*, 18th November 1922, p.3; 27th January 1923, p.5; 9th May 1925, p.6; 30th May 1925, p.6; 29th July 1925, p.1.
some articles were printed on male-to-female cross-gendered identity. In 1929, the female-to-male cross-gendered narrative returned to the pages of the *Truth*.

New Zealand Woman Posed as Man and Led a Young “Wife” to Altar.

The *Truth* article suggested Deresley Morton/Peter Stratford had ‘eclipsed’ the case of Amy Bock in ‘consummate skill and cunning’. It appeared Deresley arrived in America at some stage in the early 1910s and worked as a ‘literary service for writers’. In 1912, expecting a lump sum payment for work, Deresley decided to live as Peter Stratford. The reason was explained in letter written by Stratford and published by the *Truth*:

In 1912 there was three hundred dollars back pay coming to me. She promised me this in a lump sum and I was going to strike out as Peter Stratford for some little town in west or south and take up newspaper work. The woman failed to keep her promise and kept me hanging around New York trying to collect...Now, you see, nobody knows Peter Stratford. Deresley Morton faded out years ago.

During the war, Stratford was employed by ‘medical supply service’ and left this job in 1919 with a letter of recommendation. At some stage Stratford moved to Kansas City where he met his future wife Mrs Rowland and they married on 1st October 1925. Mrs Rowland left Stratford three months before s/he died after Peter ‘confide[d] her life secret to the woman she had married’. Letters found with Deresley/Peter’s body showed correspondence with other women up until the time of Stratford’s death. Stratford died in 1928 and was buried in potter’s field, the American equivalent of a pauper’s grave, after no-one claimed his/her body.

---

329 See articles written on Stanley Griffiths; NZT, 19th January 1928, p.5. ‘Man’s belief that he was woman leads to death,’ NZT, 19th April 1928, p.5. ‘Was Stanley Griffiths man or woman?’ Also John Black Batchelor; NZT, 30th August 1928, p.4; NZT, 13th September 1928, p.4; NZT, 6th December 1928, p.5.
330 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
331 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
332 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
333 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
334 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
335 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
'As the face she looked in public. P. Stratford'.

'Little is known about this strange man-woman so far as her New Zealand associations are concerned, but her escapes will go down in history as being among the most weird and strange that ever startled the public in America or any other country'.

Figure 7 Deresley Morton/Peter Stratford.

Figure 8 Stratford's 'wife' Mrs. Rowland disillusioned.
Peter's story was based in America though it is important to discuss the language used in the description of Deresley/Peter's identity and/or behaviour as the case shows a continuation of sexological discourse. In the by-line the Truth described Peter in this way:

No psychological freak intrigues the public imagination more than does the man-woman, that rare specimen who occasionally draws the light of publicity on to incredible escapades.\textsuperscript{339}

The discourse of deception and deceit was prominent throughout the Truth's report but perhaps what is more striking is the link between psychology and cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour. The case of Peter Stratford was described as 'a rare type of freak'.\textsuperscript{340} The Truth stated 'what peculiar twist of her mentality induced her to assume such a purposeless role is one of the mysteries of the mind that would tax a trained psychologist to explain'.\textsuperscript{341} Although it seemed a stretch to link psychology and Peter's 'masquerade' together there were clues throughout the article as to where such an idea may have come from. Peter was described as a 'man-woman', a 'pseudo husband' and woman-husband.\textsuperscript{342} Krafft-Ebing used the phrase 'man-woman' in the description of his final stage of degeneration.\textsuperscript{343} It was the only time in the New Zealand context that the phrase 'man-woman' was used, and the press quickly reverted back to using Amy Bock as the benchmark for cross-gendered cases.

[Continued on page 74.]

\textsuperscript{339} NZT, 13\textsuperscript{th} June 1929, p.7.  
\textsuperscript{340} NZT, 13\textsuperscript{th} June 1929, p.7.  
\textsuperscript{341} NZT, 13\textsuperscript{th} June 1929, p.7.  
\textsuperscript{342} NZT, 13\textsuperscript{th} June 1929, p.7.  
\textsuperscript{343} Krafft-Ebing, p.264.
This Certifies that
Peter Stratford
of Kansas City Mo and
Elizabeth Rowland
of Kansas City Mo
were united by me in
Holy Matrimony

According to the Ordinance of God and the laws of Missouri on the 12th day of Oct in the year of Our Lord 1923

I say God and the Justice of the Peace.

Figure 9 The Marriage Certificate of P. Stratford and E. Rowland.

'One of the quaintest marriage certificates ever issued. The one reproduced was issued to 'Stratford' and his 'bride'.

344 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
Conclusion

I have examined in-depth the cases of 'Boy' Bertha and Annie Read/Thomas Parkes and have given brief overviews of other cases in the 1906 to 1929 time period. A number of discourses were present in the media articles. Each case between 1906 and 1929 featured the discourse of masculine clothing being worn by an individual, and then the term 'masquerader' was used as a descriptive term. The media also catalogued the 'masculine' behaviour of cross-gendered individuals such as smoking and physical strength. The cases of Bertha and Bock integrated the idea of mental instability and 'naughtiness' into the discourse of cross-gendered behaviour. Amy Bock had a significant impact on the discourse of the 'masquerader' and I will return to examine this discourse in more depth in Chapter Four. I have shown there was a significant cross-gendered case history in the media that juxtaposed male attire and behaviour on a female body, with social or criminal transgression. The only clear evidence of a cross-gendered self-identity was in the narrative of Annie Read/Thomas Parkes who died after childbirth. As I move into the 1930s and 1940s I will show how medical and scientific discourse became more prevalent and started to influence the media reports on cross-gendered behaviour and/or identity. Chapter Three will discuss New Zealand's 'modern miracle', Peter Alexander who was heralded as New Zealand's 'own change of sex' case and the 1945 case of Mr X and the complexities of identity in the media reports in her/his court appearance.
Chapter Three: The Men

The men; a simple statement illustrates the themes and discourses contained in this chapter. The scientific and sexological developments of the 1920s in cross-gender identification and/or behaviour were solidified in the 1930s and 1940s and moved into popular discourse. The Truth discussed the use of surgery and theories like the influence of glands and the endocrine system on an individual’s biological sex. Early in the 1930s, stories were printed in the Truth of people, aided by science and medicine, changing sex. The Truth also reported on women who lived as men for significant lengths of time. Three themes emerged from the cases reported in the Truth: women who fought in war as men, athletes who changed sex and, finally, medical transformations. I will discuss each of these themes before I turn my attention to the two New Zealand case studies: Peter Alexander and Mr X. The individuals who fought as men in World War One will be discussed first.

World War One

A mythic presence developed around the female figures that fought as men in World War One and they became part of the wider international canon of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. During the 1930s a number of articles emerged of women, dressed as men, who fought in World War One. The first article was in May 1934 and the Truth reported on the ‘Princess who fought in trenches. Disguised as officer’. The ‘Princess from Paris’ became an officer in the Russian Army and fought on the front line for a week. S/he explained: ‘I shaved my head, and, as my voice is naturally deep and my hands very masculine, nobody ever suspected that I was a woman’. The princess was decorated for bravery after ‘bringing 50 ambulances to safety after they had been lost for four days’. The Truth made no judgement on the case, though it could be concluded there was enough public interest to warrant publication.

---

345 NZT, 9th May 1934, p.8.
346 NZT, 9th May 1934, p.8
347 NZT, 9th May 1934, p.8. The article also described ‘how a Russian actress had followed her until “the secret” was revealed’.
348 NZT, 9th May 1934, p.8.
Colonel Barker was the most well known case of a ‘woman dressed as man’ who fought in World War One. Colonel Barker had appeared in British media when ‘her true sex [was] uncovered’ after an arrest on bankruptcy charges. Barker was also charged with perjury due to ‘his’ marriage to Elride Hayward in 1923. Barker, born Lillian Arkell Smith, lived as a man for six years, served in France during World War One and then lived as a ‘retired officer’ in England. The first report on Colonel Barker in the Truth was in 1934, and again in 1945 in relation to the Auckland trial of Mr X, who was arrested for breaches of the New Zealand Marriage Act. In 1934, Barker appeared in a British court charged with stealing a woman’s purse. The Truth led with the headline:

Extraordinary revelations. Has a 15-year-old son. Once posed as “Colonel Barker” and wore Military Uniform.

Barker’s history was discussed in the article, though s/he appeared under the name John Hill in court. The King’s Counsel advised the ‘bench’:

I want to say in the hearing of people we are going to swear on the jury that having been committed in the name of John Hill, prisoner will be tried in that name and, for the purpose of this trial, it does not matter what the sex, identity, or occupation of the prisoner is.

The court was directed to concentrate on the charge and when ‘Hill’ was questioned about his/her son, the King’s Counsel replied: ‘It does not seem to me to matter whether the son says “Father” or “Mother” or anything else. It is a question that is irrelevant’. The newspaper reports on Hill/Barker documented his masculine attire, a similar discursive theme to early twentieth century articles on cross-gendered figures, such as Bertha, Bock and Read. Hill/Barker wore ‘grey flannel trousers, a grey sweater and a brown jacket’. Hill/Barker was found not guilty of the charges and it wasn’t until 1945 that he appeared in the Truth again. The 1945 article commented that when

---

350 Wheelwright, pp.1-3.
351 NZT, 5th December 1934, p.11.
352 NZT, 5th December 1934, p.11.
353 NZT, 5th December 1934, p.11.
354 NZT, 5th December 1934, p.11.
355 NZT, 5th December 1934, p.11.
Barker emerged from prison 'her skirt hampered her movements; she thought and acted as a man'. 356 I will now turn to discuss the less prominent examples of cross-gendered identity and behaviour in the Truth.

Less Prominent Cases in the Mid-1930s

In April 1934, the Truth commented that 'sex [was] a matter of indifference', in an article titled: 'Girl who lives as a man and a woman'. 357 Jean or Gene Crandall was 'discovered' after s/he received a telegram addressed to 'a woman working as a man'. 358 This was her/his self-narrative:

As a child, she said, she was brought up as a boy, but later, when she was at a commercial social school, her mother had her examined, and afterwards she was dressed in girl’s clothing. ‘When I finished school’, she said, ‘I worked as a girl in various places. After that I went to the Peace River district dressed as a man’. 359

S/he was arrested for vagrancy and ordered by the court to wear women’s clothes. The Truth explained, ‘when employment conditions are bad she changes her sex to the circumstances, and if there is work for a man, dons man’s clothing and applies [for the job]’. 360

Similar headlines appeared throughout the mid-1930s. For instance, 'Woman lives as Man' described the story of a Munich woman who, after 18 months of marriage, discovered her husband was 'a woman'. 361 The marriage was annulled after a doctor’s examination confirmed “Johann” was female. Further investigations revealed “Johann” was formally known as Rosa Kittel of Wasserburg, Bavaria, who had stolen men’s clothes while employed as a house servant. 362 In September 1947, the Truth reported on a seventeen-year-old Maori girl, who had stolen liquor while dressed in male attire. The

357 NZT, 25th April 1934, p.8.
358 NZT, 25th April 1934, p.8. S/he was working as a farm hand in Springfield, Ontario.
361 NZT, 13th March 1935, p.19. ‘Johann’ produced no identity papers when the two married.
judge said there seemed 'nothing wrong with her but no one was able to do anything with the girl'. All of these headlines centred upon the less prominent cases of individuals who wore male attire and masculine behaviour. However, another theme developed soon after the 1932 Olympic Games.

Mary/Mark Weston

After the 1932 Olympic Games officials suggested all women athletes be medically examined to confirm their sex. A London doctor had described women athletes as 'undeveloped men who subsequently developed male characteristics'. Mr Sims, an Olympic official, described these 'male characteristics' in the following terms:

their hair cut exactly like men, wore men's pants at all times, talked in deep voices, like men, and generally behaved like men. Many of the legs of these women were said to be muscular and exactly like any man's legs, especially if they were athletically inclined.

The act of confirmation of the sex of women athletes was controversial and did not receive immediate support from Olympic members. However, after two publicised cases of female athletes 'changing sex', some sports competitions started sex confirmation tests. The cases of Mary/Mark Weston and Zdenka Koubka in the mid-1930s were the highly publicised and well-documented cases of such 'sex change' athletes. Both athletes had risen to considerable prominence in their chosen sports and then 'changed sex' to live as men. Both cases appeared in the New Zealand media and were mentioned in the case of Peter Alexander, New Zealand's 'sex change miracle'. I will examine Mary/Mark Weston first.

Mary Weston was born in Britain and 'all his [sic] life she was a tomboy'. Childhood characteristics generally associated with cross-gendered behaviour and/or identity were

---

364 E.C. Greyland, Research Notes, Ref 80-371, unattributed newspaper clippings. A London doctor put forward this theory.
365 Greyland, 'Research Notes'.
366 Meyerowitz, Sex Changes, pp.33-35 for brief discussion on Weston and Koubkov. Various publications had different spellings of Koubkov's name.
367 Greyland, 'Research Notes'.

78
apparent in Weston who hated wearing calico chemises and 'licked all the girls at games'. At the age of eighteen Weston became an athlete and appeared in the British championships. From 1924 onwards s/he was the English female shot-put champion, and in 1927 became a champion javelin thrower. Weston retired from sport and 'underwent an operation to change into a man'. Her/his 'voice took on a deeper tone, and her features assumed just a shade more masculine complexion', though it is unclear at what time in her/his life these changes happened. Dr L. R. Broster, a New Zealand born London surgeon, stated: 'Mark Weston, who has always been brought up as a female, is a male and should continue to live as such'. Dr Broster worked at Charing Cross hospital and had considerable experience in cross-gendered individuals. He had operated on a 'number of young women who developed male characteristics'. The average 'age of onset of “virilism” (manifestations of male characteristics) was fifteen according to Dr Broster'. Mary became Mark Weston and married a long time friend.

[Continued on page 81.]

568 Greyland, 'Research Notes'.
569 Greyland, 'Research Notes'. See also Wickets, D., 'Can Sex in Humans be Changed?', in Physical Culture, 1,1937, p.16. The date of championship is listed as 1926 in this article.
570 Greyland, 'Research Notes'.
571 Greyland, 'Research Notes'.
572 Wickets, p.16.
573 Greyland, 'Research Notes'.
574 Greyland, 'Research Notes'.

79
Figure 10 Mary/Mark Weston.

'Mary Weston competing in the Javelin Championship in the Women's A.A.A. Championships at Stramford Bridge, London, 1929. She won the event and later became a man'.

The image of Mary/Mark Weston featured in the *Truth* article on Peter Alexander, who I will discuss later in this chapter. The inclusion of Mary/Mark Weston picture in the *Truth* showed an awareness of international 'sex changes' in New Zealand.

Zdeněk Koubkova

In October 1936, the Truth published a picture of Zdeněk Koubkova, previously a female Olympic athlete, shaving. The caption read Koubkova was shaving ‘a heavy day’s growth of beard from his cheeks’. Koubkova had set world records in White City, London in 1934 in the 80m and 800m. In 1935, suspicions as to his ‘true sex’ arose ‘while he was wearing his running togs’. Koubkova admitted it would be a mistake to continue to compete as a woman as he was about to have an operation to ‘give him his true sex, which was male’. Koubkova was allowed to keep his world records after the Olympic committee ruled he was technically female when he achieved them.

A number of operations were performed on Koubkova over a period of time. The first operation was in December 1935 and he ‘appeared the next day in the best of health and spirits in male attire’. The Czech government changed Koubkova’s birth certificate from ‘female’ to ‘male’ after the first operation. It was unclear what was involved in each operation though it could be inferred that the first operation was a hysterectomy, as it has been documented that the removal of reproductive organs was necessary to obtain new sex on a birth certificate. I will return to the discussions on change of sex documentation in a later section of this chapter.

Koubkova was ‘officially killed so that he could arise from her ashes’. Koubkova underwent another operation in Prague in March 1936 and travelled to New York for a ‘further operation preparatory to marrying a young woman’. It is unclear whether this operation went ahead as Koubkova left New York and went to Europe reportedly, for another operation. Koubkova’s manager explained Koubkova’s sex was ‘again dubious’, and Koubkova was upset by the requirement of another operation:

---

376 NZT, 14th October 1936, p.19.
377 NZT, 14th October 1936, p.19.
378 Wickets, p.16.
379 Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
380 Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
381 Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
382 Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
383 Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
384 Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
385 Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.

81
I want to be a man, he said. I have always had more of the inclinations of a man than of a woman. I feel all right, but my manager and the doctors say I need another operation.\textsuperscript{385}

It is unknown what was involved in each operation or how successful they were. Koubkova wrote a story of his life where he told of the:

dawning suspicions that the feminine was not his real sex. He declared that as a male he would none the less retain his girlish soul and would think no more of marriage to a woman than, as a girl, he had thought of marriage to a man.\textsuperscript{386}

It is unknown from the newspaper reports if Koubkova married. What is clear, though, is the presence of a discourse of medical intervention in cross-gendered identity and a masculine soul. Both Weston and Koubkova’s cases are important as they allude to surgical intervention in cross-gendered identity as well as the placing the cross-gendered experience on an international level. The stories were printed in New Zealand newspapers, therefore it can be inferred that there was some understanding about sex changes circulating in New Zealand.

[Continued on page 84.]

\textsuperscript{385} Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.  
\textsuperscript{386} Greyland, ‘Research Notes’. 
"With expert stokes of the razor, Zdenke Koubkova, 24, of Czechoslovakia, who for 22 years lived as a girl, shaves a heavy day's growth of beard from his cheeks. As a woman, Koubkova set the world's women's 800 metre record at International games in London in 1934. He arrived in New York recently to fill a night club engagement.\textsuperscript{387}

\textsuperscript{387}NZT, 14\textsuperscript{th} October 1936, p.19.
Sexology and Science in the Print Media

An article published in 1937 discussed some of the sexological, scientific and medical discourses and mentioned both Koubkova and Weston. The article ‘Can sex in humans be changed?’ appeared in Physical Culture, a magazine available in New Zealand. Therefore discussions on what constituted ‘male’, ‘female’ and the sexological theories behind sex changes had entered the New Zealand consciousness. The Physical Culture article outlined the cases of Weston and Koubkova and argued ‘science had actually succeeded in changing the gender of two female athletes... accomplished by surgery and duly acknowledged by law’. As well as the overview and photos of the two athletes, the article also examined the science behind the ‘sex changes’ to answer the question of whether or not ‘science could alter the sex of a human being’. The work of Steinach, Hirschfeld and Ellis were discussed to explain three factors considered to influence sex and sex changes. The three factors included chromosomes, ‘glands of internal secretion’ and ‘impressions received by the senses by the central nervous system’. The article also referred to Hirschfeld’s Theory of Intermediaries along with Ellis’ idea of Eonism to illustrate sex was more complex than ‘male’ or ‘female’. The article concluded that a ‘complete transformation of sex is not accomplished even in animals’ with the help of ‘endocrinologists, plastic surgeons, and surgeons’. Therefore the ‘two athletes cited in the beginning of this article never were normal females; if they had been, no medical hocus-pocus, no surgical miracle, could have transformed them into men’. I will now focus on the sexological, and later scientific and medical ideas and articles published in the Truth.

The first scientific based article was titled ‘Changing into a Man: Girl’s Astonishing Transformation’. The story, from Oakland, detailed the ‘transformation’ of a girl that doctors blamed on ‘a disturbance of the delicate balance between the thyroid and the

---

388 See Eric McCormick, Private Journal, MS-Papers-5599-26, ATL, passim.
389 Wickets, p.16.
390 Wickets, p.16.
391 Steinach was previously discussed in footnote 101, p.24, Chapter One. Steinach reversed the sex of rats by observing the results of swapping their genitals.
392 Wickets, p.16.
393 Wickets, p.85.
394 Wickets, p.85.
adrenal glands'. The girl was ‘not becoming a man in fact but was only acquiring male characteristics’. These characteristics were described in the following way:

The girl’s once wavy golden hair has become brown and coarse. She developed a moustache and has to shave nearly every day. Rounded feminine contours changed to broad shoulders, her hands became larger and harder and her general manner changed from feminine to masculine.

The doctors claimed to ‘save her from becoming a man’ they had to remove her thyroid gland and place her on an adrenal diet. The girl remained in hospital for many months. This case was one of the first scientific reports of cross-gendered identity and behaviour in the Truth.

There were cases of people who underwent ‘sex change’ procedures and later decided to ‘reverse’ the process. In 1936, for instance, it was reported that Bosilko Stoyanoff was ‘tired of being a man’. Although published in Truth, this article originally came from a Vienna newspaper. At the age of sixteen Bosilko was admitted to hospital where a doctor ‘observed a number of male traits’. A doctor operated, and ‘Bosilka became Bosilko’. Bosilko developed a ‘beard and excelled at football and other manly sports’ but at the age of twenty-one there was a change:

the beard began to disappear and female characteristics became predominant again. The most significant sign of Bosilko’s basic femininity came when she fell in love with a young man. In order to marry him, she (or is it he?) decided to undergo a fresh operation, but lacked the necessary funds.

Bosilko sued the original doctor after ‘a number of experts’ thought an error was made in the performance of the operation. Again this highlights medical intervention was possible in cases of cross-gendered identity and suggests that a clear demarcation

---

399 NZT, 17th January 1934, p.14. No details were published on what was involved in an adrenal diet.
401 NZT, 30th December 1936, p.16.
402 NZT, 30th December 1936, p.16.
403 NZT, 30th December 1936, p.16. The article did not include details of Bosilko operation.
404 NZT, 30th December 1936, p.16.
405 NZT, 30th December 1936, p.16.
between feminine and masculine characteristics, both emotional and physical, existed in the medical and scientific canon. The development of facial hair was seen as a clear indicator of masculinity and during the 1930s the picture of a man shaving became standard in the newspaper reports and part of the discourse on cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

One of the more curious cases during this era was Anna John Budd who was described in an advertisement as 'nature's living wonder'. Anna John Budd was described in the *Dominion* as the 'Famed Man-Woman' who was 'to display her very astonishing transformation at the Evans Bay carnival' in Wellington. Anna was born in 1900 in Vancouver Canada and was described in the *Dominion* as a 'normal child'. It appears that at some unknown stage 'her' voice became deeper, 'she' developed facial hair, 'her' muscles were more 'powerful' and 'the bones heavier on her right side'. According to Anna John the most 'notable characteristic of her changing world is in awareness that man possess an aggressive pugnacity which is in direct contrast with the defensive timidity of woman.'

[continued on page 88.]

---

406 *Dom*, 20th December 1938, p.3. The case of Anna John Budd is also mentioned in Daley, p.61.
408 *Dom*, 27th December 1938, p.13.
EVANS BAY CARNIVAL
NATURE'S LIVING WONDER.
ANNA JOHN BUDD.
THE MAN-WOMAN
Part Man—Part Woman.
NOT AN ILLUSION

From one side, this remarkable person presents the perfect profile of a normally developed man, and the other side gives the aspect of a well-proportioned female. Doctors and Scientists are baffled. Which—He or She?

See 'Anna John Budd, the Man-Woman at the EVANS BAY CARNIVAL'.

Figure 12 Anna John Budd.\(^{411}\)

\(^{411}\) Dom, 27\(^{th}\) December 1938. p.13.
In 1947, the Truth led with the headline ‘Woman Became Man after Operation’.\(^{412}\) In Stockholm, Elizabeth became Bertil after an operation. Elizabeth was described as ‘quite normal’ and attended a mixed sex school.\(^{413}\) At the age of 21 an ‘unusual physical development was noted’ and after observation, doctors decided to operate.\(^{414}\) The reason given for the operation was a ‘malformation at birth completely concealing male organs’.\(^{415}\) The media explained Elizabeth’s ‘malformation’ affected the development of sexual characteristics and was discovered later in her life than was ‘usual’, however the ‘operation restore[d] [Bertil to] normal conditions’.\(^{416}\) The Truth stated there was ‘secrecy’ surrounding the case but Bertil’s ‘re-adaptation to an entirely new life’ were to be studied by Swedish psychologists.\(^{417}\)

The final international case to mention is of Margaret and Dorothy Muller who became David and Daniel Muller. Although there was scarce information reported it was known that the twins had ‘always showed a tendency towards boys’ games’ and in 1946 they started showing signs of ‘changing sex’.\(^{418}\) They were both admitted to hospital in Capetown, where Dr Steenkamp operated and said ‘they were both masculine in every respect’.\(^{419}\) Daniel wanted to join the Army and their mother was reported to be ‘delighted at the change’.\(^{420}\)

**Surgery, Science and the Cross-gendered Individual**

Before I move to discuss the two major case studies of this chapter, Peter Alexander and Mr X, it is important to consider what types of surgery and medical treatment were available for cross-gendered individuals. In Chapter One I discussed sexological approaches to cross-gendered behaviour and identity, noting how scientific developments influenced the medical treatment of female-to-male cross-gendered

---

\(^{412}\) NZT, 13\(^{rd}\) August 1947, p.16.
\(^{413}\) NZT, 13\(^{rd}\) August 1947, p.16.
\(^{414}\) NZT, 13\(^{rd}\) August 1947, p.3.
\(^{415}\) NZT, 13\(^{rd}\) August 1947, p.3.
\(^{416}\) NZT, 13\(^{rd}\) August 1947, p.3.
\(^{417}\) NZT, 13\(^{rd}\) August 1947, p.3.
\(^{418}\) Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
\(^{419}\) Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
\(^{420}\) Greyland, ‘Research Notes’.
individuals. However, tracing the history of surgical and medical treatment of female-to-male individuals is difficult, and there are inconsistencies in the available information.

The production of a synthetic testosterone in 1935, available as a pill or an injection, was a significant development in the treatment of female-to-male individuals who sought sex/gender reassignment.\textsuperscript{421} Michael Dillion describes how testosterone pills were available for 'sex changes', and he obtained them in England in the late 1930s for his own sex re-assignment.\textsuperscript{422} The use of testosterone meant female-to-male individuals developed such male secondary sexual characteristics as the development of masculine pattern of muscle mass, facial hair, and a deeper voice. It is unclear when hormones became available in New Zealand. In 1945 the Truth’s Good Health column suggested ‘hormone therapy’ as a treatment option in response to queries on glandular deficiency and undescended genital glands.\textsuperscript{423} The doctor who responded to the inquiry stated hormone therapy ‘has been available for several years’.\textsuperscript{424} However, it is difficult to untangle the links between the surgical ‘sex change’ process and legal and social discourse, and such complexities need to be extrapolated from the available information.

Female-to-male ‘sex change’ surgery consisted of numerous operations, not all of them financially accessible or ‘required’ for a legal change of sex. The surgical process could involve all or some of the following: removal of breast tissue (chest reconstruction or mastectomy), hysterectomy and/or oophorectomy (removal of uterus and/or ovaries), and the construction of a penis and/or scrotum. In the early twentieth century mastectomies and hysterectomies were performed for female disease processes, such as cancer, tumours and chronic pain. However, cases of cross-gendered people legally


\textsuperscript{422} Kennedy, P. and Hodgkinson L. I consider it debatable that Dillion was the ‘first’ modern sex change as there is contradictory evidence and various definitions of what was considered a ‘sex change’.

\textsuperscript{423} NZT, 13\textsuperscript{th} June, 1945, p.22; NZT, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1945, p.26. The sex of the individual was not clear in one of the letters, however the discussion of ‘glandular deficiency’ and hormone treatment suggests the enquiry came from a male. The hormone therapy for ‘undescended genital glands was ‘six injections at bi-weekly intervals’.

\textsuperscript{424} NZT, 13\textsuperscript{th} June, 1945, p.22; NZT, 17\textsuperscript{th} October 1945, p.26.
changing their sex after surgery were documented. One case was Alberta Lucille who in 1917, after a hysterectomy, changed identity papers to Allan Hart.\footnote{Bullough V.L., and Bullough B. *Cross Dressing, Sex, and Gender*, Philadelphia, 1993, pp.255-256. Devor H., *FTM: Female-to-Male Transsexuals in Society*, Bloomington, 1997, p.32.}

There are conflicting accounts in the available literature of what genital surgeries were available and during what time period. One of the first cases of genital surgery for a ‘sex change’ has been cited as Sophia Hedwig, who in 1882, had surgery ‘to make her external genitalia appear more like a male’s’.\footnote{Bullough and Bullough, *Cross Dressing*, p.255. Bullough and Bullough question where this could be consider a sex change ‘an attempt to treat pseudohermaphrodisim’.} The next ‘reported’ surgery was in 1922 when Harold Gillies, a London plastic surgeon, described ‘a simple operation [on an un-stated individual]...and “she” was no longer of that gender’.\footnote{Hodgkinson, p.77. The question was also raised as to whether this surgery was due to hypospadias, the ‘underdevelopment’ of the genitals.} What was involved in this particular operation can only be guessed, though Gillies became well-known for his plastic surgery techniques on World War One casualties and later for his operations on cross-gendered individuals.\footnote{See Kennedy, and Hodgkinson Chapter Five and Pound, R. Gillies: Surgeon Extra-ordinary, London, 1964, pp.140-141, 204, 244.} In about 1916 Gillies developed the tube pedicle technique that consisted of raising a piece of flesh to create a tube that would be cut and reattached on any area of the body.\footnote{Hodgkinson, p.68.} The technique was used in various reconstructive surgeries as well as the operation to create a penis, known as a phalloplasty.\footnote{Hodgkinson, p.68.} Michael Dillion received numerous operations, performed by Gillies between 1945 and 1949 to construct a penis, and Gillies is considered by some scholars as the first to perfect the technique of the phalloplasty.\footnote{See Hodgkinson, Kennedy and Pound.} One account of Dillion’s surgery, by Laura Hodgkinson, suggested Gillies’ diagnosis of Dillion was ‘acute hypospadias,’ where the genitals are not fully formed, in order to perform the operation.\footnote{Hodgkinson, p.66.} There is contradictory evidence of phalloplasty surgery being performed in Europe in the 1930s. An article published in 1936 by Nikolaj A. Bogoraz described a phalloplasty; though it is unclear whether the recipient was cross-gendered, as it was
possible the operation consisted of a reconstruction, after an injury, of a biological male penis.\footnote{33}

The history of medical and surgical intervention on cross-gendered people is complex and contradictory, and the only certainty is that testosterone was available in 1935 for use by female-to-male individuals. ‘Sex change’ operations took place in the early to mid twentieth century and the name and sex of people were altered on birth certificates, as I have shown in previous sections on Weston and Koubkova. What constituted a legal and/or social ‘change of sex’ is open to interpretation. In some cases it appears a hysterectomy, which removed reproductive capacity, was enough for a ‘change of sex’ on a birth certificate. This was complicated when the case of Michael Dillion is taken into consideration, as he did not receive a hysterectomy, but a mastectomy and a phalloplasty. To further complicate the legal and social landscape, a recent bibliography by John Thorp, a female-to-male cross-gendered New Zealander who in the 1950s travelled to England to live as a man and have surgery, discussed how he needed the ‘addition of a phallic roll of flesh, the sole legal requirement acceptable to society’.\footnote{34} In the New Zealand context, prior to 1995, there appears to be no legal statute for change of sex on birth certificates.\footnote{35} This leaves the researcher with a complex intersection of ideas associated with cross-gendered identity and behaviour from medical technology, social ascribed meaning, and legal definitions of sex. I will expand on these issues throughout the rest of this chapter and in Chapter Four.

Each of the above cases illustrates one of three themes: women wearing male attire and going to war, female athletes who changed sex and, finally, scientific and medical changes of sex. Together the cases illustrate that New Zealanders, specifically those in control of the news media, were interested and informed - to a degree - on ‘sex changes’ and the ‘sex change’ discourse. Discourse analysis shows medical language emerged in the newspaper articles, and this in turn can lead to the conclusion that the


\footnote{34} Thorp, J., A Change For Good, Auckland, 2006, p.75. Thorp discussed the illegality of such operations in the 1950s.

general public understood ‘sex change’ treatment or at least had an understanding of the complexities of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. All of the cases prior to 1937 created a backdrop to New Zealand’s ‘sex change miracle,’ Peter Alexander, whom I will now analyse closely before turning my attention to Mr X who appeared in an Auckland court for breaches of the Marriage Act.

Peter Alexander

New Zealand woman becomes a man! Former schoolgirl Tennis Champion; Astounding case; Life story to “Truth.”

The Truth heralded the case of Peter Alexander as a ‘modern miracle.’ Most of the information contained in the Truth’s articles came from interviews with Peter himself. The importance of this case lies in Peter’s agency and reflective narrative and the medical and sexological discourse associated with Peter’s ‘change of sex.’ This section contains a detailed outline of Peter’s narrative and an examination of the sexological discourse.

Registered in Manawatu as ‘female at birth’, Mavis Huggins, who later took the name Peter Alexander, was described as a ‘bonny baby with grey eyes and wavy hair’. She came from ‘a very well-known and much respected New Zealand family, was very smart at school, and was looked upon as a brilliant pupil’. During her/his school years Mavis/Peter was a violinist, a pianist and ‘a very fast sprinter, while she also excelled at other games’. In early childhood Mavis/Peter had ‘many characteristics which did not seem right for a girl to have’. These included:

439 NZT, 25th August 1937, p.1. The first article written by the Truth claimed to know the ‘original name’ of Peter ‘but for obvious reasons does not publish it’. The name ‘Mavis Huggins’ was revealed in the Truth’s October 1937 article.
441 NZT, 13th October 1937, p.1.
... she would not play with dolls like other baby girls. She would throw her doll down, but whoop with joy at the chance to kick a football or use a cricket bat. Unlike most girls, she loved throwing stones. 443

Mavis/Peter also had the strength and endurance beyond a girl. 444 S/he was able to work 'so long and so hard without showing the fatigue which was to be expected in a mere slip of a girl'. 445 This strength was reflected in her/his sporting prowess, as s/he won the 1927 school tennis championships and it was described that:

She showed masterly speed on the courts, hitting powerfully and playing half-court and net, unusual tactics for a woman player unless she is a real top-notch [sic]. Her driving amazed spectators, and so also did her crisp net work. At the time, of course, she did not realise the reason for such ability. 446

It was suggested, in the Truth, that masculine tendencies were present from a young age. 447 As a child Mavis relayed s/he:

would stand up and bow when a lady entered the room. "One day I felt an awful fool in a lift. A lady got in and I pulled off my beret. The people looked at me. There were ladies in the lift. 'You should have been a boy' said the attendant with a smile. I said nothing, but began to wonder after that if I was a boy after all." 448

Until the age of 18, Mavis/Peter saw him/herself as a girl but at 'about 18 years old' her/his body had started to change and he sought the advice of a doctor. 449 At this point Mavis/Peter's narrative became disjointed. Two narratives were present in the newspaper reports to explain why Mavis/Peter sought the advice of a medical doctor. Mavis/Peter's relationship as a youth with a young man was the first narrative and the second was the start of physical changes.

'No safety razor for Peter Alexander, even though he had to learn shaving a short time ago! He favors [sic] a "cut-throat" blade, which is more than can be said for many young men of 24'.

---

Images of Peter partaking in 'masculine' pursuits featured in both of the *Truth* articles. Not only did the photographs give visual confirmation of Peter the man but they also reflected the dominant discursive image of the 'sex changed' man, both masculine in features and social pursuits. The pictures of Peter were similar to the international pictures of Mary/Mark Weston and Zdenke Koubkova. The images of cross-gendered men shaving, smoking, and in various 'masculine' activities would become cemented into popular discourse.

---

*NZT, 25th August 1937, p.1.*
Peter’s involvement with a young man raised some questions about his identity:

One night a boy with whom I had been out tried to kiss me good-bye at the gate. I felt as if I would like to hit him. He looked at me in amazement, and then said, ‘Whatever is the matter with you? I want to marry you one day’. 452

After the young man’s proposal, Peter ‘thought things over very seriously, and decided to go and see a doctor’. 453 The catalyst for Peter’s visit to the doctor was not in regard to his sexuality, but the question of his sex. In a later interview Peter explained ‘how could I go about to be a man, marrying another man? The whole thing is a mix up whichever way you look at it, don’t you think?’ 454 Peter was engaged at the age of 20 but broke the engagement off when s/he ‘realised her sex was changing’. 455 At the time of the first interview, Peter had met a young woman in Sydney who he planned to marry after he had further operations. 456

[Continued on page 98.]

455 NZT, 13th October 1937, p.1.
Peter's travelled to Sydney to spend time with 'the Bondi girl whom he one day hopes to marry.' Around March 1937 Peter met the woman he planned to marry on board the Maunganui on a trip to Sydney. Peter described the woman as broken hearted when hearing of his 'sex change' but 'she stuck by me and said if I was operated on and became a real man she would marry me.' Peter was concerned about the media discovering the name of his 'friend' and explained:

'I refuse to give them any information...only a cad would disclose her name.'

---

459 NZT, 13th October 1937, p.1
The changes to her/his body were the other catalyst for Peter’s decision to seek medical advice. The first ‘change’ noticed by Peter was a ‘great and irresistible desire’ to wear male clothing:

The desire came on me suddenly...I wanted to get out of my skirts and put on trousers, I did not tell anybody, because the desire soon seemed to pass. But then it would come back again. And each time there was more ongoing with it. The feeling was insistent, if you know what I mean.461

Peter also made a ‘startling discovery’ as he had begun to ‘develop muscles which did not seem right’.462 He relayed the following physical changes:

One day I was talking to some people it seemed to break quite suddenly, as if it was coming from my stomach and not my throat at all. It was a voice I had never heard before. It was of a much deeper tone than it previously had been. My complexion I noticed one night, after wiping off some night cream, seemed to have become a shade more masculine.463

Peter was ‘hirsute’ and the Truth described how he felt ‘self-conscious’ and ‘dress[ed] on his own’.464 Although these changes were framed as part of a ‘startling discovery’ it is not known whether they happened before or after ‘treatment’. The Truth’s framed the ‘discoveries’ as part of the ‘troubles’ that were the catalyst for Peter seeking medical advice and many of the cases of ‘sex changes’ in the media had a similar discourse of spontaneous bodily changes.

Peter saw a number of doctors in the course of his ‘treatment’. Both the Truth’s and Peter’s narratives focussed on the doctor’s conclusions. One doctor Peter consulted told him, he ‘was about to become a man’.465 His reaction was:

461 NZT, 25th August 1937, p.1. Peter required a permit possibly from either the police or court, to wear male clothing. However it is unclear whether this was required for life in New Zealand or Australia.
465 NZT, 25th August 1937, p.1. It is unclear whether the doctor mentioned was Peter’s New Zealand doctor or another doctor. The placement of the quote in the Truth article leaves all possibilities open.
my heart leapt with joy...I had always had the secret longing to be a male, and the thought that I was actually a man made my senses reel. No one knows how I have felt during the gradual change which has been taking place within me. 466

Peter was sent to Sydney for 'treatment' on the advice of 'a medical man', though the Truth did not document what was involved in the treatment. 467 Peter said he 'walked the streets of Sydney, as a man' and he 'had confidence because I knew no one could say I was not a man or almost a man...treatment was all that was necessary'. 468

[Continued on page 101.]

---

466 NZT, 25th August 1937, p.1. There is an interesting juxtaposition, as earlier on Peter did not claim that he felt 'male' only that he noticed changes in his desire.
Figure 16 'New Zealand's medical wonder enjoys a pipe'.

Figure 17 Peter posed for *Truth*.

'My heart leapt with joy when I knew I was a man. – Peter Alexander, but recently an attractive blonde, posed for a special *Truth* picture'.

---

469 NZT, 13th October 1937, p.1.
Peter was also sent to London for an 'operation' that was described as a way for Peter to 'be a man for good'. 471 Although the Truth did not discuss what the operation entailed, it is likely it was the removal of the reproductive organs and the construction of a penis/phallus, as such operations were available overseas. In a later interview Peter explained one of the reasons for the operation: 'I say my sex has changed so that I can marry. Such is not yet the case. My doctors tell me that I will be able to marry the same as Mark Weston did, after I have been further operated upon'. 472 The Truth established this further:

...he was not yet a real man, and does not pretend to be one. He is a man, though, except that, he was born a girl, his certificate classes him as such. Until he has had his operation, he is at law really a woman, although no one in the world would take him as one. 473

It was argued science and medicine was going to help him become a 'real man,' Peter concurred; 'I intend to live the normal life of a man. When I get married I will take my wife to some place where I am not known'. 474

[Continued on page 103.]

Figure 18 Peter Alexander with Miss Jean Traylor.

'Peter Alexander and his friend Miss Jean Traylor, who met him in Wellington and travelled to Australia aboard the same boat, enjoy a joke together'. 475

Miss Jean Traylor had danced with Peter at a ball in Wellington not knowing anything about him. He 'danced divinely' and when she saw his photo in the papers later 'she says she got the shock of her life'. 476

The discourses present in Peter's narrative reflected a number of sexological works. Peter's narrative of 'kick[ing] a football or using a cricket bat' as well as 'not playing with dolls like other baby girls' were firmly established in the sexological discourse of cross-gendered behaviour and identity. As discussed in Chapter One, Westphal, Krafft-Ebing and Hirschfeld, all thought there was a link between prolonged cross-gendered identification and behaviour in childhood, and the adult cross-gender experience. However, Peter's account departs from these early sexologists as he was 'treated' for his 'condition'. Therefore the 'treatment' aspect of Peter's story is similar to Ellis' theories. Ellis suggested in cases such as Peter's, there was an 'unusual balance in the endocrine system, inborn and sometimes...inherited'. Although it was unclear if Ellis considered treatment necessary for such a condition, his theory did link cross-gender behaviour and identity and science. It is also important to note the widespread media attention the cases of Weston and Koubkova received. As previously discussed, such cases contributed to the public's knowledge of 'sex change' treatment. Perhaps the most important feature of Peter's case was that he did not claim to be a man until he had had the necessary operations. Therefore the link between sex/gender and science became closer than previously theorised. But Peter would only be the first glimmer of 'the man' in the canon of cross-gendered identity in New Zealand. In 1945 Mr X appeared in the Truth, and the discourse of cross-gendered identity and behaviour the media again changed.

MR X

I will now turn to the case of Mr X, who lived as a man for ten years before he was arrested in 1945 for breaches of the Marriage Act. Mr X, who became the subject of debates around medicine, science and morality, was represented in the media and in the court in a combination of old and new representations. Mr X was discussed as a man, a woman/masquerader and a lesbian.

478 Ellis, p.110. See Chapter One pp.23-24 for more detailed examination of Ellis' theory.
479 The court suppressed the names of both Mr X and his wife. There were no images printed of Mr X in any of the newspapers.
Mr X was born and lived in Auckland and apart from two comments made about his early childhood, little information was reported in New Zealand newspapers about his early life. **Firstly, girls were attracted to Mr X and secondly, that 'quite early in life she [sic] showed male tendencies'.** Sexologists like Krafft-Ebing and Hirschfeld, and previous cases in the media, such as Peter Alexander, made similar comments on the childhood experiences of cross-gendered individuals. During the Depression years Mr X started to live as a man after he 'realised his life as a girl was beset with difficulties'. He had lost several jobs due to his masculine appearance and, at one point, was accused of being a man dressed as a woman. **During World War II, Mr X was called in a ballot for military service though he was turned down after his mother disclosed his 'real sex'.** A medical exam confirmed his mother's revelation and Mr X was described as a 'well-nourished woman of about 27'. Mr X was later questioned by the Auckland Star on why he wanted to fight in World War II, 'Why not? he queried. I was as strong and able to fight as any man.'

At the time of their marriage in 1945, both Mr X, 30 years old, and his wife, 18 years old, worked for the same firm, Mr X as a labourer and his wife as a clerk. Mr X's wife insisted they marry and newspapers reported she was 'aware' Mr X's 'actual sex' was 'female'. They were married at the Registrar's Office in Auckland and both their mothers acted as witnesses. The Registrar General recognised Mr X's name from his attempt to serve in the Army and the authorities were alerted. Both Mr X and his wife admitted to the charge of breaching of the Marriage Act. Mr X was also accused of 'represent[ing] as a male and a bachelor' after he admitted to 'her [sic] identity and true sex and having gone through a form of marriage'. Mr X's counsel argued in court: 'they have been dismissed from their jobs and have been punished in that respect and

---

480 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
481 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6.
482 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
483 Dom, 27th September 1945, p.6; AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6.
484 Dom, 27th September 1945, p.6; AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
485 Dom, 27th September 1945, p.6; AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
486 Dom, 27th September 1945, p.6.
487 NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
488 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6; NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
489 Dom, 27th September 1945, p.6.
490 NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
491 NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15; Dom, 27th September 1945, p.6.
in the publicity their case has received'.\footnote{NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15.} The judge sentenced both Mr X and his wife to ‘three years probation on the condition they submitted themselves to a psychiatrist, carried out his directions, and remained apart from each other’.\footnote{NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15.}

There are three strands of discourse represented in the media accounts of Mr X's case: the man, the woman/masquerader, and the lesbian. Each of these discursive elements make up the complex picture of Mr X, and need to be read and analysed alongside one another. I will discuss each theme in turn, starting with Mr X the man, before examining the media, legal, medical and religious reaction to Mr X's breast surgery and then Mr X the lesbian.

Journalists from the \textit{Auckland Star} interviewed Mr X soon after his arrest. This interview was significant as it presented Mr X's self-narrative as distinct from the discourse that would later transpire in the court and subsequent media accounts. The \textit{Auckland Star} interviewed Mr X at his house and their first impression was of a 'broad shouldered, husky looking individual wearing an open shirt and grey slacks'.\footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.} They were taken into:

a typical bachelor's room containing a single bed, above which was a bookcase and several photographs obviously of 'Mr X,' one showing him with a pipe. These photographs could be mistaken for those of a glamorous Hollywood male film star. On a dressing table stood a pot of hair cream and other male toilet accessories. Male clothing was lying about and on a shelf reposed a copy of "Esquire".\footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.}

During the interview, Mr X relayed the events that preceded his arrest. During the 1930s he realised his life as a girl was difficult for him as he had ‘a natural inclination to masculine pursuits’ as well as a masculine appearance.\footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6; Dom, 27\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.} He lost two jobs, when his employers ‘accused [him] of being a boy masquerading as a girl’.\footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6; Dom, 27\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.} He explained: ‘I was perfectly natural, that is more like a man than a woman. I felt my position keenly and

\begin{itemize}
  \item \footnote{NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15.}
  \item \footnote{NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15.}
  \item \footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.}
  \item \footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.}
  \item \footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6; Dom, 27\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.}
  \item \footnote{AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.}
\end{itemize}
at length realised that the simplest way out was to become a man. Mr X questioned the validity of criticisms directed toward him:

Haven’t I been justified in deciding that the only way to hold a job was by being a man? I’ve held the job I’m in over two years and mixed freely with hundreds of men, and nobody regards me as anything but a man. I am endowed with a masculine physique which has helped me out. Now if this comes out, I suppose it means the end of everything.

The journalists calculated Mr X’s success at a male/masculine life by his pursuits and his reaction to other men. He was described as ‘proficient in several manly sports including swimming, rowing, tennis and boxing’ and was able to ‘stand up’ for himself in ‘rough and tumble’. Mr X’s reaction to men was ‘normal, just as yours would be’.

There were two ideas present within Mr X’s self-narrative. Firstly, it is clear Mr X ‘felt’ more masculine than feminine, and this was discussed by both the Auckland Star’s descriptions of Mr X’s behaviour and hobbies and by Mr X himself. This idea of feeling ‘more masculine’ continued into his assessment of his marriage where he explained that although the marriage may seem unusual for the public, to him ‘acting and feeling like a male, it seemed perfectly natural’. The second theme involved employment issues as Mr X reported the ‘only way to hold a job’ was to work as a man. Whether employment issues were the catalyst for living as a man was unclear, however Mr X seemed to find jobs easier as a man.

The Auckland Star article ended with the journalists asserting Mr X’s masculinity:

he was any young man about town, except that his powerful physique and fine bearing gave the impression he would be a tough customer to fall out with.

498 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
499 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6; Dom, 27th September 1945, p.6.
500 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
501 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
502 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
503 AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
There was nothing feminine about him with these exceptions - a beautiful skin of fine texture, and warm colouring, and a tell-tale broadening of the hips.\textsuperscript{504}

Despite this assertion of masculinity, the headline for \textit{Auckland Star} article was 'Astonishing Masquerade: Woman’s life as man: recent “marriage” to young girl', and the summary referred to Mr X with female pronouns.\textsuperscript{505}

The discourse of Mr X, the woman, was the second of three prominent themes in the media reports. Apart from the \textit{Auckland Star}, no other newspaper reported Mr X as a man. In other dailies Mr X was a woman who masqueraded as a man. Key phrases included 'woman living as a man', the woman who 'comported herself as a man' but not Mr X the man.\textsuperscript{506} The prosecution used the medical examination, carried out when he attempted to serve in World War II, as evidence to confirm Mr X was ‘female’ and a ‘woman’.\textsuperscript{507} In court it was revealed Mr X had obtained surgery to remove his breasts, and in the courts opinion, to ‘masquerade as a man’.\textsuperscript{508} I will return to the discourse that surrounded the operation in a later section. The court insisted Mr X was a woman, and this led to his relationship being discussed as a lesbian relationship.

The third and final discourse was Mr X the lesbian. The police and the court framed Mr X and his wife as lesbians. Senior Detective Tretheway told the court that ‘they both admit[ted] that they are of the Lesbian type’.\textsuperscript{509} Furthermore the defence lawyer for Mr X and his wife described how both individuals were ‘brought up away from male influence’ and therefore there was a ‘psychological background which could explain this unhealthy association’.\textsuperscript{510} Mr X’s mother was also described as having an ‘unusual religious outlook in which she believed that for a person to reach perfection he must become bi-sexual, as Adam must have been’.\textsuperscript{511} The lesbian discourse was entwined with

\textsuperscript{504} AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.
\textsuperscript{505} AS, 26\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6.
\textsuperscript{506} Dom, 27\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.6; NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} September 1945, p.15; AS, 22\textsuperscript{nd} November 1945, p.6.
\textsuperscript{507} AS, 22\textsuperscript{nd} November 1945, p.6; NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15.
\textsuperscript{508} AS, 22\textsuperscript{nd} November 1945, p.6; NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15.
\textsuperscript{509} AS, 22\textsuperscript{nd} November 1945 p.6; NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15.
\textsuperscript{510} NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p.15; AS, 22\textsuperscript{nd} November 1945, p.6.
\textsuperscript{511} AS, 22\textsuperscript{nd} November 1945, p.6. It is possible that the use of the term bi-sexual did not relate to sexuality but to the qualities of both sexes being in one person. The phrase used by Mr X’s mother regarding ‘bi-sexual Adam’ referred to a biblical teaching that Adam was created with both male and female characteristics.
a ‘psychological problem’ and became a feature of the Mr Luxford’s summation. The magistrate stated:

indecent assaults between males have long been subject of the criminal law, but not corresponding offences between females, which, I understand, is very prevalent, is outside the law. The law does not proscribe it and this can only be the subject of comment with regard to the moral aspect. Apparently this extraordinary perversion exists between these two people. I would suggest that the Legislature should give consideration as to whether indecent assaults by females should be proscribed.512

The relationship between Mr X and his wife was framed as an obsession and therefore part of the judge’s ruling was ‘the two parties remain separate [sic] and apart.’513

What was understood by the phrase ‘Lesbian Type’? and what did it mean for the identity of Mr X? The phrase ‘lesbian type’ allowed the court and media to pursue the discourse of indecent assault and perversion. Both the policeman and the Magistrate were aware of same-sex behaviour and linked medical, legal and moral discourses to the phrase ‘lesbian’. Despite Mr X asserting he was a man in an Auckland Star interview, he was recast as a lesbian by the court and the Truth and then ‘admitted’ to being of the ‘lesbian type’.514 What Mr X understood by the phrase and why he used the phrase in court proceedings is not known. The phrase, along with the discourse of psychological problems, appeared to aid the court’s understanding of Mr X’s marriage to a woman. It is important to note the unresolvable discrepancies between the policeman’s narrative, the court’s language and Mr X’s self-identification and therefore acknowledge possible intersections of cross-gendered identity and sexuality.

The comments made by the newspapers and the court about Mr X’s ‘lesbian relationship’ was a catalyst for a moral discourse about the case. The moral implications of the case increased when the media addressed Mr X’s chest surgery.515 He had approached two surgeons before finding one who would perform the operation. The surgery was not reported in the initial article published in the Auckland Star in

512 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6; NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
513 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6.
514 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6.
515 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6.
September 1945. The *Truth* used the phrase ‘Operation Questioned’ in their headline and further examined the judge’s comments by questioning medical and religious leaders. The surgery and the discourse of mutilation became part of the complex narrative of Mr X.

The magistrate was concerned about the operation and asked the defence whether the:

operation was performed for the purpose of giving the woman the appearance of a man, or for a diseased condition, or was it done to destroy the effect of femininity?

Mr X’s lawyer responded after consultation with Mr X and stated the operation was to remove ‘any suspicion,’ and ‘as not to embarrass her in her work as a labourer’. The magistrate condemned the operation:

It seems prima facie to me that a surgeon who operated on the human body for the purpose only of enabling her to masquerade as a man is inherently wrong ... as to how far the medical rule applies in this matter I do not know, but I think it should be brought before the British Medical Association or its council for the purpose of defining a rule or course of conduct.

It was acknowledged, by the magistrate, that the surgeon was not available for a discussion on the reasons for the surgery.

The magistrate’s opinion was Mr X had no ‘medical’ condition that required his breast tissue to be removed. These comments were repeated in the *Press* and the *Dominion*, but only the *Truth* sought medical and clerical views on the surgery, thereby cementing a moral discourse around such operations. Doctors interviewed by the *Truth* agreed with the declaration that the surgery was wrong and religious leaders expressed the opinion that the operation was sacrilegious. Medical opinions all centred on various reasons

---

516 NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
517 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6.
518 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6.
519 AS, 22nd November 1945, p.6; NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15. There was no report in the newspapers to any review being held by the medical council.
520 NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
for, and possible effects of, the surgery. One Wellington doctor speculated that removal of the breasts would enhance Mr X's masculinity:

The more marked male tendencies in the woman concerned probably manifested themselves after the removal of the breasts and not before. It has been found in cases where women have had to have their breasts removed because of cancer or other disease, that male symptoms sometimes develop. It is quite possible that, after the operation, this Auckland woman rapidly grew more and more like a man.\(^{521}\)

The comments of several specialists followed in the *Truth* and they described the surgery as unprofessional and mutilating, and proposed such an operation should only happen when a 'diseased process was present'.\(^ {522}\)

Religious leaders commented on both the lesbian discourse and Mr X's surgery. Reverend Raymond Dudley, a Methodist minister, described the operation as 'sacrilege against the human body', and a member of the Catholic Church stated: 'We are made by the creator for his purposes and are not permitted to have our bodies mutilated'.\(^ {523}\)

The religious leaders also commented on the phrase 'lesbian type' and condemned any relations between those of the same sex.\(^ {524}\) All of the opinions given to the *Truth* were based upon the view, as reported in the court and in the newspapers, that Mr X was both a woman and a lesbian.

What, though, of the relationship between Mr X and sexology? The media, the court, religious leaders and doctors saw Mr X's surgery as a mutilation. A similar response to surgical intervention could be seen in the sexological work of David Cauldwell. In his article *Psychopathia Transexualis*, Cauldwell considered the case of 'Earl'.\(^ {525}\) Earl was born female but identified as male, and requested the removal of his breasts, ovaries, and the closing of his vagina.\(^ {526}\) Cauldwell, who deemed this impossible, stated:

\(^{521}\) NZT, 28\(^{th}\) November 1945, p.15.

\(^{522}\) NZT, 28\(^{th}\) November 1945, p.15; and p.20. The specialists were a gynaecologist in Christchurch, a specialist in Auckland, and an obstetrician in Christchurch.

\(^{523}\) NZT, 28\(^{th}\) November 1945, p.15.

\(^{524}\) NZT, 28\(^{th}\) November 1945, p.15 and p.20. The main theme was that lesbianism was on the increase and that it was related to a psychological 'maladjustment'.

\(^{525}\) See Chapter One pp.28-30.

\(^{526}\) Cauldwell, p.277.
It would be criminal for any surgeon to mutilate a pair of healthy breasts and it would be just criminal for a surgeon to castrate a woman with no disease of the ovaries or related glands and without any condition wherein castration might be beneficial.\textsuperscript{527}

Cauldwell's article was printed in 1949 and therefore is contemporary to the Mr X case, although it does demonstrate the ideas in circulation. There were areas of sexology, science and medicine, which recognised cross-gendered behaviour and identity but did not believe surgery was an appropriate means of treatment. Therefore it can be inferred that the discourse of 'mutilating' healthy tissue was present in medical circles in New Zealand. This was illustrated by specialist's responses to Mr X's surgery.

Before I examined Cauldwell in Chapter One I discussed the work of George Henry, who also deserves a mention in relation to Mr X's case. I suggested that Henry conflated gender, sexuality, and sex in the analysis of his case studies, and that he therefore overlooked possible cross-gendered narratives. The case of Patricia, a participant in Henry's study, drew attention to the complexities of Henry's study. There are parallels between the case of Patricia and Mr X as both discussed a long-term masculine identification, and perhaps if more details were printed the descriptions of their body types may have been similar. Just as Henry conflounded gender, sexuality and sex, so did the court in the case of Mr X. The judge, police and in one article the media, all described Mr X as a lesbian woman, yet Mr X self-identified as a man. The emphasis in court and in the majority of the newspapers was on Mr X's biological body and not his identification.

It is also necessary to flag the comment from one of the surgeons, who stated that masculine tendencies were more likely to exist after surgery rather than before.\textsuperscript{528} Krafft-Ebing was one sexologist who drew parallels between bodily characteristics and identity. In one of his cases, Mrs X, who I discussed in Chapter One, Krafft-Ebing noted that as 'her' breasts became smaller and her pelvis widened, she took on more of a masculine

\textsuperscript{527} Cauldwell, p.277.
\textsuperscript{528} NZT, 28\textsuperscript{th} November 1945, p15.
character. Although Mrs X did not have surgery, the correlation between physical and psychological changes were similar to what was described by the doctor in the *Truth* article, that is the removal of Mr X's breast tissue would have accelerated his masculine 'tendencies'.

The case of Mr X was complex, as many narratives and discursive elements were present. There was a tension between Mr X's self-identification - being a man - and the narrative offered in the court system, Mr X the woman and the lesbian and while in court Mr X's agreement to the phrase 'lesbian type'. I have drawn attention to the different narratives rather than place Mr X into an identity category. The exercise of unpacking narratives and discourses lends itself to uncovering various medical, legal and social discourses. It also allows the self-identity of the individual to be heard and to see how self-identity is negotiated within the wider discursive framework.

**Conclusion**

A new and multifarious discourse on cross-gendered identity and behaviour emerged in the 1930s and 1940s. The primary shift was from the use of the early twentieth century discourse of the 'masquerader', the individual who wore male clothes and exhibited 'masculine' behaviour, to the 'man' who received medical treatment for cross-gendered identity. However, complexities arose during this time period, the discourses associated with the cases of Peter Alexander and Mr X were different, with Peter framed as a man and Mr X as an intersection of man, lesbian and woman. The increased scientific and medical knowledge on sex and the body had a significant impact on the discourse on cross-gendered people. Sexological discourse of 'sudden changes' of the body could now be 'treated' and explained via medical science. Hormone treatment and surgery allowed individuals to 'change sex' in a legal setting and interrupted the idea of the 'masquerader'. Despite the influence of medicine the discourse of masculine behaviour, clothing and childhood conduct remained a strong theme in newspaper reports on cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

---

529 Krafft-Ebing, p.215.
530 NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
Many complex ideas surfaced in the 1930s and 1940s, and I have illustrated these with case studies from the Truth. In Chapter Four I will extrapolate the themes from the last three chapters and trace similar discourses. By doing so I will highlight the numerous discourses associated with cross-gender identification and behaviour, and will demonstrate how science and medicine impacted on the self-narrative. The relationship between sexological language and the language used in the media will be discussed, as well as the impact Amy Bock had on the New Zealand discourse of the cross-gendered experience.
Chapter Four: The New Zealand Cross-Gendered Landscape

How does sexology, along with case studies in the last two chapters, contribute to the study of gender and history? What themes and discourses emerged and were integrated into the public consciousness during the period between 1906 and 1950? This final chapter will address these questions as well as draw together the multiple narratives and discourses that emerged in Chapters One, Two and Three. The New Zealand cross-gendered landscape has been moulded and developed by various individuals, medical and scientific discourse, media, and society. There are a number of themes in this final chapter. Each section combines various theories and case-studies to draw a complex picture of cross-gendered identity in New Zealand. I intend to show how various cases linked and formed a cross-gendered history of New Zealand centred on two figures; the 'mythical' Amy Bock and Peter Alexander. The final section of this chapter will explain what my research can contribute to the field of gender and historiography. I will place my research alongside recent contributions to gender historiography by Jennifer Terry, Ruth Ford and Jason Cromwell.

Peter Alexander and Foucauldian Theory

Discourse analysis was the main method of examination in my thesis. Throughout Chapters One, Two and Three I signalled where particular discourses were present and how, in this chapter, I would draw out the discursive themes. Perhaps the most compelling argument for the use of Foucauldian theory is the case of Peter Alexander. Foucault's idea of 'practices that systematically produce the objects of which they speak' draws attention to a number of themes in the construction of Peter, the 'man' and the 'medical marvel'.

In Chapter Three, I discussed how Peter's self-narrative reflected the sexological ideas of the manifestation of cross-gendered identity and behaviour at a young age and the medical and sexological idea that Peter's 'condition' needed 'treatment'. Peter showed an understanding of medical and sexological language and was able to articulate his 'change' in the Truth interviews. Peter used medical 'practice' to 'produce' his sex change, but in doing so he also became part of the medical and

531 Foucault, Archaeology, p.49.
sexological doctrine on sex changes. He became both the 'subject' and the 'object' of the sexological, medical and societal gaze. Peter was involved in a complex negotiation of language and identity in the formation of his masculine self.

While Foucault's theory is useful in unpacking multiple discursive patterns, his concept of reverse discourse, a counter dialogue that appeared in opposition to nineteenth century medical construction of homosexuality, needs to be revisited in light of Peter's narrative. As I discussed in Chapter One, the study of cross-gendered identity challenges the idea of 'reversing' nineteenth century sexological language. The convergence of treatment, identity, and self-narrative requires us to acknowledge multiple discourses if we are to carefully unpack the implications of various individual narratives. A re-working of reverse discourse is also required with the convergence of such ideas. Peter thought about, and discussed himself with an awareness of, a variety of discourses; for instance, medical theories, social expectations and the legal requirements of biological sex. Peter actively integrated the language of sexology and medicine in his life story in order to obtain 'treatment'. However, after successful 'treatment' Peter wanted to be known as a man. Therefore it can be argued that cross-gendered individuals reversed discourse in an active and complex way. Homosexuals used reverse discourse to empower and change the meanings of words used by the medical community to describe behaviour and identities but not to 'change' identity. In contrast, cross-gendered individuals used medical language to seek treatment to assert their identity and to have access to medical knowledge. After 'treatment' medical and sexological discourse was resisted. Female-to-male people often lived as men; the medical and sexological relevance of childhood behaviour, masculine hobbies was lost after treatment. A different set of ideas emerged as the previous medicalised behaviours and traits disappeared into self-narrative.

It is also necessary to ask if Peter was a defining moment in cross-gendered history in New Zealand or was he an exception? As Foucault argued, there is discontinuity in history, and by using Peter as a central figure in the New Zealand cross-gendered picture we can draw a number of conclusions. Circular and complex arrays of discursive ideas

---

532 Foucault, Sexuality, p.101.
were apparent, as Peter was not isolated from international ideas. Peter was a figure in the worldwide establishment of medical and scientific definitions of sex, gender and 'sex changes'. He was influenced by and involved in the creation of the medical and scientific model of cross-gendered individuals, such as the 'sex change' athletes Mary/Mark Weston and Zdenka Koubkova. However, Peter can be seen as an exception, in the New Zealand 1906-1950 context of cross-gendered identity and behaviour, as he appeared to be the 'first' publicised New Zealand 'sex change'. It is therefore up to the researcher to acknowledge multiple discourses and unpack the specific points of complexity to create a full, and possibly contradictory, narrative.

Inconsistency and Dislocation

There are more examples of inconsistency and dislocation in the cases contained in my thesis. One example is Mr X, who in 1945 was convicted of breaches of the Marriage Act by marrying while living as a man, and was vilified by the media and the court. Although there were similarities between Peter and Mr X's narrative, such as long-term male identification, Mr X was not recognised as male by the public. The media treated the two cases differently and the medical and sexological discourse used in each case changed. As I have explained in the previous paragraphs, Peter had a stronger self-presence, than Mr X, in the Truth's account of his life. The Truth expressed no doubt about Peter's masculinity, although with Mr X some newspapers were sceptical about his maleness and used multiple identities to describe him. The Truth spoke about Mr X the masquerader whereas reporters from the Auckland Star asserted Mr X was a man. The term 'lesbian' was used to describe Mr X, once the case reached court, and the magistrate criticised the chest surgery.

It is possible Mr X's working class background meant he was unable to access the same medical treatment as Peter. In the court trial, it was divulged that Mr X had approached two other surgeons before finding one who would do the operation. The issue of access to 'treatment' may have had an impact on the way the Truth and the court interpreted Mr X's identity, as he did not access the same 'formal' avenues as Peter Alexander. There was also a difference between how Mr X and Peter negotiated their identity with
the media, and therefore in society. In the Auckland Star, Mr X declared he was a man and could see nothing wrong with his marriage. Peter, on the other hand, did not claim to be 'a man' and explained he needed 'more surgery' in order to marry as a man. Consequently, Mr X's case, when compared to Peter's, illustrates the Foucauldian notion of discontinuity in history, as both narratives diverged into 'new and complex histories'.533 However, if we compare the narrative of Mr X in the media to cases like Amy Bock and Annie Read/Thomas Parkes, it is possible to argue Peter was the odd person out as discussed in previous section, and Mr X was related to the 'traditional' mythology of the masquerader.

Newspapers' Reporting Patterns

What reporting patterns developed in the media in regard to cross-gendered individuals? The main sources of information on cross-gendered figures in the Truth were the coverage of court cases, public scandals, and deaths, and as the years progressed, more international stories were published. In Chapters Two and Three I closely analysed four cases: 'Boy' Bertha, Annie/Thomas, Peter Alexander, and Mr X. All of the above cases, except Peter Alexander who was heralded by the Truth as New Zealand's first sex change, were 'discovered' after the commission of a crime or after death.

One of two possible results would transpire once a cross-gendered individual appeared in the media. The first outcome would be the emergence of other stories. An example of this pattern was an article printed by the Truth after the initial report on 'Boy' Bertha, who was arrested in Sydney in male attire. The Truth followed the 1906 article on Bert/Bertha with a reference to an unnamed woman in Christchurch. The by-line of the article read 'Another Boy Bertha' and the phrase indicated to the reader a particular impression; the person in the story, like Bertha, 'masqueraded' as the opposite sex.534 The second pattern was how past cases were linked and compared to other stories in circulation. The most frequently cited case was Amy Bock, the female bridegroom.

533 Foucault, Archaeology, p.84.
534 NZT, 4th May 1907, p.6.
After 1909, the headline ‘Another Amy Bock’ became synonymous with cross-gendered individuals as illustrated by the headlines of Annie/Thomas and Henrietta Agnes Berland. Where a headline did not use the catchphrase ‘Another Amy Bock’, there was often an additional article describing Bock’s life and antics. An example of this pattern was the Truth’s article on Mr X, arrested in 1945 for breaches of the Marriage Act. The headline did not refer to Amy Bock but an accompanying article discussed the life of Amy Bock. The only two cases not associated with the ‘Another Amy Bock’ discourse were the post-1907 appearances of Bert/Bertha in the Truth and the story of Peter Alexander. Bertha, in 1906, had already secured a history and a mythology in the media and Peter Alexander was an exception to a number of discursive patterns, including the references to Amy Bock. Later sections in this chapter will further discuss Peter Alexander.

Bock, The New Zealand Anti-Hero

Bock was initially reported as a criminal, a trickster and a mentally unstable person. A number of incidents in the 1900s created a mythology about Bock. A consumer culture formed around Bock’s ‘masquerade’ with postcards titled ‘the female bridegroom’ produced from Bock’s wedding photos and auctions sold Bock’s clothing and personal effects. Her legacy evolved out of images of the ‘female bridegroom’ and the discourse of the ‘masquerader’. The mythology and media discourse on Bock had a substantial impact on the subsequent representations of cross-gendered individuals in New Zealand. Bock was not compared to previous cases; instead she became an anti-hero of cross-gendered individuals in New Zealand. The only time Bock was challenged in the role of anti-hero was in the case of Deresley Morton/Peter Stratford. The Truth implied Deresley Morton/Peter Stratford had ‘eclipsed’ Amy Bock in the ‘consummate

535 It replaced the previously used phrase of ‘Another Boy Bertha’.
536 NZT, 28th November 1945, p.15.
537 The later appearances of Bertha were in the New Zealand court system.
538 The mythology that surrounded Bock in the early 1900s still exists. There is a movie to be made on Bock’s life. See Dominion Post, 21st May 2005, E.18 and The Star (Dunedin community newspaper), 4th November 2004, p.20. Also a play has been written by Fiona Farrell.
539 See Chapter Two pp.52-61 for a discussion on Amy Bock and for some of the images that appeared as part of the consumer culture.
skill and cunning’ of her/his marriage to Mrs Rowland. However, Deresley/Peter did not ‘eclipse’ the mythical figure of Bock, as Amy Bock continued to appear in the media as the archetype of the ‘masquerader’.

The cases of Annie/Thomas, Mr X and Amy Bock were entwined within the media discourse of ‘Another Amy Bock’. There were superficial similarities and also considerable differences between all three cases, all able to be read as ‘discontinuities’ in history. Read, Mr X and Bock all wore male clothes, and were described by the media as ‘masqueraders’. By marrying while living as men, both Bock and Mr X breached the Marriage Act. Further examination of each case’s narrative reveals their stories were not identical. Bock did not self-identify as a ‘man’, Read had written a letter that described her/himself as a ‘half-boy half-girl’ and Mr X stated in an interview he was a man and later agreed to the statement in court that he was of the ‘lesbian type’.

Sexology and Medicine

Amy Bock was one part of the picture of cross-gender New Zealand between 1906 and 1950. Sexology, and in later years, science and medicine, formed a discursive framework the media could refer to and that cross-gendered individuals would negotiate. In the early 1900’s the Truth discussed the work of Havelock Ellis and Richard von Krafft-Ebing in terms of criminology, marriage and sexual deviancy. Sexological books, including works of Havelock Ellis, sold through advertisements in the Truth, and articles on the ‘sexual symbolism’, ‘punishing perverts’ and ‘meaning of morality’, integrated ideas associated with sexology. Cartoons printed in the Truth alluded to sexology; one titled ‘Curing the Criminal’ showed caricatures of a ‘scientist’ and a ‘fatman’ in the midst of a debate around various means of rehabilitation for

---

540 NZT, 13th June 1929, p.7.
541 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5; AS, 26th September 1945, p.6.
542 For references to Krafft-Ebing see NZT, 16th February 1907, p.1; 4th May 1907, p.5; 9th April 1910, p.4; 11th June 1910, p.5; 19th August 1911, p.1. For Havelock Ellis see NZT 16th February 1907, p.1; 18th May 1907, p.7; 4th May 1907, p.5; 9th April 1910, p.4; 11th June 1910, p.5; 7th January 1911, p.1; 19th August 1911, p.1; 14th February 1925, p.4.
543 NZT, 12th February 1925, p.4; NZT, 4th May 1907, p.7; NZT, 9th April 1910, p.4; NZT, 7th January 1911, p.1.
criminals. The scientist declared 'science could save the criminal' and the 'fatman' argued the 'criminal deserved the lash'.

The media, in cases of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour, linked sexological discourse, psychological issues, and transgression of societal norms. The media had enough comprehension of sexological ideas to apply the expression 'psychological issues' in the cases of Amy Bock and Bert/Bertha. Bock was considered to have 'bad blood' and 'kleptomania' and Bertha was perceived as 'abnormal' and 'a puzzle'. It appeared, especially in the case of Bertha, that the media linked cross-gendered behaviour with transgression of societal norms and psychological problems.

In 1912, Annie/Thomas's self-narrative in the Truth drew attention, albeit indirectly, to key concepts in sexological theory. Annie/Thomas described her/himself as a 'half-boy half-girl' and this phrase hinted at Krafft-Ebing's four stages of degeneration. Krafft-Ebing discussed how mental and behavioural characteristics associated with congenital sexual inversion developed in stages; the final and most serious stage was when an individual believed they embodied the opposite sex. Annie/Thomas's phrase 'half-boy, half-girl' could be located between stages two and three of Krafft-Ebing's theory. Stage two was a profound change in character towards the character of the opposite sex and stage three was a transition stage towards transmutatio sexus. It appeared from Annie/Thomas' narrative s/he did not consider her/himself the 'embodiment of the opposite sex'. Therefore s/he had not reached Krafft-Ebing's final stage of degeneration.

Was Annie/Thomas aware of sexological theory in the early twentieth century? Hints and glimmers of sexological ideas were circulating in the media, society and in individual accounts as evident by Annie/Thomas' story. It appeared the media, in the 1910s, was beginning to use sexology selectively in regard to cross-gendered identity and

---

544 NZT, 19th August 1911, p.5.
545 NZT, 19th August 1911, p.5.
546 NZT, 7th January 1907, p.5; Coleman, Convenient Fictions.
547 NZT, 9th November 1912, p.5.
behaviour. However, it wasn’t until the mid-1930s that sexological, scientific and medical discourse became more prominent in media discourse.

A crossroads emerged in the 1930s in regard to the theory and language of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. The increased sophistication of medicine and science influenced the theoretical development and treatment of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour. During the 1930s, the themes of previous sexological work, including that of Richard von Krafft-Ebing and Magnus Hirschfeld, came to the forefront of media narratives. The Truth printed more international narratives of medical intervention in cross-gendered identity and behaviour. In 1937 the Truth heralded Peter Alexander as New Zealand’s first ‘sex change’ case. His narrative reflected the sexological theories related to cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour; these included boyish play as a child, the idea of a ‘natural masculine force’, desire to dress in male attire and the success of treatment.549 One possible reason for Peter’s ability to speak eloquently on the influence science and medicine had on his identity may have been his appearance as a financially secure person of the middle class. This factor would have had an impact on Peter’s choices of medical intervention and ‘treatment’. I discussed in Chapter Three the problems of tracing a linear history of medical and surgical practice in female-to-male cross-gendered individuals. Testosterone was synthesised in 1935, and its use has been documented in Britain in the case of Michael Dillion.550 It is unlikely access to hormones would have been widespread in New Zealand and it is possible private funding would have required. Peter also travelled extensively in order to have, what appeared to be, multiple surgeries. Again this would have been expensive. Being financially secure allowed Peter to have choice in his ‘treatment’ and access to resources that were not possible for other individuals such as Mr X. Peter’s class allowed him more agency in his negotiation with the media, medical fraternity, and society.

549 All of these ideas were found in the works I discussed in Chapter One.
550 See Kennedy; Hodgkinson; Hoberman and Yesalis. For my discussion on surgery and the cross-gendered individual see Chapter Three, pp.88-92.
Anatomy, Surgery and Cross-gendered Identity

One of the multiple discourses implied by each case was the social meaning ascribed to anatomy, especially reproductive anatomy. All of the cases in my research required a 'confirmation of sex', usually achieved by medical examination. In each case the presence of a vagina, or lack of a penis, led to the conclusion the subjects were 'female' and therefore 'masqueraders'. As I have previously discussed, Peter was both part of a worldwide discourse of sex changes, and an exception in the New Zealand discursive picture. The case of Peter expanded on and challenged the connections between sexual anatomy and identity. The Truth mentioned Peter could not marry until he had received 'further' operations; perhaps inferring a hysterectomy and the surgical construction of a penis, equally it could have meant testosterone treatment and a hysterectomy. Peter could only marry once he was deemed to be 'truly' a male, possibly signalling he had no female reproductive organs and/or had a penis. There is evidence of this requirement in the Truth reports on Mary/Mark Weston and Zdenke Koubkova and in the late 1950s with the narratives of Michael Dillion, who received surgery to construct a penis in the late 1940s, and John Thorp, a New Zealander who in the 1950s travelled to England for surgery. The New Zealand context is not well known during this time period and there appears to be no law in New Zealand regarding legal changes of sex prior to the 1950s. The only suggestion of a law regarding 'change of sex' was the permit required for Peter to wear men's clothes, and it is unknown if this was required in New Zealand or in Australia. In comparison to Peter, Mr X had surgery to remove breast tissue and had lived, worked and socialised as a man for ten years but was classified as female. A complex and circular process of identity, language and medical/legal ideas becomes apparent.

The theme of ascribed anatomy and a complex discursive terrain continues with the case of Annie/Thomas. The newspapers reported his/her landlord and employer were surprised when Annie/Thomas' 'true sex' and pregnancy were revealed, though throughout the inquest on Annie/Thomas' death, the employer and landlord used male pronouns. Further complexities arose as the headline in the Truth for

---

Annie/Thomas was 'Another Amy Bock' even though the phrase 'half-boy, half-girl' was included in the article. Therefore the media saw Annie/Thomas as another female masquerader, and the sex of 'female' was confirmed via medical examination after death. Confirmation of sex also occurred with 'Boy' Bertha and Amy Bock and both were categorised as 'female' and accordingly, masqueraders. All of the cases in my thesis were affected in some way by social and cultural constructions of sexual anatomy. I argue for each case to be seen as part of an intricate and dislocated history, where similarities and differences are extrapolated and analysed.

Reflections on the New Zealand Research Context

The question of how cross-gendered individuals were already situated in New Zealand research was part of my background study. As discussed in Chapter One, three authors, Alison Laurie, Julie Glamuzina and Jenny Coleman, have written about cross-gendered identity and behaviour. Coleman, in her 'Unsettled Women' article, used an approach that focused on the historical place of women, language and discourse analysis, and created numerous points of reference for the place of Bock in New Zealand historical framework. Laurie and Glamuzina placed Bertha, Bock, Peter and Mr X under the rubric of lesbianism. They argued the importance of challenging the hegemonic heterosexual paradigm that enforced a 'silence' around lesbianism. Laurie and Glamuzina argued the importance of challenging this 'silence' around lesbian history and therefore situated people who could be discussed as cross-gendered as 'lesbians' in lesbian history framework. I hesitate to conflate cross-gendered identity with lesbianism, though I acknowledge that cross-gendered behaviour and lesbianism may at times have similar symbols such as masculine attire. The use of masculine attire as part of a lesbian self-identity is related to some areas of lesbian history, for instance the butch lesbian identity. However, I would suggest the category of 'lesbian' becomes problematic when identity and behaviour are reduced to biological sex characteristics. If one identifies as a man, has a vagina, and is sexually involved with women then is one still a lesbian? The question of lesbianism and cross-gendered identity and behaviour suggests a wider discussion on sex, gender and sexuality that cannot be expanded on here. I suggest
employing the Foucauldian notion of discontinuity on the category of sex/gender would allow more fluidity and discussion on theories of sex and gender.

I argue for a methodological approach that unpacks words and phrases associated with identity and/or behaviour in history. Such an approach facilitates an understanding of the complexities and tensions within sexuality, gender and sex. The following types of questions can be asked: Was Bertha necessarily a lesbian because the word 'Sapphic' was used to describe her behaviour? The term 'Sapphic' had different definitions during the 1900s; one was an independent woman. Was Mr X a lesbian because the he agreed to the phrase 'lesbian type' while in court? Despite being labelled as a 'lesbian type', Mr X self-identified as a man. A careful unpacking of the discourses connected these ideas indicates different understandings.

Peter Alexander, the Exception?

Why has Peter stood out as an exception to other cases I have examined? A number of short international reports on people 'changing sex' led up to the report on Peter. Over time the media intensified its interest on 'marvels' of science and the ability of medicine to 'change' an individual's sex. During the 1934 Olympic Games the media discussed the masculinity of some female athletes and irregularities in their hormone levels and sex characteristics. Given the stories printed in the Truth during the 1930s, it was only a matter of time before a New Zealander became part of the 'change of sex' discourse. There was a lack of sensationalism, atypical to the Truth, in the preliminary article on Peter's life. The second article appeared in the Truth three months after the original August 1937 article. Peter was 'spotted' playing piano on the Aorangi boat on the way to Sydney. The Truth reporter revealed Peter's birth name and commented on his interactions with young women on board the boat and his activities, playing the piano, dancing and 'punch[ing] the ball in the gymnasium' and partaking 'in strenuous exercise'.

---

552 See Chapter Two p.51 for more discussion on the term 'Sapphic' in relation to Bertha.
553 NZT, 13th October 1937, p.1.
There appeared a tension between Peter, medical experts, and the Truth in the accommodation of Peter’s agency in his pursuit of medical treatment and the social expectations of a ‘male’. Peter was living socially as a man at the time of the first and second interview but perhaps more importantly, Peter did not affirm he was a ‘man’ in the sense of a reproductive male. Peter would become ‘male’ after ‘necessary’ surgeries, as he was the ‘helpless victim of a twist of nature’. Peter claimed medical assistance allowed him to break free of the ‘forces of nature’. The recognition of sexology as a dominant narrative meant Peter was able to express parts of his own narrative but in a manner palatable to the Truth and New Zealand society.

Peter’s narrative also reflected ideas of masculinity and enforced ‘norms’ of sex and sex change operations. The ‘norms’ were the confirmation of male identity by having either surgery to create male physique and/or the removal of ‘female’ reproductive organs; a life-long identification with the opposite sex and appropriate masculine behaviour. International cases of sex change surgery had established the discourse but Peter’s case reinforced the model in New Zealand.

Visual History of Cross-gendered Identity and Behaviour

Before turning to the final section of this chapter, the contribution of research to the field of gender and historiography, a few comments need to be made on the visual history of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. Chapters Two and Three included pictures, photographs, and postcards that appeared either in New Zealand newspapers or, in the case of Amy Bock, as part of a pictorial culture. Three themes appear when examining the images. Firstly, from the first sketch of ‘Boy’ Bertha through to the images of Peter Alexander, each cross-gendered figure was shown as male or in male attire. The images authenticated the newspapers reports on the masculinity of each individual. Perhaps the only exception to this theme was the sketch of Amy Bock in the docks of the Dunedin court where Bock appeared to be wearing female dress. The

---

postcards of Amy Bock show her aliases though she is pictured in various male clothing, including her wedding suit.

The second theme relates to the image of the cross-gendered man shaving. The synthesis of testosterone in 1935 meant female-to-male cross-gendered individuals could, with regular testosterone treatment, develop secondary sex characteristics. These characteristics included the growth of facial hair. Photos of Zdenka Koubkova, in October 1936, and Peter Alexander, in August 1937, both appeared in the Truth shaving. In the case of Peter, the Truth pointed out his use of a cut-throat razor, and commented it was ‘more than can be said for many young men of 24’.[556] The idea of masculine pursuits was also prominent. Peter rode a motorcycle, Mary/Mark Weston, an English athlete who ‘changed sex’ in the 1930s, was involved in sports, and both Bertha and Peter were shown smoking. All of these ‘masculine’ images reflected the sexological discourse of masculine behaviour in female-to-male cross-gendered individuals. The pictorial representations also ‘proved’ to the public, beyond the printed text, that the individuals were ‘masculine’ and ‘male’. Interestingly this creates disidence with the discourse of the masquerader in the cases of Bertha and Bock, as the images of both individuals showed a public and ‘convincing’ masculinity. The photos and images of cross-gendered figures formed part of the wider discursive landscape in New Zealand as well as intersecting with international cross-gendered visual culture as seen with the images of Koubkova and Weston.

‘The men’ and ‘the masqueraders’ are the dominant discourses that arose from media reports on cross-gendered identity and behaviour, and no one figure has surpassed the impact of Amy Bock as the mythical figure of the ‘masquerader’. The cases of Peter and Mr X, although mentioned in some recent research, have not had the same impact; though the case of Peter captured the imagination of the Truth and cemented a medical and scientific discourse in the New Zealand consciousness. Peter was the only case in the forty-six year period of my research that combined personal narrative and sexological theory in such a concise way. A variety of language, identities and behaviour

have emerged from the cases in my thesis and shows the rich, and in some places, unique discourse of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour in New Zealand.

Engagement with Gender Historiography

My research contributes to the wider field of gender and historiography by furthering the examination of cross-gendered individuals in New Zealand and by amalgamating a number of theoretical approaches. Throughout my research, I have utilised, critiqued and revised lesbian and 'trans' academic revisions of history, to draw attention to the complexities of narrative and behaviour in cross-gendered individuals.\(^{557}\) An amalgamation of these approaches has helped in the synthesis of ideas in the exploration of cross-gendered lives. This section will place my work alongside the work of Jennifer Terry, Ruth Ford, and, finally, Jason Cromwell, before drawing my own conclusions in the field of cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

My research can be placed in context with historical examinations of sex, gender and sexuality. Jennifer Terry's research on 'deviant historiography' considered the link between sexualities, bodies and medicine. Terry emphasised the 'idea that moral character is rooted in the body' of people considered 'deviant' and this idea influenced the 'popular fictions' understood about bodies of 'aberrant' or 'deviant' people.\(^{558}\) Terry's theorising of a 'deviant historiography' has impacted upon the way recent scholars have situated the historical construction of sexuality and bodies.\(^{559}\) Terry's work is useful in exploring how the subject was theorised in medical/sexological texts. She argued that 'the new archivist of deviance... looks not only for how subjects are produced and policed, but how they are resistant and excessive to the very discourses from which they emerge'.\(^{560}\) In her later book _An American Obsession_, Terry expanded on her earlier arguments and examined how cases in sexology and medicine have 'allowed

---

557 'Trans' academia has emerged out of Queer studies and focuses on individuals who fall under the umbrella term of transgender and/or transsexual.


560 Terry, _Theorizing Deviant_, p.57.
the historian to watch the complex interplay between authorities and homosexual as both attempted to make sense of diverse and culturally minoritized forms of desire'.

Terry used Foucauldian discourse analysis in her research. She applied the concept of reverse discourse to discuss how subjects in George Henry's 1935 *Study of Sexual Variants* resisted, and then reclaimed, Henry's medical categorisation of their behaviour and identity. The concept of reverse discourse and its use in Terry's work needs to be re-examined in a similar fashion to my critique of Foucault's theory of reverse discourse, when conducting research on cross-gendered individuals. My case studies have shown an active negotiation and integration of sexological ideas and personal identity as opposed to a mere 'resistance' towards medical and sexological discourse. Duggan used a comparable notion when she argued that new lesbian identities at the turn-of-the-century were created and produced via newspapers, personal stories and sexology. One difference is situated in the concept of 'intervention'. Terry claimed medical and scientific ideas about homosexuality were 'interventionist' and were concerned with 'fixing' homosexuality. The interventionist framework Terry discussed was connected to larger agendas of curing or fixing both homosexuality and wider social concerns linked with 'deviant sexual behaviour'. The social concerns included 'precariousness of masculinity, the spectre of feminism' and the 'rise of sexual subcultures, instability of families and marriage among others'. I hesitate to apply an 'interventionist' framework to cross-gendered identity and behaviour. There are key differences between medical intervention with homosexuality and medical intervention with cross-gendered behaviour. Cross-gendered individuals negotiated medical 'intervention' to gain access to hormones and surgery and this differed from homosexuality where medicalisation was actively resisted. I have shown there was a negotiation between individuals and medical science, though it is important to note there was still a willingness, by cross-gendered people, to be medicalised in order to 'change sex'.

563 Duggan, p.809.

128
Lesbian historiography has re-evaluated the place of homosexuality in history, and is relevant to the cross-gender question, as lesbian history has begun to examine the multiple narratives of gendered and/or sexual identities. The recent work of Ruth Ford moves towards new perspectives on sexuality and gender in history.

Ruth Ford has written two articles on 'cross-gender identification and same-sex marriages'. In both articles, she articulated the main debates in writing lesbian and/or cross-gendered history. She reflected on problems with the reclamation process of early lesbian history and the difficulty associated with using 'modern' terms in discussing historical cross-gendered identity. Ford clearly expressed that 'passing wo/men' should not be synonymous with 'trans' history, however the question remains on how she worked out the difference. The separation of lesbianism and cross-gendered identity and behaviour allowed Ford to question and unpack multiple narratives around cross-gendered behaviour and identity, same-sex marriage and relationships. Her two articles discuss two different figures in Australia, firstly Harry/Annie Payne and secondly Eugenia/Harry Crawford.

Harry/Annie Payne was 'a widower and respectable working-class pensioner of Lidcombe, Sydney'. Payne was 'discovered' to be a 'woman' after being admitted to Lidcombe Old Men’s Home/State Hospital. S/he was quickly relocated to Newington Hospital for women with the note: ‘This person was found to be a woman, masquerading as a man’.

Ford asked questions about Payne’s identity and behaviour then ‘extrapolated and speculated’ on the significance of Harry/Annie Payne’s life. However Ford confused gender and sexuality with her discussion on photos of Payne. Three photos of Payne are included in the text of her article. Two photos are portraits, one of Payne in a tram conductor’s uniform and the other taken in a studio. The third

---

567 Ford, Man-Woman Murderer, pp.159.
568 Ford, Man-Woman Murderer, pp.159-161.
570 Ford, Merrily Rang the Bells, pp.41-42.
571 Ford, Merrily Rang the Bells, p.43.
photo is Payne with his first wife Harriet Payne. In the discussion of the studio photo, Ford suggested Payne showed pride and he ‘gained erotic pleasure from dressing and living as a man’.\textsuperscript{572} Ford also argued the photo of Payne implied an enjoyment of power and privilege of living as a man and the wedding photo added ‘a sexual dimension to his gendered identity’.\textsuperscript{573} His dress enabled him to act upon his desires.\textsuperscript{574} There is lack of clarity in Ford's argument about Payne and his/her identity and she conflated the analytical language of sexuality and gender. Ford is unclear on whether she saw Payne as a woman who eroticised male attire, a lesbian who preferred wearing male clothes, or a cross-gendered individual or a person who embodied the complexities of gender and sexuality.

A similar problem presents itself in Ford's examination of Eugenia Falleni/Harry Crawford.\textsuperscript{575} Eugenia/Harry Crawford had lived as a man from a young age and married Annie Birkett in 1914. In 1920, Crawford was brought before the Australian court system for the 1917 murder of Annie Birkett. Ford's article attempted to pull together multiple discursive elements of Eugenia/Harry's case from sources such as sexology, Eugenia's self-narrative and newspaper reports. These formed a complex picture of Eugenia/Harry. Ford aimed to create a narrative woven around the categories of 'the lesbian', 'the passing women', 'cross-dressing' and the 'lesbian criminal'.\textsuperscript{576} She acknowledged current debates within 'lesbian history and queer studies' about the placement of cross-gendered individuals in a lesbian framework and argued for a 'range of competing narratives'.\textsuperscript{577} Useful ideas are apparent in Ford's article as she gives an in-depth examination of the court proceedings and the subsequent newspaper reports, and highlighted the contradictory accounts of Eugenia's life. Crawford was found with a dildo in his/her possessions, and Ford argued the dildo was the primary motivation for the court and media discussion of Crawford as a deviant.\textsuperscript{578} Ford argued the sexual

\textsuperscript{572} Ford, \textit{Merrily Rang the Bells}, p.55.
\textsuperscript{573} Ford, \textit{Merrily Rang the Bells}, pp.55-56.
\textsuperscript{574} Ford, \textit{Merrily Rang the Bells}, p.56.
\textsuperscript{575} Eugenia lived in New Zealand as a child. Interesting there were no reports in the \textit{New Zealand Truth} on Eugenia/Harry case.
\textsuperscript{576} Ford, \textit{Man-Woman Murderer}, p.161.
\textsuperscript{577} Ford, \textit{Man-Woman Murderer}, p.161 and p.184.
\textsuperscript{578} Ford, \textit{Man-Woman Murderer}, pp.180-182.
nature of Eugenia's 'passing' was problematic at the time and this led to a destabilisation of the discourses of passing women.\textsuperscript{579}

The two main issues with Ford's speculations on Payne and Crawford are the categories of the 'passing women' and the discussion of 'cross dressing'. She does acknowledge the problems of modern categories, like transgender, in the historical research of cross-gendered people as such categories are often not reflective of historical language and ideas. Ford argued for a historically subjective examination of individuals with similar identities and behaviour to Payne although she did not untangle the complexities of identity, behaviour and sexuality to reflect how to perform such an examination. However, with the case of Harry/Annie Payne she speculates Payne was a 'woman' who lived as a man and was involved in same sex relationships, but she contradicts herself by discussing Payne as a man who had heterosexual privilege.\textsuperscript{580} A similar problem is apparent with Ford's examination of Eugenia/Harry where s/he was described as a cross-dresser, a man-woman, and involved in same-sex relationships. It is the linkage of cross-gender identification, same-sex marriages, sexual inversion, transvestism and female homosexuality that led to contradictions within Ford's work as she attempts to join identities instead of allowing for diverseness and complexity.\textsuperscript{581} Although there are multiple narratives involved in the reading of cases such as Payne's and Eugenia's, it is important to move away from the 'passing' narrative as it invariably leads to a totalising discussion on identity removed from behaviour, societal views and self-narrative.

How identity and/or behaviour are inscribed and theorised on the body is one difference between cross-gendered historiography and gay and lesbian historiography. Lesbian scholars have highlighted the tension in the conflation of same-sex attraction and cross-gendered identity and behaviour. Jason Cromwell is one author who challenged and unpacked previously gendered notions of the body in cross-gendered research. In Chapter Five of \textit{Transmen and FTM}s, Cromwell examined cross-gendered identity and behaviour in a historical context. He proposed three questions for the researcher in the consideration of cross-gendered individuals in history. The three

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{579} Ford, \textit{Man-Woman Murdener}, pp.180-182.
\item \textsuperscript{580} Ford, \textit{Merrily Rang the Bells}, p.55.
\item \textsuperscript{581} Ford, \textit{Man-Woman Murdener}, p.159.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
questions were: had the individual stated they were a man or had always been a man? Had the individual pursued 'body modification and available surgeries' like 'wearing padded clothing, binding breasts, and using devices in place of male genitalia'? Had the individual pursued 'body modification and available surgeries' like 'wearing padded clothing, binding breasts, and using devices in place of male genitalia'? Thirdly, did the individual live most of their life as a man and, if discovered, did they attempt to keep their identity secret? Cromwell developed the framework further in a discussion on what constituted a 'man' in particular time periods and cultures.

Although Cromwell stressed the cultural specificity of masculinity, his questions cement a singular discourse of body modification and secrecy in relation to cross-gendered identity. A framework that includes 'body modification and/or surgeries' can lead to essentialist ideals of cross-gendered identity. It suggests there are 'requirements' to an identity. It could also eclipse those individuals who do not seek or require modification or surgery. I have shown through my case studies in Chapter Two and Three, that not all individuals sought or required body modification and/or surgeries in order to live as men. Multiple discourses and life narratives question an assertion of a singular discourse of modification and secrecy. Cross-gendered identity and behaviour is played out in numerous ways on 'female' bodies and a variety of ideas and discourses surround masculinity, cross-gendered identity and behaviour in history. The recognition of other modes of cross-gendered identity and behaviour played out on the 'female' body and the intersection of class and ethnicity need to be examined by the researcher. I agree that ideas of 'men' and 'masculinity' are cultural and historically situated. This idea needs to be applied to cross-gendered behaviour and identity as specific social, cultural and historic meanings of cross-gendered lives allow for a complex and situated knowledge of gender, sex and sexuality. The discourse surrounding cross-gendered individuals, and the examination of the historic specifics shows there is much fluidity in cross-gendered identity and behaviour.

582 Cromwell J., Transmen and FTMs: Identities, Bodies, Genders, and Sexualities, Urbana and Chicago, 1999, p.81.
583 Cromwell, p.81.
584 Cromwell, p.81.
Concluding Comments

In conclusion, my thesis has shown there was a range of female-to-male cross-gendered behaviour and identities in New Zealand history. The analysis of case studies from the New Zealand Truth and other newspapers has illustrated there were multiple discourses associated with cross-gendered identity and behaviour. I have explained how popular media hinted at aspects of sexological theory and how cross-gendered individuals used sexological ideas and language in the negotiation of their identity. A number of approaches, from post-structuralism to queer historiography, were employed in my thesis to construct a theoretical research position. The main premise of my thesis is to encourage an examination of the historical landscape that unpacks signs, language, and behaviour associated with cross-gendered identity and behaviour. By questioning a singular discourses in history, it is possible to move towards constructing multiple narratives for individuals and, therefore, highlighting the complexities and contradictions of identity and behaviour. This is a move away from essentialist and reductive history and towards a history that encompasses diversity and incongruity.
Conclusion: Future Investigations

In this thesis I highlighted the complex and discontinuous history of female-to-male cross-gendered lives in New Zealand between 1906 and 1950. Cross-gendered identity and behaviour challenges existing conceptions of sexuality in society and in gender history and theory. The focus of my conclusion is to suggest new perspectives and prospective research in the area of cross-gendered identity and behaviour in New Zealand. Two areas, I believe, are beneficial in the development of future study; Firstly the continuation of the analysis of sexological research and the relationship with New Zealand's understanding of cross-gendered identification, and secondly more involved integration of discourse analysis with feminist theory and gender theory. Together, I believe these investigations will form an exciting and new theoretical perspective on the study of gender in New Zealand.

Language and ideas frequently changed and evolved throughout the post-1950 era. An important consideration in any research that furthers the cross-gendered narrative is to explore the emergence and changeable usage of the terms such as transsexual (as used by Harry Benjamin) and transgender. Each of these terms has a unique history that intersects with sexology, medicine and science, social ideas, political movements, and self-narrative. Current debates around each of these terms as identity labels need to be unpacked and examined in conjunction with sexological, medical and personal narratives.

Three figures in post-1950 sexology are important for consolidating a framework around language associated with cross-gender identity and/or behaviour, transsexualism, and later, transgenderism. Alfred Kinsey is considered an important sexologist of the twentieth century and he made numerous contributions to the study of sex, gender and sexuality. Kinsey interviewed a number of cross-gendered individuals, and theorised they were influenced by psychological conditioning at a young age. Although 'sympathetic' to transsexuals, transvestites and cross-gendered

---

individuals, he did not agree with surgical intervention, as it would solve the 'underlying psychological problem' or change the secondary sexual characteristics.586 In male-to-female cases he advocated that individuals seek psychiatric help and attempt 'homosexual relations', though near the end of his career he accepted transsexuals were not homosexuals.587

Harry Benjamin wrote Transsexual Phenomenon in 1966 and advanced medical and scientific theory on cross-gendered identity and behaviour. Transsexual Phenomenon amalgamated the idea of the 'wrong body' discourse with an analysis of childhood experiences. He initiated 'Standards of Care' for ethical and regulatory treatment for transsexual and cross-gendered individuals and produced a huge amount of research on transsexualism and cross-gendered identity.588 The impact of the 'Standards of Care,' on cross-gendered individuals' negotiation of the language of sex/gender and sexuality needs more thorough research. The 1960s and 1970s saw a proliferation of sexological work both by Benjamin and John Money who further expanded the theories of sex, gender, and sexuality. Money developed the ideas of gender, gender identity, and gender role and contributed to a theory of sexual development.589

Each of these sexologists were internationally recognised for their contribution to the study of cross-gendered identity and behaviour. Questions for future research could include: were sexological ideas further integrated into the New Zealand consciousness and if so how, and did the theories influence the discursive frameworks adopted by cross-gendered individuals? A brief overview of the Truth in the 1950s revealed a substantial article published on the work of Alfred Kinsey that illustrated there was an awareness of sexological works in New Zealand although the influence of such articles and ideas on the cross-gendered field is yet to be examined. Research on cross-gendered

lives in New Zealand post-1950 would benefit from an analysis of the work of Kinsey, Benjamin and Money as a way to investigate the language and ideas that permeated the media and society. Future research could examine how dominant the power of science and medicine became in the construction of gender, sex and sexuality and how individual agency was negotiated. An investigation on how sexuality based political movements impacted on gendered identities and bodies would add further context to the development of cross-gendered identity and/or behaviour.

Historians, Joanne Meyerowitz among them, have used the case of Christine Jorgenson to delineate the ‘modern’ sex change in cross-gendered historiography. Jorgenson achieved notoriety in the international media, although in New Zealand the Truth only published one article with the headline ‘Not a Bar to Motherhood’ that briefly gave an overview of her operation. The story of Roberta Cowell, who was considered the ‘first’ male-to-female transsexual to have surgery to create a vagina in the United Kingdom, attained more media coverage in New Zealand, with the Truth publishing a front page report and a number of shorter follow-up articles. This lends itself to a further discussion of influential cross-gendered figures in the context of New Zealand historiography.

I have cited Amy Bock and Peter Alexander as significant figures in the New Zealand cross-gendered landscape in the period before 1950. It may be possible to argue that Peter was New Zealand’s Jorgenson, due to the Truth’s approach to his ‘sex change’. More exploration into the latter part of the twentieth century would be able to answer this query as well as broaden the distinct New Zealand canon of cross-gendered identity and behaviour from both female-to-male and male-to-female. Hopefully this thesis is a catalyst for long-term research on the impact of international cross-gendered cases in New Zealand and a consideration of the ways international research framed the New Zealand situation.

590 NZT, 10th December 1952, p.1. Also mentioned in NZT, 2nd February 1955, p.19.
Theoretically, my thesis has argued for a move away from essentialist and reductive history and towards a history that encompasses diversity and incongruity. I utilised Foucauldian discourse analysis to illustrate how history can be read as complex, dislocated and fractured. Recognition of the disjunctions in self-narrative, and unpacking contradictions allows the extrapolation of numerous voices and discourses. It is important for the researcher to notice these multiple discourses and not to construct one voice in history, (see Chapters One and Four for my critique of lesbian rejections of cross-gendered figures), but multiple voices and therefore give entangled and diverse meanings to cross-gender identity and behaviour.

Before I discuss feminist theory in terms of future theoretical considerations in cross-gendered research I will briefly consider the current state of Trans-theory, situated under the umbrella of Trans-academia, and feminist theory. Although Trans-theory can be considered a separate theoretical school of thought, it has begun to merge with feminist theory to create a hybrid of theoretical knowledge on questions of sex and gender. Trans-theory and Trans-feminism have predominantly grown out of political Trans movements, fighting for recognition of Trans-rights. Writers in the field of Trans-theory have included Sandy Stone, Susan Stryker, Steven Whittle and Pat Califia, and each of these authors is contributing the field of Trans-feminism. Feminism and Trans-theory is a contested area with many complex debates on what is means to be ‘women’ and ‘man’ and how to address theoretical concerns of gendered identity, subjectivity and self-narrative. Recent contributions in the areas of Trans-feminism have started the process of questioning the relationships between Trans-theory and feminist theory by developing work that focuses on untangling the ‘imagined’ boundaries between the two theories and moving towards more complex ideas of

---


gender and feminism. Along with an acknowledgement of complexities and distributions in theory and in self-narrative I believe further theoretical notions of feminism, cross-gender and trans theory can emerge and became an important tool in the analysis of cross-gender history and present day narrative.

Bodies, identities and behaviour of cross-gendered individuals are likely to reflect dominant norms of society, sexology, and medicine as well as a negotiation between power, selfhood and gender and/or sex. Feminist theory has addressed these ideas in the examination of the construction of the categories ‘female’ and ‘woman’ as well as how power has influenced conceptions of bodies. One feminist approach that parallels Trans-theory is the feminist critique of the ideology underpinning the sex/gender system. Donna Haraway’s *Cyborg Manifesto* has challenged the sex/gender system and in future research I would seek to develop both feminist theory and trans theory along the lines of Haraway’s cyborg imagery. Haraway argued against essentialism in feminist thought explaining, ‘there nothing about being “female” that naturally binds women’ and argued for a politics of ‘affinity not identity’. Furthermore Haraway suggested ‘gender may not be a global identity’ and ‘cyborg imagery can suggest a way out of a maze of dualisms in which we have explained our bodies and our tools to ourselves’. Haraway’s describes how the image of the cyborg is a ‘myth’ of ‘transgressed boundaries, potent fusions’ and the ‘hybrid’ of machine and flesh. Haraway’s idea for a ‘post-gender’ world, her imaging of the cyborg lends itself to a theoretical approach to cross-gender and transgender theory.

A different approach to the study of gender can be created by amalgamating Trans-theory with Haraway’s cyborg vision, in which the ‘tools and myth’ of bodies influence identity. A diversification of current gender theory would involve a deconstruction,

---

596 Haraway, pp.180-181.
597 Haraway, pp.149-153.
then a reformation of the analytical mechanisms that describe and speak to bodies and
genders. Such an approach can attend to the fluid and complex myths and realities of
both theoretical and lived world of gender. An example of the usefulness of this
approach is the life of Amy Bock, who became a mythical figure, the archetype of the
masquerader, in New Zealand, and used clothing as 'technology' of time to construct
numerous identities and genders.

It is important to note that Haraway's argument has been placed largely in the political
realm of feminist theory, though Haraway has used the cyborg to critique aspects of
medicine, reproduction, and literature. Further research into the intersections between
bodies, technology and Trans-theory may lead to an evolution of new theoretical
insights. Haraway's article, along with the feminist theory of Riley and Scott cited in
Chapter One, that encourages the researcher to 'provide new perspectives on old
questions' lends itself to subsequent research on cross-gendered identity and behaviour
within a feminist theory framework.598

Cross-gender identification and behaviour challenge the theoretical assumptions of the
binary sex/gender system. More theoretical investigations are needed into how gender
and/or sex is understood and conceptualised by cross-gendered individuals. It would
then be possible to move towards a continuum of gender and/or sex where
discontinuity is celebrated. This would broaden the historiographic field and allow for
investigations into the intersections of identity, behaviour, medicine, science, culture
and society. Together feminist theory, trans theory, discourse analysis and gender
theory will enable new ways of studying and conceptualising gender.

598 Scott, p.1075. See Chapter One pp.11-12 for my discussion on feminist use of discourse analysis.
Bibliography


Wickets, D., 'Can Sex in Humans Be Changed?,' Physical Culture, 1, 1937, pp.16-17, 83-85.