Making the Choice for Music

Sara Brown

A thesis submitted for the degree of Master of Arts (Music) at the University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand

April 2017
Abstract
This research examines the impact of formal and informal music education experiences on the decision-making process of students who choose to pursue tertiary music studies. By examining the literature on this subject, and using qualitative and quantitative research methods, it explores the formal and informal music education experiences of University of Otago students who are in their first year of tertiary music studies, as well as the experiences of professional music educators in schools and teacher training, who are based in Dunedin, New Zealand. It examines, through students’ music life-stories, experiences of the music curriculum in primary, intermediate and secondary schools in New Zealand, and of their barriers to learning. It looks also at the students’ experiences of instrumental and vocal lessons, co-curricular activities in schools, and community music making opportunities. The music education experiences and views of education professionals are analysed to see if the issues raised by students (geography, finance, access to all creative aspects of the curriculum) are the same as those identified by the education professionals. The roles of significant other people (parents, teachers, mentors, classmates and friends) in the formation of a musical identity are explored, as are other factors that assist in the identity formation and decision making process. A composite view of a young music student emerges from this study, as a practitioner who sees value in understanding music and has a sense of musical identity within a music community. Recommendations regarding improving access and learning in music are suggested.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the following people for their support in the development of this thesis:

My supervisor, Dr Jennifer Cattermole, for her outstanding support throughout this process.

Emeritus Professor John Drummond, for getting me started on this journey, and inspiring me to look deeper.

My partner, Rhys Thorn, my parents Andrew and Marjorie Brown, and my daughter Mhairi Rowbottom, for their ongoing support and belief in my ability to do this.

The staff of the Department of Music, Theatre Studies and Performing Arts at the University of Otago for their wise heads.

To the education professionals who took part in the interviews for this thesis, for their time, honesty and professionalism, and their devotion to music education.

Most of all, to the students of the University of Otago who filled in survey forms, gave honest and direct interviews about their lives, told their personal stories, and made me laugh so many times. Thank you for your generosity and belief that high quality music education matters.

Sara Brown
April 2017
Table of Contents

Abstract .......................................................................................................................... ii

Acknowledgements ................................................................................................. iii

Table of Figures ....................................................................................................... ix

1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1
   1.1 Personal background .................................................................................. 1
   1.2 Research question ................................................................................... 3
   1.3 Project objective ....................................................................................... 5
   1.4 Significance of this research ..................................................................... 6

2 Literature Review .................................................................................................. 8
   2.1 Curriculum and education: schools in New Zealand .............................. 8
   2.2 Formal and informal teaching and learning ............................................. 12
   2.3 Learning music: informal music education .............................................. 14
   2.4 Community music .................................................................................... 15
   2.5 Co-curricular activities ............................................................................ 16
   2.6 Music teachers ......................................................................................... 18
   2.7 The role of parents .................................................................................. 18
   2.8 Music identity formation ........................................................................ 19
   2.9 Engagement with music .......................................................................... 19
   2.10 Concepts of musical intelligence, talent and ability ............................... 21
   2.11 Creativity in music ............................................................................... 22
   2.12 Summary, and place of this study in the context of the literature .......... 23

3 Methodology .......................................................................................................... 24
   3.1 Qualitative research .................................................................................. 24
   3.2 Ethical considerations .............................................................................. 25
      3.2.1 Personal ethical considerations ......................................................... 25
   3.3 Selection of participants in student survey .............................................. 26
   3.4 Selection of survey format ...................................................................... 27
   3.5 Data gathering from survey ..................................................................... 28
   3.6 Selection of participants for student interviews .................................... 31
   3.7 Development of interview questions from survey responses ............. 32
      3.7.1 Interview questions .......................................................................... 32
3.8 Selection of participants for education professionals interviews................ 34
3.9 Development of interview questions for education professionals .......... 34
3.10 Analysis of survey results ......................................................................... 36
3.11 Analysis of interviews with students .......................................................... 37
3.12 Analysis of interviews with education professionals ................................ 38
3.13 Structure of analysis .................................................................................. 38
3.14 Validity .......................................................................................................... 39

4 Learning Music .................................................................................................. 41

4.1 Instrumental and vocal learning methods .................................................... 41
  4.1.1 Survey results .......................................................................................... 41
  4.1.2 Private lessons ........................................................................................ 42
  4.1.3 Group lessons ........................................................................................ 44
  4.1.4 Self-teaching .......................................................................................... 45
  4.1.5 Itinerant lessons ....................................................................................... 46
  4.1.7 Out-of-hours music lessons .................................................................... 49
  4.1.8 Community based learning ................................................................... 49
  4.1.9 Does current practice reflect earlier times? ............................................ 49
  4.1.10 Summary of instrumental learning ....................................................... 50
  4.1.11 Formality and informality in instrumental tuition ................................. 52

4.2 Music education in primary schools ............................................................. 52
  4.2.1 Survey results ........................................................................................ 52
  4.2.2 Interview subjects’ comments on primary school music ....................... 55
  4.2.3 Co-curricular opportunities at primary school ....................................... 56
  4.2.4 Positive experiences: an exception to the rule ....................................... 57
  4.2.5 Creativity in primary school music .......................................................... 59
  4.2.6 Education professionals’ comments on primary school music ............. 59
  4.3.1 Survey results ........................................................................................ 62
  4.3.2 Interview subjects’ comments on intermediate school music .............. 66
  4.3.3 Education professionals’ comments on intermediate school music ....... 67
  4.4.1 Survey results ........................................................................................ 68
  4.4.2 Subject study at secondary school ........................................................... 71
  4.4.3 Classroom teaching ................................................................................. 73
  4.4.4 Formality and informality in secondary school music ............................ 76
  4.4.5 Music teachers in New Zealand secondary schools .............................. 77
4.4.6 Negative experiences at secondary school .....................................................78
4.4.7 Secondary school music: a few observations in summary ...............................79
4.5 Co-curricular activities in schools ......................................................................79
  4.5.1 Survey results .................................................................................................80
  4.5.2 Choir ..............................................................................................................82
  4.5.3 School musical productions ..........................................................................83
  4.5.4 Large instrumental ensembles ......................................................................84
  4.5.6 Small instrumental ensembles ......................................................................86
  4.5.7 Education professionals’ views of co-curricular activities ..............................87
  4.5.8 Co-curricular activities in summary ...............................................................88

5 People who have an Impact ..................................................................................90
  5.1 Family ...............................................................................................................90
    5.1.1 Parents ........................................................................................................90
    5.1.2 Siblings ......................................................................................................93
  5.2 Support networks outside the family .....................................................................95
    5.2.1 Mentors ......................................................................................................96
    5.2.2 Community music making .........................................................................97
  5.3 Friends ..............................................................................................................100
  5.4 Classmates .......................................................................................................100
    5.4.1 Negative classmates ....................................................................................101
    5.4.2 Positive classmates .....................................................................................101
  5.5 Summary ..........................................................................................................102

6 Access and Barriers to Music Education ..............................................................103
  6.1 Finance ..............................................................................................................103
  6.2 Starting age .....................................................................................................104
  6.3 Geography .......................................................................................................104
  6.4 School structures .............................................................................................105
  6.5 Access to all elements of music education .......................................................106
  6.6 Lack of creativity teaching in primary and intermediate schools ....................106
  6.7 Primary school music teaching .........................................................................108
  6.8 The views of education professionals ...............................................................108
  6.9 Summary: impact of barriers to learning .........................................................110

7 Value in Formal and Informal Music Education Experiences ..............................111
7.1 What do students value in formal music education? ............................................ 112
7.2 What do students value in informal music education? ..................................... 112
7.3 What do students value more: formal or informal music education? .............. 113
7.4 Bi-musicality and validation ................................................................................. 114
7.5 Summary .............................................................................................................. 116

8 Deciding to be a Musician ......................................................................................... 117
8.1 Deciding to study music ....................................................................................... 117
  8.1.1 The age to make the decision ........................................................................... 117
  8.1.2 Personal reasons for subject choice at university ........................................... 118
8.2 The decision: influences and circumstances ......................................................... 119
  8.2.1 Crystallizing moments and environments ...................................................... 120
  8.2.2 Motivation ........................................................................................................ 121
  8.2.3 Extrinsic and intrinsic motivation ................................................................... 121
  8.2.4 Flow .................................................................................................................. 122
  8.2.5 Peer and school recognition as a musician ...................................................... 122
  8.2.6 Challenge .......................................................................................................... 123
  8.2.7 Summary: Identity development ................................................................... 124

9 Conclusions ................................................................................................................. 126
9.1 Practitioner ............................................................................................................ 126
  9.1.1 Depth ................................................................................................................ 127
  9.1.2 Community ........................................................................................................ 128
9.2 The impact of formal and informal music experiences on the decision to pursue professional training in music ................................................................. 128

10 Recommendations .................................................................................................... 131
10.1 Collaboration ........................................................................................................ 131
10.2 Mentoring ............................................................................................................ 132
10.3 Support for community music groups ................................................................. 132
10.4 Professional Development .................................................................................... 132
10.5 Advocacy .............................................................................................................. 133
10.6 Access .................................................................................................................. 134
10.7 Theory of Music .................................................................................................... 134
10.8 Teaching Creativity in Primary School Music ....................................................... 134
10.9 Conclusion ............................................................................................................ 135
References ............................................................................................................................... 136

List of Appendices .................................................................................................................. 141

Appendix 1a University of Otago Human Ethics Committee Application Form: Category A ................................................................................................................................. 142
Appendix 1b Request for Extension or Amendment to a Previously Approved Study .......................................................................................................................... 156
Appendix 2 Questions from Electronic Survey ..................................................................... 159
Appendix 3 Interview Questions: Students ............................................................................ 176
Appendix 4 Interview Questions: Education Professionals .................................................... 177
Appendix 5 Schools in New Zealand ....................................................................................... 179
Appendix 6 School Music Qualifications in New Zealand ..................................................... 184
Table of Figures

Figure 1. Instrumental Learning Methods ................................................................. 42
Figure 2. Ages at which students started learning instruments ............................... 47
Figure 3. Education professionals’ music learning experiences .............................. 50
Figure 4. Instrumental learning methods by instrument .......................................... 51
Figure 5. Primary music specialist teachers ............................................................. 53
Figure 6. Recognition of student interest at primary school ..................................... 53
Figure 7. Opportunities at primary school ............................................................... 53
Figure 8. Importance of music at primary school ..................................................... 54
Figure 9. Fun of music at primary school ................................................................. 54
Figure 10. Formality of music at primary school ...................................................... 55
Figure 11. Intermediate music specialist teachers .................................................... 62
Figure 12. Recognition of student interest at intermediate school .............................. 63
Figure 13. Opportunities at intermediate school ..................................................... 63
Figure 14. Importance of music at intermediate school ............................................ 63
Figure 15. Fun of music at intermediate school ....................................................... 64
Figure 16. Formality of music at intermediate school .............................................. 64
Figure 17. Music specialists in schools ..................................................................... 69
Figure 18. Recognition of student interest in schools .............................................. 69
Figure 19. Opportunities for involvement at schools .............................................. 70
Figure 20. Importance of music in schools ............................................................... 70
Figure 21. Fun of music in schools .......................................................................... 71
Figure 22. Formality of music in schools .................................................................. 71
Figure 23. Students who studied music at secondary school ................................... 72
Figure 24. Highest music qualification gained at secondary school .......................... 72
Figure 25. Participation in music co-curricular activities at school ........................... 80
Figure 26. Co-curricular participation: activities ...................................................... 81
Figure 27. First parent or caregiver’s involvement in music ..................................... 90
Figure 28. Second parent or caregiver’s involvement in music ................................. 91
Figure 29. Parental expectations of music learning .................................................. 91
Figure 30. Siblings in family .................................................................................... 93
Figure 31. Siblings’ involvement in music ................................................................. 94
Figure 32. Participation in local music activities out of school ................................. 97
Figure 33. Participation in community music groups ............................................... 98
Figure 34. Creative opportunities ........................................................................... 107
Figure 35. Changes in survey responses between primary and secondary school ...... 111
Figure 36. Age at which students decided to study music at tertiary level ............... 117
Figure 37. Age at which ‘music major’ students decided to study music at tertiary level ... 118
Figure 38. Types of school in New Zealand ............................................................. 180
Figure 39. Level one music standards ..................................................................... 185
Figure 40. Level two music standards .................................................................... 185
Figure 41. Level three music standards .................................................................. 186
1 Introduction
1.1 Personal background
I am a former secondary school music teacher who has been fortunate to teach in both Scotland and New Zealand. I trained as a specialist music teacher for both primary and secondary school music in Edinburgh, Scotland, and taught secondary school music for twelve years. I spent three years as an assistant teacher in a Scottish secondary school, then nine years as head of music in schools in the North Island of New Zealand.

Secondary school music is often anecdotally referred to as the subject in which students arrive at class with the widest range of experiences and abilities. This is my personal experience also. I have taught year nine classes (aged approximately thirteen years) that included students who have no prior learning in music, as well as students who have been learning one or more instruments through private music lessons since they were very young, and students who have taught themselves to play through their own initiative. During my secondary school teaching career, I have taught hundreds of students. For some students, music was the reason they came to school each day. I was fascinated by the variability of music education my students had experienced, both in and out of the classroom. Each student had a unique set of experiences in music, and their interests were shaped by those experiences. In my time as a school teacher I encountered students whose stories have had a deep impact on me which has made me want to study music education in greater depth. Three of these stories are outlined below.

Anna arrived at high school and signed up for tuition in four instruments, two more than she was permitted to take in school time. She came from a financially limited background and could not afford the hire fees for the instruments. I called Anna in for a chat, and asked her if she preferred any one of the instruments. I reassured her that I would ensure she could have an instrument without it costing her anything if necessary. Anna asked me to choose as she didn’t know which she would like best, a significant responsibility for me as a teacher. I suggested cello (one of the instruments she had listed) as we were short of cellos in the school orchestra. Anna responded with “cool, what’s a cello?” After eighteen months Anna came top in New Zealand for grade four
ABRSM. In five years, Anna learned the cello to a level of being accepted for performance study at university. She got bored one summer holiday and so went to the library to borrow books on guitar playing. Using her father’s guitar, she taught herself to play and came back to school fluent in guitar tablature, notation, chord charts (including complex jazz chords) and even lute tablature. She played in the orchestra, the combined school jazz band and in chamber groups; she sang in the school choirs, and studied music throughout her school career and at university.

Nick and Jordy were two death-metallers I taught when they were in year twelve and thirteen. Both played guitar, bass guitar, and sang. Jordy also played drum kit. I discovered that neither of them could read music fluently, although they had managed to pass level one of the National Certificate of Educational Achievement (NCEA) the year before I started teaching at their school. Both boys were hard working and keen to improve their skills, so I gave them and a few other students some after-school tuition to catch them up on music theory. As the school music teacher, I also made sure I attended events such as Smokefree Rockquest (which Nick and Jordy’s band won in that region for three years) and whenever possible, the gigs the band performed. In return, the boys joined the school choirs, the Celtic rock band, the jazz ensemble, took lessons in guitar and voice, and played in a classical guitar trio for the Chamber Music Contest. While neither of the boys studied music at tertiary level, in part because they still lacked confidence in their theory knowledge, both are still creating, performing and recording music.

---

1 ABRSM is the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, an internationally recognised music examinations board.
2 NCEA is the national school qualification offered in all New Zealand state and state-integrated schools. This is explained in greater detail in Appendix 6.
3 Smokefree Rockquest is a national competition for secondary school rock musicians who write and perform their own original music. Smokefree Rockquest was founded in 1989 by two secondary school music teachers, Glenn Common and Pete Rainey (SmokefreeRockquest)
4 Chamber Music New Zealand (CMNZ) Secondary Schools contest, commonly referred to in schools at the Chamber Music Contest, is for ensembles of three to eight instrumental performers, and has existed in various forms since 1966 (Chamber Music New Zealand).
Edward was only fifteen when he sat and passed Bursary\(^5\) music, and was awarded a scholarship. He played piano, clarinet, saxophone, trombone and bass guitar to a very high standard, and was (when aged sixteen, but promoted to year thirteen – typically for students aged seventeen - at school) the oboe soloist with the New Zealand Secondary Schools Orchestra. He was the youngest child of older parents who supported him in his music studies financially and with time and transport. Edward studied music and physics at university and now spends his time managing his parents’ farm and playing music as a member of the New Zealand Navy Band as well as in a local jazz ensemble and a classical chamber music group.

Anna, Nick, Jordy and Edward’s experiences in music were diverse. They had started their music journeys at varying ages, with different access to music education dependant on location and financial circumstances. Their musical interests ranged from classical and jazz to death-metal. However, all of them had aspects of their music education in common. Principally, they all took part in co-curricular activities. Some formed their own bands; some took part in organised ensembles. When offered opportunities by an adult with access to music (me in my role of teacher) they participated in more activities, a wider range of genres, and actively sought to go deeper into understanding music.

1.2 Research question
In this research, I explore the question: What influence do students’ music education experiences, both formal and informal, have on their decisions to pursue professional music training? This research explores the experiences of students who have been educated in the New Zealand school system and have chosen to pursue studies in tertiary music training, to discover what impact their music experiences at school and elsewhere have had on their musical interests, preferences, and educational and vocational decisions.

To answer the research question, further questions needed to be asked and answered. The concepts of formal and informal music education needed to be explored within the

\(^5\) Bursary, or University Bursary was the final year level school examination replaced by NCEA Level three in 2004.
context of New Zealand music education as well as in other countries with similar education systems. Researchers in New Zealand education have looked outside our country to find instances of ‘best practice’ which may suit the New Zealand model, or indeed to see what New Zealand is doing in comparison with other countries that is better practice for our students. This gives rise to the following questions:

- What are the differences between formal and informal music education and experiences?
- Is the experience of formal or informal music making different in New Zealand from other countries such as England, Scotland or the United States of America?

Most of the student participants in this study attended school since the implementation of the current arts curriculum. It is valid, therefore, to examine their experiences to see if they have been exposed to the whole curriculum, or if they have experienced a restricted curriculum that does not adequately reflect what they are entitled to. These issues give rise to questions such as the following:

- Are all aspects of the music curriculum being taught to all students?
- Are there any areas of the music curriculum that are being neglected?

Students do not generally make life decisions such as studying music in isolation. They seek advice and guidance from teachers, family members and other people who act as role models. Many people are involved in the construction of a young musician, and their roles and influence will be examined, answering the questions:

- Is the student’s interest in studying music supported and validated?
- Are the roles of other people significant in the decision-making process?
- Who has had the greatest impact on them? Teachers, friends, family?

There may be barriers to music education for students in New Zealand. By identifying these barriers, their causes and their impact on the students, it will be possible to make
recommendations that enable students and their teachers to minimise these barriers. This thesis therefore asks:

- What barriers to music education exist and have had an impact on the students’ development?

The diverse nature of music, with its many genres and disciplines within the broader subject, can mean there are few clear pathways for music students to follow to tertiary study. Students might follow similar paths. Finding these paths of commonality could provide useful information for teachers and tertiary providers, as could finding points of divergence that open new opportunities for students, or new ways to approach music education: It is therefore necessary to ask:

- Are there clear pathways for music students to follow?
- What opportunities exist for music education and music making outside school?
- Who has created opportunities for students – the students themselves or others?

1.3 Project objective

The project will, in addition to answering the primary research question, evaluate the quality and relevance of school music education for those intending to pursue music professionally. This data is potentially useful for both curriculum planning and pre-service teacher training in New Zealand. The project will also explore the concepts of formal and informal music education experiences. It will gather data on what activities students have engaged with and evaluate the relevance of out-of-school music education experiences. The information gathered will enable school and tertiary teachers to recognise the varied paths available to students, and acknowledge the contribution these make to the students’ development. This will give music educators a more holistic view of what music education is in New Zealand, and what may be done to enhance these experiences for students who wish to pursue this to tertiary level. This data will be of value to school teachers, giving them clear ideas of what support students require to develop to the point of studying music at tertiary level. It will also help tertiary teachers to recognise students arrive at tertiary level having more variation of knowledge than might previously have been expected under past, more prescriptive
school music curricula. It might also lead to an improvement in communication of expectations between secondary and tertiary music educators.

1.4 Significance of this research

Some research has been carried out in relation to students’ expectations of professional training by the Commission on the Education of the Professional Musician (CEPRoM), a commission of the International Society for Music Education (ISME). This thesis engages with and builds on this work, and aims to provide tertiary music training providers both nationally and internationally with a greater understanding of the experiences and motivations of their students when they commence their tertiary studies.

It is important to establish what music aspects of the Arts in *The New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) students are exposed to and what impact that curriculum has on the developing musician. In 2000, the release of the *Arts in the New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education & Learning Media, 2000) included Dance and Drama in the curriculum for the first time in New Zealand schools. All four strands of the curriculum, Dance, Drama, Music and Visual Art, must be taught to the end of primary school (that is, year eight). At least two must be taught in year nine, with the opportunity to study at least one art available to students in year ten. While the increased diversity of the arts curriculum can be viewed as positive, the risk is that the content of music (and visual art) is diminished to allow students time for dance and drama. If the curriculum is not being fully implemented, that may be disadvantaging students who would otherwise choose to participate in music. It is also important to examine what aspects of the curriculum students are exposed to at school to see what breadth of subject matter they have experienced, and to what depth they have studied this.

This research will be of use to music educators in New Zealand for advocacy purposes. *The New Zealand curriculum* states “*The principles set out below embody beliefs about what is important and desirable in school curriculum – nationally and locally. They should underpin all school decision making*” (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 9). These principles include high expectations, inclusion, community
engagement and coherence. In the case of music education, these principles are vital, and this research will show whether or not they are being adopted and affirmed.
2 Literature Review

To be able to examine the impact of formal and informal music education experiences on students in New Zealand, it is necessary to review available information on this topic. The following literature review is divided into three key sections. The first examines the New Zealand music curriculum, looking briefly at what philosophies of education are supported and mandated in the curriculum documents, and the culture of education in New Zealand. The second explores the concept of formal and informal education in music, both in and out of school; and the third looks at the development of the person’s music identity, including musical intelligence, opportunity and creativity. These three areas represent the main social and cultural influences that students experience during their childhood, the school, the family and the community that all have a part to play in the development of the whole person, as well as the intangible elements of identity development.

2.1 Curriculum and education: schools in New Zealand

In the present study, I examine the development of the whole musician, looking at the many experiences they have had - particularly within their schooling. Much of the data gathered from the student interviews deals with the students’ views of their ‘whole-self’ development as being an important aspect of their musical development. The New Zealand school education system is designed to support the development of the whole person. The New Zealand curriculum specifies that there is a vision for the development of the students to be “young people who will be confident, connected, actively involved, lifelong learners” (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 7). The curriculum document further breaks this down into a range of values, key competencies, learning areas, and principles, which together show an ideal of a holistic development of the young people of New Zealand. The values promoted in the curriculum are: “Excellence; Innovation; inquiry and curiosity; Diversity; Equity; Community and participation; Ecological sustainability; Integrity; Respect” (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 7). Many of these values were mentioned or alluded to by the students, particularly excellence, participation and respect. The key competencies are “Thinking; Using language, symbols, and texts; Managing self; Relating to others; Participating and contributing” (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 7). These were all in evidence throughout the interviews with
students and were variously mentioned while discussing primary and secondary school music, relationships with teachers and peers, learning theory of music and, overwhelmingly, co-curricular music activities.

When a new curriculum document is introduced in New Zealand, the Ministry of Education initially provides resources and professional development to enable staff in schools to implement this. As the *Arts in the New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education & Learning Media, 2000) document included both drama and dance as discrete subjects for the first time, there has been a greater emphasis for development on these strands rather than on music. This has led to less research taking place into music education in New Zealand since the year 2000 as dance and drama have taken a more central position. While dance and drama are valuable additions to the curriculum, this should not be a reason for the neglect of music education resourcing and research.

The implementation of the *Arts in the New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education & Learning Media, 2000) led to the distribution to schools of the *Into Music* series (Dreaver, Rose, & New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2005; McLennan, 2003; Rohan, 2001, 2002), which contains practical ideas and sample unit plans to assist teachers with their planning and delivery of music lessons. It is the role of the Education Review Office (ERO) to review and evaluate education in early childhood centres and schools in New Zealand. This includes reporting on examples of best-practice teaching in all curriculum areas. The ERO produced *The quality of teaching: Good practice music, reading and speaking, and technology June 2006* (New Zealand Education Review Office, 2006), outlining three case-studies of good practice in music teaching in New Zealand primary and intermediate schools. In addition, the National Education Monitoring Project (NEMP) (National Education Monitoring Project, 2010) gathered data on student achievement from 1995 to 2010 and tested all curriculum areas in a four-year cycle. The data gathered regarding music achievement has been used to support research in music education, including that of the ERO (as discussed below in section 2.9 Engagement with music).

The National Monitoring Study of Student Achievement (NMSSA) replaced NEMP in 2012 and is now beginning to release its findings. The report, *Music – Sound Arts 2015*
Key findings (National Monitoring Study of Student Achievement, 2016) looks at many of the issues identified in the NEMP reports on music. Like the earlier NEMP reports, it provides a snapshot of the achievement and attitudes of students at years four and eight and draws similar conclusions to the earlier NEMP reports. It also goes further, however, by looking at the school teachers’ and principals’ views on music education in terms of professional development and resourcing. Unfortunately, it paints a picture of a subject discipline that is stagnating, with little professional development available to teachers in the past six years, and professional development in music not being prioritised by principals for the last five years.

Issues of curriculum implementation are beginning to be addressed by researchers in New Zealand. In Music Education in New Zealand Primary Schools (Rohan, 2004), the author looks at the implications of implementing the music teaching aspects of The Arts in the New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education & Learning Media, 2000). The picture she paints, is one of serious concern about the lack of adequately trained teachers at primary school level. Issues raised include the crowded curriculum, where the school principals’ priorities are literacy and numeracy, and a lack of funding for teachers and resources. These barriers to music learning match the issues raised by the students interviewed in the present study, discussed in detail in chapter 6 Access and Barriers to Music Education, such as the perceived lack of opportunity to learn music at primary school, and the lack of teachers who had the training or confidence to teach music. These comments were strongly reiterated by the education professionals interviewed for the present study (also discussed in chapter six).

A Promise Broken (Nyce, 2009) looks at the methods and philosophies of teaching music in primary and intermediate schools in New Zealand. While Douglas Nyce’s statistical analysis of the state of music teaching is helpful, it is coloured by his assumptions that the teaching of conventional music notation is necessarily desirable. While the author refers to the New Zealand curriculum document of 2007, he bases much of his premise on the Syllabus for Schools: Music Education Early Childhood to Form Seven (New Zealand Department of Education, 1989), a document that had already been superseded by The Arts in the New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education & Learning Media, 2000). He also fails to consider the historic and cumulative culture of New Zealand teaching, including the underlying philosophy
of development of creativity and enquiry as laid out in the *New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007), and the autonomy of curriculum delivery expected of New Zealand primary school teachers. He focuses instead on the concept of having a music education philosophy that must be instituted nationally: a concept of all students learning music in primary schools by one method.

In *From singular to over-crowded region: Curriculum change in senior secondary school music in New Zealand* (McPhail, 2012a) the author discusses these issues of broad curricula in relation to secondary school music teaching, as well as the implication of more student-led, less formal teaching practices. His work is mainly focused on the implications of this for students working towards their NCEA in their final three years of secondary schooling. He also uses observations of secondary schools and interviews with teachers to make a compelling case for a more in-depth description of requirements within the broad curriculum to support teachers in their delivery of a consistent level of music education for assessment purposes. This is further explored in *Knowledge and the curriculum: Music as a case study in educational futures*, where he relates this need for greater description from his perspective as national moderator for NCEA music:

> I have viewed copious locally devised tasks and student work derived from national standards which show there is a great variance in the knowledge content and the skill levels demanded from school to school. This raises issues of validity for the qualification, as well as concerns for equitable access to knowledge (McPhail, 2012, p. 35)

This variance was evident in the comments made by students about their work towards NCEA, which they often compared with their peers from other schools. While I sympathise with Graham McPhail’s concerns over validity and equity of access, I also think it is important for the teachers to retain autonomy over the material used for teaching as they are in the best position to tailor their tasks to their students’ interests and experiences. The alternative would see a return to the prescriptive curriculum of the early 1990s in which classical music was given pre-eminence and therefore a hierarchy of musical genres was created by the curriculum.
2.2 Formal and informal teaching and learning

Anecdotal evidence points to an ongoing philosophy of education in New Zealand that appears less formal than teaching in other countries. Through discussions with parents of school aged children who have come to New Zealand from the United Kingdom, Europe or the United States of America, and through my own personal experience of teaching in Scotland and New Zealand as well as observing teaching in England, I have noted that the New Zealand education system is set up for a less formal approach than many other countries. The ERO publishes a guide for parents Choosing a school for a five year old (New Zealand Education Review Office, 2009), which describes the features of a good classroom. These features are far from the stereotypical sterile, formal classroom with teacher-directed education being the medium of knowledge transmission. Rather, it describes a co-operative, informal space and attitude towards education that allows students to develop creativity and responsibility amongst other attributes.

The challenge of defining formal and informal music education in New Zealand comes from the nature of the New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) itself. Examining the literature regarding formal and informal music-making, particularly the work of Professor Lucy Green (2001, 2006, 2009) shows there is no one definition of formal or informal music education. What is viewed as formal music education in New Zealand is informal by British or American standards. The nature of the New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) is such that the teacher retains a high degree of autonomy over both the content and pedagogy of their classroom. While there are support materials available from the Ministry of Education through publications, and website support such as Te kete ipurangi (TKI) (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2015), there are a wide range of methods and information available for schools on implementing the curriculum. This contrasts with the more prescriptive curricula found in England. In Music, informal learning and the school (Green, 2009), the author reflects on the difficulty classroom teachers had in implementing the new pedagogy of informal music education practices resulting from the pressure of the formal demands of the English National Curriculum (Department for Education, 2013) requirements rather than any lack of familiarity with alternate music styles or learning practices. As the National Curriculum website indicated under the downloadable resources of their music programme of study: “These are the
statutory programmes of study and attainment targets for music at key stages 1 to 3. They are issued by law; you must follow them unless there’s a good reason not to” (Department for Education, 2013). This authoritarian attitude is in direct contrast to the broad statements and lack of prescription of the curriculum in New Zealand.

The formal teaching of music is considered to “derive from the conventions of Western classical music pedagogy” (Green, 2001, p. 4), that is, classical music instrumental and vocal training undertaken by students through methods such as private music lessons, and classical music appreciation and analysis in the classroom. This has developed over time; formal music education now includes a greater variety of genres taught, including music from non-Western Art music traditions, and popular, contemporary, and jazz music styles. This is a model of a master passing on knowledge of technique and musicianship to an apprentice. It is the autonomy over and methods used to acquire music knowledge and skills that define music education’s formality or informality more than the subject content. In discussing the differences between formal and informal music education practices, Lucy Green (2001, p. 6) describes these concepts as lying at the extreme ends of a pole. I find the image of a continuum of learning to be helpful, along with the acceptance that students move along the continuum in either direction according to the knowledge they wish to acquire, and the level of autonomy they have as a learner over the methods of acquiring that knowledge.

Students start their music education journeys in many ways. There may be an initial request from a child to learn the piano or other instrument, or a parent may decide that it is time their child began music lessons. The age and interests of the learner, as well as the wishes and expectations of their parents, can dictate the level of formality of their learning. Parents who invest substantial amounts of their money in music lessons for their child expect a recognisable return, such as structured lessons in which their child can make noticeable progress, generally learns to read music notation, develops an appropriate performing technique, and is set pieces and exercises to practise. It makes sense to parents and teachers that young children need guidance on what to learn and how to learn it.

Older students can have greater autonomy over their learning, either by negotiation with a teacher, or by eliminating the role of teacher from the learning process. Students
search out their own resources, such as YouTube videos, to learn specific pieces of music or specific techniques. They may prefer to work in isolation or to work with a friendship group with similar interests. There appears from the interviews conducted for this research to be a greater level of intrinsic motivation in students who choose to learn independently or have more control over what and how they are learning. This may, however, be a result of the age at which the students begin to teach themselves, as this is more common amongst older beginners.

The continuum of formal and informal music learning is evident within the classroom in New Zealand. Performance assessment is an example of this. Many assessments take place within the classroom, with students playing music in front of a live audience and a video camera. However, students are also assessed in places that are much less formal. It is common for a secondary school music teacher to take the school’s video camera to Smokefree Rockquest or to a gig that someone is playing at, and film from the back of the hall for a group performance assessment. The preparation for such events can be of varying levels of formality. Group performances may grow out of activities outside the classroom. A band can grow from an informal jam session in the school’s practice rooms at lunchtime; a student might have found a song they like online and used their developing aural skills to learn it, or have learned a piece for the Chamber Music contest using all the formally acquired music skills they have, but practised independently with a friendship group that came together through music.

2.3 Learning music: informal music education

In *How popular musicians learn: Attitudes and values in learning to play*, the author states: “The teaching strategies, curriculum content and values associated with Western-style formal music education derive from the conventions of Western classical music pedagogy” (Green, 2001, p. 4). Informal music education seems synonymous with practical music-making activities using music from outside the Western European classical tradition, such as popular or non-Western music styles.

Informal music education is seen in recent literature as a positive movement. The work of Professor Lucy Green (2001, 2006, 2009) in introducing classroom teachers to the
learning habits and practices of non-Western or non-classical musicians has been particularly influential, as shown by the regularity with which her work is cited in music education literature. Her interviews with practicing musicians illuminate themes including relevance, authenticity, and practical learning. Chapter four of *How popular musicians learn: Attitudes and values in learning to play* (Green, 2001) focuses on the attitude of the interview subjects as to what they look for in music colleagues, which links with many of the comments made by the interview subjects in the present study, particularly in the context of the mentoring roles of teachers and the collaborative nature of band musicianship. This is discussed further in chapter 5 People who have an Impact.

Green’s work, along with *Music Matters* (Elliott, 1995), which promotes practices of relevant, aural-based, practical learning, has changed the nature of music education, moving it away from the elite classical music forms and academic knowledge to a more universal skills-based acquisition of music knowledge through action. The Arts in *The New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) and the music achievement standards of the NCEA both allow for and reflect this skills-based learning while still providing for in-depth academic study. In October 2016, the inclusion of a newly developed achievement standard in song-writing was announced on the Ministry of Education’s TKI website by the New Zealand Qualifications Authority (NZQA). This is available for assessment from 2017 and is NZQA’s official validation of popular music creation as a legitimate topic of study.

### 2.4 Community music

In *Community-based traditional fiddling as a basis for increasing participation in instrument playing* (Cope, 1999), the author researches the informal learning of Scottish traditional music practices. His work predates the concepts explored by Green in *Music, Informal Learning and the School: A New Classroom Pedagogy* (Green, 2009) of aural transmission of knowledge, through the medium of Scottish traditional fiddling rather than popular music, and is community-centred. His action-

---

6 Over 3500 citations are listed on Google Scholar, accessed 21 March 2016
https://scholar.google.co.nz/scholar?hl=en&q=Lucy+Green&btnG=&as_sdt=1%2C5&as_sdtp=

15
research project is based in real teaching practice, and shows his involvement in a small Scottish town’s development of a traditional fiddling class. The project invited school-aged children to learn the fiddle through a mentored and scaffolded community-based group. Parental support and involvement was encouraged, and was found to be important to the ongoing development of the children. This was particularly highlighted in the second year of the programme when the lack of communication with the new parents to the group lead to a less-than-successful integration for the new students for the year. Fortunately, this was recognised and amended for the following year, demonstrating the action-research process in action. Informal practices such as practice groups, the use of modified music notation systems rather than classical staff notation, and the alteration of instruments to suit left-handed players were all used to ensure there were as few barriers to learning as possible.

The traits of the project resonate with the learning practices of the students interviewed for the present study, such as family involvement in music learning, working together with friends to practise and develop skills, and allowing and encouraging students to work at their own pace, going ahead if they wished, or taking a more leisurely approach if they were less motivated at the time. One primary school aged student in the Scottish study had done very little practice in her first year, but in her second year of learning suddenly became much more committed and practised for an hour each day without parental prompting.

2.5 Co-curricular activities
Music activities that take place outside timetabled classes, such as orchestra or choir practices, have traditionally been referred to as extra-curricular. In recent years, this has changed to co-curricular activities for two principal reasons. Firstly, these activities are seen to inform and reinforce the curriculum. Secondly, in the subject area of music in the NCEA it is possible to use these co-curricular activities, such as chamber music ensembles or rock bands, for assessment purposes.

There has been some research into the impact on students of their participation in co-curricular music activities. In New Zealand, many co-curricular music activities, such as orchestras and choirs, are developed and modelled in a similar way to those
overseas, particularly in the United Kingdom, where school and regional orchestras and choirs exist under very similar conditions to those here. *Advanced youth music ensembles: Experiences of, and reasons for, participation* (Hewitt & Allan, 2013) examines the experiences of seventy-two Scottish students in an advanced youth orchestra or concert band. The findings indicate that, although the initial decision to be involved in these ensembles was often social, both the social and the musical rewards from their participation was what made them want to continue participating; these decisions were emanating from the students themselves, not from significant other figures such as parents or instrumental teachers. This is reflected in the interviews with students, particularly those who have participated in high level ensembles (that is, ensembles that are representative at a regional or national level). This is further discussed in section **4.5 Co-curricular activities in schools**.

Other aspects of co- and extra-curricular activities such as school musical theatre performances have also been studied, as in the work of Stephanie Pitts’ qualitative analysis of the impact of an English girls’ secondary school’s production, *Anything Goes: a case study of extra-curricular musical participation in an English secondary school* (Pitts, 2007). Her study, and *Critical events in teaching and learning* (Woods, 1993), are amongst the few studies that approach the topic of extra-curricular participation from a qualitative viewpoint. Pitts notes that “Researchers have consistently demonstrated correlations between extra-curricular participation and success in school, measured both in terms of class test results and pupils’ attitudes towards school work” (Pitts, 2007, pp. 148-149). Her work looks at the musical and intrinsic benefits of students’ involvement in the show, rather than any value it adds to other academic endeavour. “The picture thus generated of extra-curricular involvement is a positive one, but to evaluate such opportunities only by their apparent impact on academic achievement is in some ways to miss the point” (Pitts, 2007, p. 149).

Comments from students about the musical and intrinsic influences co-curricular activities have had on their musical development are discussed further in section **4.5 Co-curricular activities in schools**.
2.6 Music teachers

The nature of the relationship between the student musician and the teacher has been examined in *Characteristics of music teachers and the progress of young instrumentalists* (Davidson, Moore, Sloboda, & Howe, 1998). The roles and personalities of teachers of music instruments, as seen from the perspective of both the students and their parents in this article, are strongly reflected in the descriptions given by students interviewed in the present study. The evidence presented is that the positive, affirming and nurturing relationship between the young, pre-adolescent students and their music teachers is much more important than the technical facility demonstrated by the teacher at that stage, whereas the students’ values of their teachers in their adolescent years are more focused on the teachers’ skills as musicians. Throughout the interviews, students commented on their relationships with teachers as well as their perceptions of their technical abilities and musicianship. The importance of these relationships is discussed further in chapter 4.1 Instrumental and vocal learning methods.

2.7 The role of parents

The place of the parent in the development of the young musician has been examined in *Musical Identities* (MacDonald, Hargreaves, & Miell, 2002) as well as *The role of parental influences in the development of musical performance* (Davidson, Howe, Moore, & Sloboda, 1996). These works underline the importance of parental support for the young musician as the student develops through childhood and adolescence, noting how the role of the parent changes as the students acquire greater autonomy and intrinsic motivation. The students in the present study commented at length on their parents’ contributions to their music education and, with few exceptions, all had experienced the kinds of support the studies affirm is required to enable young musicians to succeed. It was notable, however, that the comments of parents and students in one study quoted in chapter four of *Musical Identities* (MacDonald et al., 2002) reflect a more ‘stage parent’ attitude than I found in any of the interviews conducted for the present study.
2.8 Music identity formation
The concept of a musical identity is discussed in detail from a variety of perspectives in *Musical Identities* (MacDonald et al., 2002). The influence of the school environment is examined in chapter three by Alexandra Lamont, where the author discusses the pupils’ developing concepts of what makes a musician. Her suggestion that ‘Children’s musical identities develop at school between the ages of 5 and 14 years, and that these will be shaped not by the Curriculum but by the traditional defining activities of ‘professional’ musicians’ (MacDonald et al., 2002, p. 46) is partially reflected in the interviews of the present study when looking at the comments of performance students; however, the comments from composition students show that the influence of the New Zealand curriculum on students who pursue composition is significant. This may reflect the place of composition in the New Zealand curriculum as compared with that of the English school system within which the book is situated. In the context of NCEA music at level three and scholarship, students may choose to ‘major’ in composition, that is, to focus their study on developing their individual style as a composer. The student may choose to combine this with other aspects, such as performance or musicology and analysis, or to focus solely on composition. Within the English *National Curriculum* (Department for Education, 2013) at the equivalent level (that is, A Level), students must combine performance, composition and music appreciation and analysis. This difference allows the New Zealand curriculum to have greater influence on students who show an interest in becoming composers.

2.9 Engagement with music
In *Children’s attitudes to music* (Buckton, 1999), the author explores the results of the NEMP (National Education Monitoring Project, 2010) survey of music achievement in primary schools. As well as measuring achievement in students in years four and eight (approximate ages eight and twelve years respectively), the survey asked students about their attitudes towards music. The author examines the results and asks why the popularity of music and music activities in school declines between these ages when the participation in music activities out of school increases. The article came out at a significant time in New Zealand music education as, in 1999, the *Arts in the New Zealand curriculum Draft* (New Zealand Ministry of Education & Learning Media,
1999) was released (and reviewed in detail in the same volume of *Sound Ideas*). The article captures many of the concerns of music educators at the time. The data on which this article is based was obtained from the first survey of musical attitudes undertaken by NEMP in 1996 (National Education Monitoring Project, 2010). The results of this survey, which was repeated in 2000, 2004 and 2008, showed little change in attitudes towards music activities in school over each subsequent four-year testing cycle. This leads to questions of what is or isn’t happening in primary and intermediate schools to fail to halt the decline in popularity of music over these years, and why this situation has not been addressed in this time. The concept of engagement is studied in *What we want: the music preferences of upper primary school students and the ways they engage with music* (De Vries, 2010). This research, in which the author uses a small sample based in a single Australian school, shows the disparity between the music curriculum as implemented by a ‘traditional’ music specialist, and the interests of the students in contemporary popular music. The need of students for ownership of their music education is a common theme of the literature. The contrast between music outside and inside school can lead to a disenfranchising of students, who feel that school music is of no relevance to them. Fortunately, most of the students interviewed for the present study had not experienced this disenfranchisement, although there were some instances of this, which are discussed further in 4.4.6 Negative experiences at secondary school.

In *Where to from here? A survey of year thirteen secondary school music students and their subsequent study intentions* (Sell & Buckton, 2009), the authors look at the intentions of year thirteen students with regards to tertiary music. Their study focuses on the South Island of New Zealand and includes statistical data relating to the choices students have made as to whether to study music at tertiary level or not, as well as their reasons for choosing the tertiary institutions they intend to attend. Surveys sent out to schools were completed by the school music teachers rather than the school students themselves, and are therefore reliant on what I would consider to be second-hand information. The reasons given for students’ choices of institution are interesting, although they are focused more on the choice of institution rather than the motivation for studying music as a subject. What is valuable in this study are the comments made by the secondary school teachers about their perceptions of why students are choosing to study at certain institutions. Students have considered the type of tertiary music
education that suits them as musicians as well as acting as a continuation of their prior learning. Similar ideas have come through in the student interviews for the present study. Of greater value to the present study, however, are the school teacher’s comments on why senior secondary music students (that is, students in years twelve and thirteen who have studied music at a high level at school) are not choosing to carry on to tertiary study. This is an area of concern for music educators both in schools and in tertiary institutions, as the drop-off rate can affect the viability of tertiary courses.

2.10 Concepts of musical intelligence, talent and ability
The concept of giftedness or talent in music has been researched and debated over many years. John Sloboda’s chapter *Musical excellence – How does it develop?* in *Encouraging the development of exceptional skills* (Howe, 1990) sets out the debate for and against the concepts of precocity versus diligence, and intelligence versus education, arguing that such views on the acquisition of music fall short of the full complexity of music learning. He discusses the conditions that allow students to achieve or develop excellence in ways that resonate closely with the comments made by students and educators in the present study. Sloboda further examines the concepts of musical ability and talent in *Exploring the musical mind: cognition, emotion, ability, function* (Sloboda, 2005). The early musical experiences of people who are identified as having musical ability are described in terms that match those of the interview subjects in the present study. The concepts of emotional response to music, fun, and exploration, and the relevance of extrinsic and intrinsic motivation towards practice, are discussed. There are insights into not only the ways to introduce and promote music but, more importantly, ways to develop musical ability and confidence in students who have had negative experiences. In examining the work of Sloboda, and the work of Howard Gardner in *Frames of mind: the theory of multiple intelligences* (Gardner, 1993), there is a common argument that musicians acquire what Gardner describes as musical intelligence not by some instinct or precocious talent or gift alone, nor by simple repetitive practice or hard work. Musicians develop their skills and insights, their musicianship or musical intelligence, by a combination of opportunity, emotional response, financial and emotional support, and a development of intrinsic motivation. In *The Crystallising experience: discovering an intellectual gift* (Walters & Gardner, 1984), the authors build on the work of David Feldman (Feldman, 1980) and describe
the concept of crystallising experiences as “such experiences involve remarkable and memorable contact between a person with unusual talent or potential and the materials of the field in which the talent will be manifested” (Walters & Gardner, 1984, p. 4). In Some perspectives on musical gift and musical intelligence (Stollery & McPhee, 2002), the authors look at the concept of giftedness in music education. A small part of their study involved asking conference delegates at the Scottish Network for Able Pupils (SNAP) for responses on their personal experiences of music education. The authors categorised the responses as crystallising or as paralysing, the paralysing moments having the opposite effect to the crystallising moments. These concepts of opportunity, emotional response and crystallising experiences have all come through in the interviews conducted for the present study.

Gary McPherson and Susan Hallam, in Recent conceptions of musical potential, chapter four of The Oxford handbook of music psychology (Hallam, Cross, & Thaut, 2011) discuss the concept of musical potential. As well as the musical skills required, cognitive and learning skills are mentioned. In particular, the characteristics of sustained interest and self-discipline are considered important to musical potential, as discussed in Perspectives of Musical Talent: a study of identification criteria and procedures (Haroutounian, 2000). Self-efficacy, intrinsic motivation and persistence appear throughout the literature as being as important, if not more so, than any musical trait in determining engagement and progression building success in music. Many of the students interviewed for the present study described what had captured and maintained their interest in music, and ascribed their success as much to the development of these character traits as to any innate musicality they possessed.

2.11 Creativity in music

There is a focus in the literature on the performer-musician that fails to include the development of the young composer or music technologist. The prevailing view of a musician is that of someone who plays an instrument or sings. While there has been a movement towards researching and teaching creativity in music (as exemplified David Elliott’s work in Music matters (Elliott, 1995)) as well as the use of technology in the classroom, research into the creative aspects of music tends to be focused around either the young child rather than the adolescent composer, or around improvisation -
particularly in jazz composition and performance contexts. An exception to this pattern, however, is *Musical creativity: Insights from music education research* (Odena, 2012), which examines creativity from a wider perspective than most. It would be valuable to have more research into the development of the young composer or technologist, as some the interview subjects in the present study were studying composition rather than performance; while they had generally begun with music performance, they had diverged from the performer’s path before they arrived at university.

### 2.12 Summary, and place of this study in the context of the literature

While there has been a great deal of research done on many aspects of formal and informal music education, and on the development of musical identity, what appears to be missing from the literature is anything that links these aspects together to examine the overall formation of the young professional musician. The current study looks at the musician in a full context of what has made them thus far. Hallam comments that ‘*There is a need for future research exploring issues of motivation in different learning contexts, informal and formal, and for learners of different ages and across different types of music*’ (2011, p. 291). This study is a starting point for addressing that need.
3 Methodology
To answer the research question and the additional questions raised, it is necessary to explore the music education that a cohort of music students has experienced prior to beginning tertiary study. I have employed a mixture of quantitative and qualitative research methods. While the initial survey provides statistical data that can be analysed to show broad trends, speaking directly with the students concerned to ask them about their experiences and their views on what has influenced them allows for the nature of an emerging musician to be more fully explored. By analysing a series of music education oral histories, it is possible to find experiences in common as well as points where experiences have diverged. It is also a way to find what aspects of the student’s music education have been formal or informal, and what they view as having been most valuable. It is important to establish the depth of the student’s experience of music education, in and outside the classroom, to find out how the student began their music studies, what opportunities they were offered or denied. By interviewing students whose studies in music vary significantly (that is, by interviewing students who are studying performance, composition, music technology, performing arts, contemporary music, classical music etc.) and comparing their pathways to tertiary study, it will be possible to see if there is a common pathway or if each student forges their own path.

3.1 Qualitative research
This principal method chosen for this research is qualitative life story analysis. I have chosen qualitative research methods as I wish to examine the participants’ lived experiences of music education through their own words and insights. Robert Atkinson discusses the application of the life story interview model to specific research uses and states that, in education research, “the whole question of what it is to teach and what it is to learn is being reconceived in education. Narrative is being given a central place in this search for fresh approaches to knowing and teaching” (1998, p. 16). The narratives that come out of this study are narratives of music education from the perspective of the music-learners and educators.

This research is focused on students at the University of Otago in Dunedin, New Zealand, who are studying music at first-year level. By using qualitative research methods and focusing on a small group of individuals, I can look at the participants’
personal experiences in depth. In the *MENC handbook of research methodologies*, Colwell notes the need for descriptive powers in cultural sciences. He goes on to describe the researcher as needing to “*concentrate on interpretive understanding*” (2006, p. 274) as well as needing the “*ability to empathize, to recreate the experience of others within oneself*” (2006, p. 274). To achieve this interpretive understanding and empathy as a researcher, it is vital to take a personal interest in the research participants. In the present research, I am using life story interview techniques to create a music education biography of each of the participants, to find experiences they have in common that have led them to their present course of study.

### 3.2 Ethical considerations
As part of the initial preparation for this research, I applied to the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee for ethical approval under Human Ethics Category A to conduct this study involving human participants (see Appendix 1a). Ethical approval was granted, and the survey and interview process could then commence.

#### 3.2.1 Personal ethical considerations
Over the past eleven years, I have taught in secondary, intermediate and primary schools in Dunedin, as a classroom teacher as well as a teacher of piano, voice and violin. I have also tutored in NCEA Music at Levels one to three and New Zealand Scholarship. I have worked with school students, conducting choirs and orchestras. I know students who are studying music at tertiary level, and have worked closely with one of the interview participants prior to this study. Participants could exclude themselves if they considered that their existing relationship with me would influence their responses in any survey or interview. As a researcher, I have taken pains to remain objective in interviewing any student I have previously taught, and to avoid influencing the student to answer questions in a way that affects their responses. Kathryn Roulston refers to this issue, stating: “*The identification of one’s subjectivities has become standard practice among qualitative researchers, and is frequently identified with the idea of ‘reflexivity’*” (Conway, 2014, p. 258). Reflexivity is defined as ‘*the capacity to acknowledge how their own experiences and contexts (which may be fluid and changing) inform the process and outcomes of enquiry*’ (Etherington, 2004, p. 31).
As a former secondary school music teacher and a current private music teacher it has been important for me to acknowledge and reflect upon my prior experiences and training, which may potentially have an impact on my views of the research. This became evident when confronted with the students’ perceptions of primary school music. While analysing the survey and interview results, I noticed a trend in the comments of the interview participants regarding the nature of their music education experiences at primary school (discussed in section 4.2.2 Interview subjects’ comments on primary school music). Many of the comments were negative. I was concerned that I was becoming partial in my views towards the teaching of music at primary schools and that this may have coloured my analysis and interpretation of the data presented. To allow for a balance of views, I applied for an amendment to my initial ethics application to cover the interviewing of a range of education professionals, including music education professionals. This was granted, and I began the process of interviewing education professionals.

3.3 Selection of participants in student survey
The participants are drawn from those enrolled for a music qualification at the University of Otago, who have been educated within the New Zealand school system. Participants self-selected by completing an electronic survey designed to answer questions about the student's music education experiences prior to arriving at university, as well as questions designed to show what socio-economic background the participants came from.

The survey was open to all students taking at least one first-year music paper. They may not necessarily be studying for a degree in music. For instance, it is common at the University of Otago for students to study performance (for example, classical singing) while completing another degree (such as law), or to include a music paper into another degree out of interest. This does not necessarily prevent the students from subsequently pursuing a career in music. In the context of this study, I chose to consider all first-year music papers to be a music qualification.7

7 As I was using first-year students as for the participant pool, restricting the pool to only those enrolled for a music degree would have restricted the number of participants available. It is common for first-year students to change the emphasis of their degree
The University of Otago Department of Music, Theatre Studies and Performing Arts offers both classical and contemporary performance, Musical Theatre performance, composition and ethnomusicology. By opening the survey to the entire first-year music cohort, I hoped to find a wide range of students willing to be interviewed for this research. This is to gain insight into the music education experiences that have the greatest impact on students in as wide as possible range of musical styles and genres. The primary reason for choosing this cohort for study is purely pragmatic. As I am researching at the University of Otago, it makes sense to ask the students here for their input.

To be able to explore the experiences of students educated in New Zealand, it is important to find a participant cohort that has mostly been educated within the New Zealand school system. Approximately 92% of first-year students at the University of Otago are domestic students, therefore the majority of first-year music students at the University of Otago are likely to have been educated within New Zealand (Otago, 2015). A further advantage of surveying the first-year students at the University of Otago is that students come from a variety of places within New Zealand. Although the University of Otago is situated in the south of the South Island, about 48% of its New Zealand based first-year students come from the more populous North Island. While about 17% of the first-year students come from Dunedin itself, a further 35% come from the rest of the South Island. This spread of home areas will allow me to look for patterns of similar music education experiences throughout the country, or to find if there are major differences of access and delivery of music education experiences between different areas of New Zealand.

3.4 Selection of survey format

The survey method chosen is an internet-based electronic survey using the online survey tool at www.esurv.org ("www.esurv.org," 2012). This survey website allows for a wide range of question styles and formats, and does not limit the number of questions asked or the number of participants involved in the survey. The website is secure, and offers a good range of basic analysis tools on site as well as the facility to export the part-way through their studies; indeed, this happened with two of the students who took part in the interview process. By calling all first-year music papers a ‘music qualification,’ I could include a broader range of participants.
results for further analysis. In an age where most first-year students are more at home using electronic media than writing, I consider that this will reach the students more efficiently than handing out paper copies. I also consider it to be inappropriate to use paper resources when there is a more environmentally friendly distribution method available. It is also much more efficient to distribute the survey electronically, as all University of Otago students have university email addresses which are available in class lists; therefore, students can be reached regardless of whether they attend class or not.

To encourage as many students as possible to fill in the survey, University of Otago Music Department staff allowed me to visit the semester two first-year paper lectures and classes to introduce myself to the students and to inform the students about the research. By visiting the classes, I hoped to raise the students’ awareness of the survey so that as many as possible would complete it. The survey was sent out in an email link to all students enrolled in at least one first-year music paper in 2015. 320 emails were sent to 320 unique individuals. Thirty-seven surveys were completed, slightly greater than ten percent of those emailed out.

3.5 Data gathering from survey
The survey questions are attached as Appendix 2. Questions were designed to elicit details in the following areas.

- Personal details
  - Demographics including age and ethnicity
  - Family make up including parents and siblings
  - Family interest in music
  - Degree presently enrolled for
  - Music papers studied at university
  - Schools attended
- Music education
  - Instruments learned
  - Age started and duration of learning
  - Learning methods
The survey questions were developed while completing my application for ethical approval for this study. The questions areas bullet-pointed above are explained in further detail below. Question choices were driven by a desire to collect a broad range of information so that I could look for any patterns that might emerge and subsequently develop more targeted questions for the interviews.

I included questions related to family background as children’s first music experiences are often initiated by their parents. Ethnicity information was collected to see if there were significant differences in the experiences of children belonging to different cultural groups within New Zealand.

While asking what music papers students were taking has been helpful in identifying students who follow classical, contemporary or musical theatre streams and in identifying whether students are composers, performers, technologists or musicologists. In hindsight, it would have been better to simplify the question and ask the students to write in the codes or names of the papers rather than having to choose from so many options. Requesting students’ school names enabled me to track where the students were living at different points of their education. The schools listed by the students did
not have their decile rating, their school type or their authority attached.\(^8\) This information was obtained from the Ministry of Education website *Te kete ipurangi* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2015). This gave an overview of the types of schools that the students who participated in the survey had attended. While decile ratings can change over time, they are only reviewed by the Ministry of Education every three years and generally move very little.

To find out what prior music education the students had experienced, I asked what instruments (including voice) they had learned, when they began learning, how long they had played, and what learning methods they had used. This information, particularly on learning styles for each instrument, has been valuable, as the details given of learning styles showed a greater range of experiences than I had anticipated as well as showing trends as to the relationship between instruments and learning styles. It would have been better if I had designed the question slightly differently, to have the students state which was their first instrument and which instruments were subsequent, and in what order.

Questions on participation in co-curricular activities were included as I wanted to see the influence of the less formal activities that went alongside music lessons. These proved to be valuable for two reasons. First, the students listed a wider range of co-curricular activities than I had thought of as music activities. Second, the large number of activities in which students were engaged indicated how highly these activities were valued.

Information about students’ experiences of music in school was sought. Students were asked to make judgements as to how music was valued and whether their interest in music was noticed and supported. Students were asked to respond to these questions in relation to each of the three main levels of schooling (i.e. primary, intermediate and secondary) to see if there was a change in the value of, and support for, music over time. Students also gave details of the academic music qualifications they gained at school. Not all students had studied music as an academic subject at school, or gained

\(^8\) A full description of the New Zealand school education system is found in Appendix 5.
academic music qualifications prior to coming to university. This may have implications for how music is taught, especially in the initial stages of tertiary study.

The next group of questions asked about the students’ relationships with their instrumental teachers. In hindsight, it would have been more appropriate for this section to have followed immediately after the earlier questions on instrumental lessons. Next were general questions of what music education experiences the students had access to in and out of school. This group of questions enabled me to collect data on the types of activities students had experienced, especially the more creative experiences such as composition.

The final questions asked about the age at which the student choose to study music at tertiary level. This information may prove valuable in finding the optimum time to work with students who may wish to study music as a career option to support their decision-making process. Under the heading of ‘last things’, students were able to opt into being interviewed in greater depth.

Throughout the survey, there were spaces for students to make comments about their experiences. These were particularly useful, as the students’ comments were candid - particularly if their experiences were negative or emotional.

**3.6 Selection of participants for student interviews**

I was impressed by the willingness of the survey participants to take part in the interview process. Initially, I had hoped for six to ten interview subjects; my hopes were exceeded. Of the thirty-seven students who participated in the survey, seventeen expressed an interest in being interviewed. In the end, fifteen students gave interviews about their music education; the other two failed to respond to two follow-up emails.

Interviews were arranged at a time and place to suit the participant, generally in a group-study room at the university’s Central Library. One interview took place in the student’s home as they had transport problems. The students wanted to share their stories, both negative and positive. Some students stated that they wanted to be interviewed as they wanted students in the future to have as many opportunities as they
did, if not more, and that they felt that sharing their experiences could help with that. I found the students’ who contributed to this research remarkably generous; they gave up their time to complete the electronic survey and, in some cases, to give a personal interview to help both myself and future music students. In *The life story interview* the author states:

> Typically, a life story narrative includes the aspects of our life and experience that we want to pass on about ourselves to others, the parts that we have come to understand and see as the essence of our whole experiences. (Atkinson, 1998, p. 7)

### 3.7 Development of interview questions from survey responses

Using the students’ individual responses to the survey enabled me to tailor the questions to the participant. The interview questions were designed as open questions to stimulate the participant into storytelling in as much depth as possible. The first interview questions were used as a template upon which to base subsequent interviews. The interview questions are attached as Appendix 3.

### 3.7.1 Interview questions

Atkinson states “more helpful questions are open-ended descriptive, structural and contrast questions which encourage more thoughtful, developed answers” (Atkinson, 1998, p. 41). The interview questions were in the form of a starter with some follow-up questions to encourage the participant to keep talking. Descriptive questions, which allow broad responses, such as the opening ‘tell me about your music education from the beginning’ were followed by structural questions such as ‘what stood out for you in music at primary school?’ These structural questions help the subject to think in more detail, but are open rather than closed questions. The questions I posed to participants were as follows:

- Tell me about your music education from the beginning. How did you get your start in music?
- Did your family support you in your music? Who else supported you?
- What stood out for you in music at
Primary school?
Intermediate school?
Secondary school?

- What is the funniest thing that happened in your music education?
- What is your worst memory of music education?
- Tell me about your teachers.
- Do you think you missed out on anything in your music education?
  - Were you denied access to anything?
  - What other opportunities would you have liked?
- Who inspired you?
  - Did anyone put you off music in any way?
- When and why did you decide to study music at university?
- Is there anything else you would like to tell me about your thoughts on music education?

The interviews all began with the following request: “Tell me about your music education from the start.” In most cases, the student being interviewed would talk about their music education chronologically, with occasional drifts off on tangents. In some interviews, the opening question would lead them to answering some of the follow-up questions, such as “Did you get much support from your family?” The follow-up questions allowed me to go back to points or incidents the student had mentioned that I wanted to hear about in greater detail. While the interviews were structured in design, the questions became more of an aid to ensuring I received a full description of the student’s music education experiences (i.e. the interviews ended up being semi-structured). It was more valuable to ask the open-ended questions, listen to the response, and then ask for more detail about comments students had made than to try to stick with the script, as interrupting the flow of the life-story would have been more inhibiting for the interview subject. In most interviews, the students were happy simply to talk about their experiences with very little prompting. The students who needed the most prompting tended to be older than the average student, or had learnt English as a second language.
In some interviews, students disclosed situations or incidents that were personal and private to them, including bullying, mental illness, the development of their sexuality identity, abuse, and eating disorders. In each of these disclosures, students were asked how this had affected their music education or how music had helped them deal with these issues. When these disclosures were made in the interviews, I expressed sympathy where appropriate but tried not to comment directly on the issues or allow them to influence the questioning.

The last question, “Is there anything else you would like to tell me?” usually lead to either a “No, I think that’s everything,” or an impassioned statement from the student on how important they considered music education to be.

3.8 Selection of participants for education professionals interviews
In contrast to the self-selection of the survey and interview participants among Otago University students, I chose eight education professionals I knew who worked in a variety of positions in the New Zealand education system. They were chosen for two principal reasons: first, all of them work or live in Dunedin and were therefore likely to be available for interview; and second, all of them are education professionals who have either been specifically trained in music or have a special interest in music education.

They were initially contacted by email to ask if they would be willing to take part in this research, and sent a list of questions to consider. All but one of the people I emailed responded that they were happy to participate. I conducted six interviews, and one person whose timetable did not have space for an interview responded to my questions via email. The interviews took place in a variety of places. One occurred at the home of the educator, two were held in the schools they work at, one took place at the university’s College of Education and two in cafés.

3.9 Development of interview questions for education professionals
Each set of questions for the education professionals differed, as they were designed to elicit information relevant to the role they have (or have had) in their work. Below is the question set for one of the educators. Penny is a primary school teacher who is the
subject leader for music in her school. She also teaches on a Saturday morning at an out-of-hours music centre. The rest of the sets of questions are attached as Appendix 4.

Questions for Penny:

- Can you give me a brief overview of your music education?
- What impact has your own music education had on your teaching of music?
- What kinds of music activities and courses do you think should be available to students at primary school and intermediate school level? Secondary school?
- What exactly is your role in music at your school?
- What have you or would you put in place in a school to support and extend students who show an interest in music?
- You have been heavily involved in Out of Hours Music Classes. What do you think have been the most valuable aspects of this system of music education?
- What barriers to studying music have you seen your students experience?

I asked the education professionals to consider their own experiences of music education, their training in education in general and in music education specifically, and their practices in music education. By asking the educators about their own start in music, I could see if the student participants’ experiences were resembled those of the educators, or if the way students began their music education had changed significantly over time. It also allowed me to approach the interviews in the same way, with the same warm-up questions, and to encourage the educators to take a similar storytelling role to the students.

I asked how their music education had affected their teaching to see if they had merely repeated patterns they had been exposed to, or if they had reacted to what and how they had learned. This question ensured that the educators were thinking about the effect of their music teaching approach on students and the reasons they took the direction they did. The next set of questions asked about their views on what they felt should be taught in schools. Many of responses quoted the curriculum directly or referred to its content. As the educators had received a copy of the questions for their consideration before the interview, one of the participants had even prepared a statement that referred
to the *New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) in reference to this question. The participant read out the statement as part of the interview. Although this was pre-prepared, reading this statement did not affect the flow of the interview or the immediacy of her responses. In context of the interview, the statement was used to draw attention to the difference between the aspirations of the curriculum and the limitations of resources she was confronted with, and this was particularly effective.

I asked each of the professionals who were presently working in schools what their role was. The job-description of ‘teacher in charge of music’ meant different things in different schools, including teaching all the music lessons for all year levels, ensuring all equipment was available and in good condition ready for other teachers to use, assisting other staff to teach music, organising all performances - including a school show each year, and finding and developing resources.

The question of what programmes educators put in place to encourage and extend students reflected the best practices experienced by the student interview participants. The educators commented that they had a responsibility to enable students to experience and achieve the best music education possible. However, when asked about any barriers to music education, the primary and intermediate school educators as well as the retired college of education lecturer commented on the extreme difficulties they faced, including a lack of pre-service teacher training in music, financial barriers, a crowded curriculum, an emphasis on literacy and numeracy, a lack of resources, and a lack of ongoing professional development. I was surprised by the anger and frustration expressed by the teachers, as they were more damning in their comments than the students had been in their interviews. The educators’ comments affirmed my decision to interview them.

### 3.10 Analysis of survey results

The analysis of the survey included some statistical analysis. Although the focus of this research is qualitative analysis, the survey tool lent itself to some quantitative analysis. Data including demographic information, instruments learned, learning methods for instrumental tuition, participation in co-curricular activities, academic achievement
levels at school, and views on the values of music in schools, were all able to be analysed quantitatively. As there were thirty-seven responses, statistical analysis in this instance only lends itself to broad interpretation, and acts as a start-point for more in-depth qualitative analysis.

Thematic analysis of results developed out of the survey questions. Initial themes, such as instrumental tuition, primary, intermediate and secondary school music, family support, relationships with teachers and co-curricular involvement, all emerged as the survey results were analysed. Spaces had been left in the survey for students to make comments. These were compiled and sorted by theme as part of the preliminary analysis of the survey results.

3.11 Analysis of interviews with students

Interviews were audio-recorded with the permission of the participants and were then transcribed. At the end of the interviews, the students were offered the opportunity to have the transcription sent to them for checking; however, none of the students wished to do so.

The transcriptions were then analysed and coded into the themes that had emerged from the survey. The themes that came out of the analysis as most significant were identified and interview questions were modified for the subsequent interviews to see if the themes resonated with the rest of the participants. While coding the interview data, further themes emerged. Some of these were related to the themes already identified. For example, themes of support by people who were not either family members or teachers, the importance of mentors, and the relationships with peers and classmates, developed out of the initial codes of family and teacher support. The themes of theory of music, equity of access to music lessons, and the financial costs of music came from the first interviews. In analysing the data, I found that many of the comments made by the students could fit into more than one theme. Where this occurred, data was coded to all the relevant themes.

Subsequent interviews with students followed the same format of questioning. Specific questions were developed from their individual survey results along with the more
general questions asked of each participant. Questions were also tailored to the new themes that had arisen from the first interviews. The theme of theory of music had been a significant new theme in the earliest interviews so I asked about this in each subsequent interview if the interview participant didn’t mention it his or herself.

3.12 Analysis of interviews with education professionals

All the interviews were transcribed, then the data analysed and coded by themes. Many of the themes matched those of the university students, however further issues were raised in the educators’ interviews and these were coded also. New themes were identified, including pre-service teacher training and the ability of primary school teachers to teach the music curriculum, and barriers to learning in music. The data from the interviews with the education professionals was compared with the data from the student survey and interviews.

3.13 Structure of analysis

The analysis of the data is structured as a series of themes. The ordering of these themes has been determined by the direction of the interviews. Although no two students’ stories are the same, there were elements of commonality that allowed for a structure to come out of them. The first question in each of the interviews was ‘how did you get started in music education?’ This chronological approach asked the students to go back to their earliest memory of music learning. For most of the students, their first memory was of learning a music instrument. It appears that learning a music instrument (or voice lessons) is like an official ready-set-go for a musician, a rite of passage that says you are now a ‘proper’ music learner. In most cases, this took place when the student was at primary school, however most lessons were independent of the school, that is, they were learning with a private teacher, or through out-of-hours music classes. Some primary schools also facilitated private music lessons in school time, however the students considered these as separate to curricular music.

The analysis developed with the stories told. As the start had been chronological, students tended to tell the story of their instrumental lessons chronologically while referring to their school experiences, that is, “I learned flute with so-and-so while I was at primary school but when I went to intermediate I changed teachers…” They also
told their stories of their school experiences chronologically. In the case of primary and intermediate school experiences, the students tended to mix their curricular and co-curricular together, whereas in their secondary school experiences they could separate out their curricular studies from their co-curricular activities more readily. This is not to say that they were unaware of the difference between curricular and co-curricular activities at primary and intermediate school. However, they saw primary and intermediate school music as more focussed on co-curricular participation than learning music as a subject. This may also reflect the nature of secondary schooling, where subjects are more separated and there is less integration between curriculum and co-curricular activities in general.

As students finished their initial chronology of music learning, I used questions to review aspects of the narrative about which I wanted more detail. These review questions included further details of family and friends and the support they gave, as well as participation in music outside the school system. Over all, the structure of the analysis became a reflection of the structure of the interviews, reflecting the stories that students told.

3.14 Validity
Atkinson points out that life story research has no fixed process to determine narrative validity and is subjective. Validity within the life story itself can be achieved from examining the narrative for internal consistency, that is “what is said in one part of the narrative should not contradict what is said in another part” (Atkinson, 1998, p. 60). Validity of findings is discussed in Research design: qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches (Creswell, 2014) where the author suggests strategies for a researcher to check validity including triangulation of data, rich, thick description, clarification of researcher bias and the presentation of discrepant data running counter to the themes.

The triangulation of different data sources occurs as new data is compared with the data initially analysed to see if themes drawn out of the initial source are reflected or repeated by the new source. In the case of this research, the triangulation process takes place at three points.
• The data from the initial student interviews is compared with that from the survey.
• The data from the subsequent student interviews is compared with that from the initial interviews.
• The data from the educator interviews is compared with the data from the student interviews.

Rich, thick description is used in the findings in this research to share the experiences described by the participants. This enables me to pass on to the reader the nuances of the interview that cannot be conveyed in just the words of the transcriptions. In the present research, many of the interview subjects illustrated their points with anecdotes of their experiences, laughed, became impassioned, and occasionally sarcastic. These human responses are important for showing the research is based in personal experiences of music education.

I discussed previously the issue of bias with regards the data generated on primary school music experiences. Awareness of this bias has had to be at the forefront of my mind while analysing the relevant data to remain as objective as possible.

The presentation of data that runs counter to the themes is also an important element of validation of findings. People’s experiences and reactions vary significantly and a part of this research is to examine the range of music education experienced by the participants. Validity of results does not necessarily rely on all subjects agreeing on all aspects of the themes, but on consistency in the analysis of the themes, and reporting that shows where there are particularly strong trends.

From the analysis of the data I have drawn conclusions and recommendations regarding the recognition of the contribution of formal and informal music education experiences, and ways in which to enhance these experiences or develop better pathways towards professional music training. Data analysis follows in the second part of this thesis, beginning in the next chapter, 4 Learning Music, and findings and recommendations are discussed in detail in chapters 9 Conclusions and 10 Recommendations.
4 Learning Music
This chapter examines the participants’ experiences of learning music. It is divided into five sections, following the structure that came out of the interviews with the students: instrumental and vocal learning methods, music education at primary, intermediate and secondary schools, and co-curricular activities. While co-curricular data is included somewhat with that of primary and intermediate schools, where possible, data regarding co-curricular activities at secondary school has been kept to the latter section.

4.5 Co-curricular activities.

4.1 Instrumental and vocal learning methods
The interviews all started with the question “How did you get started in music education?” which generally lead to a description of first instrumental or vocal lessons. The analysis of the data follows the general shape of the interviews. As most of the stories told were approximately chronological, the students’ musical experiences are analysed chronologically.

4.1.1 Survey results
Through the survey and interview process, students identified a range of learning situations and methods they had experienced in learning musical instruments or voice. These are noted by gender in the first instance. Some participants responded with more than one method for the same instrument.
Figure 1. Instrumental Learning Methods

4.1.2 Private lessons

Regardless of gender, the largest proportion of lessons are taken with private music teachers. Many of the interview participants expressed their preference for individual private music tuition. They valued their teachers’ expertise, discipline, high expectations and one-on-one attention.

*I got a bass guitar at the end of year eight and started taking lessons from then.... Like, that was private lessons and that was quite intense from the beginning, which was great... I didn’t learn very well in group lessons, mainly because I could skive off and hide behind everyone else’s playing I guess, whereas my private tutors, especially the last one, S J, he would give me a bollocking if I hadn’t done the work... I know I needed that.* (Alex)

Students who changed private teachers found differences in them. Julia changed flute teachers at secondary school. She had a good relationship with her first teacher but found her new teacher to be even more effective and developed a positive relationship with her.
So, E, my first flute teacher was… she was like the bee’s knees but then I came to my current one…my high school one that I went and saw throughout high school. That was like ‘whoa’. That was C… I just clicked with her and she would describe things to me and I would understand exactly what she meant… (Julia)

The relationship between the student and teacher was vital, and often particularly close. Rineke Smilde comments on the need for a good relationship with a first music teacher: “Furthermore it turned out that the child’s perception of the teacher was important, both being a good instructor and genuinely interested in the child, and for older learners it should be someone with high professional qualities.” (2009, pp. 57-58).

Singers particularly emphasized the need for a teacher with whom they could connect. The relationship with teachers of other instruments can be just as vital for the students, however singers seem less inhibited about commenting on or claiming the relationship. Lucy’s description of an early teacher suggesting she move on to someone else felt like the end of a relationship to her, whereas William emphasised the need to have a teacher he could trust with training his voice.

I value W… who started me through grades… when my one-on-one music education actually started… And then she left, she’s like “I think you need a new set of ears so I’m going to let you go” and it felt like I was being broken up with by my singing tutor. (Lucy)

I think for singing… it’s so important to have that relationship with your teacher that you can trust them to do whatever cos you’ve got one voice, one instrument. So if they stuff you up, they stuff you up. So I think we had a great working relationship, it was really fun and I trusted her so that was really good. (William)

Some teachers were less approachable than others. Students accepted that some teachers were harsher than they would have liked although they still appreciated the input they got from them. Julia described someone her flute teacher recommended for some ‘polishing’ of her playing. This person was helpful in terms of developing Julia’s musicianship however his approach left her unimpressed.
He was really good but he was definitely a lot more harsh… I’d feel like I was saluting every time I’d go up. It felt so, it was actually like being in an army, it was crazy. But he taught me a lot about interpretation. It was interesting to see how different the teaching style was compared to C. That was, I appreciate what he did… he certainly made me feel like, if I ever went on to teach I wouldn’t want to teach like him, like he was very harsh. (Julia)

For the most part the students enjoyed the time they had with their private teachers. Words such as ‘enthusiasm’, ‘inspiring’ and ‘amazing’ were used by the interview subjects to describe their teachers.

Some students had negative experiences with teachers. Rikki’s first music teacher appears to not have taken her responsibilities seriously, walking out of her lessons to buy lunch. Thankfully, this lack of professionalism appears to be uncommon, and Rikki was confident enough in herself to become an independent learner and keep going with her guitar playing.

I was at school, so then I’d do my lesson during lunchtime. And there was a dairy down the road, and she’s like “okay I’ll be back in a min, I’m just going to get some food and I’ll be back”, so I’d just sit there, ok, so I said to her, “nup, I’m just going to teach myself.” (Rikki)

4.1.3 Group lessons

Some students didn’t want to be the focus of the music teacher’s attention. Daniel is a multi-instrumentalist who learned most of his instruments through group lessons. Daniel prefers to learn as a member of a group, so taking individual flute lessons was challenging for him. He missed the opportunity to bounce ideas off others as he could in his previous group lessons.

But then I did flute privately with J, just one-on-one and I don’t, it’s just something I didn’t really enjoy, like having just me in the class. I don’t know if that’s a… I feel too watched or… like they’re monitoring just me and listening to every single thing that I do. maybe I’m just being conscious about what I’m playing or… Like there’s
no one else to look at or say like “what are you doing for that?”, like “how do you play this bit?” (Daniel)

4.1.4 Self-teaching

Not all the participants in the study could get or necessarily wanted private lessons in all the instruments they learned. The second largest method of learning listed was self-taught.

If someone couldn't do it for me I would have to do it myself. I couldn't just wait around for someone to try figure it out, I’d just go do it… So, I picked up the guitar by myself, singing obviously, with a little tiny bit of help, nothing really, bass I picked up myself, just because it was kind of like guitar, but deeper. Piano, yeah, I just tinkered away, like so I listened to it, and then try figure it out and play it. And then drums. (Rikki)

For some, the need to self-teach was financial. Mike was self-taught: “Because lessons are expensive, I would say… And you can Google stuff. I looked up tab and notation for things and kind of just fiddled round and taught myself.”

In some situations, the students expressed a desire to have greater control over what they were learning as well as the pace at which the learning took place. Dean found learning from a teacher too slow for his interest.

I suppose with lessons it was scales and suppose in more basic stuff... And then I think, me learning myself I was able to play the songs that I wanted to play and get more of a challenge than what I was doing in lessons. (Dean)

Rikki had a similar attitude towards learning drums. Although she had some private lessons paid for by her older brother, she adapted what she had learned to develop her playing more quickly.
So he taught me just the basics and I’d go away and try and adapt from the basics, so then I’d come back and he’d be like ‘you’ve done a lot more than I expected you to but it’s good’ so, yeah, I like self-taught. (Rikki)

The instruments most likely to be self-taught from to the survey are guitar, bass guitar, ukulele and drums. There were students of these instruments who had some formal teaching, however self-teaching was the most prevalent form of learning for these instruments. Most of the students who were self-taught had some stimulus or resource to begin with such as a friend who showed them the basics, a beginner book, or the internet. Interview participants mentioned both YouTube and Google as being great ways to learn more.

4.1.5 Itinerant lessons

The system of Itinerant Teachers of Music (ITMs) in schools is available to students from secondary school (or intermediate school in some areas of the country). Lessons are free under this scheme, and are generally in small groups. Not all regions of New Zealand have an itinerant music teacher pool, however all secondary schools have access to the funding to pay for music tuition in school time. The funding is calculated at a rate of one full time music teacher per 1000 year seven to nine students enrolled at the school (New Zealand Ministry of Education). The time allocated is usually divided up among teachers of various instruments, often with an emphasis on orchestral instruments.

It is difficult to ascertain from the survey exactly how many of the students used the itinerant lessons services at school as some students simply replied to the survey question with “lessons”. What may be a pointer to the influence of the itinerant music scheme in New Zealand secondary schools is the mode age for beginning an instrument. The graph below shows the ages at which students in the survey began learning music instruments.
The mode age for beginning an instrument is thirteen years, higher than the mean age of 11.58 years. Although the structure of the survey did not distinguish between first and subsequent instrument learning I suspect that the peak at thirteen years is a mixture between early beginners starting a second or subsequent instrument, and students who were previously unable to access music lessons having the opportunity to do so for the first time through the itinerant music tuition service through their secondary school music department. This information was not immediately discernible from the survey and would either require a re-write of the survey questions, or a separate survey to find out. It would be a valuable short investigation to find out from school students who make use of the itinerant lesson scheme whether that is their first or subsequent instrument. It does appear that many students make use of the itinerant music scheme.

Students appreciated that itinerant lessons are free. Many schools own a collection of musical instruments for hire at a low rate which means that access to instrumental learning broadens significantly at secondary school as the financial barrier is lowered or in some cases removed. Schools are prohibited from charging for these lessons as outlined in a Ministry of Education circular from 2013. It is interesting to note that the wording of the circular also states that instrumental tuition is part of the school curriculum.
Programmes provided within school time may not be charged for. Itinerant Teachers of Music (ITMs) are paid for by the Ministry, and this tuition is part of the school curriculum. Students who are taught by ITMs may not be charged tuition fees. It is reasonable for parents to be charged for the hire of musical instruments owned by the school and used by students outside the delivery of the music curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2013)

Many of the students talked about the opportunities they experienced through their itinerant lessons. Sam was interested in composition and could access itinerant lessons on numerous instruments, to broaden her knowledge of instrumental writing.

I learned instruments for short periods of time to get a grasp of them for composition because I liked knowing how difficult it was to play certain things… There were three of us that decided to take it [French Horn] at the same time. Me and my friends, just because there were French Horns lying around and we had a brass teacher that gave free lessons and we were like, why not? (Sam)

Sometimes itinerant lessons lead on to private lessons. Daniel started saxophone at secondary school through the itinerant scheme but kept going after he left school on a private basis, with the same teacher: “And then when I got to secondary school I picked up saxophone with L, and I continued that until now. I’m still doing that with him, so that’s been the past six years I guess it’s been.”

And for some, itinerant lessons were a great excuse to get out of another subject. Frankie sums up the sentiments of many students: “And I had it in maths, so I went.” This attitude has been maintained over generations of school students. James, now the head of music at a secondary school, took up a new instrument by dodging compulsory Cadets when he was in the sixth form (current year twelve).

In my sixth form year there was no way I wanted to march so I went and sort of hid in the Armoury, and in walks B, Mr B who was our French teacher, but he was also the general or whatever of the army, so he walks in and “ten-hup,” we all stood up, and he says “right, who’s in charge of the Armoury” and he sort of looked round
and he said “P (surname), you’ll do” and he gave me sergeant’s stripes just like that... my job was to hand out the guns in the morning and then just wait until they came back basically and there was a double bass there, ... so I’d muck around on the double bass then. (James)

4.1.7 Out-of-hours music lessons
Daniel mentioned in his interview that he learned some of his music through his local Out of Hours Music Classes. New Zealand primary schools are partially funded for music lessons which take place outside regular school hours. Many large towns or cities with multiple primary schools pool this money and have established music centres where students can get low cost tuition in small groups. Many of these organisations also provide ensemble opportunities such as bands and orchestras, as well as performance opportunities.

4.1.8 Community based learning
Community music groups often give music lessons to their members. Pipe and Brass Bands have traditionally given free or low cost tuition and often supply instruments for students to learn. Two of the interview subjects, Daniel and Eliza had learned this way, both as pipe drummers. The expectation in these circumstances is that the student will develop to a level where they can join the band. In each case, the student interviewed has participated in pipe bands in their local community, and Daniel has represented New Zealand, travelled to Canada, and has the chance to travel to Scotland to compete in World Championships. One of the survey participant’s comments also indicated that she had singing coaching at her local Country Music club.

4.1.9 Does current practice reflect earlier times?
I examined how the education professionals I interviewed had learned their instruments to see if there were any parallels with how the survey respondents’ experiences. Like the students who completed the survey, all seven education professionals had learned at least one instrument, and most had learned more. Some had learned the same instrument in multiple ways. The methods overlapped with those of the students who had participated in the survey, with private lessons being the most common. Community groups formed a larger proportion of the learning methods for the
education professionals, in this case two brass bands and one cathedral choir. This may reflect a change in society in that groups such as brass bands or church choirs are no longer as prevalent or as active in teaching as in previous generations.

Figure 3. Education professionals’ music learning experiences

4.1.10 Summary of instrumental learning
Learning methods are primarily determined by availability and financial situation. From the comments and the survey results, the largest group of students learn their instruments through private, individual lessons. Those who are not able to take private lessons will generally find another way to learn, either through school by using the itinerant music teachers, through self-teaching methods, friends or the Internet. It appears that determination trumps financial restrictions. The warmth of relationship between the first music teacher and the student is important, especially in the early years of learning (as described by Smilde (2009), quoted above at 4.1.2). Second or subsequent music teachers tend to be viewed as more technical teachers than the student’s initial teacher.
There also appears to be a hierarchy of learning methods for certain instruments. It was uncommon for an orchestral instrument to be self-taught, more likely for piano and voice, and very common for guitar, drums and bass guitar. This may be in part due to historic attitudes to itinerant music lessons in schools being for orchestral instruments and voice. Piano lessons were likely to be available in local communities, however guitar, drums, and bass guitar were perceived to be ‘not proper music’ when music lessons and teaching styles were more formal.

A student may also approach a teacher in the short term to gain specific skills. I experienced this myself as a classically trained violin teacher in Scotland when a student in the school where I worked asked me to teach her how to shift positions on the fingerboard. This student was a gifted folk fiddler who went on to study traditional music and is now a professional fiddle player and teacher.
4.1.11 Formality and informality in instrumental tuition
Private music lessons have historically been a formal music education experience, as often a private music teacher would use one preferred method of teaching and expect the student to accede to their style and demands. This image is changing, and private music lessons are now much less formal, with students taking more autonomy for decision making in lessons in areas such as choices of music to study, and whether to sit grade examinations. Group lessons can also be formal as this requires the teacher to manage a small group of students who need to be learning similar music. Self-teaching is by its nature informal. Community music education can range from informal coaching or sitting in on sessions (typical of folk music clubs) to quite formal lessons in instrumental techniques in brass and pipe bands. The stories that the students told of their instrumental and vocal lessons show they move along the continuum of formal and informal music education as they need to.

4.2 Music education in primary schools
This section examines the influence of primary school music experiences on the participants in the study, using the data from the survey and student interviews and comparing with the comments made by the education professionals. Primary school teaching in New Zealand is carried out by trained generalist teachers. That is, they are trained in and expected to be competent to teach all seven essential learning areas of the New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007). This includes music as a strand of the Arts essential learning area. Some primary schools choose to employ a specialist music teacher to teach this area of the curriculum.

4.2.1 Survey results
The survey highlights some issues with regards to primary school music education.
Students were asked if they thought their teachers in primary school were aware of their interest in music.

They were then asked about opportunities for students to do more in music.
Students were asked if they thought music was considered important at their primary schools.

![Graph showing the importance of music at primary school.]

**Figure 8. Importance of music at primary school**

Next students stated whether they thought music was fun at primary school. Considering that the students answering this question had chosen to study music at tertiary level, it is to be hoped that they enjoyed music education at a younger age.

![Graph showing the fun of music at primary school.]

**Figure 9. Fun of music at primary school**

The last question on primary music asked the students to respond to the statement ‘music at primary school was formal’.
It appears from the survey that students access to music at primary school was limited, with few having music specialist teachers. Music was considered somewhat important, generally fun and not particularly formal. They felt their teachers knew they were interested in music but not all were able to be extended in this area.

When asked to comment on their memories of music at primary school, survey respondents covered a few areas. Singing, *kapa haka*\(^9\), and the ever-present recorder.

- *I liked being in the choir and singing at assembly. I don't recall there being much other music at primary school.*
- *I did kapa haka, but only was it considered important in relation to the celebration of Māori culture, as opposed to music itself. I did it as it was the only form of music offered except recorder lessons.*
- *Please no more recorder.*

### 4.2.2 Interview subjects’ comments on primary school music

The comments made by the interview subjects about primary school music introduce several themes that had not been evident in the survey. These were about the limited access they had to music education in their schools unless they had a teacher who was interested in music. Most respondents describe enjoying what they did at primary school, but considered it to be limited in scope.

---

\(^9\) *Kapa haka* are groups that perform traditional Māori songs and dances.
I think I had to play recorder at some point. I have sort of semi-traumatic memories of recorders, glockenspiels, and in my last year I think we had ukulele sessions. I think there were about 10 people in each group and my group got ukulele and I was really gutted because I didn’t get guitar. So that was just run by the teachers who knew how to play an instrument, so it was pretty, pretty basic. (Alex)

I went from years one to six I went to a small Area School... So as far as music the only stuff we did was sort of recorder and all of those things and the only really musical things we got to do were sort of the music festival we’d do with them every year… So as far as music education goes there wasn’t much but I thought I was a real whizz at all these things. (William)

Daniel recalled some musical opportunities but felt music was not considered a subject at his primary school. He used his out-of-hours clarinet learning to play in the talent show.

There was like a talent show thing I guess was the biggest music thing we did, where me and a friend played a wee duet on our clarinets. But there was not music as a subject. We did learn recorder at the school. I enjoyed that because I had done it previously with other things. (Daniel)

The recurring comments are about the low level at which the music education was pitched. There seems to be very little attempt to teach anything beyond the primary school instrument standbys of recorder, tuned percussion and ukulele, and these to a rudimentary level. The reliance on the recorder in New Zealand primary schools is waning in favour of the ukulele but is still a large part of the primary school teacher’s repertoire of music activities. There is very little evidence of teaching the elements of music as mandated in the curriculum, and no mention of attention to the creative aspects of the curriculum.

4.2.3 Co-curricular opportunities at primary school

There were co-curricular activities for musical students available in some primary schools. These took the forms of either instrumental lessons (individual or group)
within the school day, or ensembles to play in. Most common were the school choir and _kapa haka_. Rikki joined in the music group available at her primary school. Alex took advantage of the chance to learn the piano for a couple of years. YoYoNanas was involved in _kapa haka_, where students took turns to feature leading the _karanga_ (welcoming call). Frankie joined a few groups as well: “And *sorta everyone was roped into doing school choir… for the Kid’s Sing*\(^{10}\)… I did _kapa haka_ for about six and a bit years.”

Performances involving singing were common; school shows or ‘productions’, choir festivals other similar activities were mentioned. Assembly singing was also commented on, often as one of the more positive recollections. Alex described the school principal leading assembly singing: “Actually it was really cool… he would get up every assembly and we would have a sing-along. And it was great, and it was always like just classic _Beatles_ and really funny stuff. It was great.” He didn’t rate the performances he was involved in very highly however. His view appears to be that the expectations were low. “I think I did the _Kids for Kids_\(^{11}\) concert. It was pretty amateur but it’s primary school kids, what can you expect?”

Daniel recalled events such as school musicals and music festivals. Most of these events appear to have been large group activities rather than chances for solo performances or small ensembles. Students valued the performance opportunities they had. Eliza spoke about her small town’s music festival: “I remember at primary school they did like a big, all of the primary schools got together and did a big performance night. That was really cool because we all felt really special.”

### 4.2.4 Positive experiences: an exception to the rule

Two of the students who attended primary schools in the same city appeared to have had significantly better experiences of music education than those from the rest of New Zealand.

---

\(^{10}\) The Kids Sing is a festival for primary and intermediate school choirs run by the New Zealand Choral Federation (NZCF).

\(^{11}\) Kids for Kids concerts are fundraising concerts in aid of the World Vision charity and involve New Zealand singing personalities in concert with a combined choir of local primary school children.
Yeah there was junior and senior choir. And there was a vocal group as well which was like the ‘chamber choir’ I guess. So I sang in them, and then there was jazz band and orchestra as well… And there was a recorder group at school, and I joined in that and that’s where I learned how to read music. She used to have little flash cards and she’d go around saying ‘what note is this?’ It was really sweet actually. (Julia)

Sam had a similar experience with an outstanding music teacher in primary school who went out of his way to facilitate a variety of learning experiences. However not all students were able to access all aspects of what was on offer at the school as the instrumental lessons were private, that is, students had to pay for them.

And then I went to primary school and, I was at X Primary in Z(city) where Mr A is and he’s incredible. He got me started, first on the recorder because I couldn’t read music and then he got me private lessons for the flute, which I’ve been playing ever since. They had a really cool orchestra there and there was a choir and we had the big music festival that they do every year so I was part of that. (Sam)

The experiences of both Julia and Sam were exceptional, but mostly took place in the co-curricular environment, rather than curricular classroom music lessons. It became apparent that many of the students interviewed did not rate their classroom music education experiences at primary school highly. There were exceptions, but in these the students would describe an individual teacher who was interested in or enthusiastic about music. There were plenty of co-curricular activities available which engaged the students interest, but even at that level students were aware of, and critical of low performance standards. Students talked with enthusiasm about high level performance opportunities such as singing in the auditioned special choir for a music festival or singing in a school’s chamber choir. Many of the students felt they had been noticed by their teachers as having potential to achieve in music and appreciated that they received attention and advantages that other students may not.

The non-classroom aspects of primary school music such as co-curricular ensembles, additional instrumental lessons and elite inter-school groups were a major influence on the students’ decisions to study music. They served as motivating activities, and in
some instances, as crystalizing moments where students gained significant motivation to continue in music.

4.2.5 Creativity in primary school music
What is of concern is the lack of creative activity in the music education primary school students are experiencing. The New Zealand curriculum explicitly states:

_In music education, students work individually and collaboratively to explore the potential of sounds and technologies for creating, interpreting, and representing music ideas. As they think about and explore innovative sound and media, students have rich opportunities to further their own creative potential (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007, p. 21)_

Few of the students surveyed or interviewed recalled any activities that could be described as creative, let alone ‘rich opportunities’. Most activities in primary school music encouraged participation and performance in singing and instruments. While a reasonable standard of performance is required on any instrument to perform complex music, the opportunity to be creative needs to be available to all students.

4.2.6 Education professionals’ comments on primary school music
In part because of the responses I obtained to this aspect of music education in both the survey and the interviews with students, I applied for an amendment to my ethics approval to conduct interviews with education professionals. Their comments on access to and the content of primary school music education in many cases matched the issues raised by the students.

The interview with George, a retired College of Education music lecturer, was particularly enlightening. When asked what students in primary schools should have access to as music education his reply focused in part on creativity as a stimulus to musical development: “Through being creative with your instrument... you learn what you can do. And it motivates you to do more... you create things that are harder than you can play... you have to be good enough to play them.”
One of George’s concerns was that generalist teacher training no longer gave sufficient time to ensure teachers were competent to teach music.

And I suppose you’d have to say that teacher training… has become a huge barrier and we don’t know the effects of that yet because our teachers are getting so little time. Ten years ago, I would have said that well sixty percent of students could teach music if they were so motivated. Now I would say that thirty percent of teachers could teach music if they were so motivated, based on what they get here. (George)

This concern was echoed by Greta, an intermediate school principal who had previously been a teaching principal of a full primary school.  

I could certainly teach junior music, but after a point where the kids have become quite able, my own ability holds me back… I think music education for teachers is, I mean it’s down to about three hours a course now… [Interviewer: Six here]… How anybody could… possibly teach music effectively after a six-hour training is utterly ridiculous. So teacher knowledge is a massive barrier… but the training doesn’t address that. (Greta)

The education professionals interviewed are concerned at the narrow range of activity in music education at primary schools. I asked Clare, a specialist music teacher in a large primary school, what music education activities primary school pupils should have access to. Her reply was blunt.

I used to be pragmatic and say ‘well if you haven’t got a music teacher you can’t do it’ but that’s not good enough is it? So when I did my notes last night, I’ve written down at the very minimum, regular communal singing to ensure that every child has that experience of being immersed. But I mean that really isn’t enough, that’s just like saying that for maths, so long as they can play with a calculator once a week then you’ve covered your curriculum. Let’s be bold. Every child… should have access to weekly music sessions in a dedicated space with quality instruments. They

---

12 A teaching principal is one who has some responsibility for classroom teaching rather than being solely in an administrative position. This is common in small primary schools in New Zealand.
need opportunities to listen, move, sing, play, create, compose, record and integrate music into other areas of their day. In short, they should have access to the music curriculum as specified in the New Zealand national curriculum. So, not in an ‘ideal world’, they absolutely should. (Clare)

Penny is a general class teacher who has a great deal of experience as a musician, and is responsible for music at her school, a decile nine contributing primary school. She listed her responsibilities as the ‘music person’ for her school as including organising all the music for assemblies and ensuring that the whole school knows what they are to be singing, preparing for special events that involve music, including preparing group performances, co-ordinating interchanges with other schools, overseeing all music based co-curricular activities, ensuring resources are available to teachers for classroom music, maintaining instrument stocks, even organising for the piano to be tuned. This is alongside having responsibility as a general classroom teacher, teaching her year five class. Penny is also frequently called on to be a mentor teacher for student teachers in her school. She described having to help student teachers prepare to teach music lessons.

I look at our teachers coming from College now and it’s ludicrous. They think doing music is putting on a pop song and singing along… I had to talk them through rhythms and tapping out rhythms with chopsticks and whatever and they found it too hard and they couldn’t carry out the lessons. And yet they’re teaching next year in classes. So we’ve got teachers not being prepared, coming out into classes. (Penny)

Penny expressed an additional concern, that the move in primary schools is away from music education towards entertainment, that music is not valued for itself but as a showcase for the school: “And there’s that pervading attitude going through the school where it’s got to be a show for the parents… Yeah, more of an entertainment than an education. And it’s getting more so that way.”

Somehow students are making the decision to study music at tertiary level even through the start they are getting at most primary schools is limited. They have access to group activities such as choirs and kapa haka, and the types of instruments they learn through school has broadened with the resurgence in popularity of the ukulele. The lack of
confident, competent teachers in primary schools is of concern to me as a music educator, as is the lack of opportunity for students to participate in creative music activities or for students to do more than what they describe as ‘basic’ music. The implication of the students’ comments on their classes being ‘basic’ is that they are aware they are being sold short. If it is possible to extend able students in other areas of the curriculum it is potentially unfair to musically able students to be held back at a ‘basic’ level by poor teaching and resourcing.

4.3 Music education in intermediate schools
This section examines the music education experiences of the students who attended intermediate schools. Intermediate schools are technically part of the primary school system in New Zealand but cater for year seven and eight students (aged approximately eleven and twelve). Intermediate schools tend to be in large towns or cities where there is an adequate population base to justify a separate school for this age group.

4.3.1 Survey results
Not all the students who answered the survey attended intermediate schools. Those who did answered the same questions as the ones asked about primary schools.

![Graph showing the number of intermediate schools with specialist music teachers](image-url)

*Figure 11. Intermediate music specialist teachers*
These figures show that two thirds of students who replied had access to specialist music teaching at intermediate school, and their schools recognised and supported their interest. The next set of questions asked about the students’ perceptions of music at intermediate school.
The survey results appear to show that music was perceived as highly valued at intermediate school, while becoming more formalised, but that this formality did not prevent students enjoying making music. This is significant in that it shows that students are already valuing the formal aspects of the subject at the age of eleven or twelve. It is also possible that the students associate formality with the school having value for the subject.

Lastly, students were asked to make any comments they wished about their experiences of music at intermediate school. Some comments gave insight into how the music lessons were managed within the school’s timetabling structure. This was also commented on by students during the interview process.

- We learned music on a module rotation. So for a quarter of the year we would take performing arts twice a week which involved some music learning.
Similar issues to primary school music, for example the level of teaching, were raised by the students. By this point, many of the students were already competent musicians and found the low technical level of teaching frustrating.

- *Music class was pretty basic, everyone had to do it so it was really boring for the kids who could already play music.*
- *Guitar lessons were provided by my intermediate school but they were at a basic level.*
- *Considered a performance activity with no real options to study music seriously, though interested students were put in touch with one another, there was no offer of proper tuition.*

Some students had opportunities to advance in music through specialist programmes set up within the school, or enthusiastic teachers.

- *We had an advanced Music Academy that focused on those who were already learning an instrument, and helped them with theory and their given instrument.*
- *My teacher was passionate about music so she made extra opportunities for it.*

Some students had to survive those two years without very much support for music from their school.

- *I tried incorporating my interest in music in assignments… but teachers never realised my interest.*
- *Two years is a short span of time to be at one school, music wasn't as important there as at my primary school which was quite a difficult adjustment. The support and encouragement I was used to having had to come from my family and myself.*
4.3.2 Interview subjects’ comments on intermediate school music

At intermediate school, music appeared to be taught by a specialist where possible, in a module programme that saw students take a mix of subjects, usually in the areas of Technology and the Arts. Interview subjects commented on the level of music teaching, and the frustrations of low levels of expectation.

*All the intermediates do sort of like technology cycles. Like they do...home-ec and stuff like that, and one of ours was music, so for about half a term you would do two lessons, like two afternoons of music a week. And it was pretty basic-ish, like learning note values and learning how to read music.* (Lucy)

Some students did gain more opportunities to participate in co-curricular activities. Most were focused on enjoyment and participation. Skills developed gradually.

*I remember we were playing “Pirates of the Caribbean” or something and like trying to write out the fret numbers, so I’d have E and then I’d have all the fret numbers to play on that string and then I’d write A to change string. I had no idea what I was doing in all honesty. I don’t know how they put up with it really, it was atrocious.* (Alex)

For some students, this was the first time they came up against a barrier to their music learning or participation. In some intermediate schools, music became competitive and students felt judged or inadequate.

*I probably was very spoiled at my primary school, for the support and everything that I got there, but at B [Intermediate School] it wasn’t so much... It felt more competitive, like they wanted people in their orchestra and in their choir because they wanted to be really good, whereas the primary school seemed to be they wanted people to be involved because they liked music and they wanted to encourage that.* (Sam)
4.3.3 Education professionals’ comments on intermediate school music

I interviewed Greta, an intermediate school principal. I asked Greta to participate because she had recently been appointed to her position, and her first staffing decision was to appoint a part-time music specialist (Libby) to teach music as a module, initially to the year seven classes, and in her second year, to year eight classes as well.

"It was just a happy accident to some degree here that... the person who had been taking modules left at the same time that I started. So we had one gap for modules and there hadn’t been any formal music tuition. So having seen what Libby could do at W School [principal’s previous post] with split ages... and having had my experience in intermediate schools where this age group can do magical things if they’ve got the specialist training, yeah, that was the decision around getting her in the front door. And fortunately she’s worked her magic and the staff can also see the benefit." (Greta)

I asked Greta what music education opportunities should be available to students at intermediate school.

"I think the itinerant music programme’s brilliant, and any of those opportunities to learn within the school day... I think intermediates in general... should be about just trying tonnes of things and finding the joy in lots of things. I think if we can make it as open as possible so that kids can just give stuff a go so by the time they go to high school they’ve had some positive experience and they want to be involved at high school level... So we’re entering RockBand this year. Oh, no, not RockBand, BandQuest. RockQuest is writing an original song, BandQuest is doing a cover. We’ve got choir and all the itinerant music classes... Kids have asked this year if we could have bagpipe lessons, so we’ve got bagpipes in the school. I just think we should be attentive to what people are looking for... Oh and we’ve got orchestra of course." (Greta)

Greta’s comment that intermediate schools “should be about finding the joy in lots of things” is particularly compelling, as is the desire to make access to activities open, to break down the barriers to learning, particularly those of time and money. Greta described some of the barriers she saw in her school. Her concerns focused on
equipment, space, the crowded curriculum, teachers not being given enough pre-service training in music, and a lack of ongoing professional development. These barriers to learning are discussed in greater detail in chapter 6 Access and Barriers to Music Education.

The issues that Greta raised in this interview are the same issues raised by other education specialists, and by students interviewed for this study. While some students had very positive experiences of music education at intermediate school, others found their experiences limited by teachers with little or no confidence in teaching music. Music activities were consistently described as basic, although some had a chance for extension work. Creative work, a compulsory stream of the national curriculum document, was mentioned by only one student. Practical aspects of music making such as itinerant or private lessons did become more available to students around this age and more students had access to specialist music teaching, but most of the positive experiences commented on were around participation in orchestras, choirs and bands rather than classroom activities.

4.4 Music education in secondary schools
Students music education experiences at secondary school fall into two main categories: Classroom music (either compulsory or optional), timetabled into the week and taught by a specialist teacher, and co-curricular music, (music activities that take place outside the timetabled school day possibly at lunch time or after school) which may or may not be led by a specialist teacher. This section will focus primarily on classroom music. Co-curricular activities are discussed further in section 4.5 Co-curricular activities in schools.

4.4.1 Survey results
Twenty-nine students answered the main series of survey questions about their secondary schools. Each of figures 17 to 22 below show the responses compared with the same questions in relation to primary and intermediate schools. The first question in this section asked if their secondary school had a specialist music teacher. Only one respondent reported their school as not having a specialist. That student attended a
small rural school with a school population of about 200 pupils, which may have precluded the school employing a music specialist.

Students were asked if teachers recognised their interest in music at secondary school. Again, the results were positive, and showed an increasing recognition as students moved from primary to secondary school.
Students were asked about opportunities given to them at secondary school. Opportunities appear to have expanded from primary to secondary education.

**Figure 19. Opportunities for involvement at schools**

Students were asked to gauge how important music was considered at their secondary school.

**Figure 20. Importance of music in schools**
Students were asked how much fun they found music at school.

![Graph showing the fun of music at school](image)

*Figure 21. Fun of music in schools*

Students were further asked how formal they found school music.

![Graph showing the formality of music at school](image)

*Figure 22. Formality of music in schools*

When comparing these numbers to the questions asked at primary and intermediate school levels, the valuing of music seems to be at a similar level, while both fun and formality are greater. This could be taken to imply that students value formality in their education. This idea is discussed in chapter *7 Value in Formal and Informal Music Education Experiences*.

### 4.4.2 Subject study at secondary school

A further set of questions were asked as to whether students had taken music as a school subject at secondary school. New Zealand schools have discretion as to whether music (and other Arts subjects) are taught as part of the compulsory curriculum or as an
option subject from year nine onwards. Not all the students who took part in the survey studied music at secondary school.

![Studied Music at Secondary School](image)

**Figure 23.** Students who studied music at secondary school

Similarly, not all the students who took music in year ten had taken it in year nine. While it is positive that students have taken music through secondary school prior to entering university music courses, the numbers studying music at school in this survey are only about half of the respondents. This could be of concern for tertiary institutions as teachers at tertiary level may be making assumptions as to what prior knowledge students have. Differing prior knowledge is becoming more obvious under NCEA as achievement standards are designed to be discrete, stand-alone assessable units. Theoretically it should be easier using standards-based achievement to provide evidence as to what students have learned than in the previous examination-based system where a single percentage number was the only result available.

The students were asked in the survey whether they had studied music as a qualification subject.

![Highest School Music Qualification](image)

**Figure 24.** Highest music qualification gained at secondary school
Seventeen students listed some secondary school qualification in music prior to studying at university. No student stated that they had achieved a New Zealand Scholarship in Music, and no students had qualifications in music through either the International Baccalaureate (IB) or the University of Cambridge International Examinations (CIE), the two most commonly taught alternative syllabuses in New Zealand schools. During the interviews one student described having studied for Bursary Music (the course replaced by NCEA Level Three Music in 2004) which she had failed to pass, and therefore her highest school music qualification prior to university was Sixth Form Certificate (replaced by NCEA Level 2 in 2003).

Additional comments made by the students who participated in the survey tended to be focused on their co-curricular activities rather than classroom music. The two comments about classroom music were negative and made by students who were interview subjects. One commented on the difficulties of a classroom teacher who was a poor communicator. The other described her struggle to keep up academically with the high expectations her school had as she was part of a special music scheme in the school. Their experiences will be discussed below.

4.4.3 Classroom teaching

While there were common threads which appeared in the interviews while discussing secondary school music, the curriculum document and the NCEA achievement standards are written in such a way that a school has discretion as to what content is taught. Many of the students interviewed expressed concern or frustration about their experiences of learning music theory in school. Rikki’s school music classes were focused on practical music making: “Unfortunately, my high school didn’t do notation and theory, which sucked because now in university it’s just really difficult for me.” The students who talked about problems learning theory felt that it was a vital part of their education that had been neglected. By the time they started NCEA, the students appreciated the need to understand the formal theoretical concepts underpinning their practical activities, and almost unanimously wished that they had access to theory at a younger age.
In *Frames of mind: the theory of multiple intelligences*, (Gardner, 1993, p. 111) the author refers to Jeanne Bamberger’s research into what she describes as a mid-life crisis experienced by child musical prodigies that can take place in their teenage years. This is the result of trying to blend the prodigy’s intuitive musicianship with a new development of technical and theoretical music knowledge. While none of the students interviewed for the present research described themselves as prodigies, many mentioned the challenge of blending their early, often intuitive successes with the theoretic understanding they needed to develop further. Alex appears to be a particularly well motivated and determined student in music. He worked to overcome his lack of theory knowledge.

*I was pretty motivated with my theory because I decided at year twelve I wanted to go to university and study music and so then I knew that I needed it. And I saw that it was useful for my bass playing so I was quite motivated to do it, especially in year thirteen.* (Alex)

By the time the interview subjects were in their senior years of secondary school, they had become aware of issues that affected them in the classroom. Some students had to learn in classrooms where teachers were teaching at multiple levels. 

*Probably the worst thing was in year 13, then they combined two classes, year 12 and 13. Because we were such a small year group... I think we missed out on a lot of the theory that we could have been, that would have been helpful, especially going on to this year studying theory at uni.* (Mike)

The alternative was to be put on to Correspondence School (*Te Aho o Te Kura Pounamu*) lessons, not always a successful alternative. Eliza’s experience of this was

---

13 As a secondary school music teacher, I often taught combined year twelve and thirteen classes. It was an infrequent occurrence that class rolls were large enough for the school’s management to allow separate classes for years twelve and thirteen. A colleague in the Manawatu district in the early 2000s spoke of her frustrations attempting to teach years ten, eleven, twelve and thirteen in the same class.
negative: “I was the only person that did seventh form music, so I ended up having to do it by correspondence, and I completely just bombed out.”

The physical environment for a school can be challenging for the students. I have taught in buildings that leaked and flooded. Frankie described the excitement of a new classroom for music at her school.

*Brand new classroom, like for a start it wasn’t mouldy, which is good, and it was actually like clean and light and they had set it up so we had brand new computers with you know like the keyboards in front of them for composing, and pianos in every room they really soundproofed everything downstairs, like it was just a massive change.* (Frankie)

The music curriculum in New Zealand emphasises practical music making. At all levels of NCEA students can be assessed in performance, either as a soloist or as a member of a group. Students are expected to be able to perform on an instrument or voice and provision is made in the financing of secondary schools for students to have access to itinerant music lessons to assist in the development of performance skills.

Composition is another area of the music curriculum which is assessable in all years including all levels of NCEA music. Although students should theoretically be creating their own music from the earliest years of education, it is at secondary school that most music students first encounter composition. Mike was home schooled until year eleven. His introduction to school music included composition, a major part of his degree study. Similarly, Sam became interested in composition at secondary school: “*We had Mr L there who was really amazing. And he started me on composition which was something I had never considered before, but I really like that, and that’s what I’m doing at Otago.*”

The strongest theme to emerge from the interviews was the relationship the students had with their secondary school music teachers. In almost all cases the students saw the teachers as dedicated, caring professionals who put in extra time and effort to encourage and enable students to experience a wide variety of music education opportunities.
Mr L sort of made everything happen, so he made the room accessible to you, like the music rooms. He would open them up in the weekends and in the holidays and let you come in and practise or compose. He would always be there and you could always send him an email and send him your work. He was very supportive, and he started up a whole lot of groups. He would try and form groups you know, like he would say ‘you’re a flute and a clarinet’ and he had like a bassoon and so he put the three of us together and like you should be a group now. (Sam)

The mentoring role adopted by many secondary school music teachers appears to have a major impact on students’ learning and their decision to study music. For many students, the school music teacher is a role model to aspire to, as most music teachers are also practicing musicians: performers, composers or arrangers of music. The teacher also facilitates the student gaining access to knowledge, equipment and performance experience. By the time students are at secondary school, the relationship between music teacher and student has changed, and the student no longer needs the warm, nurturing first teacher as much as they need the strong, technically accomplished teacher who challenges them to achieve.

4.4.4 Formality and informality in secondary school music
The distinction between formal and informal music education is blurred in secondary schools in New Zealand. If you define formal music education as being theoretical or analytical knowledge taught in the classroom you omit the practical, skills based knowledge that is taught alongside it. If you define it as activities which take place in the timetabled class rather than outside, you are confounded by the overlap of activities which take place in music departments around the country. If you define it as those activities which are assessable for qualifications then you include many activities that take place well outside the classroom, such as rock bands and chamber music groups, which may have developed independently of the school. The teachers and students move along the continuum of formality daily, often within the same lesson. A secondary school music class in New Zealand may include a time of the teacher at the whiteboard formally teaching a concept, followed by self-directed autonomous
practice, and a coaching clinic approach to composition all within the same hour of tuition.

4.4.5 Music teachers in New Zealand secondary schools

New Zealand secondary school music teachers work hard. They spend long hours not only ensuring the delivery of the curriculum, but enabling their students to participate in a wide range of music education experiences. I interviewed James, the head of a secondary school music department, about his work.

Well I think that with NCEA etc., we’ve got it about right…. You know there’s nothing I see that’s lacking… The kids are able to perform, they’re able to compose, they’re able to do research, we expand their theory and their aural skills…. One of the things that I try and encourage at (the high school) is that kids are able to explore in a variety, in you know what ever style, whatever genre that interests them. (James)

From personal observation in this school, where I work as a private piano and voice teacher, there are a myriad of opportunities available to the students. The two music teachers on staff (head of department and assistant) provide access to choir, orchestra, chamber music ensembles, rock bands, a rock school for junior students, and an international award winning Jazz Band. They have also had folk music groups. There is a camp at the beginning of the year for music students in the choir, orchestra and jazz band. Over the years, I have also seen outstanding classroom teaching with thorough instruction in theory and analysis of music, aural skills, and a well-structured programme of composition teaching. The school offers itinerant music lessons in orchestral instruments for no cost to the students, with orchestral instruments available to the students to hire for nominal fees. The school also allows private music teachers (including myself) to come in to the department and teach piano, voice, guitar, bass guitar and drums. Students pay fees for these lessons, but some students who are experiencing financial hardship are subsidised by the school, particularly if they are studying music at NCEA level. Both the classroom teachers also perform as professional musicians outside the school and model appropriate professional behaviour for their students.
While I consider this school is a particularly fine example of music education, it is also quite typical of a New Zealand secondary school. New Zealand secondary schools are getting the balance between formal and informal music education right in most cases. It would be easy to argue that students need greater theory teaching at secondary school, but secondary schools are the ambulance at the bottom of the cliff for this aspect of music education.

### 4.4.6 Negative experiences at secondary school

Not all students who were either interviewed or surveyed had consistently positive experiences of secondary school music. Two students who took part in the interview process had difficult times during their secondary school music education, although for quite different reasons.

Alex attended a boys’ school in a regional centre in New Zealand. Over the course of his five years of secondary schooling he had multiple teachers, most of whom he both liked and respected for their abilities as teachers. Unfortunately for Alex he found his music teacher for years eleven and twelve difficult to deal with. While students and teachers can have personality clashes, it is difficult for the student if the teacher they clash with is their music teacher. Most schools in New Zealand only have one, perhaps two music teachers, therefore if you wish to study music throughout your school years you have little chance of changing teachers from year to year (unlike larger subjects such as English or Mathematics).

Alex described the situation: “It was absolutely horrible because we were meant to respect this guy as a musician and as a teacher but he was atrocious at both those things.” Alex articulated the need to have someone who is both a good musician and a good teacher as a music teacher. The students often talked about their teacher’s abilities as musicians as well as teaching qualities such as communication, management and dedication to their students.

Lucy struggled to thrive in a specialist music programme in a large secondary school in a city. The school has an outstanding national reputation for its music programmes and
a history of success in competitions such as the Big Sing\textsuperscript{14} and the Chamber Music contest. There is competition to be accepted into the specialist music programme and an expectation for the students to succeed in all areas of music study and performance. Unfortunately for Lucy, although she was accepted into the programme, she felt she didn’t fit in as she was a contemporary rather than a classical singer, and she had limited knowledge of music theory. Although Lucy worked through a lot of this with the help of her teachers, she found the expectations and the perceived valuing of classical music over contemporary a big challenge.

4.4.7 Secondary school music: a few observations in summary

The students who took part in the interviews mostly focused on their secondary school music experiences. This may have been because it was most recent in their minds, or because for those students, secondary school had the greatest impact on their decision to study music at tertiary level. For most of the students interviewed their secondary school music teacher has been a positive influence. Many of the students’ experiences could be described as crystalizing, where they gained greater insight or had a positive experience that inspired them to continue music study. In most cases, the experiences took place in the context of informal learning, either in organised co-curricular activities or in informal music ‘jam’ sessions. Some crystalizing moments included the realisation of how practical music making informs or is informed by the formal classroom learning that the students are doing alongside the informal. For crystalizing moments to occur, students must be in a potentially crystalizing environment. The secondary school teachers created those crystalizing environments. The students showed gratitude in reflecting on their teachers and the opportunities they were given.

4.5 Co-curricular activities in schools

Having discussed instrumental learning in section 4.1 and the classroom music experiences of the students in sections 4.2-4 above, it is important to discuss a further educational context, that of co-curricular activities. Co-curricular is the term given to activities that take place outside the timetabled curriculum but are related in some way

\textsuperscript{14} The Big Sing: A choral competition run on a regional and national basis by the NZCF. In 2016, approximately 10,000 students participated in the regional competitions, and approximately 750 of them took part in the national finale.
to curricular studies. In the case of music co-curricular activities, they are frequently multi-level, that is students are not all the same age or school year-group. Students who participate in co-curricular activities may not study music as a subject at school. Co-curricular activities have historically been described as extra-curricular, however I use the more contemporary description of ‘co-curricular’ as these activities are related to the curriculum, and support the students’ development and achievement.

4.5.1 Survey results
Four questions in the survey related to co-curricular music activities at school. The first asked the students if they had participated in any of these types of activities. Most students who answered this question had participated in at least one such activity.

![Participation in Music Co-curricular Activities in School](image)

*Figure 25. Participation in music co-curricular activities at school*

Subsequent questions asked what kinds of activities the students had participated in and at what level of schooling this had been (primary, intermediate or secondary). This is shown in the graph below.
Figure 26. Co-curricular participation: activities

The range of activities listed reflects the activities available to school students at all stages of their education. It is difficult to be precise about what exactly occurs in co-curricular music participation, particularly at primary and intermediate level. What one school calls ‘music group’ could be what another calls orchestra. Primary and intermediate orchestras can be made up of a wide variety of instruments, not necessarily the same as those found in a secondary school orchestra. As schools in NZ are structured in a variety of ways (see Appendix 5) it is also difficult to say exactly what is done at what age; orchestra at a full primary school may not include year one to four students or even year one to six students, it may be more like an intermediate (years seven and eight) activity.

There are some trends evident in these results. Primary school students are likely to have access to choirs, instrumental groups (orchestras), *kapa haka* and school shows for
co-curricular activities. Intermediate school students are likely to have access to the same main groups of activities, choirs, instrumental groups and school shows, although none of the sample who responded to this question said they participated in *kapa haka* at intermediate school.

All schools appear to attempt to provide a range of music co-curricular activities for their students. Participation grows at secondary school. Many students have taken part in multiple activities. There are ninety-six participations listed by the twenty-seven students who answered this question, a mean of 3.55 activities per student. For some of those students, the practical co-curricular activities are how they make sense of the academic studies going on in their music classrooms.

*When I got to year 11 being with people better than me pushed me enough to do better. I got really into choir that year, I was part of singing ensembles that were very senior and I was understanding it. And that’s the thing; I think choir for me has always been the thing that made the theory make sense.* (Lucy)

### 4.5.2 Choir

The largest co-curricular music activity is choir. Fourteen participations at primary school level, twelve at intermediate and twenty-one at secondary school. Choir is the least expensive activity you can take part in, there are usually no fees involved. Most schools have an un-auditioned choir so anyone may take part with no requirement of prior learning. For some students, school choir is where they get their start in music education.

*So when I was about maybe eight or nine at primary school, and we did, like all the classes were singing and all the teachers came round and they were listening to everybody sing and they would choose who would be in the choir. So I got picked to go in the choir because I can sing in tune.* (Eliza)

Singing in choirs is a tradition at most schools in New Zealand. New Zealand has a culture of choirs having high status and recognition. There is a structured competitive framework at secondary school for school choirs (the *Big Sing*) which is operated by
the NZCF. Resources are readily and cheaply available, and anecdotally teachers are often more comfortable taking a choir than a large instrumental ensemble. I have held many informal discussions with primary school teachers who are not confident teachers of music but who are happy to take the choir as they consider it the easiest music activity to facilitate. Choral singing is a social activity. Enthusiastic students often bring their friends along so they can take part together. There is a good chance that you can ‘get out of school’ at some point by being in the choir, to perform at local venues such as retirement homes, or to spend the day at the Big Sing or the local music festival with like-minded students singing together.

I would do it because it was fun and it was a chance to get away from school and spend a few days doing something that I really liked. And even like going to the rehearsals and stuff, I liked all of it, so, that’s mainly why I did it, cos I liked it.

(Mike)

Choral singing is particularly valued in church-based private and integrated schools. William attended a Presbyterian secondary school: “There was the senior choir which did all of the chapel services and stuff and there was the chorus which did all the fun things.”

4.5.3 School musical productions
At primary and intermediate levels, the next most popular activities mentioned are school shows (variously called musicals, shows or productions). In some primary schools, all students are expected to take part in an annual school show which features students singing, dancing and acting and is a major focus of the school arts teaching and learning programme in any year. In some schools the singing or dancing is also accompanied by students playing instruments, giving them a chance to show their accomplishments (often gained through lessons outside school). Primary and intermediate school shows are frequently written specifically for the students involved or even by the students themselves. Secondary school shows tend to be commercial musicals that the school hires or pays performance rights to stage. While shows are still important at secondary school level, they are less of a focus for the music students
surveyed. Some students who were interviewed commented that they enjoyed playing in the show bands for their school productions.

And every year they did the Musical and so I was part of the show band… I don’t know if it was a goal for me, it was just one of the thing that I was looking forward to when I got to (the school), to be part of this, to be part of the show band for the musicals. (Daniel)

4.5.4 Large instrumental ensembles
The next most reported activity at primary and intermediate schools, and the second most reported at secondary school, is orchestra. At primary and intermediate school, orchestra can be a problematic word. The *Oxford English Dictionary Online* (Oxford University Press) defines an orchestra as “A group of instrumentalists performing concert music, esp. one combining string, woodwind, brass and percussion sections. Now also more generally: a (usually large) group of musicians of any kind.” The second part of this definition is useful in describing a primary or intermediate school orchestra. Primary and intermediate orchestras tend to be made up of whatever instrumentalists (and instruments) the school has. Some school have classical orchestra members, some have less traditional instruments and some have classroom or Orff-style instruments such as marimbas or glockenspiels. Many are a combination of them all.

And so there were like probably 10 of us all trying to audition to play guitar and they were like ‘we don’t have guitar in it’ and then I was like ‘oh I’ll play bass in it then’ cos I knew the school had a bass. (Alex)

Most New Zealand secondary schools have an orchestra or other large ensemble such as a concert band or a jazz band. Many schools run multiple large instrumental groups. These groups range from being compulsory for students who are studying music or taking instrumental lessons through the school’s itinerant music lessons scheme, to being purely voluntary. They may also range from free entry for any instrumentalist at any ability level, to being auditioned or otherwise restricted by ability. Unlike some school choirs, in secondary school orchestras or large instrumental ensembles, prior learning is essential.
The survey results show fifteen participations in groups listed as orchestra or string orchestra at secondary school level. If you add in participations in jazz band or concert band as further large instrumental ensembles, this number doubles to thirty. While there is still a social element to participating in school orchestras and bands, there is a tendency in the comments made in interview to value the opportunity to play in these groups highly as a music education opportunity, more so than the comments made with regards to choirs.

I guess it’s just mostly how to perform in a group... how to respond to the conductor. Just sort of musicianship. And at the start… they were older kids who knew what they were doing; they were like the big ones.... but then they all leave school so you step up and I eventually got to be principal flute player and that was really cool from a leadership point of view as well, I got to see how to not just respond to the conductor but to lead the other flutes as well. That taught me a lot as well and that kind of helped with leadership stuff, not just being a good musician as well. (Julia)

In a study of adolescent musicians involved in advanced youth ensembles in Scotland, Alan Hewitt and Amanda Allan explored their subjects’ participation in either an orchestra or a concert band. Their results showed similar outcomes to those described by the subjects of the present study.

Enjoyment of repertoire performed was generally high while the sense of musical satisfaction derived from participation was very high. Strong agreement relating to enjoyment of the music and sense of creative satisfaction was expressed. There was also strong agreement with statements reflecting positive social experience of participation. Most respondents expressed strong approval of the conductors and other staff, and reported that participation was both a good opportunity to meet with existing friends and to meet new people. (Hewitt & Allan, 2013, p. 262)

Students involved in orchestras valued the hard work involved by themselves as performers and their teachers who organised and conducted. The less formal setting of
orchestra as opposed to classroom teaching allowed for a less formal relationship between teacher and student.

Playing in school orchestra was not always a positive experience. Students expressed frustration with themselves when performances went wrong, or when they let their teachers or the group down.

*And during the performance, or the competition they messed up, well, we messed up again and Mr L was so furious. And you could see it from his face as he was conducting and then he got down afterwards and we went out the back and he just ripped into us.* (Sam)

### 4.5.6 Small instrumental ensembles

Smaller chamber music groups and rock bands are well represented in secondary school co-curricular participation. Because these groups usually require significant prior learning their low numbers at primary and intermediate schools are unsurprising. At secondary school, students involved in chamber music and rock bands value these experiences. Again, there are well organised and long established regional and national competitions related to each of these activities, the Chamber Music Contest and Smokefree Rockquest.

Participation in small groups such as chamber music groups is valuable for students in developing their musicianship and their ability to critique themselves. Daniel described working in a chamber music ensemble.

*It’s made me think about assessing myself a lot more… And before going up to that we would practise as a group and L (saxophone teacher) would encourage us to say what we did wrong, and L’s definitely made me think… I’d think, “what is not sounding good here?”, or what might people think is, “what’s happening there?”, or just that self-assessment.* (Daniel)

Rock bands that form at school are some of the least overtly formal educational opportunities for students however they have a very large impact on the students
involved. For one student interviewed, Rikki, this began when she was still at primary school as a member of Groove Factory, a holiday programme run by the local secondary school designed to get students into music at a young age. When Rikki was in her last year of secondary school, she was running the programme for the younger students from the surrounding community, giving her valuable skills in management, finance and teaching, to compliment her musical skills.

I got involved with the College music department when I was about eight. So, it was really good for me to get a head start. So then, I was getting all this knowledge from high school and then coming back to my primary school and they’d be like ‘oh you should perform’ so I performed almost every week at assembly which is quite cool…. year twelve I think I became manager of it, because the music teacher, N, knew me since I was like eight and he said “Nah, it’s yours this year.” And it was cool because last year we had the most outcome ever of Groove Factory, and most money like earned, and I was like really chuffed. (Rikki)

4.5.7 Education professionals’ views of co-curricular activities
During the interviews, students came alive telling of their experiences in co-curricular activities. They valued the input of their teachers and co-participants highly. The education professionals who were interviewed spoke about co-curricular activities. Clare teaches music at a contributing primary school. Four co-curricular groups are available at that school, facilitated by the music specialist teacher. As well as allowing students to self-select for participation, she actively seeks out students to extend through these activities.

Well, all the children at my school have weekly music lessons but we also have extension music programmes for the senior children, for year five and six. So there’s a marimba group, a guitar group, a singing club, a rock band and because I teach the children right through from age five… I sort of pick up the ones along the way who maybe need a bit of prompting to try something that they otherwise wouldn’t, who have other things to do in their lunchtime, and good on them. But I might try and say [whispers] ‘look, if we make it so it’s just half of lunchtime have you thought about the guitar group?’ (Clare)
Greta is the principal of a small city intermediate school. Her school offers music lessons and co-curricular activities.

*So we’re entering RockBand this year. Oh, no, not RockBand, BandQuest. As opposed to RockQuest. RockQuest is writing an original song, BandQuest is doing a cover. We’ve got choir and all the itinerant music classes... Oh and we’ve got orchestra of course.* (Greta)

From my personal knowledge of this school, I would add there is a very strong Pasifika Cultural Group that rehearses and performs regularly. It is one of the largest performance ensembles at the school and membership of it is a high-status activity.

James is the head of music at a small co-educational city secondary school. The school has a strong reputation for music, particularly in Jazz and Rock. I have been associated with the school for the past ten years, during which I have seen groups such as Jazz combos, Chamber Music ensembles and a particularly proficient Folk Music band which focused on Eastern European traditional music.

*We provide orchestra, jazz band and rock bands and choirs and... you know, so somebody could come along and say, “well you’re not doing enough of ‘that’” but the way I think we would approach it is that if there were people who wanted to do ‘that’ we could do it and make it work within what we’ve got.* (James)

### 4.5.8 Co-curricular activities in summary

Music staff and students value co-curricular activities for motivation, development of practical skills, and the opportunity for social interaction with like-minded people. From the comments made by students and music educators, as well as the statistics from the survey I would conclude that co-curricular opportunities are highly motivating for students and contribute greatly to their decisions to carry on with music education.

---

15 My daughter attended this intermediate school and I teach voice, violin and piano lessons there.
16 I currently teach voice and piano there, and have also acted as relief head of department while the head of department was on leave.
Co-curricular activities can be either formal or informal in their structures (for example, spontaneous rock bands are informal groups, a secondary school orchestra is formally structured) however a positive environment around a co-curricular activity is the greatest value, rather than its formal or informal structure. Co-curricular activities in secondary school music appear to support the retention of students in classroom music programmes, regardless of whether the students see themselves as performers. Tertiary institutions could follow suit and facilitate co-curricular music activities throughout their music departments for other than just performance students. Students who move away from home to attend tertiary study can lose contact with co-curricular opportunities as they do not ‘know the system’ in a new city. For music students who have spent many hours on co-curricular activities, especially at secondary school, this sudden lack of an easily accessible choir or orchestra can be dis-incentivising to their continuing music studies. To keep growing musicians, we need to keep offering practical collaborative music opportunities.

4.6 Summary of learning music

Having examined the data relating to learning music in and out of the classroom, learning practical performance skills, creative skills and theory of music, it is now important to place this learning in the context of the roles other people have played. The influences of the people surrounding the young musician will be examined in chapter 5 People who have an Impact.
5 People who have an Impact

Students who gave interviews spoke at length about the impact people had on their musical development. People fell into six main categories: teachers, family, mentors, community musicians, friends, and classmates. The impact of music teachers has been discussed above in chapter 4 Learning music. Many of the students commented that they had significant support and encouragement throughout their music education therefore it is worth examining what roles these supporters have played in the students’ music life-stories.

5.1 Family

5.1.1 Parents

Students mentioned a range of family members: parents, grandparents, step-parents, and siblings. The influence family members have on students’ interest and involvement in music can be significant. The survey shows most of the students had at least one parent interested in or taking part in music.

Figure 27. First parent or caregiver’s involvement in music
There doesn't appear to be a significant correlation between students having musical parents and any expectation of the student learning an instrument or singing, as only ten students reported any family expectation. This could also mean that the expectation to learn an instrument was not overtly voiced within the family, but that the opportunity was simply there for the child to do so as a normal part of childhood.

Students who gave interviews were asked about their family’s role in their musical education. The students described their parents’ support or lack of it, and often the influence siblings had on their music. Their valuing of family support in their musical development reflects the family influences described by Sophia Borthwick and Jane Davidson in chapter four of *Musical Identities* (MacDonald, Hargreaves, & Miell, 2002, pp. 60 - 78). The comments made by the students in the present study differed from those of the students in the article in that the attitudes shown by the students in New Zealand were that their parents were enabling and supportive, whereas the English parents described in *Musical Identities* appeared significantly more authoritarian and directive. Support included support for beginning music lessons. In some cases, parents
simply announced that music lessons would begin. Parents introduced their children to lessons as a part of the weekly routine. For both Sophie and Daniel, it appeared that music lessons were simply something one did as a part of a normal childhood.

Yeah, my brother and sister both did (Out of Hours Music) before I did it… well I don’t know, at that age it was more just you’re going to do this now. Just cos that’s what the other two did and they thought it was a good way to spend Saturday mornings, so I picked up recorder as well. (Daniel)

Some parents noticed their child’s interest and enabled them to get the teaching they required. Sam commented on her step-mother’s support: “I can’t exactly remember when I started playing the piano but my step-mum heard me playing around on her keyboard and decided to get me some lessons.”

Occasionally, parental support extended to a parent learning alongside their child, modelling the learning process for them. Eliza’s father took this step: “Dad took up the bagpipes when [sister] started, so he started the bagpipes when he was about 40, but neither of them had played before.”

Students were aware of the effort parents put into supporting them, emotionally, time-wise and financially. Frankie’s mother made an extraordinary effort, given that her own experiences of music were negative.

I didn’t practise. At all. Ever. Mum tried really hard actually, ‘cause my Mum was not musical. She’s got a really nice singing voice and stuff, but she never really did music at school, she’s not from a musical family, her parents aren’t musical at all, and she ended up being molested by her choir director at school. (Frankie)

Most parents were described by their children as encouraging and supportive. Students were also aware that music is a costly business and that their parents had to pay a lot of
money for lessons and instruments. In some cases, parents asked grandparents for assistance in paying for music lessons.\(^{17}\)

*I wanted to learn the drums at school but I made the choice because Mum and Dad didn’t have a lot of money, I made the choice and I said well, I can’t ask for them to pay for that on top of them already paying for piano and everything else I was doing.* (Eliza)

While students appreciated their parents’ generosity and encouragement, sometimes the parents were a pressure influence as well. Lucy felt that some parents pushed their children into lessons: “*And when you’re a child, part of it I feel is pushy Mum syndrome because the introduction has to be slightly pushed. Because most kids don’t know what they want to do.*” Overall, however, the parents’ roles were valued by the students, who appreciated the time and money invested in them.

**5.1.2 Siblings**

Sibling roles were also discussed in interviews. Some students commented that they were an influence on their siblings’ musical education. Having an older sister or brother learning music made it seem normal for the younger sibling to learn as well. Of the thirty students who reported having one or more siblings, twenty-two said at least one of their siblings played instruments or sang.

![Figure 30. Siblings in family](image)

**17** In my own private teaching practice, I presently have two families who rely on grandparents to fund the children’s lessons.
Sometimes siblings were a source of music education themselves. Like his brothers and sisters, Mike was home-schooled for most of his childhood, although he attended a state secondary school from age fifteen. All his family members were involved in music making, and their father formed them into a folk band to play together. Mike attributes his versatility with a range of instruments to his siblings’ influences.

Well my sister had piano lessons, so she knew a lot more theory, so I probably learned a lot off [sister]… My oldest brother plays… he kind of taught himself to improvise, so probably, he probably got me back into playing piano… I have another brother who plays a little bit of guitar, and he kind of picked that up off me. And he sings… my youngest brother plays drums, and my youngest brother and myself, so we’re the two youngest siblings… we probably play the most instruments ‘cause [brother] plays the bass and drums and guitar, and he can sing a little bit. I probably picked the drums up off him. Just having a lot of siblings that play various different instruments I guess means that you can learn more, a broader range of stuff. (Mike)

Like Mike, Rikki and Daniel found having a sibling could mean having someone to explore music with. Daniel played chamber music with his elder siblings. Rikki and her brother started rock band training together.

My brother is two years older than me, and he’s, like, one of the most amazing drummers. I might be biased, just a bit. So, when I got my first guitar, so me and … my brother both went to Groove Factory. He was like ‘oh I dunno, I don't know if I
like music.’ I was like ‘oh no, no, no; come on, it’ll be fun’. And then so we both went along, and he picked up drums instantly. (Rikki)

Younger siblings were also discussed. In most cases, students felt they had influenced their younger siblings’ participation in music, and were pleased to have done so. They felt that their influence was important and that they were doing something positive by encouraging their younger siblings.

I have two brothers but they are, like, five and seven. So [G] is, like, starting on the piano… I think I’m an influence because I play the piano when I’m around them and they like to come and press a key to add to the song and stuff. I hope I’m an influence anyway. (Sam)

Family influences ranged from active enculturation by parents into the music world to absolutely no support. Jeffrey’s was the most negative family response given: “None whatsoever. No singing, no anything.”

In general, families were supportive of the students’ interests and aspirations as musicians, although there were some petty squabbles over noise. Eliza rolled her eyes as she described her sisters’ reactions: “Oh, my sisters didn’t used to like me playing the piano because I played really loudly… But my Dad played the bagpipes, seriously!”

The message received by the students from their parents and older siblings is that music is valuable, both intrinsically and extrinsically. That is, there is a perceived value in music learning for the sake of music itself (intrinsic value) and for the additional benefits that music education can bestow on the learner (extrinsic value). The students with younger siblings felt it was valuable, and even a responsibility they held to hand down this interest in music to their younger brothers and sisters.

5.2 Support networks outside the family
The roles played by people outside the family and teaching environment are described in Musicians as lifelong learners (Smilde, 2009, p. 129) as “significant others”. These significant others may be mentors, or they may appear in community music
environments. They may also be peers, friends and classmates of the students, who have had a significant input into the student’s musical or emotional development.

5.2.1 Mentors

The role of a mentor is somewhat different from that of a teacher. In *Exploring the musical mind: cognition, emotion, ability, function*, the author describes relationships with teachers that can go beyond the normal teacher-student relationship: ‘It is a relationship of personal involvement which often leads to lifelong friendship’ (Sloboda, 2005, p. 311). While teachers can be, and often are mentors to students, not all students will connect with their teacher to the degree of considering them to be a mentor. Some students find another person who models the skills and behaviours of a successful musician to them, who takes a personal interest in the student’s musical development. For some, the value of a mentor is in the experienced musician giving advice and time. For others, it may be that someone discovers the student’s abilities and gives them their start. In his final year at secondary school, William chose to board with a friend who was a singing mentor to him: “I would say, in my last year of high school I stayed...with a friend. I mean, she has done... it all in the States and stuff... So, I mean, she’s been a wealth of knowledge and support.”

Libby, an intermediate school music specialist, commented that she would like to put in place a system of connecting students with music professionals as mentors to support and encourage the students in their music making. There is a music mentoring scheme available to schools at no cost, run by the New Zealand Music Commission. The scheme enables students to work with music industry professionals for up to ten hours, and is targeted at schools where students would otherwise have little access to such support, including schools in rural areas, low decile-rated schools, and schools with a high proportion of Māori and Pasifika students. The scheme uses contemporary rather than classical music performers, and is adaptable for each individual school.

---

18 The New Zealand Music Commission (NZMC) is designed to support the development of the music industry in New Zealand. It is supported by music industry organisations as well as having government funding.
Mentoring is a valuable tool for developing the young musician. The possibility of developing these mentoring relationships to enhance music education in New Zealand will be discussed further under chapter 10 Recommendations in section 10.2 Mentoring.

5.2.2 Community music making
The survey asked students if they had participated in any music groups outside school.

![Figure 32. Participation in local music activities out of school](image)

Of the thirty-three students who responded to this question, twenty had been involved in some sort of music activity outside school in their local area. The variety of activities students had been involved in is shown in figure 33 below.
Community choirs were the most popular, followed by rock bands, orchestras and jazz bands. Some of the groups are long established community ensembles such as choirs; however, groups such as rock bands may well have been created and run by the members themselves for shorter durations.

Several of the students who participated in the survey or interview process either mentioned community music making or alluded to it in some way. Examples of this include pipe bands, church choirs, youth orchestras and country music clubs. Both Daniel and Eliza had learned pipe drumming through their local pipe band, and Frankie’s singing had developed through her joining the local cathedral choir.

Some of the music education professionals mentioned community-based groups they had been involved in over the years. George and Libby had played in brass bands to A Grade level. Across New Zealand, approximately 1900 people play in 52 brass bands, more than thirty percent of whom are under the age of twenty-three (Brass Band 19).

---

19 Brass bands in New Zealand are graded A to D, with A being the highest grade for competition purposes. There are also Youth Grade bands for young players. These grades apply to bands affiliated with the Brass Band Association of New Zealand (BBANZ)
Association of New Zealand). George talked about the impact brass bands had on him and the importance of the community in developing musicians.

I think, because so much of my music education in band was about group and community... my own education reinforced the importance of community... I think what brass banding does is, you know, many people criticise it because it's about competition. But what it does is it creates excellence from people who would have never dreamed they could achieve that excellence. (George)

Creation of excellence in brass banding through a competitive structure illustrates a further way in which community music making is of value to the student participant. Not only does the community music group (brass band, country music club, kapa haka) have a structure which allows individuals and groups to work with people who share their interests at the same performance level as them, it also teaches the students to be goal-oriented as a group member, and to take responsibility for their own preparation and practise to support the team. The same can be said for groups that are not based around competition but have performance goals, such as choirs and orchestras. Church and cathedral choirs that are members of the Royal School of Church Music (RSCM) also have the capacity for members to work towards qualifications within the RSCM structure.

Growing up, James was a member of his local youth orchestra, civic orchestra and cathedral choir, as well as playing in a wind quintet. Clare is a member of an ukulele group and an African drumming group. Penny has played in youth orchestras and is now a member of a community symphonic band as well as being on the management committee of her local youth orchestra. Penny described the value of such community groups in her interview.

The orchestras and the bands, and the whole making friends. It’s the social aspect that I think is really, really important. You know, you make lifelong friends and I’ve still got lifelong friends... I’ve seen my own kids make friends that have carried on through. And I just think it’s so important to make musical friends. (Penny)
5.3 Friends
Over the course of their childhood, and particularly at secondary school level, friendships tended to develop between like-minded students. I asked the students who their biggest supporters were apart from their family and teachers.

Throughout the whole time would probably have to be my friends, because there were three of us... we were in... every school band together, we eventually made a rock band together... It’s validation. I mean, those were the sort of people I wanted to be around. They were my best mates and I was playing music with them, and so that was probably my biggest support. (Alex)

Church music-making was an area in which students found like-minded people with whom they could connect in both music and in religious belief. For Frankie, this was as a cathedral chorister, for Mike it was as a musician in a worship team in an evangelical church. Mike’s experience of music making at his church enabled him to develop a supportive network of like-minded musicians.

I have a number of friends who I met through that church... like, I’ve got one mate of mine... he has just finished his degree playing bass here, and another mate of mine who’s been a real help. He’s doing an honours in composition... he’s got a really good background in music tech stuff, so anything I need help with technologically, you know. We use the same music software as well, so I can just ask him for help whenever I just like... It’s really good, yeah. (Mike)

5.4 Classmates
Students’ comments about their classmates divided into positive and negative. The positive responses were around classmates who encouraged, inspired and supported. The negatives responses were generally directed at classmates who disrupted classes or were ‘negative choosers,’ that is, students who studied music because it was the least un-liked subject choice, or thought of it as a soft option and didn’t want to work. None of the interview subjects mentioned being jealous of students who appeared more talented or having greater experience than them. Most of the participants found that classmates they perceived as more talented to be supportive and encouraging.
5.4.1 Negative classmates

For students who are interested in music, being surrounded by classmates who weren’t interested or were disruptive could be a source of frustration. This was identified as an issue particularly in the early years of secondary school. Julia described the attitude of her year nine classmates: “So I took it right through from year nine to year thirteen, and year nine was a little bit, it was kind of average… you know that they were never picking it because they wanted to do it.”

Even within a class of musicians, there were issues when students didn’t want to work on certain aspects of the course. Alex found his classmates were particularly unmotivated to work on their music theory. Classmates’ attitudes improved as students got older and the less-interested students opted out of music. Julia explained how this changed the classroom dynamic: “More people drop out and so you’ve got more people… that are actually interested in it… and you get a lot more work done. I guess it just got better throughout the years.”

5.4.2 Positive classmates

For some students, classmates were a source of friends with similar interests. Some of the students attended schools where the music and arts cultures were particularly strong. Julia found a musical friend: “Then I went to K High School, which has got, like, a really strong performing arts background, and straight away I actually made best friends with the music scholar for the school.” Sophie was educated both through home schooling and the Rudolph Steiner school systems: “Most of my friends were playing an instrument as well, so it was sort of a natural thing. “Of course you’re playing an instrument.” If you don’t play one, then “why are you not playing an instrument?”” Frankie was well supported by students who had more music education than she did and were willing and able to share their knowledge: “I was lucky because I had some really lovely people in the class… you know how some people are just kind of naturally able to explain things?”
Susan O’Neill, in her chapter *The self-identity of young musicians* (MacDonald et al., 2002) describes a study she undertook of sixty young musicians. She described her subjects’ reporting on their peers:

> Another interesting finding was that the ‘highest’ achievers at the specialist music school were far more likely to report that they found their peers at the school supportive. In fact, they were much happier at the music school than at their previous schools because they found themselves with more ‘like-minded’ peers (MacDonald et al., 2002, p. 83)

While none of the subjects in the present study attended specialist music schools, the parallel between the rise in happiness being with ‘like-minded’ peers is evident in the interview comments.

### 5.5 Summary

Each of the students majoring in music who were interviewed had at least one person in their lives who had been greatly supportive of their music endeavours. For almost all of them, the greatest support came from within their family, usually from their parents. The students had also built up their own support networks of friends and mentors, and acknowledged these supporters’ roles in their development as musicians. While participation in community music groups still takes place, as shown by the continuing existence of groups such as brass bands and country music clubs, music education through these groups is not as common as in previous generations. Where the music education professionals had all experienced music education opportunities through community music making (some of which were ongoing) not all the students interviewed had either experienced or had exposure to community music-making opportunities. Those students who have made use of community music education opportunities have benefitted greatly from them. The opportunities that could be developed for students by building relationships with community music organisations will be discussed further in section **10.3 Support for community groups.**
6 Access and Barriers to Music Education

The theme of access to music education was reiterated in most of the interviews. There was a sense that although many of the students interviewed had very good access to education, some felt they had come up against barriers. I examined the issues surrounding access and barriers to music education as the students emphasised that this was important to them and had a significant impact on their personal experiences. Some of the students felt they personally were in a position of privilege, and expressed their concern that others may not have the access they did.

6.1 Finance

Finance was an issue for almost all students. Students said in their interviews they had been restricted in what instruments (or music theory) they had learned as children because of cost. Students knew the cost of music education, the contributions of their parents and their financial limits. When Rikki arrived at university she was behind in theory knowledge because her family could not afford private theory lessons. She was aware that her parents had supported her as much as they could, but theory lessons would have been one financial commitment too many. Mike was part of a large family and had similar issues over wanting to continue in singing lessons. They were a luxury for him, a non-essential that he couldn’t justify keeping going. “I did some singing lessons in year twelve. And in year thirteen I stopped lessons and I didn't really need lessons at that time, and they were expensive so I just…”

Sam could access lessons regardless of finance. Lessons and instruments were freely available and the school’s itinerant scheme enabled them to come together. “There were three of us that decided to take it at the same time... Just because there were French Horns lying around and we had a brass teacher that gave free lessons and we were like, why not?”

Gaining formal qualifications can be expensive. Many music theory students will not sit anything except Grade five ABRSM (a requirement for Grade six and higher ABRSM practical music examination entry). Though Lucy decided not to sit any theory exams before Grade five for financial reasons, she still considers she was in a
privileged position. She expresses her concern that students are prevented from participation because of cost.

*And then my parents were in a position to send us to music lessons. And unfortunately it’s one of these things which is the most heart-breaking thing. It’s a lot to do about money. And sending kids to music lessons because it costs. And it’s one of these things that I think is the most disappointing things that it can almost be seen as a privilege.* (Lucy)

Eliza wanted to learn as many instruments as she could. She acknowledges that her parents were doing as much as she could reasonably ask and that wanting to learn yet another instrument was financially unreasonable. Students were aware of and grateful for the sacrifices their families made to enable them to get the lessons they did.

### 6.2 Starting age

Some students felt that they had started learning too late. This is not because they think they might have been prodigies, rather they think given an earlier start they would have greater depth of understanding. Eliza expresses this frustration. “*I think I started way too late. Playing the piano. If I had started five years earlier I would have had ATCL by the time I left school. And I would have had five years more education.*”

### 6.3 Geography

Living outside the main centres caused some issues of access to music education. Music education opportunities are available throughout the country, in the towns as well as in the cities, however there are limits as to what is available to students in rural communities. Finding qualified, experienced teachers in smaller towns or rural areas can be challenging. Some rural secondary schools are unable to get IMTs on a regular basis and compromise and have them come every second week. This situation has been made worse by the regulations that counts travel time for itinerant teachers as part of their working hours and charges it against the school the teacher is travelling to, rather than paying the teachers for additional time. These challenges can affect students’ decisions such as what schools to attend and whether to go to boarding school (and at what age) thereby further exacerbating the funding issues to smaller, rural schools as
their rolls decline. While William’s memories of his early music education were positive, he had to move from an area (composite) school to a private boarding school when he was in year seven to pursue his musical interests. His intermediate and secondary schooling were spent as a boarder at private schools. This was possible because his parents could afford to pay for private school education for him.

Sometimes moving to a new school was not an option. Students in classes of one or two pupils commonly end up taking music by correspondence through Te Aho o te Kura Pounamu, the New Zealand Correspondence School. While the courses are appropriate for New Zealand qualifications, correspondence can be a difficult way to study with little immediate feedback available. Eliza studied for Bursary music in this way (prior to the introduction of NCEA).

*I was the only person that did seventh form music, so I ended up having to do it by correspondence, and I completely just bombed out… I have to have structure, and I have to have somebody sitting there explaining things to me. That was a bit of a shame. And I tried talking to the people, but it’s not the same as having somebody sit down and talk to you.* (Eliza)

### 6.4 School structures

Frankie was a bright student who was in an extension class in year nine that didn’t take the core music curriculum the rest of the school cohort studied. While she appreciated the extension, she found when she started music a few years later she had gaps in her understanding.

Most secondary schools in New Zealand have music tuition available in school time through either the itinerant music teachers scheme, or private music teachers who come in and teach. This can lead to students missing classes as these lessons are generally

---

20 The New Zealand Correspondence School, *Te Aho o te Kura Pounamu*, is a state school designed to educate school aged children who could not attend ordinary schools for reason of geographical remoteness or illness. Some schools unable to offer subjects to only one or two students will allow the students to jointly enrol for subjects such as music.

21 Now called year thirteen.
during the school day. While some students see this as a welcome break others are concerned that they will miss out on too much regular class work. Dean didn’t want to come out of classes to take music lessons. He was concerned at the interruption to other studies at school. “Yeah, there were enough opportunities but, yeah, I don’t know, I just didn’t like it cutting into school time.”

6.5 Access to all elements of music education

Some students had access to some aspects of music only such as practical music making rather than theory, singing rather than instrumental music. YoYoNanas felt that her music learning was limited, having little access to theory at a young age. “Whereas if I had had theory possibly it would have been a set of, like an alphabet for a language I could use. I really feel everybody should be learning music like the alphabet from five. Or three.”

Lucy had spent some time working as a singing teaching in primary schools before she started university. She wants to see a more holistic learning approach to music in primary schools, where the theory is taught alongside music, and quality of performing is valued more highly.

You find with a lot of singing education is they teach you by ear so you are spoon fed a lot of stuff where you’re going into any lessons or just singing along with the radio, and that’s enough… and I found that what some kids that did have music, it was sort of this choir singing that’s almost shouting, and it’s all pop songs. And they would sit there and learn them, but they didn’t learn anything about music. (Lucy)

Students interviewed expressed the need for more music education, in greater depth and of better quality, with earlier access available for more children.

6.6 Lack of creativity teaching in primary and intermediate schools

The Arts in The New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) emphasises that students of all ages should be creating their own music from the earliest school years. Composition is also part of the NCEA music syllabus at all levels.
As mentioned previously in section **6.6 Lack of creativity teaching in primary and intermediate schools**, this is an area of weakness at junior levels.

*Developing Ideas* is one of the four strands of the Arts curriculum. There were very few examples of creative work referred to by students in the interviews. Students who took part in the survey did have the chance to say whether they had opportunities to do creative work such as improvising or composing at school, in private lessons or in other places (such as the home environment). Although most students appeared to have chances to create at secondary school, in three of the questions the second most prevalent answer was ‘no opportunity’. As these questions relate directly to the *Developing Ideas* strand, it is extremely concerning to see that very little opportunity is available to students to experience this aspect of the curriculum.

![Creative Opportunities](chart.png)

*Figure 34. Creative opportunities*
6.7 Primary school music teaching
As described in chapter 4.1 Primary school music, inadequate teaching in primary schools is of concern. Interviews with generalist primary school teachers and leaders show there is a lack of both training and resources to teach music more than superficially. The curriculum is crowded, with an emphasis on literacy and numeracy targets. Few primary schools have access to specialist music teachers, and both pre-service and ongoing professional development in music for generalist primary school teachers is limited.

6.8 The views of education professionals
I asked the education professionals what barriers to access and learning they thought existed in music education. George is a retired College of Education lecturer who has researched into music education. He describes the barriers he sees to good music teaching in the primary schools. This theme was echoed by Greta, principal of an intermediate school, and by Penny, teacher in charge of music at a primary school.

_In primary school, there are barriers in terms of some schools don’t necessarily have a strong music leader and don’t even like the idea of identifying a music leader, because everybody needs to be able to do it, because everybody is trained as a generalist teacher in primary so should be able to do it._ (George)

This issue did come through in many of the comments made by the students about primary school music, that it was too easy, unexciting or dis-engaging, or that they just didn’t do much music at primary school. Clare, the specialist music teacher at a contributing primary school had thought about this issue before her interview. “I used to be pragmatic and say, “well if you haven’t got a music teacher you can’t do it” but that’s not good enough is it?” The point that the education professionals made was there is a curriculum requirement for music teaching, particularly in the primary school, that simply cannot be met, because teacher training is not adequately covering the music curriculum. Greta was particularly impassioned in her comments on this issue.

How anybody could, you know how anybody could possibly teach music effectively after a six-hour training is utterly ridiculous... Teacher knowledge is a massive
barrier… We all needed maths, we all needed reading, we all carried on with those through high school, necessarily, but most people didn’t have the music background so we’re trying to cram now what a music specialist has spent years and years honing into a six-hour course. You know that’s nuts. And so, funding for some sort of specialised teaching I think would be beneficial. (Greta)

There were other issues raised by the educators, such as adequate funding for specialist equipment or dedicated classrooms. Greta described the conflict between the Ministry of Education’s desire for schools to develop multiple uses of spaces contrasting with the practicalities of carrying that out.

_Resourcing within the school, an actual room. We’re sort of struggling for a space now because the Ministry don’t deem – they want us to multi-use all of our spaces which is fine, but if you’re trying to get the marimbas out for a half-hour session well it takes you half of the session to get the stuff out if you can’t walk into a room that’s set up. (Greta)*

The issues of qualified, confident music teachers with in-depth knowledge of the curriculum and the availability of dedicated music rooms are less prevalent at secondary school. Other barriers to learning become more significant. George commented on the expectations for secondary school music teachers to work beyond the curriculum.

_Another barrier would be that our secondary teachers are run ragged. So, they’re effectively ninety teachers. Slight exaggeration. They’re effectively nine teachers because no other teacher is expected to do the diversity of extra-curricular stuff that our teachers have to support, lead or be in the background to support students to be able to get through that show or through that piece or whatever. (George)_

This issue is at the heart of what are the most valued educational opportunities for students. The co-curricular activities run by the classroom teachers are what brings music to life for many students, and are generally enjoyed by the teachers as well. However, co-curricular activities take a great deal of time and energy for teachers to co-ordinate. The impact of this workload is discussed in *Between two worlds: tensions*
of practice encountered by secondary school music teachers in Aotearoa New Zealand (Donaldson, 2012). The issues of burn-out and the attrition rate of music teachers are serious and may have an impact on the willingness of the next generation of music teachers to train and teach in what can be a stressful environment.

6.9 Summary: impact of barriers to learning
In view of these barriers to learning, it seems incredible that so many students do study music at tertiary level. If students are prevented from access to music education because of finance or geography there must be ways to work around these. More concerning is that access is denied through poor teaching at primary school level. What it shown is that students have an overwhelming desire for music and will work steadily to achieve their goals despite the barriers they encounter. Ways in which these barriers may be partially eroded will be discussed in chapter 10 Recommendations.
7 Value in Formal and Informal Music Education Experiences

The nature of formal and informal music education has been discussed in section 2.2 Formal and informal teaching and learning. Students are aware of differences between formal and informal music education experiences, and see value in both aspects of learning. The New Zealand education system is designed to allow for formal and informal learning, with flexibility for the teacher to modify their approach according to the needs and interests of their students. This is vital in music education as music, especially in secondary school, has become a broad subject that encompasses many. Students who have experienced formal music lessons have different needs to those who have been self-taught.

Figure 35. Changes in survey responses between primary and secondary school

Students appear to value the concept of formality in music education. Figure 35 shows changes between the answers to the same survey questions from primary to secondary school (“music was important at my school,” (perceived value), “music was fun at my school,” (enjoyment) and “music was formal at my school” (formality).). Examining these results, the student’s perceptions of music being formal in their school had little negative correlation with their enjoyment which remained high. There is a large increase in the students’ perceptions of formality in school from primary to secondary
level that appears to have some positive correlation with their perception of music being valued in their school. It seems students see an element of formality as validating music as a subject.

7.1 What do students value in formal music education?

Two main themes emerged from the interviews regarding formal music education. First, students value the input of their music teachers, both instrumental and academic. Instrumental teachers give music skills teaching, such as technique and musicianship. Secondary school classroom teachers pass on composition skills and music theory, and support and guidance in their musical endeavours at school. Sam described her high school music teacher; “I went to Girls’ High… and we had Mr. L there who was really amazing. He started me on composition which was something I had never considered before… and that’s what I’m doing at Otago.”

The second theme from the interview process was that students valued learning theory of music. This was often because they could relate their theory to practical music making, or saw the theory as enabling better practical performance. Alex commented on this; “And I saw that it was useful for my bass playing so I was quite motivated to do it, especially in year 13.” Students who now struggle with theory wish they had done more and had greater access to theory at a younger age. In hindsight, they value theory education highly, although some made comments about the way theory of music was taught as not being engaging, or not being linked to other aspects of music such as performance. Ways to improve this aspect of music education will be discussed in section 10.7 Theory of Music.

7.2 What do students value in informal music education?

Students value working together, jamming, forming bands, writing songs, rehearsing and playing gigs. They value working on their own to learn new music, to learn techniques through listening and copying, they value discovering new music and learning to play it. They acknowledge the influence of musicians around them who act as inspirations or mentors.
Rikki’s music education had included a great deal of collaborative work; “With high school we do a thing called Band Factory which is for… high school students on Wednesday nights. We get together and just try to make songs and jam out songs.” Her first exposure to this kind of music making had been as a primary school student in Groove Factory, a holiday and after school programme run by the high school students. By her last year of secondary school, Rikki had taken over the running of the programme which made enough money for the students to go to Samoa and work with children there as song-writing mentors. Rikki told this story with a great deal of pride as she had been involved from the age of eight, taking the opportunities presented to her to develop her music and inter-personal skills to a level where her teacher ‘gave’ her Groove Factory to run for her last year of school.

7.3 What do students value more: formal or informal music education?

Students value music making. None of the interview participants’ musical identities had been developed through solely formal or informal music education before they started university. All had experienced a range of music education opportunities. The students define themselves in the first instance as musicians by practical musicianship; that is, as active doers of music through the media of practical performance or music creation, as performers, composers, songwriters or music technicians. This applies to students who are interested in the more academic aspects of music study as well as those who are studying more practical applications; you cannot be a musician without making music.

The practical musician’s ability to move along the continuum of formality and informality to further develop technique, repertoire or musicianship is well developed by the time they begin tertiary training. They value theoretical understanding as a way of informing their practical knowledge. On reaching tertiary study they are also self-motivated, independent workers who seek out new music experiences and ideas. Formal and informal music education combine in a holistic learning approach where the students use whatever music education is available to them to make the advances they want. Neither formal nor informal music education is described as having greater value to them, rather each has a significant impact on the developing music practitioner and each is involved in the students’ decision making processes leading them to tertiary study.
7.4 Bi-musicality and validation

Formal music education entails the student being willing to surrender an element of their autonomy in learning to acquire knowledge or skills that the teacher can pass on. Informal music education allows the student to retain greater autonomy over their learning. The student’s ability to live in both worlds, formal and informal can lead to their developing an element of bi-musicality, that is a dual musical identity, related to their formal as well as their informal music activities.

Hannah Bibby explores students’ participations in music activities in and out of school and asks: “What views do my students appear to have on musical identities based on participation in music at school and music outside of school?” (Finney, 2013, p. 152). This lead me to consider the question: To what extent are the students’ in and out-of-school music identities similar? Many students who choose to study music at tertiary level appear to be the ones whose musical identities are created through complimentary in-and-out of school or co-curricular experiences. Those who have their out-of-school interests recognised and acknowledged by their school music teachers are more likely to feel validated as musicians, and therefore more likely to pursue music as a tertiary option or career path.

Rikki, a contemporary voice student, identifies herself as a ‘metal’ musician. Rikki’s musical preferences are rock and metal; her clothes and hairstyle also reflect metal music culture. In her interview, she used phrases such as “I’m like a metal musician, or I think it was when everyone and myself realised that I was a rock or metal musician.” Her identity reflected her upbringing (“I was always brought up on rock and metal as a kid”), and was recognised and validated by her high school teacher telling her “you’re definitely a rock chick”. Her identity as a metal musician remains with her at university, and is reinforced when she returns to her home town: “Even now when I go back to school when I’m on holidays and stuff, they’re like, ‘yay, metal’s back’.”

Frankie’s music experience in the last few years of secondary schooling was focussed around choirs. Her image of herself as a musician became closely tied to her participation in the local cathedral choir where she lived: “I emailed the choir director which is weird because I wasn’t really Christian or really musical but I was kind of exploring a bit of faith.”
Alex’s music identity is as a contemporary musician, specifically as a bass guitar player. His music making in school enabled him to create an identity where he felt of value. Alex’s out of school identity included performing in diverse genres.

*Me and my two best friends, we made up the rhythm section of every band (at their school)... I wrote a lot of notes cos I was quite early in my sight reading for that. But by the end of the production I could read, pretty fluently to be honest... Being in a rock band, cos that’s what everyone really wants to do, really. I played in a jazz band outside of school as well actually.* (Alex)

The out of school music activities Alex took part in (jazz bands, rock bands and jam sessions with friends) overlapped with his school activities. Alex had to deal with a problematic classroom teacher for two years at high school; however, he had other high school music teachers and private bass teachers who supported him and reinforced his sense of being a valuable, flexible bass guitarist.

This validation of the student’s interests outside the classroom, usually by the school music teacher, helps support the student’s musical development. While some students can maintain motivation without this validation, some students suffer from a lack of validation of their preferred genre. Lucy’s interest is musical theatre. She began her singing career with a teacher whose background was jazz and contemporary singing, and Lucy sat RockSchool grade examinations. She was accepted into the specialist music programme at a secondary school in the city where she lived. This was not a completely positive experience for Lucy, as she felt that the specialist programme did not support her style of music.

*I had a problem with the voice tutor I had because she was very close-minded. But that’s normal for voice tutors... And so coming in to do the same rep (ed. repertoire) that I was doing, the same rep that got me into the (ed. specialist) programme, cos you have like an hour class after school where you have like a workshop. It was, she*

---

22 RockSchool was a part of the Trinity Guildhall London syllabus of music examinations in which students could take graded exams in contemporary voice, guitar, bass guitar, keyboard and drums.
was like ‘oh, that’s good but I can’t do anything because I’m trained in this’. Which was really one of the things I found in year nine like well, I was doing at the time Rocks school exams through Trinity and they were just like a h - that’s cool but we can’t really help you there. (Lucy)

Lucy thought her choice of secondary school had been a mistake because of this lack of support; “And so there was part of me going ‘maybe I should have gone to like a normal school.” However, as Lucy moved through her secondary school years she began to adapt and become more involved in co-curricular activities, particularly choir: “I got really in to choir that year, I was part of singing ensembles that were very senior and I was understanding it... I think choir for me has always been the thing that made the theory make sense.” In her last year of secondary school, Lucy became a leader in the elite girls’ choir, and was given the opportunity to conduct. In hindsight, Lucy is glad that she remained at that school, in the specialist music programme; however, it was a struggle to maintain her interests and identity when it was not validated by the relevant specialist teacher.

7.5 Summary

The composite music-practitioner student moves frequently along the formal/informal continuum, using formal and informal music education opportunities as they require, to develop their next phase of musical doing or to enhance the skills they have already acquired. With the validation of professionals such as music teachers, they inhabit both formal and informal music education environments as they feel the need. The overwhelming impression is that the music student who has experienced both formal and informal music education comes to see both as equally valid. What matters more is the support for the music student’s personal musical identity, whether this is found through formal or informal music education practices.
8 Deciding to be a Musician

8.1 Deciding to study music

The decision to study music at tertiary level appears to be made in the year before students commence tertiary study. Few of the students surveyed had made any final decision that music was to be their career or major study before their last year of secondary schooling. In looking at what has led to that decision however, there may be markers that can be identified by teachers as likely to be important in the student’s decision-making process. There have often been crystalizing moments in the student’s early music education. The gradual development of intrinsic motivation rather than having to rely on extrinsic motivational forces, and the development of a personal identity in music, experiencing flow and satisfaction, and a reasonable level of challenge are all factors that may help the student come to the decision to pursue music at tertiary level.

8.1.1 The age to make the decision

The following graphs mark the ages at which students made the decision to study music. The first graph includes all the students who answered the question in the survey regardless of what degree they are studying for; the second looks at those who have identified as studying either for a Bachelor of Music (Mus. B), Bachelor of Arts (BA) majoring in music, or a Bachelor of Performing Arts (BPA), which includes music performance as a compulsory component.

![Figure 36. Age at which students decided to study music at tertiary level](image-url)
The mean age at which students decided to study music was 20.17 years. In the case of only the music and performing arts majors, the mean age is 17.23 years. I consider this shows that the students’ sense of themselves as musicians (or performers in the case of BPA students) was generally formed while still at secondary school. This mean age of 17.23 years represents a decision made during the last two years of secondary school, usually in the final year itself. In the final year of secondary school students tend to choose subjects they consider will be of value to them in determining what courses they study at university (some school subjects are pre-requisite for university courses) and will allow them to achieve their best results in NCEA or other assessments.

**8.1.2 Personal reasons for subject choice at university**

Not all the students studying music at university began their undergraduate degrees with the intention of studying music as their major. Some of the students choose to study music alongside another course: Sophie and Julia are both training to be lawyers in addition to their music studies. Alex took two mathematics papers in his first semester at university. He passed them well, but had no desire to continue in that field. Music is what engages Alex. He came alive as he told stories of his musical experiences, both positive and negative.

*Music I’m loving. It just sort of seemed logical. I couldn’t see… I couldn’t imagine going through… three more years at least of education not doing something I’m*
enjoying. So almost by process of elimination. And then once I got into that mind set I was “hell yeah, this is going to be mean,” and it’s been good so far. (Alex)

Mike hadn’t intended to study music as his major when he started at university. He found himself engaged in music making in his spare time, so decided to make it his full-time study. Like Alex, Mike became animated as he spoke about his choice to major in music. Their body language showed their passion for the subject and the necessity they felt to make music their priority.

Last year I enrolled in one music paper which is composition, that’s a full year one. And I enrolled in history and politics ones as well… And then I thought between the semesters, I switched to doing only music papers because I was doing it all my spare time anyway and I thought if my spare time can go toward getting points then do it. (Mike)

While some of the students indicated in their interviews that their families had reservations about them studying music as they were concerned about career and employment prospects, none of the students interviewed had to go directly against their parents’ wishes to study music. Most felt their parents had been supportive throughout their music education and some parents were surprised if their child chose anything but music to study. Lucy mentioned studying psychology to her parents: “And they turned around and said “are you sure you don’t want to do something with music? We told you to get a back-up, but like, we’ve spent some money on music education. You sure you don’t want…?””

8.2 The decision: influences and circumstances
Experiences such as crystallizing moments, developing intrinsic motivation, flow, developing a personal music identity and meeting challenges can be significant moments for the young musician. Some of the significant moments students experience are serendipitous. Others are the culmination of weeks, months or years of dedicated work. Not all students have the same experiences: some described many of the incidents or experiences, others described none. These experiences can happen without
intervention by other people, however they tend to be more effective if they involve a ‘significant other’ such as a mentor or teacher.

8.2.1 Crystallizing moments and environments

Joseph Walters and Howard Gardner, drawing on the work of David Feldman (Feldman, 1980), describe crystallizing moments as involving “remarkable and memorable contact between a person with unusual talent or potential and the materials of the field in which that talent will be manifested.” (Walters & Gardner, 1984, p. 4)

These crystallizing moments take place within a crystallizing environment, which includes exposure to opportunity. Julia described an event that seems to have been crystallizing for her. This may well have been Julia’s first musical success: “We had a recorder at home and my Dad taught me how to play Good King Wenceslas... We spent two hours doing it or something but then I was able to play it off by heart, never forgotten it.”

Penny, a classroom teacher who has responsibility for music in her school, described a crystallizing moment for her. The ITMs in her district came and played at her primary school. The clarinet teacher played the Pink Panther theme, which triggered a desire in Penny to learn the clarinet. Her family was not supportive of music.

“I thought, what am I going to do? They said we had to play the recorder first, so I stole twenty dollars from my mother... from her purse. Told my friend I’d buy her a recorder as well and went and bought recorders. Still had money left over, spent it on other things, and got caught... I think I got quite severely punished for that, however Mum did put me in Out of School Music Classes and let me play the recorder, and that’s how I started...” (Penny)

Penny’s parents’ attitude to music meant that she felt compelled to extreme measures. There was something in the music she had heard (the Pink Panther theme) that resonated with her and made learning clarinet essential to her. This crystallizing moment has stayed with Penny for forty years and is the reason she teaches out-of-school music classes: “I’d give up my Saturday morning every Saturday... because that was my chance, that was my break through.”
8.2.2 Motivation
In their interviews, the students talked about their motivation to continue developing as musicians. They described motivations that are either extrinsic or intrinsic, and how their self-motivation developed over time. This self-motivation appears to develop out of a growing sense of musical self-identity during the teenage years. Factors such as the achievement of flow-like states in practice or performance, peer or school recognition as a musician, and meeting challenges in musical development all contribute to this sense of musical self-identity.

8.2.3 Extrinsic and intrinsic motivation
At a young age, extrinsic motivation is vital to progress in music education. Very few young children have the self-motivation to practise without external encouragement. Richard Ryan and Edward Deci explain the difference between extrinsic and intrinsic motivation: “The most basic distinction is between intrinsic motivation, which refers to doing something because it is inherently interesting or enjoyable, and extrinsic motivation, which refers to doing something because it leads to a separable outcome.” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, p. 55). There may well be intrinsic motivation to begin learning music; the child is keen to start learning a musical instrument or take voice lessons, or to participate in a music activity such as a choir or school music group. However, to continue working at music at a young age, children need to see music as extrinsically rewarding. Frankie summed up her earliest experiences: “I did piano for a little bit when I was a kid, seven, yeah seven, but I was really just doing it for the stickers and the candy.”

As discussed in section 5.1.1 Parents, some students began music lessons because their parents decided they would. It appears from the interviews that students who come from backgrounds where music is the norm tend to learn from a younger age, learn in more formal ways (private lessons, out-of-hours group lessons) and have a great deal of support from their parents, sometimes to the point of supervision of their practice or sitting in on their lessons. These students have a great amount of extrinsic motivation in their early years to support their music learning. However, to succeed in their music career students must move from extrinsic to intrinsic motivation, actively participating in music (whether as performers, composers or technologists) regardless of any
extrinsic reward. They choose to be in performance groups, to study new instruments, to spend spare time composing or mixing, or transcribing new music to play. Intrinsic motivation is evident in the engagement of the students. Flow, identity, and challenge all seem to be factors in the move from extrinsic to intrinsic motivation.

In contrast to the early learners, students who started an instrument later, such as those who start to play in their early teenage years, show greater intrinsic motivation from the beginning. This may be because they are more likely to teach themselves. It may also be that they require intrinsic motivation as their parents are less personally invested in their musical success beginning at this point. This is the clichéd image of the teenager with a guitar in their bedroom who shuts the door and plays for hours.

8.2.4 Flow
American psychologist Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi describes flow as follows: “The defining feature of flow is intense experiential involvement in moment-to-moment activity. Attention is fully invested in the task at hand, and the person functions at his or her fullest capacity.” (Csikszentmihalyi, 2014, p. 230). This flow experience is something that students alluded to in their interviews. While none of the students used the term ‘flow’ specifically, many of them talked about the feelings they had when writing or performing music. For example, Rikki noted: “But I just got this huge rush and a buzz from every time I did music. Performance music especially, but I do love writing songs as well...”

8.2.5 Peer and school recognition as a musician
Students talked about being identified within their school communities as musicians. For Lucy, this identity was part of her placement in the specialist music unit at her school. For others, it was shown by teachers in music classes where they were given extension work away from less involved students. Rikki’s music and identity became intertwined, and she celebrates her identity in musical terms, as a ‘metal head’ or as she said “Like, the top metal head at the school.” Alex’s musical identity at high school coincided with that of his best friends: “Me and my two best friends, we made up the rhythm section of every band.”
8.2.6 Challenge
In developing a musical identity, challenge can play two roles. First, students require a reasonable level of musical challenge to stimulate them to achieve greater things. The introduction of activities such as chamber music and other high level performance groups at secondary school gives the students greater opportunity to challenge themselves.

Second, students may face non-musical challenges in their lives. For some, music is what gets them through the challenging times. Frankie’s home background was the most challenged of all my interview subjects. Frankie had experienced abuse and neglect as a young child, as well as displacement because of the 2011 Canterbury earthquake. She described dealing with an eating disorder (EDNOS\(^{23}\)) and sneaking out at night to smoke in the local park with a friend during her early teenage years.

So we’d just sort of sing to try and keep us both chipper enough to not do anything particularly stupid... And so it just sort of ended up that I sort of associated singing with a sort of emotional release that I don’t really feel comfortable doing in any sort of putting into words, like I’m not really a talker, I’m quite closed. I actually have mild Aspergers’ so it’s never been that easy for me to put things into words, like how I’m feeling and so singing was a thing, because I couldn’t play any instruments, that worked quite well. (Frankie)

Frankie joined a cathedral choir, although she wasn’t a confident singer. She thereby gave herself a musical challenge which, at the time, she considered almost impossible to deal with.

I joined the choir the next week and discovered that there weren’t any young altos and that I would be singing soprano… We were singing Rutter’s ‘For the Beauty of the Earth’, which has I think an F or an F sharp\(^{24}\) and I can just picture it sounding so God-awful high, like it sounded like the Queen of the Night kind of, and I’m just thinking “I can never sing that, I’m so screwed.” (Frankie)

---

\(^{23}\) EDNOS – Eating Disorder Not Otherwise Specified
\(^{24}\) The highest soprano note in Rutter’s For the Beauty of the Earth is G, a minor seventh below the F in the Queen of the Night aria from Mozart’s Magic Flute.
The level of challenge that Frankie was set was daunting; however, she made the effort to meet the challenge and became a valued soprano in that choir, and is now a classical voice performance student. Singing as a cathedral chorister gave her a sense of identity that coincided with her developing identity as both Christian and gay. The emotional and musical support that Frankie received from the cathedral choir community enabled her to meet her musical and identity challenges.

8.2.7 Summary: Identity development
Adolescence is a time of rapid change in identity development. Susan Moore, in *Life span development* (Santrock, 2013) refers to the work of Erik Erikson (1968) to describe the search for identity undertaken by adolescents. Her summary of developmental changes is useful.

*Although questions about identity may be especially important during adolescence, identity formation neither begins nor ends during these years. What is important about identity development in adolescence, especially in late adolescence, is that for the first time, physical development, cognitive development and socioemotional development advance to the point at which the individual can sort through and synthesise childhood identities and identifications to construct a viable path towards adult maturity* (Santrock, 2013, p. 412)

Development of an identity as a musician seems to accelerate at high school. Moore states: “*Identity is a self-portrait composed of many pieces*” (Santrock, 2013, p. 412) and includes music in the list that follows. It is difficult to tell if the self-identification as a musician is spurred on by opportunities for instrumental tuition through the itinerant tuition scheme, or the wide range of co-curricular music activities available to high school students (chamber music, choirs, rock bands etc.). It also is possible the range of activities is generated by the teachers in response to the demands of the students. From either perspective, there are many opportunities for students to participate in musical activities in New Zealand secondary schools and high levels of engagement in these activities (as discussed in section 4.5 Co-curricular activities in schools).
The effects of significant moments such as crystallizing environments, flow, or peer recognition on the decision making of the developing musician are difficult to measure empirically, however the nature of the qualitative data gathered showed that these factors are significant alongside music lessons, formal or informal. The importance of these concepts was evident in the interviews. Students can gain significantly if teachers can identify these significant moments and design their teaching to support these.
9 Conclusions
Reflecting on the students I taught as a secondary school music teacher, and reviewing the data gathered for this study, it is evident that music students arriving at tertiary study are a diverse group. There is no one story that defines development as a musician. It is possible to draw a composite view of a music student, although it remains an impressionistic and not clearly defined view. Common themes arise from the analysis of the survey and interview data, which help to shape this composite musician. The composite musician is first a practical music maker, who regards depth of understanding as important, and sees themselves as having a place in a community of music makers. While this is a generalisation, and there are students who are less comfortable as practical music makers or who prefer to work alone, all the students who responded to the survey or gave interviews had some experience of playing instruments or singing. This composite musician is drawn in the context of the initial research question, asking what impact do the students’ music education experiences, both formal and informal, have on their decisions to pursue professional music training. This, and the subsidiary questions outlined in section 1.6 are now able to be answered in the following section 9.2 The impact of formal and informal music experiences on the decision to pursue professional training in music.

9.1 Practitioner
There are three key aspects to the composite musician: practitioner, depth and community. The composite musician is a music practitioner. They may not necessarily be a performance, composition or music technology major, as some students choose to major in musicology or ethnomusicology, but music making is the largest part of what has defined them as a musician to this point in their lives and must be acknowledged as a distinct, legitimate way-of-knowing. Gardner describes this way-of-knowing as musical intelligence (Gardner, 1993). Any recommendations to be taken from this study need to reflect this way-of-knowing, and assist in building the music practitioner.

The music practitioner has often started young, with practical music, whether by learning an instrument or singing. They have chosen to give their time and effort to music at a young age (the mean starting age for instrumental tuition was about eleven years and six months in the present study) and have dedicated hundreds or even
thousands of hours to practise. Practice tends to be solitary; although students often spend time together singing or playing in ensembles, they spend more time alone honing their craft.

Most of the students’ comments about secondary school music related to the less formal and more practical aspects of music education, either co-curricular activities that were run by the school, such as choirs and orchestras, or informal access to the school music department that led to jam sessions and the formation of rock bands. Practical music making is where the determination for music comes from for many of students. These are the activities that have propelled them into tertiary study.

George, the retired music education lecturer, described his thoughts on what music was to him: “Thinking more broadly in terms of what I did, I guess I always thought of music as doing stuff as against learning about.” His background in brass banding was very strongly based in performance and contests, where excellence in practical music making was highly valued.

Although George has modified his ideas about music and states that he values in-depth thinking around the subject much more than he used to, his comment fits well with the place that many of the interview subjects are in as tertiary students. To them, music is about doing. This fits well with Gardner’s concept of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1993); the idea that musical knowing is a legitimate intelligence that includes the ability to make music as well as understand it.

9.1.1 Depth
The next aspect of the composite musician is depth. They understand that, while practical instrumental or vocal skills are where they have started as a music learner, theoretical understanding of music informs their practical music making. They wish to go deeper into music, a concept supported by the New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007). Students commented about the ways in which practical music making enabled them to understand theory of music, while their theory knowledge enabled them to perform with a greater depth of understanding. They see to be the best musicians they can be, they need theory skills and understanding, developed
in parallel with their practical skills. Many music students have had limited access to theory of music tuition and struggle with this aspect of tertiary study. They often ascribe this limit to financial constraints, as their parents could not be expected to pay for any further tuition. This is where the school system fails these music students, as the curriculum allows for theory of music to be taught alongside practical music making. If something is in the curriculum, it should not be an additional cost to the students. In *Blueprint for a music education in New Zealand*, the author states:

> It is interesting to note that no other curriculum area (within the New Zealand State School System) relies on parents sourcing and providing education in the integral influences required for achievement in that particular field of study – either inside or outside of education hours, at the parent/caregiver expense (Ward-Newall, 2002, p. 59)

### 9.1.2 Community
The third aspect of the composite musician is the appreciation they show for the support they have received. Music students appreciate what has been done for them and would like the chance to share what they have learned; they have a sense of ‘pay it forward’. There is a social element to music; with it, many students have developed a sense of social responsibility. This is evident in the attitudes of students who have taken part in school activities as well as those who have been involved in the wider music community. Students also appreciate chances for personal development, developing leadership and communication skills and learning to work as a member of a team; values and key competencies listed in the *New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007).

### 9.2 The impact of formal and informal music experiences on the decision to pursue professional training in music
Having established the key aspects of the composite musician, it is possible to examine what has had the greatest impact on their development to this stage, and in doing so answer the questions raised in the context of the initial research question. The composite musician arrives at tertiary training, formed from a combination of formal and informal music education experiences. While some students’ experiences have
been more heavily weighted to one end of the formal/informal continuum than the other, none of the students who contributed to the interview process had experienced only formal or only informal music education.

Classroom music experiences in New Zealand tend to move between formal and informal frequently. The New Zealand school music education experience differs from other countries because our education system is less formal and more student centred than those of some European countries, the United Kingdom, or the United States of America. The *New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) is designed to allow for flexibility of delivery but there are strands which must be covered and levels of achievement that should be attained. Unfortunately, aspects of the curriculum are not being delivered to all students equally, and the strands ‘Developing Ideas’ (creativity) and ‘Understanding the Arts in Context’ (including theory of music) are particularly neglected at primary and intermediate schools.

‘Significant others’ play a role in the development of the young musician, and teachers and family members have a strong influence on the students as they make the decision to pursue music beyond secondary school. Family support, financial and emotional, empowers the student to pursue music, and the teacher (especially the secondary school music teacher) validates the student as a musician by supporting their development and interest, as well as modelling professional musicianship and behaviour. Teachers and family often assist the students to overcome barriers to access and learning, although some teachers inadvertently put barriers in place, by not respecting the interests of the developing musician, or not offering some aspects of the curriculum that the student needs to access.

Multiple pathways exist for young musicians to follow, with opportunities in and out of school, such as private music lessons, co-curricular activities, or community music making. These opportunities are provided by parents, community groups, schools and teachers, and by the students themselves. The paths students take overlap and intertwine, and signposts can be observed such as crystallizing moments, involvement in co-curricular activities and the emergence of a musical identity.
Positive music education experiences, especially those where the student has a level of autonomy in their learning, have a strong influence on the students’ decisions to pursue professional music training. While students understand that formal music education is valuable to enable them to progress, achievement in music is motivated more by the collaborative, autonomous and practical aspects of their education, the informal music education experiences.
10 Recommendations

The theme of access and barriers to music education has come through strongly in this study, and the vehemence with which these issues have been raised by the study’s participants gives urgency to finding solutions to these issues. Below are a series of recommendations that might be useful starting points in addressing these. In *Some perspectives on musical gift and musical intelligence*, the authors make four observations on the promotion of music education. The fourth of these is relevant to the findings from the present study. “We need a longitudinal view of musical development that encompasses all the agencies responsible for it: primary and secondary schools; parents and the home environment; private tutors and music centres; and ensemble groups” (Stollery & McPhee, 2002, p. 95). There is potential for greater study and analysis here, investigating the many ways in which students learn and seeing if there is a way to provide support and development for children, their families, their teachers in and out of school, and for community music groups, although this is beyond the scope of this thesis.

Improved access to formal and informal music education is possible by building on the good practice already happening, to support and develop teachers and community musicians who are working with young musicians around the country. Collaboration, mentoring schemes, professional development, advocacy, the effective use of new technologies and the development of resources are all possible and could make significant differences to the education of young musicians.

10.1 Collaboration

Music educators at all levels across all genres and styles of music need to pool intellectual and musical resources to give students better outcomes. If tertiary educators want students to arrive at tertiary institutions with a deeper understanding of music, they need to assist with enabling those who have the responsibility for educating young people to do so. This needs to be done in a collaborative manner with each group of educators understanding and respecting the many roles played in the development of the young musician. This could take the form of professional development facilitated by tertiary institutions or by developing liaison programmes between tertiary institutions and schools. The vital component here is the concept of collaboration that is
student centred, working with the school and private music teachers to develop the whole musician from a young age.

10.2 Mentoring

Tertiary music students could mentor in primary, intermediate and secondary schools; another method of support that is straightforward to implement. The students interviewed for this research had a belief in the concept of ‘pay it forward’ and a wish to see others have either the positive opportunities they had experienced or to have better opportunities than the negatives they had endured. There is a high level of altruism amongst musicians: this may be why the concept of community music still exists. Mentoring is as valuable an experience for the mentor as for the mentee, and developing a mentoring system can be positive for all those involved.

10.3 Support for community music groups

Community music groups such as pipe bands, brass bands and country music clubs do still exist in New Zealand, and many serve as starting points for children to learn music. The altruistic volunteer still exists in the New Zealand music community. Tertiary institutions could set up affordable professional development for community music leaders, or assist with networking and mentoring schemes. Tertiary staff are frequently involved in community organisations as conductors or directors however it may be productive to set up ways in which community groups can grow from within, especially in areas that are geographically remote. The availability of video-conferencing and Skype technologies could prove useful in enabling people to have affordable access to this support.

10.4 Professional Development

Professional development for teachers of music needs to be reviewed. There is very little professional development in music available to teachers, particularly to primary school teachers. Penny commented that fewer quality resources such as Kiwi Kidsongs\textsuperscript{25} are being produced and that the accompanying professional development

\textsuperscript{25}Kiwi Kidsongs is a series of books and CDs formerly produced by the New Zealand Ministry of Education, used in primary schools throughout New Zealand for class and assembly singing. These were popular and effective, but have been discontinued.
that went with these products has been discontinued. As pre-service primary school teacher education in the music curriculum has been cut back to barest minimums, ongoing professional development is required for teachers who are in schools. In the report, *Music – Sound Arts 2015 key findings* (National Monitoring Study of Student Achievement, 2016), the majority of primary principals who completed the survey said that music had not been a priority for professional development in their school for the previous five years, and many teachers commented they had no professional development in music for at least six years. Again, it may be possible to use video-conferencing technologies to make professional development accessible for teachers outside main centres.

### 10.5 Advocacy

Music Education New Zealand Aotearoa (MENZA)\(^{26}\) has recently undertaken more advocacy for music education than they have done for years. They are an effective organisation and should be supported in their work. Much music education advocacy has focussed on the positive effects of music on the brain (and its use in improving literacy and numeracy achievement), however there must be advocacy of music education for music’s sake, not as a servant to other subjects. Students choose to study music because they love music: this choice must be considered legitimate and acceptable, rather than apologist.

Advocacy is also urgently needed to improve the state of primary school pre-service training in music education, or to bring in a requirement of specialist music teachers in primary schools. The current situation of primary school teaching graduates entering the profession unable to teach the music curriculum is untenable. It becomes a difficult cycle to break when primary school music teachers do not have the knowledge to teach the full music curriculum, children in primary schools do not learn music to the levels stated in the curriculum document, fewer students feel comfortable studying music at secondary school, fewer students study music at tertiary level, and fewer new entrants to Colleges of Education have the skills in music they will need to adequately teach the curriculum.

---

\(^{26}\)MENZA: the subject support society for music in New Zealand, affiliated with ISME.
10.6 Access
Programmes need to be set up to ensure that all students can access music education at an affordable rate. The itinerant music teaching system should begin in primary schools so students don’t have to wait until reaching secondary school to begin instrumental lessons. The current provisions for out-of-hours music could be re-examined as these seem limited in access. They tend to be centralised within cities, and students without access to transport are excluded from participating. Country school children have even less access to music lessons than city children through this system. Again, an exploration of new technologies may be appropriate. In the 1960s and 1970s, music programmes were broadcast to schools through the radio network. Similar programmes could be developed and made available through the internet now. Some secondary schools in remote districts of the country are using Skype technologies to deliver itinerant music lessons. With research into the effectiveness of these methods, this could be a positive way of delivering some lessons at a more affordable cost.

10.7 Theory of Music
Access to theory of music education needs to be improved. There are many music resources available on the internet such as guitar tabs. Theory of music education needs to be as accessible as these. While some Apps are available for music theory learning for devices such as iPads and smart phones, often these are expensive for students to gain access to. The development of websites and Apps for theory of music that are multi-level and free to access would be helpful in this situation.

10.8 Teaching Creativity in Primary School Music
While the issue of primary school pre-service training has been discussed above as requiring strong advocacy, there is also a need for primary school music to include more creative work. This is an area of the curriculum that is being almost completely neglected in primary schools unless the school has a specialist music teacher. In Working with musically gifted children, (Moore, 2012) the author describes the children’s creative work as outstripping their performance skills, therefore encouraging them to improve their performance abilities. Teaching creativity and compositional skills is a valuable way in which to embed theory of music as well as performance
skills. Resources that enable primary school teachers to approach this aspect of the curriculum with greater confidence need to be developed and distributed.

10.9 Conclusion

In an environment of the government’s promotion of STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) subjects to the detriment of the humanities, coupled with a societal view of music being a hobby rather than a career, and the movement towards passive music consumption rather than active music participation (that is, listening to music rather than making music oneself) it is amazing that any student chooses to study music at tertiary level. Yet multiple studies show the positive impacts music has on brain development and on the lives of musicians. To stem the decline of music students, it is necessary to look at how students are learning music, and which experiences have the greatest impact on them. Music students are passionate about their studies. They have put many hours into music long before they arrive at tertiary study, and deserve to have that effort supported from a young age.

There is an urgency attached to the conclusions and recommendations in this research. Tertiary institutions around New Zealand are under constant review, and music departments are being called upon to increase their student numbers to create more economically viable departments. While the recommendations in this research are not guaranteed, nor are they by any means a quick fix, they may prove useful as a start point to reversing the decline in student numbers currently being experienced. If tertiary institutions are seen to legitimise alternative ways of learning and knowing in music, by supporting the development of young musicians in informal and non-traditional music education opportunities, and the line between formal and informal music education continues to be flexible, then more students may well be drawn in to tertiary music study.
References


List of Appendices

Appendix 1a  University of Otago Human Ethics Committee
             Application Form: Category A
Appendix 1b  Request for Extension or Amendment to a Previously
             Approved Study
Appendix 2   Questions from Electronic Survey
Appendix 3   Interview Questions: Students
Appendix 4   Interview Questions: Education Professionals
Appendix 5   Schools in New Zealand
Appendix 6   School Music Qualifications in New Zealand
UNIVERSITY OF OTAGO HUMAN ETHICS COMMITTEE
APPLICATION FORM: CATEGORY A

1. University of Otago staff member responsible for project:
   Cattermole Jennifer Dr

2. Department/School:
   Music - Theatre Studies Programme

3. Contact details of staff member responsible:
   E-mail: jennifer.cattermole@otago.ac.nz
   Ph: 479-4025

4. Title of project:
   Making the choice for music

5. Indicate project type and names of other investigators and students:
   Student Researchers Names:
   Sara Brown
   Level of Study (PhD, Masters, Hons): Masters

6. Is this a repeated class teaching activity? (Delete answer that does not apply)
   NO

7. Fast-Track procedure
   Do you request fast-track consideration?
   NO

8. When will recruitment and data collection commence?
   July 2015
   When will data collection be completed?
   April 2017

9. Funding of project
   Is the project to be funded by an external grant?
   NO

10. Brief description in lay terms of the purpose of the project (approx. 75 words):
The purpose of this project is to examine the contribution of school music to students' decisions to undertake professional music training at the tertiary level. It will do so by looking at the variety of music education activities experienced by the participants and obtaining their impressions of their music education.

11. Aim and description of project

This research aims to explore the experiences of students who have been educated in the New Zealand school system and have chosen to pursue studies in professional music training in order to find out what impact their music experiences at school have had on their musical interests, preferences and decisions. There will be a particular focus on the teaching and learning of music at New Zealand year seven and eight (approximate ages from 10 to 13). The project will provide feedback on the quality and relevance of school music education for those intending to pursue music professionally. This data is potentially useful for curriculum planning in New Zealand, and can contribute to current international interest in the connection between secondary and tertiary music education and training.

12. Researcher/instructor experience and qualifications in this research area

Principal Supervisor: Dr Jennifer Cattermole

Secondary Supervisor: Emeritus Professor Dr John Drummond – former president of the International Society for Music Education

The student researcher (Sara Brown) is an experienced secondary school music teacher who has also taught as a private teacher of piano, violin, voice and theory of music. She has a Postgraduate Certificate of Education from Heriot-Watt University in Edinburgh in Secondary Music with Primary music as a second study. Sara has been a head of music in secondary schools in Northland and Manawatu. She has also taught in Dunedin schools as a classroom teacher, as a choir and orchestra director, and as an instrumental teacher. She has experience in curriculum development as a classroom teacher, in particular in the development of NCEA Music support materials.

13. Participants

13(a) Population from which participants are drawn:
Music students at the University of Otago, in particular those in their first year of study.

13(b) Inclusion and exclusion criteria:

Students will be enrolled for a music qualification at the University of Otago. They will be self-selecting. Students may wish be excluded if Sara Brown has taught them either as a private music student or as a school student and she or they considers that this would influence their responses in any questionnaire or interview.

13.c) Estimated number of participants: 70

13.d) Age range of participants:

18 to 19 years, perhaps older if students have delayed commencement of studies after completing schooling.

13(e) Method of recruitment:

Email to music students and by Sara Brown speaking to the first year students in class. Students who respond to the survey will be able to self select to participate in the interview process.

13(f) Specify and justify any payment or reward to be offered

Sara Brown has previously owned a music shop and has a large number of music related gifts (stationery items, novelties) from which she will offer students a choice as a thank you for participating in the interview process.

14. Methods and Procedures:

The study will be in the form of a qualitative case study analysis of students enrolled for a music qualification at the University of Otago who have been educated in the New Zealand school system.

Around 70 participants will be asked to complete an online survey describing their experiences in music learning from their earliest memories of music education and participation. They will also be asked about their socio-economic background and the schools they have attended. The survey that students will be asked to complete is attached to this application.
At the end of the survey, students will be asked if they would be willing to participate in a one-on-one face-to-face interview with the researcher. The interview will last no longer than an hour. Students will be interviewed about their learning experiences in music in and out of school settings. The questions to be asked will not have been determined in advance, but will be based on students' survey responses. These questions will probe more deeply into students' evaluations of their personal learning experiences.

15. Compliance with The Privacy Act 1993 and the Health Information Privacy Code 1994 imposes strict requirements concerning the collection, use and disclosure of personal information. The questions below allow the Committee to assess compliance.

15(a) Are you collecting and storing personal information (e.g. name, contact details, designation, position etc) directly from the individual concerned that could identify the individual?

YES

15(b) Are you collecting information about individuals from another source?

NO

15(c) Collecting Personal Information

• Will you be collecting personal information (e.g. name, contact details, position, company, anything that could identify the individual)?

YES

• Will you inform participants of the purpose for which you are collecting the information and the uses you propose to make of it?

YES

• Will you inform participants of who will receive the information?

YES

• Will you inform participants of the consequences, if any, of not supplying the information?

YES

• Will you inform participants of their rights of access to and correction of personal information?

YES

15(d) Outline your data storage, security procedures and length of time data will
Data from surveys will be kept in the following ways. Online survey data is firewall and password protected. Any hand-written responses will be scanned to pdf format then the originals shredded after checking for accuracy. Electronic files will be kept with passwords to ensure security. Video or audio files will be kept with password access also.

Data will be kept for a minimum of five years and perhaps indefinitely. Data will be stored at the university on USB drives kept in a locked filing cabinet in Dr Jennifer Cattermole's office.

15(e) Who will have access to personal information, under what conditions, and subject to what safeguards? If you are obtaining information from another source, include details of how this will be accessed and include written permission if appropriate. Will participants have access to the information they have provided?

Sara Brown will have access to this as primary researcher. Her supervisor Dr Cattermole and advisor Emeritus Professor Drummond will also have access to this data.

15(f) Do you intend to publish any personal information they have provided?

NO

15(g) Do you propose to collect demographic information to describe your sample? For example: gender, age, ethnicity, education level, etc.

Yes, in particular gender and ethnicity, and demographic information about the schools they have attended such as decile rating.

15 (h) Have you, or will you, undertake Māori consultation? Choose one of the options below, and delete the option that does not apply:

YES We have ALREADY undertaken consultation.

16. Does the research or teaching project involve any form of deception?

NO

17. Disclose and discuss any potential problems or ethical considerations:

There may be some conflict of interest for Sara Brown as some potential participants in this study may be former students of hers. In this situation, Sara's students may choose not to take part in the study, to decline to answer particular questions, or to withdraw from the study at any time up until the time of the study's submission for examination, with no adverse consequences to themselves.
18. *Applicant's Signature: .................................................................

Name (please print): .................................................................

Date: ...................................................

*The signatory should be the staff member detailed at Question 1.

19. **Departmental approval: I have read this application and believe it to be valid research and ethically sound. I approve the research design. The Research proposed in this application is compatible with the University of Otago policies and I give my consent for the application to be forwarded to the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee with my recommendation that it be approved.

Signature of **Head of Department: .................................................................

Name of HOD (please print): .................................................................

Date: ...................................................

**Where the Head of Department is also the Applicant, then an appropriate senior staff member must sign on behalf of the Department or School.

**Attach copies of the Information Sheet for Participants, Consent Form, and Advertisement to your application

Send the signed original plus 17 double-sided and stapled copies of the application to:

Academic Committees, Room G22, G23 or G24, Ground Floor, Clocktower Building,
Making the choice for music

INFORMATION SHEET FOR PARTICIPANTS

Thank you for showing an interest in this project. Please read this information sheet carefully before deciding whether or not to participate. If you decide to participate we thank you. If you decide not to take part there will be no disadvantage to you and we thank you for considering our request.

What is the Aim of the Project?

This project will explore what contribution school music experiences make to students' decisions to pursue professional music training, and to investigate whether the musical experiences gained at the school intermediate level are significant in this respect.

This project is being undertaken as part of the requirements for Sara Brown's Master of Arts in Music Education.

What Type of Participants are being sought?

Students who are studying first year music papers will be asked to fill in a survey. From there they will be able to self-select to be involved in a subsequent interview with Sara Brown.
Students who have been taught by Sara Brown either as a private music teacher or as a school music teacher may wish to exclude themselves if they feel there could be a conflict of interest.

We hope to have approximately 70 students participate in this survey and a smaller number involved in the interview process which will take place at a venue nominated by the researcher.

What will Participants be Asked to Do?

Should you agree to take part in this project, you will be asked to fill in a survey about your musical experiences throughout your school years, and if you are willing give an in-depth interview about your musical life and development. The time commitment required for the survey is approximately 20 minutes. The interview will take approximately an hour of your time. If you take part in the interview process you will be offered a music related gift as a thank you for participation.

Please be aware that you may decide not to take part in the project at any time without any disadvantage to yourself of any kind.

What Data or Information will be Collected and What Use will be Made of it?

If participants consent, their survey data will be collected electronically. Interviews will be audio recorded and subsequently transcribed by Sara Brown.

Personal information (including names, gender and ethnicity) will be collected, however, this will not be published in any way that will identify the individual.

The only people who will have access to this data will be Sara Brown, Dr Jennifer Cattermole and Emeritus Professor John Drummond.

The data collected will be securely stored in such a way that only the individuals named above will be able to gain access to it. Data obtained as a result of the research
will be retained for at least 5 years in secure storage. Any personal information held on the participants may be destroyed at the completion of the research even though the data derived from the research will, in most cases, be kept for much longer or possibly indefinitely.

The results of the project may be published and will be available in the University of Otago Library (Dunedin, New Zealand) but every attempt will be made to preserve your anonymity.

Participants who give interviews will have the chance to review the interview transcripts and make any corrections they feel necessary.

The general line of questioning includes your experiences of music education before starting tertiary music study including your opinions and feelings on this topic and of teachers and other people you have worked with. The precise nature of the questions which will be asked have not been determined in advance, but will depend on the way in which the interview develops. Consequently, although the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee is aware of the general areas to be explored in the interview, the Committee has not been able to review the precise questions to be used.

In the event that the line of questioning does develop in such a way that you feel hesitant or uncomfortable, you are reminded of your right to decline to answer any particular question(s) and also that you may withdraw from the project at any stage without any disadvantage to yourself of any kind.

**Can Participants Change their Mind and Withdraw from the Project?**

You may withdraw from participation in the project at any time until April 2017 without any disadvantage to yourself of any kind.

**What if Participants have any Questions?**

If you have any questions about our project, either now or in the future, please feel free to contact either:-

Sara Brown and Dr Jennifer Cattermole
This study has been approved by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns about the ethical conduct of the research you may contact the Committee through the Human Ethics Committee Administrator (ph +64 3 479 8256 or email gary.witte@otago.ac.nz). Any issues you raise will be treated in confidence and investigated and you will be informed of the outcome.
Making the Choice for Music

CONSENT FORM FOR

PARTICIPANTS

I have read the Information Sheet concerning this project and understand what it is about. All my questions have been answered to my satisfaction. I understand that I am free to request further information at any stage.

I know that:-

1. My participation in the project is entirely voluntary;

2. I am free to withdraw from the project at any time without any disadvantage;

3. Personal identifying information including audio recordings, may be destroyed at the conclusion of the project, but any raw data on which the results of the project depend will be retained in secure storage for at least five years.

4. The general line of questioning includes my experiences of music education before starting tertiary music study including my opinions and feelings on this topic and of teachers and other people I have worked with. The precise nature of the questions which will be asked have not been determined in advance, but will depend on the way in which the interview develops. In the event that the line of questioning develops in such a way that I feel hesitant or uncomfortable I may decline to answer any particular question(s) and/or may withdraw from the project without any disadvantage of any kind.

5. Upon completion of the interview process I may accept a small music-themed gift as a thank-you for my participation.

6. The results of the project may be published and will be available in the University of Otago Library (Dunedin, New Zealand) but every attempt will be made to preserve my anonymity.
By clicking on the link to the survey I agree to taking part in this project.

This study has been approved by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns about the ethical conduct of the research you may contact the Committee through the Human Ethics Committee Administrator (ph +643 479 8256 or email gary.witte@otago.ac.nz). Any issues you raise will be treated in confidence and investigated and you will be informed of the outcome.
Making the Choice for Music

This research study aims to explore what contribution school music experiences have had on student's decisions to pursue professional music training. Music students, particularly those in their first year of study will be asked to complete an online survey and from there they can self-select to participate in an interview about their music life stories.

Interview participants will be thanked with a choice of a small music-themed gift. Time required for the survey is about 20 minutes, the interview will last about an hour.

Please contact
Sara Brown
kelpiebrown@gmail.com

[This project has been reviewed and approved by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee. Reference: 15/084]
Appendix 1b Request for Extension or Amendment to a Previously Approved Study
REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OR AMENDMENT TO A PREVIOUSLY APPROVED STUDY
If the nature, content, location, procedure (including recruitment of participants) or personnel (including student investigators) of an application approved by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee or University if Otago Human Ethics Committee (Health) changes, applicants are responsible for informing the Committee of those changes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Application Reference number (e.g H13/011, 13/131, D13/001):</th>
<th>15/084</th>
<th>Name of University of Otago staff member responsible for the project:</th>
<th>Dr Jennifer Cattermole</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Title of Project: Making the Choice for Music

Date: 11 April 2016

Please detail the amendment(s) you would like to make to your approved proposal, the reasons for the change(s), and any additional ethical considerations:
Expansion of the ethics approval to interview a number of education professionals, including music education specialists. These participants would include (but not necessarily limited to) primary school teachers and principals, secondary school music teachers, university staff, and former music educators. Selection will be by personal invitation by Sara Brown to known music and education specialists.
All privacy and data retention issues will be treated as per the original ethics application. Participants will be asked given an information sheet and asked to sign a consent form before the interview takes place.
Interview questions will be drawn up for the individuals involved depending on their experiences and position. They will be principally concerned with the participants experiences, observations and opinions of formal and informal music education opportunities for students in primary and secondary schools, however as the interview subjects will have a wide range of experiences the interviews will individually tailored to the subject.

Please email your completed form, together with your amended Information Sheet(s), Consent Form(s), Survey(s)/Questionnaires, or any other relevant documents, as appropriate, to:
Gary Witte (Manager, Academic Committees) gary.witte@otago.ac.nz, or
Jane Hinkley (Academic Committees Administrator), jane.hinkley@otago.ac.nz or
Jo Farron de Diaz (Research Ethics Administrator), jo.farrondediaz@otago.ac.nz.
Researchers can normally expect a response within a week of submitting their request.
Appendix 2 Questions from Electronic Survey
Personal Details

* Name

* Date of Birth? (DD/MM/YYYY)

* Where were you born?

If you were not born in New Zealand, at what age did you move to New Zealand?

Which ethnicity or ethnicities do you identify with? Please choose any you consider relevant to you personally.

☐ New Zealand Maori
☐ European
☐ Pasifika
☐ Asian
☐ African
☐ First Peoples Australian
☐ First Peoples American
☐ Other

If you wish to be more specific or your choice has been omitted please comment

About your parents:
Is your first parent or caregiver
☐ Professional Musicians
☐ Amateur Musicians
☐ Interested in Music
☐ Not Interested in Music

About your parents:
Is your second parent or caregiver
☐ Professional Musicians
☐ Amateur Musicians
☐ Interested in Music
☐ Not Interested in Music

* Is there a family expectation that you will play an instrument or sing?
☐ Yes
☐ No

* Do you have one or more siblings?
☐ Yes
☐ No

Do any of your siblings play musical instruments or sing?
☐ Yes
☐ No

What instruments (including voice) do your siblings play?
* What degree are you currently enrolled for? For example, Mus B, Mus B Hons, B A...

* Are you receiving a student allowance to attend university?
  ○ Yes
  ○ No

* Where are you living?
  ○ Residential College
  ○ Flatting
  ○ Private Board
  ○ With Parents/Family

* Which music papers are you studying this year? Please tick all relevant.
  □ Materials of Music MUSI 101
  □ Music in Western Culture MUSI 102
  □ Music in Popular Culture MUSI 103
  □ Music in World Cultures MUSI 104
  □ None of these papers

* Which music papers are you studying this year? Please tick all relevant.
  □ Composition MUSI 131
  □ Music Technology MUSI 132
  □ Song Writing MUSI 135
  □ None of these papers

* Which music papers are you studying this year? Please tick all relevant.
  □ Performance Practice MUSI 140
  □ Performance (Classical) MUSI 141
  □ Performance (Contemporary) MUSI 145
  □ Professional Practice 1A MUSI 146
  □ Professional Practice 1B MUSI 156
  □ None of these papers

* Which music papers are you studying this year? Please tick all relevant.
  □ Music Industry MUSI 185
  □ Introduction to Music MUSI 191
  □ None of these papers

Please list any other music courses you are studying this year.

Where did you go to school?

School Name

City, Town or District

School Type (Primary, Intermediate, Secondary etc.)

School Year Started

School Year Left
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Where did you go to school?</th>
<th>School Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City, Town or District</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Type (Primary, Intermediate, Secondary etc.)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Started</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Left</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Where did you go to school?</th>
<th>School Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City, Town or District</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Type (Primary, Intermediate, Secondary etc.)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Started</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Left</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Where did you go to school?</th>
<th>School Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City, Town or District</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Type (Primary, Intermediate, Secondary etc.)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Started</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Left</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Where did you go to school?</th>
<th>School Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City, Town or District</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Type (Primary, Intermediate, Secondary etc.)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Started</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year Left</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where did you go to school?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Name</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City, Town or District</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Type (Primary, Intermediate, Secondary etc.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Year Started</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Year Left</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What instruments (including voice) have you learned?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age started</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level reached (including grade if any)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age stopped</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What instruments (including voice) have you learned?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age started</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level reached (including grade if any)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age stopped</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What instruments (including voice) have you learned?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age started</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level reached (including grade if any)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age stopped</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What instruments (including voice) have you learned?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age started</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level reached (including grade if any)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age stopped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What instruments (including voice) have you learned?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instrument</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age started</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning method</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Level reached (including grade if any)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age stopped</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What instruments (including voice) have you learned?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instrument</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age started</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning method</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Level reached (including grade if any)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age stopped</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Approximately how much practice did you do in minutes per day as a student learning music?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Under 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 5 to 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 10 to 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 13 to 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 16 to 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Under the age of 10, was your practice supervised?**

- ○ Yes
- ○ No

**If your practice was supervised, who usually supervised it?**

- ○

* Did you take part in any school-based, co-curricular music groups? For example, rock band, jazz band, orchestra, choir, chamber music, school shows, ukulele group, music mentoring programme, Kapa Haka, Pasifika or other cultural groups.

- ○ Yes
- ○ No

**Please list any primary school co-curricular music activities you took part in.**
Please list any intermediate school co-curricular music activities you took part in.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Please list any secondary school co-curricular music activities you took part in.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Did you take part in any school organised music competitions?

- Yes
- No

If you were involved in school organised music competitions please describe your participation below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Your role in the competition (e.g., first violin, lead guitar, alto)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role in the Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

School years involved (year 1 to 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years Involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

If you were involved in school organised music competitions please describe your participation below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Your role in the competition (e.g., first violin, lead guitar, alto)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role in the Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

School years involved (year 1 to 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years Involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

If you were involved in school organised music competitions please describe your participation below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Your role in the competition (e.g., first violin, lead guitar, alto)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role in the Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

School years involved (year 1 to 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years Involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
If you were involved in school organised music competitions please describe your participation below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Your role in the competition (e.g., first violin, lead guitar, alto)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your role in the competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

School years involved (year 1 to 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School years involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

If you were involved in school organised music competitions please describe your participation below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Your role in the competition (e.g., first violin, lead guitar, alto)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your role in the competition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

School years involved (year 1 to 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School years involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Did you take part in more music competitions than you have space to list on this page?

- [ ] Yes
- [ ] No

Did you take part in local music activities outside of school? “Local” meaning within the town or province you lived in.

- [ ] Yes
- [ ] No

What music activity group did you take part in outside of school?

Name of group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Type of group (e.g.; church choir, rock band, Kapa Haka)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What was your role in the group?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What was your role in the group?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What school years were you involved? (Year 1 to 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What school years were you involved?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What music activity group did you take part in outside of school?

Name of group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Type of group (e.g.; church choir, rock band, Kapa Haka)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What was your role in the group?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What was your role in the group?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What school years were you involved? (Year 1 to 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What school years were you involved?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What music activity group did you take part in outside of school?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of group (e.g., church choir, rock band, Kapa Haka)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What was your role in the group?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What school years were you involved? (Year 1 to 13)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What music activity group did you take part in outside of school?</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name of group</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of group (e.g., church choir, rock band, Kapa Haka)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What was your role in the group?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What school years were you involved? (Year 1 to 13)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Did you take part in more music groups than you have space to list on this page?
- Yes
- No

Did you take part in any national representative music groups while you were at school?
- Yes
- No

Please describe any national level music groups you took part in while you were at school.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Group</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Your position (section, seat, voice, leadership position)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School years involved (year 1 to 13)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please describe any national level music groups you took part in while you were at school.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Group</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Your position (section, seat, voice, leadership position)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School years involved (year 1 to 13)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Please describe any national level music groups you took part in while you were at school.</td>
<td>Name of Group&lt;br&gt; Your position (section, seat, voice, leadership position)&lt;br&gt; School years involved (year 1 to 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did you take part in any music related camps or schools not related to your school activities?</td>
<td>Yes or No&lt;br&gt; Please describe the camp or school you attended.&lt;br&gt; Name and Location of Organisation&lt;br&gt; Your role (section, seat, leadership role)&lt;br&gt; School years involved (year 1 to 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Please describe the camp or school you attended.</td>
<td>Name and Location of Organisation&lt;br&gt; Your role (section, seat, leadership role)&lt;br&gt; School years involved (year 1 to 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Please describe the camp or school you attended.</td>
<td>Name and Location of Organisation&lt;br&gt; Your role (section, seat, leadership role)&lt;br&gt; School years involved (year 1 to 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Did you study music as a subject at secondary school?</td>
<td>Yes or No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In what school years did you study music? Please select all years you took music as a subject, either as a compulsory subject or as an option.

- Year 9
- Year 10
- Year 11
- Year 12
- Year 13

* What qualifications did you gain in music at secondary school?
- NCEA Level 1
- NCEA Level 2
- NCEA Level 3
- NZ Scholarship
- International Baccalaureate (IB)
- Cambridge Examinations Board
- None

* My primary school had a specialist music teacher.
- Yes
- No

* Teachers at my primary school knew I was interested in music.
- Yes
- No

* Students who showed an interest in music at primary school got opportunities to do more.
- Yes
- No

* Music was considered important at my primary school.
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

* Music was fun at primary school.
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

* Music was a formal activity at primary school.
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

Please add any comments you would like to make about your general impressions of music at primary school. These may include any specific activities you enjoyed or disliked or any way you would like to describe your experiences of music at this stage.
My intermediate school had a specialist music teacher.
- Yes
- No

Teachers at my intermediate school knew I was interested in music.
- Yes
- No

Students who showed an interest in music at intermediate school got opportunities to do more.
- Yes
- No

Music was considered important at my intermediate school.
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

Music was fun at intermediate school.
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

Music was a formal activity at intermediate school.
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

Please add any comments you would like to make about your general impressions of music at intermediate school. These may include any specific activities you enjoyed or disliked or any way you would like to describe your experiences of music at this stage.

* My secondary school had a specialist music teacher.
- Yes
- No

* Teachers at my secondary school knew I was interested in music.
- Yes
- No

* Students who showed an interest in music at secondary school got opportunities to do more.
- Yes
- No

* Music was considered important at my secondary school.
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree
* Music was fun at secondary school.
  - Strongly Agree
  - Agree
  - Neutral
  - Disagree
  - Strongly Disagree

* Music was a formal activity at secondary school.
  - Strongly Agree
  - Agree
  - Neutral
  - Disagree
  - Strongly Disagree

Please add any comments you would like to make about your general impressions of music at secondary school. These may include any specific activities you enjoyed or disliked or any way you would like to describe your experiences of music at this stage.

What did you learn...

Instrument or voice

School years (1 to 13) you studied with this teacher

Describe your instrumental or vocal teacher or teachers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was strict</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was encouraging</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was formal</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was interested in what I wanted to learn</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher had a set curriculum</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good performer</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot about my instrument</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot of theory</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good musician</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What did you learn...

Instrument or voice

School years (1 to 13) you studied with this teacher
### Describe your instrumental or vocal teacher or teachers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was strict</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was encouraging</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was formal</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was interested in what I wanted to learn</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher had a set curriculum</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good performer</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot about my instrument</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot of theory</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good musician</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### What did you learn...

Instrument or voice: [ ]

School years (1 to 13) you studied with this teacher: [ ]

### Describe your instrumental or vocal teacher or teachers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was strict</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was encouraging</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was formal</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was interested in what I wanted to learn</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher had a set curriculum</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good performer</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot about my instrument</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot of theory</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good musician</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### What did you learn...

Instrument or voice: [ ]

School years (1 to 13) you studied with this teacher: [ ]

### Describe your instrumental or vocal teacher or teachers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was strict</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was encouraging</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was formal</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was interested in what I wanted to learn</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher had a set curriculum</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good performer</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot about my instrument</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher knew a lot of theory</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teacher was a good musician</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Please add any comments you would like to make about your general impressions of instrumental or vocal lessons. These may include any specific activities you enjoyed or disliked or any way you would like to describe your experiences of instrumental or vocal tuition.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Music Activity</th>
<th>Primary School</th>
<th>Intermediate School</th>
<th>Secondary School</th>
<th>Private Lessons</th>
<th>Not in lessons or school</th>
<th>No opportunity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Improvising in a supervised group</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop own groups for performance</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform your own choice of music</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform in front of your school</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compose your own music</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvise or jam with friends or peers</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform your own compositions</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Record your own performances</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Record your own compositions</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use a wide range of instruments and resources</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn to read music</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use computers and electronic resources</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sit grade exams in theory of music</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sit grade exams in performance</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform in public concerts or gigs</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn to use music recording technology</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn to set up and use amplification gear</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Please add any comments you would like to make about your general impressions of music activities. These may include any specific activities you enjoyed or disliked or any way you would like to describe your experiences of your music education.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>At what age did you decide to study music at university?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Are you willing to be interviewed in greater depth about your experiences of learning music in and out of school?
- Yes
- No

If you are willing to be interviewed, please fill in your email address below so I can contact you.
Appendix 3 Interview Questions: Students

These questions are designed to provoke a greater depth of thought than the basic survey questions already answered.

1. Tell me about your music education from the beginning…
2. You described your parents/caregivers as being interested in music. Did you get much family support to be involved in music?
2b. If not your family, who would you say was your biggest supporter for music?
3. Tell me about music at Primary School. Do you remember anything you did in music there?
4. What about High School? You seem to have been fairly involved in music there…
5. What was the funniest thing that happened when you were making music at school?
5b. What is your worst memory of music at school?
6. What do you remember about your music teachers?
6b. Do you think your music teacher(s) at school made a difference to your decision to study music?
7. You have learned a few instruments over the years, tell me about those.
7b. For a lot of your instrumental and vocal career you have been self-taught. Why did that come about?
8. Do you think you missed out on any aspects of music education?
   If so - what and why?
8b. Were you denied access to anything for any reason?
9. Do you feel you were given enough opportunities in music at school?
9b. Do you feel like school music prepared you enough for university music?
9c. What other opportunities would you have liked?
10. Is there anyone who has inspired you in music?
11. Is there anyone who has put you off music?
12. You decided aged (x) to study music. What made you decide that?
Appendix 4 Interview Questions: Education Professionals

Questions for George: Retired College of Education lecturer

1. Can you give me a brief overview of your music education?
2. What impact has your own music education had on your teaching of music?
3. You have an interest and experience in brass band music. What impact do you think this has had on your teaching?
4. What kinds of music activities and courses do you think should be available to students at – primary school – intermediate school – secondary school level?
5. What barriers to studying music have you seen in schools and in the wider public arena?

Questions for Clare, Libby and Abby: Specialist teachers of music in primary or intermediate schools

1. Can you give me a brief overview of your music education?
2. What impact has your own music education had on your teaching of music?
3. What kinds of music activities and courses do you think should be available to students at – primary school – intermediate school level?
4. What have you or would you put in place in a school to support and extend students who show an interest in music?
5. What barriers to studying music have you seen your students experience?

Questions for Greta: Intermediate school principal

1. Can you give me a brief overview of your music education?
2. One of the first things you did when you became principal of X Intermediate School was to hire a music specialist to teach all year seven students. Can you tell me why you did this?
3. What kinds of music activities and courses do you think should be available to students at intermediate school level?
4. What have you or would you put in place in a school to support and extend students who show an interest in music?
Questions for James: Secondary school head of music department

1. Can you give me a brief overview of your music education?

2. What impact has your own music education had on your teaching of music?

3. You have a range of experiences as a performer in a variety of music styles. What impact do you think this has had on your teaching?

4. What kinds of music activities and courses do you think should be available to students at secondary school level?

5. Many of your students have gone on to tertiary music education. Are there any traits of experiences in common that these students have which indicated to you that they were likely to study music?

6. What barriers to studying music have you seen your students experience?
Appendix 5 Schools in New Zealand

Compulsory schooling in New Zealand
Students may begin school on or after the day they turn five. Enrolment and attendance is compulsory from the child’s sixth birthday to the age of sixteen. Most children begin school within days of their fifth birthday or at the beginning of the school term following, if their birthday fell within a holiday period. Children whose fifth birthdays fall after June 1st are considered ‘year 0’ when they begin school aged five. They are often held in a reception class until they have completed a full year one. Students who wish to attend tertiary education usually stay on to complete year thirteen and gain the qualifications necessary to obtain university or further education entrance. Year fourteen exists to allow students who need more time to complete qualifications to stay at school to the age of nineteen. There is also provision for students with complex special needs to stay in school to the age of twenty-one. Parents may apply for an exemption for their child to be home-schooled rather than attend school, however the education given must meet the standards of the New Zealand curriculum (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007).

Types of Schools
Schools are divided into two main types in New Zealand: primary and secondary schools. Primary schools are taught by generalist teachers up to year eight, and secondary schools by specialist subject teachers from year nine to thirteen. There are a large variety of schools within primary and secondary school teaching, and schools which overlap.

The most common school types are as follows
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contributing Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary College</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Secondary) High School</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composite School</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 38. Types of school in New Zealand*

**Primary and Intermediate Schools**

Primary school in New Zealand lasts for either six or eight years, depending on the make-up of the school. Contributing primary schools teach years one to six students, aged from five to about ten years. Full primary schools teach years one to eight students, aged from five to about twelve years. Primary school teaching in New Zealand is carried out by trained generalist teachers who are expected to be competent to teach all seven essential learning areas of the New Zealand curriculum. Music is a strand of the Arts essential learning area. Some primary schools choose to employ a specialist music teacher to teach this area of the curriculum.

Intermediate schools in New Zealand are designed to cater for students in years seven and eight, aged approximately eleven and twelve years. While there is a greater emphasis on specialist subject teaching, particularly in the teaching of technology subjects such as hard and soft materials technology or food technology, an intermediate school is still classified under the New Zealand system as being a primary school and most teaching is carried out by primary school trained generalist teachers. Intermediate schools tend to be in large towns or cities in New Zealand where there is a population
large enough to justify a separate school for this age group. Small towns and country areas have full primary schools.

**Secondary Schools**

The type of school attended for secondary education in New Zealand can vary. Secondary schools normally start at year nine (aged about thirteen years) but some start at year seven (aged about eleven years). Some schools are composite or area schools where students attend from year one (aged five) until they complete schooling (end of year thirteen, aged about seventeen or eighteen). Secondary schools can be co-educational or single sex. In small towns and rural areas of New Zealand, the choice of secondary school is often limited to either the local school or boarding away from home. In larger towns, parents can exercise choice as to which school they want their child to attend (such as a single sex school or a co-educational school) although some schools have enrolment schemes (zones) to prioritise for children in their immediate catchment area.

**Decile Rating**

All New Zealand state and state-integrated schools are assigned a decile rating (from one to ten) by the ministry of education. Decile numbers are designed to reflect the socio-economic status of a school’s student population, and are used to provide funding to the schools. The lower the school’s decile number, the greater the funding it receives. Decile ratings are reviewed every five years, using data from the New Zealand census to justify any changes.

**School Authorities: State, State-Integrated and Private Schools**

Schools can be state schools, fully funded by the state, state-integrated schools which maintain a ‘special character’ (usually religious) or private. State, state-integrated and private schools can all be day schools or can have boarding facilities attached to them.

Approximately eighty-five percent of students in New Zealand attend state schools. The other fifteen percent attend either state-integrated schools (approximately eleven percent or private schools (the remaining four percent). State-integrated schools are former private schools which have integrated with the state education system. These
schools are funded from a mixed model of state and parent fees. State-integrated schools were set up in the 1970s to deal with the potential influx to the state schooling system of the students who were being educated in the Roman Catholic schools (private at the time) when a funding crisis threatened to stop the church’s funding of school education. More schools, often church-based, followed the Catholic schools and became state-integrated. All state-integrated schools have a ‘special character’ they maintain, such as a religious character or a philosophy of education (for example, Rudolf Steiner education). State-integrated schools must teach the New Zealand curriculum. There are two National Curriculum Documents; *The New Zealand curriculum* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2007) for English-medium schooling, and *Te marautanga o Aotearoa* (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 2008) for Maori-medium schooling. Private schools are not obliged to teach to the New Zealand curriculum but are required to provide a well-rounded curriculum for their students.

**Single sex and co-education schools**

Most schools in New Zealand are co-educational, however in each province there is generally one set of single sex state secondary schools (each of a boys’ school and a girls’ school). In larger cities, there may be more than one set. Parents can exercise choice in sending their child to either a co-educational school or a single sex school depending on the availability of places in the relevant school. Many state-integrated and private schools are single sex schools.

**Partner Schools**

As of 2014 a new type of school has been set up in New Zealand. Partner schools (Kura Hourua) are financed by the government but are run by independent organisations. There are very few partner schools (five in 2014, with an additional five set to commence in 2015) and none of the participants in the survey or interview process had attended this type of school.

**Cohort for this research**

Although only 37 students responded to the survey, they appear to be representative of a varied sample of New Zealand secondary schools. Students attended state, state-
integrated or private schools, single sex or co-educational in a variety of settings such as small towns, provincial centres and larger ‘main-centre’ cities.
Appendix 6 School Music Qualifications in New Zealand

All New Zealand state and state-integrated schools offer their students the opportunity to gain the National Certificate of Educational Achievement (NCEA) administered by the New Zealand Qualifications Authority (NZQA). NCEA was introduced over the three years from 2002 to 2004 as a replacement for the previous national qualifications. Students need to obtain eighty credits to gain their NCEA at each of Level One, Two and Three. These can be in either unit standards or achievement standards. Achievement standards were developed out of the previous examination curricula and may be assessed as fail, achieved, achieved with merit or achieved with excellence. Unit standards were originally designed as more practical applications and were assessed only as pass or fail but are now assessed in the same manner as achievement standards. Each standard’s credit value is intended to reflect the time necessary to complete the standard. A full year of study at any level in any one subject is approximately twenty-four credits. The information provided reflects the current standards as found on the NZQA website (New Zealand Qualifications Authority, 2004). Assessment is either internal (assessed by the teacher) or external (assessed by examination). The standards are as laid out in figures 39 to 41 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard Name</th>
<th>Credit Value</th>
<th>Internal/External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate and apply introductory knowledge of music technology equipment</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and techniques</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform two pieces of music as a featured soloist</td>
<td>6 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate ensemble skills through performing a piece of music as a member</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of a group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compose two original pieces of music</td>
<td>6 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate aural and theoretical skills through transcription</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate knowledge of conventions used in music scores</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard Name</td>
<td>Credit Value</td>
<td>Internal/External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate knowledge of two music works from contrasting contexts</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Credits available at Level One</strong></td>
<td><strong>34 Credits</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 39. Level one music standards*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard Name</th>
<th>Credit Value</th>
<th>Internal/External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate knowledge of the development and usage of music technology equipment and techniques</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate and apply knowledge of electronic music production and music notation application(s)</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform two substantial pieces of music as a featured soloist</td>
<td>6 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compose two substantial pieces of music</td>
<td>6 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate ensemble skills by performing a substantial piece of music as a member of a group</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devise an instrumentation for an ensemble</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform a substantial piece of music as a featured soloist on a second instrument</td>
<td>3 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate aural understanding through written representation</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate knowledge of conventions in a range of music scores</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate understanding of two substantial and contrasting music works</td>
<td>6 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigate an aspect of New Zealand music</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Credits available at Level Two</strong></td>
<td><strong>49 Credits</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 40. Level two music standards*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard Name</th>
<th>Credit Value</th>
<th>Internal/External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operate music sequencing, editing, and music notation application(s)</td>
<td>8 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform two programmes of music as a featured soloist</td>
<td>8 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perform a programme of music as a featured soloist on a second instrument</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate ensemble skills by performing two substantial pieces of music as</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a member of a group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate musical intention by composing three original pieces of music</td>
<td>8 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrate aural skills into written representation</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrate understanding of harmonic and tonal conventions in a range of</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>music scores</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyse a substantial music work</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examine the influence of context on a substantial music work</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create two arrangements for an ensemble</td>
<td>4 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research a music topic</td>
<td>6 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compose three original songs that express imaginative thinking</td>
<td>8 Credits</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Credits available at Level Three</strong></td>
<td><strong>66 Credits</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 41. Level three music standards*

**New Zealand Scholarship (NZQA Level Four)**

New Zealand Scholarship is an additional examination and portfolio presentation for outstanding students usually in year thirteen. Scholarship Music consists of a prepared portfolio of either performance, composition or music research (assessed externally), and an examination based on the analysis of previously unseen scores. Financial scholarships are awarded to students who achieve highly in these examinations. Candidates with the best marks are awarded Outstanding Scholarships.